

University of Southampton Research Repository
ePrints Soton

Copyright © and Moral Rights for this thesis are retained by the author and/or other copyright owners. A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge. This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder/s. The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given e.g.

AUTHOR (year of submission) "Full thesis title", University of Southampton, name of the University School or Department, PhD Thesis, pagination

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

FACULTY OF LAW, ARTS & SOCIAL SCIENCES

School of Humanities

Crossover

Boundaries, Hybridity, and the Problem of Opposing Cultures

by

Elizabeth Llewellyn

Thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

March 2010

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

ABSTRACT

FACULTY OF LAW, ARTS & SOCIAL SCIENCES

SCHOOL OF HUMANITIES

Doctor of Philosophy

**Crossover: Boundaries, Hybridity, and the Problem of
Opposing Cultures**

Elizabeth Ann Llewellyn

Classical crossover is a term regularly used but not yet adequately defined. This thesis attempts to redress this imbalance through a study of the relationships between high and low musical cultures. Starting from the separation of highbrow and lowbrow, the concepts of genre and musical taste are considered in relation to their connections to social hierarchies, leading to an analysis of what happens when they hybridise. Sociological scholarship, cultural criticism and contemporary musicology are combined to offer insights into ways in which we can control music, and ways in which music can control us, with particular emphasis on the field of classical crossover. Case studies reflecting issues of aesthetic preference, celebrity and image, promotion and marketing, and expanding demographic access feature as part of a broader examination of the benefits and drawbacks of cross-cultural collaborations.

This thesis clearly shows that generic affinity no longer defines either audience identity or social status, and that musicology's ideas of public reception, informed by social theory, are no longer relevant. It proposes that crossover indicates music that crosses boundaries of public reception, and that these boundaries can be unconsciously or deliberately manipulated. It recognises a need to keep pace with social change, and a need to reevaluate the separation of classical, popular, and non-Western cultures, both in musicology and in other humanities disciplines.

Contents

Abstract	i
Contents	ii
Declaration of Authorship	iv
Acknowledgements	v
0 Crossover, Classification, and Culture Clash	1
1 Theories of High, Low, and Hybridity	4
1.1 The High, the Low, and the Hybrid	8
1.2 Taste and Social Status	17
1.3 Subverting Social Structures	20
1.4 Culture and Control	23
1.5 Altering Attitudes	28
2 Consumer Control	31
2.1 Chart and Canon	32
2.2 In the Industry's Interests	37
2.3 Shaping Celebrities	45
2.4 Classification: Chart Compilation	48
2.5 Case Study: What are Classical Charts?	54
Figure 1: Top Ten Chart Entries (20 May 2006)	55
3 & 4 Case Studies in Classical Crossover	66
3 Classical Crossover's Musical Manifestations	67
3.1 Classical Stars, Popular Repertoire	67
3.2 Popular Stars, Classical Repertoire	72
3.3 From Pop Song to Symphony	82
3.4 Professional Pride and Popular Prejudice	95
3.5 Classical Crossover and Critics	105

4	Classical Crossover's Marketing Materials	116
4.1	Comely, Characterful, Captivating: Classical Celebrities	116
4.2	Pioneering Promotional Performances: Classic FM TV	121
4.3	Lifestyle Listening	136
4.4	Proximating the Popular	143
4.5	Commandeering Cultural Cachet	151
5	Making Sense of Crossover	163
Appendices		172
	Music Videos Featured by Classic FM TV	172
	Survey of Best-Selling 'Relaxing' Classical Compilations	174
Bibliography & References		179
	Print Resources	179
	Liner Notes	191
	Online Resources	191
	Selected Discography	197

DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP

I, Elizabeth Ann Llewellyn, declare that the thesis entitled 'Crossover: Boundaries, Hybridity, and the Problem of Opposing Cultures' and the work presented in the thesis are both my own, and have been generated by me as the result of my own original research. I confirm that:

- this work was done wholly or mainly while in candidature for a research degree at this University;
- where any part of this thesis has previously been submitted for a degree or any other qualification at this University or any other institution, this has been clearly stated;
- where I have consulted the published work of others, this is always clearly attributed;
- where I have quoted from the work of others, the source is always given. With the exception of such quotations, this thesis is entirely my own work;
- I have acknowledged all main sources of help;
- where the thesis is based on work done by myself jointly with others, I have made clear exactly what was done by others and what I have contributed myself;
- none of this work has been published before submission.

Signed:

Date: 15 March 2010

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my gratitude to a number of staff at the University of Southampton, past and present: to my supervisor David Nicholls for his guidance, assistance and encouragement throughout; to my adviser Andrew Pinnock, for constructive criticism and a myriad of tangents to explore; to Annily Campbell for interest and optimism; and to Matthew Head for emboldening me to invest my time in yet more study.

Grateful thanks are also due to my family: to my parents and especially to Gavin, for the support and patience which enabled this project to germinate, and to Andrew for advice on funding; and the two furry paperweights, for their regular and therapeutic interruptions.

Finally, my thanks to Jørn, Anne, Jon and Anna for their enthusiasm for my research, and the many entertaining crossover-related conversations that resulted.

0 Crossover, Classification, and Culture Clash

The definition of the term crossover and its usage in the field of music form the basis of this thesis. Yet crossover, by its very nature, defies classification. As classification provides the basis of social hierarchy,¹ it might be considered perverse for culture, springing from the necessity to define one's place in such a hierarchy, to admit hybridity; yet in most facets of the arts hybridity abounds, not least in the multiple languages of music. Classification might even be considered a socially created obstacle to a product which, to some, is wholly hybrid in any of its forms.² The classification of musics is often an afterthought, designed to help its consumers find items that cater to their tastes, and therefore is directly related to social preference, social identity, and social reproduction. Some classifications, such as genres, can separate products according to seemingly minor differences; others, such as the split between high and low cultures, can appear straightforward but in fact are riddled with problems. To understand the formation of crossovers and hybrids, we must first examine their motives: what is being crossed over, and why?

This thesis introduces the basic components of crossover in chapter 1. Through a combination of social theory and music theory, the chapter examines the separation of high and low cultures, and explains the concepts of genre and musical taste, their connections to social hierarchies, and what happens when they hybridise. A number of ways in which these ideas work in practice are then considered, with the overarching aim to explain how the concepts affect us. These brief case studies offer examples of how communities can use music to improve their social standing; how to effect successful challenges to social and cultural exclusiveness; ways in which we can control music, and ways in which music can control us.

Continuing the theme of control, chapter 2 considers the differing needs of consumers and the music industry. Beginning with a historical look at cultural

1 Bourdieu, Pierre, trans. Peter Collier, *Homo Academicus* (Cambridge, 1988), xii.

2 See Miller, Leta and Lieberman, Fredric, 'Lou Harrison and the American Gamelan', *American Music* 17, 2 (1999), 174.

ratings systems, the chapter examines canon formation and chart construction, and the ways in which apparently aesthetic preferences are manipulated. Industry-led publicity and awards ceremonies, and methods of censorship, playlisting and payola are discussed, together with the effects they have on consumers. The content of both commercial and state broadcasters is analysed, while contact with and data from chart compilation companies provides empirical backing to the observations made. The chapter closes with a case study of classical (and classical crossover) charts in the United States and United Kingdom, and the problems that arise in categorisation.

The following two chapters, 3 and 4, present a more detailed case study in the various facets of classical crossover. Each different incarnation that features in these two chapters has its own historical precedents traced, in order to more clearly show changes in industry and audience reception and practice. In addition to music history, the case study incorporates a wide variety of data. Primary materials include recordings, music videos, magazines, and industry-produced marketing literature; radio and television content is also surveyed and assessed. Responses to the music are examined from at least three angles. The opinions of music critics, documented in academic journals and the press, are considered alongside the perspectives offered by artists and industry representatives in interviews, and various measures of audience interest – including sales data, broadcast listener numbers, and concert attendance figures.

Chapter 3 explores the various ways in which performing artists and composers are identified according to distinctions of high and low culture. Performers from a range of cultural backgrounds are surveyed, and their relative critical and audience receptions gauged, in order to understand what creates successful crossover. Pop songwriters and classical composers who have exchanged places are similarly considered. The chapter concludes with a discussion of the effects of high and low culture on criticism, on its expectations and on its aesthetic evaluations, and how classical crossover is affected in turn.

Classical music's forays into 'low' cultural territory in order to increase its consumer base form the foundation of chapter 4. General issues regarding celebrity, image, and work ethic are discussed in conjunction with a number of specific marketing

ventures; methods for targetting divergent demographic groups are also covered in depth. The chapter closes with an examination of how classical music brings new social perspectives to events or products, and the benefits and drawbacks of these cultural collaborations.

The conclusions of this research are drawn together into chapter 5. Beginning with a derivation and definition of the term ‘crossover’, the chapter also summarises some of the ways it has been used, and reminds us of some of the ways in which it has been successful. A few of the reasons it is vital to acknowledge and understand crossover are reconsidered and encapsulated, from points of view including sociology, musicology, music criticism and the music industry. It explains how audience identities, social hierarchies, and the separation of musical expertise are all challenged by crossover, and outlines how and why we should continue to study it.

1 Theories of High, Low, and Hybridity

On either side of the English Channel, two nations each struggle with the integration of their diverse cultures into one united whole. In September 2005, Trevor Phillips, the head of the United Kingdom's Commission for Racial Equality, expressed his fear that having 'focussed far too much on the "multi" and not enough on the common culture', the British government's method of integration – tolerance of diversity – had failed.¹ Just a month later, youths in deprived areas of Paris (and later in cities across France) rioted in protest about widespread discrimination against immigrants of African origin and their French-born children.² Despite France's secular state ('a secularism which can accept a range of differences, provided that none of those differences is exclusive')³ and the resulting desire for cultural uniformity, minority groups were instead segregated by the unwillingness of the host community to extend equal opportunities and a refusal to discuss difference, thwarting any hope of a healthy, hybrid culture. Likewise, British expectations that divergent groups would communicate with and come to understand each other were dashed by a lack of interaction and participation in a hybrid community, undermined by the authorities' insistent classification of individuals according to racial origin. As Phillips noted, 'there has to be a balance struck between an "anything goes" multiculturalism on the one hand, which leads to deeper division and inequality; and on the other, an intolerant, repressive uniformity'.⁴

1 Phillips, Trevor, 'After 7/7: Sleepwalking to segregation' (22 September 2005), accessed at the Commission for Racial Equality website <<http://83.137.212.42/sitearchive/cre/Default.aspx?LocID=0hgnew07s&RefLocID=0hg00900c002.Lang-EN.htm>> on 22 October 2009.

2 Figures from France's Institut national de la statistique et des études économiques (reproduced at <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/4399748.stm>> (2 November 2005) and accessed 21 October 2009) show the unemployment rate of university graduates of 'North African' origin, at 26.5%, is widely divergent from the 5% rate of university graduates in general.

3 Memmi, Albert, 'Mechanisms of Oppression' in Maxim Silverman (ed.), *Race, Discourse and Power in France* (Avebury, 1991), 36.

4 Phillips, 'After 7/7: Sleepwalking to segregation'.

The discourse of unity and division is, of course, not limited to France and the UK. Yet these specific events serve to highlight two extremes of a widespread social problem. Society relies on systems of categorisation in order to simplify ever-expanding fields of reference. Political authorities and commercial interests target particular communities in order to form policy and communicate awareness; likewise voters and consumers often act according to the shared values of one group over another, endorsing certain political parties, brands and fashions, or flatly refusing to engage with others. Despite Heidegger's assertion that 'a boundary is not that at which something stops but, as the Greeks recognised, the boundary is that from which something *begins its presencing*', classification is so ingrained in the fabric of our daily lives that, when faced with a convergence of diverse interests or the elimination of barriers marking difference, we barely know how to react.⁵

A relatively recent addition to political theory, acknowledging that 'black cultural production... engages rather than suppresses difference', has been witnessed by Stuart Hall.⁶ Labelling is avoided through a positive recognition of ethnicity, that 'we all speak from a particular place, out of a particular history, out of a particular experience, a particular culture, without being contained... as "ethnic artists"',⁷ and that our knowledge gained from these experiences is uniquely mediated – translated – through our own personal perception. Homi Bhabha's consideration of colonial rule notes that 'hybridity... is not a third term that resolves the tension between two cultures... in a dialectical play of "recognition"'.⁸ Like Hall, he believes that borderline cultures create a sense of the 'new' as an act of cultural *translation*. Since personal perception has no fixity, these experiences – of position, past, participation and practice – can be reinterpreted and misinterpreted by others who receive that knowledge. Oral, popular tradition, is communicated by repeated performance, which is a constantly changing, constantly translated narrative (in opposition to the preserved objects of history); this continual evolution, and especially that of musics, makes them easy to translate, and

5 Heidegger, Martin, trans. Albert Hofstadter, 'Building, Dwelling, Thinking', *Poetry, Language, Thought* (New York, 1971), 154; Heidegger's emphasis.

6 Hall, Stuart, 'New Ethnicities' in Donald, James and Rattansi, Ali (eds.), *Race, Culture and Difference* (London 1992), 257.

7 *Ibid*, 258.

8 Bhabha, Homi, *The Location of Culture* (London, 1994), 113-114.

therefore to relocate, resulting in something that is at once both slightly and totally different – a hybrid.

Hybridisation, in cytology, is said to be ‘the fusion, by artificial means... of two somatic [unimaginary, physically existing] cells of different karyotypes [species types] to form a hybrid cell containing the nuclear material of both’.⁹ In these terms, hybridity is the result of boundary violation to the extent that the product could be said to contain the character of two heterogeneous sources. Cells are so complex that cytologists need to categorise them into groups according to similarities between distinguishing features. Music, that bewildering multimedialum of diverse pitches, rhythms, dynamics and timbres, is categorised in the same way into genres. The boundaries thus erected define a music according to its date of birth, country of origin, parentage, appearance, tone of voice, measure of pace and a range of other personal characteristics. In an attempt to specify a music's character in terms humans can understand, each unit is condensed to a series of facts and figures and grouped together with others that share some of those distinguishing features.

In order to understand what crossover is, we need to understand what is being crossed over in the first place, what the boundaries are that separate one genre from another. Foremost in the definition of a genre is its range of musical qualities, the personal characteristics mentioned above. Various theorists, however, attribute additional qualities to the resulting groups, that cause genres to extend their scope from purely musical to actively engaged in social distinction.

To Tia DeNora, genres are sets of conventions, such that meanings accrued through their usage in various settings are retained, and these same meanings are then imparted again in later use.¹⁰ In the same way we have learned that the jagged, atonal crescendo in a film soundtrack signals an unpleasant and unexpected event, so we have come to understand that punk-sounding music implies an anti-establishment bias, irrespective of what the current establishment might be. Fabian Holt believes that these genre distinctions are brought about

9 ‘Hybridisation’, *Oxford English Dictionary Online* (accessed 23 April 2007),
<<http://oed.com>>.

10 DeNora, Tia, *Music in Everyday Life* (Cambridge, 2000), 11-13.

through audiences. A genre's music may share codes, but music itself 'has cross-generic and processual qualities that defy categorical fixity'; a genre's fixity comes from conventions shaped 'in the minds and bodies' of its audience.¹¹ Anahid Kassabian adds that genre also includes listener behaviour and performance space.¹² The implication is that the audience exists first, and adopts a music that appeals; the genre becomes a symbol of community membership, and musicians and listeners produce and consume in a closed system of positive, self-perpetuating feedback.

Keith Negus also thinks that conventions are socially imposed on music genres, but rather than stemming from audience choice, these are engineered by entertainment corporations in order 'to produce identifiable products, commodities and "intellectual properties" and "targeted" promotional practices'.¹³ Thus, based on the 'historically specific cultural values, beliefs and prejudices' held by the industry, certain practices and cultures are valued and rewarded over others.¹⁴ While the majority of bands that are rewarded with receive recording contracts as a result of these conventions,

the most interesting bands musically (at least for me) were the strange, unpredictable mixtures and messes that were trying to please a range of audiences and band members simultaneously.¹⁵

Negus believes that musical creativity tends towards hybridity, towards multiple audiences and across boundaries, and that genre distinctions are maintained by the industry simply to promote their own interests, to 'divide living culture and separate social experiences'.¹⁶

Holt and Negus, while differing in their opinions of how positive generic distinction can be, are representative of a wider view that genre is understood in terms of a *single community* consisting of a body of people who *share the same ideals*. In

11 Holt, Fabian, *Genre in Popular Music* (Chicago, 2007), 159; 2.

12 Kassabian, Anahid, 'Ubiquitous Listening' in David Hesmondhalgh & Keith Negus (eds), *Popular Music Studies* (Oxford, 2002), 138.

13 Negus, Keith, *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures* (London, 1999), 14; 28.

14 Negus, Keith, 'Identities and Industries: The Cultural Formation of Aesthetic Economies' in P. du Gay & M. Pryke (eds), *Cultural Economy* (London, 2002), 116.

15 Negus, *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures*, 6.

16 *Ibid*, 172.

reality, just as Richard Dyer witnesses in cinema, audiences ‘select from the complexity of the image the meanings and feelings, the variations, inflections and contradictions that work for them’.¹⁷ Any one music can, and often does, have multiple audiences; yet genres do not reinvent themselves to a new audience, nor do their conventional meanings change to their original adoptive community. Crossover happens because music means many things at once; because genre is enclosed in the boundaries of a single audience.

The generic filing system assumes that the object always remains the same. Yet neither living beings, nor music genres, remain in stasis: both mature slowly but evolve continually, absorbing influences in different ways, at different rates. Cultural objects are always changing, and thus always pushing at the boundaries of the classifications under which humans attempt to file them for future reference. Just as Darwin proved that varieties of a species could develop into separate species by focussing on the difficulties naturalists had in distinguishing them,¹⁸ so music critics, journalists and enthusiasts have defined a whole range of new genres and subgenres along the boundaries between hard rock and metal, and pop and dance, without being able to define what categories such as ‘folk music’ should contain. Lou Harrison’s assertion that we have no choice but to respect hybrids, because there really is nothing else, rings true.¹⁹

1.1 The High, the Low, and the Hybrid

Hybridity within musicology has only recently come into focus, and this has been the result of considering music not simply as an end in itself but through its relationship with society. As social divisions gained increasing recognition as one of the foremost political problems of the last decades of the twentieth century, a

17 Dyer, Richard, *Heavenly Bodies: Film Stars and Society* (Basingstoke, 1987), 5.

18 For a discussion of the effect of applying this logic to human races, see Young, Robert, *Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race* (London, 1995), 11-15.

19 Extract from Harrison’s *Music Primer* (New York, 1970), quoted in Miller, Leta and Lieberman, Fredric, ‘Lou Harrison and the American Gamelan’, *American Music* 17, 2 (1999), 174. Harrison’s music was considered by Dale Craig to be the furthest point to which musical hybridisation could be pushed (see ‘Transcendental World Music’, *Asian Music* 2, 1 (1971), 6).

number of scholars interested in the divide between high and low cultures have attempted to track what high and low currently mean. Our basic understanding of ‘high’ and ‘low’ has been dictated to us by history, a remnant of the beginning of commercial entertainment in the mid-nineteenth century. This commercial, ‘low’ culture can be distinguished by its ‘high-pressure tactics’, according to Robert Fink, while ‘high’ culture, elevated to a state of autonomy from everyday life, ‘has demanded to be marketed with discretion’.²⁰ High art did not even need to please an audience: ‘When Theodore Thomas was warned that he was peppering his programs with too many compositions by Richard Wagner, which the people did not like, he replied, “Then they must hear them till they do”.’²¹

The main problem with this distinction is that the systems that once supported high culture financially have disappeared. While performers such as Jenny Lind and Ole Bull were marketed, this was considered part and parcel of the low cultural aspects of their concerts; by the end of the nineteenth-century, art and popular musics were rarely heard on the same bill. Without patronage or state subsidy, modern-day high culture has passed into new hands; as Hal Foster remarks, ‘art (at least in the United States) is today the plaything of (corporate) patrons whose relation to culture is less one of noble obligation than of overt manipulation – of art as a sign of power, prestige, publicity’.²² High culture must now rely on the same marketing mechanisms that drive low culture in order to survive.

The majority of commentators prefer to distinguish high and low solely on the basis of their relative degree of *cultural capital* or prestige. This is intricately linked to social hierarchies; in *Highbrow/Lowbrow*, Lawrence Levine ‘points out that the very terms “highbrow” and “lowbrow” reflect the influence of phrenology, the racist pseudoscience of the nineteenth century that “determined” racial identity and intelligence by measuring cranial shapes’, implying that the higher brows of Europeans indicated a higher intellect, and thus a superior culture.²³ High culture

20 Fink, Robert, ‘Elvis Everywhere: Musicology and Popular Music Studies at the Twilight of the Canon’, *American Music* 16, 2 (2002), 143.

21 Levine, Lawrence, *Highbrow/Lowbrow: the Emergence of Cultural Hierarchy in America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1988), 189.

22 Foster, Hal, *Recodings: art, spectacle, cultural politics* (Seattle, 1985), 4.

23 Lipsitz, George, ‘Review: High Culture and Hierarchy’, *American Quarterly* 43, 3 (1991), 520.

reproduced bourgeois public values;²⁴ it claimed a greater degree of morality and aesthetics, engaged the mind and led to enlightenment.²⁵ Low culture, on the other hand, led towards standardisation and gratification, and rejected high morals.²⁶ Richard Middleton goes so far as to suggest that pop music ‘only exists when it knows its place’, that there can be no cultural mobility.²⁷

Classical music, however, no longer has the same degree of cultural capital, the same level of prestige, due mainly to recording and broadcasting media:

The assumption that people need to be prepared to hear classical music is largely abandoned, undermined by the nature of radio itself. Classical music is no longer a ritual which you must dress up and travel to a public building to hear. Now it comes out of your speakers and into your ears before you know what it is, sometimes before you are awake.²⁸

Audiences have changed. Now art ‘is regarded mostly as entertainment or spectacle (of interest to the public primarily as a financial item)’,²⁹ is ‘less culturally relevant’ than before.³⁰ One-time consumers of high culture have expanded their musical tastes: ‘As we move up the income, education, and social pedigree scales, we find more tolerance for different musical genres’, to the extent that Bernard Gendron feels ‘exclusiveness is now associated more with lowbrownness’.³¹ High and low still exist, for cultural capital is not distributed equally; but ‘the aesthetics of each class of that hierarchy [have] undergone a major transformation’.³²

Crossover is a product of that transformation. It should not be a surprise that the

24 Foster, *Recordings*, 4.

25 Dyer, Richard, *Only Entertainment* (2nd ed., London, 2002), 2; DeNora, Tia, *After Adorno: Rethinking Music Sociology* (Cambridge, 2003), 16.

26 *Ibid.*

27 Middleton, Richard, *Voicing the Popular: On the Subjects of Popular Music* (New York, 2006), 23; Middleton’s emphasis.

28 Parakilas, James, ‘Classical Music as Popular Music’, *Journal of Musicology* 3, 1 (1984), 16.

29 Foster, *Recordings*, 4.

30 Gendron, Bernard, *Between Montmartre and the Mudd Club: Popular Music and the Avant-Garde* (Chicago, 2002), 6.

31 *Ibid.*, 12.

32 *Ibid.*, 326.

scholars who have addressed the situation of high and low have had to address the middle ground of where the two meet; and in doing so, they have turned their attentions to how cultures have integrated successfully through musical adoption and assimilation. Their conclusions all suggested that musical hybridity was indeed explicitly social; but there was little consensus as to the effects on the hybrid of natural and subconscious evolution, on the one hand, and of deliberate manipulation on the other. Problems of difference and sameness, individuality and authority, were likewise attributed varying degrees of importance in the formation and appreciation of the hybrids under study. There were, however, three broad groups into which these diverse scholars fell.

The first of these groups contains those theorists who consider the prime focus of hybridity to be *a means of negotiating cultural difference*; it includes eminent musicologists such as Richard Middleton, Georgina Born, Bernard Gendron, and Robert Fink. Following Pierre Bourdieu's assumption that the markets for 'symbolic goods' and economic goods, aligned with high culture and popular culture respectively, are historically separate and hostile,³³ music 'remains a fundamental class marker... whence the passions that highbrow and lowbrow, or elite and mass, musical tastes... still arouse'.³⁴ Crossings between high and low culture, between art and entertainment, are central to their attentions even at the expense of other social differences: 'mass culture is modernism's other in music as in the other arts, while reference to "authentic" folk and ethnic musics, primitive and exotic constructions, have remained more enduring and acceptable as forms of appropriation and projection in music'.³⁵

These theorists recognise that, in part, hybridity between high and low arts has arisen due to market forces. It is plain that high culture must acquire economic capital in order to survive: 'With the decline in public funding and subsidy for the arts, all musics have increasingly to find ways to survive on the basis of substantial markets; all are increasingly dependent on the dynamics of the recording and

33 See *Ibid*, 330.

34 Jameson, Frederic, *Postmodernism; or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism* (Minneapolis, 1989), 299.

35 Born, Georgina, 'Introduction' in Georgina Born & Desmond Hesmondhalgh (eds.), *Western Music and Its Others: Difference, Representation and Appropriation in Music* (Berkeley, 2000), 16.

entertainment industries; and marketing and market-oriented thinking have become prevalent in concert organizations, music education, and new music institutions'.³⁶ It may be less obvious, however, that the popular arts desire cultural capital of their own. Since the value of pop music 'is thought to lie in the cultural specificity of its message and effect', its cultural prestige is greater than that of classical music for its prospective audience;³⁷ and the wider its audience (or the greater its commercial success), the greater its artistic power.³⁸ Musicians' careers depend on initial and continued interest, thus 'critical approval, respect, canonization – all these are desirable goods even for those primarily preoccupied with commercial success'.³⁹ Contrary to Bourdieu's distinction between them, the markets for symbolic and economic goods have always been inseparable.

These theorists also note, however, that this cultural negotiation does not necessarily lead to cultural equality. For Born, despite the appearance of postmodernism's aesthetic plurality as 'an autonomous and effective force for transforming [socioeconomic] differences', it reflects instead 'a cultural system that conceals domination and inequality', projecting Western desires onto and reasserting Western control over its incorporated Others.⁴⁰ Middleton is reminded that 'the people's voice... [can be] spoken for it from elsewhere – or... forced to move within an orbit conditioned by "higher" cultural forces';⁴¹ the popular may threaten, but is tamed by high art, a reinforcement of 'the Enlightenment's idea of the low: under control'.⁴² Yet not all view this as a negative dialogue. Will Straw has suggested that the plurality of musical practices found within local music scenes is key to the health and vitality of those scenes. While 'the correlation of tastes and consumption patterns with categories of social identity... [is an] explicit and resonant component of the sense music fans make of their own involvement in the culture of popular music', alliances are formed between different social groups through the interaction of 'their' musics in clubs and on the radio (which are

36 *Ibid.*, 19.

37 Fink, 'Elvis Everywhere', 146; 159.

38 Middleton, Richard, *Studying Popular Music* (Philadelphia, 1990), 252.

39 Gendron, *Between Montmartre and the Mudd Club*, 5.

40 Born, 'Introduction', 20-21.

41 Middleton, *Voicing the Popular*, 5.

42 Middleton, Richard, 'Musical Belongings: Western Music and Its Low-Other' in Born & Hesmondhalgh (eds.), *Western Music and Its Others*, 64.

similarly ‘aligned with populations along the lines of class and taste’).⁴³ In this case, musical hybridity is not just reflecting social allegiances, but actively changing them.

A second group of theorists see hybridity primarily in this latter light, as a *symptom of music's use as a tool for social control* – either reflecting the changing needs of authority, or offering a healthy challenge to its order. Tia DeNora, Susan McClary, and Keith Negus are among those who believe this to be the case. Starting from Adorno's assertion that ‘the culture industry and its drive towards standardisation militated against enlightenment through repetition and predictability’, allowing the listener to take pleasure in reliability, it is not difficult ‘to focus on how music may be used as an instrument of social control – in advertisement and marketing, in political campaigns, to configure conduct within physical spaces’.⁴⁴ DeNora has written of how she has found music to act on her own consciousness, redefining the way she experienced a five-second interval: ‘it reconstructed the ongoing aim of my action such that the very thing I had been awaiting so eagerly (access to my email) was redefined in the real-time situation, as something that was interrupting the pleasure of the music’.⁴⁵ She has also noted that, as state, church, and industry have witnessed music's power over consciousness, emotion, and the physical body, these authoritative parties assert that it ‘should be subject to regulation and control’.⁴⁶

Control is manifested in different ways. Entertainment, argues Richard Dyer, is a tool of capitalism; while it demonstrates the ‘usual struggle between capital (the backers) and labour (the performers) over control of the product’, however, because the job involves direct contact between the worker (rather than the patron) and the consumer ‘the workforce is in a better position to determine the form of the product’, thus reserving an element of control for the performer.⁴⁷ Martin Stokes has written specifically of the political discourse surrounding a single hybrid genre, arabesk, in Turkey. Arabesk is interpreted variously, by different

43 Straw, Will, ‘Systems of Articulation, Logics of Change: Communities and Scenes in Popular Music’, *Cultural Studies* 53 (1991), 372; 384.

44 DeNora, *After Adorno*, 16; 153.

45 DeNora, *Music in Everyday Life*, 8.

46 DeNora, *After Adorno*, 1.

47 Dyer, Richard, *Only Entertainment* (2nd ed., London, 2002), 18.

parties, as the last remaining source of continuity with the Ottoman cultural legacy, stressing ‘the significance of the Ottoman state as a European Muslim power’; the failure of ‘state-led attempts to forget a Muslim and Arab past in pursuit of a secular and Western destiny’; or a stand-in for ‘the Ottoman cultural legacy that has been squandered during seventy years of secularist republicanism’.⁴⁸ Stokes notes:

Musical performance, while peculiarly open to discursive invasion, is also therefore open to discursive debate: its meanings can never be fixed conclusively in spoken language, and the “same” music can thus be appropriated by different groups for quite different reasons. While this allows veiled criticisms to be expressed when open criticism is impossible, it also allows dominant groups in turn to interpret musics in ways that suit their interests, to promote these interpretations with the resources available to them, and to exclude those which oppose their interests.⁴⁹

This is particularly the case with hybrids; the complexity of meanings, contexts, and contradictions within can be selected for their specificity to any culture or subculture. Communities need have nothing in common for them to share a taste for such a cultural product; consumers hear what they *want* to hear.

At other times, control can be rooted in the hands of the artists, attempting to ensure their voices are heard irrespective of their position in the social hierarchy. Most of the sampling techniques found in rap, suggests McClary, ‘principally act as pretexts for the intertextual signifying so central to African-based practices. More than that, they reflect an obsession with cultural memory, a desire to transmit traces of the past as still-vibrant elements of the present’,⁵⁰ and a means of articulating the frustrations of community isolation and difference. Misread as a postmodernist flaunting of empty conventions, sampling was dismissed by a wider audience as unoriginal, unable to express novelty; thus when the same frustrations were articulated instead through violence, the unrest was met with surprise. To avoid overlooking potential social problems, ‘we need to pay attention to the kinds of ferment located in boundaries, to fusions of unpredictable sorts that

48 Stokes, Martin, ‘East, West, and Arabesk’ in Born & Hesmondhalgh (eds.), *Western Music and Its Others*, 226; 217; 219.

49 *Ibid*, 216.

50 McClary, Susan, *Conventional Wisdom: The Content of Musical Form* (Berkeley, 2000), 160.

continually give rise to new genres and modes of expression'.⁵¹

For Negus, these two views are conflated. Culture ('the practices through which people create meaningful worlds in which to live')⁵² and the music industry do not oppose each other; rather, they use each other in order to control musical developments. We know that 'entertainment corporations set up structures of organization and institute distinct working practices to produce identifiable products, commodities and "intellectual properties"' and 'the music industry rewards and recognizes certain genre practices, sounds, combinations, cultures and not others' according to corporate priorities.⁵³ But we should also consider that 'there are just as many less known but significant artists who have attracted people due to their critical acclaim, even though they would be considered a poor investment in terms of simple economic indicators':⁵⁴ and that despite cultural intermediaries, such as advertisers, encouraging us 'not only to buy, but also to interpret, understand and grasp the meanings of products in a certain way', there is no way for the industry to determine these meanings concretely for all musicians and audiences.⁵⁵ The industry might be responsible for categorising performers, songs and audiences into distinct and divisive genres, enabling efficient marketing at the expense of contributing to community separation, but musicians who create hybrids help to reverse the process: 'Crossing genre boundaries is not only a musical act, it is also a social act, a way of making connections, of creating solidarities'.⁵⁶

Both these groups of theorists recognise that social distinction and social control go hand-in-hand: that it is because of difference that control is deemed necessary, and because of control that difference becomes so powerful. The final group of theorists contains those for whom neither culture nor control can be considered a greater contributor, and who instead concentrate on a view of hybridity as *forced and unnatural*. Representative are Frederic Jameson, Hal Foster, and Fabian Holt, all of whom are pessimistic in their outlooks.

51 *Ibid*, 139-140; 168.

52 Stuart Hall, cited in Negus, *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures*, 20.

53 Negus, *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures*, 14; 6.

54 Negus, 'Identities and Industries', 124.

55 Negus, *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures*, 23.

56 Negus, 'Identities and Industries', 129.

For both Jameson and Foster, the pluralist hybridity found in postmodernism is not only unnatural, but offers proof that art has degenerated into financially-motivated entertainment:⁵⁷ ‘in postmodern culture, “culture” has become a product in its own right; the market has become a substitute for itself and fully as much a commodity as any of the items it includes within itself’.⁵⁸ After modernism, culture lost its focus: ‘if the experience and ideology of the unique self... is over and done with, then it is no longer clear what the artists and writers of the present period are supposed to be doing. What is clear is merely that the older models... do not work any more’.⁵⁹ The past is invoked, but through pastiche, disregarding historical context and continuum, and while ‘the line between high art and commercial forms seems increasingly difficult to draw’, rather than levelling social differences, ‘it only pronounces them – along with the privileges that underlie them’.⁶⁰ Thus postmodernism, and the society that consumes it, is likened to a schizophrenic, which not only refuses to think historically,⁶¹ but also ‘is condemned to live a perpetual present with which the various moments of his or her past have little connection and for which there is no conceivable future on the horizon... an experience of isolated, disconnected, discontinuous material signifiers which fail to link up into a coherent sequence’.⁶² There can be nothing natural about such ‘indiscriminate’ hybridity when ‘both art *and* freedom consist entirely of conventions. To disregard this conventionality is dangerous: art seen as natural will also be seen as free of “unnatural” constraints (history and politics in particular), in which case it will become truly autonomous – i.e., merely irrelevant’.⁶³

With genre as his central focus, it is unsurprising that Holt also expresses distrust over a celebration of hybridity. His main fear, however – that we may ignore genre

57 Foster, *Recodings*, 4.

58 Jameson, *Postmodernism*, x.

59 Jameson, Frederic, ‘Postmodernism and Consumer Society’ in Foster (ed), *Postmodern Culture* (London, 1985), 115.

60 *Ibid*, 112; Foster, *Recodings*, 29.

61 Foster, *Postmodern Culture*, xii.

62 Jameson, ‘Postmodernism and Consumer Society’, 119.

63 Foster, *Recodings*, 15.

altogether and overlook the social factors creating music – is surely unfounded;⁶⁴ to study the transgression of borders is to observe the fields they enclose, and it would be close to impossible to fail to notice the combined social forces which enable hybrids to occur. Holt believes that, because ‘Genre boundaries are contingent upon the social spaces in which they emerge’ and thus are produced by social identity, then any hybridisation or reclassification of music genre that takes place will also affect that social identity.⁶⁵ Reminding us that ‘A classic strategy of popularization has been to adjust genres to the mainstream and create crossovers, so that artists sell in a broad market’,⁶⁶ he is troubled that such forced hybridity – as opposed to that arising from interactions between social groups – can invoke a kind of identity crisis, the new music adversely affecting the social health of the space in which the genre first emerged. Yet we know that social spaces are neither fixed nor inflexible; and Holt himself acknowledges the problem of concentrating on generic products, noting that the artists such as Jennifer Lopez and Ricky Martin are precluded from Latin music scholarship because ‘their mainstream identity does not appeal to people with a strict genre focus’.⁶⁷ Caught between concern for the social construction of boundaries and the exclusivity they create, he resorts to the warning that hybridity is not the new, sophisticated phenomenon its emergence in cultural theory suggests.⁶⁸

1.2 Taste and Social Status

It should go without saying that hybridity can only occur when two or more separate entities interact. In hybrid musics, as we have discussed, these entities are genres. Genres alone, however, cannot effect social control, nor can they articulate cultural difference, unless they are recognisably connected to culture and society. Indeed, genre preference can be considered an indicator of taste, its consumption a social choice. Bourdieu has argued that consuming culture is linked to the definition of one's social standing, both to assert an individual's privileges and to reassert existing social distinctions; put simply, consumer

64 Holt, *Genre in Popular Music*, 180.

65 *Ibid*, 14.

66 *Ibid*, 25.

67 *Ibid*, 165.

68 *Ibid*, 168.

preference is ‘the product of [class-related] dispositions activated in [individual] choices’.⁶⁹ Bourdieu also suggests that the media play a great role in forming these social choices. Controlled either by the state or commercial interests, most radio stations will target specific groups by broadcasting a narrow range of genres, selected (by market research, opinion polls, or otherwise) for their appeal to these sections of the public.⁷⁰ In turn, the broadcasters then control the types of music a consumer can access on the air, reinforcing the link between social status and preference. Bourdieu reported the results of an experiment designed to test his theory in the oft-cited *La Distinction* (translated in 1984 as *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*), in which the preferences shown for extracts from *The Well-Tempered Clavier* and *The Blue Danube* were inversely proportional and aligned with opposing ends of the participants’ social hierarchy; his conclusion was that cultural consumption reproduced social hierarchies, rather than contributing to personal enlightenment.⁷¹

Other studies suggest that, while taste does tend to reflect social status, preferences are not necessarily as polarised as those of Bourdieu’s French participants. Richard Peterson and Albert Simkus used the 1982 national Census Bureau’s Survey of Public Participation in the Arts to compare data on musical preferences with contributors’ occupational groups; their findings concluded that the division between high and low tastes had been replaced by omnivorous high-status occupational groups (who consume a variety of genres), and univorous lower-status occupational groups (who display restricted taste and strongly defend

69 Grenfell, Michael, *Pierre Bourdieu, Agent Provocateur* (London, 2004), 96; see also 84-91.

70 Bourdieu considers ‘public opinion’ to be another agent of social distinction. The opinions of the party that commissions the research are likely to permeate the responses given: the actual questioning may be biased, in wording or a limited range of answers; and the results are often reported in a manner that foregrounds the concerns of the commissioning body. In this way, a body can act in its own interest, while claiming to act in the public interest. See Grenfell, 91-92; in depth, see Bourdieu, Pierre and Passeron, Jean-Claude, trans. Richard Nice, *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture* (2nd ed., London, 1990).

71 Bourdieu, Pierre, trans. Richard Nice, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Oxford, 1984), 15.

their choices).⁷² This is disputed by a follow-up analysis of the equivalent survey of Dutch arts participation (*Cultuurparticipatie van de Nederlandse Bevolking*, 1987) undertaken by Koen van Eijck in 2001, who argued that only through linking the number of genres enjoyed with the types of genres enjoyed can trends in cultural tastes be understood.⁷³

Across separate hierarchies based on occupational status and level of education, van Eijck found very little variation in the *numbers* of genres enjoyed;⁷⁴ members of the higher-status groups did tend to be more omnivorous, but only considering those genres that were ‘more or less’ liked, rather than favourite genres (those genres marked as listened to ‘often’ tended to be those to which one could sing along, thus sentimental songs had far more apparent fans than jazz).⁷⁵ Instead, social groups divided into taste communities roughly equivalent to Simon Frith’s art, pop and folk value discourses,⁷⁶ or Gerhard Schulze’s highbrow, pop and folk schemes,⁷⁷ more or less paralleling expectations based on Bourdieu’s ideas of legitimacy.⁷⁸ Within the broadly higher-status, highbrow-consuming group, van

72 Peterson, Richard, and Simkus, Albert, ‘How musical tastes mark occupational status groups’ in Lamont, M. and Fournier, M. (eds.), *Cultivating Differences: Symbolic Boundaries and the Making of Inequality* (Chicago, 1992), 152-186.

73 van Eijck, Koen, ‘Social Differentiation in Musical Taste Patterns’, *Social Forces* 79, 3 (2001), 1163-1185.

74 The *discrete* categories from which participants could pick were as follows: chamber music; symphonic music; opera; improvised music or jazz; blues, Dixieland, etc; pop, rock, reggae, new wave; top 40, disco; folk; operetta; spiritual music, gospel, psalms, choirs; sentimental Dutch songs, chansons; music for mandolin, accordion, or guitar; brass band. ‘For each genre, respondents could indicate whether they listened to it “often”, “every now and then”, or “seldom or never”.’ (van Eijck, 1170.)

75 van Eijck, ‘Social Differentiation in Musical Taste Patterns’, 1163; 1171.

76 van Eijck (1168) cites Frith, Simon, ‘What Is Good Music?’, *Canadian University Music Review* 12 (1990) 92-102; later discussions in the present thesis draw upon the expansion of these principles in Frith’s *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music* (Cambridge, Mass., 1996).

77 See Schulze, Gerhard, *Die Erlebnisgesellschaft: Kultursoziologie der Gegenwart* (Frankfurt, 1995).

78 While ‘average levels of occupational status do decline consistently from left to right’, the ‘exceptions are jazz and blues/Dixieland, which attract a more educated audience than opera’. (van Eijck, 1171.)

Eijck situated the omnivores, ‘whose tastes combine a set of genres related to all these discourses’, and whose social standing he equates to Schulze’s ‘new middle class’, the ‘dominated faction of the dominant class’: he imagines that this factor ‘represents the taste of a segment of the cultural elite that values authenticity (blues, folk, rock) and instrumental tours de force (jazz, symphonic music, chamber music)’.⁷⁹ This appears to be validated by Schulze’s own expectations: ‘the members of the new middle class are likely to combine pop with classical music or jazz (the latter being in itself a genre that can be argued to evoke both excitement and transcendence)’.⁸⁰

What is shared among these models by Bourdieu, Peterson and Simkus, and van Eijck is their assumption of a homology between high social status and consumption of high culture, which, while criticised by Simon Frith and others, is played out in the discernible patterns within social groups. Equally, they meet problems when faced with music of a hybrid nature. For Bourdieu’s experiment, preferences for *Rhapsody in Blue* (discussed in Chapter 3) were spread across the hierarchy in no definable pattern; it failed to appeal to one section over any other, and so the findings were not useful to his point. Such hybrids do, however, construct a system of *relations*, that might offer a means of escaping social classification. Different musics, after all, use different languages; social space can be negotiated or negated by consumers as a result of their personal interpretations of this language. Musical opinions may reveal rifts in wider outlook, or form strong bonds of identity that are not exclusively tied to a consumer’s education or social status, especially so when the music is new or unfamiliar, if ingrained resistance to change is overcome.

1.3 Subverting Social Structures

The very concept of social systems reproducing themselves in order to conserve their values suggests that cultural hybridity or crossover would dilute and ultimately endanger those systems.⁸¹ Yet van Eijck’s findings indicate that groups

79 van Eijck, ‘Social Differentiation in Musical Taste Patterns’, 1163; 1175-7.

80 *Ibid*, 1168.

81 Bourdieu and Passeron, *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*, 102.

of genres accord more strongly with social group identity than do single genres alone:

knowing whether a person loves symphonic music does not mean very much. Rather, what matters is to find out whether this love is combined with an appreciation for opera or jazz. Studying tastes is probably increasingly less informative if one does not assess the full breadth of a person's taste (the cultural consumption pattern) because it is more and more the specific combination of styles of genres that tells us what type of cultural consumer we are dealing with.⁸²

By crossing over the genre boundaries *within* those genre groups, hybrid cultural products can actually *strengthen* social identity. This happened, for instance, in Peru in the 1960s, where Andean migrants to Lima dominated local radio with their blend of traditional and Criollo country music. While this represents only a transitional phase in the negotiation of urban Andean Indian identity, discrimination was avoided through the adoption of Inca traditions, strengthening the identity of the migrant groups through a shared heritage celebrated by both rural and urban Peruvians, while preserving aspects of musical interest to both communities.⁸³

America's social structure was upset as a result of the slave trade, by the arrival of immigrants of considerably different social makeup who could not hope to gain legitimacy by the system's existing standards. The host community had the power to accept or adopt any desirable traditions brought into the country, and to reject any unwanted ones. Nevertheless, aspects of heritage unconsciously shared allowed the new community to make space for itself through music: the African American music of the plantations accepted or rejected facets of American music according to taste and compatibility with the Africanisms it retained.⁸⁴ The

82 van Eijck, 'Social Differentiation in Musical Taste Patterns', 1181.

83 For hybridity in both music and society, see Turino, Thomas, 'The Music of Andean Migrants in Lima, Peru: Demographics, Social Power, and Style', *Latin American Music Review* 9, 2 (1988), 127-150; and Schaedel, Richard, 'From Homogenization to Heterogenization in Lima, Peru', *Urban Anthropology* 8, 3 (1979), 399-420.

84 Cogdell Djedje, Jacqueline, 'African American Music to 1900' in David Nicholls (ed.), *Cambridge History of American Music* (Cambridge, 1998), 103-134; Kazadi wa Mukuna's 'Creative Practice in African Music: New Perspectives in the Scrutiny of Africanisms in Diaspora', *Black Music Research Journal* 17, 2 (1997), 239-250; and Martin, Denis-Constant, 'Filiation or Innovation? Some Hypotheses to Overcome the Dilemma of Afro-American Music's Origins', *Black Music Research Journal* 11, 1 (1991), 19-38, offer excellent overviews of various musical and social exchanges.

adoption of the English language, while forced upon them by slave owners, also helped to unite slaves from diverse tribes and regions of Africa by offering a means of communication common to all of them. Lyrics, particularly of spirituals, enabled a sense of community to bloom thanks to interpretive differences: expressions of oppression gained a means of broadcast where white supervisors heard only naïve sentiment, allowing the community a chance to root and grow.

At play here, despite the apparent contradiction, are aspects both of *camouflage* and of *social-structural disruption*. Since social systems are controlled largely by the upper echelons of a society, they can be difficult to influence from outside. Music, however, is within one's own control. By disguising one's own cultural traits through merging them with those of one's hosts, hybridising the art form, an individual or community can gain acceptance; once inside the social structure, differences can be gradually amplified in order to indicate one's presence and one's needs.

Culture is subject to hybridity even when a conscious effort is made to preserve it. The last remaining Karaite Jewish community was forced to emigrate from Cairo because of heightening tensions between Arabs and Israelis during the 1950s and 1960s. Most of the refugees settled in Israel, with a thousand leaving for the United States. The level of compromise already necessitated by the communities' new surroundings, in both cases, made preserving the remaining tradition increasingly important;⁸⁵ 'the very idea of *assimilation in the destination countries* would have meant a death blow to Karaism as a living faith and to Karaite self-identity'.⁸⁶ Music was the strongest marker of community difference, and – in both Israel and America – a desire to produce one unified, 'authentic' Karaite style led to the purging of discrepancies between formerly local liturgical practices.⁸⁷ The popularity of Egyptian-Arabic music had 'surpassed that of local folk music and

85 See Rice, Timothy, 'Toward the Remodeling of Ethnomusicology', *Ethnomusicology* 31, 3 (1987), 469-488; and Shelemay, Kay, 'Response to Rice', *Ethnomusicology* 31, 3 (1987), 489-490.

86 Hirshberg, Jehoash, 'The Role of Music in the Renewed Self-Identity of Karaite Jewish Refugee Communities from Cairo', *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 21 (1989), 39; my emphasis.

87 Hirshberg, 'The Role of Music...', 36-56; see also El-Kodsi, Mourad, *The Karaite Jews of Egypt 1982-1986* (New York, 1987).

even that of the easily available popular music' in the Karaite community before and after emigration, and its influence had been felt in adaptations of the songs set to the Karaite liturgy: now deemed unsuitable for this task, songs that could be identified as Arab in origin were removed from practice altogether. As a result of dispersion and the musical purification process, just thirty of the estimated 250 melodies to Karaite prayer book texts practised in Cairo are in use among the Karaites in Israel, and only twelve in the San Francisco Bay community.⁸⁸

These three examples of voluntary and enforced migration show the different ways in which the respectively chosen and unchosen recipient communities can affect the degree of assimilative or preservative hybridity of the migrant group's culture. These hybrids are reactions to the surrounding community, deliberate steps taken to preserve tradition or make it more amenable to the majority; while they may not have evolved 'naturally', they are not deliberately created for an economic market. Just as Bourdieu found in the academic field, music can be 'the locus of a struggle to determine the conditions and the criteria of legitimate membership and legitimate hierarchy': by agents trying to have their own criteria acknowledged, 'they are working to modify the laws of formation of the prices characteristic of the [...] market, and thereby to increase their potential for profit' – *social profit*.⁸⁹

1.4 Culture and Control

Music proves an extremely powerful means of adjusting a community's social status through negotiating first cultural, then social, and eventually political capital. For those at the top of the hierarchy, this shifting balance of capital challenges their degree of privilege, and thus it is in their interests to avoid cultural change. The dominant social interest perpetuates class and other social differences by highlighting differences in taste – even though (as we have seen) these tastes are enculturated – and asserts its own right to products of the highest cultural capital, 'good' taste. By associating societal value with cultural value, the dominant class benefits high culture; but most of all it benefits itself.

88 Hirshberg, 'The Role of Music...', 52-53.

89 Bourdieu, Pierre, trans. Peter Collier, *Homo Academicus* (Cambridge, 1988), 11.

Because music is open to discursive debate, it is also open to discursive control: it ‘allows dominant groups... to interpret musics in ways that suit their interests, to promote these interpretations with the resources available to them, and to exclude those which oppose their interests’.⁹⁰ This can happen for explicitly political purposes, as the warring interpretations of the Turkish arabesk, the struggle to claim the genre for partisan gain, testify. But it can also be used as a sign of stability. Of classical music in the West, James Parakilas suggests

The classics belong to the authorities as well as to individual listeners, and not just to the musical authorities, which conferred classical status in the first place, but to the social and political authorities which support the musical ones. The classics offer comfort to the individual listener in part because they belong to the authorities. Classical music is approved music; it is politically and socially safe.⁹¹

In this way, classical music can be a haven, sheltered from political wrangling and distant from the social struggles that characterise the dangerous world of pop.

The musical authorities to which Parakilas refers can be considered responsible for maintaining the nineteenth-century idea of the canon of classical music, with a handful of more recent additions attempting to prove its ongoing relevance. This canon provides the staple fare of orchestral concerts and classical broadcasters’ airtime; it is also propagated as the basis of schools’ music curricula, and the object of study for the largest proportion of musicologists. The tools of musicology protect the canonic classics (‘Analysis upholds the cultural prestige of the canon, and maintains a powerful hierarchy of taste, based on the ability to create and perceive complex forms’),⁹² as does academic reputation (‘I began listening to the popular music that I had always avoided for fear of immediate professional death’).⁹³ ‘Classical music’, in this sense, is strongly policed by the cultural authorities; and even while its cultural advantage weakens, as academia and the middlebrow press introduce pop to their music departments, classical music remains exclusive by demanding both the ‘educational requirements for a full “appreciation” and the financial requirements to consume it.⁹⁴

90 Stokes, ‘East, West, and Arabesk’, 216.

91 Parakilas, ‘Classical Music as Popular Music’, 11.

92 Fink, ‘Elvis Everywhere’, 162.

93 McClary, *Conventional Wisdom*, xi.

94 Gendron, *Between Montmartre and the Mudd Club*, 325.

The distinction of popular music from other genres emerged during the same period as what could be considered the commodification of other cultural and scientific activities. In the UK, a stereotypical separation of the arts as (entertaining) performance and the sciences as (lab-based) research was played out by government funding plans. While the research councils were ostensibly free to make funding decisions without policy direction from ministers – even though they ‘had to be prepared to account for these decisions to government, parliament and the public’⁹⁵ – the distribution of funding was not entirely without governmental influence. While the publicly-funded Arts Council supported artistic performance and participation since its creation in 1946,⁹⁶ *research* into the arts and humanities had no central support until the foundation of the Arts and Humanities Research Board in 1998. On the announcement that the board would become a fully-fledged research *council* in 2005, its chief executive explained that this change in status would ‘provide a coherent and much-needed route from the arts and humanities community to government policy making’, marking the end of an apparent communications blockade.⁹⁷ Funds from the *charity* allocation of the National Lottery supported additional arts activity in the UK: in its first ten years (up to September 2004), ‘the lottery had injected almost £2 billion into the arts’.⁹⁸ As of 2001, however, under the government’s New Opportunities initiative, the National Lottery became a quasi-official funding source for the Arts Councils, freeing up other government resources.⁹⁹ While the Councils’ ‘arm’s length’ policy was still

95 ‘History of Arts Council England’, accessed online at <http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/regions/information_detail.php?rid=7&sid=10&id=52> on 21 November 2008.

96 Further details on the formation and purpose of the Arts Councils in the UK can be found in its official history, Andrew Sinclair’s *Arts and Cultures: The History of the 50 Years of the Arts Council of Great Britain* (London, 1995), and Richard Witten’s *Artist Unknown: An Alternative History of the Arts Council* (London, 1998).

97 Curtis, Polly, ‘AHRB set to become research council’, *The Guardian* (23 July 2002).

98 http://www.culture.gov.uk/what_we_do/arts/4079.aspx (accessed 21 November 2008).

99 The New Opportunities Fund Order 2001 specified the fund was ‘designed to give effect to initiatives specified by the Secretary of State that are concerned or connected with health, education or the environment’; these included funding for physical education (a compulsory part of the curriculum) in schools, and the prevention, detection, treatment and care of heart disease, cancer and stroke patients (which, in

considered to be in force, the New Opportunities Fund enabled the Secretary of State to have a direct hand in specifying where at least part of arts funding could be allocated.

Despite UK government rhetoric claiming the contrary, music was treated much like any commercial product. Funding mechanisms ensured activity was goal-oriented rather than spontaneous, and control over funding by central bodies tailored the goals to specific needs. Moreover, the requirement for both the Arts and Humanities Research Council and the Arts Council to be accountable to the public for their decisions privileged ‘commercial’ measures of success over others, in order to offer some kind of recompense for the receipt of public money. Cultural capital became outweighed by social and financial capital, mirroring Bourdieu’s critique of the university system in France: ‘what counts more and more is access to money, to projects, to work funded by the government, etc., and then it isn’t automatically someone’s intellectual level which counts’.¹⁰⁰ The utilitarian, rather than philanthropic, nature of most governmental arts funding should not be overlooked; economic concerns were the prime factors leading to the foundation of the Arts Councils’ predecessor (the Committee for the Encouragement of Music and the Arts, established as a wartime morale-boosting and employment scheme).¹⁰¹

the UK, would otherwise be catered for under the government-funded National Health Service). For the Arts Councils in 2008, the Department for Culture, Media and Sport were responsible for the remaining ‘part-funding’ (http://www.culture.gov.uk/what_we_do/arts/3210.aspx).

100 Bourdieu, *Homo Academicus*, 85.

101 ‘History of Arts Council England’. Arts Council England recently undertook research into the factors that affect participation in the arts in order to help shape public policy. Tak, Wing Chan et al, ‘Briefing no 7’ in *Attendance at music events and participation in musical activities in England: Findings from the Taking Part Survey* (April 2008), <http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/documents/projects/music_phpEH9JV3.pdf> (accessed 5 November 2008) outlined that the findings were, overall, in accordance with Bourdieu’s findings in *Distinction*; as opera, classical music and jazz were found to have a restricted audience (‘typically white, well educated Londoners of high social status’), it remains to be seen whether this unsurprising outcome will affect the proportion of funding these genres receive.

The degree to which the state controls culture has nevertheless decreased, as a greater level of investment can be offered by commercial industry. ‘Though federal governments may offer token support, art (at least in the United States) is today the plaything of (corporate) patrons whose relation to culture is less one of noble obligation than of overt manipulation – of art as a sign of power, prestige, publicity.’¹⁰² Music’s own powers of control, thanks to our subconscious recognition of musical codes, have been proven to affect the judgement of consumers. In one case study cited by Tia DeNora, music of stereotypical national character was piped into the wine section of a large UK supermarket chain: ‘when background music featured French accordion music, French wine sales rose significantly over German, and when German “Bierkeller” music was played, the opposite occurred, leading the authors to conclude that music is a referent to which consumers may turn to clarify choice (albeit unconsciously – few admitted, when questioned upon exiting the area, to having “noticed” the music).’¹⁰³

In a similar way, ‘music may be particularly effective under conditions of uncertainty’; in a separate case study, ‘when “classical” (Mozart, Vivaldi, Mendelssohn) music was alternated with “pop” in a wine outlet, customers exposed to the classical selections bought more expensive items. Most of the customers... confessed to having little experience of wine’, but may well have felt an expectation to *conform* to the ‘sophisticated, upper-class, atmosphere’ the music created.¹⁰⁴ While in 2008 Robert Fink suggested that, ‘For the first time in a century, classical music has lost even its symbolic or ritualistic power to define hierarchies of taste within the larger culture’,¹⁰⁵ it nevertheless continues to be psychologically linked with a high-class lifestyle towards which we are taught to aspire. Commercial industry uses our knowledge of musical conventions, together with our social needs to conform and to aspire, in order to control our behaviour as consumers; its methods will be considered in greater detail in chapter 2.

102 Foster, *Recodings*, 4.

103 DeNora, *Music in Everyday Life*, 142.

104 *Ibid*, 141.

105 Fink, ‘Elvis Everywhere’, 139.

1.5 Altering Attitudes

Access and price have traditionally been blamed for putting people off attending classical concerts and the opera. In the 2008 Arts Council report *Attendance at music events and participation in musical activities in England* (considered above: see footnote 80), the authors were keen to note that there were significant ‘attitudinal barriers’ that promoted non-attendance; that the mere thought that a visit to the opera might be expensive, or the stereotype of the typical audience member, prevents people from even considering buying a ticket.¹⁰⁶ Stereotyping – overwhelmingly negative – is enforced socially, so that even if a member of one echelon of society might wish to attend an event associated with a different level, the opinions of one's peers often keep such ideas in check. Subverting these notions, then, is a difficult task, yet it was tackled with gusto by a British tabloid in the summer of 2008.

If opera really is only ‘watched by toffee-nosed hoity-toity types who wouldn't be seen dead sitting down to an episode of EastEnders’, then *The Sun*'s prize draw for £10 tickets to the opera aimed completely at the wrong market;¹⁰⁷ critics of the move accused the Royal Opera House of trying to justify its large share of public funding by crudely engineering its audience, suggesting that such people are unwelcome at other performances.¹⁰⁸ Yet the lottery was a hit among its eight million daily readers, and many of those who attended wanted to return.¹⁰⁹ Perhaps it was the concept of an audience consisting solely of other *Sun* readers that alleviated worries of feeling out-of-place; perhaps it was the realisation that seats could be affordable; perhaps (though least believably) the stereotype of the opera-goer misses the mark.

106 Tak, *Attendance at music events (Briefing no 7)*, 9.

107 Brown, Derek, ‘Sex, death, booze, bribery, revenge, ghosts... who said opera is boring?’, *The Sun* (30 July 2008).

108 Pidd, Helen, ‘Sun readers' exclusive: a night at the opera’, *The Guardian* (23 July 2008); Higgins, Charlotte, ‘I wanted to see what it was like. Now I'm hooked’, *The Guardian* (10 September 2008).

109 Higgins, ‘I wanted to see what it was like’.

However unfair stereotypes may seem, they are often grounded in a certain amount of experience. Demographically,

Although slightly younger than normal, the crowd was no less overwhelmingly white. But it was notably good-natured. One of the disappointments of an ordinary visit to the ROH can be the rudeness of members of the audience, as if paying £150 for a stalls seat necessarily goes with sharpened elbows at the bar. The *Sun* readers, who had paid between £7.50 and £30, were as nice as pie. Nor did mobile phones go off during the performance (as they often do), and there was no exodus at the interval.¹¹⁰

This report asserts that the antisocial aspect of the stereotype is normally played out by the usual audience, and was conspicuously absent from the well-behaved crowd of tabloid-readers. Of course, *Sun* readers are stereotyped, too; in fact, the paper did its best to uphold the nature of the soap-watching, girl-ogling novice of the high arts, even arranging for a ‘topless babe’ to appear before the final curtain.¹¹¹ The choice of opera, *Don Giovanni*, certainly enabled the communication of opera as dangerous, sexy and non-genteel to take place, though the critics (even those in favour of wider access) generally agreed that this particular production was tedious and drab.¹¹²

The remaining major stereotype left for *The Sun* to dispel was that of the expense of a night at the opera. The paper claimed ‘even the cheap seats at the big shows can be around 40 quid’, while offering their seats for prices rising from £7.50.¹¹³ However, the cheapest seats (restricted view) for the production of *Don Giovanni* were only £8; the £40 quoted by the paper had the potential to reinforce readers’ views that low-price tickets really are hard to come by.¹¹⁴ Similarly, as a *Guardian* critic points out, ‘Ticket prices may be a deterrent, but it’s not just about money: theatres also need to make their work both relevant and culturally accessible to their own audiences... There are no ballots required: audiences are voting with

110 *Ibid.*

111 Lowe, David, ‘Well Don My Sun’, *The Sun* (10 September).

112 Higgins, Charlotte, ‘Will Sun readers save opera?’, *The Guardian* (9 September 2008); Holden, Anthony, ‘Dirty Don lets down the masses’, *The Observer* (14 September 2008).

113 *Ibid*; also anon, ‘A Night at the Opera from £7.50’, *The Sun* (25 July 2008).

114 Shenton, Mark, “Opera - We love iiiiiit!” declares The Sun’, *The Stage* (31 July 2008).

their feet.¹¹⁵ In this case, many who enjoyed the occasion (despite the ‘dreary’ production) intend to vote with their feet by returning, without the aid of subsidised tickets. Upholding the stereotypical reader and still proving their enjoyment of the opera might have been seen as a publicity stunt for the newspaper (and was certainly touted as such by the ‘elitist’ broadsheet *Guardian*),¹¹⁶ but it proved how strongly people want to believe in social politics. What else makes arias and topless page three girls mutually exclusive forms of entertainment?

115 Shenton, Mark, ‘Making culture open takes more than money’, *The Guardian* (28 July 2008).

116 Brown, ‘Sex, death, booze, bribery’.

2 Consumer Control

The general public, on the whole, appears to love ratings. They come in many guises: as popularity contests between artists, television programmes or people, and charts and polls compiled from consumer statistics or responses. The rivalry between the UK bands Oasis and Blur dominated the press for at least the summer of 1995, culminating in the ‘Battle of the Bands’, the groups’ simultaneous release of singles (albeit differently priced) in August of that year.¹ Radio stations with outputs from rock to classical music hold polls for their listeners to submit their favourite tracks, resulting in a mammoth broadcast of the resulting chart – occasionally spanning several days.² *Big Brother*, *Pop Idol*, *The X-Factor*, *Strictly Come Dancing* and a host of other reality television shows have captured the attention of UK viewers, enabling them to interact with the programme, to become acquainted with the characters on-screen, and then to cast votes to support or remove competitors. The *Eurovision Song Contest* has long employed televoting in many countries, but even the regular political or tactical voting, from those countries where voting panels still decide upon points, has come to be regarded as entertainment in itself.³

-
- 1 Blur's 'Country House' release date was moved forward a week to 14 August 1995 to coincide with their chief rivals Oasis's forthcoming single, 'Roll with it'. Blur's single, released in two versions with different B-sides, cost £1.99, while Oasis's cost £3.99. See Harris, John, *Britpop!: Cool Britannia and the Spectacular Demise of English Rock* (Cambridge, Mass., 2004), 233.
 - 2 Classic FM is especially fond of such polls. 'Most Wanted' request charts were broadcast daily during the writing of this thesis (albeit counting a single request per website-visitor from a shortlist drawn up by the station), and the 'Hall of Fame' is broadcast annually across the four-day Easter weekend, compiled from respondents' favourite three pieces of music.
 - 3 Le Guern, Philippe, 'From National Pride to Global Kitsch: the Eurovision Song Contest', *Web Journal of French Media Studies* 3, 1 (October 2000), <<http://wjfms.ncl.ac.uk/leguWJ.htm>> (accessed 4 January 2007) offers an in-depth study of the politics of voting. Terry Wogan's commentaries to the BBC's *Eurovision* audience deliberately concentrated on the humorous, rather than corrupt, side of such overtly political casting (though the political voting was cited as responsible for his resignation from the job in 2008).

These events have a few factors in common. They enable the viewer, listener or consumer to feel a part of the programming processes of television and radio stations, while ensuring the stations a predominant place in the consumer's priorities (at least for the duration of the event). Buying the single of one band over another might appear not to connect a consumer to one type of radio station or music magazine, yet the buyer is certain to become caught up in the anticipation created by the inescapable cross-media coverage generated by an event like the 'Battle of the Bands', and to follow it much more closely than those who are disinterested – though perhaps the media find it hard to understand that disinterested parties do exist. 'I helped that pop group, classic rock track, and *Eurovision* act to the top' instills pride in the consumer; winning is paramount.

Music charts offer us much of the same experience, but lose the specific anticipation of a one-off poll or comparison through being broadcast or published on a weekly (occasionally daily) basis.⁴ Even so, there are millions who will tune in to radio stations to follow the progress of their favourite records, or buy copies of magazines in which chart results are printed. Charts, as authoritative indicators of relative success, provide a root for conversation pieces and periodical articles aimed at people in their teens and beyond; fashion dictates that a knowledge of which stars are in favour is indispensable, and charts can help answer those awkward dilemmas as to which band is the best – even though, like *Big Brother* or *Eurovision*, talent and popularity may not be coincident. As we have seen in chapter 1, this consumer feedback is one way in which Keith Negus can claim that culture helps to guide the industry. Of course, the industry also guides culture, and the general public is the least beneficiary of the existence of music charts. Radio stations and shops benefit, in addition to the artists, their record companies and the music industry in general.

2.1 Chart and Canon

Before we examine the modern music industry, we should remind ourselves that ratings (and the charts that grow out of them) are not a new idea. Because of the links between social status and cultural taste, in which each is thought to inform

⁴ Some of the UK's Capital-group-owned commercial stations were broadcasting nightly countdowns of the *proposed* top ten singles sales by 2000.

the other, the public has always created its own authorities to control and direct taste in each of its various social strata.⁵ In the performing arts, newspaper reviews of public performances always helped to form public opinion as to which artists and composers were worthy of their limited time and money;⁶ the human need to conform with others has always encouraged people to follow the fashions of their time.⁷ There has always been, however, a distinction between what is perceived to be aesthetically (or morally) good, and what the market has pronounced worthwhile.

Canons of the visual and literary arts were considered to be in place prior to the formation of any musical canon. Sculpture and architecture were governed by Pythagorean rules, a doctrine of philosophical and aesthetic perfection. Even its Sophic antithesis, the quest for an art that was more concerned with bringing fantasy closer to reality than actually representing reality, contributed to this idealism by ‘correcting’ optical illusions in the structures, helping them to look more

5 Weber, William, *The Rise of Musical Classics in Eighteenth-Century England* (Oxford, 1992), 221.

6 Haydn both benefited and suffered from press interest in London, much like today's celebrities. Much hype surrounded the possibility that Haydn would come to England with new music in the late eighteenth century, and newspapers were keen to praise the composer. By 1785, the press had soured to the rumours; the *Morning Herald* (2 November) announced ‘his music he has been told is not in estimation with the King’. His reputation was highly damaged when, as the *Morning Post* (21 March 1788) reported: ‘Haydn, the composer, lately suffered very much in the estimation of musical people, on account of having sent to the conductors of the Professional Concert, who had transmitted him money for *new* music to be performed there, some compositions which had been previously published in this country.’ See Roscoe, Christopher, ‘Haydn and London in the 1780s’, *Music & Letters* 49, 3 (1968), 206, 208.

7 A typical example dates from the early eighteenth century, when the Royal Academy of Music and Opera of the Nobility, London's rival Italian opera companies, saw their fickle audiences flit from one theatre to the other in order to attend the most fashionable productions. An account of the crush caused by the audience at a 1720 production of Handel's *Radamisto*, and the exorbitant prices opera-goers were willing to pay for seats, can be found in Mainwaring, John, *Memoirs of the Life of the Late G F Handel* (London, 1760), 48. Both companies became the victims of fashion and folded as the audience for Italian opera in London dwindled.

proportionate and perfect.⁸ Pythagoras's philosophical and aesthetic bases soon gave way to Platonic thought and social considerations, and the canon persisted as a definitive guide to social status and good taste.

Literature was also historically aware enough to care about its legacy. Classical texts, admired mostly for their precise writing style and authoritative 'genius' led to the use of the term 'classic' to describe works admired for pursuing aesthetic greatness, but happened not to have been written by ancient Greek or Latin authors.⁹ By the nineteenth century, the literary canon began expanding to accommodate these enduring 'classics', that shared many of the characteristics valued by the upper strata of society in the canon's classical texts. The following passage, from the preface to a French collection of annotated texts for educational use (*Leçons de littérature et de morale*), provides us with a summary of these social values:

Each item in this collection offers an exercise in select reading, in memorisation, declamation, analysis, oratorical development. At the same time it provides a lesson in humanity and justice, in religion, philosophy, in unselfishness or love for the public good, etc. Everything in this collection is the fruit of genius, of talent, of virtue; everything in it reflects both the most exquisite taste and the purest morality.¹⁰

All that was considered worthwhile by the nineteenth-century European upper classes was carefully preserved in the literary canon, in the canon of great art, and – similarly – in the musical canon. Until the nineteenth century, 'the vast majority of composers had written in a highly contemporaneous manner, with little sense that they wrote in a "high" form for which their listeners needed some special training.'¹¹ 'Classical music' as we know it was about to be created.

William Weber has documented what he believes is the earliest musical

8 For a comparison, see Tatarkiewicz, Wladyslaw, 'Two Philosophies and Classical Art', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 22, 1 (1963), 3-8.

9 The differences between canon and classic are discussed in Gumbrecht, Hans Ulrich and Norton, Roger C., "Phoenix from the Ashes" or From Canon to Classic', *New Literary History* 20, 1 (1988), 141-163.

10 From Noël & De La Place (eds.), *Leçons de littérature et de morale* (Paris, 1828); quoted in translation by Gumbrecht and Norton, 'Phoenix from the Ashes', 158-9.

11 Weber, William, *Music and the Middle Class* (London, 1975), 19.

incarnation of this canon of great music:

The interest in old music grew to such an extent, in both performance and published commentary, that by the 1780s we can speak of a musical canon in England: a corpus of great works from Tallis to Handel that was studied, performed systematically, and revered by the public at large.¹²

The effort that prominent people put into the establishment of the canon was, of course, a result of social currents and trends (the same trends that led to the creation of the abovementioned *Leçons de littérature et de morale*). Attending classical concerts or patronising ancient music was more defining of social status for what it condemned, rather than condoned:

The criticism of contemporary music for its commercialism and low intellectual standards was to recur in the eighteenth- and nineteenth-centuries in close association with the idea of musical classics. Reverence for old works became the authority by which to judge the present, calling for taste of a more lofty order. This was principally a moral rather than an aesthetic argument.¹³

The moral argument was, in fact, a reaction against the commercialisation of music at the time. New printing technology, such as that at the publishing houses of Playford and Walsh in London, had made sheet music of the latest works affordable and widely available to the middle class; musical instruments (in particular the piano) could now be mass-produced, and became affordable, too. As a result, it was no longer the exclusive domain of the wealthy to be able to perform music at home. The theatre, despite being considered a low entertainment, produced a steady stream of new songs and incidental music, providing the publishers with a fashionable sales device, and virtuoso performers attracted large audiences and many commercial spin-offs.¹⁴ The music scene in European capitals in the late eighteenth- and the nineteenth-centuries seems to have been closely paralleled by the growth of rock and roll between 1955 and 1970, as music once again separated into 'high' and 'low'.

The connection with high fashion and popular taste was seen by the upper classes

12 Weber, *The Rise of Musical Classics*, preface. See also Weber, William, 'The Eighteenth-century Origins of the Musical Canon', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 115 (1988-9), 6-17.

13 Weber, *The Rise of Musical Classics*, 55.

14 Weber, *Music and the Middle Class*, 20.

as morally questionable. Among other (often religious) commentators of high-standing, Arthur Bedford, in his *The Great Abuse of Music* (London, 1711), ‘saw [the publishing business] manipulating people’s tastes and purchases for the simple purpose of making money, thereby destroying the musical standards that master composers had upheld previously’, and ‘drew upon the tradition of respecting the master composers in church music as an authority by which to counter these commercial tendencies’.¹⁵ The result of such efforts was the eventual formation of the canon of ‘ancient’ music, where the inimitable Beethoven was to become the counterpart to literature’s Virgil and Homer.

No ratings have ever been purely aesthetic; not even a canon is immune to popular taste. The admission of ‘classical’ texts to the literary canon (as discussed by Gumbrecht) was the result of understanding that more recent works of widespread popularity were likely to endure as much as the ancient works from the classical world. Likewise, the Handel Commemoration of 1784, exploited by publicists and politicians alike, gave ‘ancient’ music a much wider public. Here was a composer who associated with both political parties, while avoiding identification with either; he could be as serious as he was popular: the *Te Deum* and *Messiah* were hits from the start.¹⁶ Handel was inducted into the English canon as a result of popularity, rather than exclusively the taste of the nobility. Additionally, the commercial need to improve the once poorly-rehearsed, low-quality concerts of ancient music – so that their expensive tickets could provide entertainment value in addition to social status – led to the professionalisation of orchestral musicians.¹⁷ With a need to create revenue, elite preference was no longer the sole factor for the programmes of classical concerts. The emerging music industry used the canon, in combination with crowd psychology and fashionable taste, to provide concert-goers with ready-made musical preference (commercial radio uses the music charts in much the same way). The canon had been tempered by commercialism – one of the factors its creators had hoped to eliminate from society – and had effectively become a chart.

Popular music charts have become interesting to the public because of the

15 Weber, *The Rise of Musical Classics*, 53-4.

16 *Ibid*, 225.

17 Weber, *Music and the Middle Class*, 63.

increased rate of change of fashion, made possible by mass broadcasting and recording technology. The sales-based drive of the industry provides the pop charts with very little aesthetic counter-balance with which to compare to the idea of the nineteenth-century canon. But the ‘classical chart’ has been in existence longer than we imagined. The canon of classical music, as we have encountered it in our lifetimes, has never been the purely aesthetic construct we feel is endangered by classical music’s adoption of popular music’s marketing techniques.

2.2 In the Industry's Interests

Conventional economic theory indicates that, when governed by the market, the rational self-maximiser seeks the greatest return of value and utility for the lowest cost.¹⁸ In the music business, this embodies itself in the tailoring of musical products by the industry, through various means: hiring composers and artists on the basis of appeal over ability; gaining control over the production and post-production of an artist's original songs; and the ubiquitous packaging, advertising, television appearances and journalistic spin that accompany each gig or record release (the discussion of which forms the basis of chapter 4). Value most obviously takes the form of profit, and its clearest representation is in the ‘popular music’ of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. The profit margin of pop outstrips that of other organised and managed musics – at the opera, in the symphony hall, in the courts, on the dancefloor – despite their consistent concern for revenue production (and their less consistent financial success).

Value and utility are indicative not only of profit, but also of control. When new musical genres are tailored to approximate existing musics that sell well (such as indigenous musics becoming ‘world music’ through the addition of dance beats or high-quality production techniques), they are altered for commercial benefit, but also end up restricting consumer choice by reinforcing ideas of what musical traits are desirable. These are technical functions of the social system, revenue-creating and self-legitimizing. The regular broadcast of charts and ratings adds extra recognition of the value of these products to the public consciousness,

18 One of the basic principles of free market theory, considered to have been outlined first by Adam Smith in *The Wealth of Nations* (London, 1776).

shaping our habits of consumption and appreciation around socially acceptable taste in just the same way that the classical canon was formed. Ratings can be – and are – kept controlled through more extreme but common practices such as radio playlists, censorship, limited retail stock and even payola schemes. With the industry in charge of the systems that allow it to sell its own produce, our personal choices of music may not be as individual as we might like to think.

Sales charts provide invaluable data on the most (commercially) active music consumers. Since commercial radio relies on its advertisers to gain revenue, it is vital that it appeals to the greatest majority by playing a constant stream of music they enjoy, rather than attempting to harness the widest audience with a spread which could prompt target groups of listeners to switch frequency. Even outwardly non-commercial outlets, such as the complimentary music channels provided by many transport companies, are often compiled and produced by commercial concerns: among these, the radio production company Somethin' Else, responsible for the commercial radio/Channel 4 *hit40uk* chart programmes, claims on its website that it creates 'all the in-flight radio for British Airways',¹⁹ with 'leading presenters' drawn from their in-house presenter agency. (These channels are, in reality, a by-product of the Capital radio group, with the same playlist selection methods in place as for its commercial radio channels.²⁰)

It is tempting to believe that, thanks to the use of sales charts, audiences get what they have signalled they want to hear. We know, however, that not all radio playlists are listener-influenced. Small non-commercial stations, such as the BBC's network of local radio services, are more likely to try to appeal to the widest audience with respect to age and musical preference, where request shows take a back seat. These stations, along with the mainstream BBC radio channels, are also where minority interests are genuine candidates for inclusion; no revenue is

19 Somethin' Else's association with British Airways and other projects could be found in their website's directory <http://somethinelse.com/project> (accessed 4 January 2007).

20 From 'Mark Briggs leads United Radio', *Radio Today* (7 April 2006), <<http://www.radiotoday.co.uk/news.php?extend.657>> (accessed 4 January 2007): 'Mark [Briggs] was Head of Commercial Services for Capital Radio plc from 1995, where he developed new programme strands in emerging markets. He was responsible for projects like Eurotunnel Radio, Capital's in-flight radio channels on British Airways and even syndicating Capital Radio London live to Brunei.'

lost by listeners tuning out, and enabling listeners to hear music unavailable elsewhere helps to endorse the claim to public service. BBC Radio 3, for example, is dominated by classical music and literature, but various shows of jazz, contemporary, experimental and world musics are programmed in on Fridays and at weekends. Radio 2 features even broader broadcasting, with R&B, country, folk, popular classics, theatre organ repertoire, musical theatre, big band and jazz all getting exposure weekly in addition to pop from several decades, the Official UK Album Chart, and the heavy metal-oriented show *Masters of Rock*. Even with such diversity, chart products are broadcast, as many listeners are expected to be interested in hearing them.

There are, additionally, commercial exceptions to the rule of listener-influenced radio. Record company pressure on, or bribery of, stations or DJs is a widely-known (if not widely documented) and illegal phenomenon, also known as 'payola'. In 2005 Sony settled a case in which it 'admitted that its employees gave cash, trips and other bribes to radio stations and their employees to get its music on the air',²¹ several further investigations were ongoing in the US in 2006.²² Given the small number of major record companies in Britain, it is likely such practices also occur in the UK.²³ Music video programming is not immune, either: the agreements in the 1980s that record companies could choose 20% of MTV's

21 Lawdit solicitors have reprinted Waheedan Jariwalla's article 'Sony BMG Pays \$10 Million to Settle Payola Investigation' at
<[http://www.lawdit.co.uk/reading_room/room/view_article.asp?name=../articles/16.3%20Sony%20BMG%20Pays%20\\$10%20Million.htm](http://www.lawdit.co.uk/reading_room/room/view_article.asp?name=../articles/16.3%20Sony%20BMG%20Pays%20$10%20Million.htm)> (accessed 4 January 2007).

22 See, among others, Werde, Bill, 'Payola Probe Heating Up', *Rolling Stone* (1 November 2004).

23 Competition Commission Inquiry Report, 'The supply of recorded music: A report on the supply in the UK of prerecorded compact discs, vinyl discs and tapes containing music' (June 1994), <http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/rep_pub/reports/1994/356recordedmusic.htm> (accessed 4 January 2007). 'On the record companies side five multinational companies, known as "the majors", account for about 70% of the market. These companies are EMI, PolyGram, Sony, Warner and BMG. We find that a complex monopoly situation exists in their favour by reason of their pricing practices, arrangements on parallel imports and terms of contract with artists.'

output ‘created a formal structure for a type of “payola” arrangement where media outlets agreed to play certain artists requested by the record companies in exchange for certain favours’.²⁴ Conglomerates of major record labels later bought their own TV channels (such as Germany’s Viva! in 1993), giving them ‘direct control to promote their acts however they wish without the autonomy of an independently owned service’.²⁵ Plans to launch a similar channel in the US were dropped, however, after the Antitrust Division of the Justice Department began to investigate whether it breached anti-competition laws.²⁶

However contemporary the illegal payola schemes sound, they too have their historical precedents. To make acts look more popular, sponsors ensured their concerts were full of spectators who would stimulate applause:

For virtuosi to maintain their reputations and generate exciting social atmosphere at their concerts they had to draw large crowds from the upper classes... Most sponsors of benefit concerts therefore handed out many tickets either free or at reduced rates... but few musicians had such good contacts as Berlioz, and as a result most of the free tickets went to persons outside of the cities' elites.²⁷

In 1891, Paderewski's agent would ensure free tickets were distributed ‘to students who pledged to stampede “as though overcome with a mad desire”’.²⁸ Between 1830 and 1850, ‘music critics... often received payoffs from musicians whose concerts they reviewed’.²⁹ Peer pressure and media attention have always been manipulated to shape the tastes of the general public, and the merest hint of success was all that was needed.

Jack Banks has stated that, in the 1980s, ‘record label reliance on music video

24 Banks, Jack, ‘Video in the Machine: The Incorporation of Music Video into the Recording Industry’, *Popular Music* 16, 3 (1997), 298.

25 *Ibid.*

26 See Atwood, Brett, ‘Majors Eye New Options for Vid Channel’, *Billboard* 107, 29 (22 July 1995). This article was cited as evidence in the US Department of Justice *Miscellaneous Action no 94-338 HHG, United States of America vs. Time Warner inc. et al*, filed 3 November 1994.

27 Weber, *Music and the Middle Class*, 42-3

28 Horowitz, Joseph, *Classical Music in America: A History of its Rise and Fall* (New York, 2005), 335.

29 *Ibid.* 2.

grew so extensive that video clips became considered a necessity for an artist to achieve commercial success in the pop market.³⁰ Widespread distribution on music television, in nightclubs, music stores and shopping centres increases exposure to and interest in the bands. In the same way that industry employees approach radio stations, ‘executives provide MTV with copies of recent videos and vigorously lobby the channel to add these to its current playlist’.³¹ Playlists are generally regarded as being as limited as those of commercial radio stations, but careful planning is put into place to keep products ‘fresh’ in the audience’s mind, balancing the need for heavy rotation against the possibility of tiring of intensive repetition. While MTV’s weekly playlist in 1987 ‘had been reduced from 100 videos to 80’ (some videos airing up to fifty times in a seven-day period),³² ten years later ‘labels limit distribution of their clips to certain favoured shows because of the fear of overexposure, worrying that excessive television play of a video clip might diminish public interest in an act.’³³

Music video channels are, therefore, amplified versions of commercial radio: both singles and video clips are commercials for themselves, though the latter’s visual content introduces more potential for product placements and political and fashion statements, and additional hurdles for talented but non-photogenic artists to overcome. The increasing use of music television as background radio enforces the need for video production to gain additional audio airplay, as well as promotional visibility, and commercial radio increasingly draws on successful music videos to determine its own playlists.³⁴ As with radio broadcasting, payola, playlist lobbying, and heavy rotation occur; the expense of video production and airtime purchase further widens the gap between major record labels and independent producers. The cost of television commercials mean advertisers may be loathe to buy slots on minority music channels, or shows that include unknown

30 Banks, ‘Video in the Machine’, 293.

31 *Ibid.*, 297.

32 Wallis, Roger and Malm, Krister, ‘Push-Pull for the Video Clip: A Systems Approach to the Relationship between the Phonogram/Videogram Industry and Music Television’, *Popular Music* 7, 3 (1988), 276. It is also noted that, ‘at an MTV seminar in 1987 at San Jose State University MTV Programme Director, Sam Kaiser, described his policy in terms of the equation: Repetition = Impression = Consumer Judgement’.

33 Banks, ‘Video in the Machine’, 297.

34 *Ibid.*

new artists ('for stations looking for big audiences, only the superstars are good enough'),³⁵ encouraging broadcasters to limit audience exposure to non-hit performers. Music video is an even more powerful means for the industry to promote its own interests.

Videos are commercials in themselves, but have become commercials for other things, too:

they have erased the very distinction between the commercial and the program. As nonstop sequences of discontinuous episodes, they have erased the boundaries between programs. Music videos have also set themselves free from the television set, inserting themselves into movie theaters, popping up in shopping malls and department store windows, becoming actors in both live performances and the club scene. As omnivorous as they are pervasive, they draw on and influence the traditional image-shaping fields of fashion and advertising – even political campaigning.³⁶

The cross between an endless commercial break and a dreamlike sequence of images lacking narrative that Aufderheide highlights is not a standard part of commercial radio broadcasting. Popular music, however, has always been used in image construction for advertisers, fashion gurus and political parties, even without the additional *visual* images video constructs. As music is already a multimedia field, which juxtaposes lyrics and narratives, rhythms and melodies from any number of locations and with many potential meanings, popular songs are ideal image constructors. The introduction of music video has merely strengthened this role.

Non-commercial radio may be open to industry advances too. It certainly tailors its playlists according to committee and quota, rather than just the help of charts. The BBC's flagship popular music channel, Radio 1, displays its weekly playlist on its website,³⁷ and explains its selection processes via a frequently-asked-questions webpage.³⁸ This manufactured playlist of a small number of songs 'is compiled at

35 Wallis and Malm, 'Push-Pull for the Video Clip', 270.

36 Aufderheide, Pat, 'Music videos: the look of the sound', *Journal of Communication* 36, 1 (1986), 57.

37 Information available from BBC Radio 1's official website,
<http://www.bbc.co.uk/radio1/chart/playlist.shtml>.

38 http://www.bbc.co.uk/radio1/chart/playlist_faqs.shtml.

a meeting chaired by the Head of Music each Thursday', 'combines the favourite tracks of all the different DJs and producers to provide a varied mix of music', and 'make[s] a commitment that at least 40% of the music in daytime will be from UK artists'; it need not include the current chart topper, as 'if we don't think listeners will like the track we won't playlist it' – a peculiar reaction to an obviously much-bought song.³⁹ Stores selling music can even join in the bias towards certain types of music, by producing their own charts projecting the acts they think will be successful, and by their refusal to stock other, successful acts. WHSmith, Woolworths and ASDA, for example, were unwilling to stock John Otway's novelty 'Bunsen Burner' of 2002, despite its UK top 10 appearance.⁴⁰

Radio 1 states that it does not ban songs outright; nevertheless, its refusal to include songs or artists in a playlist gives the impression of active censorship. Censorship, of course, does not always work in the radio station's favour. Frankie Goes to Hollywood's 'Relax' of 1983 was banned from radio airplay due to its supposedly obscene lyrics, consequently propelling the record to the number one slot for five weeks. In a more bizarre scenario from 2004, the management of commercial station Classic Gold Digital pronounced to its breakfast DJ Tony Blackburn that it had 'a policy decision that [Cliff Richard] doesn't match our brand values. He's not on the playlist, and you must stop playing him'.⁴¹ Blackburn was suspended from work for refusing to submit. Massive public support for the DJ and for Cliff Richard, however, saw Blackburn back at work just two days later; the management admitted that 'We should be playing [Cliff Richard] as much as The Beatles, and we play The Beatles quite often'.⁴²

Any chart or popularity contest has the potential for vote-rigging to take place, in addition to unfair exposure and censorship. In the UK, television's *The X-Factor* has had its fair share of such accusations: Sharon Osbourne accused fellow judge Simon Cowell of rigging the voting in the 2004 contest, while the three judges

39 *Ibid.*

40 Gibbons, Fiachra, 'Cor baby that's really mean, Otway tells shops', *The Guardian* (11 October 2002).

41 Anon, 'Blackburn victory over Cliff ban', *BBC Online* (25 June 2004), <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/tv_and_radio/3835743.stm> (accessed 4 January 2007).

42 *Ibid.*

'managed' one each of the three mediocre final acts in the 2005 contest (one of the most popular acts among voters having been surprisingly knocked out in the previous round). Whether rigged or not, conspiracy theories abound among fans.⁴³ But rigging can happen just as easily *through* fans. 'Industry', The Modern's second single, was removed from the UK singles chart in 2006 after a suspiciously large number of copies were purchased by a small group of individuals close to members of the band; a spokesman for the group later claimed that 'had the original large purchases been the only ones to be discounted then we would have easily remained in the Top 20 of last week's charts as they amounted to a rather small portion of what was sold'.⁴⁴ Oasis's management, needless to say, struggled to find similar excuses when Blur won the 'Battle of the Bands'.⁴⁵

Music retailers provide the raw data for the chart-compiling companies dealing with record sales, but also receive information from charts which is useful to them in return. Knowing how active music consumers behave is vital to the prominence of certain titles in the layout of their stores, as well as the amount of stock they are likely to hold. Most notably, non-specialist music stores will often stock just those titles that are currently in the charts, or merely predicted to enter the charts, hoping that their established popularity will minimise the risk of leftover stock which is inherent in ordering a wider spread of titles. To cite one example, the former high street chain Woolworths (which, in 1994, was the second largest recorded music retailer in the UK)⁴⁶ focussed its attention on sales of the top 50 singles and top

43 A typical example is 'X factor was obviously fixed' at

<http://forum.digitalspy.co.uk/board/showthread.php?t=362908&page=1>.

44 On the band's web forum, as accessed 5 May 2006:

<http://bb01.mer.uk.vvhp.net/the-modern/YaBB.pl?board=news;action=display;num=1142266333>. See also 'Chart ban over multiple

downloads', *BBC Online* (13 March 2006),

<<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/4802804.stm>> (accessed 4 January 2007).

45 Excuses can be found in Harris, *Britpop!*, 233.

46 As the Competition Commission's inquiry 'The supply of recorded music' reports, Woolworths (with 15% of the market share) was the next most significant retailer behind WHSmith/Our Price (26.6%), followed by HMV with 13.5%. Virgin is next in the list with just 4.2%. Since 'Retail sales in the UK amount to over £1 billion per annum', Woolworths effectively shifts more than £150 million of recorded music sales each year.

100 albums.⁴⁷ These were mostly, but not necessarily, current chart singles or albums; they incorporated items which were *predicted* (by Woolworths) to enter the chart, and they did not necessarily include items which actually featured in the chart.⁴⁸ Chart title displays are also often found in specialist record shops such as HMV, to make the best-selling singles and albums easily accessible to those who do not wish to take the time to delve through alphabetical or genre-based displays.

2.3 Shaping Celebrities

Record companies naturally find the charts great vehicles for encouraging the public to buy their products, but also find them a useful analytical tool for dealing with their artists and songwriters. In addition to singling out their main sources of income for potential bonuses and extensions of contract, chart positioning can help point out where extra promotion of songs or artists could be helpful, where it has been successful, and where it has failed. The centralisation of the music chart to the music industry dictates how record companies work to promote their protégés: chart success is the goal of production once a musician has been taken on board, whether her talents are exploited or not.

There is no doubt that media interest and publicity is the main factor in creating a star performer. This is by no means limited to popular culture, but applies equally to authors, artists, classical musicians, magicians, athletes and figures from across the range of entertainment (and we will witness this in greater detail in chapter 4). It is not a surprise to learn that ‘a big launch has become an essential ingredient in the process of becoming a hit’, nor that ‘the financial imperatives of achieving *quick* market success... have shaped popular culture in the ways that critics find so

47 Smith, Tony, ‘Woolworths to take on Apple iTunes store’, *The Register* (8 September 2004), <http://www.theregister.co.uk/2004/09/08/woolies_music_download> (accessed 4 January 2007) comments on online music sales prior to the launch of Woolworth's online music download store. Smith's comments are backed up via Woolworths themselves at <http://museum.woolworths.co.uk/entertainment90.htm>.

48 Woolworths's spokeswoman (cited in Gibbons, ‘Cor Baby that’s really mean’) acknowledged this: ‘When we heard the record we didn’t think it would be a hit... we will look at [John Otway] again after the new chart on Sunday, but there are no plans to stock the record’.

distasteful’,⁴⁹ nor even that mere ‘perceptions of success can influence purchase decisions’.⁵⁰ Culture, as an inherently social creation, relies upon acceptance among groups (whether ‘fan bases’ or connoisseurs of good taste) rather than individuals; after all, ‘we like to discuss books with friends, and a book’s presence on the best-seller list means that friends will be more likely to have read it’,⁵¹ and ‘loving The Beatles *with other people* was more fun than loving them in solitude’.⁵² Widely-publicised new book or single releases, and suspenseful ratings-countdowns or awards ceremonies, occur more frequently in everyday conversation than less well-marketed affairs, leading to the impression that the author or singer is worthy of the attention of, and to the taste of, the general public. We are not just expected to follow fashion by proving *our* taste acceptable to others, but – in a somewhat more sinister but unavoidable social process – we are expected to follow suit in order to preserve our social status, to fit in with our colleagues and friends, and to be able to make conversation with them.⁵³ This ‘network economy’ caters most effectively to those interactive consumer activities – like discussion – that value instant gratification over delayed rewards and high quality, and (like fashions in clothing) increases the trend towards producing commodities that conform to standards already successful in the trade.

Once an artist has found her way into the ratings spotlight, by featuring in the charts and being nominated for industry awards, the extra visibility afforded her by media interest helps to swell her popularity, and perpetuate her winning streak. Collectives of fans help to promote their idols in order to reinforce their own visibility, too, proud that their taste in culture has been recognised as a dominant force in the market. Again, this is an inherent feature of culture as a social product, not a new arrival to popular culture:

The world of eighteenth-century French opera pitted the aesthetic styles of Gluck against those of Piccini; in nineteenth-century Germany it was Wagner versus Brahms; and in 1960s England it was the Mods versus the Rockers. Fans of each promoted their preferred aesthetic while seeking to recruit others to their

49 Frank, Robert and Cook, Philip, *The Winner-Take-All Society* (New York, 1995), 19.

50 *Ibid*, 36; my emphasis.

51 *Ibid*, 19.

52 Cowen, Tyler, *What Price Fame?* (Cambridge, Mass., 2000), 3; Cowan’s emphasis.

53 See Frank and Cook, *The Winner-Take-All Society*, 191-192.

common cause. Publicity skyrocketed in each case.⁵⁴

The values established by the market for popular culture are reinforced through charts and ratings. A typical example is that of the American Music Awards, created by a television network in order to create advertising revenue from viewer-heavy events.⁵⁵ The ceremony provides awards, and media coverage, for the strongest-selling (already successful) acts; the public will watch, in order to see and discuss the performance and appearance of their favourite stars; and the television and advertising executives are able to cash in on the opportunity. Media coverage of and public response to charts, ratings and awards suggests we live in ‘a society that can conceive of artistic achievement only in terms of stardom and success’.⁵⁶

Chart placings matter so much that the number of rival charts, awards ceremonies, nominations, interviews and television appearances continues to grow, not to fulfil the public's craving for celebrity (and would-be-celebrity) information, but in response to the music industry's demands for increased airtime and visibility for its protégés. In fact, this is a positive influence on the popular music market, which now has such a broad menu of choice that more minority recordings are available in more outlets, resulting in the increasing diversity of acts in the album charts.⁵⁷ The endless repetition of exposure to mainstream pop performers and their products renders them banal quickly, leading fans to abandon them for something more fashionable. Fashions now change so quickly that, year by year, we can count more different single releases in the top ten and in the number one positions in the Billboard charts, and fewer number ones stay in the top spot for as long as they once did.⁵⁸ The awards market is less of a consecrating body than before; Grammys now tend to be less concentrated on chart-dominating acts than in the last twenty years.⁵⁹ Popular culture may dictate a certain amount of our everyday behaviour, but, as our society – in constant flux – necessarily dictates culture in turn, its fickle nature is not to be underestimated.

54 Cowen, *What Price Fame?*, 21.

55 English, James, *The Economy of Prestige* (Cambridge, Mass., 2005), 83.

56 *Ibid*, 3.

57 Cowen, *What Price Fame?*, 103.

58 *Ibid*, 105.

59 English, *The Economy of Prestige*, 332.

2.4 Classification: Chart Compilation

Charts, then, help to offer information to all types of music-based businesses concerning those songs listeners are interested in hearing. Commercially, this provides chart compilers with money through industry subscriptions to their charts. In April 2006, there were 99 Billboard charts in the United States, 44 of which were available to the general public without subscription.⁶⁰ The UK's equivalent, The Official UK Charts Company, displayed just three sales-based, popular music charts on its website, all of which were available to the general public. The company's information pack, however, presented 30 named charts servicing various genres. The results of these remain within the music business, with the exception of one group: the company also develops charts specifically to the demands of a particular radio station. The Classic FM chart is an example of one of these charts, and is based on sales of 'classical artist albums';⁶¹ since the 'Official UK Classical Chart' is not available to the general public, the Classic FM chart provides the only source of classical sales information outside the industry.

In the United States, the official music chart compiler began life in 1894 as *Billboard Advertising*, a monthly roundup of industry news for bill-posters and the 'science of advertising'.⁶² The 'listing of Popular Songs Heard in Vaudevil [sic] Theaters Last Week', featured in a 1914 issue of *The Billboard*, was a vehicle to support the many pages of sheet music and music publishing advertisements that the magazine had already begun to incorporate. After the emergence of radio in the 1920s, it was not until 1936 that the magazine listed the most-played songs on the US' three major radio networks, a feature named 'Chart Line', followed up in 1940 by the 'Best Selling Retail Records' sales chart. Two more measures of popularity followed: 'Most Played in Juke Boxes' in 1944, and 'Disks With Most Radio Plugs' in 1945. Music seen to be of minority interest was additionally catered for, though kept separate from the mainstream, since it was assumed that different groups in society listened to 'their own' music; the 'Harlem Hit Parade', the first chart of black music (later to be renamed 'Best Selling Retail Race

60 Billboard's official website, <http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/charts.jsp>, gives an overview. The majority of charts are aimed at the industry, rather than the public.

61 According to The Official UK Charts Company,

http://www.theofficialcharts.com/info_charts-compiled.php.

62 http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/about_us/bbh歷史.jsp presents the story in full.

Records' and subsequently 'Best Selling Retail Rhythm & Blues Records'), was issued in 1942.⁶³

At the beginning of the twenty-first century, an overview of the vast number of charts the Billboard company compiles, their generic and often-changing titles, and their differing functions, shows that they have continued to expand their variety of charts by genre group, preserving various Latin, Rock, Gospel and Dance charts separately from the mainstream countdown. This is not to say that high-selling records of one genre will not make the 'Hot 100' chart, which combines singles sales and airplay figures across all genres (as opposed to the more recent 'Pop 100') – one look at the pop-country acts like Shania Twain, and the prolific success of R&B and hip-hop through the late nineties into the new century, dispels that idea. The genre-based charts, in addition to the mutually supportive, genre-based radio stations that have evolved alongside them, do much to promote successful acts in their genre that would not gain the amount of coverage and sales to enter the pop chart, and therefore this 'othering' of minority musics does help to provide a platform for influence. It is, however, questionable whether this enables a wider audience to take an interest in these minority musics, if they are given a separate corner in which to circulate – particularly as radio playlists will run parallel to chart-based audiences and are unlikely to encourage appreciation of a music they do not ordinarily play. It is also inevitable that this separation of genres leads to a reinforcement of generic boundaries (particularly through the rules that are applied to test whether a certain song is suitable to enter a particular chart), and discourages artists from embracing new material as part of their acts, as Keith Negus has discussed.⁶⁴ This limits interest in products outside that genre, and potentially results in a proliferation of copycat sounds.

The US charts also present various different types of statistics. Sales charts, download charts and airplay charts all seem self-explanatory; the two former, in particular, collect such a basic type of data (whether an independent party has bought the product in question) that they appear hard to manipulate. Nielsen's SoundScan system and other barcode-reading electronic point-of-sale machines are as all-inclusive as is technologically possible, being used by all the major record stores and many smaller ones. Chart compilers even attempt to ensure

63 *Ibid.*

64 See Negus, 'Identities and Industries', 115-131.

that singles sales are based on musical preference, by introducing rules limiting the value of free gifts given away with purchases that might adversely influence consumer selection.⁶⁵

Airplay for commercial radio is decided – in part – by active listeners, who register their preference through sales charts and request programmes. The three mixed-data sales-and-airplay charts that Billboard compiles are among their most popular, signature charts: the Hot 100, Pop 100, and Hot R&B/Hip-Hop Songs. (In contrast, an interested listener would have to be a Billboard subscriber in order to find the Singles Sales chart.) Billboard explains:

We use both pools of data because while the consumer's decision to purchase is a significant vote of popularity, singles have a job that extends beyond being a sales vehicle: to capture radio play and, hopefully, stimulate album sales. Beyond that, in today's competitive market, radio programmers do not make music decisions lightly, but rather use extensive research to play songs their audiences want to hear.⁶⁶

They also employ two different kinds of format for their airplay charts: both the basic count of tracks played, and a ratings system dependent on audience count (making tracks played at popular times of day and on the most popular stations worth the most). The complexity of this latter system, which is regularly used to compile the non-subscription minority charts, points to the depth of thought involved in creating a chart which really is intended to display the consumers' tastes accurately.

As we have seen, however, playlists can be tailored to demands other than listener preference. Even with the 'verifiable science' of the Broadcast Data Systems airplay tracking technology,⁶⁷ regular or excessive airplay may not be a popularity marker. After all, singles and music videos are made available to radio and television stations many weeks before they are released for sale. This early circulation of singles and videos is to enable the listener to hear the songs in order to decide whether to buy the single. Even the frequency of singles plugs comes

65 See, for example, http://www.theofficialcharts.com/chart_rules.php – a list of rules for chart-eligible singles covering, among other aspects, re-releases, multimedia inclusions, promotions and packaging.

66 http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/about_us/bbmethology.jsp.

67 See http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/about_us/bbhistory.jsp.

with the assurance that listeners should let songs ‘grow on them’. Yet this does not account for the preference which appears to be given to certain bands or songs, and quality is not always a factor in those plugged as singles, or albums, of the week. Neither does their subsequent placing in the sales charts always mirror the radio station’s apparent rapture over such songs.

In the UK, families of commercial stations owned by umbrella groups even give the impression of sharing identical playlists (losing the signal to a Capital group radio station while travelling, it is not unusual to pick up one of its sister stations playing the same track, at a different point in the song). It is not difficult to believe that, in this case, headquarters dictate the items on the playlist to each of their stations. Whether this happens or not, the effect of a shared playlist is that it is also a tailored playlist, and not necessarily as a direct result of listener input. For the cynic, even request shows are capable of working from a pre-dictated playlist, only putting on air callers who want a song that happens to be on the list already. The nature of commercial radio as a profitable venture leaves it open to the advances of record companies. The fact that playlists directly affect the content of airplay charts should remind us that measures of popularity are always open to manipulation.

With this in mind, it is perhaps a shame that, despite separate sales and airplay charts, the Billboard Hot 100 – the one which combines the sales and airplay figures – is the chart which most would agree to be most representative of music consumption in the United States. What about the United Kingdom? The British chart began in print in 1952, was first broadcast in 1964, and has always been sales-based; this flagship product, the singles sales chart, remains separate from the one airplay chart listed by the Official UK Charts Company – the ‘ILR Hit 40 UK’.⁶⁸ Genre charts exist in the UK, but mainstream channels, first and foremost the BBC’s Radio 1, Radio 2 and World Service, only broadcast the three of majority interest: the singles, albums and downloads charts.⁶⁹ The remaining

68 A brief history is available as part of <http://www.theofficialcharts.com/infopack.php>; all the company’s charts are listed within, though the airplay chart is not mentioned except in the chart rules download (http://www.theofficialcharts.com/chart_rules.php).

69 Rival charts are broadcast on rival stations. In 2007, the ‘hit40uk’ chart was sponsored by Woolworths, and broadcasts on 120 local commercial stations UK-wide; it is compiled from sales, downloads and radio airplay, except for the top ten singles,

charts are useful in another manner, as the company's mission statement outlines:

The Official UK Charts Company provides the chart information to everyone involved in the music industry and through them, to the public. Record companies are guaranteed accurate and fast information about how their artists are performing within hours of shops closing. They are also provided with a detailed analysis of the success of advertising campaigns in different parts of the country, allowing them to assess the best way of promoting their products. Retailers are provided with reliable data on market share, which is vital for accurate stock ordering.⁷⁰

The means of obtaining the data appear to be similar in both the UK and US. In the States, target stores represent over 90% of the music retail market, including mail order, internet sales and music downloads. R&B remains an exception, where only specialist shops are considered.⁷¹ (As for airplay charts, Billboard states that it almost exclusively tracks commercial stations, but the information it provides to interested parties does not suggest what kind of proportion of the total market is represented by its sample.) The independent data collector of the British chart, Millward Brown, receives information from approximately 99% and 95% of the singles and albums markets respectively⁷² – a percentage touted by the Official UK Charts Company as 'the largest market research sample currently in use in the

which are calculated by sales and downloads alone (hit40uk.com). Until 2005 the Smash Hits! Chart was broadcast on competing local stations, but was replaced with the A-list Artists Chart. This now broadcasts across 54 local stations, many of which are owned by the Real Radio, Heart or Century radio networks (<http://commercial.gcapmedia.com/index.php?id=15>), and is compiled to include radio airplay and ringtone downloads in its figures. Both are owned by subsidiaries of the Capital Radio group.

70 From <http://www.theofficialcharts.com/infopack.php>. Billboard's mission statement is rather less specific, but appears to suggest a similar plan of action: 'In print and online, through face-to-face events and licensing partnerships, Billboard entertains and informs, drives markets, influences decisions, platforms debate, builds community and captures the emotional power of music and entertainment for professionals and fans alike. Billboard is the first name to trust in timely news, expert analysis, trends and proprietary charts for the global music, video and digital entertainment business' (available at www.billboard.com/images/pdf/content06.pdf).

71 Information from http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/about_us/bbmethology.jsp.

72 <http://www.theofficialcharts.com/faq.php>.

UK'.⁷³ Included in this sample are retailers selling more than a hundred audio items each week, while mail order firms and clubs are excluded for not complying with the chart trading rules.

After the arrival and totalling of sales figures, the Official UK Charts Company manipulates the figures in various ways. The ‘advanced weighting methodology... used to arrive at the total number of units sold’ refers to the security measures in place for the research company to avoid including a previous day’s sales figures. The company also mentions ‘mathematical calculations’, the purpose of which remains unexplained, and the fact that, despite a ‘universe’ of over 5900 shops, a sample of over 5300 of these is taken each week to provide the chart compilation sales figures – resulting in roughly 90% of the market (the same as is used in the US).⁷⁴ This is explained thus: ‘In practise the industry prefers to estimate how the whole market has performed, so ‘multipliers’ are used, which are average guide figures calculated periodically for each format and applied to the Defined Universe Sales figure to give an approximated total market figure.’⁷⁵ Despite the company’s pride in its mainstream-concentrated coverage and its verifiable data, the accurate figures are not passed on to the industry, or to the public.

Chart results, then, reinforce the influence of certain kinds of music or specific artists in a sort of temporary canon, by enforcing the view that, by association with radio providing a listener-led service, listeners can be assumed to have chosen what is played long before singles have been released for sale. Playlist-based charts help to affirm this canon for the radio stations, making them all the more likely to include much-played material in their schedules. Sales charts also have ways of reinforcing the dominance of the few songs at the top; most noticeably, small department stores which merely dabble in music but still supply data to the chart compiler (such as small town branches of Woolworths, Smiths or Tesco) will cut the risk of significant losses on unsold goods by only supplying – thus only enabling the consumer to purchase – the top twenty or so sellers. Charts may provide a useful service, but they can be manipulated in subtle ways.

73 <http://www.theofficialcharts.com/infopack.php>.

74 *Ibid.*

75 *Ibid.*

2.5 Case Study: What are *Classical* Charts?

Classical charts appear anomalous among music charts in general. After all, the demographic that forms the largest share of the record-buying consumer base is assumed to be uninterested in old-fashioned music, and it is often proclaimed that classical music is of increasingly limited interest to us in the modern world. Additionally, charts work by counting sales or airplay of one individual recording by one artist, and classical recordings, works recorded by many different orchestras under different conductors, do not fit this model. In other words, we have not really associated the classical music trade with the vigorous marketing that other areas of the music industry encourage to favour their acts' positions in charts. Classical music has always appeared to occupy a 'high art' space secluded from the amount of advertisement, merchandise and commercial enterprise surrounding other entertainments (indeed, as has been discussed above, William Weber has pointed out that the establishment of the canon was deliberately *anti-commercial*) – until relatively recently.

As mentioned above, other than those compiled by shops themselves, two classical charts exist in the UK at the time of writing, though only one – the Classic FM-commissioned classical artist chart – is broadcast to the public.⁷⁶ In the US, several exist: Top Classical Albums, Top Classical Crossover Albums, Top Classical Midline Albums and Top Classical Budget Albums;⁷⁷ only the first two of these are accessible to the general public, while the others attempt to prevent the charts from being flooded with low-priced albums. Comparing the publicly available charts of both countries, why does the UK only need one chart to cover popular classical and classically-related purchases, while the US prefers to separate them?

76 WHSmith displays its own classical album chart, based on its own retail sales, which differs from Classic FM's rankings and is available to view in stores and online.

77 As at http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/charts/classical_index.jsp, 16 May 2006. Budget titles 'have a wholesale price lower than \$8.98', while midline titles retail 'between \$8.98 and \$12.98'
(<http://www.billboard.biz/bb/biz/currentcharts/currentalbum.jsp>).

Figure 1: Top Ten Chart Entries, week ending 20 May 2006

Billboard Top Classical Albums (previous week's position in parentheses)	
1 (1)	The 5 Browns, <i>No Boundaries</i>
2 (2)	Lang Lang, <i>Memory</i>
3 (3)	André Rieu, <i>The Flying Dutchman</i>
4 (5)	The 5 Browns, <i>The 5 Browns</i>
5 (7)	Yo-Yo Ma with Roma Sinfonietta Orchestra/Morricone, <i>Yo-Yo Ma Plays Ennio Morricone</i>
6 (4)	André Rieu, <i>Tuscany</i>
7 (6)	Juan Diego Flórez, <i>Sentimiento Latino</i>
8 (new)	Maurizio Pollini, <i>Chopin: Nocturnes</i>
9 (new)	U.S. Army Field Band & Soldiers' Chorus, <i>Duty, Honor, Country</i>
10 (re-entry)	<i>Match Point</i> Soundtrack

Billboard Top Classical Crossover Albums	
1 (1)	Andrea Bocelli, <i>Amore</i>
2 (2)	Il Divo, <i>Ancora</i>
3 (4)	Il Divo, <i>Il Divo</i>
4 (3)	Andrea Bocelli, <i>Amor</i>
5 (6)	Mormon Tabernacle Choir, <i>Then Sings My Soul</i>
6 (5)	Andrea Bocelli, <i>Andrea</i>
7 (7)	<i>Pride & Prejudice</i> Soundtrack
8 (8)	<i>Memoirs Of A Geisha</i> Soundtrack (John Williams/Yo-Yo Ma/Itzhak Perlman)
9 (10)	<i>Star Wars Episode III</i> Soundtrack
10 (12)	Hayley Westenra, <i>Odyssey</i>

The Official Classic FM Chart	
1 (1)	Hayley Westenra, <i>Odyssey</i>
2 (2)	Various Artists, <i>The Opera Album 2006</i>
3 (3)	Russell Watson, <i>The Voice – The Ultimate Collection</i>
4 (7)	The Sixteen/Christophers, <i>Ikon</i>
5 (4)	Andrea Bocelli, <i>Aria – The Opera Album</i>
6 (9)	Katherine Jenkins, <i>Living A Dream</i>
7 (5)	Karl Jenkins, <i>The Armed Man – A Mass for Peace</i>
8 (6)	Various Artists, <i>Classical Chillout</i>
9 (14)	Katherine Jenkins, <i>Second Nature</i>
10 (10)	Karl Jenkins, <i>Requiem</i>

The terms ‘classical’ and ‘classical crossover’ apparently describe different sorts of products; thus an examination of the two public Billboard charts may offer some insights into how the two designations differ, and why it may be desirable to keep them apart. Not all of this is detective work. The Top Classical Albums chart, issued 20 May 2006, contained CD releases by Lang Lang (at no 2) and Maurizio Pollini (no 8); both are solo piano albums that present classical repertoire free from gimmicks. Meanwhile, three Andrea Bocelli ‘pop’ CDs held positions 1, 4 and 6 in the top ten crossover albums (two of which, incidentally, share the majority of their track listings, each bearing just five new tracks in addition). It is also easy to argue why artists similar in approach to Bocelli appeared in the crossover chart, when Hayley Westenra’s *Odyssey* (no 10) features a ‘range of musical styles including classical, hymns, folk and pop’,⁷⁸ while ‘modern classics such as Mariah Carey’s ‘Hero’ and ‘Unchained Melody’ are given a refined classical twist’ on Il Divo’s *Ancora*, at no 2.⁷⁹ Among the remaining acts, however, any rules of what belongs where appear to be far less clear-cut.

This is where the classical chart begins to expand its boundaries. There is space not just for the ‘serious’ classics, as played by Lang Lang or Pollini, but also André Rieu and the Johann Strauss Orchestra’s light classical fare (at nos 3 and 6). The content of these CDs has always been considered classical, but it is at this point that we begin to ask what the designation ‘classical crossover’ means. Is it accessible, popular music that appeals to a wide audience?

Rieu’s live concerts attract a spectrum of fans, typically ranging in age from 16 to 65 years old. Members of the audience can be seen in any manner of attire, from formal black tie, to T-shirt and tennis shoes. Rieu himself dresses in tails and wears his hair long. The Johann Strauss Orchestra, [who] also dress elegantly, appear to enjoy every moment of each performance. Rieu’s warm demeanor habitually sets the audience to tapping its collective feet, if not dancing in the aisles outright. Rieu is not himself a dancer; he does not waltz and prefers it that way. Regardless he captured and held the interest of the mainstream public with his classical music repertoire...⁸⁰

78 <http://www.hayleywestenra.com/hayley-westenra-biography.htm>.

79 http://www.rcalabelgroup.co.uk/artist_spotlight/il_divo/biog/. (At no 3 in the classical crossover chart was Il Divo’s debut album, *Il Divo*.)

80 From Brennan, Luann and Deremer, Leigh Ann (eds.), *Contemporary Musicians* 26 (Detroit, 1999). Johann Strauss is known to have had a similarly ‘flashy personality’ to

Of course, a listener to the CD does not have to know this, as its sound content can be considered stripped of all external concerns. Take away the audience participation Rieu invites at his live performances, the dancing, the faces and clothing of the audience, and even the obvious enjoyment of the musicians; the music – what is left of it – has been sobered enough to stand alongside concert-hall classics, and can be listened to in reverent silence.

Another act which appeared in the Billboard Top Classical Albums which raises questions similar to those regarding Rieu was a quintet of sibling pianists known as The 5 Browns. Clearly successful in their home country, the Juilliard-trained Browns present a mixture of popular and less well-known classical pieces, arranged for any number of pianos, on their two first CDs (at nos 1 and 4 in the charts in the week in question). Like Rieu, their enthusiasm onstage has been associated with audiences of all ages; a reviewer on their website watched them ‘prove that classical music can reach teens and twentysomethings on their own ground’.⁸¹ Meanwhile, alongside photographs of the Browns jumping and cavorting in sand in the latest fashions, plenty of space is devoted to their reportedly homely, unsophisticated nature, and being ‘attractive and appealing’ while they ‘revamp stuffy classics for the Rachmaninoff-impaired’.⁸² Their apparent enjoyment of their situation is good news:

The 5 Browns are the sons and daughters of Keith and Lisa Brown, a down-to-earth couple from Utah. Lisa, classically trained to sing opera, decided early on that she wanted her children to have music in their lives... Lisa felt compelled to devote herself to managing their schedule – a full-time job of getting them to and from lessons, and sitting with them at the bench for their three-hour practice each day until about age 11. The hard work paid off. Each of the children, by as early as age 9, had made a debut with a major symphony orchestra.⁸³

André Rieu's, and presented low-status promenade concerts that built up a highly inclusive public in nineteenth-century Vienna. [See Weber, *Music and the Middle Class*, 110.] ‘The press bridled all the more at any implication that his gatherings stood on the same footing as normal concerts’ [*Ibid.*, 112-3] because Strauss's concerts did not include ‘classical’ works. Unlike Rieu, however, Strauss did not approve of noisy, cane-tapping gentlemen in his promenade audience, and used the high-German word ‘Tänze’ to distinguish his waltzes as a product of higher, rather than lower, culture.

81 <http://www.the5browns.com>.

82 *Ibid.*

83 *Ibid.*

Youth and good looks come into play: the quintet is managed by Joel Diamond (predominantly a pop producer), their marketing photography bears the hallmarks of the pop world, and their audience is unrestricted by age. It might be arguable that The 5 Browns, too, are a crossover product. Even their no 1 CD is entitled *No Boundaries*.

Another sort of confusion which occurs in these two charts is the separation of artist and repertoire. Juan Diego Flórez, a multi-prize-winning tenor with regular appearances at La Scala and the Rossini Opera Festival in Pesaro, was at no 7 in the Top Classical Albums chart with his CD, *Sentimiento Latino*. *Sentimiento* is a collection of ‘irresistible popular songs from his native South America and Spain’, some accompanied by orchestra, some by guitar, some by mariachi band.⁸⁴ This is an ideal candidate for the Classical Crossover Chart – Latin music with orchestra; yet it appears in the Classical chart, presumably due to Flórez's credentials in other, classical, repertoire.

If Flórez can, why can't Bocelli? After all, Andrea Bocelli *has* appeared in productions of *Werther* and *La bohème*, among others, though the number of his opera performances has been inevitably limited by his blindness, and as a result he has not been able to collect the array of trophies Flórez can boast.⁸⁵ Concentrating instead on the recorded music market, he has made many recordings of arias, and his ‘pop’ offerings are accompanied by symphony orchestra, sounding more like Rieu-style light classics or musical theatre songs. It appears to be this lack of stage performance and focus on recording that has prevented Bocelli's establishment as a ‘classical’ artist, despite the fact that extra-musical limitations should not have a bearing on how an artist's musical products are classified. And, while Hayley Westenra's website is happy to state ‘she is still primarily a classical crossover artist’,⁸⁶ Bocelli's management should be arguing with fervour against his inclusion in a ‘crossover’ chart:

With the unprecedented success of his classical career, Andrea Bocelli has

84 <http://www.deccaclassics.com/newsandnewreleases/may2006/4757576.html>.

85 Mattison, Ben, ‘Andrea Bocelli to Debut with New York Philharmonic’, *Playbill Arts* (28 April 2006), <<http://www.playbillarts.com/news/article/4449.html>> (accessed 4 January 2007).

86 <http://www.hayleywestenra.com/hayley-westenra-biography.htm>.

caused core classical repertoire to ‘cross over’ to the top of international pop charts and into previously uncharted territory in popular culture. However, while Bocelli might cause opera to ‘cross over’, his approach is distinctly not ‘crossover’. That’s a very important distinction in appreciating the achievements of Andrea Bocelli and his place in the world of music. For Andrea, ‘updating’ Puccini with funky electronic beat [*sic*] is plain heresy; the suggestion that translating the lyrics of a rock or pop classic into Italian and adding a string section somehow makes it opera, simply ridiculous. Andrea works, whether in classical and [*sic*] popular music, with huge artistic integrity and professionalism.⁸⁷

Yet another case in point, *Yo-Yo Ma Plays Ennio Morricone* featured in the Top Classical Albums chart of that week at no 5. Ennio Morricone, of course, is best known for his film scores (and of those, best of all for Westerns), and the contents of this CD are highlights from his career, marketed successfully by featuring the popular but classical cellist Yo-Yo Ma. In the Top Classical Crossover Albums chart, meanwhile, the *Pride & Prejudice*, *Memoirs of a Geisha* and *Star Wars III* soundtracks featured at positions 7, 8 and 9 respectively. To add to this, the soundtrack to *Match Point* also appeared in the classical chart the same week, at no 10. What is classical crossover when it comes to soundtracks, and what isn’t?

A look at the content of the *Match Point* soundtrack CD helps us to understand why it features in the classical chart, rather than the classical crossover chart. Unlike John Williams’s *Star Wars* and *Memoirs of a Geisha* in the crossover chart its soundtrack has not been specially composed for the event, but consists entirely of (mostly Italian) arias (since the lead characters in the film share a love of opera). This is somewhat akin to our dilemma surrounding Rieu: can this music, marketed as a soundtrack and therefore retaining links to the movie, still be considered non-crossover? Do we know if the three soundtracks in the crossover chart are only there because they contain links to an external feature (the film), regardless of the contemporary music recorded on the CD?

The music on the CD featuring Yo-Yo Ma’s name is that of various specially composed film soundtracks, in exactly the same way as the three specially composed soundtracks that feature on the crossover chart. This has been

87 <http://www.andreabocelli.com/2006/bio.html>.

collected together at random to create a supposedly classical recording, like an inversion of the *Match Point* soundtrack (which similarly features on the non-crossover chart). It might be that Yo-Yo Ma's previous unaccompanied Bach recordings give him the credentials he needs, like Flórez, to enter the classical chart. It might be that there is some distinction between Morricone and John Williams (for example) that marks one out as a classical composer, and not the other. It might be that film soundtracks should be welcomed wholeheartedly into the classical chart as the most popular orchestral music of today, or reserved for the crossover chart as aspects of a larger multimedia project. There is definitely some distinction between these two charts that is blurred; we certainly need to decide what 'classical crossover' is.

Having taken out the soundtracks, the tenors, the pianists, Westenra and Rieu, just two items remain in our two charts. In the Top Classical Crossover Chart, the Mormon Tabernacle Choir were at no 5 with *Then Sings My Soul*, a collection of hymns both ancient and modern. In the Top Classical Chart, the US Army Field Band & Soldiers' Chorus were at no 9 with *Duty, Honor, Country*, a patriotic display of military marches and Americana. To simplify matters, *Duty, Honor, Country* could well be classified as a collection of light classics (thus – like Rieu – worthy of a place in the classical chart), and some of the hymns are modern (like Rutter's 'I Will Sing with the Spirit') or feature a toe-tapping beat and sing-along chorus ('Sunshine in my Soul'). What is more difficult is deciding whether hymns and military music are classical at all. Are they placed in the classical or classical crossover charts because no other charts are suitable for them when they sell extremely well; and if this is the case, why are the classical charts chosen to fulfil this purpose? Is it because choirs, organs, and orchestral instruments feature on the recordings? To pose a very contentious question, when riding high on the charts is vital to further commercial success (whether military or religious organisations should rely on commercial success is, of course, a completely different story): do they have to chart at all?

Charting, of course, matters most to the record industry; 'brought up on a diet of charts and market-share figures, the major companies set great store by how big a share of the perceived market their classical divisions account for.'⁸⁸ As there can

88 David Blake, head of sales at Select Music, discussing 'Orbit vs. Elgar/Payne: What

never be enough charts to cover every minority genre within other minority genres, it is correct to approach military and religious music as non-popular, and a very simple test can be applied to see if it belongs in the crossover chart. The US Army Field Band's recording, despite belonging to a genre of normally limited minority interest, found itself high in the charts at a time when Americans felt the need for a reassuring military presence, and to support US troops actively serving overseas. Military music is neither pop nor classical repertoire, but neither does it *cross over* anything, and for want of a better place to highlight the success of the venture, it appeared in the classical chart. By contrast, sacred music seems to fall into two categories: that which is designed for active use in a place of worship, and that which is more suited to the concert hall. When the contents of the former category, including hymns, are taken out of their primarily occasional context and into a concert hall or onto a recording, then they are crossing over, out of their ordinary territory. The multiplicity of definitions that can be given to crossover help confuse such matters of classification, but this logic certainly helps in categorising such infrequent visitors to the classical charts.

Ricardo Companioni, responsible for the classical charts at Billboard, kindly explained how crossover titles are distinguished from those in the classical chart:

A classical crossover title is defined as an established classical artist performing non-classical material, or classical material being performed different to the composer's intent (i.e. Beethoven's Fifth Symphony performed with kazoos). Soundtrack scores are acceptable only when the artist and/or composer are established classical performers (i.e. John Williams and London Symphony Orchestra performing *Star Wars*, or *Schindler's List* with more than half the tracks performed by Itzhak Perlman).⁸⁹

This is, again, a helpful and logical set of distinctions to make, which appears to be relevant to all classical crossover releases; it helps us confirm that Westenra, Il Divo and Rieu are all where they are supposed to be, and *Then Sings My Soul* and *Duty, Honor, Country* to a certain extent, too. It does not, however, help to separate the titles discussed above into clearly defined classical and crossover genres. Primarily, there is the observation that symphonic soundtracks belong in

'Constitutes Classical Music' (14 May 2000),
<<http://www.naxos.com/newDesign/fopinions.files/bopinions.files/industry2.htm>>
(accessed 4 January 2007).

89 From email communication with Ricardo Companioni, 24 May 2006.

the crossover chart, yet this does not apply to the *Match Point* style of soundtrack where collections of arias are not being performed in the context of the composer's intent (the context of composer's intent, of course, is the reasoning behind the Mormon Tabernacle Choir's recording falling into the crossover genre). It could even be argued that the five-piano arrangements produced specially for The 5 Browns result in performances different to the composer's intent. There is also no distinction made as to what constitutes 'an established classical artist' which might otherwise help us to tell Bocelli from Flórez. It certainly fails to explain why Flórez's album and Ennio Morricone are not classified as non-classical material. As we can see, guidelines are in place, but it is possible to interpret them in any number of ways.

The Official Classic FM Chart poses few of these questions. Its name reflects the company for which it has been produced, rather than a specific type of music, and that company is happy to mix crossover with classical and often ignore any distinctions between the two. Its own top ten for the week ending 20th May 2006 included a few of the same artists, and several more of similar status.⁹⁰ Westenra's *Odyssey* was at no 1, and Andrea Bocelli featured at no 6 – albeit with *Aria*, a CD of more challenging repertoire than the three at the top of Billboard's crossover chart. Along with these are two albums from Katherine Jenkins, a young, attractively packaged mezzo-soprano, and one from Russell Watson, an ex-club singer discovered while singing 'Nessun Dorma' before a football match.⁹¹ Watson's modestly-titled *The Voice – The Ultimate Collection* at no 3, and Jenkins's *Living a Dream* and *Second Nature* (nos 6 and 9 respectively) all contain a similar mixture of light classics, arias, traditional songs and pop standards, and can be called crossover as easily as can Hayley Westenra's albums.

The Sixteen feature at no 4 with *Ikon*, a collection of sacred choral works seemingly themed around Russian composers and the Orthodox-inspired (and Classic FM favourites) John Tavener and Arvo Pärt. Were it to chart highly in America, it is easy to see this recording placed among the Top Classical Albums. Two of the remaining four entries belong to composer Karl Jenkins (no relation to

90 The top ten could be found at [http://www.classicfm.com/index.cfm?
nodeId=336&sw=1024](http://www.classicfm.com/index.cfm?nodeId=336&sw=1024) (24 May 2006).

91 <http://www.russell-watson.com/>

Katherine): *The Armed Man – A Mass for Peace* (no 7) and *Requiem* (no 10). It would seem Jenkins himself is a little nervous of being called a contemporary composer, as his website's biography shows ('it is perhaps for his *Adiemus* project and "classical" works for which he is best known').⁹² Given that traces of Jenkins's crossover projects *Adiemus* and *Imagined Oceans* can also be found in his serious work, and that Bocelli was termed a crossover artist on account of his dabbling in both pop and operatic worlds, it might not be unfair to call Jenkins a crossover artist, too. It is hard to know which of the two US charts *Requiem* and *The Armed Man* would feature in.

The main difference between the contents of the UK and US classical and crossover charts is probably the presence of two compilations of various artists. While Billboard has a separate chart for compilation albums, the Classic FM chart contained *The Opera Album 2006* at no 2, and *Classical Chillout* at no 9 in the week in question. By virtue of *Match Point*'s presence in Billboard's classical chart, these two would clearly also feature there, yet the first three tracks of *The Opera Album* present us with Katherine Jenkins, Russell Watson and Hayley Westenra. Are there really any benefits from keeping classical and classical crossover separate? Would it not make for easier classification of film soundtracks and artists trying out their hands at different trades? Sales-wise, it would appear that crossover dominates the UK classical market; The Sixteen did well to appear in the top five, though no doubt a television advertising campaign and being 'The Voices of Classic FM' gave them a head start over many other serious classical musicians selling their wares. Without precise sales figures, of course, it is impossible to say whether Lang Lang's US no 2 would have been knocked out of the top ten by Andrea Bocelli's fans.

Companioni's explanation affirms that the majority of Billboard's classical/crossover classifications are made due to the artist involved in the recording, rather than the repertoire contained within. The Official UK Charts Company made it explicit that Classic FM's chart was also an artist-based chart, yet the presence of compilations would go against that grain. What does this tell us about the status of classical music in the music industry and to the music consumer? We realise that classical music is now marketed like any other music,

92 <http://www.karljenkins.com/biography.php>.

with the vast majority of concentration on the performer, rather than the composer; that the emphasis on the performer may go beyond the sound of her voice or instrument; that there is pressure on classical artists to conform to consumer demand in order to produce profit; that techniques learned from popular music are put to work on classical performers to turn them into stars. Without artist marketing, classical music would not continue to hold its supposedly privileged and detached position from within a record company, quietly producing recordings of non-celebrity orchestras and conductors; the classical music departments would simply be removed as a profitless sector. Even Lang Lang and Maurizio Pollini belong to the new world of classical marketing, as their CD covers declare their names proudly alongside their portraits. The commercial market is where classical meets classical crossover, where high meets low, and the distinctions – inevitably – become blurred.

* * *

We have seen that charts are in part controlled by the larger music industry, both in terms of airplay – through playlisting, censorship and payola – and the manipulation of sales figures through limiting retail stock and releasing estimates rather than actual market performance. It is also clear that they reinforce generic boundaries, discouraging both the diversification of artists' repertoire and the exposure of listeners to other types of music; and even attempt to reinforce notions of high and low culture. But we also realise that charts are vital to the industry to stimulate sales and interest, and to help them manage their artists and budgets. Equally, a classical chart is a necessity to keep the classical music industry running, as is the consumerism that surrounds it.

This approach to classical music has certainly greatly spurred sales in some parts of the world; the British Phonographic Industry reported that sales of classical music had risen by £5million between 2002 and 2003,⁹³ and even if Universal Classics's CD sales through Deutsche Grammophon and Decca were down 7% in 2005, its chairman was happy to report a significant increase in the number of

93 Anon, 'Classical Sales Up By One Million', *BBC Online* (8 March 2004),
<<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/music/3542187.stm>> (accessed 4 January 2007).

classical downloads.⁹⁴ The BBC may have received well over a million requests to download Beethoven's nine symphonies in mp3 format in 2005, where the performers had not been marketed as stars – well above its estimate of 25000 listeners.⁹⁵ But it should not be much of a surprise to find the top ten classical CDs of 2003 containing more of a mixture of high and low culture, the well-marketed relaxation compilations and stars such as Westenra, Bryn Terfel and Aled Jones.⁹⁶ We are not so very far removed from the audiences of nineteenth-century America, enjoying the performances of Jenny Lind or Paderewski, but also buying their merchandise. The interest in classical music that is keeping the high-culture branches of the record industry solvent is clearly that of the *artist* who is carefully packaged to create the broadest commercial appeal; this, as will be discussed in the following two chapters, is the archetypal symbol of classical crossover.

94 Lunden, Jeff, 'Going Portable with Classical Music Downloads', *All Things Considered* (NPR broadcast, 6 May 2006),
<<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=5388986>> (accessed 4 January 2007).

95 *Ibid.*

96 Anon, 'Classical Sales Up By One Million'.

3 & 4: Case Studies in Classical Crossover

'Crossover' is most often associated with the proliferation of non-classical involvement in the classical music sphere. The relative locations of low and high culture are vital to this branch of crossover, and affect it in two broad ways: the identification of a product as part of high or low culture, and a product's adoption of aspects of another culture in order to influence the reception of that product. I have, therefore, organised chapters three and four according to this distinction, the first of which covers the identification of artists and composers, and the second concerning consumer reception of crossover. The two chapters together consider the several different kinds of classical crossover, in order to see how modern popular culture attempts to involve and evolve older music, and to examine the values we attach to crossover acts and works, and the criticisms levelled against them.

Rather than any of the more specific designations of classical periods, idioms or schools, the 'classical' of classical crossover simply indicates a genre opposed to popular music.¹ Classical music's twentieth-century stereotype includes black-tie-clad musicians, either playing showy virtuosic passages or singing in loud vibrato-rich voices; it encompasses instrumental and vocal works of diverse styles (but concentrates on opera, symphony and concerto). What is fascinating about 'classical crossover' is that its content is set up as the inverse of pop, yet proceeds to merge with it; thus it occupies the space of both low and high culture simultaneously. It has provided a wealth of different manifestations of crossover, as a result of which classical music pops up again and again in all sorts of situations, and in a whole manner of different ways.

1 For details of the various distinctions of 'classical' music within the broader study of 'classical music', see Hartz, Daniel and Brown, Bruce, 'Classical', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 9 December 2008), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

3 Classical Crossover's Musical Manifestations

3.1 Classical Stars, Popular Repertoire

Sales pitches for classical music have become increasingly based on artists, rather than repertoire. Record releases are often compilations based on snippets of well-known music of diverse genres: opera arias, traditional or national tunes, Broadway hits and movie theme songs. The artists are marketed as high culture; their repertoire covers both high and low. This typically all-inclusive attitude is now well established as one of the most prominent recipients of the label crossover. As such, it is also assumed to be a relatively new phenomenon, brought on by the wish to market the recorded product to a wider audience than the average classical music listener. It is not, however, without historical precedent.

Recitals of the nineteenth century were similar hybrids, mixing popular ballads, new songs, hymns, excerpts from operas and occasional *Lieder*.² Jenny Lind's tours of the United States were typical in their content of 'some classical music, some simple music, and some new music'.³ Instrumental soloists were no less broad in the spectrum of music they performed for their audiences: the violin virtuosi Ole Bull and Henry Vieuxtemps both performed programmes of light but showy classics (including many self-composed pieces),⁴ and both included variations on popular operatic tunes in their concerts.⁵

2 Christopher Bruhn points out that hybrid programming was typical of both amateur and professional recitals, and that '(t)he boundaries that compartmentalize musical life today - "classical" and "popular", amateur and professional, public and private - were much less clearly defined during the 1860s', in Bruhn, Christopher, 'Taking the Private Public: Amateur Music-Making and the Musical Audience in 1860s New York', *American Music* 21, 3 (2003), 260-290. On distinctions between popular and classical in the nineteenth century, see also Levine, Lawrence W., *Highbrow/Lowbrow: the Emergence of Cultural Hierarchy in America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1988).

3 Anon, 'Jenny Lind's Concerts', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 4, 80 (1851), 114.

4 Baron, John H, 'Vieuxtemps (and Ole Bull) in New Orleans', *American Music* 8,2 (1990), 210-226.

5 Bergsagel, John, 'Bull, Ole', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 17 July

The Austro-Hungarian composer and conductor Josef Gunzl, touring America with his band in 1848, successfully delighted American audiences with programmes of his own music:

[Some] had titles that reflected an American theme, such as the "Oh, Susanna and Rosa Lee Polka", the "New York Quadrille", and the "Yankee Gallop". Gunzl balanced his programs with popular overtures from the leading composers of his day, including works by Beethoven, Weber, Rossini, Mendelssohn, and Meyerbeer... He also played a variety of popular social dances – polkas, waltzes, and quadrilles – all of which were the fashionable rage.⁶

This tradition of high and low lives on through the Boston Pops Orchestra, founded not so long after Gunzl's tour of the US, which has continued to provide a similar mix of light and popular musical fare through classically-trained musicians since its debut in 1885.⁷ While considered a thoroughly American institution, the orchestra was created after the model of Parisian café concerts, and 'in the hope of re-creating the ambience of summer evenings in the concert gardens in Vienna';⁸ proof that hybrid programming – while most richly documented in the United States – was not exclusively confined there.

Despite the wide acclaim earned during their tours of America, the musicians did not escape criticism for the variety of repertoire they embraced. Vieuxtemps, writing in 1877, believed he was 'too classical' for his American audiences at the start of his career; conversely, 'several amateurs' of European descent in New Orleans had written to him in 1844 requesting more space for the works of 'Hayden (*sic*), Mozart and Beethoven' in his concerts.⁹ For Bull, the French-speaking critics of his audience in New Orleans, prone to support Vieuxtemps in preference for his Belgian background, described his compositions as lacking in depth.¹⁰ It is true that the compositions of neither Bull nor Vieuxtemps have

2006), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

6 Beck, Roger and Hansen, Richard, 'Josef Gunzl and His Celebrated American Tour: November 1848 to May 1849', *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 36 (1995), 59-60.

7 <http://www.bso.org/itemB/detail.jhtml?id=600005&area=pop> (accessed 1 February 2007).

8 *Ibid.*

9 Baron, 'Vieuxtemps (and Ole Bull) in New Orleans', 214.

10 *Ibid.*, 212.

entered the standard repertoire of violinists (though a small number of Ole Bull's melodies have become 'national tunes' in Norway, due to his somewhat special status of being the first countryman of international fame), yet the careful balance in the compilation of their programmes went a long way towards supporting their success.¹¹

We might consider this kind of programming as an exercise in negotiating the cultural differences that were discussed in chapter 1, both high and low, and American and foreign. The very fact that audiences provided feedback on the content of performances signals recognition of the differences, and – in the eyes of those who would have preferred more Beethoven – a wish to control and limit these differences. Were Jenny Lind or Henry Vieuxtemps alive and performing in a world of CD recordings and classical charts, the variety of their repertoire would not be as out-of-place as the twentieth century's trend towards more homogeneous recitals and recordings might suggest. In light of this nineteenth-century tradition, bass-baritone Bryn Terfel's renditions of 'My Heart Will Go On' (the *Titanic* theme), 'Danny Boy', and 'Abide With Me' on the album *Bryn Terfel Sings Favourites* (2003) might appear less unnatural alongside much of the rest of his recorded repertoire, including English (and a few Welsh) art songs (his albums *Silent Noon*, *The Vagabond*); favourite Schubert songs (*An Die Musik*); and the self-explanatory *Handel Arias*.

Bryn Terfel is an artist most listeners have associated primarily with opera, but always with serious high-art repertoire, since his launch into international prominence via the Cardiff Singer of the World competition's Lieder prize in 1989. Terfel acknowledges that, at the start of his career, he earned demand for recitals through his development on the operatic stage;¹² these recitals, much like nineteenth-century programmes, 'always have a definite serious and light side – like it or lump it... Some people disapprove of crossover, but who cares?'¹³ *Bryn Terfel Sings Favourites* became the second-biggest selling classical release of

11 Bergsagel, 'Bull, Ole', *Grove Music Online*.

12 Chan, Wah Keung, 'Bryn Terfel In His Own Words', *La Scena Musicale* 7, 7 (2002), <<http://www.scena.org/lsm/sm7-7/terfel-en.html>> (accessed 1 February 2007).

13 Anson, Philip, 'Bryn Terfel Interview', *La Scena Musicale* 3, 4 (1997), <<http://www.scena.org/lsm/sm3-4/sm3-4terfel.htm>> (accessed 1 February 2007).

2003 (topped only by Hayley Westenra's compilation *Pure* which contained covers of pop classics 'Wuthering Heights' and 'River of Dreams' alongside traditional Maori songs),¹⁴ proof that his wider repertoire is commercially successful. Critics suggested 'Terfel's voluptuous voice is so mesmerically rich and rolling that he gets away with it this time, but only just', but also indicated that he himself had doubts as to the wisdom of letting Deutsche Grammophon's representatives include the theme from *Titanic*.¹⁵ We witness that Terfel may be happy to perform serious and light, high and low, musics side by side; but when even he expresses uncertainty, the record company has the last word.

Terfel is by no means the only 'serious' classical performer to embrace crossover in performance and recording. In September 2005, the operatic soprano Renée Fleming released *Sacred Songs*, a collection with no real admixture of genres, but a track listing equivalent to many other crossover CDs: the *most popular* snippets of *light classical*. Here is all the famous sacred music: 'Panis Angelicus', Fauré's 'Pie Jesu', and both Gounod's and Schubert's 'Ave Maria's, alongside 'Amazing Grace', Humperdinck's 'Evening Prayer' and standards from Bach cantatas and Handel's *Messiah*. It is easily comparable with Terfel's crossover offering of 2005, *Simple Gifts*: the Bach-Gounod 'Ave Maria', 'Amazing Grace' and 'Panis Angelicus', with two settings of 'Ave Verum Corpus' (Mozart and Karl Jenkins), drive the point home repetitively.¹⁶ Fleming's album, released in the middle of a successful career, is an uncomfortable move: it is as commercial as Charlotte Church's debut album *Voice of an Angel* of eight years earlier (also sporting 'Amazing Grace', 'Panis Angelicus' and 'Evening Prayer'),¹⁷ but without the pressing need to establish herself as a household name.

14 Taken from the British Phonographic Industry's *Classical Trade Deliveries 2003*, available online at http://www.bpi.co.uk/pdf/classical_2003.pdf (accessed 1 February 2007).

15 Moir, Jan, 'Opera? Some things are more important', *The Daily Telegraph* (24 October 2003).

16 *Simple Gifts* is, according to amazon.co.uk, a 'collection of spiritual and sacred songs' and hymns, which curiously includes 'She Was Beautiful' and 'Send in the Clowns' (accessed 1 February 2007).

17 *Voice of an Angel* additionally contains Caccini's 'Ave Maria' and Lloyd Webber's 'Pie Jesu', which are not equivalent to Fleming's tracks of the same title. Church does, however, also perform 'Danny Boy'.

Yet Fleming has embraced crossover far more successfully. *Haunted Heart*, released just four months prior to *Sacred Songs*, included R&B and pop ballads together with songs by Mahler and Villa-Lobos. Her record label, Decca, was keen to point out to would-be consumers that ‘this is not Renée Fleming singing jazz as an opera singer; this is Renée Fleming exploring a completely different, highly individual method for making music’;¹⁸ unlike many crossover albums, Fleming’s displays a different tessitura from usual, a voice placement needing a microphone, and perhaps also needing recording, rather than live performance. Different, also, is the fact that for *Haunted Heart* there is no overt reliance on a ready-made fan base from her opera recordings; the contents were not selected for their accessibility, or for attracting the widest possible audience. There is no attempt to link the vocal styling presented on *Haunted Heart* with the lyric soprano she is well known for: this crossover reflects directly on Fleming slipping out of her established career path.

Although concert performances are a rarity, her recital programmes ‘include arias from Handel’s *Rodelinda*, a set of Schubert songs, arias from three Massenet operas and some show tunes’,¹⁹ balancing the popular and the classical – though with a stronger emphasis on the latter – like Terfel and their nineteenth-century counterparts. Additionally, she too has performed cinema fare, featuring on the soundtrack to *Lord of the Rings: The Return of the King*. She has lent her voice to soundtracks previously, to *Bride of the Wind* (2001) and *William Shakespeare’s A Midsummer Night’s Dream* (1999), but only in the ‘classical’ pieces offered side-by-side with the commissioned tracks.²⁰ Much like *Haunted Heart*, her *Lord of the Rings* collaboration has exploited an aspect of her voice her fans are unused to: ‘I don’t think anybody would know it’s my voice. It’s completely without vibrato, without inflection, without dynamics; there’s no connecting, no shaping of any

18 <http://www.deccaclassics.com/newsandnewreleases/july2005/9880602.html>
(accessed 1 February 2007).

19 Fleming, John, ‘Renée Fleming, the diversified diva’, *St Petersburg Times Floridian* (1 February 2004).

20 Fleming’s personal website includes details of each non-mainstream or collaborative recording she has appeared on at <http://www.renee-fleming.com/discs.php?type=miscs>.

phrase²¹ – indeed, a voice one fan likened to that of Enya.²² Once again, this was not used for commercial advantage, making no attempt to cover other popular movie themes, or connect herself with the success of the films (as did Celine Dion, who received massive publicity for her involvement in the theme to *Titanic*, resulting in topping three Billboard singles charts simultaneously).²³ Perhaps tellingly, this branch of her career is not even featured in her Decca biography (which, meanwhile, is happy to acknowledge her other appearances outside classical music ‘from appearing in advertising campaigns to serving as an inspiration for award-winning novelists’).²⁴ It is doubtful Fleming feels embarrassment at her forays into film soundtrack recording, yet that these experiences are sidelined suggests that feeling equally at ease with high and low is one barrier still to be crossed over.

3.2 Popular Stars, Classical Repertoire

Since jazz and pop musicians often start out with classical instrumental training and a traditional grounding in Western music theory, it is unsurprising to find them performing in multiple fields. This move is necessarily a more recent phenomenon, as the designations ‘popular’ and ‘classical’ were only introduced in the nineteenth century, but can be seen as early as 1959, with the release of Jacques Loussier’s *Play Bach*. The recording consisted of ‘ad-libbing works by classical composers to the swing and beat of the latest jazz numbers’, a style which evolved from ‘mess[ing] around ...while at the Paris Conservatoire’.²⁵ While studying classical performance, Loussier became a commercially successful popular musician; his ‘Air on a G String’ became firmly rooted in British popular culture as the accompanying music to a lengthy television advertising campaign by Hamlet cigars. Just under ten years later, Wendy (formerly Walter) Carlos’s *Switched-on Bach* was released, a collection of well-known repertoire played on

21 *Ibid.*

22 *Ibid.* It is worth noting that Enya was indeed the voice behind the soundtrack to *Lord of the Rings: The Fellowship of the Ring*, which preceded Fleming’s involvement.

23 http://www.billboard.com/bbcom/retrieve_chart_history.do?model.vnuArtistId=4468&model.vnuAlbumId=276801 (accessed 1 February 2007).

24 <http://www.deccaclassics.com/artists/fleming/biography/biographyset.html>.

25 <http://www.loussier.com/pages/biographie.cfm> (accessed 1 February 2007).

the new, electronic, Moog synthesiser (earning three Grammy awards and the first platinum-selling classical album by 1970, two years after its release).²⁶

It was clear that Bach's music, or at least the standard core of popular repertoire these two performers chose to focus on, lent itself to the different interpretive ideas both had in mind. For Loussier, the simple melodies and richer depths of counterpoint enabled different levels of improvisation, while ostinati were at once starting points for melodic development and functional material for Pierre Michelot on bass. Carlos makes explicit just how her selected material suited her ends: 'His music was ideal in several ways...: it was contrapuntal (not chords but musical lines, like the Moog produced), it used clean, Baroque lines, not demanding great "expressivo" (a weakness in the Moog at the time), and it was neutral as to orchestration (Bach freely used many variations on what instruments played what).'²⁷ Later experiments from both Loussier and Carlos led them to more of Bach's repertoire, and to other classical composers, independent of each other.

Classical music hit the charts in 1981 when Louis Clark (formerly of art-pop outfit Electric Light Orchestra) conducted the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra in *Hooked on Classics*, a series of excerpts from well-known classics, accompanied by the contemporaneously popular disco beat. The easily digestible snippets of widely known tunes, with the addition of the throbbing beat enjoyed by consumers of popular music, worked enough to set several *Hooked on...* spin-offs in motion. It also bears more than a passing resemblance to the products of more recent crossover artists, especially the likes of Vanessa-Mae, Bond, Maksim Mrvica and others emerging from the stable of Mike Batt, who, while not eligible for the classical charts, have been embraced by British company Classic FM TV for the attraction they hold for the under-thirties audience.

Many of today's Billboard Classical Crossover Chart titles are albums of opera excerpts and light classics sung by artists who are not primarily associated with performing on the operatic stage. (Even those who have performed live opera may fall into this category if they are primarily recording artists; Andrea Bocelli is precluded from being considered an *opera* soloist due to the limited opportunities

26 <http://www.wendycarlos.com/+sob.html>.

27 *Ibid.*

available for a blind performer.) Accessibility is the key; while it is predominantly considered a feature of low culture, there is no doubt that famous classical tunes are greatly accessible. This accessibility was exploited on *Hooked on Classics*, but additionally has been targeted by cabaret singers, actresses, balladeers and Broadway stars, just as Terfel's *Titanic* theme was expected to widen his audience.

Despite having attended stage school, Sarah Brightman only began receiving voice coaching after securing a role in the Andrew Lloyd Webber musical *Cats* in 1981; by 1985 'Sarah was in heavy operatic training' for (now husband) Lloyd Webber's *Requiem* and the forthcoming *Phantom of the Opera*.²⁸ Brightman claims Lloyd Webber wrote the starring role of Christine specifically to 'fully exploit her stunning vocal range' and her 'two voices', the pop sound and the light soprano.²⁹ Recordings from the 1990s predominantly offered pop and dance tracks in agile but unemotional, weak and breathy vocals (exemplified on *Fly* (1998)); her 'operatic' voice, heard on a snippet of 'Ebben? Ne andrò lontana' in 'A Question of Honour', is coated with reverberation and drowned by the orchestra, and does not stand out as noteworthy. By *La Luna* (2000), she was surer of her footing in dissecting her repertoire between her two voices; the album offers cover versions which suit her pop voice well (including Procol Harum's 'A Whiter Shade of Pale'), while she showcases an enjoyable, if overly vibrato-soaked, soprano sound on 'Figlio Perduto' (a setting of the slow movement of Beethoven's *Symphony no 7*), and Dvořák's 'Song to the Moon'.

Barbra Streisand, who calls herself an 'actress who sings',³⁰ released *Classical Barbra* in 1976. Though Streisand's vocal range is limited in comparison to Brightman, she makes up for it by providing a quiet support (despite a surprising lack of power) to her sound that is missing in the majority of Brightman's output. A comparison of the two singers' versions of Orff's 'In Trutina' represents the differences in their style. Brightman (whose 'In Trutina' appears on the CD version of *Time to Say Goodbye*) cannot bring her lower register above the sound of the orchestra, while her swooping between intervals and incessant vibrato attempt to offer drama in a manner which tries – too hard – to sound operatic. In contrast,

28 http://www.sarah-brightman.com/htm_sarah/biogtwo.html.

29 http://www.sarah-brightman.com/htm_sarah/biogone.html.

30 http://barbrastreisand.com/bio_bio.html.

Streisand's plainer approach sounds no less monotonous (neither singer imbues the phrases with much interest) but more carefully placed, and while elsewhere on the album shifts between intervals are prone to drag or swoop, the clearer sound Streisand gives 'In Trutina' suits her interpretation well. Streisand's selection is not adventurous, nor does it highlight versatility; these are all quiet, slow numbers, requiring a confined range and limited technique. In truth, it is hard to know what Streisand's intentions for the album were, whether it was intended as a serious departure into high culture or a fun addition to her 'low' career; and whether it was designed to impress or educate, either her own, or classical music's, fans. It was nominated for a Grammy award in classical music.³¹

Russell Watson was a Manchester-based club singer who was brought to fame in 1999 almost overnight, when asked to sing 'Nessun Dorma' before a football match – quite a contrast to the stage-school training of Sarah Brightman.³² Like Brightman, Watson's records juxtapose well-known Italian arias with pop songs (which his record company, Decca, describe as his 'innovative trademark mixture');³³ unlike her, and despite this mixture, he not only has his records displayed in the classical sections of record stores, but also features in the classical charts in Britain. Statements like 'Russell Watson became a professional opera singer in 1996'³⁴ and 'He has also played at the Sydney Opera House and both... Carnegie and Albert [Halls]'³⁵ highlight the belief that Watson is, in fact, an opera singer, and his production does nothing to dispel the parallel association of big orchestration with operatic scoring: for his third album, *Reprise* (2003), the tenor explains 'we've brought in Nick Dodd to make everything more epic. He is a phenomenal orchestrator and turns any "song" into a "big song"'.³⁶

Like Brightman, Watson also displays two voices, both of which concentrate on

31 *Ibid.*

32 From Decca's official biography at <http://www.russell-watson.com/story.php?gc=story&s=1&l=1&o=id>: 'Russell's big break came in May 1999 when he was invited to Old Trafford to sing before United's Premiership-winning match.'

33 <http://www.russell-watson.com/story.php?gc=story&s=2&l=1&o=id>.

34 <http://www.prideofmanchester.com/music/RussellWatson.htm>.

35 From Decca's 2003 biography

(<http://www.deccaclassics.com/artists/watson/biog.asp>).

36 *Ibid.*

imitation and a minimum of emotion: a small, breathy and slightly husky pop voice, often with a nasal sound, which graces cover versions of ‘Bridge Over Troubled Water’ and ‘Vienna’, and his more regular loud and vibrato-filled ‘industrial-strength tenor’.³⁷ Emotionless singing makes for equally disinterested listening, even in *Amore Musica*, which is ‘about Russell Watson singing from the heart’ (although the artist frankly admits ‘I don’t think I’ve ever done that before’).³⁸ The emotional detachment of his pop voice aligned him with many contemporary pop artists with reliably high sales; the light arias increased his appeal to the older market; and contributions to popular or well-marketed movie or television soundtracks (*Captain Corelli’s Mandolin*, *Enterprise*) widened his appeal yet more. Watson gains significantly from this older fan base: ‘the fact that I have a mature audience has benefited me hugely because they have stayed loyal’.³⁹ His commercial success is undeniable, with each of his first four albums reaching the top 15 of the UK album charts, in addition to topping the classical chart.⁴⁰ Meanwhile, despite praise in *Classic FM Magazine* for his ‘truly versatile voice’ and ‘strong image’,⁴¹ a BBC writer suggests he ‘lack[s] the taste, subtlety or finesse of classically-trained singers’ (making up for it with ‘a grand set of lungs’), and ‘tries to be all things to all manner of folk without succeeding in pleasing anyone entirely’;⁴² David Mellor in the *Mail On Sunday* has suggested that ‘to succeed, you need training and taste, and thus far he’s not been blessed with an abundance of either’.⁴³

Michael Bolton cannot be accused of sounding unemotional in his approach to opera, as we find on *My Secret Passion – The Arias* (1998). Said to have been prompted by his stage appearances with Pavarotti, his CD liner notes say ‘These

37 The phrase has been used to describe him in both negative and positive light respectively by Lebrecht, Norman, ‘How to kill classical music’, *The Daily Telegraph* (5 December 2001) and Ross, Peter, ‘He Used To Sing Elvis in Working Men’s Clubs’, *The Sunday Herald* (23 April 2006).

38 <http://www.russell-watson.com/story.php?gc=story&s=4&l=1&o=id>.

39 Ross, ‘He Used To Sing Elvis’.

40 See <http://www.everyhit.com>.

41 Anon, ‘Rover Album of the Year Winner’, *Classic FM Magazine* 90 (June 2002), 33.

42 Reavley, Morag, ‘Russell Watson: *Reprise* (Decca)’, *BBC Online* (19 December 2002) <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/music/release/bzw6/>> (accessed 4 January 2007). (It is noted that this review is not filed under classical music.)

43 Mellor, David, *Mail On Sunday* (quoted by Ross, ‘He Used To Sing Elvis’).

great arias, the ultimate means of expression for a tenor, have changed my perception of music, indeed my whole life, profoundly and permanently'.⁴⁴ It is neither operatic nor pop. There is no significant difference between his usual voice and that which he applies to these arias – it is unsupported, swoopy and shows poor breath control, though boasts a bonus of added dramatics (and peculiar vowels) in the lyrics as a result of his obvious enjoyment of the repertoire ('there's something emotional that happened on tape that I wouldn't erase').⁴⁵ As a result, listening to Bolton is less painful in places than Watson's monotone renditions; elsewhere, his sensitivity borders on the hysterical and unsettles any dramatic impact the music creates. Bolton obviously took bringing opera to his fans seriously, and its sales figures suggest they responded; it entered the Billboard Classical chart at no 1, a position it held for six weeks.⁴⁶

Classical tunes that are hummable, versatile, or accessible provide the essence of a popular hit; it is their popularity, after all, that has kept them preserved enough for us to enjoy them now. While in Bolton's case his sales figures indicate that he has introduced his fans to new repertoire, it is difficult to quantify whether the popular music consumer then explores the genre further, in a format not recorded by his favourite star. The main difficulty with using well-worn classics is that the resulting crossovers are often judged by classical music's standards: it is expected that the repertoire should be taken *seriously*, even worshipfully, and any alteration to the original, 'authentic' article provokes critical distaste. Not all Western art music is subject to this, of course, and those performers who have approached early or avant-garde musics have typically gained a little more critical approval.

Cleo Laine is best known as a jazz singer, and it was jazz that began her career, yet she has also pleased critics with her appearances on Broadway and performances of modern classics. Typical of her versatility, 'You'll Answer to Me' reached the top ten of the UK singles charts 'at the precise time that Cleo was *prima donna* in the 1961 Edinburgh Festival production of the Kurt Weill

44 See booklet accompanying Michael Bolton, *My Secret Passion – The Arias*, audio CD recording (Sony B00005620W, 1998).

45 Webster, Dan, 'When a Man Loves Opera, He Doesn't Sing the Blues', *The Spokesman Review* (13 February 1998).

46 Di Nunzio, Miriam, 'Bolton embraces new musical road', *Chicago Sun-Times* (2 June 2000) and Teachout, Terry, 'With An Aria In His Heart', *Time* (13 April 1998).

opera/ballet *The Seven Deadly Sins*'.⁴⁷ her 1974 recording of *Pierrot Lunaire* was nominated for a ‘Best Classical Performance’ Grammy the following year.⁴⁸ Despite her *Pierrot* being in English translation, thus losing a degree of the characteristic sonority brought to the *sprechstimme* in the original German, Laine’s growling voice offers a convincing performance, described concisely in Paul Griffiths’s review:

Her strength is in finding a different voice for almost every one of the “three times seven” poems, and in doing so without being archly sinister. Light, bitter and mildly sentimental, this performance is perhaps closer than any other on record to Boulez’s description of the work as “un cabaret supérieur”.⁴⁹

The more intimate (and emotional) nature of jazz performance would seem an ideal training ground for the hybrid speaking-singing employed by Schoenberg, the smokiness of Laine’s voice being a catalyst for *sprechstimme*.

Less well received were Marianne Faithfull’s interpretations of Kurt Weill on *20th Century Blues* (1996) and *The Seven Deadly Sins* (1998). ‘They think I’m a rock chick with a husky voice’ was Faithfull’s less than pleased response on hearing that *20th Century Blues* had been ruled ineligible for the UK classical chart in 1996.⁵⁰ The response of the chairman of the classical music advisory panel for the Chart Information Network (rebranded The Official UK Charts Company in 2001) was that the album ‘is not 100 per cent Kurt Weill and Kurt Weill is not 100 per cent classical’.⁵¹ (It might be noted that the Three Tenors featured in the classical chart prior to Faithfull’s recording, with hybrid affairs covering popular arias and Broadway hits; Russell Watson’s ‘innovative mixture’ also continues to feature.)⁵² This was repertoire with which she had become acquainted at an early age:

I’d known this work for years, of course, because of my own mum, who was Austro-Hungarian and a dancer in Berlin in the '30s... when I was a little tiny girl,

47 <http://www.quarternotes.com/cleobio.htm>, her official biography.

48 <http://www.sonybmgmastervorks.com/artists/cleolaine/>.

49 Griffiths, Paul, ‘Review: Pierrot Lunaire by Schoenberg, The Greatest Man, at the River, the Circus Band by Ives; Cleo Laine; Nash Ensemble; Elgar Howarth’, *The Musical Times* 116, 1584 (1975), 150.

50 Reynolds, Nigel, ‘Faithfull is Furious over Chart Bar’, *The Daily Telegraph* (11 September 1996).

51 *Ibid.*

52 *Three Tenors in Concert 1990* and *Three Tenors in Concert 1994* CD recordings.

my parents had 78s of Lotte Lenya singing "The Alabama Song" and those sorts of things.⁵³

This familiarity, together with her trademark rough and ironic vocal delivery, offers a more engaging counterpart than Sting, who had previously failed to prove that 'the raw aggression of Brecht can indeed overlap with the outlaw pose in contemporary rock'.⁵⁴ His detached and nonchalant Mack the Knife in Brecht and Weill's *The Threepenny Opera* on Broadway in 1989 was deemed 'a fast failure',⁵⁵ spawning reviews such as 'how could these scathing songs... sound as numbing as they do from the stage?'.⁵⁶

More recently, Sting's *Songs from the Labyrinth* (2006) offers the listener a selection of John Dowland's songs, both melancholy and cheerful. Sting's approach did not involve specialist vocal training, and he made no attempt to present himself as a classical musician. Rather, he hoped to reevaluate the status of what we regard as old and outdated music:

I'm hoping that I can bring some freshness to these songs that perhaps a more experienced singer wouldn't give. For me they are pop songs written around 1600 and I relate to them in that way; beautiful melodies, fantastic lyrics, and great accompaniments.⁵⁷

Prior to the album's release, Deutsche Grammophon no doubt anticipated criticism of Sting's musicianship in comparison with other recordings of the repertoire, such as Andreas Scholl's *A Musical Banquet* of 2001 (on which some of Dowland's songs, and others, are performed in their original countertenor range). The main source of irritation for critics at *The Independent* and *The Oregonian* (not to mention Norman Lebrecht) were his raw, rasping vocals and lack of subtlety;⁵⁸

53 Yurkiw, Chris, 'Interview: In a Weill Mood', *Montreal Mirror* (26 June 1997).

54 Rich, Frank, 'Threepenny Opera, With Sting', *New York Times* (6 November 1989).

55 Murray, Matthew, 'Broadway Review: The Threepenny Opera', *Talkin' Broadway* (20 April 2006), <<http://www.talkinbroadway.com/world/Threepenny2006.html>> (accessed 1 February 2007).

56 Rich, 'Threepenny Opera, With Sting'.

57 Press release, 'Sting releases new album of early music on Deutsche Grammophon', <<http://www.deutschegrammophon.com/gpp/?ID=Sting-Main>> (accessed 1 February 2007).

58 *The Independent*'s critic Michael Church wrote of his disappointment in Sting's live performance of Dowland, compared to the *Labyrinth* CD – see 'Review: Sting/Karamazov/Stile Antico, LSO St Luke's, London', *The Independent* (6 October

another critic cringes at the presence of multi-tracking and special effects, presenting songs in something other than their ‘original’ form.⁵⁹

Before the recording was available for sale, the concept had already worried Lebrecht and other guardians of high culture, causing ‘a deal of outrage among contributors to Radio 3’s unpleasant message board.’⁶⁰ Support arrived, however, from distinguished experts in historically-informed performance, including the lutenist Anthony Rooley and Richard Levitt of the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis.⁶¹ Peter Holman, director of The Parley of Instruments, was equally enthusiastic about the project:

It is exciting that an eminent pop musician is taking a serious and informed interest in John Dowland. His performances of the lute songs are refreshing in their vitality and their concern for the words. In my opinion his approach is likely to be closer to what Dowland would have expected than that of mainstream concert singers.⁶²

Holman’s statement of a view contrary to his own stance – that apparently ‘uninformed’ interpretation may be nearer the composer’s intentions than a historically informed one – is not to be dismissed. Once released, the majority of reviewers appeared to applaud *Songs From the Labyrinth* for everything from the concept to the construction, and favourable comparisons were even made with Scholl’s *Musicall Banquet*.⁶³ Even Lebrecht describes Sting as musically

2006). His colleagues generally agree that his vocals are not up to scratch on the recording, either. See Duchen, Jessica, ‘Hooked on Classics: Rock stars who attempt the crossover’, *The Independent* (16 October 2006); Stabler, David, ‘Sting’s raw tones’, *The Oregonian* (13 October 2006); and Lebrecht, Norman, ‘Sting switches strings’, *La Scena Musicale* (27 September 2006),
<http://www.scena.org/columns/lebrecht/060927-NL-sting.html> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

59 Critic anonymously cited by Hodgson, Martin, ‘Sting plucks lute composer from obscurity’, *The Independent* (16 October 2006).

60 Fenton, James, ‘There is thy Sting’, *The Guardian* (14 October 2006).

61 Allison, John, ‘A step back in time’, *The Daily Telegraph* (15 October 2006).

62 ‘Songs from the Labyrinth: Sting releases new album of early music on Deutsche Grammophon’.

63 ‘Both styles seem to share that quality of having been invented for the purpose. Sting’s style was invented by Sting. Scholl’s style is a version of something invented by Alfred Deller.’ From Fenton, ‘There is thy Sting’.

intelligent, his CD as coherent and credible, and is willing to forgive aberrations of style:

The occasional rock effect of echo chamber and over-dubbing is not overly intrusive and even the slurring of sharp consonants, fudging some of Dowland's sourdest lines, is acceptable in the context of a reconfigured presentation.⁶⁴

Sting's comparisons between himself and Dowland as 'alienated singer-songwriters' and his concentration on its intimate nature ensured he could present the recording with his usual melancholy persona and introspective outlook.⁶⁵ There is a lack of the usual pretentiousness that tends to accompany forays into high culture, and a sense of 'unfurnished emotional truth' and heartfelt sensitivity to the songs which effectively forces any seasoned Dowland listener to reexamine that familiar ground. Here is a crossover recording that helps us see similarities between seemingly diverse genres, where niche-market, high culture early music is effectively and sensitively approached by someone schooled in low culture. Admittedly, Sting's 25-year interest in Dowland will have coloured this successful interpretation, but *Songs From the Labyrinth* 'will do him and Deutsche Grammophon no end of good'.⁶⁶

In the sphere of instrumental jazz, as with experimental music, the line between performer and composer is blurred, being from oral, rather than written, traditions. Gil Evans's and Miles Davis's versions of Gershwin's *Porgy and Bess* and the album *Sketches of Spain* (which includes Rodrigo's *Concierto de Aranjuez*) feature music and orchestration techniques adapted from the originals, thus producing jazz with contrasts and sound shades rare in the genre. Evans's work as an arranger for the Claude Thornhill Orchestra in the 1940s led him to combine the ideas of orchestral composers ('mostly impressionists, plus a couple of wild cards like Alban Berg') with the necessary techniques of big band writing;⁶⁷ Davis drew inspiration from, and in turn inspired, Stockhausen.⁶⁸ Both artist and writer, often

64 Lebrecht, 'Sting switches strings'.

65 See booklet accompanying Sting, *Songs From the Labyrinth*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 1703139, 2006).

66 Hewett, Ivan, 'Refined and remote', *The Daily Telegraph* (8 October 2006).

67 Campbell, Tom, 'Absolute Master: Gil Evans', *Southline* (4 June 1986).

68 For an overview of shared influences between Stockhausen and Davis, see Bergstein, Barry, 'Miles Davis and Karlheinz Stockhausen: A Reciprocal Relationship',

occupying the same space, are able to cross over into the field of ‘classical’ music, playing and writing it in equal measure. Many other performers, including Bobby McFerrin and pianist Keith Jarrett, have achieved equal success working in the two separate spheres of jazz and classical music.

There are as many reasons for cross-cultural productions as there are artists participating in them. As we have seen, hummable tunes can both produce hit records and introduce audiences to new material. Some artists no doubt take part to prove their worth as ‘real’ musicians: Sarah Brightman’s dismay that her records are not displayed in the classical departments of record stores, and Marianne Faithfull’s response to *20th Century Blues* failing to qualify for the classical chart reveal a little of this mentality, though more prominently their tales reflect the music industry’s reluctance to move, or remove, genre distinctions. Sometimes the performer’s taste in repertoire may have matured, as no doubt is mirrored by that of their audience.⁶⁹ It is no real surprise that when Barbra Streisand produces a classical album, she chooses to cover soothing, popular arias to complement her former choice of theatre and club standards, or that Faithfull selects repertoire that challenges the listener with a bright gloss on chilling subject matter. Motives, however, are invariably difficult to ascertain.

3.3 From Pop Song to Symphony

It is not difficult, in addition to those popular musicians who perform ‘serious’ music, to find others writing it. Perhaps most famously, Sir Paul McCartney has dabbled in classical music since the early 1990s, in addition to publishing his poetry and exhibiting his paintings. Commissioned by the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra in 1991, to celebrate its 150th anniversary, McCartney produced the 90-minute *Liverpool Oratorio* (with the help of Carl Davis). His next work, *Standing Stone*, was commissioned – initially as a symphony – by EMI for its

The Musical Quarterly 76, 4 (1992), 502-525.

69 Charles Hamm has suggested a trend in mellowing musical tastes amongst American music consumers from rock, through easy listening ('adult contemporary' in the US), to light and popular classics, which – as performers adapt to prolong their careers – may be paralleled in their choice of repertoire. See Hamm, Charles, ‘The Fourth Audience’, *Popular Music* 1 (1981), 123-141.

centenary in 1997, and 2006 saw the première of the lengthy choral work *Ecce Cor Meum* (2006), both of which were also aided by orchestrators, arrangers and annotators. Singer-songwriter Elvis Costello, meanwhile, worked with the Brodsky Quartet on 1992's *The Juliet Letters*, and again (together with Swedish mezzo-soprano Anne Sofie von Otter) on the unreleased song cycle *Three Distracted Women* (1996).⁷⁰ The classical record company, Deutsche Grammophon, describe his work arranging and composing songs for chamber groups and small orchestras including the Composers' Ensemble, Fretwork, the Academy of St Martin in the Fields, the Charles Mingus Orchestra and the Swedish Radio Symphony.⁷¹ He completed the ballet score *// Sogno* in 2004, commissioned by the Italian ballet company Aterballetto four years previously, and was promptly commissioned again, by the Danish Royal Opera, for a work commemorating Hans Christian Andersen.

The length and scope of these epic works are a far cry from the production of three- and four-minute songs that both artists became well-known for. McCartney, once freed of the expectations of commissions and left to his own devices, reverted to the production of shorter, character pieces in the 1999 album *Working Classical*.⁷² Some of the pieces on the recording are new, others are orchestral versions of McCartney's pop songs; they were orchestrated by Richard Rodney Bennett and Jonathan Tunick. (Perhaps surprisingly, even once freed of the need for large-scale forms and the amount of thematic development that long pieces like *Standing Stone* require, McCartney still needed to work 'alongside his regular classical producer, John Fraser, to find a satisfactory way of shaping them into a

70 *Three Distracted Women* remains unrecorded. Details of Costello's relationship with von Otter are discussed in Allan Kozinn's interview 'Worlds of Mezzo and Pop Star Meet Somewhere in Between; Elvis Costello: "Let's Make Music"', *New York Times* (21 May 2001).

71 'Insights: Il Sogno', *Deutsche Grammophon Press Release* (July 2004), <<http://www.deutschegrammophon.com/special/insighttext.htm?ID=costello-il sogno&DETAIL=2>>.

72 Amateur Beatles-dedicated web site jpgr.co.uk attributes the following quotation to McCartney, without a source: 'I called it "Working Classical" because I've always had a bit of difficulty with the word "classical" with regard to music. "Classical" is often thought of as "serious" music, but that then denigrates all the other music I've done with the Beatles which I don't think was all humorous. There's some quite serious stuff there.'

coherent overall form'.)⁷³ Two years later (and also helped with performance and arranging by the pianist Richard Joo), Billy Joel released *Fantasies and Delusions*, a collection of short piano pieces both on CD and in a Schirmer edition.⁷⁴ While the pieces are short by the standards of *Standing Stone*, these are not as diminutive as those on McCartney's *Working Classical*, and certainly an expansion of what Joel created as rock's 'Piano Man'. After each of these songwriters has experienced success in his own right, and turned to a foreign means of expression, how is this music received by listeners (or performers) – and what has prompted its creation?

Sir Paul McCartney was the first pop musician for a long time to have produced a stand-alone classical work. The late creation of popular music as a separate genre means that very few songwriters have stepped over the boundary between pop and classical composition without blurring it. Progressive rock, characterised as a deliberate hybrid of high and low, was considered by critics (led by Lester Bangs, Dave Marsh, Simon Frith, and Robert Christgau) too highbrow, despite selling well to audiences through the 1970s, and thus not 'authentic' enough for the rock genre.⁷⁵ Any classical writing found in progressive rock, however, was repositioned firmly within a rock music frame and with a rock sound (such as The Nice's 'The Thoughts of Emerlist Davjack' (1967) and ELP's 'fugue' (*Trilogy*, 1972); even the most ambitious works, such as *Five Bridges*, also by The Nice (1969), and Deep Purple's *Concerto for Group and Orchestra* (1969), keep the languages of band and orchestra wholly separate, using the latter much as a glorious synthesiser to provide a Hollywood-style backing, and clearly separating the two groups of musicians and the two musics they provide. (This idea continues outside progressive rock; Metallica's *S&M* (1999) presented a compilation of Metallica songs arranged for the group and the San Francisco orchestra; chief orchestrator Michael Kamen described his task as 'writing a film score' to the narrative in the songs, adding extra scoring and occasional counter-melodies but

73 Liner notes to Paul McCartney, *Working Classical*, audio CD recording (EMI B00001ZSXH, 1999).

74 According to Robert Wyatt, 'Review: Fantasies and Delusions', *American Music Teacher* (April-May 2002), 'Contemporary composers would sacrifice almost any body part for a Schirmer edition with their name embellishing it.'

75 See Macan, Edward, *Rocking the Classics: English Progressive Rock and the Counterculture* (Oxford, 1997), 263 and elsewhere.

no narrative of its own.)⁷⁶

Other than Keith Emerson's *Piano Concerto no 1* (neither highlighted with media attention nor widely appreciated or purchased by fans),⁷⁷ George Gershwin is the one clear predecessor who intermingled the two worlds in which he worked. In 1923, after being commissioned to play jazz at a classical concert, he revealed his own reservations about mixing musical languages: 'I don't think jazz will ever be suitable to concerts. They won't get it.'⁷⁸ A year later, however, *Rhapsody in Blue*'s mix of nineteenth-century chromatic harmony, the blues and Tin Pan Alley met with great public success, and many more hybrid pieces followed (including *Preludes for Piano* (1927), *Concerto in F* (1925), *An American in Paris* (1928), and *Porgy and Bess* (1935)); other composers followed Gershwin's lead, creating 'highbrow jazz' for concert performance, and performance opportunities for jazz-based classical music followed.⁷⁹ Critics were not so keen: while acknowledging in 1925 that *Rhapsody in Blue* was 'enormously superior to anything that the better educated musicians have done in that style', Virgil Thomson claimed that it received 'excessive praise', adding that it was 'at best a piece of aesthetic snobbery';⁸⁰ half a century later Charles Schwarz suggested Gershwin's 'musical mannerisms... frequently seem to be ends in themselves, rather than means

76 From Kamen's liner notes to Metallica/San Francisco Symphony Orchestra, S&M, audio CD recording (Elektra 62463-2, 1999).

77 The earnestness of the *Piano Concerto*, while not unusual for Emerson, sounds out of place alongside the other band members' contributions to *Works Vol 1* (1977) on which it was released. Amazingly, Emerson describes the piece on his website as 'famous', and – together with the Chinese collaborative *Yellow River Piano Concerto* ('For years, it was the only symphonic piece allowed to be performed in China') – as 'compositions frequently regarded as two of the greatest piano concertos from the second half of the twentieth century'

(<http://www.keithemerson.com/EmosMemos/EmosMemos.html>, 25 February 2007, accessed 4 March 2007).

78 Wyatt, Robert, 'The Seven Jazz Preludes of George Gershwin: A Historical Narrative', *American Music* 7, 1 (1989), 70.

79 Details can be found in Oja, Carol J., 'Gershwin and American Modernists of the 1920s', *The Musical Quarterly* 78, 4 (1994), 646-668.

80 *Ibid*, 656.

toward more lofty artistic purposes'.⁸¹ Wilfrid Mellers points out that '*Rhapsody in Blue*... was never fully accepted by "educated" musicians' even in 1998.⁸² It is little wonder, then, that we know so few examples of classical music produced by popular songwriters.

Commissioned to write a full-scale work for symphony orchestra and chorus, and with considerable input from co-composer Carl Davis, McCartney plunged in at the deep end. Considerable public success ensued: the *Liverpool Oratorio* premiered to a five-minute standing ovation in 1991, then toured twenty countries and fourteen American states (defying the verdict that it would 'never travel').⁸³ His next work, *Standing Stone*, made its debut at the top of the Billboard classical charts. Fame has clearly been a factor in his achievement. McCartney 'can not only rustle up a front-rank orchestra to premiere his work, but hire it in advance to try things out'.⁸⁴ Legions of Beatles fans in both the UK and US provided a ready-made audience base; the barely rivalled popularity of the band among the current generation of critics has created in McCartney a figure whose musical prowess is not to be doubted. (One critic suggests that, regardless of whether his music is worthy of our attention, *he* is: 'there is no real reason why we should be listening to [*Working Classical*], aside from the fact that Paul McCartney is the composer'.)⁸⁵ Additionally, McCartney himself is of the view that his ability to produce the lyrics and melodies to best-selling songs qualifies him to write publishable poetry and symphonic music, and those who dislike the result do so not for its content or quality but because they consider his background to preclude him from participation in high art.

As a result, critics are more likely to offer a little balancing kindness to McCartney's crossover ventures than, for example, Russell Watson or Gershwin. The criticism,

81 Schwarz, Charles, *George Gershwin: His Life and Music* (Indianapolis, 1973), cited in Chase, Gilbert, 'Review', *Notes* 31, 2 (1974), 298.

82 Mellers, Wilfrid, 'Review: Questions of Identity', *The Musical Times* 139, 1859 (1998), 28.

83 Davis, Serena, 'Kings of Crossover', *The Daily Telegraph* (27 April 2004); editorial footnotes, *The Independent* (19 September 1996).

84 White, Michael, 'From Abbey Road to the Albert Hall', *The Independent* (5 October 1997).

85 Williams, Kevin M, 'Clearly Classical', *Chicago Sun-Times* (26 October 1999).

when it comes, is often carefully explained, steering clear of direct attacks on the composer's background and his preference to 'just sit down and see what happens':⁸⁶

McCartney's problem... is that he does not have the compositional means to develop material, especially at an epic length. So he falls back on clichés to keep the programmatic ball rolling. Without development, McCartney can only expand through orchestral weight, and that means the soupiest of strings and the kind of harp glissandi that even hacks have long since tired of.⁸⁷

While *Standing Stone* 'can seem painfully hokey both in some of its music and certainly in its poetic program... it also can stop a listener short with its sheer musicality'; one reviewer likened the piece to Mahler's symphonies, as well as the works of Bernstein and Gershwin (despite the lack of an overt relationship to pop in *Standing Stone*'s language).⁸⁸

Reviewers of *Fantasies and Delusions*, however, called attention to Billy Joel's name only to point out his lack of chart success preceding his classical release, calling his motives into question. His use of musical language is considered sound: a classical music critic called him 'an extremely talented person', adding 'there is a large gift residing within him... It seems that both his resources and his desire to express himself within classical forms are limitless'.⁸⁹ The overwhelming verdict on the pieces, however, is that they lack a distinctive personality beyond an exercise in nineteenth-century pastiche, 'the work of a promising student so in love with Chopin and Liszt that he has yet to find his own voice'.⁹⁰ Other voices offered less constructive criticism: while *The Observer* said it was 'perfectly harmless', *The Times* suggested that Joel 'crossed over only to a wasteland'.⁹¹ Norman

86 McCartney quoted in White, 'From Abbey Road to the Albert Hall'.

87 Swed, Mark, 'New McCartney epic sings a "massive" song', *The Milwaukee Journal Sentinel* (30 September 1997).

88 *Ibid.*

89 Wyatt, 'Review: Fantasies and Delusions'.

90 Teachout, Terry, 'Review: Fantasies and Delusions: Music For Solo Piano, Billy Joel', *Time Magazine* (12 November 2001). See also Wyatt, 'Review: Fantasies and Delusions', and the *Washington Post*'s Tim Page quoted in Wise, Brian, 'The Growing Field of Interpreting Billy Joel', *New York Times* (5 August 2006).

91 From Beard, Matthew, 'The Classical Hit Parade: From pop to "proper" music', *The Independent* (10 October 2005).

Lebrecht, in *The Daily Telegraph*, even accused Joel of helping to kill classical music with the album, together with Russell Watson.⁹² Despite this distaste, *Fantasies and Delusions* held Billboard's Classical Chart no 1 spot for eighteen weeks.

Elvis Costello's *Il Sogno* spent four weeks less at the top of the same chart, but the critics were rather more excited by his offerings. Much of what has been said about his musical language is positive:

To be fair, while *Il Sogno* is boring, tremendously boring, it's not bad. It's actually astonishingly competent for anyone's first attempt at orchestral writing – but it's the rare prodigy whose first attempt at orchestral writing merits performance at the Avery Fisher Hall.⁹³

Not just 'interesting and attractive because we know he wrote it' (implying once more the power of fame),⁹⁴ Costello's 'memorable and untrivial' melodies offered a 'surprisingly fresh' sound;⁹⁵ *The Observer*'s critic enjoyed 'some great dramatic moments';⁹⁶ and an enthusiastic review in *The San Francisco Chronicle* highlighted

an expansive, colorful and often striking creation, done with all the imaginative flair and restless precision of Costello's rock efforts... If this is really just scoring by ear, Costello's untutored facility is prodigious.⁹⁷

Faults found are generally excused: when 'ideas are not developed as fully as they might be', 'this is true of many ballet scores, which by definition are mosaics'.⁹⁸

The general consensus among classical reviewers was that Costello's move into the sphere of soundtracks and ballet-scores was promising; fans of his post-punk

92 Lebrecht, 'How to kill classical music'.

93 Bartlett, Thomas, 'Fallen Angel', *Salon* (21 July 2004).

94 Dyer, Richard, 'Il Sogno is Classic Elvis Costello', *Boston Globe* (21 September 2004).

95 Swed, Mark, 'Review: Il Sogno', *Los Angeles Times* (27 September 2004).

96 Woodcraft, Molloy, 'Review: Elvis Costello, Il Sogno', *The Observer* (19 September 2004).

97 Kosman, Joshua, 'Review: Elvis Costello, Il Sogno', *San Francisco Chronicle* (21 September 2004). Kosman goes on, however, to reveal an interest in Costello's popular background: 'But then, it always has been. From the beginning of his career, Costello has been a consummate classicist, less interested in innovation than in mastering and refining an ever-wider range of musical languages.'

98 Dyer, 'Il Sogno is Classic Elvis Costello'.

outfit Brutal Youth were no doubt less pleased, expressing in 1994 their distaste for ‘the experimentation of his song cycle *The Juliet Letters* or the supposedly unfocused jumbles of *Spike* and *Mighty like a Rose*’ and willing ‘the real Elvis’ to return wholly to rock.⁹⁹

Il Sogno's relative critical success prompted the *Danish Royal Opera* to commission from Costello an opera based on the life of Hans Christian Andersen, to celebrate the bicentenary of Andersen's birth. Prior to the planned opening of *The Secret Arias* in Copenhagen in 2005, it was revealed that a song cycle would be staged instead of the traditional opera Costello and the Danish Opera had previously promised, featuring just two singers (Costello and Gisela Stille) and four musicians.¹⁰⁰ After the event, however, *The Independent* revealed that the performance had been the result of the commission being unfinished in the appropriate year:

The Secret Arias is, in reality, a snapshot of a work in progress, with the finished opera not scheduled for performance until the spring of 2007. What Costello presents is a 70-minute song cycle with ten numbers that will form the backbone of the full-length piece.¹⁰¹

According to Copenhagen culture magazine urban.dk, the opera was never completed, and twenty songs, semi-staged, were performed at the Opera's Takkelloftet in March 2007.¹⁰² Costello's loss of interest was mirrored by the critics, leaving a distinct lack of reviews.

Famous names, of course, assume audiences to be intimately familiar with what the star does best, and this does not always work in the star's favour. When Sir Elton John produced his usual soft rock for Disney film scores and the successful musical *Billy Elliott*, the results were met with acclaim: *Billy Elliott* won the Laurence Olivier award for Best New Musical in 2006, while the *Daily Telegraph*'s

99 Marcus, Greil, ‘Review: Brutal Youth, Days Between Stations/Column’, *Interview* (May 1994).

100 Beard, ‘The Classical Hit Parade’.

101 Watson, Joanne, ‘Elvis Costello's Opera-in-Progress, The Secret Arias, Gets Its First Airing in Copenhagen’, *The Independent* (11 October 2005).

102 Jensen, Michael, ‘Den hemmelige opera’, *urban.dk* (2 March 2007), <<http://www.urban.dk/article/20070302/urban/103020015/0>> (accessed 26 February 2009).

Charles Spencer proclaimed: ‘Elton John has written a wonderful score that ranges from folk to hard rock, from razzle-dazzle show tunes to soaring anthems of human solidarity and defiance... Billy Elliot strikes me as the greatest British musical I have ever seen’.¹⁰³ In contrast, April 2006 saw the Broadway opening of *Lestat*, a musical inspired by Anne Rice’s *The Vampire Chronicles* and scored by John. The musical should have been the ideal outlet for John’s successful songwriting skills, combining the need for narrative with big show-stoppers. It closed, however, just thirty-three days later, having been slammed by critics for attempting to cram in too much story and too much schmaltz. The *San Francisco Chronicle*’s reviewer saw John ‘spend[ing] most of the evening trying to become Andrew Lloyd Webber at his most vapid and pretentious’,¹⁰⁴ while the *New York Times* lamented the ‘pulpy and mostly interchangeable’ songs.¹⁰⁵

The motives of pop musicians turning their attention to classical music have inevitably initiated critical scrutiny. This is a cultural (or social) rather than genre-related issue: composers have not normally been expected to justify their move from symphony to string quartet. McCartney, Joel and Costello were all accused of self-aggrandisement, and in response, all claimed to write classically for their personal enjoyment. Summing up opinion, ‘many felt McCartney made the move to prove he was a serious musician... the *Sunday Times* called [*Standing Stone*] “a massive folie de grandeur”’.¹⁰⁶ Yet in answer to *The Independent*’s question ‘is he out to prove something to himself, or to the world?’, McCartney ‘tend[s] to be embarrassed’ about showing people anything other than his songs (though he made no attempt to play down the publicity that surrounded his concert works, poetry anthology and painting exhibition).¹⁰⁷ While in 1998 Billy Joel proclaimed he enjoyed classical writing so much it was not important to present the music

103 Spencer, Charles, ‘Billy boy, this is the greatest musical yet’, *The Daily Telegraph* (12 May 2005).

104 Hurwitt, Robert, ‘Quick! Someone fetch the garlic and a wooden stake!’, *San Francisco Chronicle* (10 January 2006), D1.

105 Brantley, Ben, ‘Anne Rice’s Vampires, With Elton John’s Music, Take to the Stage’, *New York Times* (26 April 2006).

106 Beard, ‘The Classical Hit Parade’.

107 White, ‘From Abbey Road to the Albert Hall’.

publicly,¹⁰⁸ critics noted the fact that its release ‘came at a lean time in his career’.¹⁰⁹ For Costello,

I’ve been taken phenomenally seriously since the beginning of my career – sometimes too seriously – so I don’t need to do anything as difficult as writing an orchestral piece to make myself look more grandiose.¹¹⁰

Even so, and bearing in mind that he was commissioned to compose *// Sogno*, that ‘it’s hard to view as anything but a hubristic vanity project’ still has a ring of truth.¹¹¹

Together with the interest in motive, authenticity of musical training and authorship of works comes into play. It appears to matter to the press, and perhaps the public who read reviews, that – despite the industry’s move towards performer-led marketing – classical music is still created by an inspired composer, rather than by committee. This is even more vital when the composer is well known. *The Boston Globe*’s Richard Dyer was proudly quoted by Costello’s record company for reporting that, for *// Sogno*, ‘he wrote the music and orchestrated it on his own’;¹¹² Joel, we are told, notated *Fantasies and Delusions* himself, but turned to the pianist Richard Joo for help with the ‘arrangements and recordings’.¹¹³ For McCartney, the association was not so easy. His *Liverpool Oratorio*, as we know, was co-composed with Carl Davis. Not being able to notate music, and not wishing to learn notation in case it damaged his capacity to produce memorable melodies, we learned that McCartney dictated his ideas to Davis, who notated,

108 Tianen, Dave, ‘Billy Joel recomposes his future’, *The Milwaukee Journal Sentinel* (22 November 1998).

109 Beard, ‘The Classical Hit Parade’.

110 John, Elton, ‘Elvis Costello’, *Interview* (October 2004). It is also interesting to note that, like Andrea Bocelli’s marketers, Costello does not want to be associated with crossover. According to Kozinn, ‘Worlds of Mezzo and Pop Star Meet Somewhere in Between’, ‘it is best not to use the word crossover in his presence. He refers to it as “the dreaded C word”, and describes the concept as tainted’.

111 Bartlett, ‘Fallen angel’.

112 Dyer, ‘*// Sogno* is Classic Elvis Costello’. Deutsche Grammophon highlighted the (good) reviews *// Sogno* received with a page devoted to them on their web site (http://www.deutschegrammophon.com/artistmicrosite/pressdetail.htm?PRODUCT_NR=4715772&ART_ID=COSEL).

113 Wise, ‘The Growing Field of Interpreting Billy Joel’.

harmonised, structured and orchestrated the entire piece.

Deciding for his next commission to take the reins himself, critical interest in the team behind *Standing Stone* bred a series of conflicting reports. From *The Milwaukee Journal Sentinel*, we learn that

instead of dictating ideas to another composer, [McCartney] composed alone at the computer... Only later did he turn to others, including the saxophonist John Harle, to advise on structure, and the versatile composer Richard Rodney Bennett, to orchestrate.¹¹⁴

Meanwhile, the British *Independent* tells us that 'for the day-to-day business of translating McCartney's raw ideas into coherent, meaningful notation there was David Matthews', who described his own role to the newspaper as someone to 'sort out the rhythms, phrasing, dynamics and turn general "brass" or "strings" markings into specific instrumentation'.¹¹⁵ There is seemingly little progression from humming tunes to Davis, the human notator, to tapping notes into an electronic keyboard; a great many smaller helping hands, including two orchestrators and several advisers, have prevented another single name from being credited with the creation of *Standing Stone*, ultimately leaving us believing that each note has been carefully placed as he thought it through himself.

We should take a moment to consider whether any orchestral composers contemporary with McCartney and Costello are indeed the kind of divinely inspired genius we tend to imagine. Among Broadway and film composers it is not only accepted but expected that composers will use an orchestrator, since the scoring is a time-consuming task and deadlines can be tight. On screen, John Williams, Hans Zimmer and Danny Elfman have established long-term working relationships with Herbert Spencer, Bruce Fowler and Steve Bartek respectively. On the stage, Andrew Lloyd Webber has used David Cullen and Geoff Alexander to not only orchestrate his musicals but to produce orchestral suites for concert performance from them, too, while Stephen Sondheim worked with a number of orchestrators, among the most high-profile of whom are Paul Gemignani, Jonathan Tunick, and the Disney collaborator Michael Starobin. In some of these cases, orchestrators are used because the composer does not have the knowledge of the orchestra to produce the imagined sound. While Gershwin orchestrated *Concerto in F* (1925)

114 Swed, 'New McCartney epic sings a "massive" song'.

115 White, 'From Abbey Road to the Albert Hall'.

himself, he felt his technique insufficient to manage *Rhapsody in Blue*, and hired Ferde Grofé to transform his two-piano piece into a work for jazz orchestra. Danny Elfman ‘likens himself to an illiterate person who taught himself the alphabet and is writing a novel’, and Steve Bartek is employed to transform Elfman’s treble-clef sketches into full orchestral scores.¹¹⁶ Elfman explains Bartek’s role:

He never changes a melody, he doesn’t add counterpoint, he does not change or add harmonies. That’s the composer’s job. He will elect what instrumentation might best express what I’m trying to convey in terms of doubling melodies and dividing the parts of the string section so they can be used most effectively.¹¹⁷

The majority of the time, however, the composers are orchestrators in their own right, who have likely succeeded in the competitive Broadway or Hollywood market through starting out as an arranger, orchestrator or notator. Prokofiev’s and Copland’s orchestrations are often regarded as brilliant, yet both composers used an orchestrator when writing for film.

While stage and screen scores can be classified as crossover products that often straddle high and low cultural boundaries, we should not assume that the role of composer’s aide was absent from high culture altogether. Prokofiev and Copland aside, it was standard practice for composers’ pupils to realise figured basses in the Baroque and Classical eras, and it was assumed that performers would stamp their personalities on the music they played through ornamentation or cadenza. The concept of the single composer was created in the Romantic era, and has long been outdated, but remains ingrained as a facet of high culture (also, we remember, a nineteenth-century construction). What scandal, then, when, ‘After his death in 1886, Liszt’s achievements in Weimar were further tainted by the publication of seemingly credible allegations that he had not orchestrated his own symphonic works.’¹¹⁸ Somewhat akin to Sir Paul McCartney, Liszt was a pop icon of his day, surrounded by swooning ladies and merchandise. Andreas Moser’s biography of the violinist Joseph Joachim reports that Liszt’s scribe, Joachim Raff, had followed Liszt to Weimar in order to be helpful to him in the instrumentation

116 Maclean, Paul, ‘What Orchestrators Do’, *Film Score Monthly* 85 (September 1997).

117 Kendall, Lukas, ‘From Pee-Wee to Batman to Two Films a Year’, *Film Score Monthly* 64 (December 1995).

118 Bertagnolli, Paul, ‘Amanuensis or Author? The Liszt-Raff Collaboration Revisited’, *19th-Century Music* 26, 1 (2002), 24.

of his new orchestral works. Since Liszt until then had written only for the piano, he was so unfamiliar with orchestral technique that the accompaniment of his Concerto in Eb major, for example, was orchestrated from beginning to end by Raff. Only in the course of time did Liszt acquire that virtuosic means of treating a complicated orchestral apparatus which later was supposed to be admired in such a high degree.¹¹⁹

It is undoubtedly the composer who produces the ideas, and the orchestrator's skill lies in realising those ideas. Claiming part-ownership of the orchestral music of Paul McCartney or John Williams matters because talent is exchanged for credit and money. Why the media should be so keen on distinguishing between the products of these two composers is directly connected to the difference between the supporting role of film music, and the absolute, concert-filling role of 'symphonic poems' like Standing Stone. Creativity is judged, and valued, socially. In the music industry, 'what often appear to be fundamentally economic or commercial decisions (which artists to sign; how much to invest in them; how to market them) are based on a series of historically specific cultural values, beliefs and prejudices';¹²⁰ it is these separate systems, one for popular music, one for classical, that control what we hear, and how we hear it. If McCartney wants to succeed in the world of high culture, he will have to play by high culture's critical rules.

Despite the boundary between high and low art still prominently featuring in the critics' world, other figures in rock music have come forward into the classical music establishment with apparent ease. Jonny Greenwood, lead guitarist of Radiohead, was appointed the BBC Concert Orchestra's composer-in-residence in 2005,¹²¹ and Aphex Twin and Squarepusher both appear alongside Cage, Ligeti, Stockhausen et al on a recent London Sinfonietta CD, *Warp Works and 20th-Century Masters*.¹²² As a result, there appears to be an increasing insecurity of

119 See Moser, Andreas, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild* (Berlin, 1898), I, 75; quoted *ibid*, 25.

120 Negus, Keith, 'Identities and Industries: The Cultural Formation of Aesthetic Economies' in P. du Gay & M. Pryke (eds), *Cultural Economy* (London, 2002), 116.

121 Beard, 'The Classical Hit Parade'.

122 London Sinfonietta, *Warp Works and 20th Century Masters*, audio CD recording (Warp B000GIWRUW, 2006). Among Aphex Twin's contributions are two pieces for

identity among composers and songwriters. As Billy Joel sees it,

classical music is a very protective world. The attitude is, “Who the hell are you coming in here with your money and your fame?” And to an extent, they’re right. Who the hell are we?¹²³

3.4 Professional Pride and Popular Prejudice

The prevailing critical view of popular composers turning their hands to classical music is that they do so in order to prove themselves as great artists. What happens, then, when a figure perceived as a classical composer produces work belonging in the realm of low culture? The views of the classical music establishment would appear to have changed little since the nineteenth century, when ‘inferior music was associated with inferior people’.¹²⁴ Traditionally, however, many composers have been known to supplement their ‘serious’ work with working as an accompanist for a cabaret singer (such as Erik Satie), or with the production of music aimed at the wider public, rather than specifically for their engagements at the court or church. Purcell’s bawdy songs have been collected and published; Mozart produced *Die Zauberflöte*, incorporating the culture clash of high and low society through the music each character sings; and Haydn and Beethoven, as the most esteemed examples among many, combined popular and serious styles and wrote arrangements of folk songs.¹²⁵ It should be no surprise to find more recent

prepared piano.

123 Billy Joel quoted in Tianen, ‘Billy Joel recomposes his future’.

124 Charosh, Paul, “Popular” and “Classical” in the Mid-Nineteenth Century’, *American Music* 10, 2 (1992), 120.

125 Purcell’s songs are available in Purcell, Henry, *Come Let Us Drink: Catches Compleat, Pleasant and Divertive* ed. Michael Nyman (Great Yarmouth, 1972) – these were not intended as a collection, and the accompanying title is purely editorial. More on Mozart’s association with and reception by high and low classes can be found in Horowitz, Joseph, ‘Mozart as Midcult: Mass Snob Appeal’, *Musical Quarterly* 76, 1 (1992), 1-16; while for Haydn and Beethoven see, among others, Geiringer, Karl, ‘Haydn and the Folksong of the British Isles’, *Musical Quarterly* 35, 2 (1949), 179-208; Anderson Hufstader, Alice, ‘Beethoven’s Irische Lieder: Sources and Problems’, *Musical Quarterly* 45, 3 (1959), 343-360; and Petho, Csilla, ‘Style Hongrois: Hungarian Elements in the Works of Haydn, Beethoven, Weber and Schubert’, *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 41, (2000), 199-284.

composers enjoying the same privilege.

Philip Glass and Michael Nyman are both best known as composers associated with experimental, and more specifically minimalist, music. This has always been considered avant-garde and normally well within the realm of high culture, although both composers readily admit to influences from sources other than the traditional sphere of Western art music, among them Indian and rock musics.¹²⁶ There are numerous similarities between the careers of the two composers. Perhaps as an outgrowth of their minimalist associations, both composers have produced film soundtracks since around the beginning of the 1980s: Nyman's credits include a number of Peter Greenaway films (including *A Zed and Two Noughts* (1985) and *The Cook, the Thief, his Wife and her Lover* (1989)), and – most famously – Campion's *The Piano* (1992); Glass earned a Best Artistic Contribution Award at Cannes for *Mishima* (1985), Academy Award nominations for his scoring of *The Hours* (2002) and the black comedy *Notes on a Scandal* (2006), and a Golden Globe for *The Truman Show* (1998).

Quite independently, both composers conceived many of their film scores so that they could be performed live alongside screenings of the films. The benefit of design for live performance is that the music – even accompanied by the film – can also be used in a concert setting. Both composers have availed themselves of the opportunity, aided by controlling their own orchestras, the Philip Glass Ensemble and the Michael Nyman Band. Glass and his musicians toured film screenings of the *Qatsi* trilogy in 1999, and followed up with the soundtrack to *Dracula* the same year;¹²⁷ Nyman's group performed the new soundtracks *Man with a Camera* (to Vertov's film of 1929) and *The Commissar Vanishes* (described as an 'opera' which 'accompanies a sequence of stills from the David King archive of Stalin-era family photographs, their faces scored out and scratched') in 2004 for their twenty-fifth anniversary.¹²⁸

126 For an overview of stylistic differences, see Strickland, Edward, *Minimalism: Origins* (Bloomington, 1993).

127 Anderman, Joan, 'Philip Glass revisits musical score from 1983 film', *Milwaukee Journal Sentinel* (19 January 1999).

128 Steward, Sue, 'The Piano man's latest scores', *London Evening Standard* (16 May 2002).

This in itself is an interesting exercise in reversing expectations. Glass and Nyman's respective tours turn the concept of film-as-atraction and soundtrack-as-backdrop on its head, by bringing people to live musical performances in concert venues that may or may not include the film. Extracting soundtracks from the multimedia projects of which they form an integral part and placing them in the concert hall is also an elevation of what is often viewed as a commercial product to the sort of absolute music favoured in the concert hall environment (although arguably, in many art films not intended as Hollywood blockbusters, the soundtrack is often equally noncommercial). Removed from its original context, most diegetic film music reveals problems of continuity, while the non-diegetic music's function as a wash of colour behind the action often provides little in the way of integral musical interest. For Nyman and Glass, however, the minimalist language of their concert music already functions in a non-diegetic way, as a soundtrack to consciousness, and as a result, presenting excerpts of their film music in concert offers less of a contextual problem than, for example, the excerpts of Hollywood soundtracks broadcast on Classic FM.

The difference between diegetic and non-diegetic has nevertheless been the cause of some critical concern, mainly due to the music's integral role as part of a movie and therefore its presumed adoption of themes explored in the screenplay or script. On a 1999 London concert of Nyman's soundtracks, one reviewer reported '*A La Folie* (for a 1994 Diane Kurys film) was too bitty to make more than a vaguely pleasant impact, with no hint of the film's apparent eroticism';¹²⁹ for *Dracula*, one American critic felt 'Glass's score captured the film's tense, obsessive mood... But the music blossomed into something equally rare for Glass – full-blown, romantic song – when the action demanded it.'¹³⁰ It is no surprise that a director planning a mood of relentlessness and propulsion in a film might well choose a minimalist to provide the soundtrack. According to Neil Burger, director of *The Illusionist* (2006), Glass's soundtrack 'is a driving force to the movie... There are many scenes and sequences without dialogue, and it falls to the music to tell the story'.¹³¹ And yet Glass chose to turn to film music himself, selecting the film-

129 Maycock, Robert, 'Classical: Style and warmth', *The Independent* (14 July 1999).

130 Delacoma, Wynne, 'Glass's soundtrack brings Dracula to life', *Chicago Sun-Times* (29 October 2000).

131 Press Release, 'Music From the Motion Picture The Illusionist, Featuring an Original

makers with whom he wished to work (though there are exceptions, such as Greenaway's *The Man in the Bath* (2001)), enabling him to collaborate more closely, and more influentially, with the directors and producers of the films he scored for.¹³² It is, therefore, quite possible for action in a film to be dictated by the music produced (or its overall style), and equally possible that pieces which could ordinarily have functioned as concert music can instead be produced as parts of the score. Summarising the score of *The Illusionist* as a series of 'elegantly framed chamber operas' highlights the degree to which this can be taken.¹³³

Michael Nyman, on the other hand, started his musical career with film music, rather than turning to it, and soundtracks provided his strongest source of income. In 1993, *Time Will Pronounce*, a collection of his chamber pieces, sold thirty thousand copies; the soundtrack to *The Piano*, released the same year, sold a hundred times that.¹³⁴ Additional branches to his career include commercials and product branding. 2002 saw Nyman create a string quartet for the World Cup, 'based on the England football team', and music to accompany a television advertisement for snack foods;¹³⁵ his music is 'commissioned to play at the launches of cars and trains' and at Queens Park Rangers football club in the UK,¹³⁶ successful in the commercial sphere, and well circulated (albeit often anonymously) in the public one. Glass, too, has composed for a high-profile

'Score by Philip Glass', *Market Wire* (July 2006),
<http://www.findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_pwwi/is_200607/ai_n16632044> (accessed 1 February 2007).

132 Potter, Keith, 'Classical Philip Glass on Film Live, The Barbican', *The Independent* (14 January 2003).

133 Gray, Louise, 'Sciopero, Yo Yo Mundi', *New Internationalist* (December 2004).

134 Fontaine, Rex, 'People: No ivory tower for this pianist', *The Independent* (22 March 1998).

135 Steward, 'The Piano man's latest scores'.

136 Church, Michael, 'Opera - Nyman is just the ticket', *The Independent* (20 July 2004); Wadley, Veronica, 'Editorial: At last, a classic score for QPR', *London Evening Standard* (20 October 2005). Nyman had previously written music in honour of Queens Park Rangers, *After Extra Time*, for the 1992 television film *The Final Score*, but was pleasantly surprised to be commissioned to provide the musical fanfare to back the team emerging onto the football field. See Nyman, Michael, 'Composing the QPR suite', *The Guardian* (21 October 2005).

sporting event, being commissioned to provide the music for the opening and closing ceremonies of the 1984 Los Angeles Olympics. Both composers' contributions to sport have been classical in style, rather than incorporating any specific nods towards popular culture (Nyman describes the QPR suite as 'a piece of very, very functional music... music of a type that 99% of the fans at Loftus Road will not be familiar with... without sacrificing wide appeal');¹³⁷ the purpose of such music at popular-culture events will be discussed below.

In another independent but parallel move, both Glass and Nyman have found themselves collaborating with popular musicians. Neil Hannon, of The Divine Comedy, was already familiar with Nyman's music, having cited him as an influence on the band,¹³⁸ and so their 1997 partnership, which saw Nyman at the piano joined by the band members in arrangements of highlights from his Greenaway scores, was perhaps less of a mismatch of styles than it could have been – 'the evening's highlight... proved as engaging and visceral as any rock song'.¹³⁹ Philip Glass has had rather more engagements with popular artists, among them Suzanne Vega and Paul Simon on *Songs from Liquid Days* (1986); David Bowie and Brian Eno on the *Low Symphony* (1992) and *Heroes Symphony* (1997); and Aphex Twin, on a 1995 remix of *Heroes* (released in 2003).

Just as Glass's conscious choice of film directors enabled him to keep a certain amount of control over the narrative direction of the screen action in advance, not all of these collaborations involved a meeting of composers' ideas. Each of the four songwriters of *Songs from Liquid Days* worked with Glass in the sole capacity of lyricist. This resulted in the songs having distinct textual characters, but the uniform musical personality of Glass, subverting any narrative, inflections and speech patterns implied by the lyrics by breaking them up in his settings. A reviewer for the New York Times found it difficult to recall melodies from the pieces, and therefore puzzled over the designation of the 'vocalised poems' as songs.¹⁴⁰ As for the remix project with Richard James of Aphex Twin, it was James

137 Nyman, 'Composing the QPR suite'.

138 Bracewell, Michael, 'The divine Mr Hannon', *The Independent* (23 August 1999).

139 Thornton, Anthony, 'Flux: The Divine Comedy/Michael Nyman: The Jaffa Cake', *The Independent* (15 August 1997).

140 Holden, Stephen, 'Philip Glass Turns to the Song', *New York Times* (20 April 1986).

who made the first move in contacting Glass; while no stranger to electronic instruments, Glass was unfamiliar with Aphex Twin's electronica.¹⁴¹ The resulting mix is mostly a peculiar distortion of Bowie's voice over the rich but repetitive string arpeggios Glass created for James as his part of the collaboration – this time creating music for a pop artist, instead of the pop artists creating lyrics for him, but once again working solitarily. Reviewers' opinions were mixed; in the UK, two critics for *The Independent* published contradictory opinions over two days, one revelling in 'challenging, uneasy listening – a warped delight',¹⁴² the other finding the project 'less fun than it sounds, if that's possible'.¹⁴³

David Bowie's statement that he 'worked with Philip Glass on the *Heroes Symphony*' gives us just as little an indication of the extent of their collaboration, whether permission and discussion or sharing the writing of the score.¹⁴⁴ Here too are the thirds and arpeggios, also present in the *Low Symphony*, that mark it out as Glass's work. Besides that, there is little to tie it to the composer's minimalist repertoire, or many of his soundtracks; one commentator suggested 'the *Low Symphony*... has more of the character of an English pastoral symphonic work', adding 'It contains lovely music and it went down very easily with most critics and audiences, disappointing only rockers and hard-boiled Minimalists'.¹⁴⁵ The term 'lovely' is certainly a departure from the obsessive drive of his usual language, suggesting indeed that the combination of Bowie's and Eno's melodies with Glass's lush orchestration was a collaboration that marked a strong difference in the music of all three composers involved – a difference the reviewer highlights in that it disappoints both distinct groups of fans of *Low* and Glass's music.

141 Glass reveals his unfamiliarity in an interview about the collaboration with James: 'I didn't know his work... they sent me a tape and I listened to it' in Blaine, Richard, 'Philip Glass and Richard D James', *Future Music* 36 (October 1995), <<http://xtronic.com/nostalgia/aphextwin.nu/v4/learn/98136033774967.shtml>> (accessed 1 February 2007).

142 Perry, Tim, 'Pop: Album Reviews', *The Independent* (29 March 2003).

143 Gill, Andy, 'This Week's Album Releases: Aphex Twin, 26 Mixes for Cash', *The Independent* (28 March 2003).

144 Sischy, Ingrid, 'The artist who fell to Earth: interview with singer David Bowie', *Interview* (February 1997).

145 Swed, Mark, 'Editor's Note to Philip Glass's *Akhnaten*', *Musical Quarterly* 77, 2 (1993), 238.

Both Nyman and Glass are as influenced by popular culture as popular culture influences them, and – the driving force of the avant-garde being inaccessibility – both have made conscious moves towards ‘low’, or accessible, culture. Philip Glass is certainly interested in popular culture as a phenomenon, and claims to value it equally with high art; he has contempt for his contemporaries who ‘sniffily refuse to exercise... an equal ability to extend themselves into different musical areas’ since ‘it’s looking at culture from a very narrow perspective’.¹⁴⁶ At the same time, however, he seems unconvinced by electronic minimalism, complaining of Orbital that they are ‘really not very edgy’.¹⁴⁷ He has also been accused of letting his commercial success drive his compositional projects and musical language in the interests of populism and commercialism, removing such transethnic elements as the Indian influence in favour of an overtly populist approach.¹⁴⁸ His increased accessibility to European ears has paid off in regular work and his increased influence over film directors, though the fear that he may have compromised his artistic integrity – a fear that is often voiced over crossover artists, as we will discuss – remains a result of his overlap with popular culture.

Milton Babbitt is aware enough of the danger of perceived compromised integrity that he withdrew a number of early pieces from the list of his works.¹⁴⁹ Among these are several pieces in traditional classical forms (a symphony, a string quartet and trio, and two settings of the mass), no doubt removed due to their embrace of the tonal language the composer cast aside as he exhausted it. Also removed were a work for musical theatre, *Fabulous Voyage* (1946) and a score for the film *Into the Good Ground* (1949), excluded as a result of their commerciality, remnants from an age in which Babbitt once competed with Cole Porter, Richard

146 Blaine, ‘Philip Glass and Richard D James’.

147 Quoted in Fink, Robert, ‘Elvis Everywhere: Musicology and Popular Music Studies at the Twilight of the Canon’, *American Music* 16, 2 (2002), 154. On the following page, Fink notes: ‘I doubt many ambient-techno fans care enough about the status of minimalist music within the Western canon – positive or negative – for it to matter. Nor does it seem that any of these bands are trying to claim some cultural prestige that “classical music” still holds for them. It seems rather that the distinction between classical and popular is totally irrelevant.’

148 Nicholls, ‘Transethnicism and the American Experimental Tradition’, 582.

149 These are listed, many marked as incomplete, in Arnold, Stephen and Hair, Graham, ‘A List of Works by Milton Babbitt’, *Perspectives of New Music* 14, 2 (1976), 24-25.

Rodgers and Irving Berlin. Babbitt appears to feel that his soundtrack and musical theatre work exist outside his professional career, and as a result, it is rare that one stumbles across references to Babbitt's Tin Pan Alley activity in musicological discussion, and comes as a surprise to some. In a review of a dictionary of musicians, Peter Dickinson reads little more than a hint of Babbitt's hobby: 'his entry makes one even more curious to know and hear more of his early Tin-Pan Alley connections. Could he write a tune?'¹⁵⁰

In 1981, Peters published an edition of *Three Theatrical Songs* taken from *Fabulous Voyage* – some thirty-five years after their composition. His style in these songs is very much that of the pre-Sondheim theatre era, but clichéd and unoriginal. Allen Forte sees the musical language as one that

bespeaks a familiarity with the idioms of the American musical theater that derives from what Babbitt has described in his introduction to the *Three Theatrical Songs* as a "misspent childhood devoted in large part to the writing, arranging, and performing of 'popular' music".¹⁵¹

If they are typical of the rest of the music from *Fabulous Voyage*, it was not glimpses of Babbitt's progressive and experimental music which proved the musical unsuccessful. Richard Middleton hints at equally unsuccessful songs written for Tin Pan Alley, though sources for these are hard to find.¹⁵² Babbitt has covered his tracks well, no doubt through his professional persona's apparent embarrassment at his early association with (and, perish the thought, *enjoyment* of) popular music. Philip Glass recognises this phenomenon among composers with some scorn: 'they worry about what their colleagues think and about being looked down upon and whether they've got a university job'.¹⁵³

150 Dickinson, Peter, 'Review: Neil Butterworth, A Dictionary of American Composers', *Music and Letters* 56, 1 (1985), 58-59. Dickinson is not alone: Richard Middleton expresses a similar amazement in 'Review: Pop Goes Old Theory', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 122, 2 (1997), 303: 'Many years ago, when I first discovered that that crotchety old modernist Milton Babbitt had a less public (but not entirely secret) other musical love – the Tin Pan Alley popular song – I found it hard to understand how these two sides of his character could coexist.'

151 Forte, Allen, 'Milton Babbitt's Three Theatrical Songs in Perspective', *Perspectives of New Music* 35, 2 (1997), 66-67; my emphasis.

152 Middleton, 'Review: Pop Goes Old Theory', 303.

153 Blaine, 'Philip Glass and Richard D James'.

It would seem that popular music, while primarily a hobby, still occasionally leaks through to Babbitt's professional world. The *New York Times* reported in 1999 that 'a few years ago he surprised an anniversary party for CRI, the new-music record label, by writing a salute in his abandoned Broadway style'.¹⁵⁴ It is interesting that the composer who once told his pupil, Stephen Sondheim, that he should not attempt serialism until he had exhausted tonality, never completely abandoned the language himself,¹⁵⁵ and while avant-garde and Tin Pan Alley are always kept firmly away from each other stylistically, Babbitt at least hints that his initial forays into popular song have informed his modernist language.

Through my little songs (*Three Compositions for Piano* (1947)) [Allen Forte] makes us mindful of or reminds us of the 'lyricists', not primarily those Broadway fashioners of the polysyllabic rhyme or the clever, catalogue one-liner, but those less of Broadway than of Hollywood and 'Tin Pan Alley' who carefully crafted the sounds of words, the relations of words to music, and of words to words. The uses not just of rhyme, terminal or internal, but of degrees of assonance, consonance (direct and cognate), chiasmus, and more are precedents which have affected my settings of *Du*, of *The Head of the Bed*, and – indeed – all my settings.¹⁵⁶

Richard Rodney Bennett, too, used to insist upon keeping his careers as a modernist composer, film scorer and cabaret performer separate. Unlike Babbitt, however, it is for the more popular activities that he is better known, working with Cleo Laine and Marian Montgomery, and receiving Oscar nominations for his soundtracks, which include *Murder on the Orient Express* (1974), *Far from the Madding Crowd* (1967) and BBC2's *Gormenghast* (2000).¹⁵⁷ It has been suggested that the 'serious' side of his career (exemplified by *The Mines of Sulphur* (1965) and the cummings song setting *This is the garden* (1985)) has suffered as a result of the popularity of his successes in lower culture. Softening his approach to this separation in the late 1980s, adaptations of his film scores

154 Kozinn, Allan, 'Music Review: Show Tunes An Atonalist Wrote Before He Converted', *New York Times* (16 October 1999).

155 Sutcliffe, Tom, 'Sondheim and the Musical', *Musical Times* 128, 1735 (1987), 489-490.

156 Babbitt, Milton, 'Babbitt-Introduction: A Response', *Perspectives of New Music* 35, 2 (1997), 131.

157 Gent, Paul, 'Easy to like but hard to fall in love with', *The Daily Telegraph* (11 April 2006).

began to enter the concert hall; but the juxtaposition of, for example, *Four Weddings and a Funeral* (1994) alongside his early works, such as the *Nocturnes* (1962-3), is as uncomfortable as an avant-garde listener's discovery of Babbitt's *Three Theatrical Songs*. Such a performance elicited a *Guardian* review that 'he used the modernist musical language with competence, yet the *Nocturnes* left the impression that it was not Bennett's mother tongue'.¹⁵⁸

In a caption to a photograph of several composers once regularly commissioned by the Cheltenham and Three Choirs festivals, the *Musical Times* mused over what had become of them: '[Gordon] Crosse subsequently became a computer programmer, while Richard Rodney Bennett is now much in demand as a cabaret artist'.¹⁵⁹ The implication that the relationship between a cabaret artist and a 'serious' composer is equivalent to the relationship between a composer and a software engineer is hard to miss; even as late as 1992, when the article was published, the dichotomy between popular performer and classical composer appears to have been relatively strong.

By 2006, Bennett was clearly comfortable mixing styles and genres. A birthday celebration concert in the Queen Elizabeth Hall included the performance of an orchestral suite from *Murder on the Orient Express*, alongside a number of serious pieces which merged jazz and Broadway idioms quite unlike his earlier work (*Partita* (1995), *Two Country Dances* (2001), *Concerto for Stan Getz* (1990)).¹⁶⁰ In addition, the evening was rounded off in an unusual fashion for an orchestral concert: 'an encore of Sinatra's "In the Wee Small Hours of the Morning" finally revealed Richard Rodney Bennett the jazz singer, crooning like his namesake Tony'.¹⁶¹ In an interview the same year, Bennett admitted that 'it never occurred to me that what I was doing was important as music, but gosh it was fun. I suppose I'm still living on royalties from films of the '50s being shown in Paraguay or somewhere'.¹⁶² His tone suggests that he still views his film music as a means of

158 Jeal, Erica, 'Classical Review: Bennett the secret jazz singer', *The Guardian* (12 March 2001).

159 Wallace, Helen, 'Beyond Cheltenham: Whatever Happened to the Cheltenham Symphony?', *Musical Times* 135, 1815 (1994), 309.

160 See Potter, Keith, 'BBC Concert Orchestra/Wilson, Queen Elizabeth Hall', *The Independent* (9 March 2006).

161 Jeal, 'Bennett the secret jazz singer'.

162 Norris, Geoffrey, 'Happy birthday to a composer who can do everything', *The Daily*

earning a living, enjoyable as a hobby; but it also suggests that he understands its value as music as no less than that of his serious compositions.

3.5 Classical Crossover and Critics

Why does any of this matter? Is it not a personal choice for a performer to select her own recital repertoire and have some say in the track listing of her next CD? Record companies certainly know the commercial value of crossover's expanded audience, and – as we have seen with Deutsche Grammophon's *Bryn Terfel Sings Favourites* – can dictate track listings for recordings irrespective of the performer's feelings for individual pieces. It appears that Fleming's *Haunted Heart* tracks do appear to have been chosen by her ('Decca are releasing a disc that Renée Fleming has wanted to create for nearly a decade'),¹⁶³ but arguably this CD was not produced with a sales goal as the primary concern. As for indulging in light music alongside classical fare at recitals, is that a problem? After all, there is no career-binding clause to suggest that a classical artist need stick strictly to the well-worn classics and avoid all other kinds of music for the sake of preserving some sort of artistic purity.

Critics and journalists, on the other hand, are prone to disagree. Norman Lebrecht is an archetypal, if particularly vocal, example of the classical music critic who, in doom-laden tones, predicts the total demise of wholly classical repertoire as a direct result of the increase in classical crossover. He refers to a veritable self-made inventory of worry surrounding the idea of crossover as it relates to classical music.

First and foremost, crossover is seen to compromise the artistic individuality of a performer, since producing a best-seller is regarded as the sole aim of participation in a crossover project. In lamenting the changes of cultural circumstance affecting the survival of the string quartet, Lebrecht finds that some 'hire a clarinettist to play jazz, a percussion kit to play pop and all manner of

Telegraph (23 March 2006).

163 <http://www.deccaclassics.com/newsandnewreleases/july2005/9880602.html>.

arrangers and synthesisers to break into the nebulous crossover mould'.¹⁶⁴ This is portrayed in the context of a desperate struggle for a string quartet's existence, a last resort which hints at its members cringing with embarrassment at their predicament, brought on by younger concert-hall managers and younger audiences. The young are clearly a destructive force.

Second, crossover cheapens classical music as an art form, dragging it down from its privileged position in high culture to become something for consumption; comments such as 'cheap crossovers are doing nothing for the integrity of an art on the wane' and '[Sony Classical is] "growing the classical market" with celebrity glitz' reinforce in us the view that classical music has both integrity and, in being free of glamour, is spared of falseness.¹⁶⁵ The very notion that Peter Gelb, Head of Sony Classical, 'set out "to redefine the classical label... to return to the idea of classical music as an emotional experience for the listener"'¹⁶⁶ is a threat to what Lebrecht loves (though quite why classics should be free of emotion is never fully explained).

This idea stems from a discourse of nineteenth-century ideals very familiar to musicologists.¹⁶⁷ Since instrumental music was considered free from the conventions of language, it was assumed to be a pure medium through which the divine inspiration of the composer could be transferred to the listener unhindered by earthly meaning. It relies upon the suggestion that classical music has always been something admired from afar, with a degree of separation between worshipful listeners – Lebrecht among them – and the idolised, though invariably anonymous, musicians. The composer, too, remains at a safe distance (ever increasing with the passage of time), along with his otherworldly revelations, and anonymous enough to blur the distinctions between the myth of how he writes music, and the reality.

Anonymity comes into play in that this view of classical music only applies to the

164 Lebrecht, Norman, 'The chamber revolution', *The Daily Telegraph* (2 May 2001).

165 Both quotations from Lebrecht, 'How to kill classical music'.

166 *Ibid.*

167 See Cook, Nicholas and Everist, Mark (eds.), *Rethinking Music* (Oxford, 1999) for a series of discussions of these ideals, the extent of their modern relevance to musicology, and challenges to them.

most serious genres of absolute music. Recognisable identity of any nature, the most obvious example of which is the *prima donna*, causes disruption of the imaginary barrier between performer and listener, which ultimately reveals the distinct humanity of the music's carrier. The distance created by that barrier – the most notable difference between 'popular' and 'classical' music, if not all of 'low' and 'high' culture – is what preserves its supposed purity; it offers the same effect as the pianist playing without the aid of sheet music, and the stereotypical conductor with eyes tightly shut in a combination of concentration and pleasure, by removing the distraction of sight for the performers while reinforcing a notion of godly intervention in the *creation* of sounding music. The barrier also suggests that classical music is not actively *consumed* in the way that popular music is, and instead is rather passively received. This we know not to be the case. Those of us who go to classical concerts and purchase classical CDs do so because we enjoy the experience; we have our favourite performers and our favourite works, we may sing or hum snippets of tunes or discuss what a particular piece of music means to us (outside the public confines of the concert hall). It may not permit us to get up and dance, or chat over a drink while the concert is in progress, but it is active consumption nevertheless.

Opera, of course, has always been consumed, with the exception of the reverence given to Wagner's works (but those are music dramas, to be pedantic). Its star performers have always exuded a good deal of 'celebrity glitz', a situation which encourages an interest in the personalities, not just the characters portrayed onstage. As theatrical entertainers, opera singers share with actors that blurred distinction between transmitting their character's thoughts through their lines, or delivering their own; their bodies also fluctuate between being self-owned, owned by the paying audience, or possessed by their role. Meaning is also inherent in opera, even if its hybrid nature complicates the levels of narrative and meaning that occur in a performance's orchestral music, vocal music, libretto and stage action. An audience member, then, recognises humans visibly performing for him, imparting human emotions and earthly ideas directly to him.

Essentially, to a holder of those nineteenth-century ideals, opera is a more populist and less serious strand of classical music, which falls uncomfortably between high and low culture. Just like performances of Shakespeare in America early in the

nineteenth century, billed alongside circus acts and acknowledged more for entertainment value than to affirm one's social standing, opera performances were backdrops to socialising, which only later developed as a means of asserting status and cultural awareness.¹⁶⁸ Opera arias have always been popular tunes (although Pavarotti's high-charting *Nessun Dorma*, which will be discussed later, is clearly an extreme), and opera singers have always been popular figures. In this light, the juxtaposition of 'Danny Boy' and 'The Toreador Song' on *Bryn Terfel Sings Favourites* should be perfectly natural.

Third, and related to this concept, crossover is deemed as something unsubstantial, which does not hold a listener's attention long enough and has not been created to be a lasting product. 'Like most chart fodder, it [holds] our attention for a few weeks before heading in heaps to the charity stores' is a distinction not merely reserved for crossover ventures, but even used in the context of popular symphonic recordings.¹⁶⁹ For Mahler's Fifth Symphony, performed by the Berlin Philharmonic under the baton of Simon Rattle for the first time, Lebrecht is careful to remind us of the work's appearance on mainstream television and the mass marketing of the CD release – factors that marked it out from the rest of the classical crowd and eventually contributed to a number one spot in the classical charts. The British pop-string-quartet Bond 'are out... to have some fun', and thus their offerings are not meant seriously;¹⁷⁰ Billy Joel's *Fantasies and Delusions* 'is not music that will stop anyone in his tracks', notwithstanding the admission that it 'pays over-fond homage to the great Viennese composers'.¹⁷¹ It appears to be Joel's musical background which incenses Lebrecht the most; how can any 'faded rock star' produce music of substance and high culture? There are, thankfully, no puns on the album title – a title which suggests (in addition to the nod towards the Renaissance *fantasia* label) that Joel has no such fantasies, delusions or even aspirations of being a Great Composer of the type Lebrecht prefers.¹⁷² After all, why should he need them?

168 See, among others, Levine, *Highbrow/Lowbrow*.

169 Lebrecht, Norman, 'Drawing the Classical Line', *La Scena Musicale* (23 October 2002).

170 *Ibid.*

171 Lebrecht, 'How to kill classical music'.

172 'A term adopted in the Renaissance for an instrumental composition whose form and invention spring "solely from the fantasy and skill of the author who created it"' from

Fourth, and finally, crossover is conceived as squeezing classical music production out of existence. Not content with merely belittling cultural content and cheapening the real classical product, ‘the Billy Joels and Russell Watsons... burn up the marketing budgets of the so-called classical labels on which they appear, starving serious music of the oxygen of publicity, space on the shelf and room in the charts. Crossover is not an aid to classical renewal, rather an act of classical euthanasia’.¹⁷³ Lebrecht’s is a strong language, with no room for compromise (Billy Joel is personally credited with ‘driving a mighty nail into the coffin of classical recording’).¹⁷⁴ To him, crossover is without exception commercial, where the ‘mongrelisms’ of ‘generic contamination’ are the ‘dubious surrogates’ of our now ‘polluted culture’.¹⁷⁵ His concern for the preservation of classical music is deep and touching, albeit regarding a self-inflicted and overly gloomy forecast.

David Hurwitz of *Classics Today* has attempted to ease some of Lebrecht’s fears, while at the same time taking exception to his ‘personal standard of cultural significance and ideological purity’,¹⁷⁶ a standard which (as we have noted) even Rattle’s interpretation of Mahler’s Fifth fails to meet. The main message is that Lebrecht should worry less about the impact on classical music:

By its very nature, the principal quality of a “classic” is robustness.. The great classics have already survived the passing of the culture that gave them birth in order to earn their special status. In fact, this music is so expressive, attractive, and accessible that no matter how badly (or strangely) it's played, how foolishly arranged or altered, it still manages to retain those qualities that make it great, recognizable, or relevant. This fact, of course, explains why the classics inspire so many crossover productions in the first place.¹⁷⁷

In fact, there is every chance that, were Lebrecht to give them the opportunity, some classical crossover projects might even appeal to him by keeping that factor

Field, Christopher et al., ‘Fantasia’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L. Macy (accessed 14 June 2006), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

173 Lebrecht, ‘How to kill classical music’.

174 *Ibid.*

175 See Lebrecht’s ‘How to kill classical music’ and ‘Drawing the classical line’ (both cited above); also Lebrecht, Norman, ‘Noxious Crossover’, *La Scena Musicale* (14 June 2000).

176 Hurwitz, David, ‘The Crossover Mentality’, *Classics Today* (November 2001), <http://www.classicstoday.com/features/f3_1101.asp> (accessed 1 February 2007).

177 *Ibid.*

of ‘greatness’ which he desires. Projects such as those outlined above, however, are in effect cover versions of famous classical tunes, and inevitably will provoke the same sort of tensions many die-hard fans of a pop or rock group experience when another band appropriates ‘their’ music, turning it into music which appeals to someone else.

Hurwitz and Lebrecht agree on one thing, however: that crossover is a pretty insubstantial fad. ‘Virtually all of such projects are designed to make a fast buck, which they either do or do not, before they disappear into oblivion’, says Hurwitz; ‘it’s a short-term phenomenon... Crossover titles have always been with us, and they’ve never been anything to worry about’.¹⁷⁸ In tone, Hurwitz approximates Lebrecht – no doubt intentionally, in places – to reinforce his objection; where crossover is said to adopt ‘some gimmick that presumably makes the music more “popular” or “approachable” to the unwashed masses’, there is little doubt that Hurwitz is invoking the words of the ‘classical music snob’.¹⁷⁹ Yet, when Hurwitz speaks on behalf of himself, there is still a sense of inferiority implied. The ‘good clean fun’ of crossover is, after all, not his primary concern; the focus of his article is the uncomfortably strong feeling provoked by the generic name against the vandalism of classical music. He is not defending crossover in an equivalent way, partially because he has poured scorn on the idea that music needs defending, but also because – like Lebrecht – he values classical music much more than crossover is worth valuing.

Is there any way in which crossover can stand up for itself and dispel Lebrecht’s four worries as outlined above? Artistic integrity is not something that is easily measured. For a classical performer to produce popular repertoire for economic reasons may well be viewed as a compromise, especially if that repertoire has not been decided by them (the appearance of the *Titanic* theme on *Bryn Terfel Sings Favourites* is a case in point), but it is a compromise that has existed throughout history, for composers and performers alike. There is no reason to suppose that an opera singer cannot produce a decent CD of Broadway hits, or that a show singer cannot make a respectable recording of arias. In 1957, Bernstein despaired of the preparations for the original Broadway version of *West Side Story*

178 *Ibid.*

179 *Ibid.*

in a letter to his wife ('All the things I love most in it are slowly being dropped – too operatic, too this and that'),¹⁸⁰ when conducting his own version for the first time in 1985, he specifically chose operatically trained singers rather than theatre stars to create the effect he wanted.¹⁸¹

Equally, enjoyment is not always a marker of quality, but an artist who perceptibly enjoys her repertoire outperforms an artist of equivalent talent who is not enjoying hers at all. Bryn Terfel's renditions of 'Stars' from Boublil's and Schonberg's *Les Misérables* and 'All I Ask of You' from Lloyd Webber's *Phantom of the Opera*, both on the 2003 CD *Renée and Bryn: Under the Stars*, prove that it is possible to match admirably the quality of the all-star cast recordings of the same musicals, and his obvious enjoyment of the genre noticeably helps. Fleming's contributions are awkward by comparison: 'Hello, Young Lovers' (Rodgers's and Hammerstein's *The King and I*) offers audible traces of effort in toning down her operatic style, an effort which does not always succeed. One might have expected her initial training as a jazz singer to make such performances plain sailing. Judgement of a successful recorded performance should rely in the effect of the sound, rather than on the performer's musical background and career history.

The other sort of crossover Lebrecht has in mind which might pose a threat to artistic integrity is that of the incorporation of a beat, or other elements from non-classical musics, into a classical or classically-styled piece. This surely only indicates compromise where the performer, or group of performers, has been forced into such action against their will. With regard to the string quartets he highlights as taking crossover on board, there is insufficient evidence presented by him – or indeed by the Chamber Music America survey from which he extracts his data – that this is the case. The same might be said for Vanessa-Mae: according to her official biography, it was her own interest in new presentations of classical music that led her to release *The Violin Player* in 1995, the album which, like the artist, 'virtually defined the fusion of classical and pop that became known as

180 Burton, Humphrey, *Leonard Bernstein* (New York, 1994), 26.

181 Kiri Te Kanawa and Jose Carreras took the lead roles. For the full cast list, see Leonard Bernstein, *Bernstein conducts West Side Story*, audio CD reissue (Deutsche Grammophon GH 457 199-2, 1998/originally 1985).

crossover'.¹⁸² The fact that she continued to embrace crossover after shifting record labels from EMI to Sony late in 2003 also suggests that she was quite happy working in this genre, alongside her regular performances of 'straight' classical music. There does not seem to be much in the way of regret or compromise about her artistic identity.

In answer to Lebrecht's second worry, that crossover cheapens classical music, perhaps he could look to his own articles – particularly one which, although written in the midst of his anti-crossover rage, focusses on the transformation of a strictly classical violinist, Viktoria Mullova, after performing blues and jazz. Here is evidence clear enough for him to agree, in his own words, that the crossover project she takes part in enriches her classical art: 'Playing blues has made her listen differently to the orchestra when playing a concerto, easing her adamantine stage immobility. She writes more of her own cadenzas and has a more acute awareness of audience reactions'.¹⁸³ Elsewhere, he has quoted Tania Davis from Bond, advising schoolchildren that 'you have to learn the classical way of playing an instrument and practise hours every day until you get it right' in order to be able to play string quartet pop.¹⁸⁴ In such a tale of art and popular music techniques being mutually beneficial, participation in crossover seems something he should be advocating to all classical musicians, and something that only strengthens their integrity – an advocation that surely shows crossover to provide something of substance, thus also answering Lebrecht's third complaint.

Mutual benefits may also be in store for the consumers of crossover. A listener does not need his attention to be grabbed for more than a moment to become excited by something he hears; if he cares about it, he will explore it further. Classical music itself loses no audiences through its adoption by crossover acts to expand its accessibility. If the use of classical music in film soundtracks is anything to go by, individual pieces (such as Rachmaninov's Second Piano Concerto in *Brief Encounter*) gain many fans through the movies.¹⁸⁵ Similarly,

182 <http://www.vanessa-mae.com/redirect-bio.html>.

183 Lebrecht, Norman, 'Ice Queen melts to the blues', *The Daily Telegraph* (14 February 2001).

184 Tania Davis quoted in Lebrecht, 'Drawing the Classical Line'.

185 Anon, 'Brief Encounter theme is UK's top classic', *The Guardian* (29 March 2005): 'Rachmaninov's Piano Concerto No 2 has been named Britain's most popular piece of

using classical music in conjunction with sporting events can attract new fans who may never have heard such rousing tunes. Pavarotti's rendition of *Nessun Dorma* stayed at no 2 in the UK singles chart throughout July 1990, thanks to its association with the Italian-hosted football World Cup.¹⁸⁶

Classical crossover projects reach audiences who have not been exposed to classical music, or who do not want to be exposed to it, but they can also expose classical music fans to music they may well have dismissed as irrelevant and tedious but that they may well enjoy. That audiences for different types of music are separate is a reminder that music genres are 'more than organizational arrangements that simply facilitate efficient marketing to a "targeted" public'.¹⁸⁷ Music has different effects on different communities, it is true; but just as in the cinema, audiences can 'select from the complexity of the image the meanings and feelings, the variations, inflections and contradictions that work for them',¹⁸⁸ leaving only a social deterrent to a listener broadening his tastes. A musician traversing genre boundaries allows her listeners to enjoy different styles of music while *feeling socially included*, sharing as they do the diverse preferences of that musician. Thus classical listeners may be introduced to Billy Joel's often cleverly written ballads through his *Fantasies and Delusions*, and Fleming's opera fans may be touched by the content of *Haunted Heart*. What disheartens Mullova the most about her blues sessions is that her audience remains identical to that of her recitals, while she longs for an audience that is 'not classical at all'.¹⁸⁹ Despite this, she is nevertheless exposing her devotees to a different type of music, and one which they appear equally receptive to.

Last of all is the question of financial support being drained by classical hybrids. As Hurwitz points out, the assumption that 'money not spent on crossover

classical music [in Classic FM's 'Hall of Fame' poll]. The haunting work, heard in the movie *Brief Encounter*, has won the accolade for the last five years.' The title of the article clearly suggests that, in 2005, the music is deemed inseparable from its most famous usage, and strongly implies that *Brief Encounter* is at least partially (if not primarily) responsible for its poll position.

186 <http://www.everyhit.com/retrocharts/1990-JulyA.html>.

187 Negus, Keith, 'Identities and Industries: The Cultural Formation of Aesthetic Economies' in P. du Gay & M. Pryke (eds), *Cultural Economy* (London, 2002), 127.

188 Dyer, Richard, *Heavenly Bodies: Film Stars and Society* (Basingstoke, 1987), 5.

189 Viktoria Mullova quoted in Lebrecht, 'Ice Queen melts to the blues'.

productions is just sitting in a vault somewhere, available for projects more in the classical mainstream' is critically flawed.¹⁹⁰ There is no guarantee that 'classical' record labels would not have pulled out of classical recordings altogether without crossover acts to recoup losses. It should be acknowledged, however, that crossover recordings do not function in the same way as a supermarket loss-leader, enticing the public to the record shelves and encouraging them to pick up other, classical, titles while there. The definition of loss leading used by Hess and Gerstner would imply that money would be made from the markup in price of classical recordings, when in reality it is likely to be the better-selling crossover recordings that have the larger markup.¹⁹¹ Is there any reason record companies should invest in the production costs (covering not just recording and engineering, but distribution, publicity and promotion) of such minority interests as classical music, particularly when the market is already saturated with multiple recordings of the same repertoire?

In addition, if we consider that '*all* music broadcast on commercial radio serves as a loss leader', we cannot exclude stations such as Classic FM from the equation.¹⁹² Advertisers are more than willing to use the station for their own needs, and manipulate classical music in the same way as popular music:

Like the controlled-circulation magazine, commercial broadcasters are "in the business of matching media markets to advertising needs". *Entertainment* is not the product, but simply a tool of the trade. The true product of broadcast media is the audience; and the true consumers are the advertisers.¹⁹³

That popular music (and music video) acts brazenly as an advertisement for itself has perhaps obscured the fact that performed classical music has been its own

190 Hurwitz, 'The Crossover Mentality'.

191 'Leader pricing is a pricing strategy in which retailers set very low prices, sometimes below cost, for some products to lure customers into stores. The idea is that while customers are in the store to get this good (the leader product), they buy other goods that generate higher profits... When a featured brand is sold at a loss, stores try to avoid selling large quantities of the loss leader product and want to sell other goods with larger markups.' See Hess, James and Gerstner, Eitan, 'Loss Leader Pricing and Rain Check Policy', *Marketing Science* 6, 4 (1987), 358.

192 Huron, David, 'Music in Advertising: An Analytic Paradigm', *Musical Quarterly* 73, 4 (1989), 560.

193 *Ibid*, 559.

promoter, too; all entertainment is defined as that which sells itself by *engaging the consumer's attention*. It would seem, then, that the marketing executives may be right, and there is less of a functional gap between classical and classical crossover than the critics would have us believe.

4 Classical Crossover's Marketing Materials

Society has come to associate marketing with mass culture and art music with an elite. Yet we should not forget that the classical music industry, together with the crystallisation of the classical canon in America, was formed through commercial manipulation: by media organisations, agents and publicists, and enthusiastic consumers. In classical crossover particularly, the promise of reaching out to new audiences needs to be qualified with the marketing strategies to reach these audiences in the first place; thus it is rife with the moulding of images, stunts and the shock factor, the admiration of icons, and the insistence that music can transform your business, your health, your intellect; indeed, your whole life.

4.1 Comely, Characterful, Captivating: Classical Celebrities

There have always been big names in classical music. As the nineteenth-century saw mixed concerts fall out of fashion in favour of the opera and the concert hall, so concertos featured heavily in orchestral concerts, highlighting single ‘star’ virtuoso instrumentalists as opposed to a mixed bag of diverse soloists. The nature of their job ensures that they stand out from the crowd, as the nature of the rank-and-file orchestral player is to subordinate his or her own self to the music. Jenny Lind, of whom ‘it may be safely asserted that no singer, male or female, foreign or native, has ever achieved and held so enduringly, so wide-spread and general a celebrity’, had ‘little or nothing of the typical prima donna’ in her appearance: ‘Neither in face nor in figure was there anything striking about her... Nor was there anything spectacular about Jenny Lind’s character and behaviour’.¹ Her success is considered by some to be a result of a sort of Protestant Reformation in music, ‘an antidote to the elegant and theatrical posturing that had long ruled the vocal world’, though the forcefully effective marketing of Lind by P T Barnum was the biggest driving force behind her success.²

Fuelled by demand, much associated merchandise was marketed to Lind’s fans,

1 Rogers, Francis, ‘Jenny Lind’, *Musical Quarterly* 32, 3 (1946), 437; 446-7.

2 Harris, Neil, *Humbug: The Art of P. T. Barnum* (Boston, 1973), 136.

much in the way a pop tour might generate sales of shirts bearing the tour dates. Neither was this an exceptional move; in 1872 the clothes of the pianist Rubinstein ‘were rent by admirers in search of souvenirs’ at concerts, while Paderewski toys, sweets, soap and shampoo were available for purchase in 1891.³ Enrico Caruso’s career benefited from the popularity of the gramophone as much as gramophone sales benefited from his career. Yet merchandise formed just part of the appeal of the well-marketed star. Caruso became a hit due to ‘the combination of astonishing physical ability with down-to-earth personal magnetism’.⁴ Archetypical operatic divas such as Maria Callas had an inherent ability to generate or attract attention, coupled with an exacting and controlling nature over their art that bears more than a passing resemblance to the nineteenth-century idea of the genius artist;⁵ and ‘no opera singer has understood better... the new power of the media’ than Luciano Pavarotti, whose enthusiasm and distinctive appearance provided a suitably distinctive operatic persona for the popular audience of the ‘Three Tenors’.⁶ Popular appeal was integral to all artists; high culture and low culture never fully managed to separate.

Despite appearing for the most part with their backs to the audience, conductors can also become celebrities. Arturo Toscanini, one of the first conductors to broadcast on television, had previously initiated reforms at La Scala to control the demands of prima donnas and to remove audience distractions (ladies' hats and house lights). Such acts, together with his intransigent approach to musical style and speed, are cited as evidence of his ‘energy, single-mindedness, [and]

3 Horowitz, Joseph, *Classical Music in America: A History of its Rise and Fall* (New York, 2005), 333-4.

4 Sommer, Susan, ‘Review: Understanding Toscanini’, *Notes* 44, 1 (1987), 54.

5 Attention-grabbing potential is the vital ingredient for all stars, and is not confined to opera, music in general, or even within the arts; successful businessmen such as Richard Branson have succeeded at gaining celebrity status through manipulative use of media. ‘Indeed, to some extent the construction of the “operatic diva” can be extended to the whole notion of the cult of celebrity as it arose in Hollywood in the early part of the twentieth century.’ – McLeod, Ken, ‘Bohemian Rhapsodies: Operatic Influences on Rock Music’, *Popular Music* 20, 2 (2001), 201.

6 Blyth, Alan and Sadie, Stanley, ‘Pavarotti, Luciano’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 15 March 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

impetuosity combined with an inflexible will'.⁷ They are factors which mark Toscanini out as a strongly individual character; as a result, 'for many people he was a god who could do no wrong'.⁸ 'The story of an expanding audience whose manipulable needs and aspirations increasingly pre-empted the needs and aspirations of art',⁹ however, can also be attributed to this lasting image of Toscanini, an image 'created and evolved by publicity and marketing strategies'.¹⁰

The twentieth century idolised in a different way to Lind's presentation as 'sublime':

New kinds of newspapers and magazines, then radio, then television fostered a prying intimacy. Private lives and other proofs of mere mortality, previously idealized or shunned, came to matter. The celebrity was worshipped still, but as flesh and blood.¹¹

Toscanini the pop star became 'the most famous living symbol of classical music' as no previous performer had.¹² Partly as a result of his own limited taste for established European works, and partly as controlled corporate property at NBC, he helped to create the climate in which this could happen: without a Great Composer to celebrate, audiences would look to a star conductor, whose own baton tamed and controlled Beethoven and Wagner. According to Joseph Horowitz, the sacralisation of classical music became a popular movement after World War I with the rejection of contemporary culture and the reverence of 'dead European masters and celebrity performers', directly correlated to Toscanini:¹³ 'Compared to New York's late-nineteenth-century audiences, or Boston's – audiences with something to give – the Toscanini audience of the thirties and forties was intellectually stunted'; as a consequence of Toscanini's rising star, musical veneration degenerated 'into a species of snobbery'.¹⁴

7 Cairns, David, 'Toscanini, Arturo', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 15 March 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

8 *Ibid.*

9 Horowitz, Joseph, *Understanding Toscanini* (New York, 1987), 439-40.

10 Sommer, 'Review: Understanding Toscanini', 55.

11 Horowitz, *Classical Music in America*, 207.

12 *Ibid.*, 287.

13 *Dwight's Journal* (see above) had fulfilled a similar role to that of Toscanini, by advancing an elite aesthetic perspective through the guise of review and criticism.

14 Horowitz, *Classical Music in America*, 252.

For Horowitz, this is where what Americans know as classical music ends. In Europe, he argues, government subsidies for the creation of music have ensured equality of listening opportunity for musics excluded by the lack of funding in the US (as well as the fact that ‘more than Europeans, Americans have worshipped musical masterpieces and deified their exponents’).¹⁵ To a certain extent he is correct. All-powerful star conductors cannot dictate a limited repertoire to an audience with no other listening choices; repertoire is instead controlled with the funding needs of the orchestra in mind. A majority of Britons asked to name a conductor would likely identify Sir Simon Rattle, whose ‘abundant energies and charisma’ lead commentators to characterise him thus: ‘Few conductors communicate such joy in their music-making, and he has the ability to galvanize players and audiences alike.’¹⁶ Rattle’s tenure at the Berlin Philharmonic resulted in an educational programme ‘designed to embrace a younger and broader public via such contemporary composers as Ligeti and György Kurtág’.¹⁷ The concept had, in fact, been explored in the US, but with unsurprising brevity. ‘When in 1932 Stokowski proposed broadcasting “modernistic” music to schoolchildren so they could “develop a liking for it”, Damrosch, the accredited authority, issued a press release “deeply deplored” Stokowski’s plan. “Children should not be confused by experiments”, he wrote.’¹⁸ Stokowski, the conductor of the Philadelphia Orchestra, was an esteemed interpreter, but his keenness to introduce new music into his concerts did not please his audience; his fame did not disseminate as widely as the televised Toscanini.¹⁹

The world of the star singer or instrumentalist, on the other hand, is alive and well in Europe as in America, thriving on an artist-based, rather than composer-based, recording industry. The repertoire of these stars is also controlled, but by the

15 *Ibid*, 26.

16 Millington, Barry, ‘Rattle, Sir Simon’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 15 March 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

17 Horowitz, *Classical Music in America*, 533.

18 *Ibid*, 404.

19 The approach and audiences of these two conductors should explain their respective degree of fame. While Stokowski did not conduct in opera houses, limiting his appearances to young audiences and *Fantasia* fans (of which there were initially few), Toscanini appealed to a relatively highbrow audience from his opera house appearances in addition to the wider demographic reached by television.

industry, which – like NBC's control of Toscanini – regards its own profit over concerns about the proliferation of new music or the expansion of the repertory. Yet, in turning our thoughts back to classical stars of the past – even the recent past – these stars are not all perfect, youthful figures. Callas and Pavarotti can not be considered slim, Lind's features are bland, and Rattle's appearance is wiry and unkempt. Not one of the musicians mentioned above conforms to society's ideas of visual perfection, nor stands out as especially attractive. Glancing through the pages of *Classic FM Magazine* or *BBC Music Magazine* at the beginning of the twenty-first century, however, it would be hard to find photographs of musicians (though not conductors, nor composers – Karl Jenkins is tolerated for his music's popularity) that would look out of place in a celebrity gossip magazine. These musicians may resemble models, at best, with a distinctive and carefully managed image, or – at worst – they are heavily made up, carefully dressed to hide their shape, and skilfully airbrushed to remove any remaining traces of their mortality. Invariably, those who fall into the latter category have been in the business for more than two decades (like Julian Lloyd Webber and James Levine) or in specialist, and inherently 'serious', ensembles (such as Robert King).

Why should the end of the twentieth century have seen an increase in the interest of imagery? Performers of classical music have never been visibly anonymous; it is only since the twentieth century that recordings of music have been readily available to the general public. Until that point, other ways of consuming the music product existed: merchandise, newspaper concert reviews, sheet music, publications such as *Dwight's Journal* (ostensibly an 'appreciation' or 'criticism' magazine, but rather one that details what readers should like and how they should behave); but in order to consume *performance*, a music enthusiast had to purchase a ticket to a concert, and therefore music necessitated a visual, as well as aural, engagement with the performers. For all the perfection a studio recording can bring to the musical product – including corrections to intonation and timing, multi-tracking, and special sound effects – it is still often the live performances that separate the star performers. Pop singers of the 1990s like Robbie Williams and Will Young may not be musically perfect, but their energy and showmanship on stage mark them out from the crowd. It may not be unfair to suggest that Young owes his entire music career to his ability to entertain audiences; as the winner of a television show where viewers voted for their

favourite characters, on-screen persona is almost guaranteed to have counted for more than the small differences in vocal quality separating the finalists.

Today's music publications rely less on descriptions or reviews of musical works (which it is assumed a consumer will already know, through the wide availability of recordings and the limited focus of repertoire), and more on the criticism of those who perform them. Despite claiming musical content as their primary focus with titles such as *Smash Hits* and *BBC Music Magazine*, magazine format's association with the visible and recognisable insists that the primary focus of the magazine must be a person or object that can be replicated and summarised in photographic form. Unlike the way that screenshots of a featured computer game inform a gamer of its graphics, and the individual who reads about cars or stereo systems is equally interested in their appearance, consumers of music are not informed through imagery. Yet sales of music magazines rely on visuals as much as any other magazine, and those musicians who become stars due to their unique talent are far less likely to appeal as cover material than those personalities that become attractive to the general public because of their good looks or eccentric behaviour.

At the same time as these sales concerns are addressed, imagery is the quickest, most obvious, and universal way to convey messages of what a publication wishes its subject to mean. Successful marketing of an abstract art relies upon strong and appealing visuals. Remembering classical crossover's desire to attract wider audiences, it is hardly surprising that the commercialised side of music, associated most strongly with pop, but never quite absent from classical, comes to the fore.

4.2 Pioneering Promotional Performances: Classic FM TV

'So you thought you didn't like classical music? ...think again.'²⁰ Despite the channel's name and tagline, Classic FM TV, the first ever classical music television channel, screens virtually nothing but classical crossover. That should come as no surprise, not just because of the playlists of its parent radio station Classic FM, but

20 Tagline from the official website, <http://www.classicfm.com/tv> (accessed 19 February 2006).

also given that the very act of producing state-of-the-art music videos to pieces written two or three centuries ago is itself a deliberate act of crossover. As its website claimed in 2006, ‘Classic FM TV is introducing classical artists, composers and their repertoires to a new audience by replicating the music TV format that has been established in the pop music industry for over 20 years’.²¹ Its later admission that the channel features ‘a variety of music videos from popular core classical tracks to chill-out classics, cross-over classics and film soundtracks’ suggests, however, that like most commercial television (and indeed, radio) ventures, the playlist is selective enough to be unlikely to introduce its listeners to performers or composers as yet unfamiliar to them. The channel’s playlist candidates, as featured online, include Andrea Bocelli, Vanessa Mae and the *Star Wars* and *Gladiator* soundtracks, but also the electronic and experimental acts Portishead and Little Death Orchestra (who describe their sound as ‘uneasy listening’),²² along with Ladysmith Black Mambazo – acts that embrace various facets of crossover, even if they do not all fit equally comfortably in the bracket of ‘classical’ music.

The channel began as an attempt to emulate the success of Classic FM, the aim of which was simply to introduce classical music to a new audience.²³ Both channels sprang from the belief that, in order to avoid its stagnation and potential extinction, ‘classical music has a very serious challenge on its hands to try and connect with new people’.²⁴ With light classics slowly being pushed out of BBC Radio 2’s playlist, and Radio 3’s apparent designation as a ‘minority interest’ station – encompassing jazz, contemporary, experimental and world musics as well as lengthy classical works in their entirety – the station’s producers rightly spotted a gap in the market for a channel dedicated to all the best tunes. In addition, to avoid alienating listeners whose minimal knowledge of pieces, composers and the basics of music history led them to avoid Radio 3’s educational

21 *Ibid.*

22 From the group’s official website, <http://www.littledeath.co.uk> (accessed 19 February 2006).

23 From Classic FM’s website, <http://www.classicfm.co.uk/Article.asp?id=224052&spid=9877>.

24 Inskeep, Steve, ‘Classical Music gets MTV Treatment’, *Morning Edition* (NPR broadcast, 5 October 2004), <<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=4061540>> (accessed 18 June 07).

tone, Classic FM employed ‘professional broadcasters – rather than musicologists – who exuded enthusiasm for music and for the act of listening to it’.²⁵ The result was ‘Radio 3 with all the stuff you couldn’t hum cut out... a brilliant commercial trick’.²⁶ Accusations of ‘dumbing down’ the classics by presenting them in small chunks for limited attention spans are regularly levelled at the station, but none can deny that they serve a audience demographic that is uncatered for elsewhere.

While Classic FM shared some aspects of its output with Radio 3, limited though these were to general assumptions about their musical outputs ('classical') and audience age ('middle-aged and retired'), Classic FM TV had no direct competition. With the increase in the availability of television channels brought about by the change from analogue to digital broadcasting, BBC4, the BBC's free-to-view culture channel,²⁷ was launched in March 2002 (ten months before Classic FM TV).²⁸ Viewers interested in classical and contemporary music could enjoy documentaries and concert coverage on BBC4, but in competition for airtime with

25 Lloyd Webber, Julian, ‘Now classical music can be seen as well as heard’, *The Daily Telegraph* (14 Dec 2002).

26 Lawson, Mark, ‘Beethoven - the pop video’, *The Guardian* (25 November 2002).

27 An interesting comparison can be made between BBC4 and the arts output of rival broadcaster Sky Arts. Listings for both channels surveyed on 15 May 2008 proved typical when compared to listings over a longer period (the previous three months). BBC4 (19:00-00:40, followed by repeats) opened with the news, then concentrated on documentaries on history ('In Search of Medieval Britain', 'Storyville: Israel's Drug Generation', 'Monsoon Railway') interspersed with documentaries on television programmes ('All About Thunderbirds', 'Panorama: The Challenge of the 60s') and one forty-five minute episode of a drama series ('Mad Men'). Sky Arts begin programming at 08:00, with previews and highlights of arts events (Guardian Hay festival, Brighton Festival), followed by a string of mainly canonic art music performances (*Lohengrin*, Mozart *Piano Concerto no 6 (K284)*, the Berlin Philharmonic Anniversary Concert, 'Jacques Loussier plays Bach'). From early evening, programming consists mostly of documentaries based on popular musicians ('Altered by Elvis', 'Songbook: Fran Healy/Travis', 'Bryan Ferry: Dylanesque', 'Johnny Cash – The Anthology') and plastic arts ('National Trust Garden Treasures', 'Is This Art?', 'Andy Warhol: The Complete Picture'). BBC4's wider-sounding 'cultural' (rather than 'arts') remit sounds much wider, but in fact becomes much more self-referential with its media emphasis.

28 Wells, Matt, ‘Classic FM gambles on 24-hour TV music channel’, *The Guardian* (25 November 2002).

theatre, literature and dance on the same channel. Inevitably, the introduction of the new channel breathed new life into a long-running conspiracy theory that arts broadcasting would be removed from the two mainstream BBC channels altogether. Criticism of the BBC's gradual erosion of its arts airtime in favour of 'dumbed-down' light programming became a theme amongst concerned observers. (These fears were, it emerged, ill-founded; BBC2 would recycle BBC4's programming at a later date.)²⁹

Classic FM TV offered no documentaries, no concerts and no presenter narrative. Its wall-to-wall pop video format interspersed with advertisements is not tailored to the middle-aged, middle-class southerners Davis wished to keep funding the BBC;³⁰ music television, after all, is primarily its own marketing tool, and the abovementioned demographic group is unlikely to devote much time to consuming endless advertising. Who, then, might be part of the 'new audience' the channel wishes to introduce to classical music?

Classic FM attracts an impressively wide demographic. While its owners, GCap Media group, and its advertisers consider the station to be aimed at an older age group, 'Figures released [in May 2007] revealed that half a million teenage bedrooms reverberate to the sounds of Classic FM'.³¹ Irrespective of whether the actual content of the channel's programming, or its exam-stress-busting marketing policy (particularly in May, as last-minute revision takes place) influences the fickle teenage market more, this reveals that widening classical music's audiences has already been successful.

At Classic FM TV's conception in 2002, it was hoped to attain ABC1 Adults status, attracting middle-aged, white-collar workers with high disposable income. A year later, the channel boasted some 70% of viewers under the age of 44, and an impressive 20% under 24.³² Julian Rigamonti, the head of Classic FM TV,

29 Keating, Roly, 'Keating on the future of arts on BBC1 and BBC2', *The Guardian* (7 March 2002).

30 Byrne, Ciar, 'Davies in BBC arts pledge', *The Guardian* (3 January 2003).

31 Phillips, Sarah, 'Why do so many teenagers love Classic FM?', *The Guardian* (16 May 2007).

32 Internal audience figures from Gallagher, Rosemary, 'Classic FM TV courts youth with promo push', *Broadcast* (25 April 2003).

characterised two typical audience groups in 2004: those who tune in on Saturday and Sunday mornings, and ‘post-pub... because it’s quite a relaxing musical environment’, and those with a light interest in classical music who wish to learn more about it.³³ By 2006 the key demographic was ‘middle-aged women and students’, those who stay at home and watch television during the daytime.³⁴ Such divergent demographics hint to us that Classic FM TV is not just pulling in its parent station’s listeners, but is instead competing with other music video channels, for those who ‘intrinsically understand’ the video genre. The concept of enticing white-collar professionals to classical music through the use of a youth-orientated format – however carefully tailored to the Classic FM brand – may now seem as bizarre to Rigamonti as to the rest of us.

Rigamonti’s media interviews tell us that ‘It shouldn’t come as such a surprise that the under-20s are tuning in’,³⁵ that Classic FM TV is for young audiences who already engage with pop music videos. Initially, the channel appears to have been successful at enticing viewers away from other video channels, and ‘people are watching a lot longer than other music TV’; thus Classic FM TV ‘has called on emerging film companies and independent and major labels including Sony to produce footage’,³⁶ and the station is ‘being approached by artists and young film directors who wish to create their own material for the channel’,³⁷ indicating that the format has already affected areas of the music industry. Two weeks after its launch, its viewer figures were equivalent to the numbers watching the ten-month-old BBC4;³⁸ was described by critics as ‘a more therapeutic remedy for exhaustion or depression than anything that comes out of a bottle’;³⁹ and was already planning

33 Inskeep, ‘Classical Music gets MTV Treatment’.

34 The final year Audio-Visual Production project of Matthew Francis, a student at Nottingham Trent University (2007), drew on work experience he had gathered at MTV Europe and from editing at Classic FM TV, interviews with the former head and founder of Classic FM TV (Julian Rigamonti) and the channel manager (Alexandra Edwards), and statistics gathered from questionnaires, telephone interviews and focus group study. www.matthew-francis.co.uk/content/homtv.html (accessed July 2007).

35 Day, Julia, ‘Classic FM toasts TV success’, *The Guardian* (17 January 2003).

36 Gallagher, ‘Classic FM TV courts youth with promo push’.

37 Anon, ‘Classic FM TV: Hitting the Right Note’, *Promo* (April 2003).

38 *Ibid.*

39 Lawson, Mark, ‘Lawson on TV - Bach to Basics’, *The Guardian* (30 June 2003).

expansion to New Zealand, North America, the Netherlands, Eastern Europe and Japan.⁴⁰ It is also assumed, however, that members of this audience have short attention spans; that they prefer quick shots of entertainment to investing their time in lengthier involvement with a subject; and that they prefer tried-and-tested experiences to innovative ones.⁴¹

Upon exploring the effects of Classic FM's marketing image, a researcher found that among questionnaire respondents and telephone interviewees (of unknown demographic group) 'it was felt that Classic FM as a brand approaches classical music in a non-traditional way', where classical music is traditionally viewed as 'highbrow, narrow, dull and serious'. Apparently, *classic* music was perceived to be 'broader, not stuffy, more variety and lighter' than *classical*, and 'the expectation and preference was for Classic FM TV to remain true to the 'classic' ethos and friendly presentation style'.⁴² The same respondents, when asked what their viewing preferences for peak programming were, requested concerts, especially those featuring celebrity performers, and documentary-style biographies, histories and educational programmes – all of which are already catered for by mainstream media.⁴³

Whether this was a statement of the core wants and needs of the interested public, or merely a reflection in public awareness of the lack of imagination that limits the scope of current music broadcasting, Classic FM TV's founder found their requests easy to dismiss. Rigamonti's stance, unsurprisingly, was that

One of the major issues for peak programming is that there is little or no content currently available that can comfortably fit within Classic FM's established brand values. Most long form programming already produced has an editorial stance

40 Anon, 'Classic FM TV on a Global mission', *Broadcast* (11 July 2003).

41 Peter Maxwell Davies raised the issue of dwindling interest in culture in a keynote speech to the Incorporated Society of Musicians' conference in 2007: 'I am reluctant, and unqualified, to investigate in depth the relationships between this trend ["dumbing down" for the sake of accessibility] and exploitative capitalism, globalisation and the convenient alleged reduction of people's attention span down to the length of an advertising commercial'. Published as 'A case for classical music, old and new', *The Guardian* (10 April 2007).

42 <http://www.matthew-francis.co.uk/content/research.html>.

43 *Ibid.*

that is in keeping with the traditional ‘classical’ approach to the music that Classic FM TV intends to move away from. Until Classic FM TV is able to commission and produce its own programming, it is important that the channel’s output does not impact adversely on perceptions of the core Classic FM brand.⁴⁴

Despite conceding that concerts offered the possibility for a more neutral editorial stance, and despite crossover concerts achieving success through the adoption of popular culture,⁴⁵ Rigamonti’s general belief is that the desired audience does not have the extended periods of time necessary to follow a full-length programme and is less likely to dip in and out of an extended format:

One of the key factors for Classic FM TV is we consider it to be more like a microwave meal than a four-course meal with a bottle of wine. So we’re introducing classical music to new audiences, and if you want to compete for the attention span of younger audiences particularly, it’s important to approach them on their own level. The pop music video phenomenon has been around now for twenty-five years and there’s a whole generation who understand it intrinsically... We’re not trying to suggest that this is classical music in its purest and best form, but what it is doing is connecting with audiences.⁴⁶

There are, of course, some inherent problems with adopting the music television format. Pop videos are short. They begin and end with the music they promote. The extreme pace of the narrative provided by the song, whether enforced or undermined, has shaped the speedy development of action in pop videos, and the pulsating beats that encourage a listener to dance urge the screen action forward in the same way. Classical music, on the other hand, is not always so concise, and does not always have a propelling motion. Classic FM’s radio format had already removed full works from the majority of its programming, playing only single movements from symphonies, arias out of the context of their operas, preludes without fugues *et cetera*, thus solving the first part of the problem ('What

44 *Ibid.*

45 From a Classic FM feature on Maksim (<http://www.classicfm.com/tv>): ‘With three-quarters of the audience at his recent concert in Croatia under thirty, Maksim is not far off his dream of reaching “as many people as possible with classical music” with his contemporary interpretation of classical piano pieces. His success is no doubt attributed to his ability to communicate with a younger audience with dramatic performances, dry ice, video walls and laser shows.’

46 Inskeep, ‘Classical Music Gets MTV Treatment’.

would Beethoven have released as the single from this?).⁴⁷ But it also prefers to concentrate on ‘relaxing’ pieces (a theme to which I will return) rather than motion-exciting music. Classic FM TV does not (or is not able to) identify itself with this central facet of its parent company’s marketing.

Returning to the Classic FM brand’s core goals, we remind ourselves that the television venture not only hopes to introduce a new audience to classical music – successfully harnessing a proportion of music video viewers – but also aims to introduce classical music to a new audience. According to the head of programming, ‘a surprising amount of visual material has been recorded by classical artists’.⁴⁸ Not enough, obviously; a few videos, of a few artists, appeared in heavy rotation. A trainee editor at the station noted that, at the channel’s commercial launch in 2002, there were just thirty videos, though by 2006 this had increased to more than 300.⁴⁹

There are two obvious questions raised by the channel’s playlist. The first of these concerns the predilection for famous music (which will be discussed below): since ‘Classic FM listeners only get to hear the aggressively narrow-minded purview of classical musical culture that their schedulers allow’, does it *introduce* music to a wider audience if it plays music everybody already knows?⁵⁰ While concern for Classic FM’s limited playlist may be well-placed, there is also proof that viewers are indeed being introduced to new music. MTV is regarded as a successful marketing tool because it stimulates record sales, and it is believed that Classic FM TV can boast the same:

Video exposure for a track from Bobby McFerrin’s album, *Circlesongs*, is thought to be responsible for a dramatic sales upswing. During Classical FM TV’s first month, *Circlesongs* sold more units than in the previous two years.⁵¹

Circlesongs is hardly what could be called a classical album; Sony’s website describes it as ‘eight improvised wordless “chants” with a group of twelve singers whose musical styles encompass vocal techniques from around the world’.⁵² It

47 Lawson, ‘Beethoven - the pop video’.

48 *Ibid.*

49 <http://www.matthew-francis.co.uk/content/research.html>.

50 Service, Tom, ‘Radio by Robot’, *The Guardian* (11 April 2007).

51 Anon, ‘Classic FM TV Helps Drive Record Sales’, *Music Week* (February 2003).

52 <http://www.sonyclassical.com/releases/62734/main.htm>.

does, however, lead us to our second question. Does Classic FM TV actually introduce *classical music* to a wider audience when it plays so little of it?

In 2006, Classic FM TV's website offered a list of the 49 most popular videos on the channel (see Appendix 1). Seven provided music that could more easily be categorised as folk or world, including Bobby McFerrin's *Circlesongs* (rather than his interpretation of Mozart) and contributions from Clannad and Enya. Seven more were productions of popular songs and ballads, their inclusion seemingly justified by the presence of classical artists (Pavarotti, Aled Jones, Charlotte Church *et al*) or their exclusion from other music outlets. Five more consisted of film soundtracks, accompanied by clips from the movies, and a further four ambient electronica acts appeared. Twenty-three of the original forty-nine videos – nearly half – were of dubious classical provenance, and it is doubtful many of them would have qualified for inclusion in the classical chart. Among the remaining twenty-six videos are names that had already suffered chart exclusion and sounds that were far more crossover than classical, too, but stood out more for their conformity to video genre rather than musical content. A full eleven of these focussed on the looks and clothing of the performers, while a further three offered staged 'live' performances.

These are some of the results of Rigamonti's ideas for updating the presentation of classical music, 'trying to restrict images that have baggage', apparently necessary due to the promiscuous nature of 'young TV viewers... flicking between the likes of *Kerrang!* and other music channels'.⁵³ (Despite the assumption that many music television 'viewers' use their television as an aural backdrop, much like a radio, the channel still needs trendy visuals to be commercially viable.) The baggage in question includes the use of the 'static camera shot of people in bow-ties' that looks old-fashioned, 'just doesn't engage our new and atypical classical audience',⁵⁴ and – more centrally – makes classical music 'look like hard work'.⁵⁵ Unfortunately, many of the results appear as clichéd as the dreaded concert footage 'in an effort to blow the dust off a venerable form of music'.⁵⁶ In answer to

53 Gallagher, 'Classic FM TV courts youth with promo push'.

54 *Promo*, 'Hitting the Right Note'.

55 Gallagher, 'Classic FM TV courts youth with promo push'.

56 Inskeep, 'Classical Music Gets MTV Treatment'.

an American radio reporter, who summarised a video of the singer Dagmar Peckova as beginning ‘with the singer in full operatic costume, and then she lifts up her skirts and is revealed to be wearing combat boots’, Rigamonti responds that the video is an interesting example of making centuries-old music ‘relevant and contemporary to audiences today’.⁵⁷ The thought that a soprano in shocking footwear makes her more relevant to the audience, rather than merely adding entertainment value, is as patronising as the idea that young people do not appreciate ‘hard work’. Perhaps Bryn Terfel’s open-necked shirt is to make his singing job appear more like the typical viewer’s office job, so that audiences can identify with him rather than being in awe of him, and to make his performance appear more spontaneous. But it also runs the risk of demeaning the years of ‘hard work’ and preparation performers put into developing their instrument and their art, in favour of the unremarkable and the everyday.

The two abovementioned genres of video are unsurprising. Music television, like the rest of the music industry, has used nubile young performers to its advantage for a long time (as will be discussed below), and live performances have been the mainstay of mainstream, non-MTV music broadcasting. What is perhaps more interesting is the remaining subset, the largest grouping that contains not only Miriam Stockley (the voice of *Adiemus*) and ERA (an orchestral and rock fusion ensemble), but also respected figures such as Philip Glass and Kyung Wha Chung. These videos are not just generically diverse in terms of the music (or musicians) they accompany. Some offer glimpses of the musician at work; others avoid direct association with the composer or performer. Some could easily be confused with cinema trailers. What they all share is that the sets used resemble, in one way or another, minimalist art installations.

Of the most ‘serious’ acts, Angela Gheorghiu gives us ‘Casta Diva’ from Bellini’s *Norma* in an unfurnished, white room, overexposed in pale blue light that matches her evening dress; also in evening dress but in black and white, Kyung Wha Chung performs ‘Summer’ from Vivaldi’s *Four Seasons* in the corner of a similarly unfurnished modern room with cityscape views. Roxy Music’s percussionist-cum-harpist Julia Thornton offers the aria from Bach’s *Goldberg Variations* with no more than a curtain to grace the screen, and in a dress that makes her appear as

57 *Ibid.*

though sculpted of stone. For his *Metamorphosis One*, Philip Glass is not in evening dress, but his grand piano is yet again in an unfurnished modern room with wood laminate flooring. Ludovico Einaudi's *Melodia Africana III* accompanies shots of an empty scene in front of a barn, scattered with candles.

The connection between established artists, established composers and spatial emptiness is stressed by the repetition of these themes. For Glass and Einaudi, both composer-performers under Sony BMG's management, the link is obvious. Minimalist music, with which Glass's and Einaudi's creative outputs have been associated, is considered to share its ethos with the minimalist architecture and interior design of their video sets, and the spatial and lighting effects echo the aural concentration on dense and sparse textures. Linking contemporaneous trends in the visual arts in this manner is an extremely traditional way of visualising musical concepts, and even labelling them – Debussy's 'impressionism' is a result of this tradition.

For Thornton, Chung and Gheorghiu, all signed to and filmed by EMI Classics, the association is not so fruitful. Bach, Vivaldi and Bellini are by no means minimalist, more regularly coupled with florid or rococo art. Both 'Casta Diva' and 'Summer', while not being explicitly programmatic or having documented narratives, have strong themes which could have easily been incorporated into non-traditional visuals but are instead abstracted. The original abstract nature of the *Goldberg Variations* is likely to have been displaced by its central role in *The Silence of the Lambs*, thus evoking aspects of a different narrative by association: vacating the screen space may dissociate the aria from the scenes of horror it once accompanied, but seems more likely to allow the viewer the creative room to 'fill in the gaps' with memories of where he first heard the music.

The three works discussed above can be counted among a very few classical pieces that are well-known among casual listeners to classical music. They have entered the public consciousness through exposure to films, television and advertisements in which the tunes have featured, in which they have been used as indicators of high culture (most notably in *The Silence of the Lambs*). If high culture can be represented by a small sample of its products, then perceptions of that culture can equally be changed through that sample. Recalling the nature of

'classical' music as described by respondents to Classic FM TV's questionnaire, the issue of seriousness has been conquered by Peckova's combat boots, the issue of dullness by trendy gyrating string quartets, and the issue of variety in that the channel plays Broadway hits, Elton John covers and boy choirs. The remaining negative perception was the highbrow nature of classical music, where classical music has meaning, where popular music does not. EMI Classics may well be positing that, like Sony's videos, the content of the music is accurately displayed on screen. Perhaps we could consider the pretty ladies, still performing in their pretty evening dresses (no such relief from traditional clothing for them), as empty shells as well.

The electronics and pulsating beasts of club music found in Maksim and Bond are merely the aural representation of the perceived need to bring the music up to date, and do not overly change the content of the classical music they are superimposed on. Even so, some commentators find in it sinister motives. Sir Peter Maxwell Davies is disturbed not only by such treatment of classical music, but also by the replacement of musical variety with uniform loud and repetitive sound:

what should be an intimate and sensitive experience [turns] into a soul and ear-numbing imitation of a Hitlerian or Stalinist rally, with all sensibilities subsumed in blather and beat... To reduce all of this subtlety by placing a rock beat behind Mozart's *Symphony No 40* is like sticking orange plastic boobs on the Mona Lisa.⁵⁸

For many, the recasting of pop songs in a 'classical' (orchestral, choral or operatic) mould is a reversal of this club-enhanced string quartet model, but for the very same purpose: the use of familiar music in an 'accessible' format to introduce one music to the audience of another. Versions of pop songs translated into Italian with orchestral backing tracks, performed by the likes of Il Divo and Amici, graced the screens of Classic FM TV from the start. By 2006, Cantamus, a female chorus from Mansfield that sings pop covers with pop beats, featured on the channel, and Scala, a Belgian all-girl choir that performs cynical pop and rock songs accompanied by piano, were spotted on the channel singing Nirvana's 'Smells Like Teen Spirit'.⁵⁹ *Broadcast* magazine reported in 2003 that 'Sony has already gone

58 Maxwell Davies, 'A case for classical music, old and new'.

59 <http://www.amazon.co.uk/Dream-Scala->

into production with videos for an album by Christopher O'Riley of piano versions of tracks from indie group Radiohead, due out this summer.⁶⁰

As with any music channel, new material is vital to prevent audiences losing interest. In 2006 the channel boasted over 9.1 million viewers,⁶¹ insider figures show that for 11-17 September 2006 the year on year figure was down by -58%.⁶² Despite Classic FM's wholehearted adoption of Einaudi, most contemporary composers are not as digestible, and even popular music arranged for traditional forces has a limited number of exponents, posing a rather thorny problem. Step forward a student focus group formed to gain insight into the channel's target age range, who 'agreed that the way to ensure the existence of classical music is through the film industry, and utilising films with suitable soundtracks'.⁶³ Here is a music that is played by classical orchestras, while hiding their stuffy bow-ties; a music that has a high rate of production, and is almost always already part of a heavily marketed enterprise. It also just happens to have a large amount of video footage, in which the absent soloists are replaced by star actors. Both the film industry and the music broadcaster benefit from the advertisement of soundtrack material: the broadcaster gets airtime filled with acceptably classical-sounding music; the movie marketers need only invest minimally in post-production to produce a music video, the regular airplay of which will function as one of many facets of the film's marketing campaign.

In interview, Rigamonti acknowledged that many of his target audience may consider classical music to be dead, and attempted to prove otherwise:

The irony of it is that they will then see the *Lord of the Rings* or soundtracks to films such as *Gladiator* and they will realise that a full symphonic score is what gives them the hairs on the back of their neck [sic], but they will often not even

[Rocks/dp/B0000U6KC2/ref=pd_bbs_sr_1/026-9020042-6136463?](http://www.ebay.com/itm/100000U6KC2/ref=pd_bbs_sr_1/026-9020042-6136463?ie=UTF8&s=music&qid=1188915972&sr=8-1)

displays a review from a customer who was introduced to Scala through Classic FM's radio coverage of the choir, and who bought the *Dream On* CD as a result of their appearance on Classic FM TV.

60 Gallagher, 'Classic FM TV courts youth with promo push'.

61 <http://www.classicfm.co.uk/Article.asp?id=224052&spid=9877>.

62 <http://www.matthew-francis.co.uk/content/research.html>.

63 *Ibid.*

consider the fact that that is a classical orchestra.⁶⁴

Far from suggesting that audiences will discover more classical orchestral music through exposure to full symphonic scores, the implication of Rigamonti's statement is more that the audience will *not even consider* what they are listening to, as long as they recognise it (in this case, from visits to the cinema; more usually, from regular radio airtime). Further, when Rigamonti declares 'the *Lord of the Rings* soundtrack is symphonic. A major part of our strategy is to change perceptions about classical music',⁶⁵ he appears to suggest that, since the soundtrack is already symphonic, classical audiences must broaden their horizons to include film music. *Circlesongs*, Enya, Radiohead, *Gladiator*: to the Classic FM brand, they do not appear on Classic FM TV because they are classical; they are classical because they appear on Classic FM TV.

Critique such as this can easily disintegrate into thinly-veiled snobbery of the sort Norman Lebrecht has levelled at Billy Joel, that classically-trained pop stars should be unable to turn back the clock and enter the hallowed halls of classical artists unblemished by their experiences. 'If [Myleene Klass] ever entered your consciousness at all', for instance, 'you might remember her as a member of Hear'say... Not now. Apparently she's a classical musician.'⁶⁶ But when the criticism remains on-topic, most of it concerns the lack of 'classical' music, rather than the lack of purely serious artists. Other worries centred on the commerciality of it all, and the uneasy marriage between classical music and music video. Of Klass, 'Her album, *Moving On*, is advertised twenty times per nanosecond on CFMTV, and includes plinky plonky versions of themes from *Gladiator* and *Braveheart*',⁶⁷ of the majority of stars shown by the station,

the performers seem less happy with the form than their rock equivalents.

Because their kind of singing and playing instruments is more technically difficult, the artists tend to stand and belt or saw it out while the visual action happens around them.⁶⁸

Criticism was levelled at the channel *prior* to its launch, as might have been

64 Inskeep, 'Classical Music Gets MTV Treatment'.

65 Day, 'Classic FM toasts TV success'.

66 Miller, Iain, 'Channel Hopper: Chill out. We can be whoever we like', *The Independent on Sunday* (21 March 2004).

67 *Ibid.*

68 Lawson, 'Beethoven - the pop video'.

expected. Yet, perhaps surprisingly, the doomsayers were relatively quiet. Julian Lloyd Webber voiced concerns on the increasing dependence of record companies on the visual, and predicted that 'purists' would hate the insubstantiality of the channel's offerings, but Lloyd Webber is in fact a keen supporter of the emergence of the classical music video.⁶⁹

The main sticking point, tied closely to its commercial nature, was the channel's apparent reliance on soundtracks, seen by Classic FM as a positive move but highlighted concisely by Mark Lawson *et al.*⁷⁰ The only problem movie clips appeared to generate for the station was, in fact, the decision not to create a watershed. Rigamonti's understanding was that 'there are minimal classical video tracks that would be unsuitable to all types of viewer'.⁷¹ Indeed, the channel had highlighted footage that they deemed unsuitable; a segment in the *Gladiator* soundtrack that showed Russell Crowe killing by sword, accompanied by especially popular music, was edited specifically by Classic FM TV to enable the video to air all day.⁷² Other commentators believe that the student age bracket is the result of a 'less savoury' concentration:

It is an open question how far Classic FM TV is aware of having brought to general visibility a sub-genre which it did not invent but in which it is certainly investing heavily. The porno-classical, if it might be called, has raided the soft-porn movie extensively.⁷³

Classic FM TV has indeed invested in a great number of videos featuring the erotic gestures and orgasmic abandon of many young artists, among whom 'the worst offenders are violinists Vanessa-Mae and Lara St John and the four young women who make up the string quartet Bond, all of whose bodies appear to be of greater interest to the makers of their videos than their playing'.⁷⁴ (Performers of this ilk are well-covered by the crossover market in general, making much of their

69 Lloyd Webber, 'Now classical music can be seen as well as heard'.

70 Lawson, 'Beethoven - the pop video'.

71 <http://www.matthew-francis.co.uk/content/homtv.html>.

72 *Ibid.*

73 McArthur, Colin, 'Star Wars music, Bond and soft porn?', *Scotland On Sunday* (13 July 2003) <<http://scotlandonsunday.scotsman.com/review.cfm?id=759062003>> (accessed 28 August 2007).

74 *Ibid.*

youth and physique, such that I will discuss them in greater depth below.) The introduction of a watershed might well have highlighted this content as unsuitable for sensitive viewers, resulting in greatly restricted output and destruction of the original concept.

The model for this concept, of course, is most likely to be ‘to blame’ in the absorption of what may be deemed unsuitable content. MTV is itself a controversial business, the content of which has featured in many psychological studies of adolescents and young adults. Researchers believe that

the combination of music and video imagery can shape viewers' perspectives of the outside world, affect viewers emotionally, and even influence viewers' ambitions and career choices.⁷⁵

Worries about pop stars glamourising and normalising sex, violence and the use of intoxicating substances are often combined with the theory that acted-out stories are more believable than narrated (or written) ones, and that the young target audience has a limited capacity to separate fantasy from reality. Researchers have certainly realised correlations in behavioural patterns between actors in music videos and young people; ‘one-fourth of all MTV videos contain alcohol or tobacco use’,⁷⁶ and ‘a longitudinal study found a positive correlation between TV and music video viewing and alcohol consumption among teens’.⁷⁷ Classic FM TV believes that, rather than viewers imitating MTV, music video is shaped by the assumed behaviour of its target audience. Here, however, the channel offers us its double standards. While Crowe's swordsmanship is cut from the schedule to avoid causing concern, plenty of bare flesh is available to view, for free.

4.3 Lifestyle Listening

For classical music to be a profitable commodity, it has to appeal to the widest

75 Aikat, Debashis, ‘Streaming violent genres online: visual images in music videos on BET.com, Country.com, MTV.com, VH1.com’, *Popular Music and Society* 27, 2 (2004), 222-223.

76 DuRant, R, ‘Tobacco and alcohol use behaviors portrayed in music videos: content analysis’, *American Journal of Public Health* 87 (1997), 1131-1135.

77 Robinson, T, ‘Television and music video exposure and risk of adolescent alcohol use’, *Pediatrics* 102 (1998), e54.

possible demographic spread. The over-50s are expected to have some interest in the classics already, presumably because of their comparatively greater experience of life and exposure to a wider range of cultural offerings. From a marketing perspective, however, it is not a group with a large amount of disposable income, and therefore the younger executive audience, with increased earning power, and the still younger 18-25 age group, are perceived as those most likely to spend their income on personal fulfilment, such as the purchase of CDs and DVDs. Advertisers also wish to appeal to a wide age range, and especially to target the bigger spenders. How, then, is *classical* music (as opposed to the dance-enhanced crossover acts discussed above) packaged to look attractive to younger consumers?

Perhaps as a result of its lack of beat, classical music has been given a function to fill in opposition to pop and rock by the music industry's marketing executives. Instead of being a product to increase adrenaline, to encourage dancing, and to make the working day appear to pass more quickly, classical music is branded as something to relax to, an antidote to corporate stress. As one record label put it, 'No other music has quite the same ability to aid relaxation as the works of the great composers'.⁷⁸ Despite *The Guardian*'s correspondent recognising in 2003 that 'relaxing is the last thing live classical music is, if it's done well: excitement, longing, terror and shock are far further up the list of reactions', it also reported that EMI Classics – whose subsidiary Virgin Classics released *Classical Chillout*, the bestselling classical compilation of 2001 – had researched the market and found that 'More stimulating compilations, such as *Euphoric Classics*, sell less well'.⁷⁹

Commercial radio stations that broadcast classical music conspicuously use youthful, colloquial language, so that listeners can 'chill out' to 'smooth' classics in between the advertisements (some of which have been tailored to fit the 'relaxing' theme, while others are as frenetic and brash as on popular music stations). The

78 In reference to Various Artists, *Classical Chillout*, audio CD recording (Union Square METRTCD803, 2005) from http://www.unionsquaremusic.co.uk/titlev4.php?ALBUM_ID=707&LABEL_ID=16.

79 Higgins, Charlotte, 'Relax, Don't Do It', *The Guardian* (6 February 2003). The *Euphoric Classics* CD was released by Virgin in 2002.

health issues surrounding the hectic and stressful modern lifestyle are brought to mind; for older listeners, classical music may lower the blood pressure and reduce the risk of cardiac problems, while for younger listeners, it may help relieve mental health issues arising from their busy and stressful lives.⁸⁰ Music such as Gregorian chant is rebranded, its original purpose deemed defunct or too limited in scope for a modern audience. CDs are published with what seem to be instructions for usage: Classic FM released *Music for Bathtime* in 2004, and *Mozart for Babies* – which included two CDs labelled ‘for bedtime’ and ‘for playtime’ – in 2005.⁸¹ It is estimated that in 1995 such collections accounted for about 40% of UK classical sales.⁸²

There is, of course, plenty of more obviously cynical advertising. Like the greetings card industry, certain times of year offer the promise of increased sales of certain products. Despite recognising the classical crossover market should be driven by ‘creativity, ideas and collaborations’, an easy route beckons for UCJ’s Mark Wilkinson. ‘It’s all about motivating the massive passive... They come out on high days and holidays looking for something for themselves or a present, and if you hit them at the right time then you have them’.⁸³ Thus the appearance of well-groomed young men for Mothering Sunday, angelic young voices for Christmas, and sex-themed albums for Valentine’s Day in the CD racks.

Simon Cowell’s ‘hand-picked mixed choir of 11- to 14-year olds’, Angelis, released their self-titled debut album in November 2006, ‘backed by a rigorous TV promo campaign’.⁸⁴ This campaign aimed beyond the usual nostalgia market. The

80 A significant number of medical studies concerning the effects of music, especially classical music, on patients have been conducted since the mid-1990s. Two editorial articles which summarise some of the results can be found at ‘Music Thought To Enhance Intelligence, Mental Health’, *Psych Central* (24 June 2006) and ‘To beat pain, find the right beat’, *The Daily Telegraph* (7 October 2006).

81 Various artists, *Classic FM Music for Bathtime*, audio CD recording (Classic FM 82876616082, 2004) and Various artists, *Classic FM Mozart For Babies*, audio CD recording (Classic FM CFMCD45, 2005).

82 Nowicka, Helen, ‘Sex with minors’, *The Independent* (5 November 1995).

83 Awbi, Anita, ‘Classical acts bank on Christmas cheer’, *Music Week* (27 November 2006).

84 *Ibid.*

group's first single, 'Angel', was described as 'a masterclass in commercial positioning... In their video, the message is even more cannily underpinned: the world is dark, dangerous and full of random acts of violence, and only Angelis can offer you respite'.⁸⁵ At the same time, rival albums filled the scene. Libera's *Angel Voices* was released the same day, following All Angels's *All Angels* debut on UCJ (a 'syrupy collection of light classics') and the Froncysyllte Male Voice Choir's *Voices of the Valley* ('mildly souped-up anthems').⁸⁶ Head of EMI Classics and Libera salesman, Thomas Kaurich, worried that it would be 'hard to launch a new artist when you have lots of established acts releasing important works at the same time'.⁸⁷ He dubbed his group's lack of fabrication 'exciting', and pointed to UCJ's Choir Boys ('tipped for [the 2005] Christmas no 1, the three choristers didn't even make the top twenty') as evidence of manufactured goods having short shelf-lives.⁸⁸ Libera's novelty factor, however, appeared to have worn off by the release of their fifth album, and the new artists eclipsed them in sales; Angelis reached the UK top ten, while Froncysyllte and All Angels made the top twenty.⁸⁹ Figures from British supermarket chain Tesco, 'the market leader for retail sales of classical crossover acts', would similarly suggest that advent is a good time to launch crossover albums. In 2006 Tesco noted 'a huge rise in demand during the Christmas period over recent years', which it additionally believed justified demand for crossover classical acts throughout the year.⁹⁰

Quite a different audience was targetted by a spate of CDs for love-making. Warner's Sensual Classics series, launched in 1992, was the brainchild of the company's general manager Bill Holland, 'a conscious decision to package classical music for the pop market'.⁹¹ Market research for the project consisted of volunteers making love to forty extracts of classical music, and rated their favourites. Their results indicated, unsurprisingly, that 'listeners from non-classical backgrounds want greatest hits, not something new'; the outcome, 130 000 UK

85 Fisher, Neil, 'Never mind the cassocks...', *The Times* (1 December 2006).

86 *Ibid.*

87 Awbi, 'Classical acts bank on Christmas cheer'.

88 Fisher, 'Never mind the cassocks...'.

89 *Ibid.*

90 Awbi, 'Classical acts bank on Christmas cheer'.

91 Nowicka, 'Sex with minors'.

and 400 000 worldwide sales.⁹² Packaged showing ‘writhing couples, bare male torsos and soft-focus shots of women in blissful post-coital repose’, with sleeve notes offering the secrets of the composers’ love lives, or describing tracks in terms of their cinematic pedigree (on *Classic Climaxes*, Ravel’s *Bolero* is described as ‘the accompaniment to the famous love scene between Dudley Moore and Bo Derek in the hit movie 10’ (*sic*)), other labels’ responses, such as *Classic Climaxes* and the niche-market *Out Classics*, have achieved similar sales success.⁹³ While RCA manager Simon Foster reportedly hoped such compilations would inspire audiences to consume entire operas and symphonies, rather than popular snippets,⁹⁴ the vast difference in sales setting the sex-themed collections apart from the rest of the classical market would seem to indicate that this demographic’s appetite has been sated with smaller helpings.

The key to *Classical Chillout*, and many others marketed as ‘relaxing’, is that there should be no nasty surprises for the consumer, nothing that would stand out as equivalent to a frenetic jungle track on a reggae album. The result of this logic is that most compilations use the same classical pieces; in addition, they are pieces well-known to audiences from their use in television advertising and as film soundtracks. In surveying twenty-two of the best selling classical compilations of 1999-2005 with either ‘relaxing’ or ‘chillout’ in the title, it was found that, of a total of 906 tracks, just 374 classical pieces (41% of the total) were featured, with the remaining 532 tracks consisting of repeats of these pieces (see Appendix 2).

BPI’s 2003 market summary reported that

The best selling Classical albums of 2003 displayed a continued consumer appetite for contemplative, chillout-type compilations, led by BMG Arista’s four disc set *Smooth Classics – Do Not Disturb, The Very Best of Relaxing Classics* (Universal) and the Decadance [*sic*] label’s *Classical Chillout Gold* titles. Although the two Decadance titles featured in the chart above are multi-disc sets – *Classical Chillout Gold* being a quadruple CD and the accompanying *Best Of* a five disc box set – both had low retail prices which were clearly attractive to music buyers.⁹⁵

92 *Ibid.*

93 *Ibid.*

94 *Ibid.*

95 British Phonographic Industry, *BPI Market Information* 223 (8 March 2004).

Since 1995, Classic FM has broadcast a ‘Hall of Fame’ every Easter, playing a countdown of the three hundred classical works with the most votes from the British public.⁹⁶ For its first five years, Bruch's *Violin Concerto no 1* retained the number one slot, and from 2000-2005, Rachmaninov's *Piano Concerto no 2* topped the chart.⁹⁷ In 2006, Mozart took the pole position, attributed to the celebration of the 250th anniversary of his birth and the resulting ‘unprecedented season of concerts’ throughout the UK.⁹⁸

Such marketing exercises have, of course, limited the target consumers' range of exposure to classical music. Popular taste is not only informed by the content of classical compilations and measured by polls such as the Hall of Fame, but is similarly influenced by the results of the Hall of Fame – informing the consumer of what he *should* like – and feeds back into the marketing system in the production of more compilations of the very same popular classics (‘the top 300 is, in reality, just a reshuffling of the tiny minority of pieces of classical music that Classic FM deigns to broadcast’).⁹⁹ Moreover, the favourites are associated with films and advertisements (in addition to excessive Classic FM airplay). Many ‘relaxing’ compilations make a point of reminding the listener of the music's screen connotations, adding tags such as ‘Hovis advertisement’ to the track listings.¹⁰⁰ The media are also keen to play on associations that otherwise sound like advertising slogans for the music, reducing Rachmaninov to ‘as featured in the classic film *Brief Encounter*’.¹⁰¹

Listener favourites do change with time, albeit slowly. The nature of the Hall of Fame is that it mimics a pop chart, tracking rises and falls in popularity, drop-outs and new entries, year after year. The main difference, of course, is that pop music consumers who listen to chart countdowns get instant feedback on the popularity

96 Anon, ‘Mozart “UK's favourite composer”’, *BBC Online* (18 April 2006), <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/4917892.stm>> (accessed 29 March 2007).

97 *Ibid.*

98 Shaikh, Thair, ‘Mozart's “birthday effect” propels composer to No 1’, *The Independent* (18 April 2006).

99 Service, ‘Radio by Robot’.

100 See, for example, Various Artists, *The Most Relaxing Classical Music in the World... Ever*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCD724, 2005).

101 *BBC Online*, ‘Mozart “UK's favourite composer”’.

of their preference and may alter their tastes according to fashion. Hall of Fame listeners get the opportunity to change their minds just once a year. As a result, new classical music, such as Karl Jenkins's *The Armed Man: A Mass for Peace* (2001) may make a high first appearance in the chart, a result of intense marketing by the record label and radio station that ensures the piece is ingrained on the memory of the station's listeners. Any subsequent fall from favour is likely to reflect the passing of interest that accompanies short-lived entries into the pop chart – it is, after all, a recognised trend that interest is higher in a product during a marketing campaign than after it. *The Armed Man* entered the chart in 2004 at number 8, but fell just one place to number 9 in 2005, and again to number 10 in 2006.¹⁰² Jenkins, at least, has not fallen from grace as quickly as might have been expected; and the marketing drive behind the piece has ensured that listeners have been able to find new music that particularly appeals to them.

One of the problems associated with the Hall of Fame chart, and Classic FM's programming generally, is that of oversimplifying the character of music or musicians. Tom Service, Radio 3 broadcaster and journalist, describes a case in point:

The music chosen from one of the most popular composers on the chart, Vaughan Williams... conforms to a stereotypical view, as if all he did was write music that defined what English music should sound like at the start of the 20th century: pastoral, inoffensive and conservative. His Fourth Symphony, one of the great symphonies of the 1930s and a relentless cry of dissonant anguish, is nowhere to be found.¹⁰³

One potential model for avoiding this dilemma is presented in David Mellor's Classic FM show 'If You Liked That, You'll Like This', a programme that 'aims to stretch our musical horizons and heighten the enjoyment to be had from classical music with a diverse selection from the great composers right through to modern maestros... suggesting pieces of music that make a good starting point for exploring the world of classical music'.¹⁰⁴ This three-dimensional exploration of repertoire covers obviously similar genres and composers, but also contrasting

102 From <http://www.karljenkins.com/biography.php> and Classic FM's 2006 Hall of Fame listings, <http://www.classicfm.com/Article.asp?id=223578&spid=9443>, accessed 29 March 2007.

103 Service, 'Radio by Robot'.

104 <http://www.classicfm.co.uk/article.asp?id=227085>.

sounds and genres produced by the same composer and contemporaries, inevitably offering nice and nasty surprises along the way, even for the long-term Classic FM listener. If the station loses its playlist, Service believes Classic FM ‘could use its dominance in the market to do more than simply give the people what they want, and genuinely extend the reach and repertoires of classical music’;

The challenge for Classic is to not be afraid of the power of the music it presents; to embrace classical music as experience rather than pretend that it can only function as a lifestyle accessory. The station's listeners, after nearly 15 years, are surely ready for the expansion of their horizons beyond the limitations imposed on them.¹⁰⁵

He is not, however, holding his breath.

4.4 Proximating the Popular

The concerted drive to market classical music to a younger audience has led to various musical amalgamations of popular and classical idioms. The string quartet Bond were banned from the UK classical chart in 2000 for the failure of their first album, *Born*, to conform to the Chart Information Network's definition of classical music. According to the CIN, entries in the classical chart should be in ‘a classical idiom’, and ‘at least half of the music on an album must be written by a known classical composer’;¹⁰⁶ Bond's offerings incorporate dance beats and writing is credited to members of the quartet and other arrangers, even where recognisable classical melodies make up the core of most tracks. Of course, Bond are not alone in this.¹⁰⁷ Marianne Faithfull's *20th Century Blues* was barred for reasons

105 Service, ‘Radio by Robot’.

106 Anon, ‘Classical chart bans quartet’, *BBC Online* (16 October 2000), <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/974658.stm>> (accessed 27 February 2007).

107 Vanessa-Mae and Linda Brava are barred from the UK Classical Chart for the same reasons. Similarly, Il Divo do not feature, though they tour with the classically-acceptable Hayley Westenra, and Maksim Mrvica's recordings do not appear in the official chart but do feature in HMV's chart. Other acts have been admitted who fail to fulfil the specific criteria Bond were barred from the chart for; Russell Watson (and many other compilation vocalists, including Westenra and Andrea Bocelli), Karl Jenkins, Mylène Klass, Mediaeval Baebes, The Planets and Amici could all be cited. Newly-composed film soundtracks, such as Magnus Fiennes's *Eugene Onegin*, can

already discussed, and in 2000, Howard Goodall reported

William Orbit's *Pieces in a Modern Style* became another celebrated refusenik: this time, the "Classical Advisory Panel" (clutching at straws I fear), said the pieces (100 per cent of them from 100 per cent classical composers, by the way) were unsuitable "for live performance in a concert setting" and that Madonna's producer had "totally altered" the "tonal colours" of the original works.¹⁰⁸

The press, however, preferred to think that Bond were being singled out for another feature borrowed from popular music – the quartet's raunchy image. They are not alone; leather, torn clothing, short skirts, lots of legs, wet t-shirts, windblown hair and gyrating dancers that fill popular artists' publicity photos, album covers, videos and live performances have all found their way into the marketing of classical music. While this concentration on image is mostly confined to the manufactured crossover acts which sprang up in the 1990s, it had already emerged in the 1980s with Nigel Kennedy.

Kennedy's 'scruffy, new-age soccer-mad punky image'¹⁰⁹ together with advertising campaigns that involved 'eating his violin, or stamping on it' – even at the age of 46¹¹⁰ – helped counter the public's impression of the 'stuffy' classical musician. The image construction, designed by Kennedy together with ex-Bay City Rollers manager John Stanley to create a personality that suited the performer, was credited with introducing a new generation to classical music through his populist manner. (Howard Goodall might call it 'poaching' the pop music audience 'through clever advertising and display', his assumed definition of crossover.)¹¹¹ Perhaps more importantly, Kennedy's provocative new image was a gift to the media. 'Looking grotesque and being able to play the classical violin exquisitely didn't

also enter the classical chart, despite the fact that Fiennes is one of the non-'known classical composers' on the Bond album.

108 Goodall, Howard, 'A classic case of woolly thinking', *The Independent* (29 May 2000).

109 Kelly, Amanda, 'The artist formerly known as Nigel...', *The Independent* (6 November 1997).

110 Maddocks, Fiona, 'Rebel With A Cause', *Evening Standard* (26 September 2002). The advertising campaign referred to was for Nigel Kennedy, *Greatest Hits*, audio CD recording (EMI 5574112, 2002).

111 Goodall, 'A classic case of woolly thinking'.

tally’;¹¹² ‘The most gifted violinist of his generation was a marketing magnet, a genius who behaved like a prat. The chat shows couldn’t get enough of him’.¹¹³

Kennedy himself admits to the success of the manipulation of his own image: ‘There was quite a discussion about all this with my record company. Those stripes and things stand out, they’re different. I don’t believe in all this classical cobweb stuff’.¹¹⁴ For him, as for most artists attempting a debut album, his already proven talent needed a marketing push to reach the public domain. He is dismissive, however, of marketing potential as the primary basis for signing new acts. ‘What’s happened in classical music is the same as what happened with the teen bands, with all the make-a-pop-star-on-telly shit. It seems that it’s so much better if the band sounds like the last band, instead of a band making new shit.’¹¹⁵ Additionally, he has told Edward Seckerson of *The Independent* that his mixed-bag programming ('Jimi Hendrix alongside Bach and Bartók') is not ‘out of some oikish desire to ingratiate himself with today’s youth/pop culture’, since ‘he’s far happier when younger fans tell him that they didn’t expect to like the Bach but did, or, vice versa, when classical enthusiasts respond to the Hendrix.’¹¹⁶

Kennedy’s words, believable through the intelligence beyond his persona and the passion that shines through it, are nevertheless reminiscent of many other image-conscious acts. Maksim Mrvica, a perennially black leather clad Croatian pianist whose recordings are presented in club mixes, ‘not only demonstrates that high culture can be made accessible to all, but also that pop music is not necessarily as throw-away as it first appears... He has perhaps done more than anyone else in recent years to bring classical music to a new audience.’¹¹⁷ EMI’s press release for his fourth album, *Electrik* (2006), draws on words such as ‘complex’ and ‘great’ to invoke classical music’s cultural status, while mentions of his ‘male model good looks’ and ‘huge rock style concerts which include dramatic flashing strobe lights,

112 Maddocks, ‘Rebel With A Cause’.

113 Seckerson, Edward, ‘Nice one, Nigel’, *The Independent* (24 June 1996).

114 Maddocks, ‘Rebel With A Cause’.

115 Byrnes, Sholto, ‘Nigel Kennedy: “Antagonism vibes me up”’, *The Independent* (17 June 2004).

116 Seckerson, ‘Nice one, Nigel’.

117 Press release for Maksim’s *Electrik* album, from his official website,
http://217.199.173.171/cgi-bin/maksim_news.cgi?act=display_article&id=.

atmospheric smoke effects and huge video screens' aim the product directly at a young, rather than a broader, audience.¹¹⁸ 'Maksim plays his piano like a DJ works the decks' is perhaps the closest description of his music; it is instrumental music for clubs and raves, produced in the same way, rather than a new style of classical music.¹¹⁹

A similar claim could be made for Bond, who are 'joined on stage by nubile dancers and a rock band, and play music with a dance beat'.¹²⁰ The band members themselves, while confident that their music belongs in the classical chart, are not sure how to classify it. The quartet's violist Tania Davis sees the group as on a mission to improve the popularity of classical music:

Many people have this misconception that classical music is high-brow. We want to make it more accessible to the masses. People should not be intimidated by it.¹²¹ ...If kids see musicians who aren't wearing black morning suits, it might encourage them to take up an instrument, or go up that extra staircase to the classical section.¹²²

Meanwhile, violinist Haylie Ecker pointed out that, while

every single CD store in the country – and it's a problem we've only had in the UK, by the way – stocks our record in the classical department. That's where people go to expect to find it,¹²³

the group are pioneers of something quite different:

We're not really saying we're a classical string quartet because we're not. We're classically-influenced. People actually realise what we're trying to do. We're not taking pieces and sticking a drumbeat behind them. We're looking at it from a new aspect.¹²⁴

Similar confusions occur when asked about the girls' image, and to what degree this was manufactured. The BBC reported in 2000 that 'The foursome adopt a

118 *Ibid.*

119 *Ibid.*

120 Lister, David, 'Classics in crop-tops cause Brits dispute', *The Independent* (27 April 2001).

121 Tan, Hazel, 'Bond girls sex up classical music', *Singapore Today* (8 February 2001).

122 Jardine, Cassandra, 'They're out of tune - not us', *The Daily Telegraph* (19 October 2000).

123 Virtue, Graeme, 'Bond age', *The Sunday Herald* (16 September 2001).

124 *Ibid.*

purposefully modern image, wearing daring clothes and posing in bikinis – rather than donning the usually sober attire of the classical world,¹²⁵ – a concept concomitant with Davis's idea of bringing classical music to the timid. Davis herself, however, claimed: 'We did not deliberately adopt an image. We just wear what we like.'¹²⁶ Similarly at odds with the BBC's report, *The Daily Telegraph*'s correspondent claimed in an interview with the group that 'they refuse to perform in bikinis or underwear, but will cavort in the waves in sarongs and crop tops.'¹²⁷ We are presented with conflicting truths. Either the girls are afraid that conforming to a marketing image damages their credibility as classical musicians – a question that Nigel Kennedy's reception among critics and public has already answered – or the adoption of their personas has been so complete that they believe they really are what they are packaged as. As for the group's nude photograph, rumoured to have been turned down as a potential debut album cover, Decca's managing director Bill Holland explained that the label was 'very concerned about Bond projecting such a sensational image', yet the photograph still managed to leak into the eager hands of the press.¹²⁸ How much does their image matter? 'Bond are entertainers and see no shame in that.'¹²⁹

The industry appears to believe 'People won't buy classical stuff unless it's marketed like rock 'n' roll or pop music, complete with a sexy edge.'¹³⁰ Mel Bush, who created Vanessa-Mae's career and designed the Bond concept, is not the only impresario with a hand in the creation of boy- and girl-bands whose members play classical instruments. The Planets, 'four boys and four girls aged between 20 and 27' were selected by Mike Batt 'for their virtuosic ability'; released their debut album in 2003; and split up two years later.¹³¹ There are no prominent techno beats such as those Bond and Maksim thrive on on *Classical Graffiti*, but the content is still only based on classical themes, rather than being classical *per se*. Batt's sleeve notes to *Classical Graffiti*'s 'Carmen Caprice', representative

125 Anon, 'Classical chart bans quartet'.

126 Tan, 'Bond girls sex up classical music'.

127 Jardine, 'They're out of tune - not us'.

128 Virtue, 'Bond age'.

129 From Bond's website, <http://www.bondmusic.net/storyset.html>.

130 Harper, Jennifer, 'Sexy Looks Strike Chord', *Insight on the News* (6 August 2001).

131 Biography of The Planets from the Mhz Networks Artist Archive,

<http://www.mhznetworks.org/programming/artists/675> (accessed 16 March 2007).

(production-wise) of all of the tracks on the album, cry out for preclusion from the UK classical chart, on which it nevertheless managed to hold the number one spot for three months:

Like most of the pieces and rearrangements on this album, I arranged this especially for The Planets. It is based on tunes from Bizet's famous opera *Carmen*. Sometimes several of the tunes are played together, and I have added my own tunes in order to provide links and counter tunes to the originals.¹³² His predilection for interference even affected a track reminiscent of 4'33", and credited by Batt as being co-written by John Cage, over which a copyright battle ensued. According to the BBC, 'Batt said the idea of the track was to separate some acoustic arrangements from rockier material... "a tongue-in-cheek dig at the John Cage piece".'¹³³ He agreed to pay a six-figure sum to the John Cage Trust in an out-of-court settlement.

The Mediæval Bæbes, always photographed looking stylish, sultry and theatrical, and who 'delight in their reputation for wantonness',¹³⁴ are also accused of being 'a flesh-over-substance act created by record company executives with an eye toward making lots of money'.¹³⁵ One of the Bæbes admitted to heavy marketing by their record company, but they were not created by them.¹³⁶ Founder member Katherine Blake (who had formerly performed with a similar outfit popular on the London fetish scene, known as Miranda Sex Garden), writes the group's original compositions in the style of early music, settings of medieval poetry that is also adapted by the group members to suit their needs:¹³⁷ most of the tracks they perform are not, however, the fourteenth-century plainsong that Howard Goodall and other critics assume.¹³⁸ The band's marketing strategy overshadowed their

132 Commentary on The Planets, *Classical Graffiti*, audio CD recording (EMI 57316, 2003).

133 Anon, 'Silent music dispute resolved', *BBC Online* (23 September 2002), <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/music/2276621.stm>> (accessed 12 April 2007).

134 Mediæval Bæbes website, <http://www.mediaevalbaebes.com/home.html>.

135 Winick, Steve, 'At the Ren Faire with Mediæval Bæbes', *Dirty Linen* 129 (April 2007).

136 Briscoe, Joanna, 'I got you, Bæbes', *The Independent* (17 October 1998).

137 Winick, 'At the Ren Faire with Mediæval Bæbes'.

138 Goodall, 'A classic case of woolly thinking'.

music sufficiently that few commentators, and presumably the chart compilers themselves, were unaware of what their product actually was; the Bæbes's debut album, *Salva Nos*, entered the UK classical chart at number one.¹³⁹

Another band surfaced in 2003, Amici, whose £6 million record deal with BMG 'far outstrip[ped] those agreed by most rock and pop acts'.¹⁴⁰ Five classically-trained singers were recruited to produce hits from the popular operatic and classical themes used in television and commercials, drawing from a pool of material that already had a wide, mainstream audience. The record label hired a music marketing consultant, Chris Griffin, to advise them on the project's target group: people who recognise the music, but cannot fit a name to it. Griffin expressed his hope that 'it might lead them to take an interest in other areas of music', yet the very targeting of the group suggests that its primary concern was to lure listeners who are exposed to very little classical music but 'like what they hear'.¹⁴¹ Amici's debut album, *The Opera Band*, remained in the top ten of the UK classical chart for over 83 weeks.¹⁴²

Bill Holland, divisional director of competing record label Universal Classics and Jazz, commented on BMG's project as a result of the classical music industry having 'no option but to break down barriers and respond to modern tastes': 'Everything you would ever want to record in the way of broadstream repertoire has been recorded. How many versions do you need of standard works?'¹⁴³ Holland was excited about the Amici project, and was speaking in defence of labels branching out of classical into crossover. The difficulty with his comments, of course, is that Amici, like Russell Watson and Andrea Bocelli, record little but new versions of standard, popular works. They are pieces that are being recorded again to market the manufactured group and not for a new artistic perspective, in the way that Nigel Kennedy, Linda Brava and Anne-Sophie Mutter have all managed to do for the core violin repertoire (in addition to maintaining their own

139 <http://www.mediaevalbaebes.com/disco.htm>.

140 Burrell, Ian, 'Record giant spends £6m on operatic quintet hailed as saviours', *The Independent* (5 July 2003).

141 *Ibid.*

142 Amici's website news, <http://www.amiciforever.com/2005news.aspx> (accessed 2 April 2007).

143 Burrell, 'Record giant spends £6m on operatic quintet hailed as saviours'.

strongly marketable images).

Image-wise, Amici are not in the same mould as Bond or the Bæbes. Like their equally manufactured rivals, Il Divo, Amici tend towards an image that suggests both groups following in the footsteps of the original operatic boy-band, the Three Tenors. To compare the style of such groups with their classical counterparts, we would have to find the closest equivalent in the classical realm. The Three Tenors, Il Divo and Amici do not perform *in* operas, and do not become costumed characters manipulated by a plot. Neither are they quite recitalists, in that one individual is not the focal point of the performance, and a balance between the group members should be maintained. At the same time, the members do have to stand out as individuals, unlike orchestral, choir or chamber ensemble members, much like the soloists in the performance of an oratorio or mass. Traditional attire for such performers would be evening dress. The Three Tenors stuck closely to this, wearing tails and white bow ties for their stage performances. Il Divo typically appear in smart-but-casual attire, almost always in dark and white suits (with or without jeans). Amici's members follow suit, with the two female members wearing smart, unfussy dark or white dresses with hem lengths well above the floor. It would seem that the traditional mode of dress is being held on to as a reminder of their classical credentials, despite Il Divo's and Amici's predilection for popular songs translated into Italian ('Senza Catene' is a favourite), whose nods to classical music stop at orchestral backing tracks and melodies warbled in operatic style.

Despite the proportion of publicity given to these acts as a result of pop image's provocative nature, crossover's appeal to the older market should not be overlooked. The older female market enjoys admiring the good-looking members of Il Divo and Amici in their smart outfits, but other personas have worked equally well for them. The choirboy images of Aled Jones (who has retained his clean-cut persona in his new career as a show singer and radio presenter) and the Libera boys' choir sell extremely well to older women for their presumed innocence, fulfilling the listener's yearning for their lost youth (or that of their children, or grandchildren). Similarly, before Charlotte Church produced pop singles and hosted chat shows, Sony presented her as an ordinary young girl with the 'Voice of an Angel'; newspapers reported that she 'loves junk food, shopping, sleeping

late... like most teenage girls'.¹⁴⁴ Even the product herself realised that 'The reason I appealed to the general public is (*sic*) because I provided the innocence that was lacking from the entertainment industry.'¹⁴⁵ After several years of being portrayed as a 'dark haired innocent', by her fourth album, *Enchantment* (2001), Church was described as a 'budding glamour puss... fleshy and utterly appealing'.¹⁴⁶ While her image could be contrasted with Britney Spears's 'thong-and-navel appeal' by the *New York Daily Times*, Church was still relying on young femininity; her curves were still flaunted despite being covered up. The angelic granddaughter image morphed into that similar to a film star, a middle way steered carefully to avoid alienating the predominantly older audience and to cater to Charlotte's less childish tastes. Her *Enchantment* image is not dissimilar to that of Renee Fleming (*Homage* (2006), *Sacred Songs* (2005)) or Leslie Garrett (*Lesley Garrett* (1998), *The Essential Collection* (2006)). Hayley Westenra, currently marketed in the same vein as Church's early incarnation, may yet go the same way.

4.5 Commandeering Cultural Cachet

Classical music's association with the elegant and the exclusive has led it to being the ideal background to add class, and seriousness, to any occasion.¹⁴⁷ Harpists and string quartets are popular additions to corporate events and weddings not

144 Bashinsky, Ruth, 'Charlotte Church - Almost an Angel', *New York Daily News* (28 November 2001).

145 *Ibid.*

146 Jones, Hannah, 'Enchanting new look from angel who's growing up', *Western Mail* (9 October 2001).

147 Davies expressed his distaste for the classics being worshipped, rather than enjoyed, in 'A case for classical music, old and new'. '[P]erforming Haydn particularly, it is often impossible to be straight-faced. When Alexander Goehr, John Ogdon, Harrison Birtwistle and I were students in Manchester, we were summoned all together to the Principal's office in college, the day after a Manchester Chamber Concerts Society evening had finished with a very funny Haydn finale. It had been impossible not to smile, and even laugh, discreetly. We were told our behaviour was unforgivable in a serious concert, and that we were a disgrace to the college, and should have more respect for the composer and the string quartet.'

primarily for the pleasure of the clients or guests, as such music is invariably talked over; instead, the music provides a backdrop of opulence that offers a subconscious commentary on the prestige of the company or the credentials of the bride's family, a continuation of the custom for noble and wealthy families to publicise and flaunt their engagement with and patronage of the arts. Obvious genres associated with the entertainment of guests include the divertimento and the serenade, both of which peaked in popularity in the eighteenth century and, thanks to social changes and the resulting shifts in fashion, ended with it.¹⁴⁸ Music continues to be used in a similar manner, and the association of classical music and classiness is now so engrained in public consciousness that its value-adding effects are incontrovertible: 'the context of everything we do musically is one of social approval, not to say prestige'.¹⁴⁹

Advertisements use music in much the same way; a car, for example, may be perceived as fun, high-class or cutting edge, depending on the style of music that accompanies the pictures on screen. Nick Cook's commentary on the use of Mozart's Overture to *The Marriage of Figaro* in a 1992 advert for the Citroën ZX 16v, a 'compact hatchback with sporting pretensions', helps to explain how musical meaning can be made to appear obvious, especially when coupled with a second source of narrative (in this case, video footage):

Its overall message is that the ZX 16v represents an ideal synthesis of art and technology, and the music plays an essential role in articulating this dialectic... The final slogan ["The Citroën ZX 16v. Everything about it says quality"] is an accurate summary of what the commercial, as a whole, is saying. It also summarizes what Mozart's music is being used to say... the music imbues the product with the prestige that attaches to classical music in general and (for

148 The *Grove Dictionary of Music* takes extra care in its definition of the divertimento: 'a work primarily designed for the entertainment of the listeners and the players, *without excluding the possibility of high artistic achievement*' (Unverricht, Hubert and Eisen, Cliff, 'Divertimento', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 6 September 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>; my emphasis). Background music is deemed inferior to 'serious', 'interesting' and 'inventive' concert-hall music; yet any kind of classical music is supposedly prestigious compared with today's omnipresent backdrop of pop.

149 Small, Christopher, 'Why Doesn't the Whole World Love Chamber Music?', *American Music* 19, 3 (2001), 350.

people who recognize it) to opera in particular.¹⁵⁰ Meaning, Cook concludes, is something music has done to it, rather than something it inherently possesses,¹⁵¹ but music has the potential to transfer these acquired meanings onto other objects.

The rebranding of classical music as an aid to everything from gardening to bathing shares some features with the phenomenon of using music to add a touch of class to a product. Both are primarily concerned with sales figures; both use recognisable melodies to ensure the potential consumer is familiar with the music's context; both link high culture to a lifestyle or lifestyle product that the target audience is assumed to aspire to. While rebranding has only emerged recently, however, the associations between lifestyle and high culture have been around rather longer than we might think.

Linda Tyler's study 'Commerce and Poetry Hand in Hand' considers the role of the arts in American department stores in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and found significant correlation between the uses of music in marketing then and now:

Owners of large and small stores alike attempted to create desire for their goods through settings that evoked luxury, fantasy, and privilege. Early on in such efforts, merchants discovered music's distinctive capacity to add to this glamorous ambience and help them reach their retailing goals.¹⁵²

Song pluggers (including George Gershwin and Irving Berlin) were hired to sell music to bandleaders and performers, by demonstrating the songs in-store;¹⁵³ in an early precursor of the 'relaxing classics' trend, a 1910 trade journal 'reminded retailers that music kept the sales force "keyed up to the proper pitch. It soothes

150 Cook, Nicholas, *Analysing Musical Multimedia* (Oxford, 1998), 4-8.

151 *Ibid*, 9.

152 Tyler, Linda, "Commerce and Poetry Hand in Hand": Music in American Department Stores, 1880-1930', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 45, 1 (1992), 78.

153 From the website of Warner Chappell, http://www.warnerchappell.com/wcm/wcm_help/ourhistory.jsp (accessed 24 August 2007). See also Berger, Marilyn, 'Irving Berlin, Nation's Songwriter, Dies', *New York Times* (23 September 1989).

tired nerves and makes the tremendous labors... ever so much lighter".¹⁵⁴ By the 1920s, most department stores had their own radio stations to provide music, news and advertisements, helping them promote products in a less subtle manner.

Sales of music, of course, did not miss out; it would be natural for customers to be exposed to music and wish to purchase it. Much like commercial radio, however, the stores found they could manipulate purchases to their own advantage.

Retailers believed they could sell more records and sheet music if they capitalized on and helped create "hits" rather than encourage their customers to browse widely and develop distinctive, individual tastes. The stores wholeheartedly embraced the movement that deified conductors like Toscanini and deceased composers like Beethoven and Brahms.¹⁵⁵

The participation in promoting the big names helped the stores to anticipate demand, and concentrate on stocking certain titles rather than keeping track of an ever-widening range of recordings. Once again, commercial interests are seen to predominate over catering to individuals, yet through skilful machinations, the public believes its collective taste is its own.

Tyler continues:

This mixture of popular and classical music in the majority of programs given in department stores is significant within the broader history of American concert life because it illuminates an important transitional period between the increasing bifurcation of elite and popular music in the late nineteenth century and the popularization and standardization of the classical repertory in the mid-nineteenth century.¹⁵⁶

Lawrence Levine, in *Highbrow/Lowbrow: The Emergence of Cultural Hierarchy in America*, suggests a sudden estrangement between popular and elite that ended with clear segregation, but Tyler's study proposes instead that

The musical enterprises of the department stores... testify to a slower separation of cultural tastes, a more eclectic appreciation of music, a more comfortable interfusion of styles, and at least a partial failure on the part of intellectual elites to fence off classical music for themselves well into the twentieth century.¹⁵⁷

It would seem that the elites never quite managed to fence it off completely.

154 Tyler, 'Commerce and Poetry Hand in Hand', 99.

155 *Ibid*, 109.

156 *Ibid*, 108.

157 *Ibid*.

Classical music has filtered through popular culture to such an extent it is now nearly impossible to watch television, visit the cinema or watch a sporting event without being subjected to the classics in some form. Sports such as football and rugby have commonly featured hymns and anthems, testament to the crossover appeal of sacred music and the power of singing to unite communities. The Three Tenors gave the Italia '90 World Cup its integral Italian sound with 'Nessun Dorma'; they succeeded in bringing high art to a new, and hungry, audience. The most identifiable of the Tenors, Pavarotti, had 'never shied away from commercialism'; his tastes are 'eclectic, or indiscriminate'; he 'has made it his mission to make an art form he loves loved by others'.¹⁵⁸ Pavarotti is now synonymous with crossover.

The Three Tenors TV broadcast drew an audience worldwide of 300 million, and their CD became the bestselling classical album ever after selling six million copies.¹⁵⁹ But the phenomenon did not lose its popularity immediately after their debut appearances in 1990, and so it cannot simply be claimed that the sound captured the spirit of the moment. Katherine Jenkins reportedly struck a deal with the Welsh Rugby Union to sing at all the country's rugby matches; Amici produced 'Eternal Flame' as the theme to the BBC's 2004 Olympics coverage, as well as performing at the FA Cup final and English Rugby Union Challenge Cup final the following year.¹⁶⁰ The BBC chose Andrea Bocelli's 'Canto Della Terra' to introduce their footage of the Euro 2000 tournament, expecting it 'to repeat the success' of 'Nessun Dorma'.¹⁶¹ But Pavarotti's act has, as yet, proven impossible to emulate.

Just two years after Italia '90, football's governing body – the Union of European Football Associations (UEFA) – renamed its European Cup due to the tournament's dwindling international status. To launch the new 'Champions League', UEFA commissioned 'music in a Handelian style' from composer and arranger Tony Britten.¹⁶² The resulting theme, referred to as 'the anthem' by UEFA,

158 Wrathall, Claire, 'Profile: Luciano Pavarotti - You know it's opera when the fat man sings', *The Independent on Sunday* (6 January 2002).

159 *Ibid.*

160 Mansfield, Karl, 'Scores for scorers', *The Independent* (19 November 2005).

161 Kelner, Simon, 'One tenor set for Euro 2000 hit', *The Independent* (13 May 2000).

162 Various authors, 'Questions about UEFA', *uefa.com* (6 June 2002),

<<http://www.uefa.com/fanzone/news/kind=1/newsid=25652.html>> (accessed 18 May 2007).

'is played at the start of all UEFA Champions League matches to accompany the centre circle ceremony and accompanies the opening and closing sequences of all UEFA Champions League broadcasts'.¹⁶³ The anthem's connection to Handel – the dual-nationality star of the Baroque opera world – is difficult to miss through its similarities to the coronation anthem *Zadok the Priest*, similarly designed to suggest a sense of occasion and excitement. The resulting display of exuberant celebration puts members of the foremost football teams in Europe on a level footing with state dignitaries in the same worshipful manner as many of their fans already exhibit.

Associating football with high culture performs a kind of conjuring act: each game can appear devoid of the problems of hooliganism and alcohol-fuelled violence, and the resulting expectation of such behaviour. The Champions League anthem is the antithesis of the chants of 'Three Lions' or *Match of the Day* sung by partying fans: it uses languages foreign to every country involved (UEFA's three official languages are represented in the lyrics), and offers a melody that is not easily sung by amateurs. The peculiar aptness of Britten's Handelian anthem to the Champions League was not lost on others responsible for ensuring football matches could be viewed as classy occasions. In 2001, the UK's Football Association decided to 'enhance the identity' of the FA Cup and 'restore its prestige' along similar lines to those of the Champions League.¹⁶⁴ The rebranding exercise started with the search for a new and identifiable theme, to be used in conjunction with television and radio coverage:

"We want every FA Cup match to have a sense of occasion", said Paul Barber, the head of the FA's marketing department. "We are seeking either a unique piece of music or something fans associate with the competition."¹⁶⁵

This particular project never came to fruition, due to Paul Barber's forced resignation two years later.¹⁶⁶

Nationality is equally communicated through the choice of music. It has been

163 *Ibid.*

164 Moore, Glenn, 'Football: Search begins for FA Cup "theme song"', *The Independent* (5 October 2001).

165 *Ibid.*

166 Winter, Henry, 'Palios forces FA shake-up', *The Daily Telegraph* (28 November 2003).

thoroughly effective in both UEFA's anthem and 'Nessun Dorma', and a facet in the failure of Andrea Bocelli's 'Canto Della Terra' to capture the imagination of BBC viewers for Euro 2000 – hosted by the Netherlands and Belgium.¹⁶⁷ Notions of classical music as an international language are dispelled by this view, and high art is set on a level with folk and peasant musics as an ethnographic identifier. While this is usually successful in suggesting a sense of a place and its people, it can also evoke negative connotations of tourism, exploitation and stereotyping, especially when favouring visual spectacle. Opening and closing ceremonies have become commonplace at large events, and often try to show off the best of the host country at the same time as promoting the message that international participation in the event is, or has been, a positive step towards the ideal of global unity. The additional involvement of dance, costume and flag-waving provides a situation in which local and international are traded off against each other. It is the perfect arena for multimedia crossover, and never more obviously than at the 1995 Rugby World Cup, hosted by a South Africa that was keen to shake off its association with the apartheid era.

Jacqueline Maingard, from the perspectives of theatrical critique and local cultural history, has examined the images and symbols of South Africa, conscious and unconscious, portrayed in the Rugby World Cup ceremonies.¹⁶⁸ The changes in attitude towards the country's political situation in the 1990s can be traced visually through the choreography of the opening ceremony in particular, which was broadcast even in nations that were not participating in the tournament. Characterisations of the opening ceremony commented on both the 'massed tribal dancing, many people committing symbolism in colourful jodhpurs'¹⁶⁹ and 'a country so transparently enjoying its new multi-culturalism',¹⁷⁰ and left behind mentions of any ties to apartheid, which were – according to Maingard – overtly present from the very first acts to appear. In her eyes, the black dances formed in

167 Maume, Chris, 'Euro-watchers will turn again to Auntie', *The Independent* (9 June 2000).

168 Maingard, Jacqueline, 'Imag(in)ing the South African Nation: Representations of Identity in the Rugby World Cup 1995', *Theatre Journal* 49, 1 (1997), 15-28.

169 Smith, Giles, 'Symbolism, stereotypes and Scottish bluff', *The Independent* (28 May 1995).

170 White, Jim, 'The sight of thick-necked Springbok forwards', *The Independent* (27 May 1995).

the anti-apartheid struggle featured in the ceremony as ‘official national property under the new postapartheid regime’, and local black culture was denigrated to ‘an attractive spectacle for tourists’.¹⁷¹

As the arena filled with ‘different groups representing a range of ethnicities, each attired in identifiably ethnic costume distinguishing one from the other and treating each as a separate cultural object’, the musical accompaniment was presented by the black Cape Town vocalist Jennifer Jones; the lyrics of ‘Where the World Began’ (especially composed for the 1995 event) reflected the discernible representation of South Africa as not only a place of unity and racial harmony but as the origin of (human) life on Earth.¹⁷² The human map of South Africa then vanished, and P J Powers (a white South African singer), backed by Ladysmith Black Mambazo (a traditional black vocal ensemble), performed ‘World in Union’, ‘the official Rugby World Cup anthem’.¹⁷³ Once again, the anthem’s words are supposed to contribute to the idea of the unified nation:

the importance of the athletic competition cedes to the representation of harmony. Winning is not the aim. Unity is all. Victory lies in promoting and celebrating different levels of unity: as a nation forged from diverse groups, and as many nations forming one world... one global nation... [a] celebration... cemented by the image of Nelson Mandela.¹⁷⁴

At the same time as being an ‘international symbol of national reconciliation’,¹⁷⁵ Nelson Mandela personifies at once the alienation experienced under apartheid and the nation’s emergence from it. His entrance into the arena, accompanied by the lyrics ‘we must take our place in history and live with dignity’, could not have been timed more appropriately. When pre-existing music offers new narratives under such circumstances, it links itself inextricably to that event. Crossover is

171 Maingard, ‘Imag(in)ing the South African Nation’, 20.

172 *Ibid.*, 22. Jennifer Jones’s artist profile on the Contemporary Africa Database (<http://africadatabase.org>) states that she subsequently supported both Tina Turner and Michael Jackson on tour, and that her debut album *Slow Down* was released to acclaim. Since the late 1990s, however, Jones appears to have disappeared from the public eye, and her only album is no longer readily available.

173 *Ibid.*

174 *Ibid.*

175 *Ibid.*

evident in ‘World in Union’ in the exchange between the Zulu-derived choral delivery and Western-style vocals; in the American pop idiom in which the song is cast; and in the African-style drumming which accompanies the synthetic drum machine. Its resonances of unity between nations are stronger than in the 1991 recording, in which Northern and Southern hemisphere meet but cannot audibly be distinguished.¹⁷⁶ If ‘World in Union’ wasn’t exactly ‘the official Rugby World Cup anthem’ before 1995, the South African performance was to become the authoritative version of the song.

The success of tournament anthems is not always so dependent upon national style. For the commemorative song for Barcelona’s 1992 Olympic Games, political machinations between the International Olympic Committee and Spanish and Catalan communities had been extreme, each striving to express their own fundamental ideals. A country such as Spain is rich in heritage and can display a wealth of musical styles that are instantly recognisable to many an international listener; folk historian Josep Martí i Perez has noted that despite the social discrediting of folklorism through its political manipulation by the Franco dictatorship, its popularity was restored quickly after the regime’s demise: ‘At the end of the 20th century, expressions of local folklore, rare in previous decades, were seldom missing from festivities of big cities’.¹⁷⁷ Furthermore,

because of class segmentation and other higher-order processes, Catalonia, as a native anthropologist observes, has produced an “extraordinary mixture of identities” with ample space for ambiguity, contrast and contradiction.¹⁷⁸

176 ‘World in Union’ had its first outing in 1991: New Zealand opera singer Kiri te Kanawa recorded the pop song derived from a hymn, which had itself been plucked from an orchestral suite, and it reached number thirteen in the UK chart. Despite the song’s longer lasting association with South Africa, the 1995 version only reached number 47 (see <http://www.everyhit.com>).

177 Martí i Perez, Josep, ‘Spain: Traditional and popular music – Contemporary developments’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 31 May 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

178 Pi-Sunyer, Oriol, ‘Under Four Flags: The Politics of National Identity in the Barcelona Olympics’, *Political and Legal Anthropology Review* 18, 1 (1995), 35. The quotation within is sourced from Terradas, Ignasi, ‘Catalan Identities’, *Critique of Anthropology* 10 (1990), 40.

The chosen song, in the end, had little to connect it culturally to the city; other than its name ('Barcelona') and the presence of some Spanish in the lyrics, one of the duettists on the track, Montserrat Caballé, was born there. Instead of presenting traditional folk, a sporting anthem or a song extolling sport's contribution to international relations, the rock group Queen – fronted by Freddie Mercury – teamed up with an operatic soprano and the *Eurovision* songwriter Mike Moran.

Despite a career in which he appeared to model himself on the diva, and despite co-writing and performing 'Barcelona', the 'perfect dream' of performing with Caballé was not Mercury's idea.¹⁷⁹ This was the brainchild of rock producer Pino Sagliocco, whose career is replete with crossover.¹⁸⁰ Joaquin Cortes, a dancer whose fusion of traditional and modern is considered to be the driving force behind the younger generation's renewed interest in flamenco, was noticed, promoted and styled as a rock star by Sagliocco.¹⁸¹ *Pura Pasión*, a *Riverdance*-style dance ensemble stage show co-produced by Sagliocco and Cortes, received its premiere in London's Peacock Theatre in 2001, in which flamenco, African, Arabic and Indian music and dance were produced and staged like a rock concert.¹⁸²

'Barcelona', 'firmly on the terrain of classical music, despite its being marketed as a pop record',¹⁸³ features Mercury's strong (English-language) rock vocals and Caballé's vibrato-laden (Spanish-language) soprano, backed by orchestra, ballad-style piano, humming chorus and synthesised bells and strings.¹⁸⁴ Even the

179 There is the possibility that Mercury's cultural preferences can be considered facets of an 'opera queen': a gay (or, in this case, bisexual) man desiring a female opera icon through empathy, and ultimately aspiring to become her. See Koestenbaum, Wayne, *The Queen's Throat: Opera, Homosexuality, and the Mystery of Desire* (New York, 1993).

180 Sweeney, Philip, 'And the heat goes on', *The Independent* (19 March 1996).

181 *Ibid.*

182 Gilbert, Jenny, 'Dance: Gypsy kings reign in Spain', *The Independent* (25 February 2001).

183 Potter, John, *Vocal authority: Singing Style and Ideology* (Cambridge, 1998), 188.

184 John Potter has referred to this mixture of sounds at the beginning as 'barely connected pastiche introductory statements that no classical musicians would take very seriously, but which align the piece, as far as its intended pop audience is concerned, firmly with high art (mediated by high camp)' in *Vocal authority*, 188. This

song's performance at the 'Le Nit' ceremony, to mark the arrival of the Olympic flag in 1988, was a curious admixture of rock concert lighting, dry ice and a massed noisy crowd (with their lighters) surrounding a stage filled with black-clad orchestra and choir members, while Caballé wore a loose, black and sparkling gown.¹⁸⁵ The two singers perform surprisingly well in duet, yet – having set the scene – the main criticisms are probably already evident. A cultural critic called it 'that melodramatic screech';¹⁸⁶ a sports commentator offered that 'The voices of Freddie Mercury and Monserrat [sic] Caballé may not have been in harmony'.¹⁸⁷ The All Music Guide's expert contributor Geoff Orens stated the obvious: 'Most fans of opera will probably find it far too simplistic and pop-based, while many rock fans are sure to find the record too classical'.¹⁸⁸ If this was indeed true, then the single's high sales figures can be attributed solely to souvenir hunters: 'Barcelona' reached number two in the UK charts in 1987.

John Potter's study of singing style, *Vocal Authority*, characterises Mercury and Caballé to some extent as opportunists 'who each hope that by incorporating elements of each other's style into their own they will widen their respective markets'.¹⁸⁹ Caballé, on the one hand, is restrained by 'ideological baggage' that concentrates on beautiful sound at the expense of intelligible text ('it is difficult at times to tell even what language Caballé is singing in');¹⁹⁰ Mercury, on the other, performs musically but enunciates more clearly, an argument used to suggest popular singing is capable of expressing much more than classical or operatic

argument assumes that 'Barcelona' was targetted at a specifically popular audience, rather than the possibility that viewers of the Olympic ceremonies may not represent a group of uniform musical taste.

185 A recording of the live show can be seen on *Freddie Mercury – The Video Collection*, Music DVD (EMI 169008, 2000).

186 Jack, Ian, 'Notebook: Homage to a prospering Catalonia', *The Independent* (23 January 1999).

187 Del Bosc, Marc, 'Claymores' hopes gone for a song', *The Sunday Herald* (17 June 2001).

188 Orens, Geoff, 'Barcelona', *All Music Guide* <<http://www.allmusic.com/cgi/amg.dll?p=amg&sql=10:1m8n1vgjzzpa>> (accessed 1 June 2007).

189 Potter, *Vocal authority*, 195–196.

190 *Ibid*, 188.

vocalists can.¹⁹¹ In reviewing Potter's book, John Steane (who calls 'Barcelona' 'appalling') disputes the crux of the communication argument thus:

when Pavarotti or Domingo join forces with pop singers they do not come off to such a disadvantage – on the contrary, I would say that if the "wider section of the population" sees a concert of that kind on video or television they are impressed by the tenors as "real singers", and the sheer sound of their singing does communicate almost irrespective of text.¹⁹²

What Potter appears to be aiming for, however, is the acceptance that personal taste ought not to dictate superiority of one genre over another, a goal applauded by Steane, despite his personal preference for the nineteenth-century vocal style that comes out of Potter's book so poorly.

If "classical" musicians and their public suppose that their counterparts in the various branches of "pop" have no taste, or lack the educated intelligence to expound their ideas with precision and the use of a learned apparatus, then one thing that the book should be able to teach them is that this is not so.¹⁹³

Whether Steane likes or dislikes 'Barcelona', whether Potter approves or disapproves of Caballé's choice of project, and whether or not Norman Lebrecht predicts the demise of classical music as we know it, critics can not always write off crossover collaborations as failures when they can stir the public, excite new audiences and even change the stereotype of a nation.

191 *Ibid*, 189.

192 Steane, John, 'Vox pop', *Musical Times* 140, 1866 (1999), 56.

193 *Ibid*, 54.

5 Making Sense of Crossover

Beginning with the idea that crossover defies classification, and then attempting to define it, this thesis has attempted to make sense of a whole manner of contradictions: genres and audiences, people and places, authentic and commercial, ‘high’ and ‘low’. Crossover and hybrid are terms forced into being by the existence of the boundaries they have transgressed, whether musical, social, political or economic, summarised nowhere more concisely than in the title of this thesis. Such conciseness, however, has had to leave open a whole array of questions that the thesis has sought to answer. What is crossover? Why do we need to acknowledge its existence? How has it been successful?

The first of these questions refers to the fact that, despite widespread journalistic use for the past twenty years and application to a variety of hybrid musical ideas, crossover in its musical sense lacked any kind of inclusive definition. This is partially because the term has been used to refer to so many different processes and products that a single definition cannot hope to invoke the sheer scope of usage. The word itself is relatively recent. While the *Oxford English Dictionary* notes uses of the word in textiles (1795), railways (1884), cabling (1893), and biology (1912), the dictionary included music crossovers only as draft additions in March 2007, recording the first printed usage – describing music of one genre appealing to another genre’s audience – as 1973.¹

The term ‘crossover’ was applied first to music which overstepped the boundaries constructed around separate ‘black’ and ‘white’ popular music charts in the US (from 1942’s introduction of the ‘Harlem Hit Parade’ for black music).² The segregation of music into different charts reflected a belief in the segregation of audiences, that one group of people did not share the tastes of another group. Names such as ‘best selling retail rhythm and blues records’ (1949) and ‘hot

1 ‘Cross-over’ [sic], *Oxford English Dictionary Online* (accessed 27 November 2007), <<http://oed.com>>. The entry notes the first usage of ‘classical crossover’ in 1989.

2 This is the sole focus of the definition found in Grove’s *Dictionary of Music*. See Stilwell, Robynn, ‘Crossover’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 18 November 2005), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

country singles' (1962) ostensibly tied each chart to a musical genre, but also provided the industry with statistics on audience demography. Charts are created using consumer data, and the broadcast or publication of any chart is in return a consumer-informing (or -influencing) action; as seen in Chapter 2, charts are undeniably linked to audiences, and so are the boundaries that separate them from one another.

Boundaries in music are an artificial construction, as discussed in Chapter 1; the concept that music produced by one racial group in a society might only be accessible to, and enjoyed by, an audience sharing that racial background seems a peculiar stance, when viewed from the currently privileged position of having a large variety of musics from across the globe accessible to us, instantly, through recordings. Additionally, both 'popular' and 'classical' musical spheres have hosted a proportion of works which have been difficult to pigeon-hole stylistically for a long time, including music for church services, military bands, and songs which are popular enough to appear in the 'pop' chart that essentially belong to the genres of country or rock.

The generally received opinion that 'serious' and 'popular' musicians occupy entirely separate worlds has focussed attention on such artists as Sir Paul McCartney and Elvis Costello, as they crossed over the boundary between the pop and classical domains with their respective symphonic and ballet works (examined at length in Chapter 3). The media, understandably, appear to have been attracted to these (and similar) stories because of the idea that those who worked in 'low' culture somehow elevated themselves to an art form reserved for the elite few, storylines ideal for attracting the scorn of the devotees of high culture at the same time as reminding the masses that anyone can be a creator of timeless classics. Alternatively, if we are to admit *Standing Stone* to the Classic FM 'Hall of Fame', should we reevaluate McCartney's contributions to the music of the Beatles as potential material for the art music canon? Surely the secular music of pre-nineteenth-century composers was also considered popular in its day – have those composers also crossed over?

Received with equal delight by the media are those events which place music of one culture at the heart of an event geared towards a different culture; most

notably, the choice of Puccini's aria 'Nessun dorma' from *Turandot* as the anthem of the 1990 FIFA World Cup in Italy. Football fans were singing opera; Luciano Pavarotti, in effect, became a pop star. Five years later, South Africa's Rugby World Cup boasted 'World in Union' as its official anthem, a pop-meets-African-choir arrangement of 'Jupiter' from Holst's *Planets* suite, featuring South African singer P J Powers and Ladysmith Black Mambazo. Both choices are clearly based on the identities of the host countries, but the messages surrounding their otherwise possibly surprising use may be helpful in understanding this branch of crossover, where boundaries appear to be deliberately violated.

Crossover, therefore, is a *term used to describe the transgression of boundaries linked to public reception*. This may manifest itself as the term was originally used, as *unconscious* appeal to an audience it was not created for. It may also express *conscious* or deliberately manipulated needs. Among these are the use of specific types of music in marketing, in order to imbue the product with a particular quality; attempts by concert organisers or record executives to expand the audience for one music by attracting the audience of another; the fulfilment of a musician's desire (for whatever motive) to write or perform in a different idiom with a different audience; and the adoption or assimilation of aspects of another's music into one's own in order to preserve a hybrid identity (which may also be partially or wholly unconscious).

Where generic affinity may once have defined audience identity, this is no longer the case. The assumption that different groups in society listened exclusively to 'their own' music was proven wrong by the appearance of 'black' music in America's 'white' charts, resulting in the first printed appearance of the term 'crossover'. Neither does generic affinity define social status to the extent it once did. Chapter 4 showed us that opera and classical music may be used effectively to boost the prestige of an advertiser's product without automatically excluding potential consumers. As we have also seen, working-class Liverpudlians and London-based classical music critics attend Sir Paul McCartney's orchestral premières side by side, and tabloid newspaper readers are invited to Royal Opera House performances.

That crossover is so commonplace is a sign that our ideas of public reception –

based on social theory – are no longer relevant. While Bourdieu is the most recent social theorist fitting to this study of similarly recent trends, and his writings are still used by sociologists as though they accurately reflect current society, they too have dated. As seen in Chapter 1, many of his strategies for effecting social change, such as those outlined in *Homo Academicus*, are still valid and useful, yet the highly determinist social structures of which Bourdieu writes have relaxed over the last thirty years, such that social mobility is now more easily enacted. For sociologists, researching crossover – each instance of which is the product of a social change – ensures that findings are recent and relevant.

As with any facet of popular culture, research may be hindered by the rate at which fashions change. Depending on the reasons for and the methods of its production, some instances of crossover will date more quickly. If extreme social changes happen very quickly, such as revolution or war, the circumstances that led to the creation of the hybrid are fleeting, and the relevance of the crossover wanes with them. While this makes it difficult to keep fully informed, the artistic product that remains can be a fascinating snapshot of cultural interactions in their transitional stages. In this case, that crossover may become rapidly outmoded can be a positive reason to examine it more closely.

Not just the hybridity of music but also hybridity in the study of music has accelerated, and continues to accelerate. Musicology has seen numerous developments over the last century, among which the adoption of sociological theories is one of the more recent; the analysis of popular musics, and the application of ethnomusicological techniques to Western musics, are also vital additions to the potential crossover analyst. Together with these fields, a body of empirical data gathered from exposure to broadcasting patterns, marketing techniques, recordings, reviews, and sales data has formed the basis of a number of sections of this thesis. Much can be expressed through the degree to which the industry invests in a product, its reception in critical circles, and the number of consumers it reaches. For the evaluation of any product that relies so heavily upon value judgements, empirical methods should be considered a necessary tool. Musicology now needs to be approached from multiple directions, as once-distinct genres hybridise and the existing analytical methods, used individually, can no longer fully suffice; crossover gives us a model to which we can apply social,

political and economic theories, in addition to those used for classical, popular, and traditional musics.

For these reasons, that crossover has not been considered in depth until now is astonishing; for other reasons, it is hardly a surprise. To understand it is vital because crossover challenges several of the core beliefs of music criticism. By subverting our ideas of discrete genre categories, crossover challenges beliefs about taste and preference. By undermining the link between social class and musical taste, it challenges class identity. By threatening social or economic norms, it challenges the control that state and industry authorities have over cultural affairs. Crossover is therefore not only a puzzle at odds with traditional ways of thinking about music, but also a threat to those who form these ways of thinking about it.

Theodor Adorno saw culture as an industry, its purpose to control consumers in order to produce maximum profit. In 1975, he recorded:

The culture industry intentionally integrates its consumers from above. To the detriment of both it forces together the spheres of high and low art, separated for thousands of years. The seriousness of high art is destroyed in speculation about its efficacy; the seriousness of the lower perishes with the civilizational restraints imposed on the rebellious resistance inherent within it as long as social control was not yet total.³

As we saw in Chapter 2, it is true that taste is indeed manipulated, by the music industry and the media. Yet social control, government-led or industry-led, is still not total, and consumers – if they desire to challenge control – still have the power to do so. We also recognise that the spheres of high and low art have never wholly been separate, and that artistic seriousness is a social attribute mediated by producer and consumer alike. It is clear from his views on, among other genres, opera and jazz that Adorno had little patience with hybrid forms of music.⁴ His outlook, however, was limited in its geographical and chronological horizons to the works of the classical canon. Since in this thesis I have considered several

3 Adorno, Theodor, trans. J Bernstein, ‘Culture Industry Reconsidered’ in *The Culture Industry: Selected Essays on Mass Culture* (2nd ed., New York, 2001), 98-99.

4 See ‘Opera’ in Adorno, trans. E Ashton, *Introduction to the Sociology of Music* (New York, 1976), and the 1936 essay ‘On Jazz’ in Adorno, trans. Susan Gillespie, *Essays on Music* (Berkeley, 2002).

musics from outside this tradition as well as from within it, and sought to base findings on empirical data, Adorno's theoretical discontent can safely be dismissed.

Music critics such as Norman Lebrecht are similarly fearful of the effects crossover can have, and have fought against it as a result. The argument used in such criticism, as detailed in Chapter 3, mainly concerns the supposed purity of the 'high' arts: that interactions with 'low' or 'oriental' cultures leave indelible stains on pieces of Western art music, and starve the original objects of record company funding. The reasoning may not always be consistent, but is invariably strongly worded. Crossover has excited and infuriated commentators for well over a decade; their reactions state that a body of music capable of arousing such feelings must be powerful music indeed.

Of course, a crossover is only powerful if it is first successful, in terms of either cultural or economic capital. Not all of the factors that influence success can be reproduced at will, many of which we have surveyed: a musician may have a monopoly in a unique talent, while another may just happen to be in the right place at the right time, a combination of circumstances that can lead to success seemingly without reason. (As we have seen, record companies are aware that holidays are good times to market to specific target groups, and sales of crossover recordings are consistently higher in the run-up to Christmas.) Any bias in critical reception that promotes crossover, either due to a growing acceptance of the adopted cultural traits or in the form of a populist or anti-establishment critique, may not be entirely controllable but can be encouraged through careful marketing. Imagery and scandal ensure the popular music industry's artists maximum publicity, and this has been adopted by several of the acts surveyed in Chapter 4, such as Bond and the Mediæval Bæbes.

Other factors appear contradictory, but can be explained by the kind of success they have bred. In Chapter 3 it was seen that, in classical crossover, critics tend to find more musical value in hybrids of unusual, early or avant-garde pieces – Sting singing Dowland or Cleo Laine's *Pierrot Lunaire* – rather than the stereotypical 'classical' fare. Commercial success, however, is best assured through rereleases of canonic classics and 'old chestnuts'. Similarly, while a musician's talent,

interest, and experience in multiple musical fields will make a noticeable difference to the quality of the crossover produced, a well-marketed artist with popular appeal who is given wide exposure will have the economic edge. A figure such as Bryn Terfel, discussed in Chapter 3, benefits in both ways, from his personal skill and that of his record company.

It is partly because we associate marketing with mass culture and art music with an elite that the forms of classical crossover that incorporate the largest degree of advertisement have come in for the most criticism. Classical music communicates the details of its performances and recordings in the same ways that it always has: through concert hall brochures, flyers and posters, events listings in newspapers and the like. In order to reach a different audience, the message must be delivered in the same way that the audience receives other communication. Widespread exposure is vital, thus high culture has adopted the successful tactics of the pop industry.

The use of (existing) classical music as the aural background to a sporting event, film or advertisement is one means of attracting a new audience for that music, and – as discussed in Chapter 4 – the inherent association between high culture and quality can affect consumer opinion of the advertised product. People hearing classical music for the first time in these potentially unexpected places have discovered that they do, in fact, enjoy classical music, as witnessed by the huge sales of Pavarotti's recording of 'Nessun Dorma' in 1990. It is also possible for the association between music and product to reverse, resulting in consumers forever recognising pieces as bread, dog food, or aftershave commercials.⁵

At the same time as this perceived move towards popular culture, classical music has also been elevated to fulfil a new social function. The success of Górecki's *Symphony no 3* (1976) in 1992 might be attributable to the lack of religious practice among many in the West, fulfilling a rite's role of reflection and meditation. The same could be said for Sir John Tavener's *Song for Athene* (1993), which rose to prominence through its performance at the widely televised funeral of Diana,

5 In the UK, the first and second movements of Dvořák's *Symphony no 9*, the 'New World', advertised Pedigree Chum and Hovis respectively; Carl Orff's 'O Fortuna' from *Carmina Burana* is likewise synonymous with Old Spice men's fragrances.

Princess of Wales in 1997; it is almost certain that the public display of grief that followed her death fulfilled the same purpose.

This thesis has covered new ground in the definition of crossover and the development of a body of critical resources with which to approach it. Music can no longer claim to have discrete audiences or genres; as the differences between these distinct categories dissolve further, more and more musics will need to consider the resources outlined above. Hybrid musics are currently studied from the ethnographical perspective of identifying their component parts and their respective cultural locations; further comparison between the societies that create these hybrid genres would be fascinating to follow through. As the music industry is continually forced to find new ways in which to manipulate taste, it is inevitable that the role of charts will also change. As I write, the United Kingdom has recently introduced a new chart to contain ‘purely classical’ recordings, in addition to the Classic FM chart already discussed; this is despite the problems of definition surrounding the separation of *Billboard*’s classical and classical crossover charts in the United States.⁶ Continued evaluation of the ways in which classical and crossover repertoire are defined by the industry may offer a helpful appendix to my own definition.

We must not forget that musical genres continually evolve. Part of the cycle of evolution may well include a natural hybridity, which – as discussed in Chapter 1 – occurs as a result of the translation of one community’s cultural products by its destination community. Hybridity may also be forced: either necessarily and unconsciously as a means of negotiating social space, as in the case of the migrant groups discussed above; or consciously, experimentally, for fun, for profit, or for principles, such as those considered by the early exponents of progressive rock. The fact of constant evolution makes most crossover a natural and healthy hybrid that happens all the time. If social forces such as funding restrictions, chart regulations and critical distaste seek to prevent such hybrids from receiving exposure in the hope that they will eventually disappear, we can be assured that they are unlikely to succeed.

6 Service, Tom, ‘The countdown to a proper classical music chart is over’, *The Guardian* (5 February 2009).

There will, no doubt, come a time when music no longer needs to challenge boundaries, and crossover will no longer fulfil the same functions we have discussed; at that point, hybridity will also cease to exist, as all musics can be considered hybrid. Until then, however, crossover should prove a vital and vitalising link between musics and the societies that create them.

Appendix 1

Music Videos Featured by Classic FM TV, 2006¹

(a) Videos of debatable classical provenance, grouped by music genre

World, Folk and Traditional Music (7)

- Bobby McFerrin, 'Circlesong 6'
Bryn Terfel, 'Shenandoah'
Caroline Lavelle, 'Moorlough Shore'
Charlotte Church, 'Carrickfergus'
Clannad, 'Mystery Game'
Enya, 'Amarantine'
Hayley Westenra & Aled Jones,
'Pokarekare Ana'

Popular and Broadway Songs (7)

- Aled Jones, 'San Damiano'
Alex Prior, 'Granada'
Charlotte Church & Billy Gilman, 'Dream a
Dream'
Duetto, 'Oltra La Tempesta'
Joshua Bell, 'Tonight'
Mary Fahl, 'Going Home'
Pavarotti, 'Live Like Horses'

Soundtracks (5)

- Ennio Morricone, 'On Earth as it is in
Heaven' (*The Mission*)
Hans Zimmer & Lisa Gerrard, 'Now we are
free' (*Gladiator*)
Howard Shore, 'May it Be' (*Lord of the
Rings*)
John Barry, 'The John Dunbar theme'
(*Dances with Wolves*)
John Williams, 'Across the Stars' (*Star
Wars*)

Electronica (4)

- Lunz, 'Dew climbs'
Portishead, 'Glory box'
Vangelis, 'Mythodea'
William Orbit, 'Adagio for Strings'

(b) Videos of 'classical' music, grouped by visual content

Live (3)

- Andrea Bocelli, 'Ave Maria'
Bryn Terfel & Andrea Bocelli, 'Pearl Fishers
Duet'
Dominic Miller, 'Albinoni's Adagio'

1 List sourced from <http://www.classicfm.com/tv>; categorisation through viewing
Classic FM TV.

Appearance Aesthetic (11)

Amici, 'Senza Catene'
Bond, 'Victory'
Bond, 'Shine'
Bond, 'Winter'
Lara St John, 'Goldberg 2'
Lara St John, 'Highwire Bach'
Linda Brava, 'Ave Maria'
Maksim Mrvica, 'Flight of the Bumblebee'
Myleene Klass, 'Toccata & Fugue'
The Planets, 'Rodrigo'
Summer, 'Nella Fantasia'

Modern/Minimalist (12)

Andre Rieu, 'Love Theme' (*Romeo and Juliet*)
Andrea Bocelli, 'Canto della Terra'
Angela Gheorghiu, 'Casta Diva'
Catrin Finch, 'Harpers Bizarre'
ERA, 'The Mass'
Josh Groban, 'Questa Notte'
Julia Thornton, 'Goldberg Variations'
Kyung Wha Chung, 'Summer' (*The Four Seasons*)
Ludovico Einaudi, 'Melodia Africana III'
Libera, 'Vespera'
Miriam Stockley, 'Cantus: Song of Tears'
Philip Glass, 'Metamorphosis One'

Appendix 2

Survey of Twenty-Two Best-Selling ‘Relaxing’ Classical Compilations, 2005²

Track information was collected from twenty-two of the best-selling ‘relaxing’ or ‘chillout’ classical compilations from 1999 to 2005. The tracks that recurred most frequently were charted and then compared with Classic FM’s Hall of Fame, a chart of the listeners’ favourite pieces of classical music, in 2006 and 2007. Changes made to the Hall of Fame in 2007 – so that smaller parts of some pieces ('O mio babbino caro', 'Gymnopédie no 1') were now referred to by the full work’s name (*Gianni Schicchi, Gymnopédies*), while others ('Air on a G string', 'Clair de lune', 'Gabriel’s Oboe') were not – prohibit exact comparison with the results from 2006 but nevertheless show a strong correlation.

Of the twenty-six most regularly occurring relaxing classics (all of those with seven or more appearances among the sample of twenty-two albums):

- i) eight/31% appeared in the top twenty of the 2006 Hall of Fame (eight/31% in 2007);
- ii) a further nine/35% appeared in the top one hundred in 2006 (eight/31% in 2007);
- iii) a further five/19% appeared in the remainder of the top three hundred in 2006 (seven/27% in 2007);
- iv) only four/15% did not appear in the Hall of Fame 2006 at all (just three/11% in 2007).

Of the twenty-five highest-ranked classical pieces as voted by listeners for Classic FM’s Hall of Fame 2006:

- i) ten pieces/40% (eight/32% in 2007) occurred on seven or more of the compilations;
- ii) a further eleven/44% (twelve/48% in 2007) occurred on more than one of the compilations;
- iii) a further three/12% (four/16% in 2007) featured on just one compilation;
- iv) just one/4% (and a different one in 2007) was absent from all of the compilations.

A number of hypotheses can be drawn from these figures. Given that the survey was limited to relaxation CDs, the proportion of pieces in the top twenty-five of the Hall of Fame in both years proves the strong association among voters in the Classic FM poll between classical music and relaxation. (The anomalies – the two different pieces that

2 Sourced from <http://www.amazon.com> and <http://www.amazon.co.uk>.

appeared at the top end of the chart – were Saint-Saëns's *Symphony no 3 'Organ'* and Tchaikovsky's *1812 Overture*, neither of which could be sensibly considered relaxing, but each of which is arguably well-known among the general public.) The poll results may influence Classic FM's limited airplay throughout the rest of the year, or the voters (who we assume to be Classic FM listeners, though not necessarily) are influenced by this limited airplay; either way there is little scope for listeners to be introduced to new music, one of the station's stated aims, given this programmer-listener dialogue. The rest of the music industry markets classical music to the very same people as targetted by Classic FM, as shown by this strong correlation between the chart and the CD survey and the similar marketing techniques. (The fact that the relaxation CDs succeeded in reaching the classical chart aired by Classic FM may well have influenced listeners in a similar manner.) If new audiences are to be found for classical music, different marketing strategies – rather than a reliance upon a limited one – may be helpful in finding these new demographics. Whether the industry is more concerned with the saturation rate of its products or the disposable income of its target customers is inevitably going to influence this, however, and as long as the currently targetted group continues to buy classical compilation CDs containing the same limited number of pieces, the record companies will continue to benefit.

Discography of Surveyed Compilations

Various Artists, *The Most Relaxing Classical Album in the World ...Ever!*, audio CD recording (Classics VTDCCD155, 30 March 1999).

Various Artists, *100 Relaxing Classics [Box Set]*, audio CD recording (Pulse PBXCD557, 17 May 1999).

Various Artists, *Night Air: The Relaxing Side of Classical Music*, audio CD recording (Telarc CD80558, 4 April 2001).

Various Artists, *Classical Chillout*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCD408, 10 September 2001).

Various Artists, *Classical Chillout 2*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCD437, 4 February 2002).

Various Artists, *Pure Classical Chillout*, audio CD recording (Decadance DECTV002, 8 April 2002).

Various Artists, *Pure Cinema Chillout*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCD454, 6 May 2002).

Various Artists, *Classical Chillout GOLD [Box Set]*, audio CD recording (Decadance

DECTV005, 4 November 2002).

Various Artists, *The Very Best of Relaxing Classics*, audio CD recording (Decca 4738622, 17 February 2003).

Various Artists, *Most Relaxing Classical Album in the World...Ever! Vol. 2*, audio CD recording (Angel 5669672, 11 March 2003).

Various Artists, *The Very Best of Classical Chillout*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCD524, 7 April 2003).

Various Artists, *The Most Relaxing Classical Music in the Universe*, audio CD recording (Denon B00008RH16, 8 April 2003).

Various Artists, *Classical Chillout [Box Set]*, audio CD recording (Union Square USMCD006, 25 July 2003).

Various Artists, *Very Best Of Relaxing Classics*, audio CD recording (Decca 028947609315, 12 August 2003).

Various Artists, *Classical Chillout Box [Box Set]*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCDX540, 22 September 2003).

Various Artists, *The Only Classical Chillout You'll Ever Need*, audio CD recording (RCA Victor 82876514382, 6 October 2003).

Various Artists, *Very Best of Classical Chillout Gold [Box set]*, audio CD recording (Decadance DECTV013, 3 November 2003).

Various Artists, *Relaxing Classics [Box Set]*, audio CD recording (Decadance DECTV019, 8 March 2004).

Various Artists, *More of the Most Relaxing Classics of All Time*, audio CD recording (Denon B00025ET5K, 1 June 2004).

Various Artists, *Classical Chillout - Platinum*, audio CD recording (Decadance DECTV025, 1 November 2004).

Various Artists, *The Most Relaxing Classical Music in the World... Ever*, audio CD recording (Virgin VTDCD724, 6 June 2005).

Various Artists, *Relaxing Classic FM [Box Set]*, audio CD recording (BMG CFMCD44, 17 October 2005).

Most Regularly Recurring Relaxing Tracks

- (14 CDs) Barber, *Adagio for Strings*
- (13 CDs) Satie, *Gymnopédie no 1*
- (12 CDs) Puccini, 'O Mio Babbino Caro' (*Giannia Schicci*)
- (11 CDs) Albinoni, *Adagio*
- (10 CDs) Beethoven, 'Adagio sostenuto' (*Piano Sonata no 14 'Moonlight'*)
- (10 CDs) Pachelbel, *Canon*
- (10 CDs) Williams, 'Main Theme' (score for *Schindler's List*)
- (9 CDs) Debussy, 'Clair de Lune' (*Suite Bergamasque*)
- (9 CDs) Grieg, 'Morning' (*Peer Gynt suite no 1*)
- (9 CDs) Myers, 'Cavatina' (score for *The Deer Hunter*)
- (8 CDs) Beethoven, *Piano Concerto no 5 'Emperor'*
- (8 CDs) Elgar, 'Nimrod' (*Enigma Variations*)
- (8 CDs) Fauré, *Pavane*
- (8 CDs) Mozart, 'Adagio' (*Clarinet Concerto*)
- (8 CDs) Rachmaninov, *Rhapsody on a Theme of Paganini*
- (8 CDs) Rachmaninov, 'Adagio sostenuto' (*Piano Concerto no 2*)
- (7 CDs) Bach, 'Air on the G string' (*Orchestral Suite no 3*)
- (7 CDs) Bruch, 'Adagio' (*Violin Concerto no 1*)
- (7 CDs) Delibes, 'Flower Duet' (*Lakmé*)
- (7 CDs) Dvořák, 'Largo' (*Symphony no 9 'New World'*)
- (7 CDs) Mahler, *Symphony no 5*
- (7 CDs) Mascagni, 'Intermezzo' (*Cavalleria Rusticana*)
- (7 CDs) Morricone, 'Gabriel's Oboe' ('Nella Fantasia') (score for *The Mission*)
- (7 CDs) Newman, 'Any Other Name' (score for *American Beauty*)
- (7 CDs) Offenbach, 'Barcarolle' (*The Tales of Hoffmann*)
- (7 CDs) Satie, *Gnossienne no 1*

Classic FM Hall of Fame results, 2006-2007

Classic FM Hall of Fame 2006: Top 25

- 1 (3) Mozart, *Clarinet Concerto*
- 2 (1) Rachmaninov, *Piano Concerto no 2*
- 3 (2) Vaughan Williams, *The Lark Ascending*
- 4 (4) Beethoven, *Piano Concerto no 5 'Emperor'*
- 5 (5) Bruch, *Violin Concerto no 1*
- 6 (6) Beethoven, *Symphony no 6 'Pastoral'*
- 7 (7) Elgar, *Cello Concerto*
- 8 (11) Beethoven, *Symphony no 9 'Choral'*
- 9 (8) Elgar, *Enigma Variations*
- 10 (9) Jenkins, *The Armed Man (A Mass for Peace)*
- 11 (13) Vaughan Williams, *Fantasia on a Theme by Thomas Tallis*
- 12 (12) Rachmaninov, *Symphony no 2*
- 13 (10) Grieg, *Piano Concerto*
- 14 (21) Mozart, *Requiem*
- 15 (14) Saint-Saëns, *Symphony no 3 'Organ'*
- 16 (17) Pachelbel, *Canon*
- 17 (19) Holst, *The Planets Suite*
- 18 (15) Barber, *Adagio for Strings*
- 19 (16) Sibelius, *Finlandia*
- 20 (23) Dvořák, *Symphony no 9 'New World'*
- 21 (20) Rachmaninov, *Rhapsody on a theme of Paganini*
- 22 (40) Vivaldi, *The Four Seasons*
- 23 (22) Ungar, *Ashokan Farewell*
- 24 (27) Handel, *The Messiah*
- 25 (34) Mozart, *Piano Concerto no 21 'Elvira Madigan'*

Classic FM Hall of Fame 2007: Top 25

- 1 (3) Vaughan Williams, *The Lark Ascending*
- 2 (7) Elgar, *Cello Concerto*
- 3 (2) Rachmaninov, *Piano Concerto no 2*
- 4 (1) Mozart, *Clarinet Concerto*
- 5 (4) Beethoven, *Piano Concerto no 5 'Emperor'*
- 6 (9) Elgar, *Enigma Variations*
- 7 (5) Bruch, *Violin Concerto no 1*
- 8 (6) Beethoven, *Symphony no 6 'Pastoral'*
- 9 (8) Beethoven, *Symphony no 9 'Choral'*
- 10 (11) Vaughan Williams, *Fantasia on a Theme by Thomas Tallis*
- 11 (13) Grieg, *Piano Concerto*
- 12 (10) Jenkins, *The Armed Man (A Mass for Peace)*
- 13 (16) Pachelbel, *Canon*
- 14 (19) Sibelius, *Finlandia*
- 15 (18) Barber, *Adagio for Strings*
- 16 (39) Beethoven, *Symphony no 7*
- 17 (12) Rachmaninov, *Symphony no 2*
- 18 (29) Beethoven, *Symphony no 5*
- 19 (20) Dvořák, *Symphony no 9 'New World'*
- 20 (14) Mozart, *Requiem*
- 21 (33) Allegri, *Miserere*
- 22 (30) Rodrigo, *Concierto de Aranjuez*
- 23 (24) Handel, *The Messiah*
- 24 (32) Shostakovich, *Piano Concerto no 2*
- 25 (27) Tchaikovsky, *1812 Overture*

Previous year's positions in parentheses.

Bibliography & References

Print Resources

- Aikat, Debashis, 'Streaming violent genres online: visual images in music videos on BET.com, Country.com, MTV.com, VH1.com', *Popular Music and Society* 27, 2 (2004), 222-223.
- Allison, John, 'A step back in time', *The Daily Telegraph* (15 October 2006).
- Anderman, Joan, 'Philip Glass revisits musical score from 1983 film', *Milwaukee Journal Sentinel* (19 January 1999).
- Anderson Hufstader, Alice, 'Beethoven's Irische Lieder: Sources and Problems', *Musical Quarterly* 45, 3 (1959), 343-360.
- Anon, 'Brief Encounter theme is UK's top classic', *The Guardian* (29 March 2005).
- Anon, 'Classic FM TV Helps Drive Record Sales', *Music Week* (February 2003).
- Anon, 'Classic FM TV: Hitting the Right Note', *Promo* (April 2003).
- Anon, 'Classic FM TV on a Global mission', *Broadcast* (11 July 2003).
- Anon, 'Jenny Lind's Concerts', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 4, 80 (1851), 114.
- Anon, 'Music Thought To Enhance Intelligence, Mental Health', *Psych Central* (24 June 2006).
- Anon, 'A Night at the Opera from £7.50', *The Sun* (25 July 2008).
- Anon, 'Rover Album of the Year Winner', *Classic FM Magazine* 90 (June 2002), 33.
- Anon, 'To beat pain, find the right beat', *The Daily Telegraph* (7 October 2006).
- Arnold, Stephen and Hair, Graham, 'A List of Works by Milton Babbitt', *Perspectives of New Music* 14, 2 (1976), 24-25.
- Atwood, Brett, 'Majors Eye New Options for Vid Channel', *Billboard* 107, 29 (22 July 1995).
- Aufderheide, Pat, 'Music videos: the look of the sound', *Journal of Communication* 36, 1 (1986), 57-78.
- Awbi, Anita, 'Classical acts bank on Christmas cheer', *Music Week* (27 November 2006).
- Babbitt, Milton, 'Babbitt-Introduction: A Response', *Perspectives of New Music* 35, 2 (1997), 131.

- Banks, Jack, 'Video in the Machine: The Incorporation of Music Video into the Recording Industry', *Popular Music* 16, 3 (1997), 293-309.
- Baron, John H, 'Vieuxtemps (and Ole Bull) in New Orleans', *American Music* 8,2 (1990), 210-226.
- Bartlett, Thomas, 'Fallen Angel', *Salon* (21 July 2004).
- Bashinsky, Ruth, 'Charlotte Church - Almost an Angel', *New York Daily News* (28 November 2001).
- Beard, Matthew, 'The Classical Hit Parade: From pop to "proper" music', *The Independent* (10 October 2005).
- Beck, Roger and Hansen, Richard, 'Josef Gunzl and His Celebrated American Tour: November 1848 to May 1849', *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 36 (1995), 59-60.
- Berger, Marilyn, 'Irving Berlin, Nation's Songwriter, Dies', *New York Times* (23 September 1989).
- Bergstein, Barry, 'Miles Davis and Karlheinz Stockhausen: A Reciprocal Relationship', *The Musical Quarterly* 76, 4 (1992), 502-525.
- Bertagnolli, Paul, 'Amanuensis or Author? The Liszt-Raff Collaboration Revisited', *19th-Century Music* 26, 1 (2002), 24.
- Bhabha, Homi, *The Location of Culture* (London, 1994).
- Born, Georgina & Hesmondhalgh, Desmond (eds), *Western Music and Its Others: Difference, Representation and Appropriation in Music* (Berkeley, 2000).
- Bourdieu, Pierre, trans. Richard Nice, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Oxford, 1984).
- Bourdieu, Pierre, trans. Peter Collier, *Homo Academicus* (Cambridge, 1988).
- Bourdieu, Pierre and Passeron, Jean-Claude, trans. Richard Nice, *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture* (2nd ed., London, 1990).
- Bracewell, Michael, 'The divine Mr Hannon', *The Independent* (23 August 1999).
- Brantley, Ben, 'Anne Rice's Vampires, With Elton John's Music, Take to the Stage', *New York Times* (26 April 2006).
- Brennan, Luann and Deremer, Leigh Ann (eds.), *Contemporary Musicians* 26 (Detroit, 1999).
- Briscoe, Joanna, 'I got you, Baebes', *The Independent* (17 October 1998).
- British Phonographic Industry, *BPI Market Information* 223 (8 March 2004).

- Brown, Derek, 'Sex, death, booze, bribery, revenge, ghosts ... who said opera is boring?', *The Sun* (30 July 2008).
- Bruhn, Christopher, 'Taking the Private Public: Amateur Music-Making and the Musical Audience in 1860s New York', *American Music* 21, 3 (2003), 260-290.
- Burrell, Ian, 'Record giant spends £6m on operatic quintet hailed as saviours', *The Independent* (5 July 2003).
- Burton, Humphrey, *Leonard Bernstein* (New York, 1994).
- Byrne, Ciar, 'Davies in BBC arts pledge', *The Guardian* (3 January 2003).
- Byrnes, Sholto, 'Nigel Kennedy: "Antagonism vibes me up"', *The Independent* (17 June 2004).
- Campbell, Tom, 'Absolute Master: Gil Evans', *Southline* (4 June 1986).
- Charosh, Paul, "Popular" and "Classical" in the Mid-Nineteenth Century', *American Music* 10, 2 (1992), 117-135.
- Chase, Gilbert, 'Review', *Notes* 31, 2 (1974), 297-299.
- Church, Michael, 'Opera - Nyman is just the ticket', *The Independent* (20 July 2004).
- Church, Michael, 'Review: Sting/Karamazov/Stile Antico, LSO St Luke's, London', *The Independent* (6 October 2006).
- Craig, Dale, 'Transcendental World Music', *Asian Music* 2, 1 (1971), 2-7.
- Cook, Nicholas, *Analysing Musical Multimedia* (Oxford, 1998).
- Cook, Nicholas and Everist, Mark (eds.), *Rethinking Music* (Oxford, 1999).
- Cowen, Tyler, *What Price Fame?* (Cambridge, Mass., 2000).
- Curtis, Polly, 'AHRB set to become research council', *The Guardian* (23 July 2002).
- Davis, Peter Maxwell, 'A case for classical music, old and new', *The Guardian* (10 April 2007).
- Davis, Serena, 'Kings of Crossover', *The Daily Telegraph* (27 April 2004); editorial footnotes, *The Independent* (19 September 1996).
- Day, Julia, 'Classic FM toasts TV success', *The Guardian* (17 January 2003).
- Delacoma, Wynne, 'Glass's soundtrack brings Dracula to life', *Chicago Sun-Times* (29 October 2000).
- Del Bosc, Marc, 'Claymores' hopes gone for a song', *The Sunday Herald* (17 June 2001).
- DeNora, Tia, *After Adorno: Rethinking Music Sociology* (Cambridge, 2003).

- DeNora, Tia, *Music in Everyday Life* (Cambridge, 2000).
- Dickinson, Peter, 'Review: Neil Butterworth, A Dictionary of American Composers', *Music and Letters* 56, 1 (1985), 58-59.
- Di Nunzio, Miriam, 'Bolton embraces new musical road', *Chicago Sun-Times* (2 June 2000).
- Duchen, Jessica, 'Hooked on Classics: Rock stars who attempt the crossover', *The Independent* (16 October 2006).
- DuRant, R, 'Tobacco and alcohol use behaviors portrayed in music videos: content analysis', *American Journal of Public Health* 87 (1997), 1131-1135.
- Dyer, Richard, *Heavenly Bodies: Film Stars and Society* (Basingstoke, 1987).
- Dyer, Richard, 'Il Sogno is Classic Elvis Costello', *Boston Globe* (21 September 2004).
- Dyer, Richard, *Only Entertainment* (2nd ed., London, 2002).
- El-Kodsi, Mourad, *The Karaite Jews of Egypt 1982-1986* (New York, 1987).
- English, James, *The Economy of Prestige: Prizes, Awards, and the Circulation of Cultural Value* (Cambridge, Mass., 2005).
- Fenton, James, 'There is thy Sting', *The Guardian* (14 October 2006).
- Fink, Robert, 'Elvis Everywhere: Musicology and Popular Music Studies at the Twilight of the Canon', *American Music* 16, 2 (2002), 135-179.
- Fisher, Neil, 'Never mind the cassocks...', *The Times* (1 December 2006).
- Fleming, John, 'Renée Fleming, the diversified diva', *St Petersburg Times Floridian* (1 February 2004).
- Fontaine, Rex, 'People: No ivory tower for this pianist', *The Independent* (22 March 1998).
- Forte, Allen, 'Milton Babbitt's Three Theatrical Songs in Perspective', *Perspectives of New Music* 35, 2 (1997), 65-84.
- Foster, Hal (ed), *Postmodern Culture* (London, 1985).
- Foster, Hal, *Recordings: art, spectacle, cultural politics* (Seattle, 1985).
- Frank, Robert and Cook, Philip, *The Winner-Take-All Society: Why the Few at the Top Get So Much More Than the Rest of Us* (New York, 1995).
- Frith, Simon, *Performing Rites: On the Value of Popular Music* (Cambridge, Mass., 1996).
- Gallagher, Rosemary, 'Classic FM TV courts youth with promo push', *Broadcast* (25 April 2003).
- Geiringer, Karl, 'Haydn and the Folksong of the British Isles', *Musical Quarterly* 35, 2

- (1949), 179-208.
- Gendron, Bernard, *Between Montmartre and the Mudd Club: Popular Music and the Avant-Garde* (Chicago, 2002).
- Gent, Paul, 'Easy to like but hard to fall in love with', *The Daily Telegraph* (11 April 2006).
- Gibbons, Fiachra, 'Cor baby that's really mean, Otway tells shops', *The Guardian* (11 October 2002).
- Gilbert, Jenny, 'Dance: Gypsy kings reign in Spain', *The Independent* (25 February 2001).
- Gill, Andy, 'This Week's Album Releases: Aphex Twin, 26 Mixes for Cash', *The Independent* (28 March 2003).
- Gray, Louise, 'Sciopero, Yo Yo Mundi', *New Internationalist* (December 2004).
- Grenfell, Michael, *Pierre Bourdieu, Agent Provocateur* (London, 2004).
- Griffiths, Paul, 'Review: Pierrot Lunaire by Schoenberg, The Greatest Man, at the River, the Circus Band by Ives; Cleo Laine; Nash Ensemble; Elgar Howarth', *The Musical Times* 116, 1584 (1975), 150.
- Goodall, Howard, 'A classic case of woolly thinking', *The Independent* (29 May 2000).
- Gumbrecht, Hans Ulrich and Norton, Roger C, "Phoenix from the Ashes" or From Canon to Classic', *New Literary History* 20, 1 (1988), 141-163.
- Hall, Stuart, 'New Ethnicities' in Donald, James and Rattansi, Ali (eds.), *Race, Culture and Difference* (London 1992), 252-259.
- Hamm, Charles, 'The Fourth Audience', *Popular Music* 1 (1981), 123-141.
- Harper, Jennifer, 'Sexy Looks Strike Chord', *Insight on the News* (6 August 2001).
- Harris, John, *Britpop!: Cool Britannia and the Spectacular Demise of English Rock* (Cambridge, Mass., 2004).
- Harris, Neil, *Humbug: The Art of P. T. Barnum* (Boston, 1973).
- Heidegger, Martin, trans. Albert Hofstadter, 'Building, Dwelling, Thinking', *Poetry, Language, Thought* (New York, 1971).
- Hess, James and Gerstner, Eitan, 'Loss Leader Pricing and Rain Check Policy', *Marketing Science* 6, 4 (1987), 358-374.
- Hewett, Ivan, 'Refined and remote', *The Daily Telegraph* (8 October 2006).
- Higgins, Charlotte, 'I wanted to see what it was like. Now I'm hooked', *The Guardian* (10 September 2008).
- Higgins, Charlotte, 'Relax, Don't Do It', *The Guardian* (6 February 2003).

- Higgins, Charlotte, 'Will Sun readers save opera?', *The Guardian* (9 September 2008).
- Hirshberg, Jehoash, 'The Role of Music in the Renewed Self-Identity of Karaite Jewish Refugee Communities from Cairo', *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 21 (1989), 36-56.
- Hodgson, Martin, 'Sting plucks lute composer from obscurity', *The Independent* (16 October 2006).
- Holden, Anthony, 'Dirty Don lets down the masses', *The Observer* (14 September 2008).
- Holden, Stephen, 'Philip Glass Turns to the Song', *New York Times* (20 April 1986).
- Holt, Fabian, *Genre in Popular Music* (Chicago, 2007).
- Horowitz, Joseph, *Classical Music in America: A History of its Rise and Fall* (New York, 2005).
- Horowitz, Joseph, 'Mozart as Midcult: Mass Snob Appeal', *Musical Quarterly* 76, 1 (1992), 1-16.
- Horowitz, Joseph, *Understanding Toscanini* (New York, 1987).
- Huron, David, 'Music in Advertising: An Analytic Paradigm', *Musical Quarterly* 73, 4 (1989), 557-574.
- Hurwitt, Robert, 'Quick! Someone fetch the garlic and a wooden stake!', *San Francisco Chronicle* (10 January 2006).
- Jack, Ian, 'Notebook: Homage to a prospering Catalonia', *The Independent* (23 January 1999).
- Jameson, Frederic, 'Postmodernism and Consumer Society' in Foster (ed), *Postmodern Culture*, 111-125.
- Jameson, Frederic, *Postmodernism; or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism* (Minneapolis, 1989).
- Jardine, Cassandra, 'They're out of tune - not us', *The Daily Telegraph* (19 October 2000).
- Jeal, Erica, 'Classical Review: Bennett the secret jazz singer', *The Guardian* (12 March 2001).
- John, Elton, 'Elvis Costello', *Interview* (October 2004).
- Jones, Hannah, 'Enchanting new look from angel who's growing up', *Western Mail* (9 October 2001).
- Kassabian, Anahid, 'Ubiquitous Listening' in David Hesmondhalgh & Keith Negus (eds), *Popular Music Studies* (Oxford, 2002), 131-42.
- Keating, Roly, 'Keating on the future of arts on BBC1 and BBC2', *The Guardian* (7 March 2002).

- Kelly, Amanda, 'The artist formerly known as Nigel...', *The Independent* (6 November 1997).
- Kelner, Simon, 'One tenor set for Euro 2000 hit', *The Independent* (13 May 2000).
- Kendall, Lukas, 'From Pee-Wee to Batman to Two Films a Year', *Film Score Monthly* 64 (December 1995).
- Koestenbaum, Wayne, *The Queen's Throat: Opera, Homosexuality, and the Mystery of Desire* (New York, 1993).
- Kosman, Joshua, 'Review: Elvis Costello, Il Sogno', *San Francisco Chronicle* (21 September 2004).
- Kozinn, Allan, 'Music Review: Show Tunes An Atonalist Wrote Before He Converted', *New York Times* (16 October 1999).
- Kozinn, Allan, 'Worlds of Mezzo and Pop Star Meet Somewhere in Between; Elvis Costello: "Let's Make Music"', *New York Times* (21 May 2001).
- Lawson, Mark, 'Beethoven - the pop video', *The Guardian* (25 November 2002).
- Lawson, Mark, 'Lawson on TV - Bach to Basics', *The Guardian* (30 June 2003).
- Lebrecht, Norman, 'The chamber revolution', *The Daily Telegraph* (2 May 2001).
- Lebrecht, Norman, 'Drawing the Classical Line', *La Scena Musicale* (23 October 2002).
- Lebrecht, Norman, 'How to kill classical music', *The Daily Telegraph* (5 December 2001).
- Lebrecht, Norman, 'Ice Queen melts to the blues', *The Daily Telegraph* (14 February 2001).
- Lebrecht, Norman, 'Noxious Crossover', *La Scena Musicale* (14 June 2000).
- Levine, Lawrence W., *Highbrow/Lowbrow: the Emergence of Cultural Hierarchy in America* (Cambridge, Mass., 1988).
- Lipsitz, George, 'Review: High Culture and Hierarchy', *American Quarterly* 43, 3 (1991), 518-524.
- Lister, David, 'Classics in crop-tops cause Brits dispute', *The Independent* (27 April 2001).
- Lloyd Webber, Julian, 'Now classical music can be seen as well as heard', *The Daily Telegraph* (14 Dec 2002).
- Lowe, David, 'Well Don My Sun', *The Sun* (10 September).
- Macan, Edward, *Rocking the Classics: English Progressive Rock and the Counterculture* (Oxford, 1997).
- Maclean, Paul, 'What Orchestrators Do', *Film Score Monthly* 85 (September 1997).
- Maddock, Fiona, 'Rebel With A Cause', *Evening Standard* (26 September 2002).

- Maingard, Jacqueline, 'Imag(in)ing the South African Nation: Representations of Identity in the Rugby World Cup 1995', *Theatre Journal* 49, 1 (1997), 15-28.
- Mainwaring, John, *Memoirs of the Life of the Late G F Handel* (London, 1760).
- Mansfield, Karl, 'Scores for scorers', *The Independent* (19 November 2005).
- Marcus, Greil, 'Review: Brutal Youth, Days Between Stations/Column', *Interview* (May 1994).
- Martin, Denis-Constant, 'Filiation or Innovation? Some Hypotheses to Overcome the Dilemma of Afro-American Music's Origins', *Black Music Research Journal* 11, 1 (1991), 19-38.
- Maume, Chris, 'Euro-watchers will turn again to Auntie', *The Independent* (9 June 2000).
- Maycock, Robert, 'Classical: Style and warmth', *The Independent* (14 July 1999).
- McClary, Susan, *Conventional Wisdom: The Content of Musical Form* (Berkeley, 2000).
- McLeod, Ken, 'Bohemian Rhapsodies: Operatic Influences on Rock Music', *Popular Music* 20, 2 (2001), 189-203.
- Mellers, Wilfrid, 'Review: Questions of Identity', *The Musical Times* 139, 1859 (1998), 28-32.
- Memmi, Albert, 'Mechanisms of Oppression – interview with Albert Memmi' in Maxim Silverman (ed.), *Race, Discourse and Power in France* (Avebury, 1991), 29-39.
- Middleton, Richard, 'Review: Pop Goes Old Theory', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 122, 2 (1997), 303-320.
- Middleton, Richard, *Studying Popular Music* (Philadelphia, 1990).
- Middleton, Richard, *Voicing the Popular: On the Subjects of Popular Music* (New York, 2006).
- Miller, Iain, 'Channel Hopper: Chill out. We can be whoever we like', *The Independent on Sunday* (21 March 2004).
- Miller, Leta and Lieberman, Fredric, 'Lou Harrison and the American Gamelan', *American Music* 17, 2 (1999), 146-178.
- Moir, Jan, 'Opera? Some things are more important', *The Daily Telegraph* (24 October 2003).
- Moore, Glenn, 'Football: Search begins for FA Cup "theme song"', *The Independent* (5 October 2001).
- Negus, Keith, 'Identities and Industries: The Cultural Formation of Aesthetic Economies' in P. du Gay & M. Pryke (eds), *Cultural Economy* (London, 2002), 115-131.

- Negus, Keith, *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures* (London, 1999).
- Nicholls, David (ed.), *Cambridge History of American Music* (Cambridge, 1998).
- Norris, Geoffrey, 'Happy birthday to a composer who can do everything', *The Daily Telegraph* (23 March 2006).
- Nowicka, Helen, 'Sex with minors', *The Independent* (5 November 1995).
- Nyman, Michael, 'Composing the QPR suite', *The Guardian* (21 October 2005).
- Oja, Carol J, 'Gershwin and American Modernists of the 1920s', *The Musical Quarterly* 78, 4 (1994), 646-668.
- Parakilas, James, 'Classical Music as Popular Music', *Journal of Musicology* 3, 1 (1984), 1-18.
- Perry, Tim, 'Pop: Album Reviews', *The Independent* (29 March 2003).
- Peterson, Richard, and Simkus, Albert, 'How musical tastes mark occupational status groups' in Lamont and Fournier (eds.), *Cultivating Differences: Symbolic Boundaries and the Making of Inequality* (Chicago, 1992), 152-186.
- Petho, Csilla, 'Style Hongrois: Hungarian Elements in the Works of Haydn, Beethoven, Weber and Schubert', *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 41, (2000), 199-284.
- Phillips, Sarah, 'Why do so many teenagers love Classic FM?', *The Guardian* (16 May 2007).
- Pidd, Helen, 'Sun readers' exclusive: a night at the opera', *The Guardian* (23 July 2008).
- Pi-Sunyer, Oriol, 'Under Four Flags: The Politics of National Identity in the Barcelona Olympics', *Political and Legal Anthropology Review* 18, 1 (1995), 35-56.
- Potter, John, *Vocal authority: Singing Style and Ideology* (Cambridge, 1998).
- Potter, Keith, 'BBC Concert Orchestra/Wilson, Queen Elizabeth Hall', *The Independent* (9 March 2006).
- Potter, Keith, 'Classical Philip Glass on Film Live, The Barbican', *The Independent* (14 January 2003).
- Reynolds, Nigel, 'Faithfull is Furious over Chart Bar', *The Daily Telegraph* (11 September 1996).
- Rice, Timothy, 'Toward the Remodeling of Ethnomusicology', *Ethnomusicology* 31, 3 (1987), 469-488.
- Rich, Frank, 'Threepenny Opera, With Sting', *New York Times* (6 November 1989).
- Robinson, T, 'Television and music video exposure and risk of adolescent alcohol use',

- Pediatrics* 102 (1998), e54.
- Rogers, Francis, 'Jenny Lind', *Musical Quarterly* 32, 3 (1946), 437-448.
- Roscoe, Christopher, 'Haydn and London in the 1780s', *Music & Letters* 49, 3 (1968), 203-212.
- Ross, Peter, 'He Used To Sing Elvis in Working Men's Clubs', *The Sunday Herald* (23 April 2006).
- Schaedel, Richard, 'From Homogenization to Heterogenization in Lima, Peru', *Urban Anthropology* 8, 3 (1979), 399-420.
- Schulze, Gerhard, *Die Erlebnisgesellschaft: Kulturosoziologie der Gegenwart* (Frankfurt, 1995).
- Seckerson, Edward, 'Nice one, Nigel', *The Independent* (24 June 1996).
- Service, Tom, 'Radio by Robot', *The Guardian* (11 April 2007).
- Shaikh, Thair, 'Mozart's "birthday effect" propels composer to No 1', *The Independent* (18 April 2006).
- Shelemay, Kay, 'Response to Rice', *Ethnomusicology* 31, 3 (1987), 489-490.
- Shenton, Mark, 'Making culture open takes more than money', *The Guardian* (28 July 2008).
- Shenton, Mark, "Opera - We love iiiiiit!" declares The Sun', *The Stage* (31 July 2008).
- Sinclair, Andrew, *Arts and Cultures: The History of the 50 Years of the Arts Council of Great Britain* (London, 1995).
- Sischy, Ingrid, 'The artist who fell to Earth: interview with singer David Bowie', *Interview* (February 1997).
- Small, Christopher, 'Why Doesn't the Whole World Love Chamber Music?', *American Music* 19, 3 (2001), 350.
- Smith, Adam, *The Wealth of Nations* (London, 1776).
- Smith, Giles, 'Symbolism, stereotypes and Scottish bluff', *The Independent* (28 May 1995).
- Sommer, Susan, 'Review: Understanding Toscanini', *Notes* 44, 1 (1987), 54-55.
- Spencer, Charles, 'Billy boy, this is the greatest musical yet', *The Daily Telegraph* (12 May 2005).
- Stabler, David, 'Sting's raw tones', *The Oregonian* (13 October 2006).
- Steane, John, 'Vox pop', *Musical Times* 140, 1866 (1999), 54-56.

- Steward, Sue, 'The Piano man's latest scores', *London Evening Standard* (16 May 2002).
- Straw, Will, 'Systems of Articulation, Logics of Change: Communities and Scenes in Popular Music', *Cultural Studies* 53 (1991), 368-388.
- Strickland, Edward, *Minimalism: Origins* (Bloomington, 1993).
- Sutcliffe, Tom, 'Sondheim and the Musical', *Musical Times* 128, 1735 (1987), 489-490.
- Swed, Mark, 'Editor's Note to Philip Glass's Akhnaten', *Musical Quarterly* 77, 2 (1993), 238.
- Swed, Mark, 'New McCartney epic sings a "massive" song', *The Milwaukee Journal Sentinel* (30 September 1997).
- Swed, Mark, 'Review: Il Sogno', *Los Angeles Times* (27 September 2004).
- Sweeney, Philip, 'And the heat goes on', *The Independent* (19 March 1996).
- Tan, Hazel, 'Bond girls sex up classical music', *Singapore Today* (8 February 2001).
- Tatarkiewicz, Wladyslaw, 'Two Philosophies and Classical Art', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 22, 1 (1963), 3-8.
- Teachout, Terry, 'Review: Fantasies and Delusions: Music For Solo Piano, Billy Joel', *Time Magazine* (12 November 2001).
- Teachout, Terry, 'With An Aria In His Heart', *Time* (13 April 1998).
- Thornton, Anthony, 'Flux: The Divine Comedy/Michael Nyman: The Jaffa Cake', *The Independent* (15 August 1997).
- Tianen, Dave, 'Billy Joel recomposes his future', *The Milwaukee Journal Sentinel* (22 November 1998).
- Turino, Thomas, 'The Music of Andean Migrants in Lima, Peru: Demographics, Social Power, and Style', *Latin American Music Review* 9, 2 (1988), 127-150.
- Tyler, Linda, "Commerce and Poetry Hand in Hand": Music in American Department Stores, 1880-1930', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 45, 1 (1992), 75-120.
- van Eijck, Koen, 'Social Differentiation in Musical Taste Patterns', *Social Forces* 79, 3 (2001), 1163-1185.
- Virtue, Graeme, 'Bond age', *The Sunday Herald* (16 September 2001).
- Wadley, Veronica, 'Editorial: At last, a classic score for QPR', *London Evening Standard* (20 October 2005).
- Wallace, Helen, 'Beyond Cheltenham: Whatever Happened to the Cheltenham

- Symphony?', *Musical Times* 135, 1815 (1994), 308-310.
- Wallis, Roger and Malm, Krister, 'Push-Pull for the Video Clip: A Systems Approach to the Relationship between the Phonogram/Videogram Industry and Music Television', *Popular Music* 7, 3 (1988), 267-284.
- wa Mukuna, Kazadi, 'Creative Practice in African Music: New Perspectives in the Scrutiny of Africanisms in Diaspora', *Black Music Research Journal* 17, 2 (1997), 239-250.
- Watson, Joanne, 'Elvis Costello's Opera-in-Progress, The Secret Arias, Gets Its First Airing in Copenhagen', *The Independent* (11 October 2005).
- Weber, William, 'The Eighteenth-century Origins of the Musical Canon', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 115 (1988-9), 6-17.
- Weber, William, *Music and the Middle Class: The Social Structure of Concert Life in London, Paris and Vienna* (London, 1975).
- Weber, William, *The Rise of Musical Classics in Eighteenth-Century England: A Study in Canon, Ritual and Ideology* (Oxford, 1992).
- Webster, Dan, 'When a Man Loves Opera, He Doesn't Sing the Blues', *The Spokesman Review* (13 February 1998).
- Wells, Matt, 'Classic FM gambles on 24-hour TV music channel', *The Guardian* (25 November 2002).
- Werde, Bill, 'Payola Probe Heating Up', *Rolling Stone* (1 November 2004).
- White, Jim, 'The sight of thick-necked Springbok forwards', *The Independent* (27 May 1995).
- White, Michael, 'From Abbey Road to the Albert Hall', *The Independent* (5 October 1997).
- Williams, Kevin M, 'Clearly Classical', *Chicago Sun-Times* (26 October 1999).
- Winick, Steve, 'At the Ren Faire with Mediæval Bæbes', *Dirty Linen* 129 (April 2007).
- Winter, Henry, 'Palios forces FA shake-up', *The Daily Telegraph* (28 November 2003).
- Wise, Brian, 'The Growing Field of Interpreting Billy Joel', *New York Times* (5 August 2006).
- Witts, Richard, *Artist Unknown: An Alternative History of the Arts Council* (London, 1998).
- Woodcraft, Molloy, 'Review: Elvis Costello, Il Sogno', *The Observer* (19 September 2004).
- Wrathall, Claire, 'Profile: Luciano Pavarotti - You know it's opera when the fat man sings', *The Independent on Sunday* (6 January 2002).
- Wyatt, Robert, 'Review: Fantasies and Delusions', *American Music Teacher* (April-May 2002).

Wyatt, Robert, 'The Seven Jazz Preludes of George Gershwin: A Historical Narrative', *American Music* 7, 1 (1989), 68-85.

Young, Robert, *Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race* (London, 1995).

Yurkiw, Chris, 'Interview: In a Weill Mood', *Montreal Mirror* (26 June 1997).

Liner Notes

Bernstein, Leonard, *Bernstein conducts West Side Story*, audio CD reissue (Deutsche Grammophon GH 457 199-2, 1998/originally 1985).

Bolton, Michael, *My Secret Passion – The Arias*, audio CD recording (Sony B00005620W, 1998).

McCartney, Paul, *Working Classical*, audio CD recording (EMI B00001ZSXH, 1999).

Metallica/San Francisco Symphony Orchestra, *S&M*, audio CD recording (Elektra 62463-2, 1999).

The Planets, *Classical Graffiti*, audio CD recording (EMI 57316, 2003).

Sting, *Songs From the Labyrinth*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 1703139, 2006).

Online Resources

Anson, Philip, 'Bryn Terfel Interview', *La Scena Musicale* 3, 4 (1997),
<<http://www.scena.org/lsm/sm3-4/sm3-4terfel.htm>> (accessed 1 February 2007).
Bergsagel, John, 'Bull, Ole', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 17 July 2006),
<<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.

BBC Online, 'Blackburn victory over Cliff ban' (25 June 2004),
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/tv_and_radio/3835743.stm> (accessed 4 January 2007).

BBC Online, 'Chart ban over multiple downloads' (13 March 2006),
<<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/4802804.stm>> (accessed 4 January 2007).

BBC Online, 'Classical chart bans quartet' (16 October 2000),
<<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/974658.stm>> (accessed 27 February 2007).

BBC Online, 'Classical Sales Up By One Million' (8 March 2004),
<<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/music/3542187.stm>> (accessed 4 January 2007).

BBC Online, 'French Muslims face job discrimination' (2 November 2005),

- <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/4399748.stm>> (accessed 21 October 2009).
- BBC Online*, ‘Mozart “UK’s favourite composer”’ (18 April 2006),
 <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/4917892.stm>> (accessed 29 March 2007).
- BBC Online*, ‘Silent music dispute resolved’ (23 September 2002),
 <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/music/2276621.stm>> (accessed 12 April 2007).
- Blaine, Richard, ‘Philip Glass and Richard D James’, *Future Music* 36 (October 1995),
 <<http://xltronic.com/nostalgia/aphextwin.nu/v4/learn/98136033774967.shtml>>
 (accessed 1 February 2007).
- Blake, David, ‘Orbit vs. Elgar/Payne: What Constitutes Classical Music’ (14 May 2000),
 <<http://www.naxos.com/newDesign/fopinions.files/bopinions.files/industry2.htm>>
 (accessed 4 January 2007).
- Blyth, Alan and Sadie, Stanley, ‘Pavarotti, Luciano’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy
 (accessed 15 March 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- British Phonographic Industry, *Classical Trade Deliveries 2003*,
 <http://www.bpi.co.uk/pdf/classical_2003.pdf> (accessed 1 February 2007).
- Cairns, David, ‘Toscanini, Arturio’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 15 March
 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Chan, Wah Keung, ‘Bryn Terfel In His Own Words’, *La Scena Musicale* 7, 7 (2002),
 <<http://www.scena.org/lsm/sm7-7/terfel-en.html>> (accessed 1 February 2007).
- Competition Commission Inquiry Report, ‘The supply of recorded music: A report on the
 supply in the UK of prerecorded compact discs, vinyl discs and tapes containing
 music’ (June 1994), <http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/rep_pub/reports/1994/356recordedmusic.htm> (accessed 4
 January 2007).
- Field, Christopher et al., ‘Fantasia’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L. Macy (accessed 14 June
 2006), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Hartz, Daniel and Brown, Bruce, ‘Classical’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 9
 December 2008), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Hurwitz, David, ‘The Crossover Mentality’, *Classics Today* (November 2001),
 <http://www.classicstoday.com/features/f3_1101.asp> (accessed 1 February 2007).
- Inskeep, Steve, ‘Classical Music gets MTV Treatment’, *Morning Edition* (NPR broadcast, 5
 October 2004), <<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=4061540>>
 (accessed 18 June 07).

- Jariwalla, Waheedan, 'Sony BMG Pays \$10 Million to Settle Payola Investigation',
<[http://www.lawdit.co.uk/reading_room/room/view_article.asp?name=../articles/16.3%20Sony%20BMG%20Pays%20\\$10%20Million.htm](http://www.lawdit.co.uk/reading_room/room/view_article.asp?name=../articles/16.3%20Sony%20BMG%20Pays%20$10%20Million.htm)>
(accessed 4 January 2007).
- Jensen, Michael, 'Den hemmelige opera', *urban.dk* (2 March 2007),
<<http://www.urban.dk/article/20070302/urban/103020015/0>> (accessed 26 February 2009).
- Lebrecht, Norman, 'Sting switches strings', *La Scena Musicale* (27 September 2006),
<<http://www.scena.org/columns/lebrecht/060927-NL-sting.html>> (accessed 1 February 2007).
- Le Guern, Philippe, 'From National Pride to Global Kitsch: the Eurovision Song Contest',
Web Journal of French Media Studies 3, 1 (October 2000),
<<http://wjfms.ncl.ac.uk/leguWJ.htm>> (accessed 4 January 2007).
- Lunden, Jeff, 'Going Portable with Classical Music Downloads', *All Things Considered* (NPR broadcast, 6 May 2006), <<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=5388986>> (accessed 4 January 2007).
- Market Wire, 'Music From the Motion Picture The Illusionist, Featuring an Original Score by Philip Glass' (July 2006),
<http://www.findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_pwwi/is_200607/ai_n16632044>
(accessed 1 February 2007).
- Martí i Perez, Josep, 'Spain: Traditional and popular music – Contemporary developments', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 31 May 2007),
<<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Mattison, Ben, 'Andrea Bocelli to Debut With New York Philharmonic', *Playbill Arts* (28 April 2006), <<http://www.playbillarts.com/news/article/4449.html>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).
- McArthur, Colin, 'Star Wars music, Bond and soft porn?', *Scotland On Sunday* (13 July 2003), <<http://scotlandonsunday.scotsman.com/review.cfm?id=759062003>>
(accessed 28 August 2007).
- Millington, Barry, 'Rattle, Sir Simon', *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 15 March 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Murray, Matthew, 'Broadway Review: The Threepenny Opera', *Talkin' Broadway* (20 April 2006), <<http://www.talkinbroadway.com/world/Threepenny2006.html>> (accessed 1 February 2007).
- Orens, Geoff, 'Barcelona', *All Music Guide* <<http://www.allmusic.com/cg/amg.dll>?>

- p=amg&sql=10:1m8n1vgjzzpa> (accessed 1 June 2007).
- Oxford English Dictionary Online*, ‘Cross-over’, <<http://oed.com>> (accessed 27 November 2007).
- Oxford English Dictionary Online*, ‘Hybridisation’, <<http://oed.com>> (accessed 23 April 2007).
- Phillips, Trevor, ‘After 7/7: Sleepwalking to segregation’ (22 September 2005),
<<http://83.137.212.42/sitearchive/cre/Default.aspx?LocID=0hgnew07s.RefLocID=0hg00900c002.Lang-EN.htm>> (accessed 22 October 2009).
- Radio Today*, ‘Mark Briggs leads United Radio’ (7 April 2006),
<<http://www.radiotoday.co.uk/news.php?extend.657>> (accessed 4 January 2007).
- Reavley, Morag, ‘Russell Watson: *Reprise* (Decca)’, *BBC Online* (19 December 2002)
<<http://www.bbc.co.uk/music/release/bzw6/>> (accessed 4 January 2007).
- Smith, Tony, ‘Woolworths to take on Apple iTunes store’, *The Register* (8 September 2004), <http://www.theregister.co.uk/2004/09/08/woolies_music_download> (accessed 4 January 2007).
- Stilwell, Robynn, ‘Crossover’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 18 November 2005), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Tak, Wing Chan et al, ‘Briefing no. 7’ in *Attendance at music events and participation in musical activities in England: Findings from the Taking Part Survey* (April 2008),
<http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/documents/projects/music_phpEH9JV3.pdf> (accessed 5 November 2008).
- Unverricht, Hubert and Eisen, Cliff, ‘Divertimento’, *Grove Music Online* ed. L Macy (accessed 6 September 2007), <<http://www.grovemusic.com>>.
- Various authors, ‘Questions about UEFA’, *uefa.com* (6 June 2002),
<<http://www.uefa.com/fanzone/news/kind=1/newsid=25652.html>> (accessed 18 May 2007).
- The 5 Browns (official site) <<http://www.the5browns.com>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).
- Amazon <<http://www.amazon.co.uk>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).
- Amici (official site) <<http://www.amiciforever.com>> (last accessed 2 April 2007).
- Andrea Bocelli (official site) <<http://www.andreabocelli.com>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).
- Arts Council England <<http://www.artscouncil.org.uk>> (last accessed 21 November 2008).

Barbra Streisand (official site) <<http://barbrastreisand.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

BBC Four <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/bbcfour>> (last accessed 15 May 2008).

BBC Radio One <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/radio1>> (last accessed 12 March 2008).

Billboard <<http://www.billboard.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Bond (official site) <<http://www.bondmusic.net>> (last accessed 16 March 2007).

Boston Pops Orchestra <<http://www.bso.org>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Classic FM <<http://www.classicfm.com>> (last accessed 29 March 2007).

Cleo Laine (official site) <<http://www.quarternotes.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Contemporary Africa Database <<http://africadatabase.org>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Decca Classics <<http://www.deccaclassics.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Department for Culture, Media and Sport <<http://www.culture.gov.uk>> (last accessed 21 November 2008).

Deutsche Grammophon <<http://www.deutschegrammophon.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

EveryHit, amateur UK top 40 database <<http://www.everyhit.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Gcap Media <<http://commercial.gcapmedia.com>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).

Hayley Westenra (official site) <<http://www.hayleywestenra.com>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).

Jacques Loussier (official site) <<http://www.loussier.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

JPGR, amateur Beatles fan site <<http://www.jpgr.co.uk>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Karl Jenkins (official site) <<http://www.karljenkins.com>> (last accessed 29 March 2007).

Keith Emerson (official site) <<http://www.keithemerson.com>> (last accessed 4 March 2007).

Little Death Orchestra (official site) <<http://www.littledeath.co.uk>> (last accessed 19 February 2006).

Maksim Mrvica (official site) <<http://217.199.173.171>> (last accessed 16 March 2007).

Matthew Francis (research) <www.matthew-francis.co.uk> (last accessed 28 July 2007).

Mediæval Bæbes (official site) <<http://www.mediaevalbaebes.com>> (last accessed 2 April 2007).

MHz Networks <<http://www.mhznetworks.org>> (last accessed 16 March 2007).

The Modern Official Forum <<http://bb01.mer.uk.vvhp.net>> (last accessed 5 May 2006).

The Official UK Charts Company <<http://www.theofficialcharts.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Pride of Manchester <<http://www.prideofmanchester.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

RCA Records <<http://www.rcalabelgroup.co.uk>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).

Renée Fleming (official site) <<http://www.renee-fleming.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Russell Watson (official site) <<http://www.russell-watson.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Sarah Brightman (official site) <<http://www.sarah-brightman.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Sky Arts <<http://www.skyarts.co.uk>> (last accessed 15 May 2008).

Somethin' Else <<http://somethinelse.com>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).

Sony BMG <<http://www.sonybmgmasterworks.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Sony Classical <<http://www.sonyclassical.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Union Square <<http://www.unionsquaremusic.co.uk>> (last accessed 4 January 2007).

Vanessa Mae (official site) <<http://www.vanessa-mae.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Warner Chappell Music Ltd <<http://www.warnerchappell.com>> (last accessed 24 August 2007).

Wendy Carlos (official site) <<http://www.wendycarlos.com>> (last accessed 1 February 2007).

Woolworths Archives <<http://museum.woolworths.co.uk>> (last accessed 5 May 2006).

The X Factor Fan Forum <<http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/forums/forumdisplay.php?f=96>> (last accessed 5 May 2006).

Selected Discography

- 5 Browns, The, *No Boundaries*, audio CD recording (RCA Red Seal 78719, 2006).
- Amici, *The Opera Band*, audio CD recording (RCA Victor 82876640832, 2002).
- Aphex Twin, *26 Mixes for Cash*, audio CD recording (Warp CD102, 2003).
- Bennett, Richard Rodney, *Lady Caroline Lamb, Elegy for Caroline Lamb, Murder on the Orient Express*, audio CD recording (EMI 5861882, 2004).
- Bennett, Richard Rodney, *Sea Change: The Choral Music of Richard Rodney Bennett*, SACD recording (Collegium CSACD901, 2004).
- Berlin Philharmonic/Sir Simon Rattle, *Mahler: Symphony no 5*, audio CD recording (EMI 5573852, 2002).
- Bob Delynl a'r Ebillion, *Gedon*, audio CD recording (Crai CD021, 1994).
- Bocelli, Andrea, *Amor*, audio CD recording (Universal Latino 653455, 2006).
- Bolton, Michael, *My Secret Passion – The Arias*, audio CD recording (Sony SK63077, 1998).
- Bond, *Born*, audio CD recording (Decca 00289 470 0402, 2001).
- Bowie, David/Eno, Brian, *Low: Remastered*, audio CD remaster (EMI 5219070, 1999/originally 1977).
- Brightman, Sarah, *Fly*, audio CD recording (WEA 0630-17256-2, 1996).
- Brightman, Sarah, *La Luna*, audio CD recording (Angel 56968, 2000).
- Carlos, Wendy, *Switched-on Bach*, audio CD remaster (ESD 81602, 2001).
- Cheb Khaled, *Khaled*, audio CD recording (Barclay 511815-2, 1992).
- Church, Charlotte, *Voice of an Angel*, audio CD recording (Sony Classical 60957, 1999).
- Costello, Elvis, *Il Sogno*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon CD4715772, 2004).
- Costello, Elvis, *The Juliet Letters*, audio CD recording (Warner 9362-45180-2, 1992).
- Davis, Miles, *Sketches of Spain*, audio CD remaster (Colombia CK 65142, 1997/originally 1960).
- Deep Purple/Royal Philharmonic Orchestra, *Concerto for Group and Orchestra*, audio CD reissue (EMI CDP 7 94886 2, 1990/originally 1969).
- Emerson, Lake & Palmer, *Emerson, Lake and Palmer*, audio CD remaster (Sanctuary CMRCD165, 2001/originally 1970).
- Enigma, *Love Sensuality Devotion - The Greatest Hits*, audio CD recording (Virgin

- CDVIR150, 2001).
- Ensiferum, *Victory Songs*, audio CD recording (Spinefarm SPI274CD, 2007).
- Faithfull, Marianne, *20th Century Blues*, audio CD recording (RCA Victor 74321-38656-2, 1996).
- Fleming, Renée, *Haunted Heart*, audio CD recording (Decca 9880602, 2005).
- Fleming, Renée, *Sacred Songs*, audio CD recording (Decca 4756925, 2005).
- Flórez, Juan Diego, *Sentimiento Latino*, audio CD recording (Universal 000629502, 2006).
- Gabriel, Peter, *So*, audio CD recording (Realworld CDA PGCDR5, 1986).
- Garmarna, *Vedergällningen*, audio CD recording (MNW MNWCD337, 1999).
- Gen-Dos, *Shizo i.d.*, audio CD recording (Sketis SKMR029, 2006).
- Genesis, *Selling England by the Pound*, audio CD remaster (Virgin 8397772, 1994/originally 1973).
- Gershwin, George, *Rhapsody in Blue*, *An American in Paris*, *Concerto in F*, audio CD recording (EMI Classics CDU66943, 1999).
- Glass, Philip, *The Illusionist*, audio CD recording (Ryko RCD10884, 2006).
- Glass, Philip, ‘Low’ Symphony/‘Heroes’ Symphony, audio CD recording (Pid B000A2PFKS, 1999/originally 1992, 1997).
- Glass, Philip, *Songs From Liquid Days*, audio CD recording (CBS Masterworks MK39564, 1986).
- Gáte, *I selilja*, audio CD recording (Warner WEA5050467 544826, 2004).
- Horslips, *The Book of Invasions: A Celtic Symphony*, audio CD remaster (Edsel EDCD667, 2000/originally 1976).
- Il Divo, *Il Divo*, audio CD recording (Sony CK93963, 2005).
- Jenkins, Karl, *Adiemus – Songs of Sanctuary*, audio CD recording (Virgin/Carol-7524-2, 1995).
- Jenkins, Karl, *The Armed Man – A Mass for Peace*, audio CD recording (Virgin CDVE956, 2001).
- Jenkins, Katherine, *Living A Dream*, audio CD recording (UCJ 77266, 2005).
- Jethro Tull, *A Passion Play*, audio CD recording (Chrysalis CDP321040-2, 1990/originally 1973).
- Jethro Tull, *Thick as a Brick*, audio CD remaster (EMI 7243495400-2-6, 1998/originally 1972).

- Joel, Billy, *Fantasies and Delusions*, audio CD recording (Sony 85397, 2001).
- Kennedy, Nigel, *Greatest Hits*, audio CD recording (EMI 5574112, 2002).
- Klass, Mylene, *Moving On*, audio CD recording (Universal 9865632, 2003).
- Ladysmith Black Mambazo feat. PJ Powers, *World in Union '95*, audio CD recording (Polygram TV RUGBY2, 1995).
- Laine, Cleo/Nash Ensemble/Elgar Howarth, *Pierrot Lunaire/Ives Songs*, vinyl LP (RCA Red Seal LRL15058, 1974).
- Lang Lang, *Memory*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 000582772, 2006).
- Libera, *Libera*, audio CD recording (Erato 3984 290532, 1999).
- Loussier, Jacques, *Play Bach no 1*, audio CD remaster (Decca 157561, 2001/originally 1959).
- Ma, Yo-Yo/Roma Sinfonietta Orchestra/Morricone, *Yo-Yo Ma Plays Ennio Morricone*, audio CD recording (Sony Classical 93456, 2004).
- Maksim, *Electrik*, audio CD recording (EMI 094637037720, 2006).
- McCartney, Paul/Davis, Carl, *Liverpool Oratorio*, audio CD recording (EMI 54371, 1996).
- McCartney, Paul, *Standing Stone*, audio CD recording (EMI 56484, 1997).
- McCartney, Paul, *Working Classical*, audio CD recording (EMI 56897, 1999).
- McFerrin, Bobby, *Circlesongs*, audio CD recording (Sony Classical 62734, 1997).
- Mediæval Bæbes, *Salva Nos*, audio CD recording (Virgin CDVE935, 1997).
- Mercury, Freddie/Caballé, Montserrat, *Barcelona*, audio CD recording (Polydor CDPOLH44, 1987).
- Metallica/San Francisco Symphony Orchestra, *S&M*, audio CD recording (Elektra 62463-2, 1999).
- Moody Blues, The, *Days of Future Passed*, audio CD remaster (Polydor UDCCD-512, 1997/originally 1967).
- Mormon Tabernacle Choir, *Then Sings My Soul*, audio CD recording (Mormon Tabernacle 70036, 2006).
- Mullova, Viktoria/Labèque, Katia, *Recital*, audio CD recording (Onyx 4015, 2005).
- N'Dour, Youssou, *Hey You!: The Essential Collection 1988-1990*, audio CD recording (Nascente NSCD018, 1998).
- Nice, The/Sinfonia of London, *Five Bridges*, audio CD reissue (Virgin CASCD 1014, 1990/originally 1969).

- Nyman, Michael, *A la Folie (Six Days, Six Nights)*, audio CD recording (Virgin Venture 72438 39949-22, 1994).
- Nyman, Michael, *Time Will Pronounce*, audio CD recording (Argo CD 440 282-2, 1993).
- Ojos de Brujo, *Techarí*, audio CD recording (Diquela DQRCD05, 2006).
- Osimira, *Proshcha*, audio CD recording (Sketis SKMR028, 2004).
- Pavarotti, Luciano, *Nessun Dorma/O Sole Mio*, audio CD recording (Decca PAVCD3, 1990).
- Planets, The, *Classical Graffiti*, audio CD recording (EMI 57316, 2003).
- Rieu, André, *The Flying Dutchman*, audio CD recording (Denon DEN17570, 2004).
- Royal Philharmonic Orchestra/Louis Clark, *Hooked on Classics*, audio CD recording (K-Tel ECD3265, 1996/originally 1981).
- Runrig, *Amazing Things*, audio CD recording (Chrysalis CDCHR2000, 1993).
- Scholl, Andreas, *A Musically Banquet*, audio CD recording (Decca 466917, 2001).
- Simon, Paul, *Graceland*, audio CD recording (Warner CD925447-2, 1986).
- Sting, Faithfull et al, *Lost in the Stars: The Music of Kurt Weill*, audio CD recording (A&M 3951042, 1985).
- Sting, *Songs From The Labyrinth*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 1703139, 2006).
- Streisand, Barbra, *Classical Barbra*, audio CD rerelease (Sony 33452, 1990).
- Terfel, Bryn, *Bryn Terfel Sings Favourites*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 4747032, 2003).
- Terfel, Bryn, *Silent Noon*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 4742192, 2005).
- Terfel, Bryn, *Simple Gifts*, audio CD recording (Deutsche Grammophon 4775919, 2005).
- Terfel/Fleming, *Renée and Bryn: Under the Stars*, audio CD recording (Decca 4732502, 2003).
- US Army Field Band & Soldiers' Chorus, *Duty, Honor, Country*, audio CD recording (Altissimo 2255842, 2006).
- Vanessa-Mae, *The Violin Player*, audio CD recording (EMI 7243 5 55089 2 8, 1995).
- Various Artists, *Match Point*, audio CD recording (Milan M2-36145, 2005).
- Various Artists, *The Opera Album 2006*, audio CD recording (UCJ 4769833, 2006).
- Watson, Russell, *The Voice – The Ultimate Collection*, audio CD recording (Decca 074

3238, 2006).

Westenra, Hayley, *Odyssey*, audio CD recording (Decca 4757027, 2005).

Westenra, Hayley, *Pure*, audio CD recording (Decca 4733002, 2004).

Whelan, Bill, *Riverdance: Music from the Show*, audio CD recording (Decca DCAU53076.2, 1997).

Williams, John, *Memoirs Of A Geisha*, audio CD recording (Sony SK74708, 2005).

Yothu Yindi, *Tribal Voice*, audio CD recording (Mushroom MUSH32463.2, 1992).

Zimmer, Hans/Gerrard, Lisa, *Gladiator*, audio CD recording (Decca 467094, 2001).

Начало Века [Nachalo Veka], Этнограмма [*Etnogramma*], audio CD recording (Soyuz SZCD4486-07, 2007).