

Eighteenth Century Music

<http://journals.cambridge.org/ECM>

Additional services for *Eighteenth Century Music*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



ABSENT CADENCES

DANUTA MIRKA

Eighteenth Century Music / Volume 9 / Issue 02 / September 2012, pp 213 - 235

DOI: 10.1017/S147857061200005X, Published online: 30 July 2012

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S147857061200005X

How to cite this article:

DANUTA MIRKA (2012). ABSENT CADENCES. *Eighteenth Century Music*, 9, pp 213-235

doi:10.1017/S147857061200005X

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

ABSENT CADENCES

DANUTA MIRKA



ABSTRACT

The slow movement of Symphony No. 64 in A major, ‘Tempora mutantur’, has long intrigued Haydn scholars on account of its absent cadences and enigmatic form. The Latin title of the symphony is thought to be derived from the epigram by John Owen, a near-contemporary of Shakespeare, and it was used by Elaine Sisman to support her hypothesis that the slow movement formed part of Haydn’s incidental music for Shakespeare’s Hamlet. The enigma can be explained through an analysis informed by concepts native to eighteenth-century music theory. The absent cadences create instances of ellipsis, a rhetorical figure described by Johann Adolph Scheibe and Johann Nikolaus Forkel, and the form plays with a familiar template codified by Heinrich Christoph Koch. This analysis leads to a different interpretation. Rather than suggesting the protagonist of Shakespeare’s tragedy, the movement stages a fictive composer in an act of musical comedy not dissimilar to that in Symphony No. 60, ‘Il Distratto’. The title comes not from Owen but from a Latin adage that was incorporated by Owen into his epigram. This adage had been popular in Germany since the Reformation and was then applied by one eighteenth-century music theorist to describe changes of musical conventions.

Arguably the most eccentric movement Haydn ever composed.

James Webster¹

‘TEMPORA MUTANTUR ETC.’

‘It would take an entire article to describe this extraordinary movement adequately. I mention here merely its inability to complete musical phrases properly, its discontinuities of material, dynamics, and register, its refusal to execute an intelligible form (I could go on).’² With these words James Webster refers to the slow movement of Haydn’s Symphony No. 64, ‘Tempora mutantur’ (see Example 1). Of the extraordinary features on his list, the first is certainly the most eccentric: whereas discontinuities of material and unorthodox formal procedures can be found in many pieces, no other tonal composition consistently neglects to complete its phrases. This feature of the slow movement was approached from another perspective by W. Dean Sutcliffe: ‘Nothing could more obstruct listener absorption than its unparalleled feat of failing to offer a single functional perfect cadence throughout.’³ Not only perfect: the movement contains no cadence at all. Throughout its course cadences are thwarted or dissolved. Consequently, they are absent.

The eccentricity of Haydn’s feat can be appreciated if one takes into account that cadences belonged to the basic elements of eighteenth-century musical language. As conclusions of phrases or sections, they defined musical form and tonality. In vocal music, they were coordinated with punctuation marks in the text. The parallelism between linguistic and musical punctuation in songs, recitatives and arias underlay the

1 James Webster, ‘Joseph Haydn: Climax of the “Sturm und Drang” (c.1772)’, programme notes accompanying the recording of Haydn’s complete symphonies by The Academy of Ancient Music, conducted by Christopher Hogwood, volume 7 (Decca/L’Oiseau-Lyre CD 443 777–2, 1996), 24.

2 Webster, ‘Climax of the “Sturm und Drang”’, 25.

3 W. Dean Sutcliffe, ‘Expressive Ambivalence in Haydn’s Symphonic Slow Movements of the 1770s’, *The Journal of Musicology* 27/1 (2010), 110.



parallel between music and language, which, in the course of the eighteenth century, was extended beyond vocal music and helped to transfer the concept of musical punctuation to instrumental genres. The fundamental precepts of musical punctuation in both vocal and instrumental music were formulated by Johann Mattheson in *Kern melodischer Wissenschaft* (Hamburg: Herold, 1737) and incorporated by him into *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* (Hamburg: Herold, 1739). They were subsequently developed in composition handbooks by Joseph Riepel, Johann Philipp Kirnberger and Heinrich Christoph Koch. How to articulate musical punctuation marks was discussed in handbooks of musical performance.⁴ For Haydn's contemporaries, a composition consisting of incomplete phrases was as unthinkable as a series of incomplete sentences. If Haydn could not just think of it, but, in fact, compose it, he must have had some special reasons.

Conjectures about such reasons behind the slow movement of Symphony No. 64 have been nourished by the title: 'Tempora mutantur' comes from the Latin inscription 'Tempora mutantur etc.' found on a wrapper for the authentic Esterházy parts for the symphony.⁵ Although the wrapper is later than the parts and the inscription may not come from Haydn, it may have been copied from the authentic wrapper, and it is thought to be derived from the Latin epigram by John Owen, a near-contemporary of Shakespeare:

Tempora mutantur, nos et mutamur in illis;
Quamodo? Fit semper tempore peior homo.

The relation between the title of Haydn's symphony and Owen's epigram was posited by Jonathan Foster,⁶ who also cited the English translation of the epigram published in 1677 by Thomas Harvey:

The Times are Chang'd, and in them Change'd are we:
How? Man, as Times grow worse, grows worse, we see.

While Foster related the title to the rondo finale, James Atkins suggested that the title should be associated with the slow movement.⁷ Atkins's suggestion was adopted by Elaine Sisman, who used it to support her hypothesis that this movement formed part of Haydn's incidental music for Shakespeare's *Hamlet*.⁸ The German adaptation of *Hamlet* by Franz von Heufeld was performed at Eszterháza by the famous Karl Wahr troupe in the summer of 1773 or 1774.⁹ One contemporary newspaper and a few theatrical journals point to Haydn as the composer of the incidental music.¹⁰ Sisman connects Haydn's eccentric manipulations of cadences with the couplet that ends Shakespeare's first and Heufeld's second act: 'The time is out of joint. O cursed spite, / that ever I was born to set it right!'.¹¹ 'In fact', she observes, 'the slow movement of Symphony no. 64 is an extended essay on time out of joint: it is precisely the joins, or cadences, that are delayed and subsumed in the next phrases, until the resolutions fall further and further behind the period structure.'¹² I will reconsider Sisman's hypothesis in the course of this article. I will first focus on the absent cadences and examine them in the light of theories of musical grammar and rhetoric. Then I will turn to the form of the slow movement and account for it in terms of eighteenth-century punctuation form. I will also consider its affect and come up with a different hypothesis about its connection with theatre. My discussion will conclude by revisiting the question of the symphony's title.

4 For the concept of musical punctuation and its role in eighteenth-century performance practice see Stephanie Vial, *The Art of Musical Phrasing in the Eighteenth Century: Punctuating the Classical 'Period'* (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2008).

5 Joseph Haydn, *Critical Edition of the Complete Symphonies*, ed. H. C. Robbins Landon, volume 6 (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1967), xiv.

6 Jonathan Foster, 'The Tempora Mutantur Symphony of Joseph Haydn', *The Haydn Yearbook* 9 (1975), 328–329.

7 James Atkins, letter to the editor, *The Haydn Yearbook* 11 (1980), 196–198.

8 Elaine Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 43/2 (1990), 320–331.

9 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 325.

10 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 321–322.

11 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 326. As she notes, this couplet was singled out by the protagonist of Johann Wolfgang Goethe's *Wilhelm Meisters theatralische Sendung* as the key to Hamlet's entire behaviour.

12 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 327.

Example 1 Haydn, Symphony No. 64 in A major, ‘Tempora mutantur’, second movement (*Critical Edition of the Complete Symphonies*, ed. H. C. Robbins Landon, volume 6 (Vienna: Universal, 1967)). Crossed-through abbreviations and bracketed harmonic symbols refer respectively to cadences and chords that are expected by the listener but do not actually occur



17 repeat

23

28

f *p* *f* *p* *f* *p* *f* *p*

f *f* *f*

p *pp* *p* *pp* *pp* *pp*

pp

The musical score is presented in three systems, each with four staves. The key signature is one sharp (F#). The first system (measures 17-22) features a 'repeat' sign at the beginning. Dynamics include *f* (forte) and *p* (piano). The second system (measures 23-27) includes a *f* (forte) dynamic. The third system (measures 28-32) includes *p* (piano) and *pp* (pianissimo) dynamics.

Example 1 continued

Example 1 *continued*

Example 1 *continued*

ii

FONTE

Example 1 *continued*



96

Horn 1

Horn 2

p *f* *f* *p* *pp*

K4

d: $\flat \text{II}^6$ $\text{vii}^\circ / \text{V}$ V° *i*

103

pp

pp

pp

pp

pp

pp

I

Example 1 *continued*



ELLIPSES

Sisman's observation that cadences are 'delayed and subsumed in the next phrases' suggests that, for her, they are present. This analytical reading can be justified by noting the smooth harmonic connections that exist between phrases. The first two phrases of the slow movement (Example 1) are interrupted by general pauses after the cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ chords. Both general pauses leave the listener with clear expectations of what should follow and give her as much time as she needs to fill in the blanks.¹³ In bar 4 the listener expects a half-cadence (to use Koch's terminology, a *Quintabsatz*, QA) in D major and in bars 7–8 a full cadence (*Kadenz*, K) in A major.¹⁴ The new phrases start with chords that should have followed the $\frac{6}{4}$. The chord on the third beat of bar 4 is identical with the dominant expected on the second beat. Likewise, the dominant on the second beat of bar 8 is identical with the dominant chord expected on the third beat of bar 7. Yet the chords after the general pauses do not continue the cadential harmonic progressions announced before them. The chord on the third beat of bar 4 brings no resolution of the cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ to the dominant of the main key. Rather, it becomes the tonic of the dominant key and starts the second phrase in A major. The dominant on the second beat of bar 8 retains its tonal function, but, again, it does not resolve the cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ from bar 7 and does not lead directly to the tonic.¹⁵ Instead, it takes a different harmonic turn and starts the third phrase.

If the listener has taken these chords for continuations of cadences, she must revise her understanding in the light of what follows. Although the revision takes place in real time, it affects the flow of musical time represented by metre. This follows from the eighteenth-century rule concerning the metrical position of caesuras. According to Mattheson, Kirnberger, Koch and other authors, caesuras of musical punctuation marks represented by cadences must fall on downbeats.¹⁶ The final tonic of the full cadence expected to close the second phrase should thus fall on the downbeat of bar 8 and be preceded by the dominant on the third beat of bar 7. If the dominant on the second beat of bar 8 is taken for the delayed resolution of the cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ chord, it implies that the tonic will fall on the third beat in the same bar – a metrical position inappropriate for caesuras. The same rule holds for caesuras of half-cadences (*Quintabsätze*), but they, as all *Absätze*, can be decorated by means of appoggiaturas. While the dominant harmony must be reached on the downbeat, an appoggiatura can postpone the melodic resolution to the second beat. In 3/4 metre the resolution can be postponed to the third beat, but in bar 4 this possibility interferes with the expectation – conditioned by the starting-point of the first phrase – that the second phrase will begin with a crotchet upbeat. In order to perceive the chords after the general pauses as delayed resolutions of the $\frac{6}{4}$ chords, the listener must discount the pauses and shift the chords to the metrical positions on which they were expected. By revealing that these chords start new phrases, the following events correct this perception and the metrical grid must be readjusted: the general pauses should be counted after all.¹⁷

13 George Edwards, 'Papa Doc's Recap Caper: Haydn and Temporal Dyslexia', in *Haydn Studies*, ed. Dean Sutcliffe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 293, observes that 'Haydn has tremendous confidence in the willingness of the listener to supply mentally events which are not physically present', but he refers to bars 98–108. In bars 4 and 8 the effect of filling in the blanks is even more pronounced.

14 Throughout this article I follow Koch's terminology. His theory of musical punctuation is included in the second volume of *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition* (Leipzig: Böhme, 1787). English translation by Nancy Kovaleff Baker in *Introductory Essay on Composition* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983).

15 Atkins (letter to the editor, 197) points out that the expected resolution of $G\sharp_4$ to A does take place in the melody, yet it is not accompanied by the harmonic resolution of the dominant to the tonic.

16 This rule is ubiquitous in eighteenth-century music theory. For detailed discussion see Danuta Mirka, *Metric Manipulations in Haydn and Mozart: Chamber Music for Strings, 1787–1791* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 74–82.

17 The shifts of metric perception are related by Atkins to the symphony's title. For him, 'Tempora mutantur' refers to the 'mutations of time' which affect our sense of metre (letter to the editor, 198).



From this discussion it follows that, even if initially the listener may think that the cadences are delayed, she ultimately recognizes that they are absent.¹⁸ But absent cadences transgress the rules of musical grammar. Can they be accounted for in terms of eighteenth-century music theory? Does this theory have a concept for them? Such a concept can, indeed, be derived from the parallel between music and language. In the eighteenth century this parallel extended from the realm of grammar to that of rhetoric. While these domains were distinct from each other, rhetoric could encroach upon grammar for the sake of expression. Such phenomena, called rhetorical figures, consisted in deviations from grammatical rules under the influence of emotion.¹⁹

In *Kern melodischer Wissenschaft* Mattheson supplements his discussion of musical punctuation with remarks on rhetorical figures and draws a distinction between figures of diction (*figurae dictionis*) and figures of sentence (*figurae sententiae*).²⁰ In *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* he translates these Latin terms into German as 'Wörter-Figuren' and 'Spruch-Figuren' and adds their definitions.²¹ The influence of rhetorical figures upon musical grammar is not discussed in the composition handbooks of Riepel, Kirnberger and Koch, but it is taken up by two other authors. Among the twelve rhetorical figures described in *Critischer Musicus* by Johann Adolph Scheibe,

die IIIte ist das Verbeißen, (*Ellipsis*,) oder das Abbrechen eines Satzes, den man nur anhebet, aber nicht völlig endiget. Sie geschieht auf zweyerley Art. Erstlich, wenn man in dem heftigsten Affecte und mitten in einem angefangenen Satze unvermuthet abbricht und stille hält, endlich aber mit einem ganz fremden Gedanken aufs neue wieder anhebt. Oder auch, wenn man am Schlusse eines Satzes den gewöhnlichen Schlußton verändert, und in einen ganz fremden und unerwarteten Accord fällt. Dieses letztere nennen die Componisten, das Ausfliehen der Cadenz. Je heftiger aber der Affect ist, oder seyn soll, desto fremder muß auch der Accord seyn, in den man die gewöhnliche Cadenz verändert. Die erste Art dieser Figur ist die schönste, und erfordert wegen des Abbrechens, und weil man zugleich dem ganzen Satze Einhalt thun muß, viel Geschicklichkeit, Feuer und Stärke so wohl in der Melodie, als Harmonie. Die Töne, in welchen man stille hält, müssen so beschaffen seyn, daß sie auch ohne Worte eine Vollführung erfordern. Dießfalls sind auch dissonirende, oder

18 Stages of this perceptual process correspond to three stages of 'embodied musical meaning' distinguished by Leonard B. Meyer in *Emotion and Meaning in Music* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956), 37–38. The *hypothetical* meaning, represented by the expectation of cadences, is frustrated during the general pauses. When the new phrases start with the chords which were expected to close the preceding phrases, the *evident* meaning is that the cadences are delayed. The *determinate* meaning arises when the phrases continue beyond the first chords, revealing that the cadences are absent.

19 For an excellent discussion of the expressive function of rhetorical figures see Brian Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), 294–339.

20 Johann Mattheson, *Kern melodischer Wissenschaft* (Hamburg: Herold, 1737), 141.

21 Johann Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* (Hamburg: Herold, 1739), 242. This treatise was one of the first books purchased by Haydn (Georg August Griesinger, *Biographische Notizen über Joseph Haydn* (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1810), 10; Albert Christoph Dies, *Biographische Nachrichten von Joseph Haydn*, ed. Horst Seeger (Berlin: Henschel, 1976), 41–42; English translations in Vernon Gotwals, *Haydn: Two Contemporary Portraits* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968), 10, 96). On Haydn's familiarity with rhetoric see Elaine Sisman (*Haydn and the Classical Variation* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), 23–25, and 'Rhetorical Truth in Haydn's Chamber Music: Genre, Tertiary Rhetoric, and the Opus 76 Quartets', in *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, ed. Tom Beghin and Sander M. Goldberg (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), 282–289) and Tom Beghin ('Haydn as Orator: A Rhetorical Analysis of His Keyboard Sonata in D major, Hob. XVI:42', in *Haydn and His World*, ed. Elaine Sisman (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), 205–208). Both authors suggest that Haydn learned some rhetoric at the choir school of St Stephen's Cathedral in Vienna, but he could have absorbed rhetorical figures from everyday life. As emphasized in all handbooks of rhetoric, such figures were not artificial inventions but parts of ordinary language. As such, they were imitated in literature and theatre and found their way into operatic librettos. Indeed, opera might have been *the* school of rhetorical figures for Haydn.



enarmonische Intervallen am besten darzu geschickt. Die Töne, welche auf das Aufhalten folgen, und solches zugleich unterbrechen, müssen ferner den vorhergegangenen Tönen ganz entgegen seyn. Sie müssen eine fremde und mit einer andern Tonart verbundene Harmonie ausmachen, und endlich muß darauf eine ganz neue Gattung von Melodie und von Taktbewegung folgen.²²

the third is the *ellipsis*, or breaking-off of a phrase which one only starts but does not completely finish. This happens in two ways. First, when, in the most violent mood and in the middle of a phrase, one unexpectedly breaks off, comes to a halt and finally starts again with a completely different idea. Or when one changes the final note at the end of a phrase and falls into a completely different and unexpected chord. The latter is called by composers the deceptive cadence. The more violent the affect is, or should be, the more distant the chord into which the ordinary cadence is twisted. The first kind of this figure is the most beautiful and, because of the break and because one must halt the entire sentence, requires lots of skill, fire and strength in both the melody and harmony. The notes on which one halts must be so arranged that they demand completion even in the absence of words. Therefore dissonant or enharmonic intervals are most convenient for this purpose. The notes that follow, and thus interrupt, the standstill must be completely contrary to the preceding ones. They must make up a foreign harmony related to a different key and represent a completely new type of melody and metrical motion.

Scheibe's description is echoed by Johann Nikolaus Forkel in the Introduction to the first volume of his *Allgemeine Geschichte der Musik*:

Eine auffallende Art von Aeußerung einer Empfindung ist die, wenn sie, nachdem sie nach und nach zu einem hohen Grad von Stärke angewachsen, auf einmal plötzlich stille steht, und abbricht. Diese Figur wird *Ellipsis* genannt. Die Kunst, die diese Art von Aeußerung ausdrücken will, muß sie daher so in ein Bild zu bringen suchen, daß dadurch der Gang der Leidenschaft für die Einbildungskraft gleichsam sichtbar werden kann. Sie kann es auf zweyerley Art bewerkstelligen, nemlich 1) wenn ein nach und nach zu einer großen Lebhaftigkeit angewachsener Satz unvermuthet abbricht, sodann aber mit einem ganz veränderten Gedanken aufs neue wieder anfängt, und weiter fortgeht. ... 2) Wenn ein ebenfalls nach und nach sehr lebhaft gewordener Satz bis zu einer Art von Cadenz fortgeführt wird, anstatt aber diejenige Cadenz zu machen, die sich aus der hervorgehenden Modulation hätte erwarten lassen, in eine sogenannte ausfliehende Cadenz fällt, und dadurch den Faden der Modulation abreißt ... Je heftiger aber die Empfindung ist, deren Lauf schleunig unterbrochen werden soll, desto fremder und entfernter muß auch die Cadenz seyn, in welche die gewöhnliche verändert wird.²³

A conspicuous manner of expressing a sentiment is when, after it has gradually grown up to a high level of intensity, it suddenly stops and breaks off. This figure is called *ellipsis*. The art that seeks this type of expression must therefore try to represent it so that the course of the passion becomes visible, as it were, for the imagination. It can achieve this in two ways, namely: 1) when a phrase which has been growing more and more lively unexpectedly breaks off, then starts again with a completely different idea and continues. ... 2) When a phrase which has likewise been growing more and more lively leads toward a cadence but, instead of reaching it, as one would have expected on the basis of the foregoing course of modulation, goes over into the

22 Johann Adolph Scheibe, *Critischer Musicus* (Leipzig: Breitkopf, 1745), 687–688. My translation.

23 Johann Nikolaus Forkel, *Allgemeine Geschichte der Musik*, volume 1 (Leipzig: Schwickert, 1788), 56–57. My translation. Forkel illustrates the first type of ellipsis with an example from C. P. E. Bach and refers to Bach's miniature 'L'irresoluë' from *Musikalisches Allerley* (1761) in connection with *dubitation* (58). Given Haydn's admiration for Bach (Griesinger, *Biographische Notizen*, 21–22; Dies, *Biographische Nachrichten*, 40; Gotwals, *Two Portraits*, 12–13, 95), Bach's keyboard music could be another source of Haydn's familiarity with rhetorical figures.



so-called deceptive cadence and in this way breaks off the thread of modulation ... The more passionate the sentiment whose course is to be interrupted, the stranger and more distant must be the cadence into which the expected one is twisted.

As these descriptions make clear, Scheibe and Forkel distinguish between two types of *ellipsis*: the first type occurs in the middle of a phrase, while the second takes place in the course of a cadence. Their different positions condition a cognitive difference between them: whereas an interruption of a cadential schema in the second type of *ellipsis* leaves the listener with a clear expectation of what should have followed, an earlier interruption of a phrase in the first type arouses no such expectation (unless it interrupts another schema). These two types of one rhetorical figure can be more precisely (and more properly) associated with two different – though related – rhetorical figures: *ellipsis* and *aposiopesis*. According to Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg, ‘der Unterschied zwischen diesen Figuren besteht darinnen, daß jene nur ein oder ein paar Worte, die sich leicht errathen lassen; diese aber ganze Sachen, die sich nicht allezeit errathen lassen, betrifft’ (the difference between these figures consists in the fact that the former affects only a few words which can be easily guessed while the latter affects entire segments which cannot always be guessed).²⁴ The similarity between them is manifest from the fact that they are indicated by the same punctuation mark – the dash (*Denkstrich*). Along with question mark, exclamation mark and parenthesis, dash is subsumed by Marpurg under *rhetorical* punctuation marks, by contrast to *ordinary* punctuation marks represented by full stop, colon, semicolon and comma.²⁵

In the light of these remarks, the absent cadences in the first two phrases of Haydn’s slow movement can be heard as ellipses but stray from the descriptions of this rhetorical figure by Scheibe and Forkel because they combine features of both types: they take place in the course of cadences, as in the second type, but cut them off by means of general pauses, as in the first type. In addition, ‘the notes that follow ... the stand-stills’ are not ‘completely contrary to the preceding notes’ and they do not ‘make up a foreign harmony’, as they should, according to Scheibe. Instead, the new phrases seem to continue the cadential harmonic progressions interrupted by the general pauses. The principle adopted by Haydn of interrupting the cadential progressions after the $\frac{6}{4}$ chords, rather than after the dominants, enables him to create ellipses before a full as well as before a half-cadence and explains why, in Sisman’s words, the delayed resolutions ‘fall further and further behind the period structure’. She corroborates this point as follows: ‘the first phrase lacks a single beat on which to resolve; the second phrase lacks two beats; while the third phrase, of seven measures, displaces the dynamic accent of the first two phrases and creates parallel two-measure incises (subphrases) that are themselves lopsided and lead to a delayed resolution’.²⁶ Because the cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ is the penultimate chord of the half-cadence but the antepenultimate chord of the full cadence, the second ellipsis enters sooner, and is longer, than the first. In the third phrase the listener expects another full cadence in A major and the cadence is again interrupted by a general pause after the $\frac{6}{4}$ chord (bar 13), but this interruption creates no ellipsis because the chords following the general pause do not start a new phrase. The dominant arrives on time on the third beat of bar 13 but it is reduced to only two notes (G \sharp –D) and weakened in terms of dynamics (*piano*), articulation (*staccato*) and texture (violins only).²⁷ The tonic is delayed until the second beat of bar 14 and further weakened (*pianissimo*). Although the full four-part texture is restored, the top voice resolves the seventh of the dominant to the third of the tonic one octave lower than expected. Consequently, this delayed resolution cannot count as a cadence (*Kadenz*). The harmonic progression V⁷–I in bars 13–14 brings no resolution of the cadence announced in bars 10–13, but its dissolution,

24 Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg, *Kritische Briefe über die Tonkunst*, volume 2 (Berlin: Birnstiel, 1763), 346.

25 Marpurg, *Kritische Briefe*, volume 2, 309–310. Marpurg’s discussion of punctuation marks forms part of his ‘Unterricht vom Recitativ’ (Lessons on Recitative). He takes his examples of *ellipsis* and *aposiopesis* from operatic recitatives and goes on to show their settings by Hasse and Graun.

26 Sisman, ‘Haydn’s Theater Symphonies’, 327.

27 In addition, the two notes are inverted so that the G \sharp , expected to occur in the top voice by analogy with D \sharp in bar 11, is played by the second violins while the first violins play the D.



and thus resembles *asyndeton*, the rhetorical figure which creates the effect of ‘dissolution by the absence of connecting particles’.²⁸ If ellipses curtail phrases, *asyndeton* results in phrase expansion. Further expansion of the third phrase is achieved by means of repetition and a change of the composed metre. The ‘parallel two-measure incises’ (bars 10–11 and 12–13) observed by Sisman form a ‘displacement or a similar repetition of a segment of the phrase on other degrees of the scale’, a means of phrase expansion described by Koch.²⁹ The deceleration of harmonic rhythm from bar 10 signals the change of metre from 3/4 to 6/4, confirmed at the end of the phrase by the structurally ‘empty’ bar 16. This exemplifies the phenomenon of *Doppeltakte*, in which notated bars become beats of composed bars.³⁰ The repetition of the tonic triad in bar 14, before its arrival on the downbeat of bar 15, causes even further expansion of the third phrase through the insertion of one bar of notated 3/4 metre equal to half a bar of composed 6/4 metre.

FORM

Even without cadences, the first three phrases of the slow movement have interesting implications for the musical form. The first two of them, which ought to be concluded with the half-cadence in the tonic (QA/I) and the full cadence in the dominant (K/V), suggest that the movement is in small two-reprise form. Koch calls this form a ‘small composition’.³¹ Only in this form can one modulate to the dominant in the second phrase. A half-cadence in the tonic followed by a full cadence in the dominant is mentioned by Koch as one of the possible patterns of punctuation in the first reprise of small compositions containing four phrases (see Table 1, rows 6–7).³² Although small compositions can contain more phrases than four, only two phrases can be contained in the first reprise of dances. Three phrases occasionally occur in the first reprise of ‘the melodies to odes, songs, and small pieces of unrestricted type and tempo’,³³ but in this case the second phrase cannot close with a full cadence. Rather, ‘if the melody is already in the fifth in the second phrase, this phrase always closes with a half-cadence [*Quintabsatz*] in the key of the fifth’.³⁴ It follows that the pattern consisting of a half-cadence in the tonic and two full cadences in the dominant (QA/I, K/V, K/V) is not regarded as possible in small compositions. ‘Only in larger compositions does the case occur that two different melodic sections form a cadence immediately after one another in one and the same key’.³⁵ Apparently, with the third phrase the movement turns toward a ‘larger composition’. This turn is also suggested by the extension of this phrase in Haydn’s movement and its bolder melodic gestures. The pacification of these gestures and ultimate dissolution of the phrase suggest a withdrawal from a larger composition and a return to the original formal template. This template is confirmed by the written-out repeat of the first reprise with all the vicissitudes caused by the third phrase (bars 17–32).

28 Quintilian, *Institutio oratoria*, book 9, section 3, paragraph 50, quoted by Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric*, 304.

29 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3 (Leipzig: Böhme, 1793), 206; *Introductory Essay*, 155. The ‘displaced dynamic accent’ is the change to *forte* in bar 11. Sisman’s annotations (‘Haydn’s Theater Symphonies’, 328, Example 8) suggest that this accent results in misplacement of two-bar incises, yet it does not seem to affect grouping. Rather, it creates syncopation against the two-bar hypermetre which corresponds to the composed 6/4 metre of this passage.

30 For a discussion of this phenomenon and the role of the ‘empty bar’ in its identification see Claudia Maurer Zenck, *Vom Takt: Untersuchungen zur Theorie und kompositorischen Praxis im ausgehenden 18. und beginnenden 19. Jahrhundert* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2001), 43–44, and my *Metric Manipulations*, 217–232.

31 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 39–152; *Introductory Essay*, 78–128. The term ‘small two-reprise form’ comes from Leonard G. Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style* (New York: Schirmer, 1980).

32 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 84; *Introductory Essay*, 95.

33 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 145–146; *Introductory Essay*, 125.

34 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 147; *Introductory Essay*, 126, translation amended.

35 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 76; *Introductory Essay*, 93.



Table 1 Patterns of punctuation in major-mode small compositions containing four phrases, after Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition*, volume 3 (Leipzig: Böhme, 1793), 57–127. English translation by Nancy Kovaleff Baker in *Introductory Essay on Composition* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983), 85–117

	First reprise			Second reprise	
1	GA/I	K/I	: :	QA/I	K/I
2	QA/I	K/I	: :	GA/I	K/I
3	QA/I	K/I	: :	QA/I	K/I
4	GA/I	K/I	: :	GA/I	K/I
5	GA/I	K/V	: :	QA/I	K/I
6	QA/I	K/V	: :	QA/I	K/I
7	QA/I	K/V	: :	GA/I	K/I
8	GA/I	K/V	: :	GA/I	K/I
9	GA/I	QA/I	: :	GA/I	K/I
10	GA/I	QA/I	: :	QA/I	K/I

GA = *Grundabsatz*, QA = *Quintabsatz*, K = *Kadenz*

The second reprise of what seems again to be a ‘small composition’ starts with what promises to be a Fonte at bar 33: this sequential harmonic gambit involves transposing a segment of material from the second to the first scale degree.³⁶ After the first segment of the Fonte in bars 33–34, the second segment should continue with the same material transposed down a step in bars 35–36, but it is curtailed by a general pause.³⁷ While the D \sharp in bar 35 could function as an appoggiatura to C \sharp , equivalent to D \sharp in bar 33, the general pause cuts off its resolution. The third-inversion dominant seventh with C \sharp in the top voice occurs on the third beat of bar 35 and resolves to the first-inversion tonic triad in bar 36, equivalent to the first-inversion triad in bar 34. However, rather than being heard as the continuation of the sequence, which it in fact is, this harmonic progression starts a new phrase. The phrase leads to a half-cadence (QA/I) but is cut off after the cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ by the general pause in bar 38, as the first phrase was in bar 4. The following phrase (bars 39–41) corresponds to the second phrase (bars 5–7) and is interrupted after the $\frac{6}{4}$ chord before it can reach a full cadence (K/I). After the listener has mentally supplied the missing chords, these chords actually sound in bars 42–44, as they did in bars 13–15. Anomalous as it is on account of the absent cadences, the second reprise thus adheres to the template of a small composition containing four phrases (Table 1, row 6). According to Koch, when the first reprise of such a composition modulates to the dominant, the first phrase of the second reprise should turn back to the tonic and close with a half-cadence (QA/I). The second phrase should close with a full cadence (K/I). If it contains a thematic return, the returning material could be either the first or the second phrase of the first reprise.³⁸ The slow movement of Symphony No. 64 illustrates the latter option, even if it combines the second phrase with echoes of the (supernumerary) third phrase of the first reprise.

A small composition should finish with a repetition of the second reprise. The repeat follows in bars 46–57, but the slow movement continues beyond this section and its texture grows with the unexpected

36 The Fonte is defined and discussed along with two other gambits, Monte and Ponte, by Joseph Riepel in *Anfangsgründe zur musicalischen Setzkunst*, volume 2: *Grundregeln zur Tonordnung insgesamt* (Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1755), 44–48. For a concise summary of Riepel’s discussion see Ratner, *Classic Music*, 213–214. A thorough discussion of the Fonte is offered by Robert O. Gjerdingen, *Music in the Galant Style* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 61–71.

37 Sisman, ‘Haydn’s Theater Symphonies’, 328, Example 8, points to this curtailment in an annotation: ‘not parallel in duration and accomp[animent]’.

38 Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 88; *Introductory Essay*, 98.



entrance of the winds. From D major the music veers off to G minor (bars 58–61) and approaches a full cadence in D minor. After the German augmented-sixth and cadential $\frac{6}{4}$ chords followed by the dominant (bars 62–64), the tonic is expected in bar 65. This expectation is conditioned, again, by the metrical position of caesuras. The resolution of the $\frac{6}{4}$ chord to the dominant on the third beat of bar 64 implies that the tonic should fall on the downbeat of the following bar. By coming to stop on the dominant and repeating this harmony over the bar line, the composer creates a harmonic syncopation and, having avoided the cadence, returns to the beginning. Or does he? Bars 68–71 repeat the first phrase of the movement (bars 1–4) but bars 72–74 form a hybrid of the second phrase (bars 5–7) with its variant familiar from the thematic return (bars 39–41).

The deviation from the main key and the faked return to the beginning after the end of the second reprise reveal the fundamental problem of this movement: *a small composition is the wrong formal template for it*. According to Koch, this form is suitable for dances, songs and other short pieces but not for symphonic movements, which he calls ‘larger compositions’.³⁹ After the wrong choice of formal template, the question is how to continue: how to enlarge a ‘small’ composition so as to make it ‘larger’. The composer, as affected by Haydn, does not seem to know the answer, and his attempts to find one take him into wrong keys: in bars 58–67 this is the key of D minor. In bars 76–82, he turns toward A major via another *Fonte*. The sequence should continue for one more bar, but it is abandoned and the music approaches a cadence (K/V) yet, once again, stops on the dominant (bar 85). The accompaniment provides the tonic pitch A on the second beat of this bar and the appoggiaturas G \sharp –D could still resolve to A–C \sharp in bar 86, but the composer seems to be seized by doubts. He avoids the cadence by adding the seventh to the tonic and withdraws from A major via a ‘doubtful modulation’ (*dubitatio*), reaching the third-inversion dominant seventh of D major (bar 89).⁴⁰ With the resolution of this chord to the tonic of the main key we are once again back to the beginning. Bars 91–95 correspond to bars 68–72, but the second phrase stops in the middle (*aposiopesis*). The doubts increase, the mode changes to minor and the cadential harmonic progression is dissolved (*asyndeton*), its chords disconnected from each other in space and time. The dominant seventh (bar 101) is suggested by only two notes, and the tonic pedal does not complete the cadence. Rather, it consolidates the absent cadence with a postcadential harmonic progression in D minor (bars 102–107). Only after this progression – and detached from it by a general pause – does the tonic triad with the major third occur.⁴¹

It follows from my analysis that the absent cadences of Symphony No. 64 are involved in an extended play with the musical form. As is the case with the cadential tricks, the formal manipulations play with the listener’s expectations, but, if the former could be perceived by all listeners, including less competent ones (*Liebhaber*), the latter could only be appreciated by connoisseurs (*Kenner*) familiar with eighteenth-century punctuation forms. It is the concept of punctuation form, fundamental for eighteenth-century music and summarized by Koch, that brings the solution to the problem of form in the slow movement.⁴² This problem has been noted by many authors: H. C. Robbins Landon compares ‘its curious form (no double

39 The formal templates suitable for slow movements of symphonies include sonata form with or without development, rondo and variation (Koch, *Versuch*, volume 3, 311–314; *Introductory Essay*, 201–202).

40 ‘Doubtful modulation’ (*zweifelhafte Modulation*) occurs in one of two types of *dubitatio* described by Forkel, *Allgemeine Geschichte*, volume 1, 58.

41 The conclusion of this movement is analysed in detail by Webster, *Haydn’s ‘Farewell’ Symphony and the Idea of Classical Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), 147, 150–152.

42 This concept was revived by Karol Berger in ‘Toward a History of Hearing: The Classic Concerto, A Sample Case’, in *Convention in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Music: Essays in Honor of Leonard G. Ratner*, ed. Wye J. Allanbrook, Janet M. Levy and William P. Mahrt (Stuyvesant: Pendragon, 1992), 405–429, and ‘The First-Movement Punctuation Form in Mozart’s Piano Concertos’, in *Mozart’s Piano Concertos: Text, Context, Interpretation*, ed. Neal Zaslaw (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1996), 239–259.



bars at all, and *durchkomponiert*)' to 'the equally enigmatic *Capriccio* of Symphony No. 86'.⁴³ For Sisman the movement has 'an apparently unique two-reprise structure with both parts ending in the tonic'.⁴⁴ For Webster it refuses 'to execute an intelligible form'.⁴⁵ For A. Peter Brown 'it consists of two expository statements (mm. 1–16, 17–32), a middle section that is still more disruptive in its phrase structure, two recapitulatory statements (mm. 68–90, 91–101), and a coda'.⁴⁶ Sutcliffe relates the problem of form to the absence of cadences: 'If there are no proper cadences, then there can be no proper sections: the movement is therefore in a sense formless, even though the recurrences of the opening material clearly create some sort of structure'.⁴⁷ The first part of his reasoning is sound, but, even if absent, the cadences are announced clearly enough to allow an eighteenth-century connoisseur to map the music upon a familiar formal template. For such a listener the form was thus 'unique' but not 'formless'. It was 'intelligible', even if it was a *forme manqué* in that the listener had to fill in its blanks. With this caveat, the slow movement of Symphony No. 64 can, indeed, be considered 'a wonderful illustration of the process of *Verfremdung*' that Sutcliffe finds central to Haydn's musical thought: 'renewing our perception by making strange something that could normally be taken for granted'. 'Yet', as he adds, 'all such considerations could equally be absorbed into an affective reading that concerns nostalgia and melancholy. The disrupted cadential activity and incomplete phrases represent a sort of broken utterance under stress, they are painful and discomforting'.⁴⁸ He connects this affective reading to Sisman's: 'in her hypothesis that this movement may have formed part of the incidental music Haydn is supposed to have written for *Hamlet*, she captures something of its melancholic affect'.⁴⁹

AFFECT

But is this movement melancholic? One musical characteristic that could be indicative of this affect is its tempo: Largo. For Johann Georg Sulzer 'diese Bewegung schicket sich also für Leidenschaften, die sich in feyerlicher Langsamkeit äussern, für melancolische Traurigkeit, und etwas finstere Andacht' (this tempo is suitable for passions that express themselves in solemn slow movement, for melancholic sadness and somewhat gloomy meditation).⁵⁰ Not so the key. Although ascribing characteristics to keys was surrounded by controversies in the eighteenth century, D major was unanimously characterized as gay, funny, joyful, bright, lively, brilliant and uplifting. For an anonymous reviewer in Carl Friedrich Cramer's *Magazin der Musik* it was 'the perfect key for funny pieces and joyful dances'; for Francesco Galeazzi 'the most cheerful

43 H. C. Robbins Landon, *Haydn: Chronicle and Works*, volume 2: *Haydn at Eszterháza, 1766–1790* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1978), 307.

44 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 327.

45 Webster, 'Climax of the "Sturm und Drang"', 25.

46 A. Peter Brown, *The First Golden Age of the Viennese Symphony: Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002), 147. This analytical reading is clearly provoked by the cadential manipulation in bars 64–65. The stop on the dominant before the full cadence can be reinterpreted as an early arrival on a half-cadence. Standing on this dominant (bars 65–67) suggests that the faked thematic return (bar 68) is the beginning of the recapitulation.

47 Sutcliffe, 'Expressive Ambivalence', 110.

48 Sutcliffe, 'Expressive Ambivalence', 111.

49 Sutcliffe, 'Expressive Ambivalence', 111, note 46. Even if Sisman does not directly refer to Hamlet's melancholy to support her hypothesis, she mentions this affect in connection with Heufeld's adaptation ('Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 324) in order to dismiss Landon's speculations about Haydn's music to *Hamlet* having been incorporated into 'the fiery minor-key symphonies' Nos 44 or 52 (326). See Landon, *Haydn at Eszterháza*, volume 2, 279. Hamlet describes himself as melancholic at the end of Act 2 (*Riverside Shakespeare*, ed. G. Blakemore Evans (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1974), Scene 2, line 588).

50 Johann Georg Sulzer, *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste*, part 2, volume 1 (Biel: Heilmann, 1777), 121.



and gay key that music has'.⁵¹ Some authors found it suitable for the expression of tender love, serenity and calm,⁵² but not for melancholy. This last affect was associated with flat minor keys, D minor being most frequently mentioned.⁵³

The slow movement is also short on harmonic, melodic and rhythmic signs of melancholy. Foremost among them were chromatic lines, chords and harmonic progressions. The connection of chromaticism with melancholy was grounded in *Affektenlehre* and justified by the mimetic relationship between musical motion and emotion. 'If one knows that sadness is a contraction of these subtle parts of our body', consisting of blood vapours, which were considered the source of human passions, 'then it is easy to see that the small and smallest intervals are the most suitable for this passion'.⁵⁴ Since melancholic sadness was believed to be caused by an excess of black bile, which tends to sink and causes depression, melancholy was represented by descending lines and lamento basses. Also suitable for melancholic expression were 'sigh' motives (*Seufzer*) and short pauses called 'sighs' (*Sospiren*).⁵⁵ All these musical characteristics abound in free fantasias, the eighteenth-century epitome of melancholy, frequently associated with this affect by contemporary listeners and in one case – that of C. P. E. Bach's Fantasia in C minor, H75, the concluding *Probestück* from his *Versuch über die wahre Art, das Clavier zu spielen* (Berlin: Henning, 1753) – explicitly related by one listener, Heinrich Wilhelm von Gerstenberg, to Hamlet's monologue.⁵⁶ In fact, Haydn's Largo is a far cry not only from free fantasias but also from eighteenth-century representations of melancholy in other genres, such as C. P. E. Bach's trio sonata *Sanguinicus et melancholicus*, H579, 'Il Malinconico' from Carl Ditters von Dittersdorf's *Il combattimento dell'umane passioni* and the finale of Beethoven's String Quartet Op. 18 No. 6, 'La Malinconia'. With its diatonic harmony and singing melody, played by the violins *con sordini* in the comfortable middle range, Haydn's theme sounds serene, even sleepy.⁵⁷ The crotchet motion in

51 The debate about key characteristics is summarized by Rita Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1988). The quotations from Cramer and Galeazzi are included in Appendix A, 238, 239.

52 See Paul M. Ellison, *The Key to Beethoven: Connecting Tonality and Meaning in His Music* (Hillsdale: Pendragon, 2012). Although this side of the affective character of D major was not described in the eighteenth century, several examples occur in eighteenth-century music. My further discussion suggests that the slow movement of Symphony No. 64 is one of them.

53 Other flat minor keys associated with melancholy were G minor, F minor and E flat minor. On the sharp side, melancholy was sometimes related to E minor, B minor and F sharp minor. The only major key associated with this affect was A flat major (Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics*, 242–244). The fundamental importance of key characteristics for the expression of melancholy is emphasized by Melanie Wald, 'Melancholie in Mozarts Instrumentalmusik: Biographische Legende oder ästhetische Praxis?', *Acta Mozartiana* 54/1–2 (2007), 31–53, and the association of D minor with melancholy is acknowledged by Sisman, 'Pathos and the *Pathétique*: Rhetorical Stance in Beethoven's C-minor Sonata, Op. 13', *Beethoven Forum* 3 (1994), 99.

54 Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, 16; English translation by Ernest C. Harris in *Johann Mattheson's Der vollkommene Capellmeister* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1981), 105.

55 See Koch, *Musikalisches Lexikon* (Frankfurt am Main: August Hermann der Jüngere, 1802), column 1421. These and other musical characteristics of melancholy are mentioned by Ernst Herttrich ('Studien zum Ausdruck des Melancholischen und seiner kompositionstechnischen Mittel in der Musik von W. A. Mozart' (PhD dissertation, Julius-Maximilians-Universität zu Würzburg, 1969)), Werner Braun ('Melancholie als musikalisches Thema', in *Die Sprache der Musik: Festschrift Klaus Wolfgang Niemöller zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. Jobst Peter Fricke (Regensburg: Bosse, 1989), 81–98) and Wald ('Melancholie in Mozarts Instrumentalmusik').

56 Gerstenberg's experiment is described in Eugene Helm, 'The "Hamlet" Fantasy and the Literary Element in C. P. E. Bach's Music', *The Musical Quarterly* 58/2 (1972), 277–296. On the relation between free fantasia and melancholy see Peter Schleuning, 'Die freie Fantasie: Ein Beitrag zur Erforschung der klassischen Klaviermusik' (PhD dissertation, Albert-Ludwigs-Universität zu Freiburg im Breisgau, 1973) and Annette Richards, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

57 Landon (Haydn, *Complete Symphonies*, volume 6, xiv) compares it to a hymn.



3/4 metre calls to mind the topic of sarabande with (somewhat exaggerated) accents on the second beats.⁵⁸ In contrast to fantasias, where sudden pauses bring about changes of affect, the general pauses cause here no affective contrasts between phrases. Rather, the affect continues from phrase to phrase, as if the music were submerging into, and then emerging from, the silence. Only the third phrase of the small composition (bars 8–16 and 24–32) deviates from its affective and formal conventions, turning toward a larger form with emotionally charged melodic gestures ascending into the high register. A few turbulent passages occur after the completion of the small composition: The dramatic turn to D minor in bars 59–66 via the Neapolitan-sixth, diminished-seventh and German augmented-sixth chords brings contrasts of dynamics and texture characteristic of *ombra* scenes in opera seria.⁵⁹ This texture returns in bars 76 and 80. The *dubitatio* in bars 85–88 and the final turn to D minor from bar 97 feature further chromatic harmonies. Sisman points to these ‘highly expressive and darkly colored’ passages in the course of her discussion,⁶⁰ but, rather than Hamlet’s sombre ruminations or fear at the appearance of the ghost, they may depict the agitation of the fictive composer mock-terrified by his initial mistake and subsequent inability to finish the piece.⁶¹

One more characteristic of the slow movement that can be associated with a melancholic affect is the absence of cadences. Sutcliffe is right that ‘the disrupted cadential activity and incomplete phrases’ may represent ‘a sort of broken utterance under stress . . . painful and discomforting’, but the rhetorical figures to which he refers can express a variety of affects. *Aposiopesis*, which interrupts a sentence, leaving the sense ‘uncertain [how] to be understood’, can ‘indicate passion or anger’, but for Quintilian the same figure ‘may serve to give an impression of anxiety or scruple’.⁶² The list of affects associated with it is extended by other authors. According to George Puttenham, *aposiopesis* arises ‘when we doo interrupt our speech for feare’ or ‘for shame’, or ‘for anger or by way of menace’, or ‘to show a moderation of wrath as the grave and discreeter sort of men do’, or ‘upon some sodaine occasion’. Besides, ‘this figure is fit for phantasticall heads and such as be sodaine or lacke memorie’.⁶³ The ‘polysemous nature’⁶⁴ of *aposiopesis* is illustrated by Brian Vickers with examples from Shakespeare’s dramas. Two of them, in fact, come from *Hamlet*. One is Hamlet’s uncompleted message to Fortinbras, symbolizing death:

HAMLET. So tell him, with th’occurents more and less
Which have solicited – the rest is silence.⁶⁵

(*Hamlet*, Act 5 Scene 2, lines 357–358)

The other comes from a comic episode between Polonius and Reynaldo, and illustrates how *aposiopesis* can be used by ‘such as . . . lacke memorie’:

58 For concise descriptions of the sarabande topic see Ratner, *Classic Music*, 11–12, and Wye Jamison Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart: ‘Le nozze di Figaro’ and ‘Don Giovanni’* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983), 37–38.

59 Apart from textural and dynamic contrasts, such scenes feature slow tempo, ostinato, repeated notes, pedal points and bold harmonic progressions including diminished-seventh, Neapolitan and augmented-sixth chords. The most typical keys are C minor and D minor. See Clive McClelland, *Ombra: Supernatural Music in the Eighteenth Century* (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2012).

60 Sisman, ‘Haydn’s Theater Symphonies’, 327.

61 Changes of mode from major to minor are related to melancholy by Hertrich (‘Studien zum Ausdruck des Melancholischen’, 36–43), but the tradition of *ombra* scenes suggests that the dramatic turns from D major to D minor in Haydn’s slow movement can be interpreted as shifts of mood from calm to terror.

62 Quintilian, *Institutio oratoria*, book 9, section 3, paragraph 60, 28–29, quoted by Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric*, 317, 318.

63 George Puttenham, *The Arte of English Poesie* (1589), 166–167, quoted by Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric*, 333.

64 Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric*, 307.

65 Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric*, 336. *Hamlet* quotations from the *Riverside Shakespeare*.



POLONIUS. And then, sir, does'a this – 'a does –
 what was I about to say?
 By the mass, I was about to say something.
 Where did I leave?
 REYNALDO. At 'closes in the consequence'.
 POLONIUS. At 'closes in the consequence', ay, marry.
 He closes thus: 'I know the gentleman ...'⁶⁶

(*Hamlet*, Act 2 Scene 1, lines 49–55)

Of course, 'lack of memory' was the theme of another play staged at Eszterháza by Karl Wahr and his troupe: Jean-François Regnard's *Le Distrait*. The German revival of Regnard's comedy, called *Der Zerstreute*, was first performed in 1774 and then taken by the troupe to other towns. Contemporary reviews of this production praise Haydn's incidental music, which consists of an overture, four entr'actes and a finale. This music, subsequently detached from the play, started an afterlife as Symphony No. 60, 'Il Distratto'. Sisman discusses it along with No. 64 and lists a number of 'characteristic techniques by which Haydn makes known his specific theatrical intentions'.⁶⁷ The list includes no absent cadences but, in the first movement, distraction is depicted by the music gradually 'losing its way' (*perdendosi*), 'as though the composer had forgotten where he was and what he was to do next'.⁶⁸ Could the slow movement of Symphony No. 64 be related to *Der Zerstreute*?

Interesting as it is, this question is ultimately beyond the point, as can be seen from the earliest review of Haydn's music for *Der Zerstreute*. The correspondent of the *Preßburger Zeitung* reports that connoisseurs regarded it as masterful and found in its 'musically comic humour [*musikalisch-komischen Laune*] the same spirit that enlivens *all of Haydn's works*'.⁶⁹ Gretchen Wheelock quotes this review at the conclusion of her analysis of Symphony No. 60 in order to justify her take on this piece. If Sisman and earlier authors have concentrated on Haydn's 'characteristic techniques' as they relate to devices of plot and character in *Der Zerstreute*,⁷⁰ Wheelock focuses on the considerable independence of these techniques from the theatrical context and stresses that they remain effective even if dissociated from the play.

The approach taken by Wheelock was elaborated by Gerhard Winkler.⁷¹ As does Wheelock, Winkler observes that theatrical gestures of Symphony No. 60 do not directly refer to situations from Regnard's comedy but, rather, create equivalent musical ones. He distinguishes between two types of such situation. One of them, illustrated by the *perdendosi* passage of the first movement, has for its subject a fictive *persona* of the composer: 'Als ein Schauspieler seiner selbst verliert er nach und nach die Kontrolle über den musikalischen Prozeß und läßt sich schließlich gleichsam "von außen" wieder an das Steuer zurückholen, während der "reale" Komponist Haydn die Zügel der ganzen Veranstaltung fest in der Hand gehalten hat.' (Like an actor of himself, he gradually loses control over the musical process and lets himself be eventually brought back to the rudder 'from outside', as it were, whereas the 'real' composer Haydn has firmly held

⁶⁶ Vickers, *In Defence of Rhetoric*, 335.

⁶⁷ Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 320.

⁶⁸ Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 312.

⁶⁹ *Preßburger Zeitung*, 23 July 1774, quoted by Gretchen Wheelock, *Haydn's Ingenious Jestings with Art: Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer, 1992), 170. My italics.

⁷⁰ Those earlier authors are Arnold Schering, 'Bemerkungen zu J. Haydns Programmsinfonien', *Jahrbuch der Musikbibliothek Peters* 46 (1939), 9–27, Rudolph Angermüller, 'Haydns "Der Zerstreute" in Salzburg (1776)', *Haydn-Studien* 4/2 (1978), 85–93, and Robert A. Green, 'Haydn's and Regnard's "Il Distratto": A Reexamination', *The Haydn Yearbook* 11 (1980), 183–195.

⁷¹ Gerhard J. Winkler, "'Orchesterpantomime" in den Esterházy-Sinfonien Joseph Haydns', in *Das symphonische Werk Joseph Haydns: Referate des internationalen musikwissenschaftlichen Symposions Eisenstadt, 13.–15. September 1995*, ed. Gerhard J. Winkler (Eisenstadt: Burgenländische Landesmuseen, 2000), 103–116.



the reins of the whole enterprise in his hand.)⁷² The other type of comic musical situation arises when the ‘real’ composer prescribes quasi-theatrical roles to performers. This is exemplified by the ‘forgetful’ violinists who have not remembered to tune their instruments before the finale of ‘Il Distratto’. As Winkler observes, this situation can be performed with theatrical gestures: ‘gestrengter Blick des Dirigenten, Abwinken, betretene Gesichter der Streicher’ (sharp look of the conductor, stroke of the baton, mortified faces of the violinists).⁷³ Winkler calls it *orchestral pantomime*. It is under this category that I propose to subsume the slow movement of Symphony No. 64. Although it contains no quasi-theatrical roles for performers, the fictive persona of the composer is arguably far more distracted than that of ‘Il Distratto’: not only does he choose a wrong formal template, he then forgets its course, loses his way in the third phrase and, finally, loses himself in unsuccessful attempts to close the movement. All along, he forgets to close phrases and complete harmonic gambits.⁷⁴

As far away as it takes us from Sisman’s hypothesis that the slow movement of Symphony No. 64 formed part of Haydn’s incidental music for *Hamlet*, my interpretation brings us back to her conclusion: ‘A connection between *Tempora mutantur* and *Hamlet*, between Haydn’s symphonic movements and theatrical rhetoric . . . suggests a new category for his theater music. Instead of writing theater music and then incorporating it into his symphonies (as in no. 60), he developed musical styles appropriate to the theater, and could simply use a grouping of movements in spoken plays.’⁷⁵ Sisman calls this category ‘music in the playhouse idiom’.⁷⁶ For her it only pertains to *Sturm und Drang* symphonies, but more recent Haydn scholarship has suggested that theatrical rhetoric permeates Haydn’s music from other periods and spreads to other genres.⁷⁷ The more we become familiar with eighteenth-century musical conventions and able to reconstruct the experience of eighteenth-century connoisseur listeners, the closer we come to share their view, conveyed by the correspondent of the *Preßburger Zeitung*, that comic spirit ‘enlivens all of Haydn’s works’.

72 Winkler, ‘Orchesterpantomime’, 106. My translation. Winkler compares the fictive persona of the composer to the narrator of a literary text and refers to the work of Wayne Booth, *Die Rhetorik der Erzählkunst*, trans. Alexander Polzin, two volumes (Heidelberg: Quelle und Meyer, 1974). More recent literary theory draws a distinction between the ‘real author’ and the ‘implied author’ by analogy to the ‘real reader’ and the ‘implied reader’ (Paul Copley, *Narrative* (London: Routledge, 2001), 139). The concept of ‘implied reader’, proposed by Wolfgang Iser (*The Implied Reader: Patterns of Communication in Prose Fiction from Bunyan to Beckett* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974)), was adopted for music and turned into the ‘implicated listener’ by Wheelock, *Haydn’s Ingenious Jesting*, 193–206.

73 Winkler, ‘Orchesterpantomime’, 103. My translation.

74 Felix Diergarten, “‘At times even Homer nods off’: Heinrich Christoph Koch’s Polemic against Joseph Haydn”, *Music Theory Online* 14/1 (2008), suggests that Symphony No. 60, ‘Il Distratto’, was the clandestine object of criticism directed against musical representation of an absent-minded person in the second volume of Koch’s *Versuch* and uses this as part of his argument against the relevance of Koch’s theory for Haydn’s compositional practice. One can imagine that Koch’s opinion about Symphony No. 64 would have been no less critical than about No. 60, but this does not undermine the explanatory power of his theory in relation to the enigmatic form of the slow movement. The relevance of eighteenth-century music theory for the analysis of eighteenth-century music requires more nuanced discussion. With this article I aim to contribute to it.

75 Sisman, ‘Haydn’s Theater Symphonies’, 330.

76 Sisman, ‘Haydn’s Theater Symphonies’, 331.

77 Theatrical gestures in Haydn’s keyboard sonatas were elucidated by Wheelock, *Haydn’s Ingenious Jesting*, 173–176, and Tom Beghin, “‘Delivery, Delivery, Delivery!’ Crowning the Rhetorical Process of Haydn’s Keyboard Sonatas”, in *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, 131–171. The ensemble pantomime in the finale of the String Quartet Op. 33 No. 2, ‘The Joke’, is discussed by Wheelock, *Haydn’s Ingenious Jesting*, 10–13, and Winkler, ‘Opus 33/2: Zur Anatomie eines Schlußeffekts’, *Haydn-Studien* 4/4 (1994), 288–297. Other instances of pantomime in the string quartets Op. 50 No. 2/i, Op. 55 No. 1/i and Op. 55 No. 2/iv are elucidated in Mirka, *Metric Manipulations*, 254–274, 275–294, 214–217. See also my general discussion (298–301).



SIC TEMPORA MUTANTUR

What remains to be explained is the question of the title, 'Tempora mutantur'. Although Sisman refers to it in connection with her interpretation of the slow movement of Symphony No. 64 as 'an extended essay on time out of joint' and hypothesizes that it formed part of Haydn's incidental music for *Hamlet*, the title is open to other interpretations. As such, it deserves a separate discussion.⁷⁸

The relation proposed by Foster between the title of Haydn's symphony and Owen's epigram is based on the assumption that 'most Europeans of literary culture in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries were acquainted with the works of Owen, ten books of epigrams which commanded extraordinary influence, particularly in German literature'.⁷⁹ Sisman adds credence to this assumption by pointing out that Owen's epigrams 'had been translated frequently into German, and had been published in Latin in Basel as recently as 1766'.⁸⁰ She also corroborates the relation between the slow movement of the symphony and the second line of the epigram by suggesting that the temporal progress of the former reflects the progress of moral corruption described in the latter: 'The epigram embodies a human truth; the slow movement is clearly a musical interpretation of that truth. The times are changed and we grow worse'.⁸¹ Foster's own attempt to match the words of the epigram with the melody of the rondo theme is limited to the first line and, as he states, it is 'especially the first line' that became world-famous.⁸² This clue is revealing in the light of his further remark that 'Owen did borrow single lines from predecessors and work them up into epigrams'. Foster himself admits that 'some of the credit for the first line is due variously (according to dictionaries of quotations) to Lothar I of Germany and to Raphael Holinshed', although he finds it 'fair to claim that its international fame is due wholly to Owen'.⁸³ In reality, this line is much older than Foster suspects. In English literature it is quoted in William Harrison's *Description of England* (1577), part of *Holinshed's Chronicles*, and occurs in John Lyly's *Euphues* (1578).⁸⁴ Its tradition goes back further in Germany, where it has been a popular proverb since the Reformation. Before 1554 it was recorded by Caspar Huberinus:

Tempora labuntur, tacitisque senescimus annis;
Tempora mutantur, nosque mutamur in illis.⁸⁵

The German translation of the proverb was provided in 1565 by Johannes Nas:

Tempora mutantur et nos mutamur in ipsis;
Die zeit wirdt verendert vnd wir in der zeit.⁸⁶

78 Another interpretation of the title was proposed by Thomas Tolley, *Painting the Cannon's Roar: Music, the Visual Arts and the Rise of an Attentive Public in the Age of Haydn, c. 1750 to c. 1810* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001), 88. This author associates the theme of changing times with political issues of the day, such as the Partition of Poland, in which Austria participated in 1772–1773.

79 Foster, 'The Tempora Mutantur Symphony', 328.

80 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 326.

81 Sisman, 'Haydn's Theater Symphonies', 327.

82 Foster, 'The Tempora Mutantur Symphony', 328.

83 Foster, 'The Tempora Mutantur Symphony', 329, note 4.

84 William Harrison, *The Description of England: The Classic Contemporary Account of Tudor Social Life*, ed. Georges Edelen (Mineola: Dover, 1994), 170; John Lyly, *Euphues: The Anatomy of Wyt* (London: Cawood, 1578), 276. The popularity of this line in England is further testified to by the title of a caricature, 'Tempora mutantur', mentioned by Tolley in connection with his hypothesis summarized in note 78.

85 Caspar Huberinus, *Postilla Deusch* (Frankfurt, 1554), f. 354.

86 Johannes Nas, *Das Antipapistisch eins vnd hundert* ([Ingolstadt,] 1565), f. 83.



Somewhat altered, it occurs in a couplet dedicated by Matthias Borbonius to Emperor Lothar I and was included in the anthology *Delitiae Poetarum Germanorum*:

Omnia mutantur, nos et mutamur in illis
Illa vices quasdam res habet, illa vices.⁸⁷

The opening clause of the Borbonius version is a quotation from Ovid's *Metamorphoses*: 'Omnia mutantur, nihil interit'.⁸⁸ Lyly also refers to Ovid: 'The tymes are chaunged as Ouid sayeth, and wee are chaunged in the times.'⁸⁹ The fact that he quotes the opening clause imprecisely betrays that it does not come from Ovid. In fact, it is an adage adopted from an oral tradition and inherited from classical antiquity by the Middle Ages as one of those Latin *sententiae* that formed the stuff of grammar and rhetoric and adorned scholarly discourse up to the eighteenth century.⁹⁰ And discourse about music too: early eighteenth-century music-theoretical treatises overflow with *sententiae*, and one of them contains the sentence we are concerned with. In his first treatise, *Das Neu-Eröffnete Orchestre*, Mattheson writes, 'Der bey den Alten verbotene Sprung der *Septimae* ist bey itziger Zeit unsere beste *decoration*. *Sic tempora mutantur*.' (The skip of the major seventh, prohibited by the old, is now our best decoration. *Sic tempora mutantur*.)⁹¹

The stylistic change from the 'old' baroque music to the 'new' galant style in the first decades of the eighteenth century demonstrated that compositional rules are conventions and that, from time to time, they change. To be sure, cadences were the most important eighteenth-century conventions. Would a day come when they disappeared? This might be the question Haydn asked himself and tried to answer in the slow movement of Symphony No. 64. To label it 'Tempora mutantur etc.' would not be far from the mind of someone who started his pieces *In Nomine Domini*, finished them *Laus Deo* and laced his conversation with Latin proverbs.⁹² But in his days this movement remained a thought experiment. Cadences did not disappear from eighteenth-century music. One had to wait for another century to see this convention wane, and, when it declined, this brought about the end of tonality and disintegration of traditional musical forms. For Haydn and his generation, music without cadences was music of the future – and so it remained.

87 *Delitiae Poetarum Germanorum huius superiorisque aevi illustrium*, volume 1 (Frankfurt, 1612), 685. Foster's incorrect attribution of this couplet to its dedicatee, Emperor Lothar I, comes from Georg Büchmann, *Geflügelte Worte: Der Citatenschatz des deutschen Volkes* (Berlin: Haude and Spener, 1898), 506.

88 'Everything is changed, nothing perishes' (book 15, line 165).

89 Quoted in George Latimer Apperson and Martin Manser, *Dictionary of Proverbs* (Ware: Wordsworth, 2006), 582.

90 *Sententiae* were 'inserted into the speech at the conclusion of individual paragraphs' (Sisman, *Haydn and the Classical Variation*, 33, note 67).

91 Johann Mattheson, *Das Neu-Eröffnete Orchestre* (Hamburg: Benjamin Schillers Witwe, 1713), 111.

92 For instance, *sunt bona mixta malis, nihil sine causa* and *sed hoc inter nos*. See David Wyn Jones, 'Becoming a Complete Kapellmeister: Haydn and Mattheson's *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*', *Studia Musicologica* 51/1 (2010), 32.