UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

FACULTY OF BUSINESS AND LAW

Winchester School of Art

Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope

by

Georgina Suzanne Williams

Thesis for degree of Doctor of Philosophy

August 2014

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

ABSTRACT

FACULTY OF BUSINESS AND LAW

Winchester School of Art

Doctor of Philosophy

LINES OF BEAUTY:
PROPAGANDA, THE POSTER, AND THE PICTORIAL TROPE

by Georgina Suzanne Williams

Propaganda conceived for distribution via the medium of the pictorial poster creates artwork that can be productively examined from an aesthetic as well as political perspective. When this artwork is primarily restricted to conflict propaganda from the second decade of the twentieth century, the temporal and contextual considerations assist in focussing the poster's role as a functional object, not only within a propaganda campaign but also within the wider visual ecology of an era.

For the poster to operate as an effective means of propaganda distribution, the propagandist requires composition that incorporates constructs capable of attracting the viewer. In isolating a particular construct, its manifestation has the potential to be utilised as a tool in the unpacking of the imagery; consequently the concept of a propagandist promotion of an alternate reality as a challenge to a current real, and the prospective movement from one to the other, can be literally and figuratively conveyed via its employment as a pictorial trope. In this regard, the construct deemed to represent not only movement, but movement at its most beautiful thereby forming a focus for attraction, is the serpentine curve that in 1745 William Hogarth scribed and titled the *line of beauty* (Hogarth, 1997 p6).

In concentrating on the poster within the wider genre of early twentieth century visual conflict propaganda, and creating new associations with aesthetic and metaphoric concepts pertaining to the *line of beauty*, this research becomes the articulation of how each contributory element within the artwork's construction 'respectively influences the identity and the economies of the other', thereby providing 'a model by which to focus and rethink' these relationships (Ostrow, 2005 p226). The *line of beauty* serves as both cause and effect of the process by which the relationships are reconsidered, thus provoking an innovative discourse as to the potential impact of the whole upon the visual culture field.

LIST OF CONTENTS

Academic Thesis: Declaration Of Authorship

I, Georgina Suzanne Williams, declare that this thesis and the work presented in it are my own and has been generated by me as the result of my own original research.

Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope

I confirm that:

1. This work was done wholly or mainly while in candidature for a research degree at this University;

2. Where any part of this thesis has previously been submitted for a degree or any other qualification at this University or any other institution, this has been clearly stated;

3. Where I have consulted the published work of others, this is always clearly attributed;

4. Where I have quoted from the work of others, the source is always given. With the exception of such quotations, this thesis is entirely my own work;

5. I have acknowledged all main sources of help;

6. Where the thesis is based on work done by myself jointly with others, I have made clear exactly what was done by others and what I have contributed myself;

7. Either none of this work has been published before submission, or parts of this work have been published as: [please list references below]:

Signed: ……..……

Date: ..……

With grateful thanks to Professor Ryan Bishop

and with thanks and love to Michael, Hannah, and Joseph

Introduction

As a genre within the field of visual culture, pictorial conflict propaganda, with the primary emphasis upon the poster, is the artwork under consideration in this research. Whilst previous assessments of propagandist artwork have considered recurring motifs within compositions, what this research sets out to accomplish, and therefore differentiating it from other studies, is the isolation of a particular visual construct not usually associated with artwork of this genus and the consequent explanation as to what its presence within the works subsequently represents. The construct utilised as a tool for the unpacking of the imagery is not one that has been chosen at random, but instead selected for its genealogical legacy and more importantly for its connotation as both a literal and metaphorical representation of movement. The pertinence of this to the artwork central to the research lies in the concept of a propagandist promotion of an alternate reality as a challenge to a current "real", and which therefore includes hypotheses such as Jean Baudrillard's assertion that what is provoked by "simulation" is the extinction of truth (1983 p6). Consequently the potential for circular cause and consequence relating to competing constructions of the real suggests conditions of possibility whereby the metaphorical movement between them can be aesthetically represented by a literal, visual construct. To this end the construct that serves as a pictorial trope deemed to represent not only movement, but movement at its most beautiful, thereby forming a focus for the attraction of the viewer, is the 'serpentine line' that in 1745 artist and theorist William Hogarth (1697-1764) scribed on a paint palette and titled 'THE LINE OF BEAUTY' (Hogarth, 1997 p6, capitals in the original) [Fig. 1].

It is worth acknowledging, however, that in the introduction to a 1955 edition of Hogarth's manuscript *The Analysis of Beauty*, Joseph Burke writes that 'The serpentine line, which has proved a stumbling-block to so many readers of the *Analysis,* requires some introduction', despite it being 'as old as art itself...' (1955 pxlix). *Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope* as a body of research does not concentrate on elements contained within an image in a way that might construe it as being a work dedicated to semiotics, and Hogarth's interest in the aesthetic legacy of the serpentine curve is most noteworthy in establishing the role the *line of beauty* plays in respect of this. The work of artists and theorists including Gian Paolo Lomazzo (1538-1592) assisted in formulating Hogarth's ideas surrounding this serpentine curve and his subsequent designation of this pictorial trope as a *line of beauty*, and this aspect as it pertains to this research is further

contextualised in the first chapter of this text titled *The Genealogy of the* Line *and the Role of Resemblances*. In the articulation of his objective, Hogarth writes that

> "More reasons I form'd to myself but not necessary here why I should not continue copying objects but rather read the language of them (and if possible find a grammar to it) and collect and retain a remembrance of what I saw by repeated observations only trying every now and then upon my canvas how far I was advanc'd by that means" (Hogarth in Burke, J., 1955 pxxxviii).

In trying to ascertain a "grammar" within what he was being forced by convention to copy, Hogarth sought a "language" he could interpret, of which the serpentine curve – the *line of beauty* – became the catalyst, as he was later to communicate in his 1753 published manuscript *The Analysis of Beauty.* Joseph Burke comments that for Hogarth 'Memorizing was helped by a natural impulse to abstract the salient' and this observation is further endorsed by Hogarth's own declaration that '"the most striking things that presented themselves made the strongest impressions, in my mind"' (Burke, J., 1955 pxxxix). Burke's further clarification of this point, concerning the artist whose predilection is 'for seizing the essential in the abbreviated form' (pxxxix), allies with the notion that perception 'is always an active process, conditioned by our expectations and adapted to situations' (Gombrich, 1959 p148). This is, arguably, a conditioning that includes our literally-inherited traditions as well as those connected with 'resemblance – not clearly and logically perceived, but felt – that evokes and relates the conscious elements' (Ribot, 1906 p41). These are concepts more fully considered in the following chapter, but it is relevant to acknowledge at this point the correlation that exists in both Hogarth's assertions and Joseph Burke's comments with the reasoning that lies behind the construction of concise propagandist messaging conceived for the specific purpose of distribution via the functional object of the pictorial poster. For this particular medium to be effective the propagandist needs to create imagery comprising visual constructs capable of "striking" the viewer in order for each individual to perceive and subsequently extract that which the propagandist considers to be crucial.

In further explanation of the *line of beauty* as it relates to this research, it is important to acknowledge Hogarth's simultaneous reference within his manuscript to the *line of grace* (1997 p51), a serpentine curve that in general is three-dimensional and not necessarily seen in its entirety, for example a *line* that dips in and out of vision as it curves around a sculptured figure. Hogarth comments in this regard, reflecting upon a utilisation within artworks where not all the *line* can be shown

visually, meaning it often requires the aid of the imagination to continue through any breach (p42) – a concept in itself that is explored in later chapters of this research. Hogarth's theory relating to this point is certainly corroborated in respect of the *line*'s "disappearance" as perceived by the viewer, not only in the three-dimensional object in and of itself, but also as viewed in the two-dimensional execution of something three-dimensional, such as in the pictorial compositional elements that contribute to the construction of a poster. Hogarth insists the *line of beauty* and the *line of grace* should be 'judiciously mixt' (p51), however, and therefore, bearing in mind the *line of grace* as a separate concept has arguably all but been subsumed into that which surrounds the more commonly referred to "Line of Beauty", it is the latter expression that is exclusively employed throughout this text.

Taking into account the elements so far considered, and in order to further define the boundaries of this study, the propaganda artwork under examination is primarily restricted to visual conflict propaganda from the second decade of the twentieth century. Although the premise of this investigation suggests a prospective genealogy which threads into other eras as well as cultures – and these are acknowledged throughout this research for contextual purposes – this era has been carefully selected via consideration of a number of factors. Firstly, it is in these early years of the century that the pictorial poster was first exploited by the state (Weill, 1984 p129) and subsequently used as a tool for the distribution of propagandist messaging. Secondly, propaganda as a concept was beginning to be considered in the context we now understand, and this point is examined later in this *Introduction*. Of prime import is the recognition that

> As the war's meaning began to be enveloped in a fog of existential questioning, the integrity of the "real" world, the visible and ordered world, was undermined. As the war called into question the rational connections of the prewar world – the nexus, that is, or cause and effect – the meaning of civilization as tangible achievement was assaulted, as was the nineteenth-century view that all history represented progress (Eksteins, 2000 p211).

Certainly in Britain at least a 'tiny social elite held the threads of social, economic and political power firmly in their grasp' (Jones, 2014 p178) and the 'self-conscious modernism' particular artists and writers possessed assisted in jeopardising the 'cosy certainties' of an age that long before August 1914 was already effectively obsolete (p11). Futurist and Vorticist modernity contributed to these innovations in art and expression, resulting in artworks informed by fascination with technology,

movement and speed and which results in an inevitable association with the first 'truly modern war' (Walsh, 2002 p93). In pursuing an analogous correlation with the *line of beauty* in respect of this transformational period, therefore, the idea that 'the Great War was perhaps the last to be conceived as taking place within a seamless, purposeful "history" involving a coherent stream of time running from past through present to future' (Fussell, 2009 p21) is of note. This legacy-associated metaphor parallels the genealogical as well as the representational mobility of the *line*, and these ideas are explored throughout this research especially as they relate to a propaganda perspective. Mark Wollaeger maintains that at the commencement of the twentieth century 'modernism and modern propaganda emerged as mutually illuminating responses to modernity' (2008 pxi) and when this is articulated through the pictorial it generates artworks that are of both propaganda and *counter*-propaganda provenance, as neither can operate in isolation. During this prescribed era the propaganda poster that is central to this research, an example of which is illustrated at Figure 2, inevitably instigated a counter-propagandist aesthetic response, regardless of whether or not the artist's intention was consciously reactive. The direct association of the Savile Lumley poster [Fig. 2] to these considerations is more fully explored later in this text, yet it nevertheless reflects Joseph Burke's comment that there is a necessity for capturing what is critical, as previously cited, not least in the idea of the 'visual ellipsis' (Klein, 2012), a concept interpreted in the next chapter. It is important to assert at this point, however, that the isolating of this visual trope is not about testing the attraction of the "line" deemed to be a *line of beauty* for the specific purpose of *proving* its effect. This study concentrates instead on recognising the presence of this serpentine curve within artworks – as Hogarth practiced – yet with the focus upon artworks utilised for the distribution of conflict propaganda, particularly the medium of the poster, and what the existence of the *line* as a contributory compositional element within them potentially signifies from both a literal and metaphorical point of view.

This research is therefore not concerned with the more usual analysis pertaining to each image as an object, nor is it associated with image studies that concentrate on compositional generalisations, the aesthetics of a defined era, or one particular art movement or singular style. Equally it does not centre solely on the genealogy of the visual trope. This research explores focussed combinations from within each of these areas and investigates their subsequent formation into a unique whole. The originality lies in employing the eighteenth century aesthetic theory that creates the concept of the *line of beauty* as a means through which pictorial propaganda

relevant to the temporal and contextual emphasis already described can be examined, because 'When two seemingly disparate elements are imaginatively poised, put in apposition in new and unique ways, startling discoveries often result' (McLuhan and Fiore, 2008 p10). The emergence of interest in the so-called "reading" of imagery and the acknowledgement of recurring thematic concepts within 'contemporary image culture' (Manghani et al, 2006 p2) highlights a relevance with regard to what this study aims to achieve, subsequently indicating a prospective position for this research in the more general conversation. The focus upon early twentieth century pictorial conflict propaganda examined through the employment of an eighteenth-century aesthetic theory results in a combination of elements that not only effect each other and therefore the whole, but illustrate a genealogical thread with the potential to permeate into the twenty-first century, as is considered throughout this text.

Theorists and Terms

In support of the comments made so far in this *Introduction*, in relation to the reading and analysis of images a 'single "interdiscipline"' can be considered as 'inappropriate' (Manghani et al, 2006 p1); consequently the incorporation of philosophical, theoretical, literary and aesthetic models is instigated in order to examine the imagery contained within this study as each pertains to the specified boundaries. To this end, although ostensibly an eclectic array of theorists has been utilised in formulating this research, each has been selected for his or her specific relevance in underpinning the concepts that contribute to the central premise. These include, but are not limited to, theorists from fields relating to cultural and communication theory, critical technology studies, aesthetics, and perceptual psychology. If on occasion a theorist or theorem is represented in isolation, it is because the particular explanation of the point under consideration is deemed to be the most apposite.

With this in mind, therefore, Victoria O'Donnell's and Garth Jowett's remarks relating to Jacques Ellul's ideas concerning the 'pervasiveness of propaganda' (2012 pxiv) are pertinent. Although 'respectful' of the philosopher and sociologist, O'Donnell and Jowett express they cannot concur with his summation (pxiv). The "pervasiveness of propaganda" is aptly illustrative of both propaganda's rise as a concept and the subsequent recognition of the same, however; consequently Ellul's evaluations are suited to the specific temporal and contextual parameters within which this research is positioned. It is also Ellul who conceived the term

"propagandee" and this text employs this neologism in order to indicate the individual as a specified receiver of a propaganda message. Furthermore, in the consideration of artwork regarded to have a propagandist function it is important to assess any differences between what constitutes "propaganda" and what is more usually deemed as being "persuasion". The early twentieth century dictionary listing of the word "propaganda" is at variance with the twenty-first century entry, yet a similar differentiation is not evident in the two denotations of the word "persuasion", or the more explanatory derivative of "persuade". It is possible to distinguish between propaganda and persuasion by declaring the latter as interactive and for the benefit of both parties, whereas the former is in the interest of the propagandist only (O'Donnell and Jowett, 2012 p1). However, Ellul's concept of the propagandist and the propagandee sharing culpability in the propaganda process assists in negating this distinction (1973 p119). In addition, because propaganda as a term was nascent in the prescribed era of this text, it is feasible to consider "propaganda" as arguably being a focussed field that not only lies within the more general concept of "persuasion", but is also indicative of a more concentrated approach by the instigator towards a targeted individual or group, regardless of their prospective collusion, and this is further considered throughout this text. Nevertheless, in acknowledging these temporal boundaries, for the purposes of this research both terms have been utilised, albeit with each commented upon where deemed appropriate.

Propaganda is a complex subject, and in addition to the points relating to "propaganda" and "persuasion" already referred to are the differences that potentially exist between what is considered to be "propaganda" and what is meant by the more general term of "information". Despite their close association there is a distinction between the two that lies in the propagandist's aim of leaving the propagandee with an 'impression' rather than merely facts and/or figures (Ellul, 1973 p86). Konrad Kellen remarks that Ellul does not base his work on 'statistics' or 'quantification' but instead on 'observation and logic' (Kellen, 1973 pvii) and in this respect the significance of resemblances and post-cognitive affect as they relate to this process within the prescribed boundaries is examined in the following chapter. It is this contrast that distinguishes this research, primarily concerned as it is with visual culture, from a study associated more with social science. Regardless, in this context it is still "information" being conveyed, with the difference apparent only in the propagandist's intention and the propagandee's subsequent perception of that information, as explored later in this text. This latter point concerning a

propagandist's conveyance of information is further supported by the idea that 'The state inevitably spreads propaganda because the need to publicize its accomplishments results in the dissemination of information designed to alter public opinion' (Wollaeger, 2008 p143). "Dissemination of information" is a pertinent expression when considered not only in the context of the distribution of propaganda via the medium of the poster in general, but in relation to a more focussed distribution in particular, as is the case during times of conflict. Moreover,

> The public accelerates the transformation of information into propaganda because public opinion generally prefers the clarity of myth (propaganda's specialty) to a chaotic profusion of facts, and there is simply too much information in circulation for most people to process (Wollaeger, 2008 p143).

This highlights the relevance of a concise propagandist message in focussing the attention of the propagandee, and the medium of the poster as a method for distribution and which includes within its composition a construct with the ability to attract, such as the *line of beauty*, is productive for the purpose. In addition, Wollaeger's comments serve to enforce the points of the premise previously reflected upon, therefore functioning not only as a reminder of the propagandist/propagandee "collaboration", but also demonstrative of the circular cause and consequence that is an inevitable part of propagandist messaging and the counter-propagandist response, whether distributed pictorially or otherwise. In further recognition of the debate surrounding "propaganda" as opposed to "information", it is relevant to acknowledge Wollaeger's assessment that it was not until the 1950s that 'the erosion of the distinction' between the two was 'theorized' (2008 pxiv). Consequently, and in consideration once more of the temporal parameters of this research alongside Wollaeger's more general comment that 'one person's propaganda is another person's information' that thereby makes the 'distinction between the two' often too complex to discern (p2), both "propaganda" and "information" as nouns are utilised collaboratively throughout this text.

Composition

As further clarification of the points made in the last section, during the twentieth century the dictionary denotations of the word "propaganda" changed, from a 1913 designation of '...any organization or plan for spreading a particular doctrine or a system of principles' (Webster, 1913) to a more recent entry of 'Information, especially of a biased or misleading nature, used to promote a political cause or point of view...' (OED, 2009 p1150). Hindsight enables the "propaganda" of the

former period to be analysed utilising the explanation documented in the latter, however, especially when taking into account the period within the twentieth century under examination here. This is as applicable to pictorial propaganda as it is to that distributed via other means, and the succinct, quotable aphorism that summarises the essence of doctrine and that is neoterically known as a “sound bite” has a visual equivalent perfectly demonstrated in the medium of the poster. This particular art form encapsulates the aforementioned “essence” through concise textual and design constructs that convey to the masses the ideology and information of their progenitors, “advertising” political matters including conflict. Propaganda art equals ‘art in the service of social and political change’ (Moore, 2010 p7), and it is therefore productive for conflict propaganda poster art, and the inevitable artistic counter-response, to be examined from an aesthetic as well as political point of view, as is the aim of this research. The ability to effectively communicate visually to the masses requires design that instigates instantaneous and efficient attraction, and in the concept of a visual construct employed to assist in effecting this objective lies the link to Hogarth previously explained and which is consequently of particular pertinence.

In addition to the specified visual construct of the *line of beauty* there is further association that links Hogarth, his ideas, and subsequent interpretations, to early twentieth century pictorial propaganda. This connection lies in the engraved print of the eighteenth century and its parallels with the poster, a medium of distributing information that grew not only from the technological advances in printing techniques but also from ‘the emergence of a precise sociopolitical need, rendered acute as suffrage was extended to ever greater numbers of people’ (Schnapp, 2005 p21). Marshall McLuhan writes that ‘With print the discovery of the vernacular as a PA system was immediate’ (1962 p194), an observation that not only analogises the bond between a literal “sound bite” and its optical equivalent, but also emphasises the value of the medium as it pertains to the propagandist’s purpose.
Supplementary support of the employment of Hogarth within the context of this research also exists in how Hogarth satirised the exploitative and often socially- and morally-bankrupt London he was embedded within by executing and selling, as a means of social commentary, pragmatic engravings of subjects common to his environment and the time in which he lived (Shesgreen, 1973 pxiv). In this respect, ‘Because satire was so keenly appreciated by his age, he had a public quick to respond to all that was most original in his genius’ (Burke, J., 1955 pxvi), and these considerations are reflected in the more contemporary observation that

> To write and speak about the psychology of visual propaganda is to suggest that the content of such propaganda carries meaning, and not only meaning in a cognitive or a semantic sense, but in an emotional and evaluative sense as well. It implies that there is someone, a propagandist, that can be an individual or a group, who endows visual messages with meaning, and that such meaning has political significance because it works to produce persuasive effects for targeted audiences (Bryder, 2008 p101).

The requirement for efficiently constructed, visual propagandist messaging should be further considered in the context that propaganda is of most value 'when based on a collective center of interest, shared by the crowds', as opposed to rooted in an 'individual prejudice' (Ellul, 1973 p49). This not only supports Hogarth's obvious and successful interest in being a visual portrayer of contemporary issues, but also underscores Tom Bryder's assertions as to the importance of exploitation of the pictorial as a specific propagandist stratagem.

Of particular significance in this regard is Bryder's remark concerning a validation of the subject matter through the discourse it provokes, because this speaks of the ways in which visual culture as a field of study has opened up the possibility of examining previously-asked questions from alternative angles (Rogoff, 2002 p26). This is especially relevant when taking into account the conflictions that inevitably arise through reasoned debate, with the result that

> The relationship between intellectual knowledge and visual representation is frequently misunderstood. Some theorists talk as though an abstract concept could be directly rendered in a picture; others deny that theoretical knowledge can do anything but disturb pictorial conception. The truth would seem to be that some abstract propositions can be translated into visual form and as such become a genuine part of a visual conception (Arnheim, 1956 p121).

Consequently, by focussing upon early twentieth century conflict propaganda art in general and the propaganda poster in particular, and combining this with the aesthetic and metaphoric concepts surrounding the *line of beauty* in its role as a visual trope, this research becomes the articulation of how each contributing component 'respectively influences the identity and the economies of the other' thereby providing 'a model by which to focus and rethink' these relationships (Ostrow, 2005 p226). Studies within the field of visual culture

> provide the possibility of unframing some of the discussions we have been engaged in regarding presences and absences, invisibility and stereotypes, desires, reifications and objectifications from the disciplinary fields... which first articulated their status as texts and objects (Rogoff, 2002 p27).

The theoretical deliberations observed by Rudolf Arnheim cited earlier include the aesthetic concepts put forward by Hogarth in the eighteenth century. The employment of the *line of beauty* as a catalyst within this text as already noted serves as a tool in the unpacking of theories and assumptions that surround a particular genre within the visual culture field – namely, the conflict propaganda art created during the prescribed era, with specific focus upon the medium of the pictorial poster.

What is of note to consider in relation to this research, and following on from the comments previously made with respect to distinct denotations of terms, is that there is a 'sinister ring' to the word "propaganda" which is suggestive of 'manipulative persuasion, intimidation and deception' (Clark, 1997 p7). Conversely, "art" as a universal encapsulation is usually indicative of 'a special sphere of activity devoted to the pursuit of truth, beauty and freedom' (p7), meaning the expression "propaganda art" arguably could be considered as an oxymoron. Furthermore, when a visual construct designated as a "line of beauty" that when implemented is as applicable to literal representations of movement as it is to the metaphorical is added to the equation, the paradoxical effect of the phrase is enhanced, with the consequence that the construct as a pictorial trope becomes both the cause and effect of the process by which the relationships are re-evaluated.

Structure

The aim of this research is to explore the key elements of this somewhat broad term of "propaganda art", with especial regard to the pictorial poster, as are material to the temporal and contextual boundaries cited, and consequently examine the effects the catalyst of the *line of beauty* provoke when the two apparently disparate subject areas are brought together. The first chapter, titled *The Genealogy of the* Line *and the Role of Resemblances*, expands upon Hogarth's role as it applies to the parameters of this text, thereby reinforcing the importance of his eighteenth century aesthetic theorising as this pertains to the genealogical thread of the serpentine curve he named the *line of beauty.* The genealogical legacy of this pictorial trope is explored through the relevance of *Figura Serpentinata*, alongside historical

references regarding “beauty” reaching back to Plato’s ancient Greece, as well as those that express the necessity for the effective suggestion of movement within artworks to be articulated through an s-shaped curve. In isolating this construct within the artworks specific to this study, this chapter also addresses the impact the *line of beauty*’s appearance has on the viewer, as an individual’s perception is effected not only by personal experience but also by memory traces. The *line* as perceived by the viewer may be present within an artwork considered to be “beautiful” in its entirety, or conversely may be either knowingly or unknowingly incorporated as a distractive elemental component representative of beauty within an artwork arguably considered to the contrary. Regardless, and because a propagandist message whether pictorial or otherwise is aimed at the attraction of the individual within the mass (Ellul, 1973 p9), the role of the individual as participant within a crowd – as opposed to the individual who stands outside it – is explored. This examination includes concepts concerning the constitution of the ‘psychological crowd’ (Le Bon, 2001 p13), the conventions of the participative mass thereby considered in relation to its potential for prospective manipulation.

In ascertaining the elemental components of a constructed image, of which the *line of beauty* as a visual construct serving as an attraction for the viewer is of most relevance within the context of this research, the values of these constituent factors are examined as they individually and collectively contribute to the role the poster plays as a valuable medium for the distribution of conflict propagandist information. Efficient construction of the propaganda poster assists in its effective inclusion within a wider propaganda campaign, contributing to the poster’s continuing relevance as a medium for distribution in addition to its potential as a productive object in and of itself, and this forms the focus of the chapter titled *The Poster as a Functional Object*. The relevance of this particular medium is examined, not only during the specified decade but also in relation to how its heritage has impacted upon the latter years of the twentieth century and into the twenty-first, despite competition from ever-advancing methods of information-conveyance through technological innovation. Within this medium lies the potential for the inclusion of the pictorial trope with a genealogical legacy that encompasses the temporal and contextual conditions surrounding the rise of the poster as a propagandist tool, namely the *line of beauty.* The ability for this visual construct to express movement, thereby bestowing upon it a metaphorical as well as literal connotation when viewed from a propagandist perspective, is of primary import and its effectiveness therefore depends upon how productively the suggestion of that movement can be perceived

by the viewer (Gombrich, 1977 p193). The experimentation of photographic processes that capture *actual* movement, including chronophotography and photodynamism, informed the aesthetic output of Futurist and Vorticist artists in their objective of creating artworks that demonstrate the influence of technology, movement and speed, as the chapter *The Static Representation of Movement in Art and War* serves to examine. This includes not only the merging of the mechanistic with the figurative, which led to the mechanomorphic aesthetic compositions that demonstrate the Vorticists' and, particularly, the Futurists' interest in the technologically-innovative, but also the additional influence of dance as a medium for expressing movement. This latter aspect is highlighted by Hogarth, and arguably as central to Futurist thematic concepts as the apparatus of war. Consequently, the *line of beauty* as a visual construct representative of this manifestation of literal as well as metaphoric movement is the mechanism by which these influences are deemed to have impacted upon the pictorial propaganda of the prescribed era of this research. This is not only as it subscribes to the compositional elements contained within the poster in particular, but also how movement can be additionally integral to a viewer's perception if taken into consideration at the point of presentation of the information. Furthermore, this chapter explores the contexts within which the connotations of the serpentine line at the centre of this research contribute to the more general "language" of lines. The means by which the artist utilises this "language" in aesthetically articulating his or her own literal and figurative expressions of movement further affirm the *line of beauty*'s position as a viable pictorial construct suitable for propagandist exploitation, including via the medium of the poster.

In focussing upon the aesthetics of conflict within the temporal boundaries of this text, the chapter titled *Representing the Real in the Aesthetics of Conflict* concentrates not only on propaganda artwork with particular emphasis upon the pictorial poster, but also the counter-propagandist response of the soldier-artists of World War I. The influence of Modernist concepts gave rise to new ways in which conflict could be aesthetically depicted and the *line of beauty*, as an elemental component within these works in its role as a visual construct that expresses movement, initiates a blend of the viewer's eye and imagination in order for it to be perceived as "beautiful". When this is considered from the perspective of the construct's position within an artwork deemed to be counter to our preconceived ideas of "beauty", as is prevalent in artworks that emerge from the battlefields of conflict including World War I, it is reasonable to conjecture that it is this visual

construct that instigates the viewer's attraction to the work, and this particular contextual consideration is addressed throughout this chapter. The *line of beauty* is examined for its function as a synchronic object that, as already emphasised, is not only indicative of literal movement but also representative of the metaphoric value that lies in the *line*'s ability to pictorially assist in conveying competing constructions of a real within both propaganda and counter-propaganda artworks of the time. In addition to this significant consideration of the metaphoric perspective of the *line* is the examination of the idea of empathetic involvement as a requirement in the effective collaboration between propagandist and propagandee, and these concepts continue to be highlighted throughout this research for their compelling contribution to the propaganda process. The rise of the pictorial poster during this era generated the conditions within which conflict could effectively be "advertised", and the correlation between the poster created for commercial advertising and that designed specifically for propaganda purposes is examined in the chapter titled *Gauging the Conflict Propaganda Poster within the Wider Visual Ecology*, along with consideration and further clarification of the manipulation of an individual's nostalgic view of his or her past to suit the progenitor's objective. During this period the pictorial poster was required to form part of a larger, more complex campaign specific to the propaganda cause, and therefore its position within the wider *visual* ecology in particular is further contextualised when other mediums of predominantly pictorial propagandist distribution are considered alongside it. In following on from the assessment of conflict art as is relevant to the boundaries of this research, one of these competing methods of information-distribution is the contemporaneous reaction to the artworks that emerged from the trenches of World War I, and these analyses subsequently generate a debate in respect of the literal construction and application of a *line of beauty*. In addition is propagandist messaging in the form of the newsreel, an analogous visual medium which therefore justifies the position of the singular example *The Battle of the Somme* as a comparative and competitive alternative to the poster in the wider media ecology of the time. In assessing the role of each method by which propagandist messaging can visually be conveyed, the emphasis remains on the specific pictorial trope contained within them, that is to say the construct of the *line of beauty*.

The Genealogy of the *Line* and the Role of Resemblances

In establishing the function of the conflict pictorial poster, particularly in relation to this medium's utilisation during the second decade of the twentieth century, it is necessary to acknowledge the compositional elements that contribute to the object as a whole. Of most significance to the parameters of this study is the visual construct of the *line of beauty*, not only for its literal presence, but also for the *line*'s figurative association with movement from a propagandist objective, whereby 'a metastable, programmatic, descriptive machine' can offer 'all the signs of the real' (Baudrillard, 1983 p4). As already commented upon, there is an obvious requirement for the pictorial propagandist to make use of whatever visual constructs can serve propaganda's purpose – namely, the embedding within the artwork of something upon which a propagandee can focus and which is the source of attraction for the wider visual message. The role of the poster as an object in and of itself is examined in the chapter dedicated to the medium; however, as commented upon above, it is first relevant to consider the compositional elements of which that object is comprised and which are therefore instrumental in the artwork's effectiveness or otherwise as a means of distribution for propagandist information, particularly the specific use of the *line of beauty*. In this respect and taking into account the temporal considerations of this text, in talking about wartime propaganda Toby Clark speaks of the use by propagandists of 'conventional visual codes already established in mass culture' (1997 p103). Clark underlines the importance of the "visual code" in the role of a recognisable construct that remains a constant regardless of the differing media within which it is embedded (p103), an aspect relating to contrasting as well as competing mediums of propaganda distribution examined in a later chapter. Baudrillard expands upon this idea of a necessity for the recognisable with his declaration that 'We need a visible past, a visible continuum, a visible myth of origin, to reassure us as to our ends...' (1983 p19). This is a concept that serves as further support of the premise behind the utilisation of the *line of beauty* as a pictorial trope, and in addition demonstrates the requirement for a semiotic construction such as the *line* to possess a genealogical heritage. Consequently this chapter further acknowledges and explains Hogarth's position in not only how his articulation of his own perception of the serpentine curve within the artworks he studied formed the basis for his aesthetic treatise, but also how, within the broader picture, his naming of the *line* as the *line of beauty* is positioned as a link in a long genealogical chain. It is this genealogy that exposes an opportunity for the propagandist to exploit a visual construct in the prospective

manipulation of the viewer: the chapter therefore additionally considers how, whilst remaining within the defined boundaries, the *line of beauty* serves as an example of Baudrillard's "visible continuum" and subsequently is of value as a propagandist tool in the construction of the conflict pictorial poster aimed at the individual within the mass.

'An Old Acquaintance'

As alluded to in the *Introduction*, Hogarth's decision to commit his thoughts and ideas to paper grew from his disquiet regarding the so-called "rules" that existed in the eighteenth century in relation to aesthetic academia (Uglow, 2002 p519), yet what is of greatest consequence in the context of this research is the additional inspiration that arose from the querying interest aroused by the *line of beauty* scribed on his 1745 self-portrait (p519), as illustrated at Figure 3. Hogarth's original intention was that his subsequent manuscript, *The Analysis of Beauty*, would be 'a painter's book' rather than 'an academic treatise', and he undertook his research vigorously – a translation of Socrates' debate regarding beauty from Xenophon's *Memorabilia* was found within his papers (Uglow, 2002 p520-521), a document referenced in a later chapter of this research. Despite Hogarth being initially unwilling to physically write the text of his manuscript himself – literary skills not being his strong suit – he came to understand the impracticality of asking one man to articulate the ideas of another, and Hogarth's biographer Jenny Uglow believes it is clear that within the manuscript 'the central ideas and examples were all his own' (p521-522). Opinions were mixed when *The Analysis of Beauty* was first published; 'Polite society' appears to have been 'intrigued', and 'The press, too, was kind' (Uglow, 2002 p538). Nevertheless, the painter Joshua Reynolds apparently criticised Hogarth's lack of 'philosophical account' relating to his theory – that Hogarth decreed it to be so, simply because *he* deemed it to be (p540), and this is more fully explored as this chapter of the research progresses. Ronald Paulson, in his introduction to the 1997 edition of *The Analysis of Beauty*, asserts that "aesthetics" was classed as a philosophy which was not founded on 'reason or faith' but on the 'senses' (pxix). In his notes Paulson explains that the word 'aesthetics' derives from the Greek *aisthetikos* and that it translates as perception, rather than relating specifically to art, or beauty (endnotes pliv), and on contemplating Hogarth's thesis most of the artists doubted – in Uglow's view rightly – that such a subjective issue as '"beauty"' could ever be reduced 'to a formal "rule"' (Uglow, 2002 p540). Joseph Burke concurs, remarking that 'Hogarth was at fault in attempting to confine beauty to a rigid and invariable pattern... Beauty does not obey rules and cannot be

conjured up by a formula' (1955 plxii). At this point it is necessary to establish what constitutes an ancient concept of "beauty" in order to not only contextualise the role the *line of beauty* plays within an artwork in general and a propagandist artwork in particular from an arguably "modern" perspective, but also to understand the potential for exploiting the idea of an absolute. In this respect it is pertinent to return to Clark's observation of "art" being a pursuit of "truth" and "beauty" and consider Socrates' declaration that 'the power of the good has retired into the region of the beautiful; for measure and symmetry are beauty and virtue all the world over' (Plato, 2001 p60). This demonstrates an analysis that applies universality to the concept of the ideal form, despite the question provoked regarding whether an 'individual unity' such as 'beauty' can be considered to have a 'real existence' (p4); nevertheless, there exists within Plato's *Republic* the intimation that 'overwhelming beauty' can be a provider of 'knowledge and truth' whilst still being 'beyond them in beauty' (1991 p189). Within these historic documents lies an assumption of the difference between "opinion" and "knowledge" (p158), leading to a consensus where truth is an absolute, as is beauty, therefore disregarding the opportunity for personal opinion to expand that which a viewer might consider to be "beautiful". A noteworthy correlation in respect of these absolutes is that despite the archived acknowledgement throughout the centuries of the so-called grey areas that surround them – as explored within this text, including via Hogarth's own assessments of his particular *line* – they are nonetheless relied upon in the selling of an ideal for advertising as well as propaganda purposes. This latter point is further considered later in this research, and Socrates' declaration that 'Unless truth enter into the composition, nothing can be truly created or subsist' (2001 p59) arguably serves to underscore the reasoning behind this particular capacity for manipulation, and in addition endorses Ellul's belief that successful propaganda needs to be at least grounded in the truth (1973 p239).

Of import in this regard, therefore, is the suggestion commented upon above that the concept behind the *line of beauty* has an association with any kind of "formal rule", as this is directly disputed by Hogarth, evidenced within his own manuscript and referred to throughout the chapters of this text. The contention behind the criticism and which assigns the idea of beauty to an absolute simplifies Hogarth's concept to a degree that is arguably unwarranted: the key to the examination of this theory, especially as it pertains to the prescribed parameters, is not whether Hogarth's interpretation of the "line" necessarily demonstrates beauty within an artwork in and of itself, but that its satisfying, pleasurable structure epitomising

movement, albeit statically represented, forms the basis of a powerful attraction for the viewer. It is this aspect that constitutes an additional relevance to the *line of beauty* and what it may or may not represent when it is examined from the specific perspective of a viewer's attraction to artworks that are constructed for propaganda purposes, for example the conflict pictorial poster. However, it is productive to return to the ancient perspective regarding truth and beauty in order to continue contextualising this, and consider Plato's analyses of perception and actuality. In this respect, one sees what is within one's immediate environment and perceives this as the truth because there is no evidence to suggest otherwise; even when able to perceive an alternative, there remains nothing to imply that what is first encountered and experienced is anything less than the truth (1991 p193-194). Consequently, in correlating these ideas with the metaphoric connotation of the *line of beauty* there lies the potential that even after following the "line" from one experiential situation to the other and contemplating what is newly discovered as the truth, one cannot instantly perceive it as being so because of the link back to what is now understood to be, effectively, an illusion – a connection which qualifies one's position within that original state (p194). This can be further considered from a Baudrillian perspective – the acknowledgement that 'One can live with the idea of a distorted truth' (1983 p8). However, 'metaphysical despair' is borne from the concept that the imagery obscures nothing; on the contrary, it reveals that these are not images but rather 'perfect simulacra forever radiant with their own fascination' (p8-9). Regardless, there is a process which needs to be undergone in order to understand the new reality – a mobility from one version of a real to another that requires acceptance of the new experience over the original that can now be seen as a deception (Plato, 1991 p194-195). In following this *line*, therefore, and in addition analogising with a particularly propagandist perspective, the idea of beauty equalling truth can potentially be dispelled via the very mechanism of movement, subsequently supporting the reasoning behind propaganda's protocol of aiming to establish at least the concept of an alternate, superior "real" to entice the propagandee. Plato's recorded assertion that 'the opinable is distinguished from the knowable' (p190) serves to demonstrate a separation of an ancient idea of beauty as an absolute from the concept of a viewer's hypothesis of what he or she might consider to be beautiful. Furthermore, what is significant when considering a so-called "ideal form" in this context, as well as contemplating the *line* as a visual construct representative of movement at its most beautiful, is Hogarth's observation that although artists were puzzled and amused by this *line* they also found it to be 'an old acquaintance of theirs' yet were unable to account for how they recognised it

(1997 p6). Hogarth alludes to references regarding a mysterious 'serpentine line' in literature and in art (p11) and he continues to reiterate this point throughout his manuscript – that historically people were aware of this serpentine curve but their knowledge of it may have been shrouded in mystery (p74). Pertaining to ancient concepts surrounding the idea of "beauty" or not, the genealogy of the *line of beauty* before it was given a specific "name" has value in and of itself within the context of this research. To this end there is 'no figure of speech more characteristic of the language of Mannerism' than the term *Figura Serpentinata*, and John Shearman considers that Michelangelo di Lodovico Buonarroti Simoni (1475-1564) was the artist who invented this particular style of aesthetic representation; Shearman quotes Lomazzo and the latter's assertion that Michelangelo believed figures at least should always be 'serpentine' (Shearman, 1967 p81). Lomazzo declares that '"a figure has its highest grace and eloquence when it is seen in movement"' and goes on to say that the best way to achieve this is through '"flame"' – figures with this form '"will be very beautiful"' and therefore '"The figures should resemble the letter S... And this applies not only to the whole figure, but also to its parts"' (p81, ellipsis in the original). Shearman believes the first surviving example of the concept of *Figura Serpentinata* is Michelangelo's sixteenth century *Victory* (p81-83), yet other representations of serpentine curvature that can in this context be considered as "lines of beauty" are found in art and design that considerably predates this, examples of which are shown in Figures 4-6.

In respect of the Myron sculpture [Fig. 4.] the original bronze has been lost, yet it is recognisable from 'various Roman copies' (Phaidon, 2007 p221) with one such example examined later in this chapter. Serpentine curvature is expressed in the shape of the figures in all three artworks, and also demonstrates additional representation – firstly through the depiction of dance conveyed in *Shiva as Nataraja* from early in the eleventh century [Fig. 5], and secondly in the twelfth century Romanesque fresco *Luxuria* [Fig. 6] through the wrappings that circulate the body. With regard to the articulation of the serpentine curvature in *Shiva as Nataraja* in particular, the medium of dance as a potent expression of movement forms part of the examination of the *line* in a following chapter. What is particularly noteworthy is that Hogarth 'pounced with joy' on the work of Lomazzo, the latter's reference to Michelangelo's advice regarding '"Serpentlike"', as well as Lomazzo's own idea of 'true grace' being 'the expression of *motion*' (Uglow, 2002 p526, italics in the original). As an apt summation of this enthusiasm, Hogarth quotes Lomazzo's declaration that '"the greatest grace and life that a picture can have, is, that it

expresse *Motion*: which the Painters call the *spirite* of a picture"' (1997 p3, emphasis in the original), and this, as alluded to earlier, has a metaphorical parallel when viewed from a distinctly propagandist perspective.

Resemblances

Hogarth's rejection of the idea of mathematical proportions playing any part in finding the source of what makes an artwork beautiful (Paulson, 1997 pxxviii), and which contradicts the ancient consideration of beauty being equated with symmetry and, consequently, truth (Plato, 2001 p60), is indicative of an emotive articulation that is evidently necessary in the efficient scribing of the *line of beauty* in the composition of an artwork. That Hogarth desired to challenge accepted conventions and to commit his thought process in this regard to an aesthetic treatise is interestingly analysed in T. E. Hulme's observation that

> The artist is in the position of a man who sees for the first time a certain peculiar curve whose only means of drawing that curve is represented by a set of standard wooden curves such as architects use. It is not that by his artistry he polishes up or decorates the previously existing curves, but simply that he has to create a new curve in order to say anything at all (1994 p168).

Despite this being an analogy, albeit an extremely apt one, it is relevant to reference because of Hulme's thoughts on creating something new in order to continue to say something worthwhile. This is as significant to the specific visual construct under examination here as it is to the pictorial propagandist's objective, particularly a propagandist utilising a medium created especially for concise conveyance of a message such as the poster. Although the *line of beauty* as a visual construct might not be regarded as an innovative concept in and of itself, as even Hogarth conceded, his recognition of its place in aesthetic theory demonstrates the serpentine curve's ability, as Hogarth undoubtedly saw it, to "say" something fresh about attraction and what that attraction might consequently represent. This is upheld in Hulme's contention that 'In the state of mind produced in you by any work of art there must necessarily be a rather complicated mixture of the emotions' (1994 p192), indicating that artists have a particular way of looking at things that may not be new but have yet to be interpreted (p194). Hulme, who is referring to Henri Bergson's theories concerning art in his assertions, upholds the concept that it takes an artist's vision and ability to produce this in a form others can then see and understand, and clarifies this supposition by declaring that an artist can 'pick out one element which is really in all of us, but which before he had disentangled it, we were

unable to perceive' (p195). Seemingly this is what Hogarth was able to do so far as the *line of beauty* is concerned: Hogarth acknowledged the *line* was already "there", an important feature of artworks historically, but he was the protagonist who drew particular attention to it, further utilised it and, most significantly, named it, which is the reasoning behind why Hogarth, as an artist in general and as an aesthetic theorist in particular, is of primary import in this research.

With regard to the "naming" of a particular visual construct, William Ivins discusses the idea of 'dictionary definitions' that pertain to words but not to 'individual lines and spots' that go into creating a symbol, although the symbol itself may have a dictionary denotation; consequently, Ivins concludes, there is 'no syntax for the reading of their meaning' (1969 p61). We view the image as a whole and only after that experience can we evaluate the constituent parts (p61). The significance of this is reflected in the Futurist movement, and these artists' assertions that 'Those lines, those spots, those zones of colour, apparently illogical and meaningless, are the mysterious keys to our pictures' (Boccioni et al, 2009c p50). It is these "mysterious keys" that a pictorial propagandist can exploit in the construction of a poster designed for ultimate attraction of the viewer. When considered in relation to the *line of beauty* these are particularly pertinent observations in and of themselves, whilst collectively acquiring additional interest when viewed in the light of the relationships formed by these "constituent parts" and how these will be further compounded if the contributing elements subsequently alter – for example, when collated for the purpose of constructing visual conflict propaganda. If communication – propagandist or otherwise – was restricted to only text, *or* only pictures, its function would be severely limited: 'Verbal definition is a regress from word to word' and it is therefore sometimes appropriate to utilise an image in the clarification of the message, thereby defining or naming it 'by the association of a sensuous awareness with an oral or visual symbol' (Ivins, 1969 p61). Certainly Gustave Le Bon emphasises that with regard to "words" it is necessary to understand the meaning the text will have for the crowd at that particular time in order for it to be influential, irrespective of any additional meaning the words may convey, for example historical references (2001 p62), and this premise is particularly significant when considered from the perspective of the propagandist messenger. These latter points form part of the focus of the following chapter, but it is nevertheless relevant to acknowledge that when Hogarth utilises descriptive phrasing in appraising the serpentine curve he designates the *line of beauty* he applies some very striking textual interpretations. These are worth noting not only

for their own aesthetic value but also for their appropriateness in articulating movement through a narrative: '*leads the eye a wanton kind of chace*' (1997 p33, italics in the original) is a very apt as well as poetic description of how one's eye might follow a serpentine curve, as is the expression 'the pleasure of the pursuit' (p34). Furthermore it is arguably only a small step to additionally evaluate these particular descriptive explanations from a propagandist's viewpoint, thereby exposing how manipulation in the employment of the visual construct within pictorial conflict propaganda, including the medium of the poster, can subsequently effect the perception of the *line* by the viewer. The importance of text in relation to imagery as it lies within the boundaries of this research, as well as to language as an influence upon an artwork, is explored later in this text; however, Hogarth's lyrical narratives regarding the *line* uphold his assertion previously noted that there are no mathematical calculations involved in defining his ideal serpentine curve as being the *line of beauty*. In this specific context, Hogarth talks about the eye being the best judge of what is proportionally right (p65) and consequently when he declares that 'the hand takes a lively movement in making it with pen or pencil' (p42) it indicates not only the feasibility that this is an instruction but also, at the very least, the probability that the utilisation of the *line* comes intuitively to the artist and is not an illustrative construct that has to be specifically and painstakingly measured every time. John Dewey clarifies Hogarth's assertion when he writes that 'Curved lines... are agreeable because they conform to the natural tendencies of the eye's own movements' (2005 p104), further underpinning Hogarth's observation that one's eye takes pleasure in 'winding walks and Serpentine Rivers', believing this might go some way to explain why one is attracted to objects that have this particular serpentine curve embedded within (1997 p124). It is the *line*'s ability to represent movement and the subsequent attraction this holds for the viewer that is of greatest consequence in this research, rather than its purported ability to indicate literal "beauty" within an artwork in a traditional sense of an absolute, or at least as we generally now understand "beauty" to be.

Consequently, and following on from this reasoning, an object regarded to be beautiful arguably must be viewed in its entirety so the 'unity and sense of the whole' is not lost (Aristotle, 2010 p13). In this context the *line of beauty* can be considered as a unifying link within the wider composition, a concept further examined later in this text. Friedrich Kittler, who cites Aristotle, remarks that 'Aesthetics begins as "pattern recognition"' (1997 p130) and although it is a worthy conjecture this might relate to "pattern recognition" in its literal sense, it could

conceivably also be allied to considerably more complex theories including the idea of 'tertiary retention' (Stiegler, 2011 p16). This latter conceptualisation suggests what we experience stems from a past not physically, literally or personally undergone but instead inherited, meaning we are influenced not just by our own past, with its specific memories and experiences, but by a past that is not actually ours (p60). One perspective from which this can be viewed lies in the idea that

> The mind of man has naturally a far greater alacrity and satisfaction in tracing resemblances than in searching for differences; because by making resemblances we produce new images, we unite, we create, we enlarge our stock; (Burke, E. 1958 p18).

This latter observation takes on an added resonance in respect of the genealogical association that exists where the *line of beauty* is concerned when it is remembered that the author of this reference is Edmund Burke who was writing contemporaneously to Hogarth. Almost two centuries later Dewey concurs with Burke's argument that something within an image initiates within the viewer the understanding that there is "life" within the 'object' and that this is 'characterized by having a past and a present; having them as possessions of the present, not just externally' (2005 p183). Dewey's additional comment concerning 'That which is dead does not extend into the past nor arouse any interest in what is to come' (p183), also serves to highlight the necessity for a visual construct with the ability to attract to be expressive – to demonstrate motion, as is the role of the *line of beauty*, conveying not only movement, but movement at its most beautiful and therefore maximising the attraction for the viewer. The Futurists wrote of the '*stylization of movement*' and how they considered this to be among 'the most immediate manifestations of life' (Severini, 2009 p125, italics in the original) and when Dewey remarks on an 'organization of energy' (2005 p183) it similarly correlates with the Futurists' proclamations and their employment of the expression 'chaotic excitement' (Boccioni et al, 2009c p49). Although these Futurist ideas are more fully considered in the chapters to follow, in relation to these concepts it is worth noting that

> In the esthetic object the object operates – as of course one having an external use may do – to pull together energies that have been separately occupied in dealing with many different things on different occasions, and to give them that particular rhythmic organization that we have called (when thinking of the effect and not of the mode of its effectuation), clarification, intensification, concentration (Dewey, 2005 p183).

The status of the poster as a functional object, as well as what constitutes an "object" within a visual medium is examined in the next as well as subsequent chapters. Nonetheless, Dewey's comments underline the evolving relationships that culminate in an affect upon visual culture, one that is further intensified when a propagandist significance becomes one of the contributing elements. When these ideas are allied with the concept that an overriding aesthetic sensation within the viewer is arguably not *one* sensation that expands, but many sensations experienced one after the other, with each aroused by the previous (Bergson, 1910 p12-13) – so much so that even the slightest suggestion can cause the viewer to be consumed by the cumulative emotional responses (p16) – it is a feasible supposition that attraction to the repetitive appearance of a visual trope within artworks, such as the *line of beauty*, can be the instigating stimulus. Consequently, the *line of beauty* as a visual construct is worthy of exploitation by the visual propagandist in the construction of a pictorial poster.

Key Visuals

Taking into consideration the observations made in the previous section of this chapter, it is pertinent to recognise that Hogarth was undoubtedly influenced by the art classes he attended as well as by the 'traditions he inherited' (Uglow, 2002 p527), not only as an artist and theorist but also as a viewer himself. Such hypotheses concerning onlookers' innate or overt responses in the respect of how an artwork is perceived are taken into account throughout this text, yet Baudrillard's concept of the visible continuum not only demonstrates a correlation to the idea of "pattern recognition" but also emphasises an acuity ripe for propagandist purposes. In this context the serpentine curve Hogarth designated the *line of beauty* can be considered a visible continuum regardless of how it is conceived and/or perceived; as already referenced, Hogarth maintains that people were aware of the *line* but their knowledge of its genesis within their own perception was often unclear. Arnheim, echoing Edmund Burke, succinctly summarises thus:

> Shape is determined by more than what strikes the eye at the time of observation. The experience of the present moment is never isolated. It is the most recent among an infinite number of sensory experiences that have occurred throughout the person's past life. Thus the new image gets into contact with the memory traces of shapes that have been perceived in the past. These traces of shapes interfere with each other on the basis of their similarity, and the new image cannot escape this influence (1956 p32).

When looking at an artwork the viewer responds to what he sees and the information is analysed in conjunction with his experience and memory traces. This concept of repetition via a genealogical legacy can be applied to the appearance of a visual construct such as the *line of beauty* and therefore when considered from a specifically-propagandist viewpoint it is important to remember that a 'persuader has to build on beliefs that already exist in the minds of the audience. A persuader has to use anchors of belief to create new belief' (O'Donnell and Jowett, 2012 p34). This aptly demonstrates not only how a recognisable visual trope can aid in the promotion of pictorial conflict propaganda, but also how the manipulation by the propagandist of a propagandee's nostalgic ideals with regard to his or her past serves to assist in the same. Theories pertaining to this latter point are considered more fully in later chapters of this text, but the premise behind the potential exploitation of a viewer's perception of recognisable constructs is illustrated in the two posters at Figures 7 and 8. The employment of familiar visual tropes – "visual codes" as commented upon previously – utilised within a layered composition is as relevant to the advertiser as it is to the propagandist. This aptly serves to underscore the reasoning as to why the visual propagandist utilised lessons learned from the advertising industry (Lawrence, 2006 p193) – and vice versa, factors considered in a later chapter. However, the example of Jean de Paleologue's *Rayon d'Or* poster from the late nineteenth century [Fig. 7], as well as the anonymous *Add the Fifth Point* conflict poster from 1917 [Fig. 8], clearly illustrate the connections via their parallel use of certain pictorial constructs. What is most notable for the purposes of this research is the presence within both images of the serpentine curvature that shapes the visual construct of the *line of beauty*.

There is an additional angle from which these previous considerations can be viewed: Frédéric Ogée reiterates the hypothesis put forward by James Grantham Turner and Angela Rosenthal that the attraction associated with the *line of beauty* is strongly connected to eroticism (2001 p64). Although this particular research thread seemingly extends outside the boundaries of this text, it is worthy of acknowledgement because of Ogée's employment of two specific nouns in order to qualify his comment, namely 'suggestiveness' and 'potentiality' (p64). In respect of the incorporation of the *line* in the construction of art for conflict propaganda posters, both these nouns are particularly significant: the artwork "suggests" something to the viewer that is attractive, with the "potential" being that the viewer will then be mobilised to act upon it. When Ellul maintains that all 'symbols' can stir within us a recognition of the link between the emotional and the intellectual, thereby not

leaving the individual as ‘intellectually lost’ (1973 footnote p164), he is speaking about key words (p267). It is worth considering Ellul’s theories as they pertain not only to words but also, in an echo of Umberto Boccioni et al, to “key visuals” – as well as or, indeed, instead of – as this arguably expands the concept without compromising Ellul’s original intention. As an example, the use of these key visuals can be considered in relation to the mithridatism of information and the fact that a propagandee, eventually, will no longer need to concentrate on a propaganda poster for something in it to still awaken the necessary response within (Ellul, 1973 p183). Nevertheless, it is important to again acknowledge that the premise of this research is not about semiotics in general, but instead a recognition of one particular construct which, because of its facility for attraction, focuses the viewer’s attention on the artwork within which it is embedded in order for the message being distributed via that medium to be productively conveyed and, consequently, perceived. If the relevant artwork is designed around these key visuals then the probability of a purposeful response by the propagandees to whom the pictorial message is targeted can potentially be improved substantially. Although it is certainly too radical a concept to maintain that any visual stimulus either overtly *or* innately recognised via a singular pictorial construct will subsequently have such a profound effect upon the viewer that it alone will, for example, send that viewer to war – even if embedded within a specifically-propagandist composition – the attraction nonetheless assists in motivating the viewer by magnifying already-present inclinations in order to incite the viewer to action (Kellen, 1973 pvi). When this is allied with a specific *medium* of distribution in the form of the poster – a functional object employed *because* of its ability to attract the attention of the ‘amorphous crowd’ (Bryder, 2008 p112) – the possibilities are increased exponentially.

Gary S. Messinger remarks that an ‘ambivalence’ with regard to propaganda stems from a political convention (at least so far as the British within the temporal boundaries of this research are concerned), that is generally ‘uncomfortable with views of human nature which say that political behaviour can be controlled by those who manipulate primitive, biologically-based instincts of people’ (1993 p123), yet manipulation of one extreme or another is a necessary requirement in persuading any one person to do any one thing. Advertising serves as an apt illustration of this point – the deliberate enticement of an individual to purchase a product, or to view a film, for example. It is arguably a thin line between this sort of “persuasion”, including that which involves so-called key visuals, and propagandist manipulation

required to incite someone to vote or, of more importance in the context of this study, to enlist. To tap into the "instincts" of individuals is an understandable approach and it seems somewhat disingenuous for political manipulation to be considered as morally reprehensible whilst antipathy towards a similar stratagem is muted when utilised in other areas. From a purely pictorial viewpoint, however, this does serve to underscore how an attraction to a visible continuum in the form of a pictorial trope embedded within an image can be imperative to the viewer's acquiescence, and therefore how that attraction manifests itself within visual conflict propaganda including the medium of the poster remains a key to potential propagandist success.

Participants

Following on from these considerations, the observations relating to the targeting of commonalities can be allied with the ideas explored previously regarding potentiality and suggestiveness. This can subsequently be expanded to encompass Le Bon's concept of 'contagion' in order to explain an individual's need to morph into a mass, thereby resulting in one who willingly surrenders his or her 'personal interest' to a 'collective interest' (2001 p18), reflecting Ellul's similar observation cited in the *Introduction*. Le Bon remarks that this "contagion" is merely an effect of 'suggestibility' (p18) – a form of 'social influence' (Cialdini, 2007 p59) that allows an individual within that crowd to justify his or her actions. Furthermore Le Bon asserts that both "contagion" and "suggestion" effect the imagination of the masses, particularly when 'presented under the form of images' (2001 p59), and this idea can be assessed in two ways. Firstly, imagery can be created in the mind of the individual through the instigation of his or her imagination; secondly, an individual's imaginative thought can be provoked by literal imagery, including that which distributes propaganda and which therefore incorporates the pictorial poster as the functioning medium. Sigmund Freud, who references Le Bon's work on the "psychological crowd", considers these concepts when he writes that

> A group is extraordinarily credulous and open to influence, it has no critical faculty, and the improbable does not exist for it. It thinks in images, which call one another up by association (just as they arise with individuals in states of free imagination), and whose agreement with reality is never checked by any reasonable function. The feelings of a group are always very simple and very exaggerated. So that a group knows neither doubt nor uncertainty (2012 p8).

What is of note when determining what constitutes a “crowd” from a propagandist viewpoint, especially one that will respond to pictorial distribution of the propaganda message as is the premise of this research, is that ‘The masses are not a population, a society, but the multitude of passers-by’ (Virilio, 1986 p3). This serves as a reminder that although the propagandist objective must be to reach the multitudes – and why the poster as a functional object is a particularly effective medium – each person within the mass should be ‘individualized’ (Deleuze and Guattari, 1988 p341). Le Bon observes that ‘new psychological characteristics’ are the outcome of the simple fact that individuals *have* formed into a mass, noting that ‘the conscious activity of individuals’ morphs into ‘the unconscious action of crowds’ (2001 p4), and a rationalisation for why one person follows the lead of another that psychologist Robert Cialdini summarises as ‘social proof’ (2007, p116). This concept suggests the existence of a certain susceptibility within the individual that arguably separates him or her from the individual who stands outside the mass: the difference lies in the *participation* of that individual and it is the “participant” to whom the propagandist message is most effectively directed. To this end, Le Bon speaks of the ‘striking peculiarity’ that exists, in that despite the separate circumstances of each participant within the gathered mass, it is the very fact of their formation into that mass that confers upon them ‘a sort of collective mind which makes them feel, think, and act’ in ways contrary to how each would behave as an individual; ‘certain ideas and feelings’ do not make themselves known *except* when an individual is part of a crowd (2001, p15). Freud postulates that if an individual allows him- or herself to be subsumed within a group, thereby letting others ‘influence him by suggestion’, it arguably indicates a requirement within that individual for a compatible association over and above a dissenting one (2012 p22). Freud alludes this can be because of the influence of the sexual – either from an emotional perspective and therefore classified as “love” or, perhaps more pertinently, eroticism (p22), thereby paralleling the points made in the previous section of this chapter; Freud utilises the phrase ‘libidinal ties’ to explain, in this particular context, the connection that exists between the individuals (p25). That propagandists need to draw a distinction between the individual who stands separate from the mass and the individual who concedes to being an active participant within that mass is unsurprising. Furthermore, when this is viewed from the perspective that ‘propaganda is not the defense of an idea but the manipulation of the mob’s subconscious’ (Ellul, 1964 p373), it demonstrates how effective propaganda can consist of material that contains a construct which arguably speaks to the subconscious through recognition of its genealogical

heritage – for the purposes of this research, namely the visual trope that is the *line of beauty*.

In respect of the above, as well as following on from the observations cited previously, Colin Moore writes of the necessity of 'repetition' – in this instance from the perspective of a relevance in keeping things 'simple, [that] lies at the heart of every successful propaganda campaign...' (2010 p11). We respond intuitively to repetition: repetition, as with routine, gives our lives structure and, consequently, a sense of security. Moreover, Freud believes that 'repetition, the re-experiencing of something identical, is clearly in itself a source of pleasure' (1955 p36). Freud argues that this can be a passive response: we are not always conscious of the reasons why we repeat certain actions, but can conclude that within the mind there prevails 'a compulsion to repeat which overrides the pleasure principle' (p22). This situation takes into account the observations concerning the conscious/unconscious behaviour of an individual inside and outside a crowd, as well as indicating potential attraction to the unattractive, a concept examined in a following section of this chapter and of further significance when considered in the context of Plato's supposition that "pleasure" has not 'reason', whereas wisdom is arguably equal to truth (2001 p60). However, in considering a pictorial medium of information-distribution capable of attracting the individual within the mass, Moore remarks that successful propagandist artwork 'is more than the sum of its parts': it is more than the chosen colours, embedded signs and symbols, the text; context is particularly pertinent (2010 p11). The emphasis is therefore on the requirement for poster artists to utilise 'typographical objects; a repertory of signs... symbols, and acronyms; a rhetoric of simplified geometrical forms' in the creation of artwork that will have maximum impact on the viewer (Schnapp, 2005 p23) and from this perspective the *line of beauty* can be considered as one of the "tools in the kit". Nevertheless, it is arguably the historic aesthetic genealogy contributing to the *line*'s presence within a poster that is what constitutes it being "greater than the sum of its parts".

'Mutual Interaction'

Consequently, in placing the conflict propaganda poster within these considerations, it is relevant to demonstrate evidence of this genealogical legacy as it is illustrated in the posters at Figures 9-11. These three images contain a representation of the *line of beauty* via the serpentine curvature that forms the road, despite the overall design and the message conveyed differing in each. In serving as an example these

particular posters condense the genealogical heritage to a mere three decades in the first half of the twentieth century, yet this temporal constraint focuses attention on the Charles Fouqueray poster *La Journée Serbe 25 Juin 1916* [Fig. 10], as it illustrates that the conflict of one era was being pictorially represented whilst the conflict of another was ongoing. A similar composition that pertains to the genre as well as the conflict central to this research, that is to say a propaganda poster associated with World War I, is shown at Figure 12.

The ideas regarding how and why the *line of beauty* can be represented in ways other than by a direct, drawn "line", as is manifest in the George Illian depiction of a progression of military vehicles [Fig. 12], is explored in the next chapter. However, it is relevant at this point to examine the concept of the visual ellipsis noted in the *Introduction* – a logical premise because the potential recognition of the serpentine curve as the visual construct of a *line of beauty*, when utilised and subsequently perceived as a visible continuum, allows the viewer to expand, or invent, his or her own context. This results in form and content becoming inseparable from the context, with the consequence that the missing sections of the curvature can be implied, thereby acknowledging Hogarth's reference to a *line of beauty* that is not necessarily seen in its entirety and consequently requiring the assistance of the viewer's imagination in order to complete the structure. In addition to the Illian image, as already alluded to the Lumley conflict poster at Figure 2 serves as an example. In specific relation to this latter poster the concept is magnified when it is viewed alongside comparative imagery as collective illustrative representations of the explicit as well as implicit context of the *line*, and this is demonstrated in the chapter titled *Representing the Real in the Aesthetics of Conflict*. Whether explicit *or* implicit, a visible continuum in the form of an aesthetic constant – such as the *line of beauty* as a manifestation of movement – when embedded in an artwork then shown to be effective in the distribution of a message ultimately serves to exemplify why there is every reason to encourage propagandists to continue to utilise it in their imagery. The posters at Figures 9-12, regardless of their specific messages, function as a testimony to this concept. Propaganda in the form of a poster is designed for the amorphous mass, with an intention to amplify existing proclivities for the purpose of arousing an active response and Theodor Adorno, in a pre-emption of the considerations examined earlier in this section of the chapter, asks the question as to what forces, be they social, psychological, cultural and/or contextual, go into forming a 'mass' of individuals that then begins to think and act as one (2001 p135-136). A carefully calculated and composed visual message may

instigate an appropriate reaction from within that mass and although this may affect only one person, perhaps a few, the individual or individuals concerned – the participants – will then be in a position where they can influence the many, and so a domino effect can occur (Cialdini, 2007 p156). This is indicative of the concept of "social proof" previously referred to, a justification that is an imperative behavioural condition as it assists in an individual believing that he or she is complying with 'reason' as well as with 'proved experience' (Ellul, 1973 p85). In this way, and expanding to include the wider culture industry, there exists an hypothesis that individuals can move forward providing they do not question their motives and are 'willing to be compliant' (Horkheimer and Adorno, 2002 p104). Any resisting individual 'can survive only by being incorporated' (p104), a factor highlighting the parallels between the culture industry in general and one specifically focussed upon the distribution of propaganda. In addition is the idea that the 'products' relating to the industry can be 'alertly consumed even in a state of distraction' (p100), a concept that emphasises why a functional object such as the pictorial poster is an apposite medium of distribution for both commercial and propagandist information aimed at a mass. Consequently, propaganda poster artists can design accordingly, utilising whatever they consider best elicits an appropriate response within the propagandees (Bryder, 2008 p103), be that a particularly potent word or phrase, or a visual construct embedded in the design. In this regard, Max Horkheimer's and Adorno's analyses contain the idea that the utilisation of specific effects are subordinated to the 'formula' that supersedes the original work, an outcome that again indicates a "whole" conceivably greater than can be justified by the sum of its parts (2002 p99). From an arguably "formulaic" viewpoint, therefore, Arnheim's reasoning that shape is a better way to communicate than colour (1956 p273) serves as a significant example; shapes form text, which can be definitive in a poster's perceived success, but certain shapes within a composition may also prove essential in maximising its visual impact. Arnheim explains that 'Broadly speaking, in color vision, action issues from the object and affects the person; in order to perceive shape, the organizing mind goes out to the object' (1956 p274), alluding to a circularity with his reference to object-mind-object that is indicative of continual movement.

As formerly noted, examination of an "object" as it applies to this research is more fully considered later in this text, but in the context of the focus of this section of the chapter Arnheim's comments can be assessed in conjunction with Freud's analysis regarding 'the perception of the signs of an emotional state' which is 'calculated

automatically to arouse the same emotion in the person who perceives them' (2012 p15). In support of previous observations is Freud's contention that the larger the number of participants in whom an observation can be made of their emotional response the fiercer the 'automatic compulsion' becomes (p15). Consequently the strength required for one individual to be critical is lost and an emotional assimilation occurs, which in itself leads to an escalation of excitement within those responsible for the initial effect upon that individual, and the 'emotional charge' of the others within the mass becomes 'intensified by mutual interaction' (p15). When this is allied with Freud's previously-cited comments regarding the libidinal it underscores the capacity for the *line of beauty* as a visual construct to be exploited for its ability to attract, because when viewed in the additional context of a more erotic connotation, as formerly noted, the connection to suggestiveness and potentiality demonstrates a productive contribution to pictorial propagandist stratagems. Consequently these concepts can be manipulated for their metaphorical as well as literal meaning to a propagandist's advantage, particularly in relation to the utilisation of the swift and efficient poster campaign. That 'structural generalizations or concepts' are key to successful poster design ideas (Toney, 1980 pxx) corresponds to an understanding of an aesthetic concept of which Hogarth's articulated assertions regarding the serpentine curve he named the *line of beauty* can be considered as one such example. In addition is the viewer's subsequent ability, *need*, even, to respond to it, for when Anthony Toney goes on to say that 'we prefer what we are prepared to like' (1980 pxx), he is referring to the recognition of what we perceive from within the artwork and, accordingly, our subsequent reaction to it. This results in a behavioural condition that can be targeted by propagandists able to manipulate the feelings of the selected individuals in order for each to accept what is being offered over and above the idea of absolute truth. As previously stated, the relationship between propaganda and the wider visual media ecology as it pertains to this research is more closely examined in a following chapter, but in support of this concept, and as a productive conclusion to this section of the text, it is worth reflecting upon Horkheimer's and Adorno's observation of the culture industry, and how

> With consummate skill it maneuvers between the crags of demonstrable misinformation and obvious truth by faithfully duplicating appearances, the density of which blocks insight. Thus the omnipresent and impenetrable world of appearances is set up as the ideal. Ideology is split between the photographing of brute existence and the blatant lie about its meaning, a lie which is not

> articulated directly but drummed in by suggestion. The mere cynical reiteration of the real is enough to demonstrate its divinity (2002 p118).

The individual's absorption into the mass, and the effect one individual has on another before potentially influencing the whole, serves to create the perfect audience for the propagandist, particularly when the ideology is repetitively-delivered via carefully-compiled pictorial means.

Juxtaposition

As a means of distribution for productively conveying a message that a viewer will respond to effectively the poster has always been an invaluable tool for the propagandist because of it being an inexpensive medium that can be rapidly reproduced, ensuring propagandist messages, including those related to conflict, are generated as proficiently as possible. Ellul maintains that posters are most apposite for the provision of 'shock propaganda'; they are 'intense but temporary' (1973 p10), with the effect as commented upon earlier of instigating the viewer into instantaneous action. Consequently, a visual propaganda message that contains a sign or symbol based on aesthetic theorising can be utilised to potentially expedite the conditions of possibility whereby the propagandee is attracted to that message and the appropriate reaction is initiated. However, although an aesthetically-beautiful wrapping can give the insidious a mantle of acceptability, the converse can also be true, and this is not only demonstrated in pictorial propaganda designed specifically to disturb the viewer, but also in the counter-propagandist art that is an inevitable response especially in times of conflict, as demonstrated during World War I and examined in a following chapter. In considering this particular perspective it is worth acknowledging David Boyd Haycock's reference to the English painter John Currie and the latter's connection to a Friedrich Nietzsche quotation that 'one must have chaos in one, to give birth to a dancing star' (1969 p46). The relevance of this as it pertains to the context of this research lies in more than merely its undeniably lyrical charm: it highlights the juxtaposition of two seemingly opposing elements in order to not only be effectively expressive, but also to emphasise the prominence of one aspect over the other. In this regard it serves as an illustration of the requirement to maintain at least a semblance of the "acceptable" within the conveyance of something that could be considered as otherwise. As already indicated, this line of thinking can be looked at from opposing viewpoints, and therefore it is of note to consider an epigram by Celio Calcagnini (1479-1541) which,

in relation to the sculpture at Figure 13 (already referenced albeit in intact form at Figure 4), asserts:

> "Sunt quaedam formosa adeo, deformia si sint:
> Et tunc cum multum displicuere, placent"
> ("There are certain things that are beautiful
> just because they are deformed,
> and thus please by giving great displeasure") (Shearman, 1967 p156).

Shearman clarifies this concept when he talks about a 'special kind of beauty' – how Mannerist work can seem on the face of it to 'consort awkwardly with the more familiar taste for ideal beauty' (1967 p156). Francis Bacon concurs with his sixteenth century observation that 'There is no Excellent *Beauty*, that hath not some Strangenesse in the Proportion' (2008 p177, emphasis in the original). It is not about beauty in and of itself – certainly not beauty relating to an "ideal form" – but the capacity for the representation to instigate intense attraction within the viewer, and these particular citations take on additional relevance because they underscore a genealogical legacy that runs parallel to that of the *line of beauty* as a visual trope. Of interest in respect of the *line* in particular is Plato's recording of the idea that 'the pleasant and the painful, when they arise in the soul, are both a sort of motion…' (1991 p265) because this intimates a mobility in the juxtaposition under examination here that can be directly affiliated to the *line of beauty*. Consequently, a viewer's "attraction" to an image can be because of 'the co-presence of two discontinuous elements, heterogeneous in that they [do] not belong to the same world...' (Barthes, 1993 p23); although this is proposed as an observation relevant to a specific photograph, the idea can be expanded to include other imagery without undermining the original intention of the analysis, because the 'duality' (p23) referred to is indicative of the points made previously in this section of the chapter. As reflected in Shearman's and Bacon's assertions, the poetic proclamation attributed to Nietzsche is indicative of more than a simplified distinction between "beautiful" and "ugly", or when considered from a particularly, albeit extreme propagandist viewpoint, "good" and "evil". These adjectives are all utilised as universal declarations – as absolutes, the concept of which is further examined later in this text. What is of more import is that Nietzsche's expressive phrasing speaks of a creative and exciting element that is borne from the frenetic and disordered, and in many ways this is the antithesis of propaganda where often something ugly requires a cloaking of something beautiful. This concept is further accentuated in Thomas Mann's assertion that 'Evil was far more evil when there was good, and good far more beautiful when there was evil'

(1999 p112), thereby proffering the idea of how much more illuminating a message – particularly a propagandist message – can be when configured in a context considered, if only in part, to be "beautiful". Consequently this underscores the role of the *line of beauty* as an exploitable visual construct within an artwork – for example, a poster that is part of a political campaign in an era of conflict.

Following on from these ideas, and in formulating an additional example in support of the comments made previously in this section of the chapter, it is worth noting that the artist Paul Nash, in writing from the trenches in 1917, declares his work can no longer stem from his life as an artist, but instead from the 'messenger' within him who will deliver the truth from the battlefields to those at home who insist the war should continue (Haycock, 2010 p278). Nash's message from the fields of France necessarily expresses a visual, counter-propagandist response to those away from the Front Line, and therefore it is feasible to assume this includes the authorities who exploited imagery in the presentation of their own perspective, for example via a recruitment poster. As reflected upon earlier, from this viewpoint Nash's artwork from the battlefields potentially if conversely demonstrates something beautiful shrouded in ugliness: Nigel Viney describes Nash's conflict artwork as possessing 'remarkable, if macabre, beauty' (1991 p50). Although conflict art from World War I and the subsequent connotations that surround it is examined more fully in a following chapter, it is relevant at this point to refer to Nash's painting *The Ypres Salient at Night* [Fig. 14], as it illustrates an Abstraction-influenced example of a *line of beauty* – the something beautiful the viewer can latch onto embedded in something terrible, something macabre. The assertion that a viewer 'may like objects which attract by some oddity or peculiarity of form or colour, and thereby suggest to him new and intriguing rhythms' (Fry, 1981 p37) not only corroborates these points but also provokes an additional perspective through Roger Fry's employment of the noun "rhythms", as its use serves as a connection to movement thereby further reiterating the reference to "rhythmic organisations". As already expressed, a visual construct indicative of movement utilised for propaganda purposes can be representative of the metaphorical as well as the literal, and this is as applicable to a *line of beauty* embedded within a perhaps somewhat inconsistent composition as it is to its position within any other artwork's construction.

'Wanton Chace'

Further to the analysis in the previous section, as well as continuing the thread of reasoning considered earlier regarding the articulation of a literal *line of beauty*

within an artwork, it is worth acknowledging Turner's reference to Hogarth's use of the phrase '"wanton chace"', because the former asserts that art which is 'successful' causes the viewer's gaze to roam in such a fashion (2001 p40). It is this direction of the viewer's attention that is of import to the propagandist and therefore how this can be effected is a consideration necessary in the construction of the visual message designed for prospective scrutiny by the propagandee, for example that which is distributed via the medium of the poster. It is also relevant to note that Turner adds: 'and vice versa' after this statement (p40) – the concept that a viewer is attracted to a work containing a *line of beauty*, and then arguably understands the attraction is *because* it contains the *line of beauty*, underscoring Ellul's thoughts concerning "key" symbols. Turner goes on to say that 'Wanton movements' of our eye demonstrate 'an aesthetic motion virtually indistinguishable from desire' (2001 p40) – that there is a connection between eye and artwork that goes beyond merely aesthetic appreciation. Turner references Rosenthal's analyses in this regard and avers that Hogarth utilises the *line of beauty* in the depiction of the execution of a fan being presented, and that this is one of many 'seductive gestures' relevant to the '"language"' of the fan (p46). The symbolism of the fan aside, the term "seductive gestures" is a pertinent expression for the potential power of the *line* in general and in conjunction with propaganda art in particular, alongside Ogée's comments regarding suggestiveness and potentiality. It is also Ogée who emphasises Hogarth's assertion that the utilisation of the *line of beauty* cannot be done in practice without the use of one's imagination (2001 p63) and it is plausible to add the *recognition* of the *line* to this premise, an idea more fully explored throughout this text. To this end, it is noteworthy to reflect that

> Affect is postcognitive. It is elicited only after considerable processing of information has been accomplished. An effective reaction, such as liking, disliking, preference, evaluation, or the experience of pleasure or displeasure, is based on a prior cognitive process in which a variety of content discriminations are made and features are identified, examined for their value, and weighted for their contributions. Once this analytic task has been completed, a computation of the components can generate an overall affective judgement (Zajonc, 1980 p151).

As previously indicated, the contribution and ensuing effect of "language" upon the visual arts as relevant to this research is examined later in this text, but Robert Zajonc's assertions do echo the concepts examined throughout this chapter with regard to resemblances, repetitions and memory traces. Moreover, not only are

these ideas expanded upon, Zajonc's observations additionally offer an alternative viewpoint when considered in the light of somewhat visually-discordant elements within an artwork, and consequently how a viewer's emotional response to an apparent incongruity is subsequently processed. Regardless, although a viewer might *feel* that something is "right" – or not – the intellectual assumption relating to that emotion can only be drawn because of an intuition that allows one to make that judgment. A viewer must have an understanding of what an object is before he or she can establish if it is something to "like" or "dislike", or at least as a minimum to have 'identified some of its discriminant features. Objects must be cognized before they can be evaluated' (Zajonc, 1980 p151). This is a reflection that supports Toney's rather more succinct summation regarding preferences cited earlier, and emphasised in the analogy that 'We cannot point, knowingly, to a rose without some concept of what a rose is; conversely we cannot hold such a meaning without any means to refer to it' (Manghani, 2013 p14). This underpins the importance of the genealogical legacy of not only an "object" but also a visual construct that serves as a representative, for example, the *line of beauty* that represents movement both literally and figuratively. When the idea is extended in support of the theory that 'the name of a thing appears already to invoke the imagery and emotions associated with it' (Manghani, 2013 p14), no example could serve the purpose more completely than a serpentine curve that is representative of beauty in the form of movement and that has physically been named and documented as "The Line of Beauty".

Hogarth's recognition of the premise behind these ideas serves to encapsulate the concept and thereby provides a model through which artworks – in the context of this study conflict propaganda artwork predominantly in the form of a pictorial poster – can potentially be innovatively evaluated. Furthermore, although we adopt what we consider to be appropriate adjectives in order to interpret something we have seen, it is really our *reaction* to what we are seeing that those adjectives are describing (Zajonc, 1980 p157), and Hogarth will have been no less susceptible to this behavioural condition than anyone else. When this is analysed in the specific context of the *line of beauty* as it pertains to this text it reinforces how it is less about the *line* in and of itself and more about a propagandist's manipulation of the connotations that relate to its presence within pictorial propaganda. This is necessarily coupled with a viewer's particular reaction and subsequent opinion regarding that appearance, especially considering that viewer in his or her role as propagandee. In addition, we may choose to believe we make decisions after weighing up positive and negative aspects, but it is likely the final decision is

weighted heavily by the mere fact that, again, we simply “like” it (Zajonc, 1980 p155) – more specifically within the parameters of this research, that we are pleasurably *attracted* to it, opening up the possibility once more for this conditioning to be exploited by the pictorial propagandist, including during times of conflict. Interestingly, Zajonc maintains that the thought process behind these “decisions” is less about making the decision itself and more about justifying it afterwards (p155), and when this is taken into account it clarifies how an individual can be subsumed into an amorphous mass through the “social influence” that instigated the act of compliance. In order to further underscore these ideas, it is worth considering that

> If we wish to discern whether anything is beautiful or not, we do not refer the representation of it to the object by means of the understanding with a view to cognition, but by means of the imagination (acting perhaps in conjunction with the understanding) we refer the representation to the subject and its feeling of pleasure or displeasure (Kant, 2007 p35).

Immanuel Kant’s analysis serves to highlight the points made throughout this chapter, including an emphasis upon the necessity of a viewer’s imagination in the evaluation of what is being perceived. More specifically, and as previously commented upon, imagination is required in the successful “chase” of the *line of beauty*, from a literal, visual point of view as well as with regard to what following the path of the *line* might represent metaphorically to the viewer, namely the propagandee.

Consequently, the point of acknowledging the *line of beauty* as a visual construct with a long genealogical history which is then employed within propaganda artwork and particularly the poster, is that although it is not an aesthetic trope that has been specifically designed as a propagandist tool, it can still arguably be utilised as such when exploited for its ability to attract, and collated with other visual elements including text. Because propaganda uses and reinforces ‘cultural myths and stereotypes’ (O’Donnell and Jowett, 2012 p289) – of which visual constructs can be considered from a design perspective as being either stereotypical, in the example of the *line of beauty* through its portrayal of “beauty” in the form of movement, or cultural because of a genealogical recognition – then understanding the significance of the *line of beauty* as propaganda *in and of itself* could be deemed as being somewhat difficult for the viewer to ascertain (p289). Arguably, however, this could be construed – conversely – as actually being one of its benefits, in the sense that the viewer’s attraction to the *line* indicates an intuitive response to what can then be

considered as an actual pictorial propagandist signifier. When this aspect is combined with other components in the construction of visual propaganda, it changes the relationship between those components as well as the subsequent impact of the whole, underpinning the concepts relating to these ideas reflected upon in the *Introduction*. Ellul's description of propaganda as being 'continuous and lasting' (1973 p17) speaks of a repetition that can be aptly applied to an effective pictorial trope resourced from a visual archive. Moreover there exists the correlation with repetition indicative of the machinic replication within Modernist-inspired artworks, an area examined more fully later in this text. Of more import is how repetition relates directly to the machinic replication of the pictorial poster as an object in its employment as a medium for the distribution of information. Propaganda's reliance on a 'slow, constant impregnation' (1973 p17) therefore supplementally reflects Hogarth's assertion that his peers articulated their awareness of his *line of beauty* yet could not recall how or why the visual trope seemed so familiar to them.

Decoding the Ideal

Following on from this is Paulson's reference to William Warburton and the latter's argument that hieroglyphs stem from 'natural signs', pictures reduced to one simple feature, such as 'a serpent to a curve' (1997 pxxxv). Consequently there is the suggestion that Hogarth may have been inspired by such considerations – that he made the journey from pictorial representation, through a refinement of the same, until it became the '"perfect"' and '"mysterious"' *line of beauty* (pxxxvi). This argument assumes, however, that the genesis of the *line* itself stems from Hogarth when, as has been highlighted throughout this text, in reality the part Hogarth plays lies in his observation of the *line's* presence within artworks, his subsequent analysis, followed by the communication of his ideas. Despite it not being clearly evident as to whether in his treatise Hogarth is addressing the artist or the viewer, there is undoubtedly a requirement for both to be aware of the principle behind his theories (Paulson, 1997, pxx), and this is reflected in the concept that a visual propagandist will need to be conscious of the elements within the construction of the poster that are considered to best effect a response from the propagandee. As previously referenced, Hogarth's aesthetic deliberations were intensified by what he believed this particular serpentine curve represented, analyses rooted in the legacy of artists and writers before him including Lomazzo. In relation to this latter point, Hogarth 'traced his theory back in time', believing it was out there, 'waiting to be rediscovered' (Uglow, 2002 p526) and it is a realistic supposition that his ideas were

influenced not only by inherited traditions, a concept reflected upon earlier, but also by the more recent memories of what he had observed within the classical arts during his time at the new artists' academy in London (p81-82).

Nevertheless, this leads to the conjecture that, if it can be said that 'In decoding messages from the other side we get more meaningful results if we use their code rather than ours' (Shearman, 1967 p136), then what is arguably being avoided is the notion that context in areas of art history and visual culture will alter when each subsequent generation inscribes upon it its own thoughts and ideas, its own analyses of intention. Realistically, the context in which we view an artwork, whether propagandist or otherwise, cannot be ignored in the interpretation of that work, yet where possible the context in which it was created should also be borne in mind (p136), albeit whilst maintaining an awareness of the issue of intentional fallacy. This is never more pertinent than when the context is culturally- as well as temporally-specific, for example World War I, and this is as applicable to the aesthetic response as so-called counter-propaganda as it is to that generated for distinctly propagandist purposes, including that designed especially for distribution via the medium of the poster. If this idea is expanded to include not just an artwork but a visual construct *within* that artwork, then regardless of where and when the theories pertaining to a serpentine curve as an expression of movement at its most beautiful were initially conceived, every examination of its function made since will have been affected. This is not only in respect of the era in which each observation is made, but also by the circumstances of each individual making the observations because of his or her own understanding of what the visual construct should represent, instilled within via a combination of traditions and memory traces through education and inheritance. As a temporally-broader example, Nietzsche talks of classical literature and in so doing intimates a dismissal of it that parallels the Futurists' dismissal of classical art: Nietzsche talks about "ideals" – 'this ideal is simply *their* ideal' (2003 p109, italics in the original) – the artist's as well as the viewer's perception of what is "ideally" beautiful, a concept considered earlier in this chapter. Similarly, it was the Futurists' intention at the beginning of the twentieth century to attempt an obliteration of artistic traditions going back centuries, yet despite these aspirations it is a pertinent conjecture as to whether an historic treatise such as that articulated by Hogarth with regard to the serpentine line, executed unknowingly through an intuitive sense of perception as to what is aesthetically "right", can be included in such a universal declaration. The Futurist Boccioni concedes that certain 'formulas' applied to art over the centuries have

declared particular artworks to be ‘masterpieces’ (2009b p89) and it is a plausible hypothesis that Hogarth’s theory – his own interpretation of what the serpentine curve he subsequently deemed as a *line of beauty* represents – can be categorised as one of these purported formulas. Boccioni maintains that the Futurists’ intention was to ‘destroy four centuries of Italian tradition’ (p88), then contradictorily declares that Italian Futurist artists were the only practitioners utilising the historic qualities of traditional art (p90), a point further considered later in this text. Nonetheless, as has been considered in this section of the chapter, it is an arguably inevitable conclusion that in any art movement it is impossible to completely disregard the so-called “lessons of the past”, whether learned educationally or inherited subconsciously. Consequently, Hogarth will have been as susceptible to contextual influences as any other artist, theorist, or writer, including those associated with the construction and distribution of visual propaganda.

In further support of this line of thinking, Nietzsche’s references to Kant are of note, as the latter writes that the ability ‘to say that the object is *beautiful*’ is dependent upon the perception of that manifestation, rather than on anything that makes one ‘dependent on the existence of the object’ (2007 p37, italics in the original); Nietzsche maintains that an adequate understanding is therefore required with regard to who the onlookers actually are (2003 p73). To this end, the capacity for a construct to demonstrate its meaning is imperative to the design of pictorial propaganda – a serpentine curve that can represent movement in the form of change, that is to say a transference from one version of a real to another, for example – and equally as important as the pertinent perception of precisely for whom the imagery is intended. Baudrillard’s concept of a real that is generated exponentially from objects, models and ‘memory banks’ (1983 p3) serves to coalesce these observations. Conscious of the genealogy of the *line* or not – and despite the comments made previously regarding influences – it is reasonable to at least consider to what extent an onlooker’s reaction to the *line of beauty* contributes to his or her own creation, observation, or assessment of the arts, even when the ultimate intention of that artwork is the instigation of a desired emotional response that can be manipulated by the pictorial propagandist. This conjecture has been highlighted here because, as Ezra Pound asserts, ‘One sees the work; one knows; or, even, one feels’ (1970 p101), echoing points made earlier in this chapter. Richard Cork’s reference to Henri Matisse’s ‘deliberately “careless” execution’ in his work serves as an interesting corroboration of Pound’s remarks, with Cork observing a similar utilisation in Vorticist founder Percy Wyndham Lewis’ contemporaneous

artworks including *Café* (1976a p16) [Fig. 15], where the curvature of the *line of beauty* is clearly evident. Lewis articulates a similar concept, referring to an 'ACCIDENTAL RIGHTNESS' in artworks (1981b p46, capitals in the original), and with specific reference to the *line of beauty* these ideas can be expressed in the contention that, ultimately, 'Hogarthian beauty and grace' is far removed from some sort of 'abstract metaphysical concept of the aesthetic consequences of the application of a set of rules' (Ogée, 2001 p66). This particular observation additionally parallels Boccioni's views regarding formulae, as well as Hogarth's own assertions relating to the futility of any mathematical contribution in the formation of the *line* as *he* believed it should be expressed. Furthermore, and in supplementary support, is the idea that Hogarth's expression of "beauty" and "grace" surfaces as fleeting yet 'physical phenomena' in which – importantly when taking into account the potential contradictions reflected upon previously – the viewer has a vital, participating role in the process (Ogée, 2001 p66), and all these considerations are as relevant to pictorial propaganda in times of conflict as to any other genre of artwork.

Continuum

In keeping in mind a viewer's collaborative function commented upon in the previous section, which in itself reflects the shared culpability Ellul maintains exists between the propagandist and the propagandee, attraction to a propaganda poster can conceivably be instigated by a variety of contributing elements. An individual's attention can be drawn because of a recognisable visual construct, because the poster is bright and colourful, or because of the potency of the accompanying text – or by any combination of these components. However, it should also be considered that a propagandee is attracted to that specific medium simply because of its ubiquity, in addition to the acknowledgement that this is the means by which information has been conveyed to the crowd in the past. The interest for the viewer is therefore in discovering the particular message communicated at each posting, and a situation undoubtedly heightened during times of conflict. Imperative when taking all this into account is that an artwork 'exploit its medium to the uttermost – bearing in mind that material is not medium save when used as an organ of expression' (Dewey, 2005 p237). Dewey's remarks are further corroborated by the observation that, in some ways,

> the role of the exactly repeatable pictorial statement and its syntaxes resolves itself into what, once stated, is the truism that at any given moment the accepted report of an event is of greater importance than

> the event, for what we think about and act upon is the symbolic report and not the concrete event itself (Ivins, 1969 p180).

A theory such as this not only upholds the concepts considered earlier regarding reactive responses, but also serves as a reminder of the genealogical thread in respect of the public interest aroused each time Hogarth issued a new series of engraved prints, not only pertaining to what he had to say, but also how he had chosen, pictorially, to say it. Baudrillard expands on this when he declares that 'Only the medium can make an event – whatever the contents, whether they are conformist or subversive' (1994 p82). Although Baudrillard maintains this can create a problem for 'all counterinformation' (p82) this is not necessarily the case, as references in this text to circular cause and consequence aims to demonstrate. The medium utilised can be manipulated – as Baudrillard contends – thereby transforming 'the reality using the impact of the medium as form' (p82). This is more fully explored in the next chapter, but it is worth acknowledging here that clever marketing campaigns can make us buy – or buy into – a product or an idea we may not have felt an association with if sold to us by alternative means of distribution. It is therefore worth contemplating these comments regarding an "event" with this in mind, as well as with specific regard to the conflict propaganda poster. Certainly it is worth considering whether propagandees' attention might be drawn more effectively if contemporary propaganda flashed onto their iPads or computer screens, or whether in fact the converse is true. Whilst messaging in text- and image-form via computers and "smart 'phones" is already an efficient method of moving information around the world, it is plausible the focussed, propaganda message needs to be more cleverly delivered. The propagandee is required to react, but the need to instigate a response to the medium through which the propaganda is distributed, in addition to the event or situation itself, should also be factored into the equation, emphasising the requirement for careful consideration and construction of the visual message in order to attract and incite-to-action the viewer – the propagandee. Moore believes most current propaganda poster art is designed *specifically* to be downloaded and printed as required, with the internet being at the forefront of the creator's mind (2010 p189). Equally, the fact a person – potential propagandist or, conversely, a propagandee – can take that file to a printer and get just *one* poster printed, rather than the historic print run of hundreds, means everyone can now be involved in the continuing distribution of specific propagandist messaging (p189). There is a question as to whether in this current technological context the political poster has lost its place when there is no longer a need for mass gatherings of protest because our 'information-based society' enables 'virtual forms of assembly

and political participation' (Schnapp, 2005 p16). The *Occupy* movement founded in 2011 disputes this premise, however, demonstrating a "need" for mass gatherings *and* emphasising the poster as being at the forefront of ensuring the message is projected to as many people as possible. Jeffrey T. Schnapp concedes that 'Posters provide a literal, material bridge between the new public sphere constituted by mass communications and the public spaces that become the sites of modern politics as street theater' (2005 p20). The suggestion that the *Occupy* movement has contributed to a change in headlines and sound bites which now 'reflect the language of the movement' (Ruggiero, 2012 p10) should undoubtedly be expanded to include the *visual* language, as the associated imagery plays an essential role in keeping *Occupy*'s profile at a high level – the visual equivalent of sound bites as previously proposed. Posters as a specific medium utilised for the distribution of a message, including those relating to conflict propaganda, are 'aggressive' simply because of their ubiquity within the wider visual ecology (Sontag, 1999 p196). As a result there exists a combination of complement and competition between them (p196) which is supplemental to the complementary and competitive aspect that lies between the poster as one medium and other, alternative means through which propagandist information can be conveyed, as is focussed upon in a later chapter. Consequently, and in support of Schnapp's comments, the posters as distributing media 'presuppose the modern concept of public space – as a theatre of persuasion' (Sontag, 1999 p196-197). In further reiteration of the position of the poster in a contemporary context there is an intriguing genealogical parallel in the observation that Michelangelo and Raphael Sanzio da Urbino assisted in the creation of 'a new visual language' (Shearman, 1967 p60) almost five hundred years ago, as similarly considered in relation to the *Occuprint* artists of the *Occupy* movement. In continuing forward along this temporal thread, and focussing upon the internet as a method of information-distribution, it is pertinent to note that

> Our daily lives are punctuated by one persuasive communication after another, the vast majority of which do not involve argument or rational debate but are a one-sided exercise in the manipulation of symbols designed to engage our emotions (Moore, 2010 p192).

The phrase "symbols designed to engage our emotions" is a twenty-first century observation that summarises the themes examined within this chapter, as it illustrates perfectly the ideas behind Baudrillard's visible continuum in the form of the *line of beauty*, supported by the genealogical legacy that encompasses Hogarth's eighteenth century aesthetic theorising. Focussing on a formal element such as the *line of beauty* assists in the innovative confrontation of the discourse

surrounding propaganda art in general and the poster in particular. It is the culmination of this collaboration and the subsequent impact it potentially has on visual culture that is further examined throughout this text, and the following chapter therefore concentrates on the importance of successful exploitation of the medium through which these concepts are distributed, namely the poster as an object in and of itself.

The Poster as a Functional Object

The previous chapter acknowledges how the visible continuum of the *line of beauty* can be a contributing element in the construction of effective pictorial propaganda, including that designed to promote a message during times of conflict and thereby assisting in the propaganda poster functioning as the visual equivalent of a sound bite. The carefully constructed combination of concise pictorial and textual information allows the essence of political doctrine to be conveyed to the masses swiftly and inexpensively. This contributes to the poster's ability to maintain its role within the larger landscape of propagandist messaging despite the means by which information can be communicated increasing exponentially through advances in technology. Even by the end of the nineteenth century and into the beginning of the twentieth, the amalgamation of the 'ephemeral and the ubiquitous' in the pictorial portrayal of propaganda was considered 'to be worryingly apposite in the age of the crowd' (Thompson, 2007 p180). In this regard, as previously highlighted, although the purpose of propagandist messaging constructed in this form is as a magnet for the attraction of an amorphous mass, it is to each participant within the crowd that the information is most productively directed. That individual need not even have to be fully conscious of the poster's message, as the required response may be achieved by he or she glimpsing the poster as an object, attracted by the bold colours used in its design – or a visual construct that might 'waken the desired reflexes' within (Ellul, 1973 p183), as is the premise of this research.

There are always questions regarding the relationship that exists between political matters and aesthetics, including whether propaganda art necessarily insinuates a 'subordination' of artistry to the directive it serves to communicate (Clark, 1997 p10). This inevitably leads to the conjecture as to whether or not 'the criteria for judging aesthetic quality can ever be separated from ideological values' (p10-11), and these are areas of discussion considered throughout this text. Nevertheless, when George Creel recalls that in America during World War I posters proclaimed 'from every hoarding like great clarions, captioned in every language, carrying a message that thrilled and inspired' (1920 p1), it underlines the necessity for the effective conveyance of pictorial information to exploit precise design constructs in order to instigate immediate attraction within the viewer. As already established, the elements under examination in this research, that is to say early twentieth century pictorial propaganda as a genre – particularly the poster utilised in times of conflict –

and the concept of the visible continuum in the specific construct of the *line of beauty*, effect an influence upon each other whilst additionally suggesting a 'model' by which to reassess the relationship between them and the resultant effect this has on visual culture (Ostrow, 2005 p226). This chapter therefore aims to concentrate on the poster as a functional object, not only as a medium for the circulation of conflict propagandist messaging principally as it pertains to the stated temporal emphasis, but also with regard to the presence within the poster's composition of the *line of beauty* and what that presence consequently represents.

Design and Distribution

The poster, in the form we now understand it, dates back to Roman times; prior to this are examples of artwork that can arguably be considered as being genealogically-linked including cave paintings, but Roman cities possessed the '*album*' (from whence the name derived) – a lime-whitened wall upon which legal notices were posted (Weill, 1984 p9, italics in the original). For research that examines the products of technological advancement with the capability of reproduction it is important to mention the industrialisation of paper production in general, as well as Johannes Gutenberg's contribution in the middle of the fifteenth century to the printing press in particular, this latter invention being one that instigated reproduction methods previously only possible when carried out by hand (Weill, 1984 p10). Similarly is the acknowledgement that from the end of the seventeenth century copper engraving was a method utilised for advertising purposes, particularly for business cards including those designed and constructed by Hogarth (Weill, 1984 p13) alongside his pictorially-conveyed social commentaries as referred to in the *Introduction*. However, studies in respect of these historical references form part of research not germane to this investigation in any more depth than has been recognised here, although the latter genealogical observation is significant not only because of Hogarth's crucial position as a catalyst within the context of this examination, but also to highlight an aspect of the printing process essential in the understanding of the *line of beauty* as a visual construct. Pictorial print designs taken directly from original paintings result in a printed image that is flipped horizontally, as illustrated in Figures 16 and 17. This technical necessity consequently supports the belief that not only are there no mathematical obligations in the articulation of this serpentine curve in forming a *line of beauty*, there is also no directionality issue with regard to how the *line* should be portrayed in an artwork in order for it to be deemed a *line of beauty*, and its presence can therefore be evaluated without the constriction of any specified positioning requirements. With

this in mind, therefore, the seeking out of prevalent features within a wider visual landscape serves to demonstrate their prospective function, not only as 'symbols to express ideas' (Hardie and Sabin, 1920 p24) but also as visual tropes that elicit recognition from within the viewer, as continues to be considered within this study with regard to the *line of beauty*. Consequently, and in the context of the conveyance of information via the specific medium of the poster, it is relevant to cite the following:

> Anyone can make a song or a story, but getting songs or stories out to the public is a specialist, strategic exercise. Keeping information and ideas out of public circulation is equally a function of distribution. Both promoting and denying circulation confer wealth and power, introducing disjunctures, deferrals, omissions and selections that restructure and reorganize both content and audience activity (Cubitt, 2005 p200).

Although Sean Cubitt is talking about a variety of media it is reasonable to apply this concept to the distribution and censorship of information in the form of propagandist promotion without altering the intention of the theoretical argument. As commented upon in the *Introduction*, information is, after all, information, regardless of content and whether communicated or withheld. In addition, the content is itself a medium, one that is separate to the medium through which it is delivered (McLuhan, 1964 p8), as suggested earlier in connection to the poster's distinctive ability as an object to "speak" to an individual within a crowd. In this regard the concept of the 'Medium' being the 'Message' (McLuhan, 1964 p7) is especially relevant when related to a poster employed for expressing propagandist messaging, including that which concerns a conflict situation. Creel similarly emphasises the significance, recognising that 'The printed word might not be read, people might not choose to attend meetings or to watch motion pictures, but the billboard was something that caught even the most indifferent eye' (1920 p1). The potential of this pervasiveness is further enhanced by the concept that the 'perpetual readiness of volitional, discursive memory, encouraged by the technique of mechanical reproduction, reduces the scope for the play of the imagination' (Benjamin, W., 1999 p183), thereby reinforcing how the poster, if strategically distributed as well as designed, has the ability to be *everywhere*. As a consequence, its ubiquity assists in channelling the viewer's focus. The very fact people can see the poster wherever they are and regardless of what they are doing demonstrates its pre-eminence in relation to other media, a situation especially pertinent in the early part of the twentieth century before television and the internet competed alongside this

particular medium for a viewer's attention. The ascension of the 'pictorial poster' therefore indicates

> the dynamism of a politics sensitive to broader cultural changes, notably developments in visual culture. It did so, however, not by merely parroting the visual language of advertising, but rather by integrating its emphasis on "striking the eye of the beholder" and the power of association, with the pictorial conventions and argumentative resources of the political cartoon (Thompson, 2007 p209).

Political cartoons as a comparative as well as competitive medium in the distribution of pictorial messaging is acknowledged in a later chapter, but what is key in this observation is the recognition of the necessary combination of the "power of association" with the requirement to strike "the eye of the beholder", a concept Hogarth reflected upon in the assessment of his ideas cited in the *Introduction*. These factors are undeniably essential in the creation of effective poster design, propagandist or otherwise. Moreover, when this is further considered in the context of how a poster has the ability to circumvent so-called normal distribution means, often by way of guerrilla circulation – a factor that again assists in elevating the poster above other forms of propagandist messaging – the unique and often diverse elements that contribute to the whole become mediums in their own right. These mediums remain separate to that of the poster as an object, yet culminate in a relationship that results in a singular, powerful medium in the form of the poster. The elements as individual design constructs, as well as the completed compilation, can individually or collectively be manipulated in their function as tools that assist in serving the propagandist's objectives. Although a more focussed examination of advertising in the form of commercial marketing and its connection to propaganda is considered in a later chapter, it is relevant at this point to ally the reference to "pictorial conventions" with the pervading qualities of the poster as a medium, and concentrate briefly on the idea of manipulating nostalgia (Adorno, 2001 p63) as a means of inciting an individual to buy – or buy into – an ideal, the objective of the propagandist. Once again this concept benefits from the viewer's recognition of a design construct known to be attractive and which includes a visible continuum such as the *line of beauty*. The application of this particular serpentine curve need not necessarily be overt – as already explored in this text, and as further illustrated in the British Railways poster *The Isle of Man* at Figure 18 – as the concept of the "visual ellipsis" can be instigated within the viewer. This correlates with the idea of "seizing the essential in the abbreviated form", as this latter premise is as applicable

to the viewer as it is to the artist, and especially in their respective roles as either propagandee or propagandist. Dewey, in an echo of Adorno, maintains that 'The first stirrings of dissatisfaction and the first intimations of a better future are always found in works of art' (2005 p360), and when combined with an arguably nostalgic influence to create a way of attracting the individual to its message, as the Charles Pears poster [Fig. 18] serves to demonstrate in this particular context, the theory is enhanced. The relevance is especially germane in respect of the poster designed specifically for propaganda purposes, and takes on extra significance when the pictorial propagandist promotion is specifically conflict-related because of the necessity to suggest an attainable reality worth fighting for. Equally, in the construction of a poster considered to be successful in this regard, there needs to 'be a mystery; something more must be suggested than is said' (Gregg, 1918 p94), a concept relating directly to the presence in an artwork of the *line of beauty*. This is not only because of the *line*'s genealogical heritage which will therefore instigate recognition within the viewer albeit not always consciously acknowledged, but also because its representation indicates a visual trope with an ability to suggest movement at its most beautiful. The viewer's attraction to the artwork is subsequently compounded because of the connotations behind what that movement may serve to represent. If the element of "attraction" is then taken in isolation it is reasonable to suggest that the meaning this visual construct expresses to the viewer is at least as important as any accompanying textual captioning, regardless of whether the information being distributed is considered as propaganda or otherwise and, as reflected upon earlier, this ability to attract becomes an elemental medium in itself. The relevance of Pears' poster [Fig. 18] as it further pertains to these concepts is clarified in a following section of this chapter.

'Montage of Attractions'

The above observations can be considered in conjunction with poster design in general, but more pertinent is their association with conflict propaganda poster design in particular and their subsequent contribution to this medium in relation to the necessary 'stirring [of] the minds of the people by means of appeals through the eye' (Gregg, 1918 p47). The Russian film-maker and theorist Sergei Eisenstein writes that

> An attraction... is in our understanding any demonstrable fact (an action, an object, a phenomenon, a conscious combination, and so on) that is known and proven to exercise a definite effect on the attention and emotions of the audience and that, combined with

> others, possesses the characteristic of concentrating the audience's emotions in any direction dictated by the production's purpose (2010 p40-41).

Eisenstein's theory of *The Montage of Attractions* is concerned with the editing and subsequent juxtaposition of moving imagery, but what is key in the cited observation relevant to this research is the reference to an "object", isolated by Eisenstein and consequently providing the focus for this particular contextual consideration. For a viewer to be susceptible to the 'attractional effect of an object' Eisenstein maintains one needs to be certain of where that viewer is to be directed and consequently which 'emotional and psychological effects', whether singular or in multiples, will be of most value (2010 p265-266) in extracting the required response from the individual. The model of a combination of effects pertains perfectly to the poster when it is considered as a layered construction: a static representation of Eisenstein's own theoretical concept highlighted above. The construction consists of the background, the message, both pictorial and textual – and Baudrillard's visible continuum that in this context assists in unifying the whole, not only through its function as a visual construct, but also through its historic aesthetic genealogy and the consequent recognition of the same by the viewer. The primary objective of this "montage" is 'the common quality of *attraction*' (Taylor, 2010 p3, italics in the original), a concept as applicable to other imagery as it is to film, and in this respect it is of note to consider that 'The ends justified the means and for Eisenstein the ends were always *ultimately* ideological, even if they were frequently expressed in aesthetic terms' (Taylor, 2010 p3, italics in the original). Consequently, in advocating a correlation between film and the poster through this idea of "montage", not least with regard to a considered editorial process, there lies a supplementary connection in the metaphorical meaning that relates to the concept of the "ideological" objectives. With this latter point in mind and in order to further discern an acceptable analogous association between Eisenstein's specifically-theatrical and -filmic theories with the construction of a propaganda poster, the primary signifier relevant to this research is situated ostensibly in "movement". This is despite the fact that in the construction of the poster, movement is statically represented, because it nonetheless equates metaphorically with the attraction associated with the manifestation of movement via the *line of beauty* that directs the onlooker to the ideological. Baudrillard considers 'the collapse of reality into hyperrealism in the minute duplication of the real, preferably on the basis of another reproductive medium' (1983 p141), an acknowledgement of the need for an object or idea to be "sold" to the viewer and which can form part of a collated construction.

A visible continuum in the form of a *line of beauty* therefore contributes additional layering to the assemblage: firstly the construct can indicate the static representation of movement in a literal sense. Secondly, as already acknowledged, it can signify movement from a metaphoric standpoint, a function relating specifically to the promotion of propaganda through the concept of movement equalling change, that is to say from a current real to an alternate, future real, and which is particularly significant when considered in the context of a conflict situation such as World War I. Thirdly, the *line of beauty* can be considered exactly as Hogarth's designation describes: as beauty embedded within an artwork – for the purposes of this research, conflict propaganda artwork – that is otherwise either literally or metaphorically potentially *un*attractive, the *line*'s role being as a catalyst to draw the attention of the viewer to the work under consideration. All these attributes are examined throughout this text, but of additional interest in relation to the latter point is the idea that 'desire' can be considered as 'a dimension of the Real that remains inaccessible to depiction' – except that 'Art refuses to accept this prohibition, and insists on depicting desire' (Mitchell, 2005 p56). This is a belief Hogarth undoubtedly subscribed to as this led him to articulate his theories in this regard through his manuscript *The Analysis of Beauty*. The utilisation of the noun "desire" accentuates the points made previously regarding suggestiveness and potentiality and how they can be employed productively when considering a propagandist objective. The genealogical relevance is further highlighted by Ellul's declaration that propaganda 'acts much more through emotional shock than through reasoned conviction' (1973 p204) and this aids in underlining a viewer's potential reaction on encountering a *line of beauty*: not so much "shock" in and of itself but, in effect, a jolt of recognition – a "striking" of the viewer, as Hogarth describes it. In relation to photography in particular, Roland Barthes refers to an element within the image with this capacity to 'prick' a viewer as a '*punctum*' (1993, p27, italics in the original), and it is not discernibly counter to Barthes' overall theoretical intention to apply this concept to other media within visual culture. With especial regard to propagandist messaging, Ellul speaks of an 'ideological elaboration' initiated through that shock (1973 p204) and this supports the idea that the *line of beauty*, when used as a visual construct with the ability to attract – a "*punctum*", so to speak – assists in unifying the visual message, namely the propaganda message conveyed through this particular medium of distribution.

As formerly reflected upon there is a necessity for a work of art to demonstrate "unity"; a *line of beauty* aligned within the context described above can be utilised as

a unifying link that enables the viewer to contemplate the propaganda artwork in its entirety. Hogarth's ideas regarding this particular serpentine curve as explained in the previous chapter underscore this conjecture, as does Fry's assertion that

> In a picture this unity is due to a balancing of the attractions to the eye about the central line of the picture. The result of this balance of attractions is that the eye rests willingly within the bounds of the picture (1981 p22).

This concept allies with the considerations surrounding Eisenstein's theory referred to earlier, and although it speaks of a pre-conceived constructive formula it can arguably also include an artwork created more intuitively. When Fry discusses 'the emotional elements of design' he declares that one of these elements is 'the rhythm of the line with which the forms are delineated', and continues that 'The drawn line is the record of a gesture and that gesture is modified by the artist's feeling which is thus communicated to us directly' (1981 p23-24). These observations serve to highlight Hogarth's own thoughts concerning the *line of beauty* and the role it plays in expressing that which is 'beautiful' within an artwork (1997 p33). Furthermore, even taking into account the points made regarding a literal reading of the *line as* a *line of beauty*, it is the concept of its value to attract as it pertains to an artwork intended to provoke a specific response within the viewer that is of most relevance here, particularly artwork in the form of the conflict propaganda poster. The idea put forward by Socrates that whether something is deemed to be 'beautiful' or not is associated diametrically with its use (Xenophon, 2009 p79) – especially pertinent in light of the comments made in this section of the chapter so far – is upheld by Fry's observation that

> The perception of purposeful order and variety in an object gives us the feeling which we express by saying that it is beautiful, but when by means of sensations our emotions are aroused we demand purposeful order and variety in them also, and if this can only be brought about by the sacrifice of sensual beauty we willingly overlook its absence (1981 p21).

This is of significance because of the idea that propagandist messaging, from a literal, dictionary-denotation viewpoint, is judged to be 'biased' or 'misleading' (OED, 2009 p1150) and there is potentially – as previously alluded to – a necessity to disguise any deceit by utilising within that pictorial message a construct considered to be "beautiful". Ellul comments on an awareness that the amalgamation of the 'covert' and the 'overt' with regard to propaganda presents a 'facade' in order to arrest a propagandee's attention (1973 p16) – the so-called "misleading" information

distributed via a poster disguised by the “facade” of a visual construct regarded as representing beauty, at least insofar as this “something beautiful” pertains to an attraction for the beholder. With this in mind it is worth noting Fry’s belief that there is an explanation for

> the apparent contradiction between two distinct uses of the word beauty, one for that which has sensuous charm, and one for the aesthetic approval of works of imaginative art where the objects presented to us are often of extreme ugliness. Beauty in the former sense belongs to works of art where only the perceptual aspect of the imaginative life is exercised, beauty in the second sense becomes as it were supersensual, and is concerned with the appropriateness and intensity of the emotions aroused. When these emotions are aroused in a way that satisfies fully the needs of the imaginative life we approve and delight in the sensations through which we enjoy that heightened experience, because they possess purposeful order and variety in relation to those emotions (1981 p22).

Fry’s observations illustrate perfectly the perceived purpose of propagandist messaging and the desired and required responses from the propagandees to whom the visual communication is directed, a theory examined further later in this text. What is pertinent to contemplate with Fry’s assertions in mind is to what degree conflict propaganda poster artists, especially in the early twentieth century, incorporated within their designs specific ‘principles, aesthetic or otherwise’, knowingly or unknowingly, and which result in certain visual constructs – ‘symbols’ – instigating a response from the viewer that stems from connections deeply-rooted in previous personal experience (Toney, 1980 pxix), thereby assisting in eliciting Ellul’s “desired reflexes”. Undeniably, certain ‘generalizations’ are imperative in effective poster design (Toney, 1980 pxx), as cited in the previous chapter; a so-called toolkit of design constructs contribute to the collation of attractions and aid in the consequent flexibility and efficiency of the poster as a medium. In this respect, the poster’s ability to keep pace with ever-changing events (1980 pxvi) is facilitated – an imperative function especially in times of conflict – whilst simultaneously altering not only the relationship between the elements but also the resultant effect of the whole.

A Touchstone

The *line of beauty*, as stated, is representative of movement and although this is closely examined in the chapter that follows it is nevertheless worth commenting upon Edmund Burke’s eighteenth century description of ‘a waving surface’ (1958

p155) that Uglow ascribes to the *line of beauty* in her biography of Hogarth (2002 p532). This "waving surface" speaks of the visual construct not necessarily defined yet indicative of movement, especially when allied with Burke's expression of 'a gentle oscillatory motion' (1958 p155) and which can be articulated pictorially in a conflict propaganda poster as a line of soldiers, a road, or fire, for example, as demonstrated in Figures 19 and 20. However, as historically political posters frequently took the form of a 'diptych' (Thompson, 2007 p198), the literal dividing line between contrasting party policies, the battlefield and the Home Front, as well as "before" and "after" scenarios whether real or aspirational, can also utilise the construct of the *line* as illustrated in Carles Fontseré's Spanish Civil war poster at Figure 21. These images [Figs. 19-21] not only demonstrate the presence of a *line of beauty* as a visual design construct, they also express the concepts formerly suggested regarding an assemblage of textual and pictorial information that together form a whole greater than the sum of its parts in order to effectively portray propagandist information through the functional medium of the conflict propaganda poster. Moreover, the presence of the *line* in imagery that lies within the parameters of this research from a genre as well as contextual perspective, yet exists outside of its temporal emphasis, for example Figure 21, is once more indicative of the genealogical legacy of this particular trope; a replication and repetition that is continually highlighted throughout this text.

The line of reasoning so far observed feeds directly into the idea that 'all works of art get made to be used' (Malvern, 2004 p21), a notion that echoes Socrates' comments regarding use and beauty, yet which also highlights the conditions of possibility for *mis*use – that a viewer might misread any so-called message, a theory particularly relevant in the context of this research with its focus on conflict propaganda art. This underlines the idea that propagandist intentions can sometimes have a counter-propagandist outcome, not least because different "realities" can be invoked depending on the viewer's interpretation of the work. These interpretations are often separate from the artists' original intentions, a concept productively illustrated in the practice of adapting existing artworks to create imagery that consequently indicates alternative contexts, as is examined later in this and other chapters of this text. It is not possible, however, for propaganda to 'create something out of nothing' (Ellul, 1973 p36), and when this is considered alongside the idea of different mediums creating differing effects which then combine together – 'the *complementary* character of propaganda' (1973 p161-162, italics in the original) – the conclusion is therefore construed that the purely pictorial conflict

propaganda message, in this instance carried within the medium of the poster, is arguably unworkable unless part of a wider campaign. This is not to underestimate the power a poster can wield for reasons previously suggested: posters are intended to work with an immediacy that designers need to exploit with eye-catching imagery and captioning kept to a minimum (James and Thomson, 2011 p4), as demonstrated in the World War I poster designed by Bert Thomas at Figure 22. This is an example of conflict propaganda poster art that depicts the *line of beauty* not only as a "waving surface" in the form of the war bonds visualised as ammunition, but also in a "drawn" line generated by the hard-edged quality of the block colour that is set alongside it. In once more supporting this somewhat fluid conveyance of the *line of beauty*, Joseph Burke comments that Hogarth's 'regard for visual truth prevented him from using a sweeping or regular line as the basis of his technique, even though lines played such an important part in his mental analysis' (1955 pxlii-xliii). In addition to the references previously made in relation to Hogarth's own descriptions concerning the utilisation of the *line* as they serve to underscore this observation, the ambition to convey a "visual truth" equates with the concept of the visual ellipsis from the perspective of the requirement of the imagination in continuing the *line* through the formation of a serpentine curve that is not pictorially depicted in its entirety. These ideas are expanded upon in the next chapter as they relate directly to the capturing of actual movement.

In considering the Thomas artwork [Fig. 22], and in a further and very specific illustration of Saul Ostrow's observations as they pertain to visual culture cited at the beginning of this study, World War I caused the object of the poster to be utilised in an extraordinary way and for extraordinary purposes, focussing its ability to function as a 'touchstone' in the organisation of what is 'useful and valuable' in the commonplace, in order to form the components into 'weapons of immense power' (Hardie and Sabin, 1920 p1). The relationship between the components demonstrates an outcome with the potential to outweigh the merits of each individual contribution to the construction. This era of artists recognised this potential and responded accordingly, with the result that

> the poster, inspired by an enthusiasm unknown before, became the one form of Art answering to the needs of the moment, an instrument driving home into every mind its emphatic moral and definite message (Hardie and Sabin, 1920 p3).

It should be acknowledged, however, that this observation is only partially true, because artists who enlisted as soldiers can also be said to have responded

aesthetically to the moment, and this is examined in the following chapters. Nonetheless, if the theory is correct that any 'symbol' used in a cynical fashion is likely to produce contrived, and therefore not very good, art (Pound, 1970 p86), the comments above do provoke the question as to whether the *line of beauty*, if utilised consciously by an artist, results in artwork too contrived to be considered aesthetically successful, despite its presence being arguably associated with a very specific "use". Even so – and leaving aside the contextual considerations of personal opinion in what denotes so-called "good" or "bad" art – there is a definite requirement for the construction of artwork intended for propaganda purposes to be contrived, especially in the context of a visual sound bite encapsulated in the form of a poster, and it could even be deemed as defeating its own objective if this is not the case. Eisenstein maintains that generalisations need to be made with regard to audience reactions, and responses should be approached with these reactions in mind; if this is not adhered to, he asserts, there can be no '*influential art*' and, more importantly, '*no art with maximum influence*' (2010 p69, italics in the original). This is an observation as relevant to the individual onlooker surveying a poster as it is to a crowd collectively viewing a film, and the crux of the role of the poster within a propaganda campaign. A viewer's reaction to an image depends on how that image is positioned within the 'huge stock of images stored in the memory' (Arnheim, 1956 p33); consequently

> This tie with the past may or may not have a tangible effect, depending on whether traces are mobilized that are strong enough to take advantage of the structural weaknesses (ambiguities) in the perceived figure. It is a matter of the relative strength of the stimulus structure as compared with the structural strength of the pertinent traces (p33).

These observations underscore the points made previously regarding the relevance of resemblances to a viewer's analysis of an artwork, thereby highlighting why a propaganda poster's composition should consist of a considered collation of components. These not only include the message, be that textual or purely pictorial, but also the incorporation of a sign or symbol with a "strength" capable of generating recognition within the viewer, form the basis for his or her attraction to the functional object, and thereby instigate the propagandist's required response – and the *line of beauty* serves as a productive example for this.

Textual Context

One of the threads commented on previously in this chapter and which needs to be taken into account in any examination of the poster, is the use of text in its role as a contributory medium, because its function may or may not serve in support of companion mediums that contribute to the construction of conflict propaganda artwork, including the visible continuum of the *line of beauty*. This use of text is explored in later chapters, but it is germane at this stage to reference Clark's observation that

> A large proportion of propaganda posters ...would lack a clear meaning without their written slogans, and some of these are incomprehensible when removed from their context. Propaganda images are seldom devised to communicate independently... (1997 p43).

In the chapter titled *Representing the Real in the Aesthetics of Conflict*, comparison is made between World War I propaganda posters including those relating to recruitment and the aesthetic response from soldier-artists in the trenches, particularly in respect of the representation of a real and the ability to communicate this effectively with or without text. Nevertheless, it is pertinent at this point to consider how much an object with a function designed to convey a message can depend upon only *one* feature of the design, be it a visual construct or concise textual augmentation, bearing in mind the comments regarding relationships already examined. It is therefore worth acknowledging that 'Image and text can fulfil their functions only as long as it is not forgotten that both are material forms and the "truth," as a material-immaterial structure, must always be written and read anew...' (Sloterdijk, 1988 p278). This observation is an interesting perspective on McLuhan's concept of the medium being the message, especially in relation to the representation of a real articulated through both text *and* image. Taking all this into consideration, a relevant illustrative example is a British poster from 1918 [Fig. 23] that proffers similar textual messaging to that formerly cited in the Thomas poster at Figure 22. Although the presence of a *line of beauty* in the Sidney Stanley *Feed the Guns with War Bonds* poster [Fig. 23] is merely suggested in the waving surface of the distant smoke that lies behind the soldier, and represented through Abstraction influence in the shape of the soldier's body, this poster is referenced here because it is an actual example of how a slightly later production of a design was 're-worded to play to people's growing war-weariness' (James and Thompson, 2011 p19), as illustrated in Figure 24. With specific regard to a 'caption' (as opposed to a 'headline' or accompanying 'article'), Barthes maintains this has the ability – at least

in appearance – of being able to ‘duplicate the image’ (1977 p26). Not only is it apposite to consider this in the context of straightforward combinations of caption and image in the structure of a poster, it is also relevant in respect of how the relationship may or may not change when the caption is replaced or, indeed, vice versa. Of additional interest is Barthes’ assertion that this “duplication” is a practical impossibility – it can amplify a message, or it can misdirect (1977 p26-27), and the relevance of this is never more significant than when allied with pictorial propaganda messaging, as alluded to earlier. Adaptation of existing posters was not an uncommon practice, as is examined later in this research; what is of note in view of Clark’s comments, however, is how successful or not the image is without any text at all, as demonstrated in Figure 25.

Ellul remarks that ‘Propaganda gives the individual the stereotypes he no longer takes the trouble to work out for himself’, with a poster caption being one such “stereotypical” slogan; in this way an individual can be convinced it is he or she who has the opinion rather than accepting the one supplied as his or her own (1973 footnote p163). Taking this into account, the meaning of the text-less “message” at Figure 25, now dependent on the imagery alone, is manifold, although the viewer cannot be in doubt that its objective is militaristic; temporal context alone will aid viewers in comprehending the image, particularly a conflict propaganda poster made and distributed as it is for immediacy. Without explanatory text, however, the imagery in this example could construe a warning – that despite the representation of the soldier appearing to be an ally, he could conversely symbolise a potential threat. Arguably the unadorned image expresses a more evocative connotation, as the perspective intimates the viewer is not only on the battlefield, but in the trench looking up at the soldier fighting beside him or her. As an example of Modernist-inspired conflict propagandist graphic art the image can be said to be attractive: it is certainly relevant, but can a viewer – the propagandee – be seduced by it to the point of incitement-to-action, a question which takes one back to the issue as to whether the context is explicit enough to accomplish this without additional pictorial or textual explanation, that is to say, whether it can function without complementary components to enhance the whole. The lack of clarity in this example results in the specific contextual intention being left as undefined, and an unclear message is undoubtedly as unhelpful to a propagandist cause as no message at all. If, on the other hand, in general the image is considered to be of less significance than the text there would be no requirement to expend time and energy in the creation of new designs, especially those utilising visual constructs with known genealogical

relevance and ability to attract: the “message” can instead be distributed in the form of two-tone newspaper-style headlines. Apart from the fact such distribution would cease to have an effect on large groups with a high number of illiterate members, even taking into account the premise that the inevitable *literate* individual within the mass can take control of the translation, the imagery forms the basis for a viewer’s initial attraction. This emphasises that it is not necessarily about the medium utilised in the distribution of the message in and of itself, but what is done with that medium in order to elicit the required response – or, indeed, a collation of contributory mediums combining to create another, for example a functional object in the form of a poster. Certainly Barthes’ remark that the combination of the complementary qualities of image and text is important in the understanding of the whole (1977 p16) underpins imagery design considerations already commented upon within this research, yet particularly noteworthy is Barthes’ use of the word ‘parasitic’ when discussing text which is used to ‘connote’ an image (p25). The amalgamation of text and image, as has been demonstrated in the illustrations at Figures 23 and 24, changes the meaning conveyed, thereby altering the relationship between the two and therefore the impact of the whole upon the viewer.

Hearts and Minds

With the purpose of clarifying the points made in the previous section it is of import to reference a Fred Spear poster design from 1915, illustrated at Figure 26. This poster, with the *line of beauty* now explicit in the shape and positioning of the woman’s body, was created to take advantage of the level of feeling that emerged after the sinking of the *Lusitania* (Moore, 2010 p105). There is no need to mention the actual event, either textually or pictorially, as the image of the young woman with the baby in her arms and which possibly relates to contemporaneous accounts regarding ‘a mother and child washed up on the beach’ (side note p105), is all that is required to adequately demonstrate the context to the general public. Although it is therefore an example of how propaganda practices need to work in conjunction with each other in order to be successful, (viewers will only understand the poster’s message if they have already read about the *Lusitania* in the newspapers, or seen reports of the sinking via newsreels), the propagandist requirement to incite-to-action the viewer by way of a response is articulated through the poster’s visual messaging utilising only minimal textual captioning, namely the single word “ENLIST”. In addition, the concept of something beautiful embedded in something insidious is not only illustrated as a way of eliciting an attraction to the message, it is also an apt reminder to the viewer that war in general, and in this instance World

War I in particular, is fought ‘in defence of the beautiful things of the world against those who delight in their destruction’ (Gregg, 1918 p47). The need to manipulate the hearts and minds of the public was as relevant in early twentieth century conflict as it is at the beginning of the twenty-first. Although, as W. J. T. Mitchell writes, logically everyone knows that imagery is not the same as the object that is contained within it, particularly if that ‘object’ is human (2005 p31) as is the case with the Spear poster – nor, indeed, and in a reflection of Dewey’s comments cited in the previous chapter, that the image has a literal life of its own – there still seemingly exists a willingness ‘to make exceptions for special cases’ (Mitchell, 2005 p31). The ability to initiate an emotional reaction from within the viewer increases considerably when he or she can perceive an empathetic link to the pictorial components in the imagery, and the depiction of a figure in distress is one such design concept that will inevitably have such an effect. This idea of empathetic involvement is a crucial element in propagandist manipulation, as is reflected upon throughout this research, because of the alleged requirement for at least some form of collusion between the propagandist and the propagandee. In addition, Mitchell’s observation that there are certain images utilised in advertising that appear to take on a so-called life of their own when it comes to engendering interest beyond expectation (2005 p31) can as equally be applied to comparable success or otherwise of posters designed for conflict propaganda purposes. Consequently, this generates speculation as to whether a deconstruction of Mitchell’s conjecture might reveal the premise that, at least under certain circumstances, it is a particular design construct within that image that has the potential to be responsible for this attraction phenomenon. This promotion of a concept that plays on nostalgic ideals with regard to current realities worth “saving” was exploited as a propagandist tool during twentieth century conflicts, not only in relation to people as indicated above, but also to places. The idea as well as the practice of altering existing posters in order to create a new context is further explored in the next chapter. However, as a summation of the ideas so far examined, it is also demonstrated in Figure 27 – a specific adaptation of the Pears’ poster referenced previously in its original incarnation at Figure 18 – whereby the context of the imagery as a whole has been altered entirely because of the replacement of the assigned text by a caption possessing a considerably more emotive connotation. Furthermore, the contrived caption has the capacity to adopt an additional, temporally-contextual attribute if the resultant poster is distributed during a time of ongoing conflict.

This adapted poster [Fig. 27] serves to support Mitchell's supposition regarding the separation of the contained object from that of the functional object utilised to convey it, and the manipulation of a viewer's emotional response by way of calculated textual augmentation aids in the understanding that certain images are capable of instigating a reaction arguably greater than the sum-of-the-parts warrants. Both advertising and propaganda posters are reliant on the medium's reproducibility to fulfil their potential, and mass-production confers an accessibility to, and recognition of, artworks that consequently 'shift the sites of reception and confer a sense of common ownership over the image' (Clark, 1997 p60-61). The *line of beauty*, already indicated within the images illustrated in this chapter is similarly portrayed in the countryside pathway depicted in Figure 28, as well as in its manipulated alternate at Figure 29. It is therefore a reasonable assumption that this "common ownership" is not restricted to the imagery as a completed construction, but also includes the visual tropes employed within the compositions and what they may or may not serve to represent, as this research continues to assess with regard to the specific pictorial construct of the *line of beauty*.

The posters at Figures 18 and 28 could be categorised as being unexceptional in and of themselves; it is the amended captioning that connotes new, more evocative meaning to the imagery [Figs. 27 and 29]. In addition, particular images can be said to be temporally iconic, with some held in their 'status as enigmas and omens, harbingers of uncertain futures' – unexceptional, perhaps, but with a pictorial component capable of eliciting the '*idea*' of 'dread' (Mitchell, 2005 p12, italics in the original). In this instance the presence of a *line of beauty* can be representative, whether knowingly scribed or otherwise, of a reassurance, especially if embedded within an artwork generally thought to be disconcerting, for example, conflict artwork. This concept of a so-called "disequilibrium" encountered on the part of the viewer as alluded to in the previous chapter is more fully considered later in this research, but it is pertinent to comment here on how an image such as a World War I propaganda poster is temporally representative of the era as an object, and also temporally indicative of that era because of the "objects" contained within it. The pictorial portrayal of a column of marching soldiers suggestive of a visual ellipsis, as demonstrated at Figure 2, is an apposite example. Moreover, when this concept is applied to Mitchell's specific comment regarding an unexceptional image that nevertheless conveys an "idea of dread", the pictorially-emphasised, text-less version of the Lumley poster equally serves as a productive illustration [Fig. 30]. The image at Figure 30 supports Mitchell's comment when it is considered

retrospectively and allied with the understanding that any poignancy attributed to the pictorial portrayal of the First World War soldiers is undoubtedly affected by knowledge regarding the fate that befell so many of the men (Bryan, 2011 p70), visualised as they are in this poster example and therefore adding to the debate regarding the importance of contextual considerations in the analysis of artwork. Taking this idea a step further is the feasible conjecture that in addition to emotions aroused within the viewer that may include anxiety or sadness upon encountering the subject matter, there exists a recognition of a visible continuum with an aesthetic legacy such as the *line of beauty* that will similarly if *conversely* affect the viewer's perception. In respect of the image under analysis here [Fig. 30], this relates to the serpentine curve the line of soldiers is represented as following, and despite it being an example of a *line of beauty* that requires the imagination of the viewer in order to complete the curvature, this is nonetheless an acceptable process – as Hogarth decrees within his treatise – in ascertaining the "visual truth" of the whole.

Ephemeral Encapsulation

Temporally-iconic imagery as defined within the parameters of this text is significantly represented within the medium of the pictorial poster, and therefore it is pertinent at this point to cite Walter Benjamin's assertion that

> *Reproductive technology ...removes the thing reproduced from the realm of tradition. In making many copies of the reproduction, it substitutes for its unique incidence a multiplicity of incidences. And in allowing the reproduction to come closer to whatever situation the person apprehending it is in, it actualizes what is reproduced* (2008 p7, italics in the original).

Benjamin's comments focus attention on the concept of 'The Medium is the Message' (McLuhan, 1964 p7) and the idea that an individual – a propagandee – relates to the object *in addition* to the literal or pictorial information, correlating with reflections regarding response to the *report* of an event rather than to the event itself, as noted, and further illustrated in Spear's *Enlist* poster [Fig. 26]. Similarly it emphasises the idea of "common ownership" over an image that is expanded not only by the actual reproduction but also by the extended distribution of the multiple over the single image. Adorno remarks that 'All mass culture is fundamentally adaptation', maintaining this 'adaptation' equally applies to the 'consumers' themselves, that each facet adjusts to accept the other in as simplistic a way as possible (2001 p67). This correlates with the idea of collusion between the "consumer" as propagandee and the distributor in the form of the propagandist.

However, even taking into account Walter Benjamin's assertion, there is a difference between artwork intended as an original piece of work subsequently reproduced in the form of prints – whether of a limited edition or otherwise – and artwork purposely designed *in order* for it to be reproduced, as is the case with the poster. Walter Benjamin comments on the possibility that the reproducibility of a work of art takes priority over the actual work of art, investing it with 'new functions' that may in fact render the aesthetic 'function' as ancillary (2008 p12-13), and from a technical point of view at least this is undoubtedly the case for poster production. Of interest is Benjamin's assertion that upon the failure of the requirement for 'a genuineness in art' because of the ability for reproduction, 'ritual' is replaced as the supporting function by 'politics' (2008 p12). This emphasises how the motivations behind an artwork intended to stand alone as an original are different from those related to the creation of artworks designed for reproduction purposes. Where the two intersect, however, is in their 'display value' (Benjamin, W., 2008 p13): an initial work of art may have value as an original piece that alters once it is displayed, and this latter attribute therefore allies it more with the poster because the poster is an object designed *specifically* for display, with any value therefore assessed accordingly and in addition to the value of the message conveyed. Furthermore, the message itself consists of "values" that stem from the components that contribute to its distribution, including the text and, equally as importantly, the visual constructs which include the *line of beauty*.

Following directly on from the aspect of an artwork in the context of display is the issue of retention. If it can be said that collections hold artworks that '"deserve[s]"' to be retained (Clifford, 1988 p231) whether displayed or otherwise, then the propaganda poster as an aesthetic object demonstrates a rather paradoxical example. This is not only because its function means it is simply not designed to be preserved, but also because it lends itself to being adapted to suit specific purposes of a given moment, as previously shown. The poster is not intended as an artwork with an 'auric mode of being' that possesses a value representative of it existing as '"one-of-a-kind"' (Benjamin, W., 2008 p11) – a value often decreed by the museums that hold these artworks, with the consequence that they are separated from their own reality once removed from their original context (Hainard and Kaehr in Clifford, 1988 footnote p231). This concept, reflected upon earlier in this text, especially applies to the poster and in particular the poster designed to be of most pertinence within a precisely-defined context, including specific events within a conflict situation such as World War I. Benjamin defines 'aura as a "unique manifestation of a

remoteness, no matter how near it may be"' (2008 endnote p39), whereas a primary function of the propaganda poster is that it is *not* seen as a remote object, as not only is its very accessibility and facility for reproduction at the centre of its success as a medium for pictorially conveying information to the masses, but also the propaganda poster's function is to work collaboratively with other forms of propaganda distribution. These points can also be analogised with the concept of original propagandist doctrine retaining its value despite being reduced to a sound bite, or indeed its visual equivalent in the form of a poster. The propaganda poster as it relates to the temporal emphasis of this text was created to have a short life, pasted onto billboards for quick and easy distribution of the message, constantly replaced not only to keep pace with changing circumstances but also to retain the interest of the amorphous mass. The paper on which the poster was printed was often of inferior quality and easily spoiled, even without taking into account natural wastage through its exposure to the elements once posted. Supplemental to this, and expanding the temporal if not the contextual considerations, historically each regime destroyed the propaganda of the previous; in these circumstances such material can perhaps be considered too dangerous for anyone to keep or, conversely, it may not have been deemed relevant enough to be preserved. If as a consequence poster artwork is construed as being a literal representation of "a moment in time", many examples will have been dismissed before their significance could be understood and consequently archived – as objects in their own right, as opposed to prospectively documented for their role as illustrative symbols of any specific creed.

Bearing this in mind and in addition referring back to ideas examined in the previous section of this chapter, Fry's conjecture that as viewers we tend to allow an aesthetic object of a certain period to encapsulate that whole period, rather than understand that it expresses merely one part (Fry, 1981 p2) is noteworthy. It is not that this element is necessarily lacking in other eras, but that the representation of other ages has been displaced by different indicative objects; Fry employs the phrase 'prevailing mood' to explain what we believe we are experiencing from a specific object signifying a specific era (p2). From the perspective of the poster, this idea is of particular interest: firstly, the propaganda poster, including that constructed for the conveyance of information during times of conflict, plays only a partial role in the concept of propagandist messaging in general, being only part of a much wider campaign. Secondly, the poster is not designed to be enduring, either physically or informatively. Taking the partial role the poster plays coupled with this

impermanence, the poster is an unlikely object to represent an entire era and yet the imagery of those that do remain as documentation of a visual culture are capable of contributing substantially to the summarising of an epoch, particularly within the enclosed parameters of conflict, including World War I. What is intriguing, therefore, is the role the *line of beauty* plays as a visual construct with a genealogy that not only transcends eras but also genres, utilised to demonstrate movement at its most beautiful and which can be manipulated in its application as well as in its perception. This can be demonstrated in its metaphorical portrayal in the sense of the prospective movement from a current to an alternate reality, as previously indicated, as well as eliciting a facade of beauty in the form of an attraction within something prospectively censurable. When Walter Ong writes that after oral genealogy ceases to exist then so does genealogy itself, with textual material remaining until it is systematically, often laboriously, destroyed (1982 p67), he cites the example of a book run that ceases to be printed: allied with this is the idea of hundreds of propaganda posters systematically obliterated by every subsequent regime, as alluded to earlier. Of supplemental value to note, as Ong does, is that whilst 'the genealogies of winners tend to survive (and to be improved), those of losers tend to vanish (or to be recast)' (p67), correlating not only with the continuing utilisation of visual constructs known to be effective in attracting attention from a viewer – a propagandee – but also with the destruction of the materials of the vanquished by the victors. Nevertheless, even taking this into account in relation to the poster as ephemera and regardless of the event and/or era, what can be concluded is that such 'material traces can serve as a reminder of how easily an art form may be manipulated as a political tool' (Shen, 2009 p19), and the contrived utilisation of an aesthetic construct such as the *line of beauty* in the formation of pictorial propaganda as an incitement to the viewer is a perfect example of this.

The "Humble" Medium

Further to the ideas regarding image value and retention is the acknowledgement that advances in technology not only aid in the reproduction of imagery as well as the distribution of the information, it also promotes a means by which the message *and* the medium can be easily archived for the sake of posterity. In an effort to position the poster within the parameters of a discourse on media archaeology, it is relevant to cite, if only as a metaphor, Thomas Elsaesser's observation that 'We care about the indexicality of the photograph because we miss it in the post-photographic pixel' (2004, p92). It is the idea behind this sentiment that holds a clue as to why the propaganda poster still has a place in contemporary society. A

medium as undemanding as the poster perhaps should have been replaced by something purely digital by the twenty-first century and we therefore marvel at the fact that, to all intents and purposes, this has yet to happen. Consequently, although the poster arguably runs the risk of becoming a parody of itself in its attempt to remain as a serious medium through which to distribute information – propagandist or otherwise – it appears to remain capable of rising above this through its continuing ability to secure a productive place within the wider visual ecology. Further to this is the idea that 'Art lives on through its reworking. Technical development – as opposed to mere speculative invention – sets the measure' (Benjamin, A., 2005 p2). In this context the poster has developed into an art form of its own that remains separate to its role as a means of conveying a message, correlating with Walter Benjamin's thoughts cited earlier in this chapter. In addition, Moore reiterates the relevance of the poster in modern society when he observes that 'For a hands-on direct-action community, the humble handmade poster' proffers the same solution it has for over a century (2010 p186). The fact a poster is inexpensive and easy to produce is one aspect to be considered, but the aesthetic skill and experience in the art of visual communication, whether for advertising or propaganda purposes, continues to produce work that utilises every advantage in concisely promoting the message in the most gratifying way possible. Certainly McLuhan writes that

> The effects of technology do not occur at the level of opinions or concepts, but alter sense ratios or patterns of perception steadily and without any resistance. The serious artist is the only person able to encounter technology with impunity, just because he is an expert aware of the changes in sense perception (1964 p18).

In the context of the previous paragraphs the use of the term "technology" undoubtedly brings to mind technological devices including those designed for mass communication as they pertain to contemporary advances, with a specific emphasis on an artist's potential manipulation and utilisation of the technology and the subsequent effects these may then have on the viewer. However, McLuhan's assertions, written as they were in the middle of the last century, can be allied to *all* technological changes reaching back to Gutenberg and beyond, and unquestionably as they lend themselves to the boundaries of this research. When Ellul remarks that excessive information does not inform a propagandee but rather will conversely cause him or her to, in essence, 'drown' (1973 p87), it arguably illustrates another attribute of the poster, in that the information it conveys is condensed, easily digestible – a visual sound bite, as previously described. Consequently this is

another supporting factor for why the poster retains its place as a medium for propaganda distribution despite twenty-first century competition in the form of exponentially-increasing technological modes of mass communication. Reiterating this importance of distribution, it is pertinent to consider Cubitt's conjecture that as an element it is largely ignored in 'information theory' because in this context distribution 'is the channel through which media are delivered' (2005 p197) – and from the perspective of this research that makes the "channel" the poster and the "media" the propagandist message. However, as has already been examined, each is as important as the other as mediums in their own right, despite Cubitt's opinion that only the 'sending and receiving' are relevant: in this example, the propagandist's message and the propagandee's reception of that message (2005, p197), and not the productive medium – the functioning object – through which it is articulated. Baudrillard supports the collective relevance when he talks of a circularity: the medium, the message, the 'sender' and the 'receiver' (1983 endnote p76-77), which not only speaks of a necessity for each of the elements within the distribution, but in addition is further indication of an implied complicity between the propagandist and the propagandee. Once one departs from a literal face-to-face connection then the distributing medium *has* to play a role, even if that role is on a sliding scale of importance dependent on the actual message and how that message is subsequently received and/or perceived. Dewey summarises thus:

> What makes a material a medium is that it is used to express a meaning which is other than that which it is in virtue of its bare physical existence: the meaning not of what it physically is, but of what it expresses (2005 p209).

It is this combination that is of most significance, and enforces the need to take into account the influence each component has on the other, the relationship then formed between them, and the resultant effect this subsequently has – whether considered as propaganda or otherwise – on visual culture.

Taking into account the ideas considered so far in this section of the chapter, and in further contextualising the position of the conflict propaganda poster within a wider examination of the poster as a functional object, it is relevant to recognise that in 2011 the *Occupy* movement, initially inspired by the Arab Spring, was brought to the world's attention through the *What Is Our One Demand?* poster created by *Adbusters* [Fig. 31]. When talking about the poster, Adbusters' Kalle Lasn remarks that '"To me it was a sublime symbol of total clarity. Here's a body poised in this beautiful position and it spoke of this crystal-clear sublime idea behind this messy

business"' (Eifling, 2011 paragraph 5). Despite the conspicuous use of the *line* in the poster's composition and Lasn's associated comments, it is unknown and arguably irrelevant as to whether or not he, *Adbusters*, or any of the other *Occuprint* artists from the *Occupy* movement – of which there are many – are aware of the provenance of such visual constructs, the historic aesthetic thread of the *line of beauty*, Baudrillard's visible continuum. Nevertheless, in this regard it is pertinent to associate the concepts behind twenty-first century poster design with the concerns that faced poster artists preparing propagandist artwork during World War I, and how the

> British love for a story in a picture has accounted for an immense amount of ingenious artistry falling into amorphous ineffectiveness. It is the essence of the poster that it should compel attention; grip by an instantaneous appeal; hit out, as it were, with a straight left. It must convey an idea rather than a story. From its very nature it must be simple, not complex, in its methods (Hardie and Sabin, 1920 p8).

There is undeniably a large amount of truth to this theory, as has been examined throughout this chapter, and yet in order to entice a viewer to accept the idea of an alternate real – an aspiration as pertinent to World War I recruitment drives as it is to the *Occupy* movement – what will cause an individual to 'act is the emotional pressure, the vision of a future, the myth' (Ellul, 1973 p86). This undoubtedly requires some underlying implication of mystery, as previously intimated, in the form of at least the suggestion of a story. Edward Bernays writes that, to be effective, the selected 'themes' must have value as an attraction to the 'motives of the public', as it is these "motives" that activate 'both conscious and subconscious pressures created by the force of desires' (1947 p118). The enticement to strive for a desire is as applicable to a new version of reality as it is to a marketable product and both can be conveyed through pictorial mediums, including the poster. Productive conflict propaganda imagery, therefore, lies in the immediacy of visual constructs to initially attract, combined not only with viewers' recognition of the same in relation to nostalgic ideals pertaining to the past that consequently offer assurance – or reassurance – with regard to what is required of them, but also, under certain circumstances, each viewer's imagination.

Era, Culture, Context

In respect of the above and as previously cited, the presence of a *line of beauty* can represent a unifying link in an image's construction, relevant not only for its value in attraction, but also for its aesthetic legacy, as exemplified in Figures 32 and 33. The

utilisation of recognisable symbols in the promotion of propaganda unsurprisingly incorporates patriotic references, such as nationalistic colours and flags, and this is particularly relevant during times of conflict. This is demonstrated in the 1917 poster at Figure 32 and emphasises the need to 'confer identity on communities within the framework of a secularized sacred' (Schnapp, 2005 p94), reminding the viewer of what he or she is striving for. As already acknowledged, such communities need not constitute a literal gathering of people; a crowd can be a 'mass' of 'organic existence' (Ellul, 1973 p8) – individuals grouped together because they read the same newspapers, for example, or listen to or watch the same broadcasts, forming 'a single being' and therefore 'subjected to the law of the mental unity of crowds' (Le Bon, 2001 p13). Le Bon writes that

> The disappearance of conscious personality and the turning of feelings and thoughts in a definite direction, which are the primary characteristics of a crowd about to become organised, do not always involve the simultaneous presence of a number of individuals on one spot. Thousands of isolated individuals may acquire at certain moments, and under the influence of certain violent emotions – such, for example, as a great national event – the characteristics of a psychological crowd (p13-14).

The formation of "Pals' Battalions" during the First World War is an example of this premise, stirred as they were by the "social influence" of the individuals they found themselves literally or metaphorically connected to – as is the *Occupy* movement, not least because this movement actually consists of a *collection* of groups. So far as *Occupy* is concerned, in its capacity as an organic gathering yet in contrast to the example of Pals' Battalions, the movement cannot be satisfactorily represented by a common construct pertaining to one country's flag or colours. On the contrary: the anti-globalisation movement ironically requires something universal in its design to aid in the promotion of a global message. It is therefore of particular interest to observe the visible continuum of the *line of beauty* that is present not only in the World War I poster previously referred to at Figure 32, but also in Katherine Ball's design for the *Occupy* movement at Figure 33, despite almost a century separating their conception.

This very distinctive, aesthetic legacy can be examined in more detail, as demonstrated in the six posters at Figures 34-39; each image illustrates the serpentine curve as a visual construct, utilised for its role as a complementary element that assists the conveyance of the resultant object's propagandist message

despite the differing eras, cultures and contexts of the respective doctrines. Within these six images the *line of beauty* represents a serpentine coiling of a marching mass [Fig. 34] – one that culminates in movement from right to left, that is to say towards the viewer. In addition is the construct's appearance as a road [Fig. 35], one that sweeps through the countryside and out of the picture, therefore arguably indicative of a directionality leading the viewer's eye and imagination towards a "better" future. These are both concepts examined in the chapters to follow. In contrast, the remaining posters present the rather more insidious: manacles [Figs. 36 and 39], barbed wire [Fig. 37], and "venomous cultural depravity" [Fig. 38], all disguised in a visual construct analysed as more usually being a representation of movement at its most beautiful. What is noteworthy is that the illustration of these particular symbols has been conveyed with "movement" at all, when a certain rigidity might have reinforced the meaning behind them, and yet their serpentining presence within the compositions demonstrates Fry's "balancing of attractions", the unifying elements around which the other visual constructs are aligned.

In light of these illustrative examples and their demonstration of the *line of beauty* as a visual trope with a clear and effective genealogical legacy, and in order to emphasise the points made throughout this chapter, it is relevant to consider E. H. Gombrich's comments regarding the purported 'give and take' that exists between the artist and the viewer in the interpretation of a work (1977 p196). Gombrich explicitly references poster artists as being among those most capable of demonstrating to the viewer the 'processes of interpretation' required, stating that 'if we watch ourselves in our reactions, we are presented with a kind of slow-motion picture of the mechanism that jumps into action whenever we search for the meaning of an image' (p196). This reflects the comments made in the previous chapter regarding resemblances and memory traces, and when these ideas are viewed in a purely propagandist-messaging context the result can be considered as 'a sort of persuasion from within' – 'sociological' propaganda, virtually imperceptible (Ellul, 1973 p64). Although this leads to an intriguing conjecture with regard to propagandist messaging in the form of the visual arts – in that the concept of an artwork in general, and an artwork that contains specific design constructs in particular, forms an example of sociological propaganda when allied with a genealogical thread of a visible continuum such as the *line of beauty* – it can only be concluded that there is no definitive line distinguishing the "sociological" from the "political". Visual propaganda poster art, particularly that which relates directly to conflict, is undeniably political as well as sociological, as aptly illustrated in the

posters at Figures 34-39. Consequently, Ellul's assertion that sociological propaganda is a method propagandists would never purposely use (p64) is a supposition that is naive at best, especially when taking into account the disparate mediums utilised for propagandist distribution. This nonetheless serves to underline the necessity for a *collation* of varying components within that medium, because it is the relationship that then exists between them that has the greatest effect, as this chapter has focussed upon in the context of the *line of beauty* as one such component in the construction of the poster as a functional object. Throughout the following chapters the methods by which this specific design construct is demonstrably utilised as a contributory component is further examined, and therefore the following chapter concentrates on how and why the *line of beauty* is representative of movement in ways that are subsequently distributed via the medium within which the construct is embedded. This is not only from the point of view of a literal manifestation of this movement in the *line*'s role as a visual construct with the ability to attract, but also from the viewpoint that the *line of beauty* possesses metaphorical significance with regard to movement when the pictorial trope is specifically related to conflict propaganda portrayals.

The Static Representation of Movement in Art and War

In the previous chapter the poster is examined in its role as a functional object, a medium through which propagandist messaging including that related to conflict can be distributed and, as noted, the early years of the twentieth century saw the ascendance of the poster as an instrument of the state. Whether consciously contrived or not, the conflict artwork of the era can arguably be considered in the context of a response to these state-controlled propaganda posters. Certainly the ways in which conflict was depicted, notably with regard to the aesthetic output of particular artists involved in the war, were shaped by the influences of the Futurist and Vorticist movements whose literary and aesthetic convictions were rooted in the birth of Modernism. In one Futurist Manifesto, Gino Severini writes:

> Speed had given us a new conception of space and time, and consequently of life itself; and so it is perfectly reasonable for our Futurist works to *characterize* the art of our epoch with the *stylization of movement* which is one of the most immediate manifestations of life (2009 p125, italics in the original).

The effective interpretation of movement into static representation as previously acknowledged depends upon how successful the 'suggestion of movement' is understood by the viewer (Gombrich, 1977 p193). From the specific perspective of attraction to pictorial propaganda, Bergson's comment concerning a sedation of 'our active and resistant powers' that consequently makes us receptive to suggestion (1910 side note p14) is apposite. This observation concurs with Gombrich's point and in addition highlights the effect the propagandist inevitably desires from the propagandee. In this respect, propaganda attempts to 'create conditioned reflexes' within the propagandee in order for certain 'words, signs, or symbols... [to] provoke unfailing reactions' (Ellul, 1973 p31). Movement suggested by a serpentine curve, therefore, when manifested as a visual construct that is then utilised in the creation of artworks, initiates Hogarth's stated 'pleasure of the pursuit' within the viewer, not only on visually encountering the *line* that consequently '*leads the eye a wanton kind of chace*', but also as it pertains to the necessary role the viewer's imagination plays in prolonging that '*chace*' (Hogarth, 1997 p33-34, italics in the original). As already highlighted, it is this combination that causes the viewer to regard the *line* as 'beautiful' (p33) with the consequence that the particular serpentine curve at the centre of this research is known as the *line of beauty*. This *line* is a synchronic object that traverses dimensions as a static representation of movement, and

movement, as previously attested to, relates to propaganda in the concept of mobility between a current version of reality and an alternate, future real. Continuing with the utilisation of this serpentine curve as a visible continuum, this chapter aims to establish how experimentation in the capturing of movement informed Modernist aesthetic expression that subsequently served to impact both literally and figuratively on early twentieth century pictorial conflict propaganda, of which the poster as a medium is an apt example.

'Movement, Life, Struggle, Hope'

Gombrich asserts that 'The illusions of art presuppose recognition' (1977 p221), a concept considered previously in this text and which examines how we not only need to have knowledge of what we are seeing in order to comprehend it, but also an understanding of the process by which we interpret what we are seeing. To demonstrate that 'all recognition of images is connected with projections and visual anticipations', Gombrich uses the example of a viewer who, when confronted by 'a pointing hand or arrow', will 'tend to shift its location somehow in the direction of the movement', for if the viewer does *not* have the propensity 'to see potential movement in the form of anticipation, artists would never have been able to create the suggestion of speed in stationary images' (1977 p191). It is this ability not only for the artist to create effective suggestions of movement but also for the viewer to perceive the same that is of most interest when considered from a specifically propagandist point of view. In employing a pictorial trope such as a *line of beauty* within a constructed image for propaganda purposes, the crucial aspect in the context of this research is that both literal and metaphoric connotations of movement must be perceived by the viewer in his or her role as propagandee, even if not consciously acknowledged, in order for the suggestion of movement to be considered as effective. Consequently, Gombrich's examples of a "pointing hand" or "arrow" can easily be substituted by other symbols: a road depicted in a poster, for example, shaped as a serpentine curve to form a *line of beauty*. This has been explored in imagery referenced earlier in this text, exemplifying both explicit and implicit utilisation of this visual construct, and is further demonstrated in the poster *Fighting for a Better Future* at Figure 40. In referring to this particular poster [Fig. 40] as an example, the viewer recognises this construct as a visible continuum to which he or she is attracted. The viewer optically follows the movement of the curve and imagination then instigates pursuance of the line, out of the picture and beyond – to the future, where the propagandist behind the poster is intimating that "things can only get better". As has been established so far within this text, the design of an

effective conflict propaganda poster should constitute components that include visual constructs known to instigate an appropriate response from the onlooker. Successfully-represented movement within that efficient portrayal of pictorial propagandist messaging is therefore pertinent for both its literal and metaphoric translations – the idea of movement equating to change in the context previously cited, demonstrating propaganda's intention to address the perceived immutability of the present reality with the purpose of motivating the masses into attaining a universal real. However, when Eisenstein declares that 'form' can sometimes be 'more revolutionary than the content' (2010 p59), it again emphasises the analysis made in the previous chapter, that how something is constructed and/or presented should matter at least as much as what it is attempting to say.

With the focus on the concept of a visual construct as an example of Baudrillard's visible continuum, and in an echo of Hogarth's already-cited observations, it is relevant to reference Futurist founder F. T. Marinetti, who writes that 'In an s-shaped curve with double bends, velocity achieves its absolute beauty' (2009c p228). Marinetti clarifies this point with the conclusion that 'Speed in a straight line is massive, crude, unthinking. Speed with and after a curve is velocity that has become agile, acquired consciousness' (p228). The Futurist movement aspired to recreate a visual expression of consciousness through the representation of movement and speed, and consequently it is unsurprising that artists believe 'the curve will suggest the movement of lines more convincingly than the straight projection', despite the curve being 'a compromise that does not represent one aspect but many' (Gombrich, 1977 p217). As previously acknowledged, the importance lies in not only how specific elements of imagery can be interpreted, such as a straight line or a curve depicting movement, but also how that imagery is interpreted by the viewer in general, and the reaction it necessarily instigates. This is particularly imperative to the pictorial conflict propagandist, as well as to the propagandee to whom the imagery is directed, when a representation is multifarious, for example when it is indicative of metaphoric as well as literal movement as is the potential of the construct that is the *line of beauty*.

Pioneering chronophotographic experimentation conducted simultaneously in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries by Etienne-Jules Marey and Eadweard Muybridge proved influential to the aesthetic suggestion of movement and speed, consequently instigating artistic interest because of its effect on the recording of *accurate* movement, as illustrated in Muybridge's *Florence A., Running* at Figure 41.

This capturing of what had previously been “unseeable” effected how movement was subsequently portrayed in two-dimensional imagery. Certainly with regard to conflict art it has been suggested that in the late nineteenth century battles could not be successfully visually portrayed without a moving horse, and so Marey’s and Muybridge’s findings confirming the actual movement of a horse’s legs whilst cantering proved to be ground-breaking (Dagognet, 1992 p138-140). When these innovative concepts are allied to Marinetti’s belief that Futurism demonstrates ‘a rejection of the past’ as much ‘as an idolatrous concern with the portents of the future’ (Humphreys, 1999 p9-10), asserting that one should put ‘trust in Progress, which is always right even when it is wrong, because it is movement, life, struggle, hope’ (Marinetti, 1972 p82), it culminates physically in artwork that includes Boccioni’s *Lancer’s Charge* [Fig. 42]. Boccioni’s depiction of French mounted soldiers attacking a German-held trench during World War I (Humphreys, 1999, p69) is photodynamically-influenced Futurist imagery that references advances made in the ability to portray a more exact representation of movement with its inclusion of the replication of a motif that is chronophotographically inspired. The overlapping imagery of the horse and rider also conveys serpentine curvature: overtly, abstractly, as well as implied. In addition, Boccioni’s mixed media artwork encapsulates the mechanomorphic and effectively parallels Paul Virilio’s concept of the man-soldier who inevitably becomes indistinct from the mechanistic aspect of warfare, assimilating into that of the ‘surgical prosthesis’ (1986 p61) in order to become the machine required for battle. This can be associated with observations made by Tim Armstrong, who references Virilio when he discusses conflict, man, and the machine and who, significantly in the context of this research, considers the First World War as a prosthetic, ‘in the sense of attempting to radically extend human capabilities, whether in terms of perception... or performance’ (1998 p95). The relevance of this line of thinking as it pertains to the parameters of this text lies in the correlation of Armstrong’s ideas with the Futurists’ vision of war as an aesthetic concept, underscored in an extraction from a Marinetti manifesto cited by Walter Benjamin, and which considers that

> “... War is beautiful because it ushers in the dreamt-of metallization of the human body. ... War is beautiful because it creates fresh architectures such as those of the large tank, geometrical flying formations, spirals of smoke rising from burning villages, and much else besides... Writers and artists of Futurism... remember these principles of an aesthetic war in order that your struggles to find a

> new kind of poetry and a new kind of sculpture... may be illuminated thereby!" (Benjamin, W., 2008 p36-37).

Aestheticising war carries with it a connotation that can unarguably be considered as distasteful when described in ways similar to Marinetti's chosen articulation, yet as a concept it is nonetheless pivotal in this research because the central premise of this study focuses on conflict propaganda art as a genre within the field of visual culture. In this respect the so-called "aesthetics of war" is not only a necessary aspect of the soldier-artists' response as emphasised by Marinetti, but also an undeniable propagandist objective in times of conflict because of a requirement to attract the propagandee, particularly via a ubiquitous medium of distribution in the form of the poster. Furthermore, Marinetti's treatise emphasises the incongruities that arise from the attempt to extract something "beautiful" from that which is overwhelmingly otherwise, an area more fully considered in the next section of this chapter. Marey's research imagery *Flexioned March* [Fig. 43] similarly correlates with the ideas of a so-called prosthetic "metallisation of the body", in the form of soldiers in movement as 'mere cogs in the mechanism' (Nevinson, 1937 p87). In this context the machinic repetition of marching men is repeated in both conflict propaganda poster art, and propagandist/counter-propagandist conflict artwork emanating from World War I, as illustrated in Figures 44 and 45.

All three images [Figs. 43-45] pictorially express Gilles Deleuze's and Félix Guattari's comment that 'Everywhere, the war machine displays a curious process of arithmetic replication or doubling' (1988 p391), feeding into the idea of one man representing the many visually recorded in Marey's *Flexioned March* [Fig. 43], and subsequently informing recruitment posters including *Step Into Your Place* [Fig. 44]. Similarly this machinic replication influences the inevitable aesthetic response by artists including C. R. W. Nevinson, as illustrated at Figure 45, whose personal wartime experience serves to highlight a very particular version of a real that manages to simultaneously support the scientific observations of Marey, as well as the propagandist concept of the pictorially-depicted recruitment drive. With specific reference to *Step Into Your Place*, because of the viewer's intuitive *and* overt recognition of the serpentine curve the image is able to intimate a visual ellipsis, with the consequence that the second half of the curvature as it relates to the line of soldiers can be implied, as has been examined in imagery already illustrated so far in this text. The viewer's recognition of and response to a visual ellipsis is a psychological tool usefully exploitable by the propagandist – in the same way that Ellul describes particular words, signs and symbols as being capable of prompting

dependable responses – because of how the continuation of the curve in forming a serpentine line becomes a visual trope representative of both literal and metaphorical movement.

Frenzied Force

Virilio argues that Futurism derives from one 'single art – that of war and its essence, speed' (1986 p62), succinctly summarising with the phrase 'The violence of speed' (p151) to clarify his point whilst at the same time highlighting the recorded beliefs of the Futurist movement. Consequently it is relevant at this stage to correlate Virilio's views with Deleuze's and Guattari's assertion that members of an artistic movement 'can make war only on the condition that they simultaneously create something else' (1988 p423). In this respect and in addition to his manifesto reflected upon in the last section of this chapter, Marinetti writes that he 'extract[ed] the first three Futurist dances from the three mechanisms of war: shrapnel, the machine gun, and the airplane' (2009b p237). Marinetti combines all elements of Futurist fixations, as previously alluded to, and in addition conceivably attempts to illustrate something aesthetically beautiful within the horror of war, whether for personal, propaganda or, conversely, counter-propaganda purposes. Even more pertinent is the association between Deleuze's and Guattari's remarks and Vorticist sculptor Henri Gaudier-Brzeska's expressed personal philosophy with regard to his intention to draw his 'emotions solely from the arrangement of surfaces'; Gaudier emphasises that these sensations will be expounded 'by the arrangement of my surfaces, the planes and lines by which they are defined' (1981 p34). Serving in the trenches of World War I and inspired by the shape of a Mauser rifle, Gaudier decided to counter the 'brutality' of it by carving a sculpture of his own design; his aim was to instigate a more preferable emotional response, 'BUT I WILL EMPHASIZE that MY DESIGN got its effect (just as the gun had) FROM A VERY SIMPLE COMPOSITION OF LINES AND PLANES' (p34, emphasis in the original). A visible continuum such as the *line of beauty* can play an imperative role as a visual construct in pictorial conflict propaganda, not only in its simplicity as a "line" that forms a serpentine curve, but also as a "something beautiful" utilised for its ability to attract within something potentially iniquitous. Its application can be equally as effective in conflict counter-propagandist responses as it is in the propagandist's articulation through pictorial media that includes the functional object of the poster.

Following on, and with regard to a line – a serpentine curve – representing movement, it is of relevance to note that Futurists' discussions recognise the importance of 'lines and planes' and in so doing express their belief that lines referred to as 'trepidating' articulate the impression of 'chaotic excitement' (Boccioni et al, 2009c p49). The Futurists employ the phrase '*force-lines*' to convey emotion and movement (p48, italics in the original) and these combined concepts of an internal, frenzied force are an apt summary for the interiorly-held emotional turmoil experienced by Gaudier and other artists involved in warfare. In addition there exists an especial relevance when considering Virilio's use of the phrase 'line of force' as a description of visual perception (1989 p3), as this undoubtedly assists in informing artists' counter-propaganda responses: metaphorical as well as literal representations of the *line of beauty*. The conclusion drawn is that the interiorly-held metaphoric interpretations can be articulated through the literally-drawn, and thus a logical step for artists to attempt pictorial replication of the internal as well as external forces that consume them, utilising visual constructs that suggest motion in order to achieve this. Deleuze's and Guattari's observations that 'the war machine... [sometimes] has as its object not war but the drawing of a creative line of flight...', and that 'an "ideological", scientific or artistic movement can be a potential war machine' (1988 p422), highlight the collective aesthetic aspirations of the Vorticists and, particularly, the Futurists. These assertions aptly describe the motivation behind the artists' speed- and movement-inspired literature and artistic compositions and how they feed into artwork that emerged from the trenches of World War I. Furthermore, this exemplifies how influential an art movement can be on the visual culture of its own as well as future eras. In corroboration of these ideas it is relevant to note Paul Gough's comment that Lewis

> was not overly concerned with literal representation; the figure was a metaphor for far more wide-reaching notions about the human condition, their individual likenesses subservient to a broader set of ideas about the relationship of man to the machine (Gough, 2010 p237).

Lewis' alleged conjecture is echoed in the concept of the subsumption of the soldier into the machinery he necessarily depends upon to the point of it becoming a prosthesis, and the link between these observations and the distribution of conflict propagandist messaging is reinforced in the assertion that

> The purpose of propaganda is to place the act of violence within a moral universe by identifying the enemy as something that lies on the boundaries between the inhuman and the human, as something

> without a “soul,” and thus the proper object of hostility (Leed, 1979 p105).

This statement serves to emphasise the “man-in-the-machine” aspect, not only in the context of the soldiers’ requirement to become part of that machine for the benefit of its continuance in times of conflict, but also from the point of view of identifying the enemy as being similarly constructed – automatons, so to speak. Of interest in this regard is the suggestion of a circular cause and consequence, in that one side is effectively ignoring this perceived condition in themselves whilst at the same time requiring it from the other, with the result that the soldiers of both sides can disregard the requisite for any level of empathetic involvement. More importantly is how this can all be analogised and applied to the specific context of visual propaganda distribution, with the two “sides” now designated plainly as propagandists and propagandees. The emphasis is again on machinic replication, movement and speed that can all be interpreted pictorially and, for the purposes of this research, utilising the visual construct of the *line of beauty*. The ultimate objective is for the resultant propaganda artwork to be effective in its ability to “suggest” the same to the viewer, and from the propagandist’s perspective the aim is for this to be achieved both literally *and* figuratively because of how movement relates to the propagandist objective of change, that is to say, the mobility from one interpretation of a real to another. The concept of circular cause and effect is therefore replicated in the aesthetic interpretations of conflict propaganda posters and soldier-artists’ responses, and this is further examined in the next chapter.

Dynamism

Immediately before the outbreak of World War I the Futurists and Vorticists concentrated on discarding the conventions of the past, the overt classical influences that had dominated artwork for centuries, in order to embrace not only speed and movement but also technology and the mechanistic, and in this respect the influence of the first “modern” war upon these artists’ work is unsurprising. Arguably less predictable is how additionally motivated they were by contemporary trends, including those relating to dance as previously referenced and it is an intriguing conjecture that such a sinuous art as dance cannot only inspire, but also be so central to, such mechanistic bodies of work. However, the Futurists’ and Vorticists’ fascination with this particular art form stems simply from the fluidity of movement required in the execution of its performance, and it was this medium of expression ‘more than any other, that fired rebel artists in their search for the perfect equation between form and content’ (Cork, 1976b p392). As Hogarth maintains, the

best ways to pictorially express motion is by the depiction of 'fire' (1997 p3) and 'dance' (p110), and Hogarth's *Preface* to *The Analysis of Beauty* quotes Charles Alphonse Dufresnoy's description of '"serpent-like and flaming form"' (p3), the serpent-like curve consequently pertaining to the *line of beauty*, and represented through dance in imagery illustrated thus far in this research at Figures 5 and 31. When this is allied with the concept that 'every perception presupposes movements and representations are the remnants of past perceptions' (Ribot, 1906, p4), the attraction is further clarified: for the Futurist and Vorticist artists dance represented movement, and the ability to depict movement – and to have the viewer perceive it as movement – was the driving force behind what they wanted to accomplish through their work.

What is especially interesting when analysing these assertions is the observation that when artists employed chronophotographic snapshots of movements, transcribing them in a *literal* fashion, it ironically 'lent a static quality to dynamic scenes which robbed the picture of its meaning by inadvertently stripping it of all emotion' (Adam, 2010 p18). The ability to represent movement in such a way that it invokes an emotional as well as an arguably intellectual response within the viewer is undoubtedly the objective of both artist and propagandist and, as Hogarth observes, requires not only visual perception but also imagination on the part of both artist and viewer. Gombrich, echoing Hogarth, writes that an artist's role is

> to compensate for the absence of movement in his work by clarifying his image and thus conveying not only visual sensations but also those memories of touch which enable us to reconstitute the three-dimensional form in our minds (1977 p13-14).

This is a theory as applicable to the conflict propaganda poster artist as it is to any other artist, considering the specific emphasis required in suggesting successfully movement that is both literal and metaphoric. Consequently, when these ideas are examined in the context of Hans Christian Adam's comment cited earlier it provokes the question as to what is the most productive way in which to capture the emotion without losing naturalistic positioning that makes an image an authentic encapsulation of movement, underscoring a concept as relevant to the metaphoric distinction of conflict propagandist messaging as it is to the literal pictorial depiction. Further to this, it is Gombrich who discusses the work on the Renaissance undertaken by German art historian and cultural theorist Aby Warburg (1866-1929) and the observation that the influence of classical sculpture on Renaissance painting was linked to a requirement to represent 'a particularly expressive image of

movement or gesture' (1977 p20). As already acknowledged, Lomazzo in the sixteenth century, Hogarth in the eighteenth and Marinetti in the twentieth, all stress the necessity of employing curvature in order to represent movement at its most beautiful, clarifying the notion that traditional ideas influenced, whether knowingly or unknowingly, artists that followed. This not only reiterates the genealogical heritage of the serpentine curve subsequently recognised as the *line of beauty*, but also emphasises the relevance of plundering a visual storehouse for constructs that are known to be of value in instigating the required response from the viewer when utilised in the construction of an artwork, propagandist or otherwise. Baudrillard maintains 'Our entire linear and accumulative culture would collapse if we could not stockpile the past in plain view' (1983 p19), an interesting perspective on the idea of historically emphasising an ideal form as an absolute, the genealogical threading-through of an arguably more ambiguous interpretation, then a circling back to the absolute in the form of a manipulatable universal encapsulation such as "good" or "evil". In addition the past is utilised as an exploitable tool to remind us of the reasons why we choose to fight for a particular version of a *future* real and the *line of beauty* as a visual trope is one that survives transfer, ultimately operating as shorthand for the pictorial representation of movement as it relates to both literal and metaphorical means.

To this end it is noteworthy to reflect on Futurist Anton Giulio Bragaglia's comment that in representing movement the intention is to obtain a continuous and infinite 'sinusoidal curve' (2009 p41), a smooth, repetitive oscillation that has as much correlation with the serpentine curve that Hogarth named the *line of beauty* as it does with a "smooth, repetitive" conveyance of propagandist messaging, particularly that which is concisely constructed and distributed through the medium of the poster. Bragaglia believes that in the same way anatomical study enhances the skills of an artist, the information that derives from the imagery of figures being modified whilst in motion proves crucial to the pictorial depiction of movement. Bragaglia's argument is that the knowledge of even the tiniest detail required for accurate portrayal can only be clarified by the scientific characteristics of photodynamism (2009 p41) – illustrated in his photograph *Searching and Slap* at Figure 46 – consequently disregarding the influence of chronophotography. Bragaglia's belief that photography, as opposed to painting, asserts itself as being considerably more progressive and more sympathetic towards 'the evolution of life' than any other form of pictorial depiction (2009 p45), somewhat contradicts his contention that Futurists' intentions with regard to photographic processes should lie

solely in the application of photodynamism. Photography and all its related fields was a new, burgeoning technology and consequently more akin to the Modernists' way of thinking than traditional painting; photography, especially in relation to its role as conflict reportage as a contextual consideration appropriate to this research, will be the subject of further examination later in this text. However, the point of photographic techniques so far as the Futurists are concerned stem from the utilisation of what they learned from photographic processes in the artwork they went on to create, arguably employing the *accuracy* of movement from chronophotography, and the *emotion* of movement from photodynamism. It is relevant to note, when challenging a criticism of the Futurists – particularly with regard to painting – that in reality not everything 'rushes around at speed', Boccioni's defence that

> it is the conception which dominates the visual, which perceives only fragmentarily, and therefore subdivides. Hence Dynamism is a general law of simultaneity and interpenetration dominating everything, in movement, that is appearance/exception/shading (2009c p94).

Boccioni's declaration emphasises the quest to capture the "unseeable" *because* of its very omnipresence, and consequently parallels the all-pervading objectives of conflict propagandist messaging. As examined in the previous chapter, the conveyance of visual propaganda via distribution in the form of a poster campaign aids in this objective because of the ubiquity of this specific medium. In addition the ambition arguably transcends the merely aesthetic and therefore what is apposite with regard to Futurist Giacomo Balla in particular is that his abstract artwork was considered "research" (Fagiolo, 1987 p64). Consequently, and similar to Marey's and Muybridge's work, Balla's complex collection of studies leading up to the eventual paintings demonstrate that his way of working was based not only in the artistic but also in science and mathematics (p64) – the *technology* of representing movement two- as well as three-dimensionally. Balla developed what he referred to as his '"Line of Speed"', a line which was 'schematic and abstract' (Fagiolo, 1987 p26) and which Maurizio Fagiolo describes as being both 'scientific' and 'poetical' (p86). This latter adjective can be considered as arguably correlating more successfully with Bragaglia's resolute affirmation that the Futurists were uninterested in the concept of an exact representation of movement; their concern lay much more forcefully 'in the area of movement which produces sensation, the memory of which still palpitates in our awareness' (2009 p38), an objective that once more echoes those sentiments desired by the propagandist.

In allying the points above with previous comments concerning a viewer's perception of an artwork, it is relevant to consider McLuhan's suggestion that how a viewer interprets visual constructs within an image in particular, and the entire image in general, is related to whether or not the viewer is literate or illiterate (1962 p37). Certainly Arnheim maintains that the habit of reading an image from left to right, as occurs in western society at least, simply stems from the way in which that society reads books (1956 p19). As a genealogical link, this concept is not only further upheld but also expanded upon by the observation that Hogarth's prints are not merely '*looked* at' but "read" (Herdan and Herdan, 1966 px, italics in the original); Uglow concurs, remarking that 'Westerners allegedly read pictures rather like print, their eyes running across the image from the left (but starting at the bottom, not the top of a "page"), then circling up into the centre and then "out" at the right' (2002 pxv-xvi). In addition to its contribution to the considerations regarding a viewer's cognitive process in his or her evaluation of an image, at least as it subscribes to the parameters of this text, what is especially noteworthy is that Uglow's description suggests a "shape" formed by the movement of the eyes which traces a *line of beauty*. It is therefore particularly significant to note Fagiolo's concurrence of these collective conclusions as they associate with his observation regarding Giacomo Balla's paintings of velocity: Balla depicts his vehicles as travelling from right to left, as demonstrated in *Velocità Astratta (è Passata L'Automobile)* [Fig. 47]. Supplemental to the clear influence of chronophotography as well as photodynamism, and the inclusion of curvature in an attempt to replicate movement and speed albeit statically, Balla's compositional consideration in relation to this directional positioning 'makes the impact between the subject represented and the spectator's eye more dynamic' (Fagiolo, 1987, p76). This correlates with compositional considerations of the propaganda posters illustrated at Figures 2 and 34, and the theory is further analysed and compounded later in this chapter.

Iniquity and Elegance

The relevance of examining the various themes so far considered in this chapter is supported by the role each plays as links in the genealogical chain, and the consequent demonstration of how one "link" greatly influences another. Chronophotographic and photodynamic experimentation in the capturing of movement subsequently translated for pictorial conveyance informed Futurist and Vorticist artwork, and it was these artists and their fascination with technology, movement and speed who found themselves subsumed into the conflict of the First World War. The same influences, not least because of temporal factors, effected

the rise and subsequent construction of conflict propaganda posters from which evolves the circular cause and consequence concerning this body of artwork within the field of visual culture and the aesthetic, arguably counter-propaganda responses from soldier-artists. Threading through the links of this genealogical chain is the visible continuum of the *line of beauty*, and this remains the catalyst at the centre of this research to which the other thematic threads are firmly connected. To this end it is of note to acknowledge how the exploration of successful static representation of movement and speed continued, not only across the decades but also genres, and Boccioni comments that 'modernity is using – in advertisements, newspapers, sketches and caricatures – a new kind of basic dynamic norm which corresponds more to the truth' (2009d p153). Marta Braun concurs when she cites Marey's work as a continuing influence on the visual arts in ways contrary to his initial, solely-scientific intentions, noting how his chronophotographic imagery is ever-present: 'In advertising, videos, illustration, cartoons, and caricatures, Marey's repeated overlapping forms remain the single most important means of representing time, speed, and motion' (1994 p316). Braun's observation, illustrated in Figures 48 and 49, inevitably includes conflict propagandist imagery, as demonstrated in Figures 50 and 51. Both conflict propaganda posters [Figs. 50 and 51] are examples of pictorial representation of machinic replication of the man-soldier, with the Jaume Solá Spanish Civil War poster at Figure 51 in particular additionally indicative of an Abstraction-influenced articulation of the *line of beauty*. This albeit unintentional influence of both Marey's and Muybridge's research continues to inform art and design in the form of machinic replication, as indicated above, in a way that parallels the visible continuum of the *line of beauty*, functioning as a pictorial trope that is reaped then repeated across the genres within the field of visual culture. What is noteworthy with regard to these observations, however, as commented upon earlier, is that Boccioni's Futurists wanted to separate themselves from chronophotographic experimentation and, so it would seem, with the exception of photodynamism from photographic processes in general; Bragaglia says:

> We despise the precise, mechanical, glacial reproduction of reality, and take the utmost care to avoid it. For us this is a harmful and negative element, whereas for cinematography and chronophotography it is the very essence. They in their turn overlook the trajectory, which for us is the essential value (2009 p39).

The emphasis on "trajectory" is a key point in equating how movement conveyed in this way relates directly to the movement of propaganda. In addition to an aesthetic legacy of inspiration borne from the experimentation referred to in this chapter that is

affiliated with a general attraction in representing movement and speed, there is also a continuing association with the depiction of motion in the form of dance as a *specific* representation of movement. In this respect, dance as an expression of movement is conveyed not only in its original, literal form, but also statically as two-dimensional or three-dimensional imagery. As an example of the former, Modernist dancer Loie Fuller [Fig. 52] deliberately concealed her body under a shroud of many metres of fabric (Garelick, 2007 p140). It was Fuller's extensive movements beneath that transformed the whole into 'balletic' serpentine contours that helped shape a career which was 'a monument to the technologised body' (p140); Rhonda K. Garelick emphasises Fuller's predilection for the mechanistic in her performances over any idea of 'naturalness' (p157), a particular aspect of machinic representation examined more fully later in this chapter.

Dance as a representation of movement depicted in the form of Gaudier's sculpture *Red Stone Dancer* [Fig. 53] encapsulates the artist's recorded thoughts on lines, planes and emotions, whilst the genealogical legacy of the concept is given further credence in the photograph *Famous Leap by Peggy St Lo* [Fig. 54], and via the Ludwig Hohlwein poster *Reichs Sports Day for the League of German Maidens* from 1934 [Fig. 55]. The reference in these artworks not only to movement in general and movement in the form of dance in particular, but also to the serpentine curve – the *line of beauty* – as a way of articulating this, is explicit. Furthermore, with specific regard to *Famous Leap by Peggy St Lo*, this concept is supplementally supported by the original accompanying caption, albeit uncredited, to the effect that the image is '"considered by experts to be one of the most beautiful photographs ever taken"' (Armstrong, 1998 p111-112). Exactly who these "experts" are and in what field their so-called expertise lies is unknown and yet the very wording is arguably indicative of at least a perception of the *line of beauty*, paralleling the previously-cited response Hogarth received from artists – that they conceded to an awareness of the "line" but were unable to vocalise where, why, or how. These observations serve to further support this particular visual construct as a visible continuum with an aesthetic legacy that warrants the examination being undertaken here. Of continuing interest is the way in which this aesthetic genealogical thread winds its way into the twenty-first century, linking the imagery referenced above with that created by the *Occuprint* artists, including the *What Is Our One Demand?* poster referenced at Figure 31, as well as in the Camila Schindler de Souza response illustrated at Figure 56. However, unlike the *Occupy* ballerinas, the photograph of Peggy St Lo, and Hohlwein's German maiden, it is not Fuller's body

that forms the serpentine curvature, but the carefully contrived result of the way she manipulates her rods and fabrics and choreographs her movements. The rods and fabric are employed as prosthetics, allowing her to extend herself into a mechanistic form through which the desired effect of specific shapes in motion can be achieved. Fuller's physical actions are designed *solely* for the optimisation of the fabric's movement in order to create the necessary shapes in her 'serpentine' dances (Garelick, 2007 p33). Movement, repetition and machinic replication: not only do these concepts allude to the technological processes behind the reproduction of the poster as a medium of swift and efficient information-distribution particularly during times of conflict, they also convey a more basic and blatant assessment of the apparatus of war. Fuller's "machinery", rather than indicating the mechanisms of a battlefield, contrarily manufactures instead beautiful forms pertaining to a Futurist dynamism that inevitably still shapes "Lines of Beauty", and in so doing calls to mind Armstrong's previously-cited assertions regarding the prosthetic as a radical extension of human perception and performance. The circular cause and effect this inevitably provokes incorporates the iniquity of the battlefield with the elegance of movement, particularly in the shape of a serpentine curve, and in addition reiterates the concept that 'Beauty must be veiled because nothing unveiled is quite beautiful' (Durham Peters, 1997 p13). The beauty of, and attraction to, the *line* is heightened when it is submerged to some degree, arguably enhancing its value with regard to its function as a visual construct utilised, whether knowingly or unknowingly, as an aesthetic enticement. Consequently, when these concepts are converted into concise, two-dimensional representations – as appositely illustrated in Figure 57 – they demonstrate interpretations which can be productively employed within the construction of the conflict propaganda poster, as has been examined throughout this text. These particular articulations of the *line of beauty* evident in *La Loie Fuller* [Fig. 57] emphasise the construct as being not only literally-drawn serpentine curves, but also as "waving surfaces", and this latter manifestation is especially evident in examples previously illustrated at Figures 19 and 20, as well as in the more compositionally-comparable at Figure 26.

A Frozen Moment

The importance of a functioning "suggestion" of movement, as declared by Hogarth, Gombrich and others already cited, can be analysed from an alternative viewpoint; Boccioni et al write that

> Indeed, all things move, all things run, all things are rapidly changing. A profile is never motionless before our eyes, but it constantly

> appears and disappears. On account of the persistency of an image upon the retina, moving objects constantly multiply themselves; their form changes like rapid vibrations, in their mad career. Thus a running horse has not four legs, but twenty, and their movements are triangular (2009b p27-28).

This is aptly demonstrated in the Muybridge recorded experiment *Florence A., Running* at Figure 41. As commented upon earlier, these experiments changed the perception of how a horse in battle could be depicted pictorially, with artists exploiting the findings in their work because, as Boccioni explains,

> a horse in movement is not a motionless horse which is moving, but a horse in movement, which makes it another sort of thing altogether, and it should be conceived and expressed as something simply varied (2009d p152).

This is an argument supported by Jacques-Henri Lartigue's photograph, *Bichonnade Leaping* [Fig. 58]. Although the image is clearly of someone who is "leaping" from the steps, the visual effect demonstrates instead a woman merely suspended in mid-air and not a woman "in movement" which, as Boccioni emphasises, should be the primary objective in capturing motion. The effective "suggestion" of movement in the photograph of Peggy St. Lo [Fig. 54], as well as via the figures in the Hohlwein and de Paleologue posters at Figures 55 and 57 in particular, clearly emphasise the contrast. Boccioni's conjecture that 'It is a matter of conceiving the object in movement quite apart from the motion which it contains within itself' (2009d p152) suggests a potential pictorial outcome that is three-fold: the capture of an object in movement; the recording of that captured movement for scientific analysis; the representation of captured movement for purely aesthetic value, and all have an impact on the effective conveyance of pictorial messaging for propaganda purposes. Barthes reiterates these points when he remarks that 'What the Photograph reproduces to infinity has occurred only once: the Photograph mechanically repeats what could never be repeated existentially' (1993, p4), a comment that brings to mind the outcome of chronophotographic experimentation as literal representations, as well as acknowledgement of the technological seizing of the "unseeable" as occurs with photodynamism. Barthes continues with the observation that not only is the photograph 'a motionless image', in an echo of Boccioni's declaration, but the subject matter is 'anesthetized and fastened down' and it is the "*punctum*" that causes the subject matter to be reactivated (p57). Although the idea of an image that is "fastened down" is an apposite description of what results from the chronophotographic process, a *punctum* that causes a "reactivation" expresses an

arguably more emotional aspect that can be considered as being more applicable to photodynamically-captured imagery. This is especially relevant when considered in the context of Barthes' belief that, in the case of the photograph and dependent on the particular *punctum*, this results in either a bringing back to life or the endowment of a new life (p57). These ideas reiterate Dewey's and Mitchell's comments cited previously and are therefore contributory in support of the idea that careful composition and construction must go into the suggestion of movement in an artwork, including the pictorial propaganda poster, in order for it to instigate the appropriate response from the viewer and consequently be considered as effective representation. A direct correlation to the Futurists' assertions is François Dagognet's suggestion that Marey's objective for his chronophotographic experimentation was to capture life's most distinctive quality – its ceaseless motion – and to seek 'its "signature," so that it would surrender its rhythms and variations in the form of graphic lines' (1992 p16). This underscores Hogarth's own observations regarding the particular serpentine curve he observed and its position within the genealogical chain that caused him to analyse the concept surrounding it and, pertinently, to name it. Chronophotography arrests that which is fleeting and attempts to translate it into a viable, enduring, visual account; Marey's chronophotographically-captured insect wings [Fig. 59], for example, demonstrate serpentine curvature – "lines of beauty" that supplementally assist in illustrating Hogarth's insistence that his aesthetic theories are supported by what can be found in nature (1997 p46).

Nevertheless, it is 'paradoxical' that only after movement has been eradicated from a photograph can a number of images be specifically linked together to demonstrate the 'optical impression' of motion (Adam, 2010, p12). Adam explains that

> Because our eyes are slow to react, a light stimulus reaching the retina has a continuing effect. Only after about 0.05 of a second has it faded sufficiently for a new image to take its place. This is no disadvantage, because without this sluggishness, there could be no cinema or television: a frequency of 25 images per second is perceived by the human eye as continuous movement (p12).

In respect of photodynamism, however, Bragaglia's assertion concerning the capturing of the emotional aspect of movement rather than the scientific literal, recalls artists' reflections considered earlier in this chapter and is undoubtedly more consistent with the desired response required by the propagandist from the propagandee. Bragaglia remarks that it was a deliberate move to separate

photodynamic work from ‘reality’ because ‘cinematography, photography and chronophotography already exist to deal with mechanically precise and cold reproduction’ (2009 p43-44) – a “reproduction” suited to war reportage, a subject as it pertains specifically to the defined parameters of this research considered later in this text. Bragaglia believes Marey’s work to be a form of cinematography in that it ‘shatters the action’, with the consequence that it cannot be considered as an *analysis* of movement (2009 p39). He remarks that chronophotography does not succeed in reconstructing motion, or even to suggest the sensation of it, and writes that the system Marey employs

> seizes and freezes the action in its principal stages, those which best serve its purpose. It thus describes a theory that could be equally deduced from a series of instantaneous photographs (p40).

This is a sound observation and highlights the fact Marey was investigating movement for reasons other than aesthetic value, despite the unintentional influence his research was to have on visual culture across the years and genres. More importantly it reinforces the requirement for a careful construction of an image that aims to demonstrate a viable suggestion of movement. It is therefore significant to recall Bragaglia’s statement that

> The greater the speed of an action, the less intense and broad will be its trace when registered with Photodynamism. It follows that the slower it moves, the less it will be dematerialised and distorted. The more the image is distorted, the less real it will be. It will be more ideal and lyrical, further extracted from its personality and closer to type, with the same evolutionary effect of distortion as was followed by the Greeks in their search for their type of beauty (2009 p40).

In remaining conscious of previously-noted reflections regarding an ancient concept of “beauty”, of significance within these comments is the paralleling of the suggestion of movement with the idea of competing constructions of reality and the continuing reiteration this gives rise to regarding association between the literal and the metaphoric when considering conflict propaganda in a pictorial manifestation, including via the medium of the poster. Added to this is the correlation with the desire of expression in as “beautiful” a way as possible, leading back to the beneficial incorporation of a visible continuum representative of movement in the form of a *line of beauty*.

The Emotion of Motion

At least one of the differences between photodynamism and chronophotography, as Bragaglia arguably perceived it, lies in how Marey's and Muybridge's work demonstrates literal aspects of movement in still imagery that could then be utilised, artistically, in portraying anatomically-correctly how humans and animals are positioned mid-movement, for example, a cantering horse. The Futurists' objective focused much more on displaying an aesthetic representation of movement that captured the feeling, the mood, the *emotion* of motion: photodynamism portrays movement as we perceive it should be, not necessarily how it actually is, as demonstrated in Bragaglia's *Change of Position* [Fig. 60]. It is this "emotion of motion" which is arguably of most use to the propagandist than literal depiction, the 'attempt to make every aspect of life vibrate towards what... [is] hoped and believed [to] ...be a better future' (Balla, A., 1987 p8). Nevertheless, analysed in this particular context, photodynamism is the more "correct" form of representation; Bragaglia's phrase 'the dynamic representation of reality' (2009 p42) speaks of a reality in the sense of how an image is perceived, not necessarily reality in the sense of what actually happens, as alluded to above. This parallels how propaganda, in a construction of a real, postulates a distorted concept of an alternate reality and speaks to the status of a specified regime of the real: an "actual" real at a specific moment that needs to be substituted by an alternative, "true" real. It is interesting to consider the dichotomy, therefore, that since it is the technique of *photo*-dynamism that is under examination, the imagery is indisputably realistic: it is recording *exactly* what is happening – in the same way chronophotography records what is in front of the camera's lens at each activation of the shutter – just not in the context of a focussed scientific study of how the action manifests itself step-by-step. Certainly when photodynamism received criticism that it renders images too complex to discern, Bragaglia defended the process by asserting that 'it is desirable and correct to record the images in a distorted state, since images themselves are inevitably transformed in movement' (2009 p43). Photodynamism does not record movement in a way that allows that movement to be easily analysed: on the contrary – it is arguably impossible to anatomise the process in photodynamism, and such scientific scrutiny was never behind the Futurists' intention anyway. Similarly, in relation to its use or otherwise in propaganda artwork, and the conflict propaganda poster in particular, it is undoubtedly elements perceived and emotionally-felt by the viewer – the propagandee – that are of most use for manipulation purposes. Pertinent to this conjecture is Jean-François Lyotard's question as to how 'something which cannot

be seen' can be made 'visible', as he maintains that Kant 'shows the way when he names "formlessness, the absence of form," as a possible index to the unpresentable' (1984, p78). A so-called negative aesthetic representation will 'enable us to see only by making it impossible to see; it will please only by causing pain' (p78), an observation that can also be analogised with the idea that a viewer is attracted to the unattractive because of the aesthetic visual construct embedded within it. Any perceived need within that viewer to actively disseminate that image would surely prove counter-productive to the propagandists' intention of a hopefully-instant instigation into some form of action. To this end, the creation and examination of 'a moving image of the impossible' – and the faster the object is moving the more difficult it becomes to accurately capture its motion – necessitates in 'the simultaneous speeding up' of the object and 'the slowing down of what is speeding up' through the photographic process utilised to arrest the motion of that object (Bishop and Phillips, 2011 p6). Although the conclusion is, therefore, that the former 'is the technology of speed' whilst the latter 'is the technology of visual culture' (p6), it also emphasises that the connection between the technological aspects and the aesthetic interpretations can be additionally analysed in the context of circular cause and consequence.

At this point it is necessary to emphasise that for the purposes of this study the capturing of movement is not being considered in its guise as a precursor to cinema. The concern instead is in how this "capturing of movement" can be successfully translated in order for its representation to be effectively articulated in two-dimensional still imagery in general such as the conflict propaganda poster, and through the form of the visual construct of the *line of beauty* in particular. Nonetheless, Eisenstein did connect the idea of a 'montage of associations' with 'Futurist methods of exposition' (2010 p47), and he remarks upon the desire to demonstrate 'the socially useful emotional and psychological effect that excites the audience and is composed of a chain of suitably directed stimulants' (p65). As examined in the previous chapter, an analogous association can be established between Eisenstein's filmic theory and the construction of a poster through its focus on an object as it pertains to its presence within a collated composition. Eisenstein's latter observation above is relatable to the artist, whether propagandist or otherwise, as it speaks of a shared objective in aiming to achieve comparable reactions from the onlooker, namely a response to the representation of movement that arguably parallels that experienced by a cinema audience. Eisenstein's observation also correlates with Ellul's assertions pertaining to propaganda and the requirement to

provoke a reaction through “conditioned reflexes” as cited at the beginning of this chapter. Nevertheless, it must be considered whether or not it is possible to create static representation of movement that is as effective for initiating a reaction from the viewer as that which is achieved through actual moving imagery. A viewer’s imagination undoubtedly plays a significant role in a functional response that potentially requires a ‘unity of imagination and understanding’ (Kant, 2007 p25), and Hogarth was clear in his assertion that imagination is often required in the visual expression, as well as in a viewer’s perception, of a *line of beauty* (1997 p42).
The role of the imagination is further highlighted in Tom Gunning’s suggestion that ‘The movement from still to moving image accented the unbelievable and extraordinary nature of the apparatus itself. But in doing so, it also undid any naive belief in the reality of the image’ (1995 p129). Similarly Marey’s and Muybridge’s chronophotographic experimentation demonstrates human and animal positioning whilst in motion that contradicts previous assumptions made when movements were analysed only in the context of what could be captured by the naked eye. Gunning’s observation, which relates once more to machinic reproduction, is also conceivably of most relevance when considered conversely, that is to say whether movement depicted statically has the ability to instigate awe in the viewer, regardless of whether or not that viewer’s “belief in the reality” has been suspended.
Furthermore, Gunning’s reference to technological advancement in the apparatus itself again prompts the question as to how a medium – a functional object, for example the poster – is integral in the distribution process. Of significance is how the medium in and of itself contributes to the recreation of a sense of motion within the viewer’s consciousness, an aspect considered in more detail later in this chapter, and what the key requirement of the imagery contained within it needs to be in order to instigate a similar response as that initiated by literal motion. So far as the aim of photodynamism is concerned, Bragaglia writes that the objective was to ‘extract not only the aesthetic expression of the motives, but also the inner, sensorial, cerebral and psychic emotions that we feel when an action leaves its superb, unbroken trace’ (2009 p45). Not only does Bragaglia’s comment highlight the importance of the emotional emphasis in the successful suggestion of motion, essential for all artists whether propagandist or otherwise, it also demonstrates interesting juxtaposition apparent between two-dimensional, three-dimensional, and filmic representation of movement. Gaudier was a sculptor, and certainly Giacomo Balla’s foray into sculpture was an endeavour to further experiment and consequently highlight how ‘Speed passing through matter gives it a new value – the material world becomes active, alive’ (Balla, A., 1987 p8). Other Marey

experiments include the stereoscopic photographs *Slow Run* [Fig. 61] in which, when viewed as intended, the lines in the imagery appear as three-dimensional. Marey's objective in utilising a stereoscopic rather than chronophotographic camera was in order to visually capture 'three-dimensional movements of the torso shifting in space as it reacts to the movement of the limbs', by registering the sun-reflected button attached on black clothing at the base of the volunteer's spine (Braun, 1994 p100). In describing the resultant 'undulating lines' Braun employs the satisfying term 'exotic calligraphy' (p100), a remark that allies Hogarth's assertion in respect of the *line of beauty*, that the artist's 'hand takes a lively movement' (1997 p42) when incorporating the *line* in imagery, whilst the former's observation that Marey's experiment recorded 'twisting arabesques' (Braun, 1994 p100) emphasises the affiliation between the static representation of movement and the medium of dance.

All the examples cited above assist in supporting the idea of the *line of beauty* as serpentine curvature conveyed in artworks in order to express movement, and therefore holds a productive position in the construction of conflict propaganda imagery which has an additional purpose for the expression of movement in its metaphoric role as a representative of prospective change. Both two-dimensional *and* three-dimensional representations of movement are static forms of that representation, although the experience and perception may be enhanced by the viewer being able to circle a three-dimensional sculpture, something not possible with a two-dimensional image nor where the stereoscopic or cinematic experience is concerned. In cinema all the requirements necessary for the achievement of an accurate portrayal of movement is created on behalf of the audience; consequently far less effort – and imagination – is required of the cinema viewers themselves.

The Language of Lines

Continuing with the concept of "lines" in general in the contextualisation of the *line of beauty* in particular, it is interesting to note art critic Clive Bell's observation of a 'common quality' he perceives as present in great artworks, a distinct construction of lines and planes that instigate an emotional response within the viewer, and to which he refers as 'significant form' (Cork, 1976a p202). This concept of the application of lines, both figuratively and descriptively, employed by artists and writers to communicate emotion and instigate emotional reactions within others and therefore of manipulative value to the propagandist, has been explored earlier in this chapter. The premise is highlighted in Gaudier's already-referenced philosophy, a personal perspective acknowledged in Deleuze's and Guattari's declaration '"I am

speaking literally," I am drawing lines, lines of writing, and life passes between the lines' (1988, p201); they go on to declare, 'we must invent our lines of flight, if we are able, and the only way we can invent them is by effectively drawing them, in our lives' (p202). Hulme, albeit writing contemporaneously to Bell and Gaudier, succinctly summarises the concept with the following observation:

> Suppose that the various kinds of emotions and other things which one wants to represent are represented by various curved lines. There are in reality an infinite number of these curves all differing slightly from each other. But language does not and could not take account of all these curves... (1994 p199).

Hogarth's expressed intentions contradict Hulme's assertion, at least with regard to the concept of a lack of appropriate language; in *The Analysis of Beauty* Hogarth endeavours to articulate a "language" specifically for the purpose of defining literal differentiation between lines in general and curved lines in particular and what they might represent. When Lewis discusses 'mental-emotive' it is with regard to the desire to arrange the lines and planes within an artwork that results in construction that is not so much inadvertent as emotionally-driven; Lewis defines 'mental-emotive' as meaning 'subjective intellection, like magic or religion' (1963 p504-505). Considered in the context of Hogarth's thoughts and subsequent phrasing when describing the *line* – allied with the points made earlier in this research – the potential for the viewer to be seduced by such "emotionally-driven lines and planes" is clarified, as are the possibilities for exploitation of this potential at the hands of the pictorial propagandist. Of most interest, and an apt summation of the observations cited above, are Mitchell's comments regarding the 'double meaning' of the word 'drawing': Mitchell – who specifically refers to Hogarth's serpentine curve in his assertions – notes the word 'drawing' is not only defined as 'inscribing', but also as 'attracting' (2005 p59), a perfect encapsulation of the significance of the *line of beauty* as it pertains to this research. Bearing this in mind, and in relation to how the *line* may or may not be manifested in propaganda art, especially the conflict propaganda poster, it is relevant to consider Hogarth's analyses in more detail with regard to the expression of movement specific to the *line of beauty*. Although Hogarth maintains many 'waving-lines are ornamental', the *line of beauty* as he perceives it to be is number four in the image on the left of the illustration at Figure 62 (1997 p48). Nevertheless, it is essential to reiterate Hogarth's adamant assertion that the eye is the best judge of what is proportionally right, and that mathematics plays no part in the process (p65). Dewey concurs with Hogarth's premise in his comment that there can only be 'mechanical approximation' resulting from an

attempt ‘to construct esthetically satisfactory curved lines’ (2005 p170), and further supports Hogarth’s own previously-cited beliefs with his suggestion that curved lines are perceived as being pleasurable in that they replicate the innate movement of one’s eye (2005 p104). Although unsurprising considering his elucidated theories, it is nonetheless of interest that Hogarth’s own utilisation of the *line* demonstrates a contour that often varies from his documented structure. This deviation is in addition to any technical requirements necessary when adapting the imagery in an original painting for reproductive purposes, as noted in the last chapter, evidenced in Figure 62, and highlighted in Figure 63. This serves to again support Hogarth’s affirmation regarding the artist’s intuitive way of articulating the *line* when pictorially conveying it, consequently demonstrating that the act of ascribing the line to paper, or canvas, or bronze, stems from an expression of emotion that will inevitably affect the end result. This is not only significant in respect of the literal depiction of an s-shaped curve, but also to the implied continuation of an incomplete construct – a logical premise because of the familiarity of the visual trope, as previously referenced with regard to imagery illustrated in this research thus far. Furthermore it is a concept that tallies with the Futurists’ intimation that to capture the emotion of movement is arguably more important than scientifically-precise replication, particularly when attraction to the work is the catalyst for a viewer to be potentially persuaded by a propagandist message. Boccioni et al write, ‘We have declared in our manifesto that what must be rendered is the dynamic sensation, that is to say, the particular rhythm of each object, its inclination, its movement, or, more exactly, its interior force’ (2009c p47). The Futurists desired and required an affective response to the work they created, an ambition shared by the propagandist in his or her relationship with the propagandee.

With the above observations in mind it is pertinent at this point to reference as an example Russian artist Kuzma Petrov-Vodkin (1878-1939), who towards the end of the first decade of the twentieth century devised a theory concerned with the portrayal of space resulting in a purported ‘“spherical perspective”’ (Tchernyshova, date unknown), accurately represented by a ‘gently upward-travelling curve’ (Gray, 1986 p91). This concept involves various areas of the canvas being linked by ‘gravity’, whereby pivoting figures create a ‘“fan”’, which opens up from within the image; viewers need to consider the artwork from varying viewpoints, the requirement being that the viewers move around it as they observe (Tchernyshova, date unknown), insofar as this is possible where a two-dimensional image is concerned. This linear construction became a constant in Petrov-Vodkin’s work;

Camilla Gray observes that it serves as the backdrop to figures captured 'in a common ecstasy of rhythm' (1986 p91) and is referenced here because the phrase "gently upward-travelling curve" seemingly speaks of either an overt or covert use of Hogarth's concept a century and a half after he defined the construct that is the visible continuum germane to this research. Furthermore, although as a Futurist Boccioni declares that art practice needs to feed off current, cultural context (Boccioni et al, 2009a p25) – as does effective propaganda (Ellul, 1973 p36 and footnote) – he nonetheless maintains that

> if a composition seems to demand a particular rhythmic movement which will add to or contrast with the circumscribed rhythms of the SCULPTURAL WHOLE (the basic requirement of any work of art), you may use any kind of contraption to give an adequate sense of rhythmic movement to planes or lines (2009a p65, capitals in the original).

Despite the Futurists' acknowledged dismissal of centuries of artistic tradition, it would seem the movement in general, and Boccioni in particular, gave credence to certain formulaic "contraptions", so long as they continued to serve the artist's purpose: machinic replication as well as continual referencing from a visual storehouse, and tools as useful to the pictorial propagandist as they are to any other artist. Petrov-Vodkin's theory, along with the more detailed and documented considerations of Hogarth's aesthetic treatise, can therefore feasibly be considered within this concept.

Mechanomorphic

Taking the idea of aesthetic formulae as examined in the previous section of this chapter into account whilst acknowledging a similar observation by Horkheimer and Adorno cited earlier, what is noteworthy is Braun's assertion that it was Marey's imagery that turned out to be the 'key visual source' for the aesthetic side of Modernism (1994 p264), including – and despite Bragaglia's recorded thoughts on the subject – the Futurist and Vorticist artists. Braun in fact maintains that Marey's technical experimentation with movement left an indelible impression on fine art almost certainly more important from a scientific standpoint than anything 'since the discovery of perspective in the Renaissance' (1994 p264). As previously acknowledged, however, the influence is not restricted to fine art, as there is evidence of its effect across other genres within the visual culture field. Braun declares that Marey's 'scientific chronophotography provided a fertile vocabulary for the expressive language of abstraction' (p277): chronophotographic influence

motivated Giacomo Balla to create *Girl Running on a Balcony* (p264), for example, as well as informing Dadaist Marcel Duchamp's *Nude Descending a Staircase* (Adam, 2010 p15). This latter artwork speaks of machinic replication, as illustrated in Figure 64, and consequently relates directly to *Flexioned March* [Fig. 43] and *Marching Men* [Fig. 45]. As a further consideration of these correlations, Garelick describes Fuller as being a meld of human and machine which, as depicted in the literature and artwork of the Futurists and Vorticists, perfectly parallels the innovatively-indistinct borders that aesthetically existed at the time between them (2007 p6). Fuller's serpentine dance, as with most Modernist art forms, evolved from, and combined with, other dance genres (p16), her style being 'a seamless blend of apparent opposites: a sleek, impersonal mechanomorphic modernism', which is what the Futurists in particular found so engaging about her performances (p32). Marinetti references Fuller in his 1917 *Manifesto of Futurist Dance* (2009b p236), and Garelick underlines the mesmerising link that connects the Futurists to movement represented through the medium of dance, referring to ballet as 'a deeply mechanized and fetishistic art form' (2007 p139) that gifted the Futurists' further thematic expression. The contortions of the body necessary for the ballerina to perform suggest 'scarcely human shapes' and Garelick cites André Levinson's assessment that the ballerina is '"a machine for manufacturing beauty"' (p139). Fuller utilised long rods and hooks requiring great force in order to manipulate the fabric in which she shrouded herself; once the fabric was in motion 'the shapes spun partly out of centrifugal force' (p40), sometimes as far as twenty feet above her head. The effect produced by this technological construction not only creates a *line of beauty* but also recalls Marinetti's call to 'kneel in adoration before the whirling speed of a gyroscope compass: 20,000 revolutions a minute' (2009c p225), the combined effect of which is illustrated in the Fuller-inspired dance at Figure 65. This assists in further expounding why performing artists including Fuller – who literally became a fusion of flesh and machine in order to create her dances – held such allure for the Futurist movement. The parallel with the concept of the human figure assimilated into the prosthesis is similarly reflected in Carlo Carrà's artwork *Horse and Rider* [Fig. 66]. This composition, as with Boccioni's *Lancer's Charge* [Fig. 42], comprises a combination of chronophotographic inspiration and Futurist photodynamic-influenced mechanistic Abstraction that includes serpentine curvature, all of which facilitates in aptly illustrating a fast-moving horse and rider in battle subsumed into the war machine. The Carrà image is cited by Braun as an example of Marey's specific influence on Futurist artists (1994 p293).

The focus upon different genres within the Modernist movement in this research is not only to contextualise the temporal parameters prescribed, but also, as Boccioni writes, to emphasise that the differences between the depiction of the movements of motorised vehicles, humans and animals, are simply deviations in 'form and rhythm. It is a matter of gradations of movement, and above all a matter of tempo' (2009d p153). These explorations into innovative composition by the artists associated with this era again demonstrates how each link in the chain impacts upon the next and how aiming to focus solely on only one of these links in formulating a viable discourse is not merely unhelpful but unworkable. As examination of the *line of beauty* as a visible continuum has shown so far in this text, its importance lies as much in its genealogical heritage as it does in its physical manifestation in artworks and what its presence once part of the construction serves to represent. As an example, the interaction between these links is highlighted in Boccioni's aesthetic vision of the conflict of World War I as an opportunity for 'breaking down the image' whilst at the same time maintaining 'a connection to his figurative past' (Fagiolo, 1987 p30). This is recognition of the association that Lewis at least believed would always remain between the figurative and Abstraction (Cork, 1976b p334), and furthermore is another reasonable analogy for the melding of the soldier and the technological machine. With these observations in mind it is significant to refer to Nevinson's *Returning to the Trenches* [Fig. 67], the oil painting which preceded the pastel entitled *Marching Men* [Fig. 45], and to acknowledge Armstrong's comments that

> Where *Returning to the Trenches* (1914) is the futurist vision of mass-men moving dynamically in space, the disillusioned vision of *French Troops Resting* [sic] (1916) [Fig. 68] shows the company broken up into facets, like a cubist study of detached immobile objects (1998 p96).

Boccioni concurs with Armstrong's explanation when he declares that 'A body in movement, therefore, is not simply an immobile body subsequently set in motion, but a truly mobile object, which is a reality quite new and original' (2009c p93); the arrangement of lines and planes in the composition of *Returning to the Trenches* clearly indicates an expression of movement notably absent in *Troops Resting*. The construction of the former painting as it pertains to a representation of the *line of beauty* is examined in the chapter titled *Gauging the Conflict Propaganda Poster within the Wider Visual Ecology*; however, the contrast between the two images clearly underlines the importance in the construction of an image for it not only to effectively convey the suggestion of movement when that is the artist's intention, but

also for that movement to be adequately perceived as such by the viewer. This is an important consideration to any artist and especially pertinent to the pictorial conflict propagandist because of the figurative as well as literal intimation of what that movement subsequently represents.

‘The Medium is the Message’

There is an echo of Fagiolo’s analysis of Giacomo Balla’s artworks in *Returning to the Trenches*, as it illustrates replicated machinic soldiers marching “dynamically” from right to left, albeit shaping a curve that moves towards and then away from the viewer, and this aspect is further considered in a following chapter. Regardless, this observation on the western viewer’s perceived process for reading an image and its association with the effect it subsequently has on that viewer can be combined with Ellul’s comments regarding conditioned reflexes pertaining to certain signs or, indeed, words. In this latter regard, Gombrich maintains that the viewer relies on the way text *normally* looks, and it is this perception of how we think things *should* be that enables us to interpret text organised differently (Gombrich, 1977 p221). An example of this is text with an unusual depth of field, such as might be found on a conflict propaganda poster, and which appears as though it is not only being *literally* directed towards the viewer but is perhaps doing so dynamically and with ‘aggressive force’ (p221). The relevance of aligning Fagiolo’s analysis with Gombrich’s points above is two-fold. Firstly, it clarifies the importance of text in the promotion of visual propaganda where textual captioning is one component in a layered construction of a functioning medium of distribution. Secondly, and more importantly in the context of this chapter where the main focus is on movement, is the ability for text conveyed in this way to appear to be in motion:

Gombrich observes ‘that perspective creates its most compelling illusion where it can rely on certain ingrained expectations and assumptions on the part of the beholder’ (p221); these “assumptions”, as well as Ellul’s intuitive responses, all play

into the propagandist's hands when construction of effective visual propaganda is considered. Analysing the concept in conjunction with Gombrich's example regarding "projections" and "visual anticipations" cited at the beginning of this chapter and illustrated in the poster *Fighting for a Better Future* [Fig. 40], therefore, if one takes the idea of the *line of beauty* representing a road in a propaganda poster the viewer, recognising the construct as a visible continuum, is attracted to the *line*. He or she then follows the curve, not only literally with the eye but also metaphorically with the imagination, in anticipation of what might lie beyond. This example of a productive utilisation of the *line* serves as a reminder as to how the pictorial conflict propagandist can benefit from the looting of a storehouse of visual constructs: the "visible continuums" that include the *line of beauty*. Furthermore, this concept can be further illustrated by continuing along the genealogical thread in order to take into account the adaptation of London Transport advertising posters from the nineteen-twenties and -thirties into World War II propaganda posters. The original posters emphasised "visit it" with regard to British towns and countryside; the alternate *Fight For It Now* campaign posters, though essentially remaining the same pictorially, changed that emphasis from "visit it" to "save it" (Moore, 2010 p153-154), as alluded to in the previous chapter. With this practice and these observations in mind, as well as to clarify the points made previously, five images – three original posters along with elements of their manipulated alternates [Figs. 69-73] – have been utilised to create the layered poster *Fighting for a Better Future* referenced at Figure 40. In addition, and with regard to relevant textual augmentation as illustrated at Figure 74 McLuhan, in an echo of Gombrich, remarks that

> Typography bears much resemblance to cinema, just as the reading of print puts the reader in the role of the movie projector. The reader moves the series of imprinted letters before him at a speed consistent with apprehending the motions of the author's mind (1962 p124-125).

From a visual propagandist's point of view, the elements of experimentation into the static representation of movement can be utilised not only in imagery but also in the way text is pictorially represented, to the point where the physicality of its display can have as much bearing on the way the message is perceived as the literal message itself. Certainly Gunning remarks that the 'agitating experience' is part of the attraction (1995 p116); although Gunning is referring to early cinema, the context is equivalent to the proposed *effect* upon the viewer, in the same way the static representation of movement in artworks arguably aims, however ambitiously, to instigate similar effect as that experienced when confronted by actual motion.

Ivins' observation that the viewer responds not to the event itself but to the *report* of the event correlates with Eisenstein's previously-cited assertion regarding the "revolutionary" aspect of form over content. A twenty-first century consideration of the ongoing relevance of the poster, as referenced in this text along with the subsequent means by which the information contained within can be distributed, includes the carefully-considered placing of the "exactly repeatable pictorial statement" and correlates directly with the saturation method of bill-posting, ensuring propagandees have overlapping opportunities to absorb the communicated message. This consideration serves to encompass Ivins' and Eisenstein's comments, and in so doing consequently creates conditions of possibility whereby the assertions can be revisited, their pertinence subsequently re-evaluated in the light of contemporaneous methods of distribution. Advancement in technology such as that illustrated in Figure 75 serves as an example. The prime objective of the visual propagandist is to instigate a productive response from the viewer; therefore, and as has been considered so far in this research, the carefully collated and constructed poster and its inclusion of effective visual constructs – such as the *line of beauty* – combined with how that poster is subsequently distributed, is as important as the message it is attempting to convey. In addition to the examination of the static representation of movement and its pictorial manifestation in visual conflict propaganda via the construct of the *line of beauty*, there consequently exists a supplementary perspective in how movement can play a literal part in the viewer's *perception* of the information that serves as an apt conclusion to this chapter. Firstly, as illustrated in Figure 75, the same poster can be displayed on each screen; the image remains static but the viewer does not, due to the motion of the escalator. Secondly, digital displays can offer a progression of chronophotographic images, and the motion of the viewer will therefore emphasise the perception of movement, particularly if the images' progression is opposite to the direction in which the viewer is travelling. Thirdly, the digital displays can project "moving pictures" – a multi-screened cinematic experience and one that is then enjoyed chronophotographically because of the movement of the viewer. Furthermore, as it is the individual within the mass whom the pictorial propagandist aims to target, a situation such as the one highlighted in Figure 75 becomes a perfect environment for the prospective manipulation of the captive crowd. This subsequently leads to the consideration that, in addition to the literal characteristic of the gathered crowd, there exists its configuration as an *organic* mass, because of the commonality that lies in the reasons as to why each participant is present in that environment – in this example, the London Underground.

This concept of a specific environmental context is relevant not only in respect of the viewer's perception of pictorial propaganda messaging but also with regard to its creation. This is further enhanced when that "environment" is culturally- and/or temporally-focussed – from the perspective of this research, the contextual considerations surrounding World War I. Consequently the following chapter concentrates on the aesthetics of conflict as it pertains to the propagandist and counter-propagandist pictorial responses to the war, whilst remaining focussed upon the manifestation of the *line of beauty* within this genre of artwork.

Representing the Real in the Aesthetics of Conflict

The previous chapter concentrates on how the *line of beauty* can be employed in effectively suggesting movement within artworks, not only as a literal visual construct but also for its metaphoric connotations when employed as a pictorial trope and therefore potentially indicative of movement from a propagandist perspective. Both literal and metaphorical observations can be aligned more specifically with the aesthetics of conflict artwork that lies within the temporal scope of this text, and in this regard it is relevant to refer to Walter Benjamin's comment that '*All efforts to aestheticize politics culminate in one point. That one point is war*' (2008 p36, italics in the original). This concept is highlighted in the previous chapter and underscored in the Marinetti manifesto that begins with the declaration "War is beautiful", and which consequently expresses a distinct, and arguably particularly personal, point of view. "Aestheticised politics" in the focussed form of pictorial propaganda is designed to motivate the viewer – the propagandee – by amplifying existing inclinations and converting them into action (Kellen, 1973 pvi), with the climate, both environmentally and psychologically, having a bearing on how suggestible a propagandee will be (Ellul, 1973 p66). Aestheticising politics and/or war serves both a propaganda and counter-propaganda function. In the concise context of conflict relevant to this research and this chapter in particular, the concept can be considered more specifically from the point of view that the visual propagandist's position begins with the poster, including posters related to the recruitment campaign, whilst the counter-propagandist's role is rooted in the subsequent pictorial response.

Between 1870 and 1914 conflicts only featured in poster art when used as leverage by manufacturers of commercial and industrial products and at the outbreak of World War I the pictorial poster was procured for the war effort, especially in England where there was no conscript army and volunteers were required (Weill, 1984 p129-130). The aim was to inspire patriotism with the inevitable consequence that 'the horrors of war were scrupulously avoided' (p130). During the First World War the state embraced mass media in a manner not seen in previous conflicts, facilitating the relative ease with which propagandist messaging could subsequently be distributed. Although soldiers were the same "cannon fodder" they had always been, how this was presented – and perceived – began to change. Baudrillard remarks on the futility of envisaging either a 'revolution through content' or 'revelation through form', maintaining that 'the medium and the real are now in a

single nebular whose truth is indecipherable' (1994 p83), an observation that indicates a postulation that plays to the potential of both pictorial conflict propagandist messaging and the counter-propagandist reaction. This theory, upholding Le Bon's assertion that sometimes 'there is more truth in the unreal than in the real' (2001 p5), is a consideration that not only correlates with the concept of propagandist messaging hypothesising a future reality through the manipulation of pre-formed nostalgic ideals pertaining to an individual's past, but also the scientific and aesthetic findings of chronophotographic and photodynamic processes and their subsequent and continuing influence on visual culture. The *line of beauty* is symbolic of both literal and metaphorical movement and furthermore functions as a pictorial signifier for the manifestation of attraction – a "something beautiful" wrapped in or around something mendacious, with this latter idea never more apparent than when associated with visual depictions of conflict. This serves as a reminder as to how pertinent it is that imagery conceived for the attraction of the individual within the crowd, such as the propaganda poster, is constructed via a collation of elements that includes a visible continuum recognised by the viewer *because* of its value as an attraction. Consequently, this chapter aims to examine the role of the *line of beauty* as a synchronic object in the specific genre of propaganda/counter-propaganda art, as a way of further contextualising the early twentieth century propaganda poster as a functional object. In addition is the simultaneous demonstration of how the *line*'s inclusion in both propagandist *and* counter-propagandist artwork can be compellingly exploited in the representation of a real, whilst each paradoxically struggles under the weight of its own contradictory claims.

Macabre/Beauty

It is important to bear in mind that *counter*-propaganda has the ability to develop to a point where it functions at a level similar to that of propaganda, and although the former exists as opposition to the latter the general public may not be aware of this at the time (O'Donnell and Jowett, 2012 p306). Whilst the significance of this is further considered later in this text, it is a feasible supposition that the soldier-artists of World War I were not part of any organised counter-propaganda campaign, certainly not one of their own making: on the contrary – most were concerned with how their experiences effected their aesthetic output, not least when considering the appalling conditions that engulfed them. The reasoning behind the biblical phrase 'the lust of the eyes' (John 2:16), as cited circa fourth century by Augustine and utilised as a summary for the senses, consequently provokes the question as to

whether we seek ‘pleasure or curiosity’ (Augustine, 1955 p148). This is a particularly apt concept when considered in the context of Front Line artists and their creation of artwork that was effective in demonstrating the conflict in which they were involved,

> For pleasure pursues objects that are beautiful, melodious, fragrant, savory, soft. But curiosity, seeking new experiences, will even seek out the contrary of these, not with the purpose of experiencing the discomfort that often accompanies them, but out of a passion for experimenting and knowledge (p148).

These assertions are indicative of the objectives of the Futurist and Vorticist artists in their ambition to create artworks expressive of a modernity through their exploration of technology, movement and speed, in ways which had never before been applied to the aesthetics of conflict. Of additional interest is the alliance of this with Augustine’s reiteration of the desire that appears to exist in the attraction of something hideous, including that which is dead even if the sight of it makes us ‘sad and pale’; Augustine chooses the word ‘compelled’ to describe this need one has to view, and even alludes to ‘a rumor of its beauty’ as being what it is that entices the viewer (p148). This is a concept already reflected upon within this text, and incorporates the presence of the *line of beauty* in artworks including those of propagandist and counter-propagandist provenance. In an echo of these observations, and as previously cited, Viney asserts that Nash as a World War I conflict soldier-artist possessed a ‘poetic gift’ that enabled him ‘to transmute the grimly appalling scenes into works of remarkable, if macabre, beauty’ (1991 p50). This lyrical phrasing is indicative of how attraction can be instigated not only in spite of, but also, contrarily, under certain circumstances *because* of the subject matter. As a concurrence, Edmund Burke does not equate ‘deformity’ with ‘*ugliness*’, but instead declares that ‘Between beauty and ugliness there is a sort of mediocrity, in which the assigned proportions are most commonly found, but this has no effect upon the passions’ (1958 p104, italics in the original). The disconcertion that occurs within the viewer on regarding an image which is, in effect, “deformed”, because it is of a difficult and unattractive subject matter yet has an element of “beauty” within it, is caused by the disequilibrium of that combination, as inevitably is the converse. The concept is further analysed in Arthur Schopenhauer’s assertion that if ‘interest’ was essential to the production of something beautiful, then everything ‘interesting’ would also be beautiful (2006 p29). Insofar as the *line of beauty* is concerned, the key is not necessarily in the representation of “beauty” in and of itself, as has been emphasised throughout this research, but instead in its ability to attract and thereby

evoke an effective, emotional response from within the viewer. A viewer can be attracted to, or seduced by, a propagandist or counter-propagandist image, enticed into the artwork by the static representation of movement depicted by the *line* as a visual construct, with the consequence that this instigates a productive response through its figurative implication of movement. When considered in the context of a conflict propaganda poster dedicated to a recruitment drive, for example, this is especially pertinent. As previously explored, the necessary suggestion of movement indicates both literal and metaphoric perspectives and with regard to the latter, in the construction of the desired real, visual propaganda assists in perpetuating the perception of an alternate reality whilst simultaneously addressing the status of the known regime that pertains to the current real. Nevertheless, any representation intended to indicate potential movement from one version of a real to another is suggestive of a "logical contradiction", for if it is believed the state of events can be changed, then the real being considered cannot be actually real. Baudrillard's assertion that 'It is no longer a question of a false representation of reality (ideology), but of concealing the fact that the real is no longer real, and thus saving the reality principle' (1983 p25) uncovers the combination of circumstances that results in the effective construction of pictorial propaganda subsequently distributed through the medium of the poster, for example as a contribution to a conflict's recruitment campaign. Furthermore, when Baudrillard speaks of 'Surprising the real in order to immobilize it' (1994 p105), it is demonstrative of the circular cause and effect that is arguably in place once there is a counter-response – in this context from the soldier-artists contained within the actual mechanism of conflict as opposed to that which emanates from those who necessarily operate from the outside.

When the points raised in this section of the chapter are considered from the specific point of view of the unifying link of the *line of beauty* as an elemental object within a propaganda artwork, the concept of circularity as suggested is further enhanced. Ominous scenes of the trenches of World War I are unlikely to be considered as "beautiful" in and of themselves, at least not from the perspective of what is traditionally meant by this adjective – more indicative, in fact, of Shearman's 'special kind of beauty' (1967 p156). However, it does not necessarily follow that a viewer cannot still find him- or herself drawn to the imagery, as Augustine alludes to: in the context of this research, via the *line of beauty* as the catalyst for that attraction. In addition is the premise of the visual ellipsis and how this can be allied with the notion of the *line* as a "waving surface", and when the relationships between

these contributory elements are combined they produce artworks of which Nash's watercolour *After the Battle* [Fig. 76] is a productive example. Consequently, the subject matter of this particular painting, consolidated by a Modernist construction, illustrates not only a literal example of an encapsulation of these concepts, but also serves as a demonstration of how the relevant collation of components forms a whole which subsequently impacts upon the visual culture of an era.

Prior to World War I conflicts had generally produced works that expressed a colourful glory and were considered as being of 'great beauty' (Haycock, 2010 p209), a description that is somewhat ironic when considered from the perspective of the points made thus far. Haycock refers to Lady Elizabeth Butler who had immortalised nineteenth century battles and who was still producing work when the First World War was declared. Lady Butler's depictions were typical of previous pictorial conflict in that there were uniforms and flags to focus upon, resulting in imagery that manifested an air of ceremony and colour, whereas the artists of World War I would conversely struggle with how they could accurately portray life in the trenches (2010 p209) when so much was shrouded in muted and muddied tones. As examined in the chapter titled *The Poster as a Functional Object*, these patriotic and colourful signifiers continued to be utilised within recruitment posters, yet by 1914 the Futurists at least believed 'the distinctions between art, life and politics were seriously collapsed into a new genre of imaginative and prophetic propaganda' (Humphreys, 2009 p225). In this respect the contrast between Lady Butler's representation of conflict as illustrated at Figure 77, and imagery influenced by the chronophotographic, photodynamic and technological elements of Modernism expressed in Boccioni's *Lancer's Charge* [Fig. 42], is therefore patent. The Vorticists, a movement Cork describes as managing 'to forge an identifiably national art, as homegrown and pugnacious as Hogarth' (1976b p557), wished to demonstrate an 'unsentimental, clear-eyed assessment' of life in the early twentieth century, and as this included conflict and war they were prepared to risk any association their work might then have with the iniquities of it (p363). The influence the war held over these artists is unsurprising, as remarked upon in the previous chapter: apart from its complete and utter dominance of life during this period and the fact that some of the artists actually participated as serving soldiers, the burgeoning emphasis on the technological and mechanomorphic resonated with their Modernist personas. Gough's description of Vorticism as artworks 'that shimmer with a tensile energy' and 'pulse with staccato movement' (2010 p214) clarify the machinic intensity shared with the Futurists. Consequently it is only to be

expected that when the aesthetic war that had been anticipated, coveted, and embarked upon on the 'battlefield of art' was subsequently converted into 'bleak, terrible reality on the world stage' (Orchard, 2000 p21), Modernist artists hoped to create work representative both of their distinctive style and the reality of battle. These observations are further expanded in Eric J. Leed's assertion that

> War effects a psychic regression toward a place where the restraints of reality do not operate. The myths and fantasies of war are an escape, a flight from constraining modern realities that in war were translated into military terms (1979 p118).

Representations of so-called "myths" and "fantasies" are as relevant to the conflict artists of World War I as they are to the propagandists behind the recruitment drive and articulated through the medium of the pictorial poster. Of additional significance in this specific context, and in support of comments regarding competing constructions of the real noted earlier, is the undeniably blatant actuality that 'Modernism had not changed, but reality had' (Hynes, 1990 p195), and artists of both propagandist and counter-propagandist persuasion were equally as affected.

Human versus Machine

The appointment of official war artists in Britain was for the benefit of propagandist needs in order to gain support both at home and in so-far-uninvolved countries (Viney, 1991 p21). It is relevant at this point to acknowledge that the commissioned artworks were expected to conform to the authorities' objectives, with the consequence that not all the subsequent paintings and drawings were accepted due to a lack of compliance with the stated parameters. For the purposes of this research no distinction has been made with regard to which images referenced were commissioned in this way, whether ultimately accepted or rejected, as each image is examined solely for its merit in appertaining to the points made within the boundaries of this text. However, it is nonetheless worth noting that because the scheme was not instigated until August 1916 it effectively results in all relevant World War I artwork produced before this date being considered as "unofficial". Nevinson wasn't classified as a war artist until August 1917, a position he held for only six months (Gough, 2010 p106), yet this is unarguably a moot point as there is little "unofficial" about his depiction of war in his work up to this date. Nevinson had been in France as an active participant in the conflict and his painting *Returning to the Trenches* [Fig. 67] was created as early as 1914. This particular painting exemplifies the circular cause and effect of pictorial propaganda/counter-propaganda when considered in the context of its 1914 inception, contrasted with

the *Step Into Your Place* recruitment poster from 1915 [Fig. 44], and then further contrasted with Nevinson's pastel version of his composition titled *Marching Men* [Fig. 45] completed in 1916. Michael Walsh adamantly asserts, however, that *Returning to the Trenches* does not serve a 'propaganda function' (2002 p116), yet it is undeniably effective – as is *Marching Men* – in illustrating a perceived reality of being amongst the soldiers returning to the Front Line, and therefore an apposite distributor of at least *counter*-propagandist information as a response to the lines of smiling soldiers in the recruitment posters of the era. Walsh does concede that part of the success of the painting is its 'rendering of atmosphere and expression' (2002 p116) and its particular construction of lines and planes as it further relates to the *line of beauty* is analysed later in this text. Nevinson and his aesthetic output operate as a productive example when considering that, contemporaneously, questions were asked as to what 'constituted an authentic image? ...How much front-line experience did an artist need – if any at all – to create convincing representations of modern war?' (Gough, 2010 p69), and these are concepts examined later in this chapter alongside the issue as to whose viewpoints these "convincing representations" are expected to endorse. Nevertheless, the blurring of the line between figurative and abstraction in Nevinson's work such as *Returning to the Trenches* and *Marching Men* – reputed as this soldier-artist was for having 'brought Futurism to the Western Front' (Walsh, 2002 p92) – arguably generates the right balance for the purpose of pictorially presenting war, demonstrating chronophotographic influences in the machinic replication and an emotion of movement in the employment of photodynamic effects. Nevinson took the ideals of the Futurist movement and used them to portray the facileness and anonymity of modern conflict – *not* the splendour (Walsh, 2002 p108), which is the message propagandists undoubtedly prefer soldier-artists to convey, and as had arguably been the case in the painterly depiction of past conflicts. This machinic replication is further emphasised in Nevinson's revisiting of distinctive compositional elements within *Returning to the Trenches*, effectively replicating the imagery in subsequent artworks, thereby evoking the observations commented upon in relation to values examined in the chapter titled *The Poster as a Functional Object*. Nevinson steadfastly affirms the points regarding a pictorial conveyance of conflict that expresses modernity when he writes that

> No man saw pageantry in the trenches. My attempt at creating beauty was merely by the statement of reality, emotionally expressed, as one who had seen something of warfare and was caught up in a force over which he had no control (1937 p88).

Noteworthy is Nevinson's own admission that despite the circumstances and the subject matter he was nonetheless attempting to create artworks that could be considered as beautiful, echoing observations made previously regarding a pictorial conveyance of an internal force. The concept of a suspension of the reality of a situation within which one might find oneself, and the resultant aesthetic endeavours undertaken to aid in the achievement of this, demonstrates the circumstances by which a visual construct such as the *line of beauty* can be recognised within an artwork deemed to be counter to our preconceived concepts of "beauty". It is therefore a reiteration of the reasonable conjecture that it is this visible continuum that instigates the viewer's attraction to the work, underlining Mann's observation regarding beauty in relation to "good" and "evil", as well as the previously considered "lust of the eyes".

Taking this into consideration it is relevant as a comparative exercise to refer to the first "official" World War I artist, Muirhead Bone, who was sent to the Front in August 1916 (Haycock, 2010 p270). Bone's skills as an etcher had been suggested in order to supplement the imagery necessary to augment 'the demands of a global propaganda campaign' (Gough, 2010 p23). This campaign employed pictorial media that includes the poster, and although Bone's style may have been ideal for mass reproduction his work is critiqued by Viney in that despite being 'all recorded in sober, unemotional and detached detail, often arranged with the greatest possible dramatic effect', it suggests a personal testimony to the war which is 'dry and factual, muted but precise' (1991 p24). Gough concurs with his comment that Bone's 'flat, journalistic language' stopped short of being a suitable vehicle for the pictorial description of modern war, however fitting for reproductive purposes (2010 p48). This particular aesthetic approach could no longer adequately convey a reality of warfare – certainly not one conducive to Modernist interpretations, although arguably apposite for underpinning the imagery that contributed to the construction of the pictorial propaganda poster. In further support of the point regarding modernity is reference to a 1917 article in *The Egoist*, which comments that the Vortex – Vorticism – had 'been converted from an aesthetic concept to a military weapon' (Cork, 1976a p295), a theory Hal Foster scrutinises and dissects with his observation that for Marinetti and Lewis the machine 'attracts them not for its utilitarian and productivist possibilities but for its imagistic and energistic qualities – because it can image both the dynamism of the instincts and the armoring of the ego' (1997 p10). This not only assists in exposing concepts relating directly to propagandist strategies and the subsequent objectives, but also underscores the

potential for such fervent inspiration to translate into evocative conflict imagery. This reiterates why, despite often unsatisfactory criticism to the contrary, Futurism and Vorticism were productive styles through which to pictorially interpret 'the increasingly demonic world of mechanism' (Leed, 1979 p121) encountered at the Front, with the consequent reflection of this apparent in both propaganda *and* counter-propaganda imagery of the time.

Nevertheless, with regard to modern art Hulme suggests a legitimate question to ask is '"Why make use of the human body in this art, why make that look like a machine?"' (1994 p283), a sentiment particularly germane when applied to the specific genre of visual conflict propaganda/counter-propaganda. When considering artworks such as *Marching Men* [Fig. 45] or *Returning to the Trenches* [Fig. 67], this is undoubtedly the point: the human has *become* part of the machine. Artworks that merely depict machinic technology are unlikely to elicit the empathetic emotional response that occurs when a viewer can see how entrenched a human being is within that mechanism yet still recognise the figurative within the image: the 1915 propaganda poster *Step Into Your Place* [Fig. 44] would not be so compelling if the line consisted merely of armoured trucks or tanks. The previously-cited recognition of a visual ellipsis with regard to the curvature is overt in the construction of this particular poster design and if one takes the human – literally – out of that picture, as demonstrated in Figure 78, although the concept still applies the reality of the intention is arguably altered, and consequently it becomes less problematical for the viewer to remain uninvolved, both physically and emotionally. This acquires further resonance when that "viewer" has additionally been targeted as a "propagandee". Hulme goes on to say that artists including Lewis turned 'the organic into something not organic' (1994 p283) and it is worth reiterating Lewis' assertion that it is virtually impossible to remove the figurative from Abstraction entirely, with the consequence that the attraction to the corporeal remains despite the technologised emphasis of the composition. Foster comments in this regard, declaring that Lewis' idea of Abstraction is the 'conversion of a figure into a protective shield' and that he

> is not content to show the mere result of this armoring; rather, he evokes its struggle and its stake. Especially in the "designs" of the early 1910s a great tension exists between figure and surround, as if the body ego, never secure, were caught between definition, about to break free as an autonomous subject, and dispersal, about to be invaded schizophrenically by space (1997 p23).

Foster's observations equate to the concept of mechanomorphism, suggesting Lewis was anticipating the point where the soldier assimilates the machinery of war to such an extent it becomes the surgical prosthesis reflected upon earlier in this text. Furthermore, Foster references Lewis' *The Vorticist* from 1912 [Fig. 79] and describes the figure as seemingly 'abstracted as if by the stimulus-shock of the world' (p24). Serpentine curves as "Lines of beauty" are still discernible within this mechanomorphic image, however, just as they are when created through Fuller's Modernist serpentine dance and artworks devised by other Vorticist and Futurist artists including Boccioni, as examined in the previous chapter. Following on from Foster's comments is the observation that Nevinson was similarly affected, in this instance by the immensity of the 'industrialised military occupation' in France (Gough, 2010 p111). Nevinson's experience assisted in his revealing 'new truths' in his work with regard to 'total war' – that conflict had become habitual and justified, with the consequence that it became 'its own normality, rather than an interruption to peacetime' (p111), an additional example of conflicting constructions of a real emphasised through the constricted context of World War I. As already examined, the effective interpretation of speed and motion in art requires a suggestion of movement that can be understood by the viewer, and Nevinson, whose work was reviewed in the contemporaneous publication *Lloyds Magazine*, was declared as '"The Man who Paints Motion"', a critique highlighting Nevinson's skill at 'rendering dynamic movement using geometrical simplification and "lines of force"' (Gough, 2010 p109). Nevinson's distinctive style is particularly effective in evoking 'the mechanical and inhuman nature of modern industrial warfare. His marching soldiers, for example, are actually machines' (Orchard, 2000 p21). What is of interest to recognise is how a potential chronophotographic machinic replication of Lewis' figurative abstraction at Figure 79 inevitably leads directly to the compositional elements observed in Nevinson's World War I *Study for Returning to the Trenches* [Fig. 80], as well as the subsequent versions cited – and how this specifically relates to "lines of beauty" is expanded upon later in this research. Nonetheless, in further clarification and conclusion of the points made in this section of the chapter, it is of note that

> However strong the desire for abstraction, it cannot be satisfied with the reproduction of merely inorganic forms. A perfect cube looks stable in comparison with the flux of appearance, but one might be pardoned if one felt no particular interest in the eternity of a cube; (Hulme, 1994 p283).

In this particular context, and in further support of the reasoning above as it especially relates to the propaganda posters illustrated at Figures 44 and 78, it is a relevant exercise to replace Hulme's chosen noun "cube", with "tank". It is this point which is of most significance when considering the requirement of the pictorial propagandist utilising the medium of the poster to elicit effective responses from the propagandee, exploiting whatever visual constructs are deemed necessary in order to achieve this.

The Real

An examination of the concept of conflicting constructions of the real is relevant to this research because of its specific function as a tool employed within pictorial propaganda. It is therefore pertinent to again refer to Baudrillard, who writes of how 'promises of the future go the same way as memories of the past: they vanish with the very principle of reality' (2001 p62-63). Consequently – and remaining within the temporal parameters of this text – the requirement to continually counter-respond to the prospective impact of conflict imagery such as Nevinson's with the distribution of visual messaging in the form of posters, particularly those relating to the ongoing recruitment drive, is once more demonstrative of the necessity to substitute an "actual" real, which holds at a particular moment, by an alternative "true" real. Not only does this echo observations cited at the beginning of this chapter, it is also another example of circular cause and consequence that is an inevitable part of propaganda/counter-propaganda practice. This is further illustrated in the concept that 'the Real ...implies an origin, an end, a past and a future, a chain of causes and effects, a continuity and a rationality' (Baudrillard, 2001 p63), an assertion that supports the idea of Baudrillard's "visible continuum" as a metaphoric symbol, as well as its role within this research as a tangible, semiotic construction of a pictorial trope. The constant association of memory and nostalgic ideals relating to one's past helps to formulate the process within which the propagandist can manipulate the propagandee, and further serves to emphasise the element of collusion between the two necessary in the effective achievement of the same. It is this "real" which is at stake where propaganda is concerned; the real always represents the regime of power and agreement and yet it is inevitably a fabrication: propaganda speaks to the "ideal real" and in this context, as previously intimated, it posits a perfect circumstance for its manipulation, which is no less imperative when considered in *pictorial* propaganda terms. Alternate versions of a "real" articulated pictorially are represented in Figures 2, 81 and 82. In further examining the observations previously made with regard to the Lumley artwork in particular [Fig. 2], the poster,

the film still [Fig. 81] and the sketch [Fig. 82], each illustrate a marching column of soldiers that explicitly or implicitly suggests a *line of beauty* in its progression, yet the resultant pictorial articulation of the subject matter arguably conveys three separate versions of reality contained within their respective mediums. These interpretations not only indicate the differentiation between the creators' perspectives, and therefore their intention in constructing or contriving the composition in the way he or she has, but also how each of the compositions might feasibly be perceived by the viewer, an aspect arguably more important when considered in the context of the subsequent affect required of the propagandee by the propagandist. Of additional interest is how *counter*-propaganda can serve to offer a version of reality that is not palpably "ideal" as a whole, yet may incorporate at least the attraction of an "ideal" in the form of the visual construct utilised in its formulation, such as the presence of a *line of beauty*, and in similar fashion to how a propagandist might disguise any iniquity behind a facade of attraction. Soldier-artists, as previously alluded to for example with regard to Gaudier and Nevinson, sometimes look at their bleak surroundings from a purely aesthetic viewpoint – a determination to unleash something beautiful from within something repulsive. When Paulson declares that Hogarth in effect 'replaced morality with aesthetics' in the search for some sort of 'ideal' in the beleaguered London that he knew (1997, pxxxi-xxxii), it is a concept that parallels Gaudier's viewpoint: 'THE BURSTING SHELLS, the volleys, wire entanglements, projectors, motors, the chaos of battle DO NOT ALTER IN THE LEAST, the outlines of the hill we are besieging' (Gaudier-Brzeska, 1981 p33, capitals in the original). The probability is apparent that these men, despite the differing circumstances between eighteenth century London and the World War I battlefields of France, developed a subconscious defence mechanism that enabled them to cope with the disturbing reality in which they found themselves irrevocably embedded, and one that led both to define "beauty" in what they encountered in their respective immediate environments. In identifying this analogous alignment between Hogarth and the soldier-artists of World War I, it further contextualises the importance of the genealogical thread as well as Hogarth's aesthetic theorising as both relate to the parameters of this research.

It is intriguing and perhaps somewhat ironic to consider therefore whether the concept of representing soldiers as being part of the war machine emphasises the reality of the situation or perpetuates the *un*reality as viewed by people away from the Front Line. This is regardless of whether this representation is manifested by the soldiers or by others away from the battlefields, and despite varying motives

dependant on the propaganda/counter-propaganda stance. Henri Barbusse in his 1917 novel *Under Fire* writes:

> ...War is frightful and unnatural weariness, water up to the belly, mud and dung and infamous filth. It is befouled faces and tattered flesh, it is the corpses that are no longer like corpses even, floating on the ravenous earth. It is that, that endless monotony of misery, broken by poignant tragedies; (1926 p325).

It is *not*, Barbusse continues, 'attacks that are like ceremonial reviews ...visible battles unfurled like banners', not 'the bayonet's silvery glitter, nor the trumpet's cock-crow in the sun!' (p325). Equally, however – and productively serving as an example of circular cause and consequence pertinent to versions of reality that are antithetical, or at the very least inconsistent – Barbusse's assertions do not reflect Marinetti's declaration that '"War is beautiful..."' and therefore suggestive of '"a new kind of poetry"' (Benjamin, W., 2008 p37), despite an undoubtedly rhythmic tone in the former's turn of phrase. Nevertheless, conflict artwork such as that produced by soldier-artists including Nevinson and Nash are examples of an exploration undertaken by Modernist artists of an innovative way in which to adequately interpret conflict that pictorially endorses Barbusse's literary observations of the reality of war. Similarly, paintings of battle as demonstrated in the work of artists including Lady Butler completely contradict Barbusse's adamantly-asserted experiential perspective of the reality of this "modern" war, when it had become unacceptable for contemporary war artists to paint only the 'pathos, patriotism and sentiment of manly conflict' (Walsh, 2002 p107). It is also reasonable to hypothesise that Marinetti did not have Lady Butler's paintings in mind when he was encouraging the aestheticising of conflict, as his objective was rooted in a particularly Modernist response. Barbusse reflects on the disconnect that exists between the actual reality and the perceived real readily embraced by civilians (1926 p326), as well as by those with their own agenda to protect, and this once more echoes how Futurist and Vorticist interpretations of conflict parallel the dramatic, literal, literary representations via the iconic imagery that emerged from the battlefields. Siegfried Sassoon writes blatantly that 'The war had become undisguisedly mechanical and inhuman. What in earlier days had been drafts of volunteers were now droves of victims' (1930 p147), an observation appositely encapsulated in the progression through Figures 2, 81 and 82 commented upon earlier. Sassoon's reflections serve to highlight the imbalance between the messaging distributed via pictorial recruitment propaganda and the soldiers' actual perception once confronted by the reality of their situation, and this is further

demonstrated in Figures 83 and 84. Baudrillard speaks of 'the soul of art', commenting upon 'its power of illusion, its capacity for negating reality, for setting up an "other scene" in opposition to reality...' (1993, p14), echoing the points made previously in this section of the chapter, and the concept of which is illustrated in the *An Appeal To You* poster [Fig. 83] and Nash's *Existence* [Fig. 84]. This contrast is further endorsed by the addition of a third image – a still extracted from the 1916 documentary *The Battle of the Somme* [Fig. 85], which reiterates the disconnect that inevitably lies between the propagandist's depiction whether deliberately misleading or not, and the real that is perceived through first-hand experience. Of additional significance when appraising the three images together [Figs. 83-85] is how the appearance of serpentine curvature, whether overt or implied, is augmented via the folding of the soldier's body as each "situation" contained within the image deteriorates. This is again indicative of how the visual construct of the *line of beauty* can often be represented, whether knowingly or unknowingly, in imagery that is not thought to be of great beauty in any traditional sense and, in the context of these three images in particular, how the value of the construct in its attraction increases as the subject matter becomes less "attractive" in and of itself. Moreover, Barthes writes of the differences that exist between a painting and a photograph – and for the purposes of this singular argument the film still can be considered in the latter category – remarking that no matter how much realism there is in a painting, what it cannot express that a photograph can is the concept that the soldiers '*were there*' (1993, p82, italics in the original). Although this is an interesting point it does not capture the "truth" of one image over another in its entirety, for there is always the consideration that the photographic "evidence" may have been contrived, and therefore the artist's interpretation can fall under no more suspicion than the photographer's – or indeed the film-maker's, and this latter point is examined in the next chapter. Of relevance to consider at this juncture is the concept of a so-called 'metaphysical' rule, which states that 'as long as I can produce proof, it is permissible to think that reality is the way I say it is' (Lyotard, 1984 p12), and when this is combined with the idea of a requirement for empathetic involvement, the possibility arises that reality can be more acutely conveyed in a photograph of "real" people. A pertinent conjecture in this regard, however, is that the viewer's empathy might lie with the *subjects* of the photograph, yet feasibly transfer to the artist in the case of a painting, as the photographer may become overshadowed in the eyes of the beholder in his or her role as spectator by the realism of the corporeal captured as so-called proof within the frozen moment of the subject matter.

Unpalatable Sacrifice

When all this is taken into account it is easy to understand Gough's remarks that as a World War I official war artist Bone 'lacked the creative nerve to summarily include the obscenities of war'; Gough adds, however, that this was a 'dilemma' that many other artists faced, not only at the time but also in conflicts that were to come (2010 p59). David Welch cites newspaper articles from 2003 in which Jack Straw, the then British Foreign Secretary, articulated his belief that 'too much reality' could have adverse effects on the viewing public (2005, pix):

> "Had the public been able to see live coverage from the [first world war] trenches, I wonder for how long the governments of Asquith and Lloyd George could have maintained the war effort. Imagine the carnage of the Somme on Sky and BBC News 24" (Gibson, 2003 paragraph 10).

Welch maintains that throughout most of the twentieth century the media played a willing part in cooperating with governmental and military leadership, contributing to a flow of information less concerned with accuracy than it was with propaganda and, inevitably, censorship (2005 px), an observation that upholds Hulme's assertion that the concern is not 'with truth, but with success' (1994 p210). In the field of visual culture as it relates to the boundaries of this research the position of each medium is best analysed in the context of what else is available at the time, an area examined in the next chapter. Similarly, one form of propagandist messaging can only effectively be assessed in relation to the place it holds in the wider propaganda landscape. The growth in mass media, increasing exponentially into the twenty-first century, necessarily alters the way propaganda is not only distributed but also proposed, as well as the means by which the propagandee consequently responds to it. Sue Malvern remarks that there was a 'simmering' debate around the end of the First World War with regard to artwork borne from the trenches as to 'whose prerogative it was to tell the truth about the war, in whose interest and by what means' (2004 p37). Furthermore, there was the question of what medium best told this "truth" – whether paintings or drawings could substitute photography, whether some styles of paintings or drawings were more valuable than others in getting the message across (p38). Clearly this depends on *whose* message, as consensus was inevitably divided even if focussed upon the propagandist and the counter-propagandist. When Gough comments on Nevinson's later conflict work he describes it as having 'an outwardly dry, documentary appearance, an art of exacting reportage' (2010 p111). Paul Peppis employs the same noun in his summary 'Recruitment propaganda disguised as objective reportage' (1997 p49) –

the inference being that an intention existed to shape the concept of one real in order to instigate the construction of another. In the context of the artwork as it pertains to this chapter, this use of the word "reportage" is significant because of its association with something usually considered as being *factually* presented. However, '"casualty free" combat footage and photography that is generally required to obscure bodily suffering, whether by outright avoidance or aestheticization' (Carruthers, 2005 p241), merely speaks of a manipulation of the public into believing a real that is not actually real and which is in this context astounding. The relevance of recording these reflections at this point in the research lies in the dichotomy of how best, then, to pictorially demonstrate a conflict situation. Regardless of whether the illustration is for propaganda or *counter*-propaganda reasons, and whether the pictorial "message" is conveyed through the medium of a poster or a painting, it once more juxtaposes artists' and writers' interpretations of the situations within which they find themselves. Moreover, it indicates the propagandists' need to maintain support for an alternate reality whilst simultaneously making a conscious attempt to suppress the often unpalatable sacrifice necessary to achieve it. When this is considered more specifically in the context of the recruitment poster, the pictorial propagandist's requirement for concealment of the realities of war is unsurprising. Susan Carruthers' employment of the term "aestheticization" [sic] parallels in particular Walter Benjamin's observations cited at the very beginning of this chapter, as well as the concept of embedding a visual construct, for example the serpentine curve indicative of beauty pertinent to this research, within an image as a magnet for a viewer's attention, albeit often resulting in a somewhat disconcerting composition as previously examined.

Virilio claims that despite the existence of textual and other visual documentation regarding war, military recruits still maintain they have no perception of the reality (1989 p47), a situation correlating with the differences that predictably lie between depiction of conflict from the viewpoint of the recruiter as opposed to that of the artist embedded within the machinery of war. Each has his or her own propagandist agenda and therefore a personal vision of a perceived real, and as examples the images at Figures 2, 44, and 83, contrasted with those at Figures 45, 82 and 84 are indicative of this. Cork writes that

> The spawning of instant images by electronic media offers no guarantee of lasting significance. Although television commands unparalleled immediacy, and photographers can define a moment

> with compelling power, there is still a need for the more sustained and meditative insights of the artist (1994, p35).

Even if by these remarks an assumption can be made that the more "honest" representation stems from the soldier-artist's first-hand familiarity of conflict, it nevertheless still appears too difficult to demonstrate the experience to those who have no concept of what to expect. Leed argues that war might be better comprehended by those not directly involved if they perceive it in the form of a reality they can understand, namely that soldiers are workers in an ordinary, albeit industrialised workplace (1979 p92). What is noteworthy about this particular theory is that the soldiers' subsumption into a workplace that is necessarily mechanised, for example heavy artillery operation, runs the risk of resulting in them being contemplated as part of the machinery and nothing more – as formerly explored – with the consequence that public perception can be allowed to step back from empathetic involvement in a situation simply too difficult to comprehend. Certainly Barbusse believes one would have to be 'mad' to imagine what World War I trench warfare is really like and so it literally remains impossible to do so; this may go some way to explain why civilians, at least on occasion, veer towards the other extreme, describing the situation as 'beautiful' (1926 p325). Alternatively, it could be the manifestation of a "something beautiful" concealed within the horror that is coveted and consequently clung on to, and when this "something beautiful" is visually portrayed as a *line of beauty* and incorporated either overtly or otherwise into an artwork it serves as a visible continuum with a recognised ability to attract, as has been examined throughout this research. In allying the *line of beauty*'s literal expression of movement at its most beautiful with its additional value as a metaphoric representation of movement from one reality towards a perceived ideal "real" – the propagandist's objective – it signifies that the literal and metaphorical connotations of this pictorial trope are not necessarily mutually exclusive. Regardless of the reasoning behind it, as already reflected upon soldiers – including soldier-artists – often suspend the reality of their situation; it is therefore unsurprising that civilians, with all the distractions of life away from the Front Line, find it beneficial to do the same.

Another aspect to further add to the equation is the reasonable assertion that if the viewing public regarded conflict artwork from World War I to be overtly propagandist then it ceased to be considered as 'art' (Malvern, 2004 p44). Lewis, in justifying the delay of the second edition of his publication *Blast*, writes that the contributors were generally painters, and as such were painters first and foremost, being 'only

incidentally Propagandists'; consequently 'they do their work first, and, since they must, write about it afterwards' (1981b p7). Lewis's observation arguably supports the concept that the creation of an artwork should be separated from the subsequent critique of that work, reflecting comments made previously in this text. In addition, Lewis' remarks emphasise that an artist's intention is primarily concerned with the creation of an artwork and not the *response* to that artwork, which is counter to the fervent propagandist's requirement, especially when considering a propaganda artwork that takes the form of, for example, a recruitment poster. Analysis of the success of World War I conflict artwork, including some of the paintings conceived by Nevinson, however, was attributed to the 'emotional and expressive response of the viewer', the power, drama and emotion that was both 'seen and felt' (Walsh, 2002 p130). Critics 'mused as to how the formalizing influence of Futurism enhanced this ability beyond anything that an optical reality could offer. Line, form and colour, as a language in itself' (p130). Futurist artwork, as examined in the previous chapter, focussed as much if not more on the emotion of movement rather than on the reality of a literal translation, the "sensations" recorded by the artists' use of "force-lines". The serpentine curve at the centre of this research is therefore interestingly examined in the example of a Nash painting, titled *The Menin Road* [Fig. 86]. Gough utilises the phrase 'serpentine coil' to emphasise the feeling of entrapment initiated by the placement of the channels within the painting (2010 p161). This is a notably compelling juxtaposition when considered in respect of a serpentine curve indicative of a manifestation of movement leading the viewer through, as well as out of an artwork – including a poster designed purely for propaganda purposes. As Gough describes it, this particular use of the curve demonstrates instead a visual construct that keeps the viewer trapped within the image; Gough expresses it as 'the unfulfilled progress into the distance where the "Promised Land" of the horizon is unreachable, locked in some unimaginable future' (p161). Although this appears to be a contradiction of the *line*'s usual aesthetic intention as previously described, "unfulfilled progress", whilst seemingly an oxymoron, is nevertheless still "progress", albeit of a paradoxical nature. Similarly, Ellul speaks metaphorically of a propagandee who is following a route along a road, and continuing to follow it even when there are obvious 'twists and turns'; it is not that he or she is unaware of this twisting and turning, but that the individual is simply 'caught up in the system' (1973 p18). Taking this analogy a step further, if it is accepted that a *line of beauty* represents movement, and movement relates to propaganda because it is about change from the perspective of mobility between one version of a real and another, then even

though following the *line* requires imagination as well as the eye, the path that both follow is smooth and repetitively-oscillating thereby making it easy to resist distraction. Consequently, if one recognises the *line of beauty* as a visual construct that leads the viewer – literally as well as figuratively – out of the picture and beyond to a future reality, "unimaginable" or otherwise, Gough's observation is indicative of a truly counter-propagandist viewpoint that actively contradicts that as offered by the propagandist.

'Prosthetic God'

Taking these points into consideration, and despite a recognition of the requirement for contemporary and therefore arguably more honest pictorial portrayals in the visual archiving of World War I, Viney notes that William Orpen was another official war artist who recorded 'everything with characteristic industry and skill – but coldly, even clinically, and unemotionally, rather than introducing any note of comment' (1991 p27). Viney's observation concerning Orpen's seeming lack of propagandist/counter-propagandist agenda nonetheless poses a question regarding whether an artist who attempts to incorporate the figurative into a deliberately mechanistic framework in an effort to emphasise the "man-in-the-machine" aspect of trench warfare necessarily needs to survey the scene before him in a "cold and unemotional" fashion in order to achieve this. In many ways this is the point, for the reasons cited earlier with regard to empathetic involvement. Such portrayals arguably demonstrate a view held by the artists aware of their and their comrades' roles as "mere cogs in the mechanism", as well as by the authorities – that in the grand scheme of things soldiers can no longer be considered as men or women in and of themselves if the required objectives are to be successfully achieved. Figurative representation feasibly precipitates a more obvious compositional opportunity for incorporation of a *line of beauty*, yet as previously shown this is not an essential requirement as this particular visual construct is often expressed outside the human form. Virilio's observation that the soldier necessarily assimilates into that of a surgical prosthesis is indicative of a combination of both, echoing Freud who writes that

> Man has, as it were, become a kind of prosthetic God. When he puts on all his auxiliary organs he is truly magnificent; but those organs have not grown on to him and they still give him much trouble at times (1930 p44).

The idea of the prosthesis relates back not only to a soldier's subsumption into the mechanism of warfare, but also to Fuller and the appendages she utilised in her

serpentine dance. Fuller's objective was to create something beautiful, resulting in a physical manifestation of literal "Lines of beauty", a complete contradiction to 'the soldier-subject as phallus – the body-psyche as narcissistic-aggressive weapon, autotomic projectile' (Foster, 2010 p16), as observed by Foster. Each aptly demonstrates the concept of precise machinic representation that perfectly encapsulates not only the connection between a "man" and a machine, but also the consequence of what such mechanomorphism is subsequently capable of, "magnificent" or otherwise, and further corroborating and expanding upon this aspect of conflict already addressed. Lewis chooses the term 'Dehumanization', regarding it as 'the chief diagnostic of the Modern World' (1981a p141), an affirmation of the Futurist viewpoint that war is 'the world's only hygiene', therefore justifying the glorification of it (Marinetti, 2009a p22). Foster expands this when he reflects that 'the becoming-machinic of the body is not only a model of armoring but a means to expose the inhuman within the human' (1997 p28): the corporeal subsumed into the prosthetic to the degree that Man can no longer be separated from the Machine in the theatre of war. Haycock believes that First World War artwork is now so fixed within our perception there is difficulty in contemplating Nevinson as being the first English artist to portray the war 'as this hideous, corrupting, faceless mechanism for mass annihilation' (2010 p260). Consequently, in so doing Nevinson was arguably the first to recognise through aesthetic expression that the conventional way of thinking about war, 'the human element, bravery, the Union Jack, and justice' (Nevinson, 1937 p87), was clearly erroneous considering the horrific consequences of a battle which was ostensibly between a human and a machine (Haycock, 2010 p260). Furthermore, these aesthetic interpretations simultaneously emphasise the vast contrast that prevails between these artworks and the pictorial conflict propaganda posters employed by the state. Regardless of the innovative quality of not only representations of conflict from a Modernist perspective but also the exploitation of the pictorial poster as a propagandist tool – a nascent phenomenon in the second decade of the twentieth century – the latter employed the very "conventional" visual constructs of war to attract the viewer that artists such as Nevinson considered to be inappropriate for the era.

With this in mind it is pertinent to recall Viney who, in an echo of Armstrong's remarks regarding *Troops Resting* [Fig. 68], observes that Nevinson's 'semi-Cubist style struck a harsh note which was in keeping with the subjects; his uncomfortable imagery exactly suited the sufferings of the wounded soldiers' (1992 p42). Viney's

use of the word “uncomfortable” is particularly apt when considered in the context of visual constructs that cause disconcertion and disequilibrium in the viewer, and the subsequent conjecture as to whether this relates to uncomfortable compositions albeit deliberately constructed, to images that are “uncomfortable” to view or, more plausibly, a combination of both. The Vorticists for the most part reverted to representation over Abstraction in their recording of the war, yet the question has arisen as to whether Modernist methods of expression are even suitable for the depiction of the horror of warfare, to emphasise the reality of the experience, or to remark on it in an aesthetic fashion (Orchard, 2000 p22). Such an enquiry is at the very least ambiguous: Vorticism and Futurism are undoubtedly productive styles for illustrating the realities of war as these Vorticist and Futurist artists viewed it – both literally and metaphorically – with Abstraction lending itself appropriately to ‘a central nervous system for a work of art, rather than the conventional husk of the old pictorial image’ (McLuhan, 1964 p108). With regard to this particular war it was after all “convention” that was being challenged, including its pictorial conveyance and how this imagery could be portrayed as well as received as effective propagandist and counter-propagandist messaging. Malvern observes that since art was considered as being both ‘selective and interpretative in a way denied photographers, art had both the power and authority to tell it like it was’ (2008 p48); it was this dearth of photographic imagery in Britain that led to the recruitment of official war artists in the first place and Malvern maintains this recruitment ‘changed the nature of British propaganda’ (p48). She writes:

> In order to carry conviction and have authority, in other words to be seen as art and not rhetoric, artists had to work free of constraint but this also made it impossible to predetermine or control all the meanings works of art when circulated might provoke (p48-49).

There was an obvious risk in relation to how artworks by soldier-artists including Nevinson and Nash would be perceived by the general public that was arguably of no significant concern to the authorities when imagery of conflict was constructed and conveyed in a fashion similar to that created by Lady Butler. In the same way recognisable signs and symbols are exploited in the promotion of propaganda through the medium of the poster, national flags and colours are obvious elements to utilise in the pictorial construction of a battle to ensure patriotism and glory is not merely discernible but protrusive. This practice is demonstrative of how a visible continuum with an acknowledged genealogical heritage of which the *line of beauty* is one such construct can be advantageously aestheticised in order to serve a specific purpose. Such pictorial outcomes are propaganda: there is little if any of the

counter-propagandist intention in *Scotland For Ever* [Fig. 77], for example. In addition, and still with this model in mind, the artist was not an active participant at the Front Line, which automatically affects how the reality will be perceived and ultimately conveyed – and then perceived *again*, this time by the viewer comprehending the resultant artwork. The government of the time relied upon the intelligentsia when it came to endorsing its own version of reality with regard to the conflict of World War I and therefore a cultural context was created, which although in effect prohibited political as well as artistic dissension nonetheless did allow some opposition to be expressed (Peppis, 1997 p48). In this way the Vorticists and their allies were able to create 'a body of literary and artistic works that were at once propagandistic and experimental, imperialistic and avant-garde, Edwardian and modernist' (p48), yet unsurprisingly the inevitability is that this could never wholly satisfy the requirements of either the propagandist *or* the counter-propagandist.

Truth/Beauty

This exploitation of constructs to promote one version of reality over another is reflected in Sassoon's articulated disquiet at an apparent necessity that existed for 'the Western Front to be "attractively advertised"' (1930 p262). There is an association between advertising and propaganda that even when considered in this particular context of conflict is neither a flippant nor tenuous one; Moore quotes Creel, the director of the Committee on Public Information who, when America entered the war in 1917, described it as being '"the world's greatest adventure in advertising"' (2010 p110). Nonetheless, the concept of both propagandist and counter-propagandist versions of reality does lead to the conjecture as to whether or not so-called misinformation is always "evil" simply *because* it is deliberately misleading and, equally, whether the straightforward, honest message is always "good" just because it speaks the truth. Of interest in relation to this, therefore, is Peter Sloterdijk's assertion that

> The distinction between authentic and inauthentic seems more puzzling than it really is. So much is clear from the beginning: It cannot be the difference in a "thing" (beautiful-ugly, true-false, good-evil, great-small, important-unimportant), because the existential analysis operates prior to these differences (1988 p201).

When the concept of aesthetic representations of "good" and "evil" is considered not only in this respect but also in the context of Bergson's belief relating to one's susceptibility to suggestion, it again illustrates the requirement for a multi-layered construction of a propagandist message that negates the temptation to ignore the

so-called “grey” areas between the extremes in order to be effective. This is particularly pertinent when taking into account Ellul’s contention regarding efficient propaganda being at least based in truth. However – if blatant use of these emotive terms is considered to be, at best, inappropriate, then there is a valid argument for upholding this only with regard to the ways in which they pertain to certain contextual conditions, because despite their implausibility as universal encapsulations, as alluded to previously they are nonetheless themes which are often exploited, in propagandist messaging as well as in advertising, and this is examined further in the following chapter. Nonetheless, when the concept is considered in the context of pictorial propaganda, a potentially-effective visual trope embedded within an artwork not only emerges as one of these layers but also assists in the clarifying of the concept being promoted, and this is as relevant to mediums of distribution that include the poster as it is to the aesthetic output of a conflict artist. In respect of the pictorial propaganda poster in particular it is of additional import to note Baudrillard’s assertion that ‘simulation threatens the difference between “true” and “false”, between “real” and “imaginary”’ (1983 p5), as this emphasises the focussed requirements necessary for efficient construction of a poster created for propagandist means and also highlights the historical considerations surrounding articulations on absolutes cited earlier in this text.

It is therefore of significance to acknowledge that World War I artwork was considered to be more ‘persuasive’ when the artists possessed an additional legitimacy because they were also serving soldiers, and Malvern observes that ‘the real contest for truth-telling about the war was modern art versus photography’ (2004 p44). From its genesis photography as a genre was believed ‘to be an objective, mechanical transcription of reality’ (Malvern, 2004 p47) and the concept of photographically-capturing “reality” in the form of accurate movement has already been examined, whilst further consideration of its role in the wider ecology of conflict artwork within the temporal boundaries of this research is made in the chapter to follow. Contrasting with photography, however, is ‘the more selective processes of art,’ which necessarily takes into account ‘the sensibility and subjectivity of the artist’ (Malvern, 2004 p47), a reference to intention and interpretation. Peppis believes the more established journalists and writers were highly critical of Modernism in general, believing it to be ‘a decadent distraction from the pressing realities of war’ (1997 p44); although this is an opinion echoed by others even if not universally held, in the light of Futurist and Vorticist viewpoints regarding the mechanistic, movement, and speed, it is a statement which is at the very least short-sighted, as has been

considered in this research thus far. In addition – and of most importance from the perspective of this section of the text – the question is again provoked as to *whose* "reality" is at stake and in what context, for there is a belief 'that truth in itself carries an explosive force, a power of fermentation that will necessarily lead to the end of lies and the shining apparition of the true' (Ellul, 1973 p234). The difficulty comes in not only how to authentically convey this "truth", or how to adequately assess it, but also in establishing what it is the protagonist is aiming to achieve. Sassoon's comments regarding the so-called "advertising" of conflict serve to highlight the contradictions at play, because the reality of war necessarily requires testimonies regarding its 'ugliness, brutality, squalor and sordidness' (Malvern, 2004 p45) but are unlikely to be found in the pictorial recruitment poster circulated by the relevant authorities. In addition, these testimonies, whether represented through pictorial, literary or philosophical distributors are not merely about archiving conflict for historical purposes, for a very 'real' story 'contains, openly or covertly, something useful' (Benjamin, W., 2008 p86), and in the explicit context of whether or not propaganda creates 'truth', this can then only lead to the conclusion that "truth" must be 'powerless without propaganda' (Ellul, 1973 p235).

In order to remain temporally-specific, these points need to be allied with references previously made to the "avoidance or aestheticisation" of conflict casualties as this relates to World War I. It should therefore be acknowledged that as early as 1914 when a propaganda department was established in England – and despite understanding that 'words' were not going to be sufficient to suit its purpose – no picture conceived in France could include 'the dead body of a British soldier' (Viney, 1991 p21-22). Although the reasoning behind this is arguably understandable, it nevertheless is a propagandist manipulation aiming to maintain a real that cannot be actually real. In this respect, Nevinson encountered difficulties concerning one of his paintings of fallen soldiers from 1917. Nevinson originally titled the painting *Dead Men*, but later changed it to *Paths of Glory*. He also toyed with the caption *Shall Their Sacrifice be in Vain?* (Walsh, 2002 p177). In following on from the observations surrounding the Stanley imagery at Figures 23 and 24, even if this titling does not specifically reflect *alternate* versions of reality with regard to the subject matter, it nonetheless reiterates how easy it can be to evoke conflicting contexts simply by the addition of a contributory layer of calculatedly-composed text. Consequently, by advertising conflict in a particular way individuals can be persuaded into believing the propagandist's – or, conversely, the counter-propagandist's – idea of reality. Gombrich writes that 'It is the caption which

determines the truth of the picture' (1977 p59), citing propaganda as an example in that mislabelling of imagery deliberately presents a message that is the truth only insofar as the propagandist intends it, an observation applied to other examples of imagery earlier in this research. Certainly Nash's *Existence* [Fig. 84] similarly demonstrates how titling can convey a very specific construction of a real; in this example, the representation of the soldier huddled in the somewhat tenuous safety of a World War I trench could still have indicated a credible context if the title had been *At Rest*, or *Weary*. Nash's specific use of the noun *Existence*, however, serves to completely encapsulate the concept of the soldier's subsumption into the battlefield that no other descriptive phrase could have summarised so effectively, with or without the additional context that arises when the image appears alongside Figures 83 and 85. This concept is again paralleled in the two Stanley propaganda posters at Figures 23 and 24, in that the caption of the former suggests a less personal request of the propagandee than the more emotive connotation of the latter.

Truth versus Fact

It is a pertinent exercise, in light of the observations made in the previous section, to further analyse the points in conjunction with Leed's observation that

> Just as the meaning of text may not lie in the purposes of an author but in its impact upon those who imaginatively enter it, the meaning of the war was commonly felt to lie in the self-awareness, consciousness, fears, and fantasies that it engendered in those who were forced to inhabit a world of violence they had not created (1979 p36).

The important point here is perception: how the viewer responds to an artwork augmented by captioning, which is especially significant where the propaganda poster is concerned, allied with how conflict as a whole is perceived. In addition is how in this context a viewer's perception can be manipulated by the propagandist anticipating that viewer's prospective response. Varying media utilised for the distribution of propagandist information generates an understanding within the viewer that is further convoluted by the combinations at play, not only with regard to the differing forms but also in how the text interplays with the imagery and the visual constructs employed to create it, including a pictorial trope such as the *line of beauty*. It is therefore apposite to note that Nevinson's chosen title for his 1917 painting *Paths of Glory* is itself misleading – and it is reasonable to assume intentionally so – as it is a phrase from Thomas Gray's eighteenth century *Elegy*

Written in a Country Church-Yard and the complete line reads 'The paths of glory lead but to the grave' (1955 p12). It is significant to reflect upon this in the context of Barthes' observation that whereas at one point it was imagery that clarified text, more latterly the 'text loads the image, burdening it with a culture, a moral, a relationship' (1977 p26), and this is of no less significance to the medium of the poster than it is to the painting. This is further epitomised when specific temporal considerations are taken into account – in this example, the World War I propaganda requirements that representations of the dead should be 'rigidly suppressed', an objective challenged by Nevinson with his response that his picture 'happened to be a work of art' (Walsh, 2002 p177). Nevinson's argument constitutes an interesting perspective in the sense that it is insight into the soldier-artist's priority linked to his or her intention, and all these points are further evidence of the additional layers that can become elements in a construction where the differing relationships between them continue to inform the subsequent impact of the whole. To emphasise his displeasure regarding the situation surrounding *Paths of Glory*, Nevinson exhibited the work in 1918 with the word "censored" emblazoned across it (Walsh, 2002 p178-179). Malvern makes a compelling observation with specific regard to this action: 'Everyone knew what it was they were not allowed to see' (2004, p45). Malvern continues:

> Censored dead bodies were an obvious and unconvincing untruth, easily discredited. It is not a question here, however, of exposing the "truth" about censorship because acts of censorship also reveal anxieties. It is how testimonies of ugliness were used to preserve a regime of truth and contain a specific interpretation of the war, as well as the ways images sometimes escaped containment, that are revealing (p45).

There is an observable connection here to already expressed thoughts regarding arguably unreasonable summations surrounding concepts such as "truth" and "beauty", "good" and "evil", and how one can be used to help disguise the other – for propagandist, or counter-propagandist reasons. This is frequently undertaken pictorially, and can include the visual construct at the centre of this research in achieving this, both in its role as a literal representation of movement at its most beautiful and as a metaphoric symbol of movement as it equates to a perceived transference from one version of reality to another, as has been considered throughout this text. With regard to the focus of this particular chapter it is of interest to note Ellul's clear distinction between 'truth' and 'accuracy of facts', and that it is the relationship between propaganda and the latter that is the more pertinent

concept (1973 p52). When examining the specific utilisation of text, as undertaken earlier in relation not only to Nevinson and Nash but also to poster art in general, how this contributes to the relationship between propaganda and the "facts" obviously reawakens the questions raised with regard to the necessity that lies in its use as a contributory layer in the composition of propagandist artwork. Pound writes that 'The image is itself the speech. The image is the word beyond formulated language' (1970 p88), the assumption therefore being that art intended to "say something" should not, by definition, require textual augmentation. That Nevinson physically covered his own, original image as a way to not only emphasise his point but also to still exhibit, is one example that illustrates the reflections analysed above, and furthermore relates to the concept of how an image's value changes depending on its use, appropriating additional functions in the process, as explored in a previous chapter. In this regard the concept of the "Medium" being the "Message" can, as an example, be applied to Nevinson's painting *Paths of Glory* in the strict context of its uses: the untitled painting and its compositional connotations; the painting with each of its three prospective titles, which may or may not affect those connotations as well as the viewer's ultimate perception of the imagery; the painting with an additional, alternate caption in the form of not only the word "censored" in and of itself but also the physical introduction of a further object in its own right in the medium of the banner upon which the word is inscribed. These factors at play in respect of the combination of contributory elements underscore the process by which the propaganda poster is similarly constructed. Furthermore, in considering the addition of the banner to Nevinson's painting, his original, effectively *counter*-propagandist image attained arguably-intentional supplementary *propagandist* messaging, because of his specific use of the provocative word "censored" – one that in itself carries added weight and therefore value because of the temporal context of World War I.

Bearing all this in mind it is of interest to note Mitchell's assertion that 'the best case of a purely visual medium' is painting, yet he dismisses the actuality of this because of the ways in which paintings are always influenced by language (2013 p7-8). Titling is one aspect, and even *Untitled* as a caption instigates a response from a viewer, and it is discourses such as these that constitute "language" connected to paintings. Critique, discussion, interpretation, translation, intention: these are just some of the elements of a language-attribute attached to a painting or, indeed, other artworks considered as being "purely visual" – and the physical construction of this very research bears testimony to this concept. These theories take on added

resonance when applied to propaganda artwork because of the requirement for clarity in the conveyance of the message and the subsequent perception of the same. In the defined context of propaganda poster imagery, a medium utilised for its ability to not only attract an amorphous crowd but also as a way to subsequently influence and entice the individual within that crowd, it emphasises how every tool in the kit must be utilised by the artist in order to maximise the potential of the medium and the message distributed through it.

Legacy

In relation to artworks that emerged from the battlefields of World War I regardless of their captioning and the language thus assigned to them, what is noteworthy is that there existed in the aftermath an idea that perhaps they could not be classed as art at all (Malvern, 2004 p107). Malvern cites Bell's belief in this regard, that the imagery was not prompted by aesthetic value but purely by the need to pictorially convey the specific subject matter (p107), namely the abhorrent reality of the conflict within which these solder-artists were subsumed. This dichotomy is further highlighted by Malvern's comments with regard to Lewis and Nevinson in particular, that their World War I works of art 'were not quite art and not quite politics, not quite acquiescence and not quite protest' (2004 p107). This is a reflection that at best demonstrates an unnecessary narrowing of context and for seemingly mere categorisation reasons, as though a work of art cannot have more than one purpose – and examination undertaken in this text potentially assists in disputing this premise. Conversely, these reflections also generate a debate as to whether artworks have to have a specific stated "purpose" at all, or at least one that enables the viewer, or more probably the historian or critic, to be able to relegate the work under a heading with which he or she feels comfortable. Such categorisation arguably cannot take into account the artist's thought process as the work is constructed, and therefore the artist's original intention, and certainly does not legislate for the development of contextual considerations – in effect, hindsight – that affects the viewer, whether an historian, critic, or otherwise, as the distance between conception and perception increases. However – artwork created specifically for propaganda purposes, as well as those *intentionally* created to be seen as counter-propaganda, must be considered to possess a definite "purpose" in order to be construed as effective, in the same way propaganda artwork that is not contrived could be viewed as defeating its own objective.

What is pertinent in this respect, and following on from comments made earlier regarding imagery of the dead and wounded, is that representations of injured soldiers did appear in propaganda posters, but only if they were seen to serve a very specific function. This could be as encouragement for the propagandee to enlist in order to aid his or her compatriots, or for money-raising purposes on behalf of organisations including the Red Cross. The former situation is of most significance to this research, yet regardless of the reasoning behind their inclusion these depictions of the wounded were often a 'flat caricature' (Kinder, 2009 p347), indistinct illustrations that stripped the soldier of his 'nationalist markers' (p348) and these design elements highlight certain contradictions relating to posters constructed in this way. Although the lack of recognisable insignia removes the suggestion of weakness that might be attributed to one particular area of the armed forces or another – a consideration propagandists undoubtedly need to be conscious of – it nevertheless assists in separating the viewer from a requirement for empathetic involvement. An unrecognisable provenance equates to an unrecognisable soldier, therefore from the point of view of the onlooker the soldier ceases to represent a fellow countryman, and still less the viewer's son, or brother, or friend, thereby lessening the compunction the viewer may have to respond as the propagandist intends. Furthermore, these particular posters exhibited a deficit of actual *injury* (Kinder, 2009 p348), although after the war photographs of horrifically-injured servicemen were distributed as part of anti-war campaigns (p360). In this regard,

> Such images force the viewer to confront what modern war does to human flesh – to acknowledge that the meeting of technology and the soldier's body is not always benign but can be traumatic, destructive, and frequently disabling (p360-361).

Not only does this emphasise the disconnect between the somewhat sanitised pictorial propagandist depictions and the reality of warfare, it also demonstrates that the meld of the technological and the corporeal does not always result in an *extension* of "human capabilities". The "prosthesis" is reduced to its literal purpose, arguably one required by the soldier in order for him or her to continue to function – outside, rather than inside, a battlefield situation. As an expansion of these points, and with specific reference to American World War I soldiers, John Kinder writes that there is no visual record of the psychologically-injured, and this extensive mass of conflict casualties is consequently 'rendered largely invisible' (2009 p365). When this point is considered in light of observations made previously concerning imagery towards which a viewer is attracted, not in spite of but arguably *because* of an

incongruity, it is a reminder that 'we notice only when we look for something, and we look when our attention is aroused by some disequilibrium, a difference between our expectation and the incoming message' (Gombrich, 1959 p148). This combination of concepts results in artworks of which Lewis' post-war painting *A Reading of Ovid (Tyros)* [Fig. 87] can serve as an apt example. In keeping Kinder's comment in mind, Richard Humphreys' suggestion that the rigid smiles on the faces depicted in Lewis' painting are as a result of World War I 'trauma-induced fixed expression' (2004 p43) is noteworthy, and in addition is an idea which echoes Sassoon's thoughts regarding the soldiers he encountered at the Front Line. Sassoon writes:

> I believe that there is submerged horror in their souls. They cannot think; they dare not think it out. The situation appals them. So they try to forget, and this passes for courage. Their hectic gaiety is the stuff that stimulates war-correspondents to enthusiasm (1936 p188).

Supplementary to highlighting the disquiet felt regarding the way in which the conflict in general and the soldiers caught up in it in particular were perceived by those not directly involved, Sassoon's pathos inadvertently assigns a language-attribution to Lewis' painting that cannot be ascertained from its caption. When this is further analysed in the context of Humphreys' and Kinder's comments it once more alludes to that indication of beauty, contextualised in this example in the overt facial characteristic of the curvature of a smile, yet a smile that barely conceals something execrable that inevitably lies beneath.

When it came to a more general aesthetic commemoration of the fallen of World War I, however, it 'was a matter of capitalising on the moment while expressing the hope that there was a future' (Malvern, 2004 p76) – an exemplification of movement between one reality and an alternate, seemingly superior, perceived real. This overtly-propagandist agenda was felt to be more authentically conveyed by soldier-artists actually present in the conflict than to postpone and create something derived from archival material. In an echo of the points made throughout this research regarding a viewer's involvement, experiential portrayals were deemed to elicit more empathy, with the consequence that the resulting imagery could potentially have a greater impact upon the viewer; consequently the body of work would prove to be a more fitting memorial (Malvern, 2004 p76). Nevertheless, it is necessary to acknowledge Leed's assertion that even among the soldier-artists disparate personalities recorded the experience differently (1979 p37), and although aesthetically-speaking Modernism may have been one connective thread, it did not assume a mantle that was all-encompassing. Leed maintains that what most

commonly lingered did not take the form of ‘an impression, a stimulus that was somehow preserved, but a perspective, a construction that was placed over the realities of war’ (p125). Leed’s reflection summarises aptly the focus of this chapter, concentrating as it does on the aesthetics of conflict: propaganda and the recruitment poster in particular, *and* counter-propaganda as articulated through artworks from the battlefields, and the subsequent representations of a real contained within each insofar as this latter concept falls within the scope of the research. Furthermore it highlights the points made previously regarding an object that encapsulates an era, and both so-called counter-propaganda artwork conveyed via the medium of a painting that includes those created by Nevinson and Nash, and a propaganda poster, particularly one created for distribution of information related to the recruitment drive, have a place as a signifier of the visual culture of an epoch. Both art forms are nonetheless only part of the wider visual ecology and in the next chapter these ideas are expanded to reflect this; consequently the position of the conflict propaganda poster is further assessed alongside the simultaneous focus upon the portrayal of the *line of beauty*, and its ongoing relationship with both the literal and metaphorical manifestations of movement.

Gauging the Conflict Propaganda Poster within the Wider Visual Ecology

In continuing the examination of the role of the *line of beauty* as a pictorial trope with a genealogical heritage contained within early twentieth century visual conflict propaganda, and in order to further focus on the propaganda poster as it pertains to the parameters of this research, it is necessary to assess the poster separately from that as a functional object in and of itself, as well as in addition to the aesthetic response to the medium as examined in the previous chapter. The propaganda poster is intended as a complement to other forms of propagandist messaging, and a viewer's response to one particular medium is influenced by other competing media. With this in mind, and in support of the poster's position within this specific propagandist environment, it is productive to examine its place within the wider visual ecology, including its relationship with the poster that functions as a medium for consumer culture. This is a relevant process because of the relationship that exists between the two genres. During World War I public opinion was regarded as being of national importance and individuals became more conscious of the 'message-making institutions of the state' persistently addressing them via mass communication, methods of information-distribution which includes posters, as well as newspapers and film (Clark, 1997 p7). Interest was therefore activated in what could be learned from the growing advertising industry and how this could subsequently be applied to the business of mass inducement, especially with regard to creating posters that endeavoured to sell politics in a similar fashion to the way commercial products were sold (Lawrence, 2006 p193). This transference was not completely straightforward: advertising for commercial products is generally directed at the product itself, whereas political posters – propaganda – require concentration upon preferences within a constricted context because any choice there may be is likely to be extremely limited (Thompson, 2007 p184-185). This is inevitably highlighted when the context is further contracted, as it is during times of conflict including World War I. However, there are similarities that lie in the 'marketing and merchandising' of not only 'objects' but also 'ideologies' (Baudrillard, 1983 p125) and it is this connection that is of interest within the boundaries of this text.

Taking this into consideration it is pertinent to note Moore's assertion that, without doubt, awareness of being manipulated by propagandist messaging during the First World War meant public attitudes towards propaganda toughened, and as a consequence advertising and public relations were deliberately excluded from its

denotation (2010 p8). In this specific context, and despite contemporary dictionary denotations accentuating a political, often spurious connotation, Moore's suggested separation is arguably somewhat naive, as the concept of promoting a perceived real lies as comfortably under public relations and advertising headings as it does under a propagandist one. As a result, O'Donnell and Jowett maintain 'There is little doubt that under any definition of propaganda, the practice of advertising would have to be included' (2012, p151). The propagandist's role, if not necessarily to attempt a dramatic *change* in one's opinions, rather aiming, as formerly noted, to magnify already-present inclinations and incite the propagandee to action, is a strategy which could be achieved by the advancement of argument based purely on reason (Moore, 2010 p9). Moore, in a reflection of the points raised in the *Introduction*, views this approach as 'persuasion', but recognises that more effective is the manipulation of emotions, a tactic he unsurprisingly declares as 'propaganda' (p9), and the propagandist's requirement for an emotional response from the propagandee has been examined throughout this text. With regard to propaganda borne from the necessities of wartime security considerations, concerns relating to soldier and civilian morale, as well as the promotion of a perceived real for political purpose, it is arguably a mistake to think there is no effective way of criticising 'matters of fact' from the perspective of how this intelligence is conveyed, without stepping back and concentrating on the 'conditions that made them possible', as this requires the uncritical acceptance of exactly what these facts are (Latour, 2004 p231). This chapter therefore aims to examine the conditions of possibility that relate to the wider visual ecology and the poster's place within it, in the context of the era as well as the communication technology available at the time. In conjunction with this objective, the chapter continues to focus on the utilisation within these further-defined parameters of both the literal and metaphoric manifestation of the *line of beauty*.

The 'Repeatable Pictorial Statement'

By the end of the nineteenth century the use of the 'exactly repeatable pictorial statement' was customary, not only in newspapers, but also in books and advertising, as well as in propaganda (Ivins, 1969 p93), and although it is the visual construct embedded within the image as it relates to the latter genre that is at the centre of this research, the connections that lie between the different media and subject-matters are important to examine for contextual reasons. Of equal relevance is the genealogical link, because of how this supports assertions already made with regard to the visual construct, as well as in respect of how it underlines

the relevance of the pictorial medium in the wider visual ecology. It is therefore pertinent to acknowledge that Hogarth designed and constructed trade cards for businesses, and the example of *Ellis Gamble's Trade Card* [Fig. 88] illustrates a form of eighteenth century advertising whilst additionally demonstrating the appearance of a *line of beauty* apparent within Hogarth's work prior to his 1745 self-portrait. Almost a century and a half later, Ivins' "repeatable pictorial statement" is similarly represented by the untitled Albert Robida sketch at Figure 89. The Robida caricature appears somewhat prescient in its representation of the concept of mass communication in the medium of a "home movie" – that is to say, television – and conveys an interesting alliance of genres relating to a genealogical thread captured in one nineteenth century image. Moreover, the visual trope central to this text and distinctive as a design construct is also articulated through the subject matter of dance, a common means by which the *line of beauty* can be expressed as previously explored. Political graphics relating to conflict encompass those published in periodicals including *Punch*, and therefore Ellul's conjecture that individuals are not swayed by the editorial dogma in a newspaper they buy, but instead seek the newspaper whose style tallies with their own beliefs and purchases accordingly (1973 p104) is noteworthy. This albeit somewhat simplistic assessment is not a behavioural condition limited to the twentieth and twenty-first centuries: the rise of the so-called "middle class" in eighteenth century England initiated a search for 'sympathetic reflections' in what individuals saw and read (Shesgreen, 1973 pxiv). The requirement was therefore created for the acquisition of literature and artworks to offer uncomplicated explanations of life, conveyed in an 'unadorned and lucid' fashion; the public hungered for 'compelling statements of the moral values which were uniquely theirs' (pxiv). This is an attitude that not only correlates with Ellul's assertion noted above, but also with the concept of empathetic involvement, as reflected upon previously and which is considered more fully later in this chapter. The increase in demand and subsequent expansion in the publication of relevant newspapers and periodicals in the eighteenth century was the climate within which Hogarth produced the engravings separate to those for the promotion of other people's businesses. These were often satirised, visually interpretative representations of social commentary (Shesgreen, 1973 pxiv), an objective no less desirable then as now, and equally as relevant during times of conflict, as illustrated in drawings portrayed in *Punch* during World War I [Figs. 90 and 91]. With regard to *Punch* in particular, Figure 90 has been selected as an illustrative example because of its association with Modernism and the mixed reception this new method of aesthetically depicting war received during and immediately after the First World

War. The Abstraction-influenced *line of beauty* within the painting contained within the image is therefore notable, and reflected in the second *Punch* cartoon at Figure 91. In this latter instance, the construction of the line of soldiers is indicative of a visual ellipsis, and so the viewer's intuitive recognition of the visual trope in the form of the serpentine curve allows the continuation of the curvature to be implied in order to form the *line of beauty*. In addition, the *line* expresses motion in the context of soldiers who serpentine away from the viewer, moving through to what is inevitably an uncertain future. A temporally-relevant propagandist articulating a similar *line*, one that is often found construed in a recruitment poster of the era, might offer movement from one version of reality to another, "better" real. Even without the benefit of hindsight this is unlikely to be evoked from the *Punch* representation, especially given the date of its creation. The idea behind this specific utilisation of a *line of beauty* within a propaganda/counter-propaganda pictorial interpretation is examined further later in this chapter.

Ellul's observation that propaganda is at its most effective when concentrated on collective interest clearly supports the idea of pictorially-conveyed social commentary, despite its often satirical, *counter*-propagandist intent. However, it is relevant to remember it is the individual within that collective to whom any influence is aimed via the carefully calculated and composed, often purely visual message (Cialdini, 2007 p156), the intention being that the mass, whether literal or organic, will be motivated into action. With this in mind it is apposite to reflect on Baudrillard's description of advertising as being 'vaguely seductive, vaguely consensual' (1994 p87), a theory easily assignable to the perception of propaganda, especially when considering Ellul's observation that a propagandee can be considered as complicit in the manipulation, given the right conditions. Nevertheless, Baudrillard's choice of "vaguely" seems a somewhat benign adjective to employ as this counteracts the perceived immediacy of both advertising and propagandist messaging, particularly that conveyed through the medium of a poster. What should be considered in this context, therefore, is the proposed length of a campaign: the concept of information mithridatism suggests an individual exposed to a slowly-delivered message will cease to comprehend the manipulation of his or her emotional and intellectual responses. Consequently it is pertinent to consider that

> In advertisement the intellectual process can be watched apart from its ethical implications, and advertisement and party politics are becoming more and more closely assimilated in method. The political poster is placed side by side with the trade or theatrical

> poster on the hoardings, it is drawn by the same artist and follows the same empirical rules of art (Wallas, 1920 p43).

The "assimilation" Graham Wallas remarks upon upholds the idea of mithridatism, particularly if an individual consciously feels comfortable with the concept of advertising yet would argue against his or her compliance in respect of messaging considered to be of a more overt propagandist nature. With regard to the "rules" a poster artist might follow, these have been examined elsewhere in this text and include the premise of a recognisable visual construct utilised because of its ability to attract. Therefore, in conjunction with the similarities between poster-design genres referred to earlier, this theory is illustrated in the images at Figures 92-94. Utilising these particular posters as examples, the concept of "common ownership" of an image as well as the visual constructs contained within its composition can be analysed alongside the idea of popular culture's "visual codes". As already demonstrated, one way this is expressed is in the practice of adapting existing artworks to create others, often altering their context in the process and consequently the artist's original intention. Not only is an artwork transformed when it takes on an additional function, for instance in the conveyance of either advertising or propagandist messaging via the medium of the poster, the design concepts within it are also transferable from one genre to another, signifying once more the genealogical thread of the pictorial trope of the *line of beauty*. As is clear in the examples at Figures 92-94, the promotion of a consumable product, the marketing of a movie, and the call to arms, all possess a commonality with regard to the visual codes employed in the posters' constructions, including utilisation of the *line* as portrayed in these instances through the movement of the horse and rider. This latter point is an interesting addendum in itself to the legacy of Marey's and Muybridge's research: the ability to effectively suggest movement in this way, that is to say statically, benefits from those experiments undertaken in chronophotography and recalls Boccioni's comments regarding "a horse in movement". What is necessary to remember, as formerly reflected upon, is that how a viewer perceives the suggestibility of this movement within an image is crucial to how he or she responds, not only to the image as a whole but also to the metaphoric as well as literal connotations attributed to the contributory elements within the construction.

'The Actual Fact of War'

When considering Hogarth's named *line* as not only being indicative of movement in and of itself but also symbolic of beauty embedded within the artwork as a focus for attraction, it is pertinent to ally the comments made in the previous section with the

theory that ‘The sheen of beauty – in advertising, fashion, cinema, or mass culture’ can be viewed as ‘a spoonful of sugar to help the domination go down’ (Durham Peters, 1997 p10). It was during World War I and immediately following that ‘a new profession developed in response to the demand for trained, skilled specialists to advise others on the technique of engineering public consent, a profession providing counsel on public relations’ (Bernays, 1947 p115). If as noted earlier advertising played its part in influencing propagandist messaging during the First World War, it should also be acknowledged that this growth of propagandist stratagems similarly informed the wider objective of capturing post-war public opinion in matters outside a conflict situation. To this end the key arguably lies in the development of the “business” of propaganda – that lessons learned informed post-war growth in advertising because it was understood this burgeoning industry would benefit from similar concentration to that created within distinct departments established during the war where agenda was very specifically focussed. The idea of a so-called “sweetener” in assisting the distribution of the message, however, is especially relevant in times of conflict, and with this in mind it is worth noting that

> It is a great mistake to have a mean notion of the artistic intelligence of the general public, for it has been found to be an invariable rule that the best art is effective, whether you are striving to lure money from the purse, or to persuade young men to go into the army (Gregg, 1918 p94).

Of particular interest in this latter remark regarding art’s influence on the conveyance of information, whether for advertising or propaganda purposes, is the date of its inception, namely that it is a contemporaneous observation associated with the First World War and not one affected by hindsight. Progressive artistic movements in the early part of the twentieth century, including Futurism and Vorticism, were influences on commercial design as well as the aesthetic output of soldier-artists, who at least in some ways as already acknowledged can be considered as *counter*-propagandists. This observation can be expanded and allied to the idea that ‘When the real is no longer what it used to be, nostalgia assumes its full meaning’ (Baudrillard, 1983 p12): in this respect the propaganda of mass culture can assure the reader, listener, or viewer, that he or she does not have to renounce his or her ‘dreams’, regardless of what is eventually achieved (Adorno, 2001 p62). Some deception can therefore be instituted in order for individuals to remain connected to a so-called extended childhood, meaning a nostalgic view of their past might be good preparation for a future that fits with what is required of them (p62-63). Bernays emphasises that when “engineering consent” the importance lies in

first analysing the general public in order to ascertain how and why it acts, not only as individuals but also when those individuals form into a group (1947 p116), a behavioural condition previously examined within this research; Bernays maintains that 'Only after this preliminary groundwork has been firmly laid is it possible to know whether the objectives are realistically obtainable' (p116). This reflects points already considered surrounding Ellul's requirement for propaganda to be grounded in truth, as well as the need to manipulate "nostalgic ideals" in order to formulate at least the veneer of a story by which a prospective future real can be perceived as an attainable objective. Bernays additionally supports the previously-explored concept of the "psychology of the crowd" in his query that 'If we understand the mechanisms and the motives of the group mind, is it not possible to control and regiment the masses according to our will without knowing it?' (2004 p71), thereby reiterating that the stratagems required for the distribution of advertising material parallel those necessary for that of propaganda, and the active growth of this latter "industry" during World War I productively demonstrates this. In this respect it should be remembered that Bernays is writing in the third decade of the twentieth century, analysing First World War propagandist methods that although to some degree were shaped by a contemporaneous if relatively nascent advertising industry nonetheless heavily influenced advertising protocols in the years that followed. Bernays' contention that it is possible to 'effect some change in public opinion with a fair degree of accuracy by operating a certain mechanism…' (p71) is a reminder of the importance of a recognisable construct in the achievement of what can be classed as successful information-distribution and which includes the pictorial trope of the *line of beauty*. Furthermore, the assertion that although propaganda is not scientific in a literal, subject-specific context it cannot be classed as empirical because of the emergence of studies in the field of mass psychology (p72), is reasoning upheld by circular cause and effect in relation to the influence between the two industries under brief examination here.

However, regardless of whether the message being promoted is for commercial or propaganda reasons, in relation to the functional object of the poster as a means of distributing these concepts to the masses the foremost benefit lies in its ability to be placed virtually anywhere in order for it to be seen by everyone. Saturation bill-posting aims to further enhance the objective of repeatedly instilling the message within the viewer and although this can take the form of the same design repeatedly pasted across one hoarding, it can equally apply to a mass rendering of different compositions but which all carry the same core message, as illustrated in Figure 95.

This 1915 photograph demonstrates this latter concept, but the replacement of the recruitment posters with those designed purely for commercial purposes can be easily visualised, as can an arguably incongruous mixture of the two. During World War I the general public was reliant on information almost entirely delivered by official sources, including that generated via saturation bill-posting as indicated in the photograph. Whilst these accounts – which also include media as diverse as newsreels and newspaper reports, and rhetoric supplied by clergy and schoolteachers – generally articulated a 'rosy picture' (Eksteins, 2000 p181), soldiers were unable to declare the actuality of warfare to their families back home. Although there is an inevitable censorship consideration in this, particularly with regard to letters from the trenches, it is pertinent to remember that 'the language and metaphors appropriate to describe the unexpected new experience were lacking' (p181). This declaration upholds the idea of painting as a "new language" of expression, particularly new forms of painting such as Futurism and Vorticism appropriate to a "new" kind of war. Gifford Pinchot's temporally-synchronous observations succinctly summarise the situation:

> Drilling goes on in the parks and other places all day and every day. The shop windows are full of articles for use at the front. War fills the papers and monopolises conversation. But all this fails to make war really felt. None of these, nor the posters calling for enlistment which cover every wall, appear in every shop window, flash across whole blocks of buildings, and decorate every taxi cab ...are sufficient to bring home completely the actual fact of war (1915 p1).

In addition to an endorsement of these points in Virilio's comments concerning new recruits cited previously, there is supposition that despite its ubiquity within the wider visual ecology the poster as an object was not functioning effectively. However, in this particular temporal context it is not the role of the *propaganda* poster to demonstrate the "actual fact of war", but to entice men to enlist by whatever visually-articulated means at the creator's disposal, as considered previously in this text. Pinchot's observation, upheld as it is by the photograph at Figure 95 is further illustrated in the example of the *Britain Needs You At Once* recruitment poster, also from 1915 [Fig. 96]. This metaphoric representation once more manipulates the intransigent concepts of "good" and "evil" and demonstrates how a "mythical" version of a reality can be exploited in the conveyance of an advertising or propaganda message whilst incorporating movement in the imagery suggested by "lines of beauty". Furthermore the image is an apposite illustration of how propaganda works to remove the 'sense of reality' of a situation, to bring about 'a

confusion of motives', meaning that subconsciously a mass can be persuaded to "wage war", not on a disparate collective of adversaries but on a combined group of them to the point where it becomes a singular entity – the "enemy", "evil", or "untruth", for example (Ellul, 1964, p367). Consequently, and in corroboration of Leed's comment regarding "objects of hostility", the subconscious allows the individual propagandee to position a variety of bête-noires under one all-encompassing heading (p367), thereby underscoring a genealogical serpentining from absolute to absolute, as cited in the chapter titled *The Static Representation of Movement in Art and War*. The use of nostalgic and storybook "ideals" in poster art similarly supports the theory, as can be seen in the poster at Figure 96, and a concept further considered later in this chapter.

Constructive Criticism

In addition to the poster, one medium through which information about World War I was pictorially conveyed to the public is artwork that emanated from the Front Line, as explored previously. As further examination of the conflict propaganda poster's place within a wider visual ecology that includes other genres of poster design as well as other media employed for the distribution of propagandist messaging, it is relevant to consider how conflict artwork was *contemporaneously* assessed and described, especially when that artwork is considered in the context of being a response to the state-sponsored poster. Around the end of the First World War an uncredited critic wrote an article entitled *The Influence of the War on Art* and in referring to previous exhibitions of conflict art that emanated from soldier-artists on the battlefields, he or she writes of Nevinson that

> From the very first he stood apart from all other painters of the war by reason of these two things: his extraordinary power and success in suggesting movement, and the implication in all his pictures that modern war is not the affair of human individuals but the creaking progress of a complicated machine (Unknown, c1918 p2).

The ability for the serpentine curve – the *line of beauty* – to represent movement, and its utilisation in artworks pertinent to this research, has been examined throughout this text, along with the concept of a soldier being subsumed into the mechanism of warfare. The significance of this latter point lies in the machinic replication reflected in propaganda in general and propagandist information distributed through the reproducible image in the form of the poster in particular, and equally in the propagandist's requirement for empathetic involvement from the propagandee, as previously described. As noted, the date of the article's origin is of

interest because of the inevitable impact the inference of contemporary critique subsequently reported in newspapers could convey to the public. In praising the Futurists for their ability to successfully render 'the suggestion of movement', the article interestingly attributes this to 'an avoidance of curves' with which 'to suggest the movement of a vast machine rather than of individual human beings' (Unknown, c1918 p2). Clearly this reasoning appears to contradict the very premise of this research, namely that the representation of movement in still imagery is most productively demonstrated via serpentine curvature, specifically the *line of beauty*. Nevertheless, the critique continues with the description of 'slanting lines' utilised in the composition of *Returning to the Trenches* [Fig. 67], and these lines, although not curved in and of themselves, combine to create Abstraction curvature, particularly with regard to the direction in which the soldiers are moving. This relates to Marinetti's comments previously cited regarding straight as well as curved lines in manifesting movement and speed, and it is the combination of both pictorial articulations that is of interest here. The Nevinson image *On The Way To The Trenches* [Fig. 97] is of similar but simpler construction to *Returning to the Trenches*, and consequently assists in further illustrating the point. The pertinent aspect of this concept, with particular regard to these images, is the perspective: if one thinks of the viewer as being at ground level the curvature of the line of soldiers as it continues "round the bend" is distinctive, and indicative of the principle of the visual ellipsis. The *line of beauty*, albeit implicit, is constructed from the utilisation of straight lines, as observed by the critic, to then form a static, two-dimensional example of an elliptic hyperboloid in order to create serpentine curvature within machinic replication, as illustrated at Figure 98. Guillaume Apollinaire's early twentieth century observation that 'Geometry, the science that deals with space, its measurement and relationships, has always been the most basic rule of painting' (2001 p222) ostensibly appears to contradict Hogarth's own assertions regarding a necessary *lack* of mathematical consideration when forming an effective *line of beauty*. However, the comment is qualified by Apollinaire's further contention that although artists have no intention of becoming 'geometricians', it nonetheless can be stated 'that geometry is to the plastic arts what grammar is to the art of writing' (p222). As cited in the *Introduction*, it was the seeking of a "grammar" in artworks that led Hogarth to theorise a language related to aesthetics that subsequently formulated *The Analysis of Beauty* in general and the concept behind the *line of beauty* in particular. When this is examined in the context of the *line* as a pictorial trope utilised for its attraction within an artwork, particularly one of propaganda value

such as the pictorial poster, the idea can be expanded upon: Deleuze's declaration regarding desire is noteworthy in this regard, as he writes that

> Desire is no more symbolic than figurative, no more signified than signifier: it is made up of different lines which cross, articulate, or impede each other and which constitute a particular assemblance on a plane of immanence (1993 p137-138).

The literal as well as figurative context of this use of "lines" in the construction of an artwork is especially apt when considering the *line of beauty*'s multiple connotations in respect of what its presence can represent, and suggestive of an illusionary aspect to a visual construct which appears to be curved yet in reality can be created utilising straight lines, as demonstrated in Figure 98.

In addition to these observations, the example of *On The Way To The Trenches* at Figure 97 enforces the points made in the previous chapter regarding machinic replication as specifically applicable to a particular collection of images within Nevinson's body of conflict artwork. This is not only in respect of Nevinson's use of repetition as it relates to the subject matter and compositional elements contained *within* each of these images (Figures 45, 67 and 97, and endorsed further by Nevinson's study illustrated at Figure 80), but also the values attributed to the works, individually and collectively, when appraised in the context of what is effectively a *reproduction* of each image as an object in and of itself. Furthermore, and in consideration of Nevinson's specific aesthetic output, a 1918 commentary on a 1916 exhibition remarks that the artworks were

> pictures to make men come forward and do their duty for their country. They were full of life, manliness and force; eloquent, interesting, and intelligible to all who were not made blind by prejudice (Dodgson, 1918 p4).

Of import in this declaration is the idea that Nevinson's imagery can be considered suitable for the propaganda cause behind the recruitment drives and therefore a direct correlation with the objectives of the pictorial recruitment poster, as opposed to representing a counter-propaganda viewpoint once the reality of the Front Line was experienced first-hand and pictorially interpreted, as examined in the previous chapter. Campbell Dodgson's description suggests precisely what it is that should be conveyed through the functional object of the conflict propaganda poster in order to instigate the desired effect within the propagandee. However, it is noteworthy that there is no mention by Dodgson of any "machinic" quality as alluded to in the former article, a style of Futurist- and Vorticist-influence in conflict artwork that has

the ability to enable the viewer to separate him- or herself from a requirement for empathetic involvement. Equally as interesting is what Dodgson means exactly by the word "prejudice": it is a feasible conjecture that the reference relates to Futurism in and of itself, as public acceptance of conflict pictorially portrayed in this style was mixed to say the least, as previously acknowledged. The article titled *The Influence of the War on Art* comments on Nevinson's marching men as being 'certainly not painted as the camera would see them, but they are indisputably alive and moving' (Unknown, c1918 p2), demonstrating once more an endeavour to capture the *emotion* rather than the *accuracy* of movement. There is a triangular connection between artist, critic and the public that is particularly relevant when viewed in the context of the wider visual ecology pertaining to the parameters of this research: although as already highlighted not everybody was complimentary with regard to Futurist and Vorticist interpretations of conflict for reasons of aesthetic predilections, there was in addition the consideration that an unpalatable truth was being conveyed regarding the reality of life on the battlefields. For reasons relating to security, morale, and empathetic involvement, not everyone believed this version of "reality" should be exposed. Lewis cites a journalist who regarded the work of fellow Vorticists William Roberts and Edward Wadsworth, as well as his own, as 'Prussian Junkerism'; Lewis analyses this and considers that the perhaps somewhat 'strange' compositions are interpreted as 'ferocious and unfriendly' despite them being 'neither' (1981b p78). Lewis continues, with the comments that 'the disciplined movements' that possibly

> cause misgivings in the unobservant as to our intentions, are aesthetic phenomena: our goddess is Beauty, like any Royal Academician's though we have different ideas as to how she should be depicted... It is too commonly suggested that rigidity cannot flower without "renouncing" itself or may not in itself be beautiful. At the worst all the finest beauty is dependent on it for life (p78-79).

The presence of a *line of beauty* within these conflict artworks corroborates Lewis' concerns with regard to aesthetic intention, and his use of the word "rigidity" is especially relevant to themes already examined, not only to the idea of machinic repetition in general, but also to the concepts cited in this section of the chapter regarding curvature generated by the strategic placement of straight lines. Equally, Lewis' reference to that which "may not in itself be beautiful" underscores ideas considered in this text, including Augustine's thoughts concerning desire in the attraction of something repugnant, regardless of its ultimate effect on the viewer.

Advertising Attraction

The latter point above is reflected in Sassoon's comments concerning an article entitled *War Pictures at the Royal Academy*, asserting that by the tone the correspondent appears to be 'deriving enjoyment from the War', although concedes may not have been conscious this could be construed (1930 p262). Sassoon goes on to query why 'it was necessary for the Western Front to be "attractively advertised"' (p262), a question considered previously in this research. Not only was there a propagandist need to "advertise" a perceived reality of what conflict would be like for new recruits, there was also a requirement to advertise a future real that, ultimately, they were fighting for, examples of which are present in recruitment posters of the era. The 1915 poster *Your Country's Call*, illustrated at Figure 99 as a case in point, intimates a *line of beauty* suggesting movement via progression along the road in the foreground and through the valley represented by the overlapping patchwork of fields, before continuing out of the image to whatever lies beyond. When this is compared to the *Punch* cartoon at Figure 91, it clarifies the observations made in that section of the chapter regarding propagandist and counter-propagandist viewpoints, including the subsequent differing interpretations of a real as conveyed pictorially. In addition, the practice of substituting the "visit it" advertising concept with the propagandist "save it" campaign as an inducement to the viewer, was as relevant to World War I as to other twentieth century conflicts. In this regard,

> a feeling for a countryside under threat could also motivate a sense of self-defence as self-love and self-sacrifice that transcended not only individual self-preservation but also the obvious incidental causes of war in favour of an abstracted essence of Englishness located in the country (Malvern, 2004 p23-24).

Malvern's comments are pictorially articulated not only through the *Your Country's Call* poster [Fig. 99] but also in the adapted posters at Figures 27 and 29. Moreover, Baudrillard's previously-cited assertions concerning the connection between "objects" and "ideologies" can also be considered in this context, and are further reflected in the idea that 'By claiming to anticipate fulfilment through their aesthetic derivatives, it posits the real forms of the existing order as absolutes' (Horkheimer and Adorno, 2002 p103). As these "absolutes" include "good" and "evil", "beauty" and "truth" – subsequently underscoring how 'the claims of art are always also ideology' (p103) – a circular cause and consequence is revealed in respect of the motives and methods of the propagandist. Furthermore, although

during this prescribed era there was no radio, no television, and certainly no twenty-four-hour rolling newsfeed, the propagandist needed to make as much use as possible of the different media available (Ellul, 1973 p9), including the functional object of the poster. It is too difficult to ascertain exactly what the British public really knew and understood at the time from the media about the Western Front; there was an eclectic array of reporting from journalists and the newspapers they worked for, and the dilemma was, as always, 'between patriotic support for the war and a desire to convey its terrible nature' (Badsey, 2011 paragraph 18). The government, however, systematically 'promoted its official films and photographs as displaying the true nature of war to the public' (2011 paragraph 19) – a "true nature" undoubtedly weighted to suit and serve a specific purpose and which is examined more fully later in this chapter. Nonetheless, it was during the First World War that the merging of genres and media was initially employed – 'the application of publicity and advertising methods to political affairs' (Ellul, 1973 p232). It is this connection that is important to assess when considering the position of the poster, not only in respect of the wider visual ecology and the competing and contrasting methods of communicating information within it, but also the design constructs utilised in the expressing of that information through a pictorial medium. Bearing in mind the concept of the manipulation of nostalgic ideals relating to an individual's past, it is relevant to cite the following:

> The purpose of publicity is to make the spectator marginally dissatisfied with his present way of life. Not with the way of life of society, but with his own within it. It suggests that if he buys what it is offering, his life will become better. It offers him an improved alternative to what he is (Berger, 1972 p142).

John Berger is clearly referring to advertising, yet the correlation between the modus operandi of publicists and the motives of propagandists working with a perhaps somewhat more dubious rationale is evident: the mere substitution of the word "propaganda" for "publicity" demonstrates this point without compromising the original context of Berger's intent. In fact Berger himself blurs the two when he observes that 'The means of reproduction are used politically and commercially to disguise or deny what their existence makes possible' (1972 p32), which underscores the values and functions of imagery intended for replication purposes, as is the case with the advertising as well as the propaganda poster. What is noteworthy is Berger's assertion that the "improved alternative" does not necessarily relate to the situation, but to the individual him- or herself. This supports the suggestion that although it has always been essential to instil within individuals

'ideological and sentimental motivations to get them to lay down their lives', in times of war it is even more important for them to 'be given strong impulses' and 'good enough reasons for his sacrifices' (Ellul, 1973 p142-143). The means of manipulation through disguise or deniability is interesting when considered in the context that it is a mistake to think the individual is not culpable in his or her lack of resistance to either propaganda *or* advertising, and as a genealogical endorsement it is worth acknowledging that Hogarth was writing about the idea of "subliminal messaging" as far back as the 1750s (1997 p20). This latter concept is one with which Adorno concurs in his observation that 'the dream industry' does not manufacture the 'dreams' of the consumers but instead introduces the 'dreams' of the purveyors to the public (2001 p93). Alongside these observations, Bergson's affirmation in respect of both resistance and suggestibility considered previously demonstrates the conditions of possibility whereby a more meaningful reality can be seen to be attainable through movement – through a change in cultural, social, or ideological conditions. To this end the concept of a visible continuum again demonstrates a perception on the part of the viewer that is ripe for propaganda purposes when considered as a layer in a construction; this takes both a literal and metaphoric form, in the sense that if something is 'constructed' then it is 'fragile and thus in great need of care and caution' (Latour, 2004 p246). This is a theory worth considering in the context of a critique of propagandist messaging as it specifically pertains to the parameters of this research, as "fragile" tends to bring to mind characteristics less divisive than those normally associated with the propaganda machine. Nevertheless, the obvious need to keep an arguably mythical reality alive undoubtedly requires something akin to "care and caution". The cautious construction of both present and future realities through nostalgic perceptions of the past combined with ideological concerns, and the potential movement from one reality to the other, relies upon a visible continuum, something tangible the propagandee can relate to and consequently believe in. From the point of view of pictorial representations of the same, this is aptly demonstrated by the prudent assemblage of design constructs that includes the contribution of a visual trope in the form of a *line of beauty*. A suitable conclusion to this section of the chapter is the idea that Nevinson's artwork, previously perceived at least from the point of view of the critic as arguably assuming a propaganda role, can be considered conversely. Along with other aesthetic representations that were products of first-hand experience of the Front Line, these artworks "unattractively advertised" life on the battlefields of the First World War, whilst remaining true to the reality of it from the specific point of view of the soldier-artist.

Entertainment versus Education

Further to these points, and despite the constructive criticism of his work recorded in certain contemporaneous newspapers as noted earlier, Nevinson remembers that

> The *Times* was horrified and said the pictures were not a bit like cricket, an interesting comment on England in 1915, when war was still considered a sport which received the support of the clerics because it brought out the finest forms of self sacrifice... (1937, p80).

This assessment underlines observations made regarding a propagandist necessity for a manipulated construction of information, whether conveyed pictorially, textually, or a combination of both, in order to promote one version of reality over another. Early *Topical Budget* British wartime newsreels similarly documented 'reports from the home front' rather than of actual conflict, before some later footage depicted scenes from the Fronts in addition to other events (McKernan, 2012 paragraph 5). This latter development emanated from a more sophisticated approach to editing techniques, especially with regard to 'striking compressions of actions, or even of whole battles, within the short time-frame of the newsreel story' (2012 paragraph 6). Eisenstein remarks most pertinently, however, on the additional, disparate stances that can be given to the same account depending on political and social partialities of the editorial personnel, a propagandist practice as applicable to other media as it is to film (2010 p154), and which has been analysed in relation to poster adaptation in particular previously in this text. What is principally notable in relation to this is the comment that

> The lesson learned by the propagandists, in placing their newsreel on the marketplace in competition with other newsreels, was that exclusive access to the official war footage was not enough. The newsreel had to include popular, general items, even at times had to appear not to be a war newsreel at all, if it was to gain a wider acceptance, which would in turn allow it to get its messages across (McKernan, 2012 paragraph 6).

As a means through which information is conveyed, the newsreel did not compete only with other newsreels but with a variety of media including the pictorial poster. Luke McKernan's assertion aligns with the observations made so far in this section of the text, and contributes to the concept of the circular cause and consequence existing at that time between pictorial propaganda, a counter-propaganda reaction, and a further propagandist response to that reaction, as reflected upon in the previous chapter. Supplemental to this is the stance placed upon the messaging distributed via newspaper and periodical reports, and all this contributes to a

viewer's perception of the visual material he or she encountered at the time. Another consideration is the premise shared with that of effective poster construction, in that "more must be suggested than is said": as intimated in McKernan's observation, a utilisation of that which is considered as ordinary and acceptable, and therefore more attractive to the viewer, assisting in disguising the true nature of war. This is further illustration of why posters constructed in times of conflict to promote a recruitment drive contain the same design elements as those publicising commercial products or films (Clark, 1997 p103). When all these concepts are collated it is relevant to refer back not only to the idea of common ownership of imagery and visual constructs, but also to the ways in which those constructs are picked up and repeatedly utilised across the years and genres – and the direct correlation of how this latter aspect is translated within the specific medium of film relevant to this research is considered later in this chapter. As already considered, the significance of these points is as applicable to poster design as it is for film, whether for propaganda or advertising purposes. Consequently, in further contextualising the propaganda poster in the wider visual ecology of the era, an additional collaboration is created by the combination of both mediums of distribution, namely the temporally-analogous poster designed for film promotion. "Lines of beauty" in the form of a female figure are evident in the 1914 poster for the Italian film *Cabiria* illustrated at Figure 100. Supplemental to the recognisable visual construct in the poster is the apparent narrative notion of peril and the "something beautiful" that needs to be fought for in the face of something that can be considered as "evil", corresponding with the Spear *Enlist* poster from 1915 [Fig. 26] examined earlier in this research. Alongside the construct of the *line of beauty*, this particular thematic thread is at the very least intimated in Adolfo Hohenstein's advertising poster for a commercial product, created around 1900 and illustrated at Figure 101. In addition is the thread's continuation and more explicit influence perceived within Mikhail Kalmanson's 1917 film poster for *Topiel*, as shown at Figure 102. These linking themes within the poster designs bring to mind the idea that

> Modernity greatly expands our access to images of instantly beautiful others, inviting an attitude of neglect toward beauty's less flashy kinds that escape reproduction by the image. The danger of the mechanically reproduced image, in short, is beauty without history (Durham Peters, 1997 p12).

A work of art's function and subsequent value, whether intended as an original or designed specifically for reproduction, has been examined in the chapter titled *The Poster as a Functional Object*, and the final comment in the John Durham Peters

quotation adds an additional layer to the theories examined in this regard. Nevertheless, when this is considered in the context of the defined boundaries of this research, especially in relation to the mechanically-reproduced imagery of the posters in this last illustrative example, the assertion ceases to be valid as the aesthetic genealogy of the *line of beauty* as a recognisable visible continuum serves to contradict this premise, as has been considered throughout this text. Furthermore, and in order to return to the more specific, conflict propaganda poster, the thematic concepts are again demonstrated in the Harry R. Hopps recruitment poster circa 1917, evidenced at Figure 103. The conflict propaganda poster *Destroy This Mad Brute* [Fig. 103] is indicative of a considerably more overt visual message than is initially discerned from Spear's *Enlist* [Fig. 26], although the central pictorial theme remains consistent. This is not only in the representation of the woman "in peril", but also in the utilisation of the *line of beauty* spiralling through the twisting female form.

In assessing the comparable elements that contribute to the composition of certain conflict propaganda posters and those devised specifically for commercial purposes, especially the promotion of film, an additional perspective is created from which these particular posters can be viewed. In remaining temporally-consistent, the idea of film promotion leads directly to the contextual consideration of film as entertainment for prospective audiences versus its educational value, expanding upon the points made earlier regarding the construction of the World War I newsreel. It should be noted that in general the British civilian population was considered to be participating in the anguish caused by the war, and supplementally tasked with contributing to the winning of it; inherent within this aim, therefore, was the requirement for some form of justification that the sacrifices were worthwhile (Badsey, 1983 p101). As previously examined, posters relating to the recruitment campaign designed in the context of pictorially portraying a reality worth fighting for as an inducement contribute to this approach. Although photojournalism was viewed with distrust, the "official" position with regard to cinema was more of 'indifference', as it was considered to be for purely entertainment value (Badsey, 1983 p100), illustrating the dilemma that existed in how to best take advantage of it as a medium to be utilised in the distribution of propagandist information. With this in mind, Walter Benjamin's comments are noteworthy in that

> nowhere more than in the cinema do the individual reactions that together make up the mass reaction of the audience prove from the outset to be caused by their immediately imminent massing. And in

> making themselves heard, they also check on one another (2008 p26).

This observation is echoed in the concept of "social proof" and the reasoning behind an individual's participative contribution to the actions of the mass. It is also indicative of a paralleling of the formation of a literal crowd with that of an organic mass, thereby further rationalising the logic behind the collective presence, that is to say the communal interest in the film or newsreel being projected. Certainly in respect of the onset of World War I a considerable amount of the 'meaning of a film' was constructed within the auditorium, not only because of the 'accompanying music and sound effects, but more importantly by the reaction in vociferous groans, moans, cheers and shouts' (Hiley, 1995 p164). Taking this a step further is the idea that participation in large-scale events blurs the lines between performer and spectator (Virilio, 1989 p66), with the "performer" in this instance being the soldier on screen. The heightened empathetic involvement this instigates within an audience is a condition with the potential for easy manipulation for propagandist objectives. In the same way that artwork ceased to be considered as "art" if overtly propagandist (Malvern, 2004 p44), however, the general public tended to avoid anything cinematic if similarly presented; in an echo of Ellul's remarks cited earlier, propagandist film messaging was only deemed to be acceptable to audiences if they were already of a like-minded persuasion (Reeves, 1999 p27 and endnote p46). In placing the poster in general and the conflict propaganda poster in particular within the wider visual ecology of the era, and in consideration of both complementary and competitive functions of other contemporaneous media, it is the footage of the feature-length film *The Battle of the Somme* that is examined more closely at this point in the research. Alongside conflict artwork, *The Battle of the Somme*, filmed and distributed in 1916, is a predominantly pictorial medium and therefore a productive example for demonstrating within its composition the contribution of the construct that is the *line of beauty*.

The War as Film

As acknowledged, *The Battle of the Somme* demonstrates a means by which a physical appearance of a *line of beauty* can be compared against this construct's use as a static representation of movement in other media – and genres – of artwork, including the pictorial poster, whilst its recurring appearance across all strengthens its position in general as a visual trope. In addition is the film's contribution to the debate regarding competing constructions of the real, and the messaging of the same to the viewers as propagandees: the connective thread

continues to be that of movement, as this relates to propaganda's objective of promoting the ideal of a more meaningful reality towards which the propagandee will be enticed. In a continuous assessment of the connection between the *line*, its ability to express movement, and the subsequent correlation of both within the wider visual media ecology, it is necessary to acknowledge that 'Tempo and dynamism are paramount', to the point where perpetual motion has overridden the requirement for anything to remain the same (Horkheimer and Adorno, 2002 p106). Furthermore, if 'only the universal victory of the rhythm of mechanical reproduction promises that nothing will change, that nothing unsuitable will emerge' (p106-107), then this not only underlines how mobility is essential in maintaining at least the illusion of change, it also emphasises the importance of the "repeatable pictorial statement" in endorsing the premise. The concept of concealing or, conversely, revealing the "unsuitable" continues to be considered throughout this chapter.

The Battle of the Somme was not consciously devised as a full-length documentary (Smither, 1993 p150). Although by and large 'well-received', some of the first newsreels contained imagery of military training as well as more overtly dramatised scenes configured to be perceived as emanating from the battlefields, with the consequence that the trade, finding them not only 'suspect' but also 'dull, ...pressed for a more honest and dramatic record of the war' (Badsey, 1983 p104). Propaganda by its very nature is the manipulation of not only the truth from which it draws its legitimacy but also of the propagandee towards whom it is directed, and it is therefore pertinent to consider how much of what was presented during the First World War the general public took at face value. Certainly, whether

> Rightly or wrongly, wartime propaganda became synonomous [sic] with lying. Lying goes against the chivalric code of duty and honor in warfare. It is also hard to justify an official ministry of lying if one has claimed, as the Allies often did, that the War was a great moral crusade, with one's own side holding the monopoly of rightness and goodness and the best in European and Western culture (Messinger, 1993 p123).

With this in mind it is easy to understand why advertising was apparently excluded from the denotation of propaganda around this time, and further analysis of the concept of "truth" as it pertains to this research in general and this chapter in particular is examined in a following section. However, it is nevertheless necessary to recognise, before additional analysis of *The Battle of the Somme* in its context of an official distribution of information, that propaganda and censorship contributed to

the blurring of the reality of war for civilians in the respect that it was unacceptable for them to understand exactly how the war was developing (Eksteins, 2000 p233):

> Defeats were presented as victories, stalemate as tactical maneuvering. Truth became falsehood, falsehood truth. As euphemism became the official order of the day, language was turned upside down and inside out (p233).

This emphasises points made in the previous chapter regarding arguably unrealistic summations of concepts through emotive terms, and in addition more elaborately demonstrates the disconnect between certain recruitment posters and the aesthetic response of conflict artists. Therefore, even though the authorities might not have declared that every relevant scene in *The Battle of the Somme* was filmed at the Front Line whilst combat was actually taking place, it arguably can still be construed this was exactly the impression they intended to convey to the viewing public.

Further to this is the use of a silent film's title cards and if it can be said these function in a similar fashion to a sound film's spoken commentary, then the prescribed dogma related to the film is conveyed through these appendages (Reeves, 1999 p32). The title cards specific to this film, temporally-incongruent as they are – as opposed to image and text which are temporally-related – may be considered as having missed an opportunity to express propagandist messaging that could have added to or enhanced a particular context (p33), highlighting Eisenstein's comments on disparate stances noted previously. Regardless, because they *are* temporally-incongruent, there inevitably still exists a certain manipulation within the title cards of *The Battle of the Somme*, in that at the very least they serve to direct a viewer's emotional response. Although something similar can be said for the temporally-synchronous perception of a propaganda poster with a textual element in the form of a caption – and Spear's *Enlist* poster [Fig. 26] is an apt example – the pre-scene title card of a newsreel injects anticipation into the equation, thereby serving as significant signposting for the viewer as propagandee. An example of this within *The Battle of the Somme* lies in title card number 59 which refers to Gunners and Highlanders as 'CHEERY' (2008, time code 1:09:08, capitals in the original) and which therefore suggests to the onlooker a behavioural condition applicable to the soldier before the spectator views the relevant scene. In addition, this particular example contains echoes of the comments surrounding Lewis' *A Reading of Ovid (Tyros)* [Fig. 87] examined in the previous chapter; this concept of emotive editorial direction is further explored later in this text. Nicholas Reeves writes that the method of titling undertaken – one

which continued throughout the war – indicated a clear distinction between officially-sanctioned films and 'the hysterical hyperbole of most other wartime propaganda' of the era, as well as throughout the twentieth century (1999 p33). Reeves continues:

> For such subsequent films invariably went to very great lengths to ensure that audiences were left in no doubt what meaning they should construct in the images that were being presented to them – to a quite remarkable extent, the official British films of the First World War leave that construction of meaning to the audience (p33).

This is an important point, as it indicates that film as a distributing medium was not adequately understood by the authorities at the time. Even so, when this is allied with previously-cited reflections regarding context and the role of the viewer, a relevant conjecture from this specific perspective is how unlikely it is that the concept of "leaving it to the audience" was a conscious decision. If the authorities were not certain the context within which the film was made and distributed was productive, they would undoubtedly have gone to great lengths to remedy this, a requirement similarly applicable to the complementary aspects of imagery and text in the construction of a poster already explored. Film in general was a nascent phenomenon, certainly film utilised in this way, and although the poster's use as a propaganda tool was equally as innovative during this period, the "exactly repeatable pictorial statement" possessed a much longer genealogy in contrast to film. Consequently this created a new set of parameters to be taken into account in the distribution of propagandist messaging related to the latter medium and which had not necessarily been applicable prior to this particular conflict.

A Moving *Line of Beauty*

In examining the comparable and competitive elements of alternative visual media as a way of continually contextualising the conflict propaganda poster and its position within the wider ecology of the stipulated era, the focus remains on the aspects of *The Battle of the Somme* that are subject-specific to the parameters of this research. As previously noted, the areas further considered relate to the representation of a *line of beauty* as a pictorial trope, as well as the film's depiction of a particular construction of a real conveyed through its propagandist messaging, as both parallel the contemporaneous propaganda poster. With regard to the former point, previous chapters examine the *line* in its role as a visual construct that statically represents movement – a central concept of this text, and an interesting consideration when observing a *line of beauty* in filmed footage is the most unlikely scenario that it has been deliberately contrived. The zig-zag design of the trenches

lends itself to an Abstraction-influenced example of a *line of beauty*, especially when battle damage has interfered with the geometry of the construction, as illustrated in *The Battle of the Somme* film still at Figure 104. This is similarly represented in the work of World War I artists including Nash, a prime example of which is *The Ypres Salient at Night* referenced at Figure 14. There is similar lack of contrivance in the lines of marching soldiers, recognisable from recruitment posters and both as illustrated previously in this research in Figures 2 and 81. What the two film stills at Figures 81 and 104 demonstrate are a reality of "lines of beauty" in conflict, as opposed to an aesthetically-perceived real as illustrated in corresponding artworks, including the recruitment poster. The scene captured in the film still at Figure 105, however, indicates a similar serpentine curve of marching soldiers and in addition represents the men moving from bottom left, through the picture, and then out of the screen to the right of the centre at the top. Not only is this an echo of how an image is purportedly "read", it is also a filmic demonstration of the eye following a *line of beauty* through and out of the image and on to the propagandist's idea of a "better future". Comparison can again be made with the *Punch* cartoon cited earlier [Fig. 91] and which demonstrates movement of the soldiers from "home" to "war", whereas film still at time code 00:32:45 [Fig. 105] feasibly insinuates the opposite – that the soldiers "movement" could be *away* from a conflict situation and towards home, an alternate reality the soldiers are undoubtedly striving for. Visual representations of the *line* as demonstrated in Figures 81 and 105, in their original are examples of actual movement as opposed to a static symbol of the same. Figure 104 shows an immobile line, effectively made mobile by the camera's sweep and consequently perceived as movement by the viewer. Figures 81 and 105 illustrate a moving line of soldiers, whilst the camera that captures the motion remains immobile. These points echo the analysis made regarding the presentation of information examined at the end of the chapter titled *The Static Representation of Movement in Art and War*. Barthes speaks of the difference between a photograph and film as being that which has been 'posed' in front of the lens as against that which has 'passed' in front of the lens (1993 p78), yet in the case of landscapes, which in this context equates to the battlefields, the idea of the subject matter being "posed" cannot really be an accurate summation. In addition is the premise that it is not necessarily the subject matter that "passes", but the *camera*, in the sense that the camera itself can be the moving object. This consequently puts the viewer in the role of a moving "object" surveying, in these particular examples, a rendering of a *line of beauty*. With regard to the scenes in the film represented by these stills, if the suggestion of movement is explicit, rather than implicit as is often the case in

posters and other artworks, then the viewer's imagination is not directly required as an aid to his or her comprehension. What is still at issue, however, is the suggestion of movement metaphorically represented in the construction of one version of reality over another and which the viewer can perceive and believe in. It is this particular contextual consideration of propagandist messaging distributed through this specific medium, as a contrast to similar representation through the conflict propaganda poster, that is worthy of further examination as it pertains to the parameters of this research.

As commented upon earlier, a debate ensued during World War I as to the educational value of official war films versus their entertainment value, and *The Battle of the Somme* is a particular example cited. Michael Hammond writes that 'Reports of the film's reception around the country highlight the contradiction between advertising real action as an "attraction" and arguments for the enlightening and informative power of the footage' (2011 p28). The dichotomy appears to exist that one objective counteracts the other, which is not necessarily the case as a viewer can still be educated whilst being entertained or, indeed, vice versa. That there was any apparent dilemma in this regard at all is indisputably due to the novelty of film during this period: no one had had to consider the attributes of this particular medium utilised in this way before. One means by which *The Battle of the Somme* can be considered as "speaking" to its audience at the time was in the depiction of real people, even if the actual elements of battle were seemingly 'toned down' – for security, access, and timing issues, among others (Hammond, 2011 p30). Consequently the possibility prevailed that an audience member might see on screen someone they knew (p30), enhancing the performer/spectator connection reflected upon earlier and contrasting spectacularly with the indistinct illustrations of soldiers in certain contemporaneous posters formerly cited, particularly with regard to any injury the soldiers may be portrayed as suffering. Whether this recognition occurred in actuality or not is irrelevant – the possibility of it provokes the empathetic involvement undeniably necessary for propagandist success. Worth noting is Hammond's belief that 'the depiction of death was an attraction' for audiences in itself (2011 p35), as this corroborates earlier considerations regarding the visually-compelling quality of a certain deformity in the imagery perceived and the subsequent disequilibrium it causes the viewer despite, or contrarily *because* of the attraction. Certainly there is one predominant aspect of this film relating to the construction of a real as it pertains to empathetic involvement, and that is the question relating to the faking of certain scenes. With regard to the use of footage

within *The Battle of the Somme* that has now been corroborated as being either strategically edited in or faked in its entirety, Reeves writes that

> We concentrate on the extent of faking in the film; contemporaries were struck by its honesty, by its realism, by its truthfulness. And they saw the film like this because their wider cultural context was so dominated by dishonest, unrealistic, mendacious images of war. In posters, in cartoons, in speeches, in newspaper stories, the war was characterised as a titanic but exhilarating struggle between good and evil – (1997 p23).

Reeves' assertions underline observations already made in this chapter and elsewhere in this research, in relation to universal encapsulations of emotive terms as well as acknowledgment of the broader media ecology and the information distributed within it. In this latter respect Reeves' remarks operate as a reminder as to what else was available for the distribution of information in general and within the visual ecology in particular, whether of propaganda or commercial value, and therefore serving as either a competitor to the propaganda poster or conversely as a complement, especially within the wider propaganda campaign. The period within which this film was made and seen is an important consideration, and all these aspects need to be taken into account when examining the cause and effect of the specific scenes in question. Reeves' comment regarding the "unrealistic" is worth acknowledging in the context of how much the general public were aware *at the time* of dishonest reportage, and certainly Reeves' mention of a wider cultural context infused with dishonesty at least acknowledges the possibility that the general public was not entirely ignorant of the potential for duplicity in the media around them, whatever the reasons that lay behind it. Recording the actuality of battle highlights the same challenges as recording the actuality of movement, namely which technological and editorial procedures best impart the "correct" story. Chronophotography explicitly illustrates, frame by frame, the exact positioning of a body, yet lacks not only the emotion but also any sense of tangible *movement*, and photodynamism demonstrates specifically what occurs when an object is moving, yet often renders the physicality of that object as "unseeable". Of most interest is which version of the "story" the protagonists wish to impart, and in relation to the propagandists of World War I in particular this prompts the question as to what ends they were prepared to go to in order to present this version to the public. This is a consideration not only pertinent to film but also to information-distribution via other media, including the poster, and specific imagery extracted from *The Battle of the*

Somme therefore serves as a suitable illustration for both comparative *and* competitive purposes.

‘Response and Responsibility’

The major section of so-called “questionable” footage in *The Battle of the Somme* consists of a going-over-the-top sequence, and shows soldiers falling after being, allegedly, attacked. It is commonly held that despite the ‘stunned but approving empathy’ (Smither, 1993 p149) this sequence instigated in the audience – and which presumably constituted at least part of the argument for its inclusion in the completed film – this particular section is faked, for reasons involving access to the Front Line for a cameraman with the necessary equipment, as well as timing issues with regard to this battle. How early the debate began concerning the fakery is unclear, but it is generally believed to have been accepted as being so by the beginning of the 1920s. The dramatisation of scenes for the enhancement of the whole can be considered as not only tolerable, but in some cases advisable, and certainly this was not an uncommon practice. However, without prior indication that footage within the film has been dramatised there exists the possibility that once one scene is revealed to be a “fake” there is a risk of losing the credibility of the entire film. The stimulation of a spectator’s belief in a concept is indisputably an essential requirement for the propagandist, regardless of whether the message is distributed via a film or poster. Nevertheless, this provokes a further if converse debate and is certainly the crux of this particular argument as it pertains to this research: although the imagery conveys a contradiction to the propagandist objective of intimating an alternate “*better*” real in scenes that speak of the very opposite, in the context of the whole does undeclared faked footage actually matter if it is genuinely portraying a reality of life on the battlefield? This question has already been addressed to some extent, chiefly in the previous chapter with regard to censorship of soldier-artists’ conflict artwork, as well as in the context of manipulation of original intention including through textual augmentation attributed to that artwork. When this is allied with the consideration of credibility its pertinence to this research is encapsulated in the need for empathetic involvement to fulfil the propagandist’s requirement – a reliance, so to speak, on the propagandee’s supposed collusion in the propaganda process. Just as soldier-artists arguably suspend the horrors of their reality by concentrating on the aesthetics of their surroundings, so a viewer can choose not to identify with a situation which is at best uncomfortable to watch if that viewer can justify emotional distance because at least part of the imagery put forward is unmasked as being an untruth. This is a concept with the potential to impact upon a

viewer's perception of other artworks of the time, including the propaganda poster. Sassoon echoes this condition when he writes that it is 'a bloody shame, the troops getting killed all the time while people at home humbugged themselves into believing that everyone in the trenches enjoyed it' (1930 p284). This is a useful rationalisation on the part of the civilian and one undoubtedly aided by observing a similar attitude in others in the form of "social proof".

The consideration of whether undeclared faked imagery within a war documentary is an issue so long as the context is consistent with the subject matter is a pertinent query, but where the difficulty lies is in once it is known that some scenes are bogus then a viewer can only be suspicious of others, hence Stephen Badsey's comment that the attempt to include faked imagery disguised as a real 'backfired disastrously' (1983 p111). Film footage or photographic imagery known to be faked can assist a viewer in not only separating him- or herself from a given situation, but also prompts the concept of a viewer's 'response and responsibility' (Clark, 1997 p126): everyone knows it happens, but it is not happening *here*, and therefore no action needs to be taken by the observer. This is further corroboration of the undeniably unintended impact of a recruitment poster that utilises imagery of injured soldiers, but in so doing negates their provenance because of the removal of "nationalist markers". Inevitably this reawakens the question with regard to how important it is if imagery, including the film footage cited previously, is contrived: soldiers involved in conflict die – does it matter if the soldiers portrayed in these scenes allegedly did not, at least not on camera or in the context conveyed? Barthes declares that photographs of genuine 'trauma' are 'rare', *because* of the connotation implied as to whether the subject matter is real or not (1977 p30), as alluded to previously and despite the photographic documentation of the injured circulated post-conflict by anti-war organisations. However, the contradictory claims that arise from conflicting constructions of the real only serve to highlight that 'war is not any the less heinous for being a mere simulacrum – the flesh suffers just the same' (Baudrillard, 1983 p70). Regardless, the idea that a medium, or at least the message deliberately distributed via that medium, once discredited (even if only in part) allows anyone to subsequently criticise the whole, is a risk far greater than may initially be recognised, as the "truth" – a particular version of reality – can be readily dismissed unless or until proven otherwise. One consequence of this particular area of focus and which further adds to the justification of its inclusion within this text over and above the literal, visual representation of the *line of beauty*, is that because parts of the film *are* now acknowledged as faked, especially with regard to the battle

sequence commented upon, 'its development into a classic part of the imagery of the First World War is one of the ironies of how media images shape historical memory' (Smither, 1993 p150). This is not only an example of the disparity that sometimes exists between historical and art-historical concepts, as opposed to examinations associated more with visual culture, but is also demonstrative of imagery as an object often misleadingly serving to represent an entire era, as previously examined. In the context of the period under investigation in this text, the newsreel is in direct competition with the conflict propaganda poster as the productive object that may or may not function as the selected signifier of that era.

An Innovative Event

As already appraised, one advantage of the poster is its ubiquity and therefore its consequent ability to reach the masses. In addition to the parallels between the poster and the newsreel previously commented upon, this benefit constitutes a direct affiliation with *The Battle of the Somme* as an effective distributor for propagandist information. Badsey concedes that although no records exist of actual box office receipts and numbers of viewers before it ceased to be shown in late 1917, the ambition for the film to be seen by 'every man, woman and child in the country was well within the capacity of the cinema industry of the time and if the target was missed it was not through lack of effort' (1983 p108). Furthermore, supplementary equivalence between the two mediums lies in how films specific to this war period were targeted at the mobilisation of members of the public 'into some form of war-related action' (Van Dooren and Krämer, 1995 p98). However, if some believed *The Battle of the Somme* should be shown to illustrate the "reality" of war, others considered it should *not* be shown for the same reason, demonstrating a situation similar to that surrounding the work of soldier-artists who conveyed life on the Front Line utilising Modernist stylistic influences. What is noteworthy is that the lack of certified film critics means that journalists who reported on all the official films at the time, including *The Battle of the Somme*, were closer to the audiences in their attitude to the attributes of the film, and in this way the subsequent impact upon the spectator could be accurately assessed due to the critics viewing the film alongside the audience, as opposed to in a specialised, separate film-critic screening (Reeves, 1997 p22). These journalists reported not only on the film itself but also on the audience's reaction – the '"event"' (p22), which corresponds with considerations cited previously in this text. This is a concept with an equivalent connotation to contemporaneous reports of exhibitions of conflict art, before the inevitable post-mortem after the Armistice affected an individual's opinion. In this latter respect,

Walter Benjamin remarks on how a painting at any one time is generally viewed by a single spectator or a small group, which is rarely the case with a filmic presentation (2008 p26-27), and it is worth considering that a poster that comprises the static imagery of the painting with the viewing figures of the film is what constitutes it as being acknowledged as a successful medium for the propagandist to exploit. It is arguably this ability for the poster as a functional object to transcend such boundaries that assists in its continuing relevance as a productive medium for the distribution of information, and therefore a useful propagandist tool.

The role of the viewer is undeniably important whether it is in relation to a poster, conflict artwork, or a film, and it is essential to remember that

> Sensing is not the same as perceiving. The eyes and nervous system do the sensing, the mind does the perceiving. The faculty of perceiving is related to the individual's accumulated experiences, in other words, to memory (Huxley, 1943 p19).

The relevance of "resemblance" in the sense of learned as well as inherited traditions has been considered in other areas of this text, along with the concept of how the resultant response from the viewer is compounded. In considering this point in specific relation to *The Battle of the Somme*, however, there is no denying that audiences were perceiving imagery previously unimagined. The very fact it was conveyed in a medium of visual communication of innovative technology – both literally and creatively – ensured this was a depiction of war a civilian audience could never have foreseen, reflecting Gunning's observations regarding the incredible construction of the technology itself cited in a previous chapter. This is inevitably paralleled with the burgeoning Futurist and Vorticist concepts leading to the portrayal of conflict in ways contrary to previous artistic depictions of battle. The growth of photography can be similarly viewed from the standpoint of its position in the wider visual ecology, not only as a competitor to the poster – a medium which was itself utilised in ways and numbers not previously realised – but also arguably as another correlation: certain photographs of newly-trained soldiers were considered to have 'the qualities of good posters, for they appealed to the feelings and the imagination' (Gregg, 1918 p94). Noteworthy in this respect is the comment made by French poster artist Jean Colin, who observes that '"Photography is materially founded on details, while the poster should be simplified and powerful"' (Weill, 1984 p316). The necessity for the poster in general and the propaganda poster in particular to be succinctly constructed has been explored in other areas of this research, and although there are undoubtedly certain connections between the

two mediums as formerly indicated, including the function of relaying information to the viewer and that viewer's subsequent response, the photograph, in this context, is not a literally-constructed image. Undeniably it is imperative to accept that some contrivance can occur where photographic reportage is concerned, as already alluded to; however, it is still feasible to assume that the photograph in and of itself is an instantaneous capture (technological capabilities within specified eras notwithstanding). The photographic image is a literal snapshot of an event or situation, even if one that does not necessarily convey an entire story, as chronophotographic and photodynamic experimentation has demonstrated. In further positioning the conflict propaganda poster within the wider visual ecology of the time, the images illustrated at Figures 106-108, in conjunction with *The Battle of the Somme* film still time-code 00:32:45 [Fig. 105] cited earlier, have been selected as examples to illustrate these points. There are far fewer elemental components in the construction of the 1917 German poster [Fig. 106] – as Colin maintains is essential in poster design – than are apparent in the photograph of British infantry at Figure 107, as the photographic process necessarily captures everything that lies within the scope of the lens; the Nash painting [Fig. 108] arguably falls somewhere between the two in its level of detail. Although the photograph can be looked at in two ways, that is to say the "object" of it in the sense of a technological medium, as well as the subject-matter captured, this assessment is applicable to other artworks; the difference lies only in the "captured reality" contained within the photograph – the frozen moment – as opposed to an aesthetic interpretation by an artist. The photograph/artwork is an object; what is "contained" within is separate and defined in relation to the points noted above and the parameters previously addressed in this text. In addition is the concept of "framing": the poster at Figure 106 is edged, causing the image to be visualised with a literal frame that contains the content within. The painting may well have been framed before exhibition, altering the value as well as the content from that as viewed by the artist during its inception and immediately after completion. The idea that framing serves to separate the content from the wider connotations that surrounds it suggests circumstances by which the contained reality within is "seeable" whilst everything lying outside the frame can be conversely construed as "unseeable" because of the separation in context, thereby at least alluding to the prospect of an alternate real. There is a noteworthy connection between this and ancient Greek concepts cited earlier, as Plato records the hypothesis that 'what *is* entirely, is entirely knowable; what in no way *is*, is in every way unknowable' (1991 p157, italics in the original). This scenario of the seeable/unseeable, the knowable/unknowable, when related to the pictorial, is of

particular significance where the propaganda poster is concerned, as all the elements will be included at the time of its construction, designed with a specific intention from its inception to contain a precisely-compiled montage of components relevant for the ultimate attraction of the propagandee. Even when taking into account the adaptation of existing advertising posters in the creation of new media with a somewhat enhanced propagandist bias, the relevant additional elements are added before their distribution as functional objects serving in their new status as propagandist tools. Especially pertinent with regard to these particular images at Figures 105-108 is the presence of the *line of beauty* as a construct within each, despite their distinct mediums, emphasising the enduring representation of this visible continuum as support for the role it plays as a pictorial trope. Moreover, the utilisation of the *line* serves to symbolise movement that begins outside the image, whether "framed" or otherwise, threading a serpentine path through the captured content, and out again to the version of a real that exists beyond, all as previously explored.

Following the Lead

Further to the role played by a viewer's perception of visual media in general and nascent film technology in particular, it is a credible conjecture that any bewilderment felt on behalf of the audience viewing *The Battle of the Somme* was as a reaction to these new experiences as a whole: the faces of men that were either literally or figuratively familiar, the bleak and obliterated landscape, the prisoners, the dead – all encapsulated to elicit specific emotion. Arguably, therefore, it is less an information film about the realities of war, more an emotional overview, and it is undeniably an emotional response a propagandist will seek to provoke, however that response is subsequently analysed. Modris Eksteins writes of the number of people necessarily engaged in

> the creation of myth and the distortion of reality. Reality, a sense of proportion, and reason – these were the major casualties of the war. The world became a figment of imagination rather than imagination being a figment of the world (2000 p236).

This echoes Nevinson's observation that it was conflict that had become the normal, rather than the abnormal, situation, and therefore information and the means by which that information was distributed changed accordingly, and the escalating growth of the pictorial poster for propagandist means forms part of this phenomenon. It is also Eksteins who notes that 'It has often been pointed out that the war was fought with nineteenth-century ideas and with twentieth-century

technology, and that in this contradiction resided the explanation for the tragedy' (1995 p205), thereby upholding the points made in the *Introduction* regarding the contextual considerations surrounding the modernity of the selected era of this research. Aside from obvious developments in military technology, the idea is further enhanced, not only in the way the poster as a productive medium evolved in its employment for propagandist purposes, but also in how photographic and film evidence of conflict expanded through the early years of the twentieth century. This contribution to the ways in which propagandist or marketing material can be distributed and subsequently perceived is further enriched by the cinematic experience adding a previously-unimagined context to the concept of pictorial information. Nonetheless, it is imperative to remember that despite the innovation of conflict portrayed in this way, film was still only one of the means by which information, propagandist or otherwise, could be distributed during World War I. In the wider visual ecology film competed with – or, conversely, complemented – the comparably-advancing technology in the form of photography, as well as with media that possessed a far longer genealogical heritage, of which the poster as an example of an "exactly repeatable pictorial statement" is of prime importance in the context of this research. The poster in particular, as noted, works to its greatest advantage as a medium for the distribution of propagandist information when it is a contributing element of a much wider propaganda campaign. Supplementary "pictorial statements" incorporate the graphic imagery that appeared in newspapers and periodicals – including *Punch* – as well as propagandist pamphlets, and which often contributed to the already-examined uncompromising concepts of "good" and "evil" in an effort to provoke an apposite response from the viewer. This is most dramatically rendered in Louis Raemaekers' illustration *The German Tango: "From East to West and West to East, I Dance With Thee"* at Figure 109. Alongside the depiction of the *line of beauty* in the form of dance portrayed in the image, what is of interest is how the illustration represents the concept of evil being ever more evil in the company of the good and the beautiful – and vice versa. In addition is the consequent summation of the theory behind this particular serpentine curve being utilised for its value as an attraction when embedded within the iniquitous, be that a visual propagandist message or the "reality" of a conflict counter-propaganda response. Supplemental to this is the temporally-pertinent date of its inception as it relates to the parameters of this research and therefore the consequent assumption that the intended audience will concur with the image's pictorial advocation of peril as well as a "monopoly of rightness and goodness", both concepts considered earlier. The image assists in demonstrating how the varying layers within a

construction function to form a whole with the potential to impact on the visual culture of a defined era, a premise as pertinent to this reproducible image as it is to the specifically-designed recruitment poster. Firstly, the visual construct utilised has a genealogical heritage as a visual trope, indicative of movement at its most beautiful, and further enhanced by its representation in the form of dance; secondly, a disequilibrium is caused within the viewer due to the subject matter, consequently creating an additional attraction for that viewer; thirdly, the title intimates a context that in this instance distinguishes Ellul's "singular entity" over and above a collective of adversaries; fourthly, the date of the image's creation facilitates the contextualising of the whole as being relevant to the conflict of World War I.

Expanding upon this with regard to a more general pictorial conveyance, Eksteins observes that associations were made between 'the sights and sounds of war with art', citing Marinetti and Gaudier in particular (2000 p214). Although there was a general consensus that perhaps the First World War had "killed" the arts, this really relates specifically to 'traditional' art forms, replaced as they were by more inventive ways of aesthetic interpretation (p214), as has been analysed throughout this text. This challenging of the conventional was a productive process in respect of the new style of conflict encountered, as well as in relation to the subsequent reality of the life that followed when so much about attitude and society had changed (p214). The Futurists' effect on World War I artwork extends beyond the literal pictorial representation, however: Humphreys maintains that Lewis was not only influenced by the movement's understanding of its work and what it was trying to achieve, but also its 'manipulation of the mass media for a confrontational relationship with the general public' (2004 p19) – in the context of Moore's assertions cited at the beginning of this chapter, "propaganda" as opposed to "persuasion". In *A Review of Contemporary Art* published in 1915, Lewis comments on how commercial art would benefit if its design was shaped by Abstraction (1981b p47). It is therefore of note to reflect upon the construction of A. Stuart-Hill's advertising poster from 1932 at Figure 11, in addition to observing the direct inspiration of Nevinson's 1915 *Flooded Trench on the Yser* [Fig. 110] upon Nash's 1932 advertising poster at Figure 111. Nash, an artist, commercial artist, and designer was, as already referenced, a contemporary of Nevinson and a fellow official war artist. The employment of an Abstraction-influenced rendering of the *line of beauty* is significant in the genres illustrated in Figures 11, 110 and 111, operating as a design construct in and of itself, whilst its inclusion in the imagery serves to exemplify the construct's genealogy as a pictorial trope. When conflict artwork is analysed in the context of

propaganda, or counter-propaganda, as examined elsewhere in this text, the examples at Figures 110 and 111 are supplementally demonstrative of Wallas' observation that propagandist- and advertising-artwork is often created by the same artists following the same formulae.

Despite these latter illustrative examples demonstrating a circularity, this time between propaganda/counter-propaganda and advertising in the form of the visual trope utilised, as earlier suggested the direct transference of marketing skills from the advertising industry to the propagandist one is not always straightforward, and Ellul maintains that, unlike advertising, 'political propaganda' should always look to the future and not the past (1973 p40-41). Ellul does somewhat contradict himself, however, as he recognises the need for propaganda to exploit material that already exists (1973 p36), manipulating it with 'contexts and explanations designed to re-integrate it into the present' (1973 p14). Ellul highlights literature in this latter respect, and it is therefore a relevant exercise to ally this to the theories already referenced and consequently apply them to the storybook element of certain advertising campaigns, whilst acknowledging how this imagery can be further developed for propaganda purposes, all as demonstrated in Figures 112-114. In addition to the corroboration of the ideas previously commented upon with regard to the propaganda/counter-propaganda viewpoint as it pertains to the *Punch* cartoon at Figure 91 and the *Your Country's Call* recruitment poster [Fig. 99], there is great significance in the use of Robert Browning's version of *The Pied Piper of Hamelin* (1993) in all three of the illustrated posters at Figures 112-114. This literary reference can be allied with the concept of 'authority figures', specifically the premise that the very term suggests 'a superior access to information and power' which makes it prudent for an individual to acquiesce – '...so much sense, in fact, that we often do so when it makes no sense at all' (Cialdini, 2007 p218). Consequently, in addition to the value perceived in translating a storybook legend into useful material for advertising as well as propaganda lies the irony that exists of "someone" luring a willing crowd into an uncertain future – a perfect analogy in the context of World War I when millions of young men were encouraged to enlist in a conflict of which they had no comprehension, even if the "authority figure" they were following was not quite as unaware. This particular demonstration of the manipulation of an individual's "nostalgic ideals" illustrates a situation whereby every participant within a mass is invited to 'share in the secret' (Adorno, 2001 p83). If that individual – the propagandee – feels part of the collective as well as the campaign being distributed via the medium of, in this example, the poster, then

arguably he or she will be more open to the message. It is a relevant supplemental exercise to take the images at Figures 112-114 and analyse them in the context of not only the relationships which exist between the layers of a construction of a whole, but also the resultant values pertinent to that whole because, as previously noted, an artwork 'becomes its own material and forms the technique of reproduction and presentation, actually a technique for the distribution of a real object' (Adorno, 2001 p64). If this layering consists of the visual constructs comprised in its composition, including the use or not of textual captioning, and if in addition it is feasible to include in this montage the "story" utilised in the promotion of a "real object" – namely a commodity which includes soap and travel, as demonstrated in Figures 112 and 113 – then there is no reason to assume the "real object" in question cannot also be "propaganda". The same premise applies to propaganda specifically related to periods of conflict and includes a propagandist advancement of an ideal real which is subsequently promoted in exactly the same way. In this respect the idea of a "shared secret" can be further expanded to not only include any so-called "story", categorised in the above example as an object and which may be one element contained within the layered construction, but also the recognition of a visible continuum with a genealogical legacy that cannot necessarily be isolated in the viewer's memory in and of itself, but which nonetheless provokes a productive emotional reaction due to its representation of movement at its most beautiful. The aim of this research is to illustrate how these conditions of possibility culminate in the pictorial trope that manifests in the shape of a serpentine curve and which has been named "The Line of Beauty". Furthermore this study seeks to demonstrate the role the pictorial trope plays within visual media constructed for propaganda purposes, especially via the functional object of the poster. A reiteration of the means by which this has not only been literally and metaphorically considered, but also evidence of the supporting structure that assists in endorsing the premise, is summarised in the concluding chapter of this text.

Conclusion

As has been examined throughout this research the *line of beauty* as a construct, when encountered within an image, speaks of considerably more than Hogarth's summation of an indicator of "beauty". The association with movement Hogarth recognises generates a dialogue beyond his observations in relation to a metaphorical interpretation, and therefore the construct becomes the means by which a genre of artwork such as visual conflict propaganda can be innovatively explored. *Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope* is a body of research that lies within the field of visual culture, and although therefore not a study comprising investigation and analyses of purely historical or art-historical value, a crossover of fields at least to some degree is inevitable. In establishing how a close examination of the *line of beauty* opens up new ways in which the relevance of this construct can be assessed, it is pertinent to note the distinct deficiency in the public domain of references to Hogarth that consider him in the role of an aesthetic theorist rather than in his current historical position as an eighteenth century practicing artist. As an example Gombrich, in his book *Art and Illusion: A Study in the Psychology of Pictorial Representation*, concedes that 'Hogarth accepted the idea of art as a language' (1977 p296) yet fails to mention *The Analysis of Beauty* as an aesthetic treatise in support of this. Consequently, references in the wider field to the *line of beauty* in a context whereby the visual construct might serve as a key factor in the evaluation of an artwork outside of Hogarth's own examination can be said to be conspicuous by their absence. The *line of beauty* is not the only replicated visual construct to be found in artwork of a specific genre, nor is it the only recognisable pictorial trope. However, in utilising Baudrillard's visible continuum in the form of a *line of beauty* as a mechanism by which preconceived concepts surrounding the composition of an artwork can be reconsidered, such as visual conflict propaganda and particularly the pictorial poster in the way this text aims to demonstrate, the relationship between the artwork and the construct instigates an innovative discourse that has the potential to be productively positioned within the wider media ecology.

As has been established Hogarth's place within this research is fundamental. This is not in respect of his discovery of something new and therefore previously unacknowledged, but because of Hogarth's recognition and subsequent naming of the serpentine curve representative not only of movement, but movement at its most beautiful and therefore considered as a "Line of Beauty". The *line of beauty* is a

construct which serves as a pictorial trope when perceived by the viewer because of its metaphorical as well as literal connotations. Of particular import is Hogarth's adamant assertion within his manuscript that the *line* does not require mathematical calculations to enable it to conform to his idea of "beauty": on the contrary – the intuitive formulation of the *line* contributes to the advocation of the visual construct functioning as shorthand for movement. In posters examined throughout this text, the *line* has been expressed to convey the corporeal via participants within a marching mass, as well as manifesting as a path or road. These particular representations assist in pictorially articulating the concept of movement from one reality to another, perceived real, utilising not only the viewer's eye but also his or her imagination in following the *line* through the compositional elements contained within the image, and beyond to what lies outside the literal or figurative frame and which in this context can be considered as "unseeable". In endorsing the necessary use of the viewer's imagination Hogarth intimates acknowledgement of the incomplete construct – the curve that is broken through compositional constraints and that sometimes provoke the concept of the visual ellipsis in order for the viewer to comprehend the "visual truth" of the whole. Within this research, the *line* is similarly observed and illustrated in other imagery pertinent to the specified boundaries, including those created during World War I as arguably an aesthetic response to the pictorial propagandist interpretations, such as those relating to the recruitment drive, and the concepts commented upon above are as pertinent to these representations as they are to the conflict propaganda poster.

Propagandist manipulation is particularly focussed within the condensed parameters of conflict including World War I, not least because 'War, as opposed to mere fighting, depends... on strategies of persuasion in the art of getting other people to die for you' (Johnston, 1997 p21). In this regard, and certainly in relation to the political poster as part of a recruitment campaign, imagery employed to serve the propagandist's purpose therefore needs to be more than merely 'attractive, even seductive' in its objective of engaging the viewer, because the message being conveyed is of more import than something that is simply '"desirable;" it is imperative' (Sontag, 1999 p203). This sentiment expresses a reasonable observation, yet as this research has explored it is undeniably of additional benefit to the pictorial propagandist if the message being communicated is not only distributed via an object that is attractive in and of itself, as is demonstrated with an efficiently-constructed poster, but also through visual constructs contained within the object that are known to be attractive to the viewer, that is to say the propagandee. The

presence of a *line of beauty* as a construct serving as a pictorial trope can be considered as a unifying link within the image, focussing the viewer's attention and around which the other elemental contributory layers of the construction can be aligned. The rise of the poster as a propagandist tool at the beginning of World War I created conditions whereby information could reach ever greater numbers of people. In employing recognisable thematic concepts as well as constructs as visible continuums in the collation of the poster, the pictorial propagandist pursued ways in which a viewer's nostalgic ideals relating to the past could be manipulated in an approach similar to that employed by the manufacturers of commercial products, in an effort to incite that viewer to action.

Equivalency

However, for a viewer to perceive both literal and metaphoric manifestations of movement within an image, including the poster, it is imperative for the artist to be able to effectively suggest movement through the constructs contained within it. Exploration into the capturing of accurate movement through processes that include chronophotography and photodynamism, and the translations of the results of these experiments for aesthetic as opposed to scientific purposes, focussed an artist's attention on how a static representation of movement could be best conveyed to the onlooker. In so doing, these artists' intention was to capture what had previously been "unseen" in order to confirm the "reality" of *actual* movement. During the prescribed era, fascination not only with technology, movement and speed in general, but in how these related to the mechanisms of war in particular, informed the creative output of certain artists both in and outside a battlefield situation. A seemingly contrary influence was effected from an equal fascination with the medium of dance, and dance as a means of expression links directly to Hogarth's treatise in respect of this art form's ability to further suggest not only movement, but movement at its most beautiful. Hogarth's objective in analysing an artwork in order to define a language to communicate "beauty" correlates with the conflict artists of World War I, who expressed a necessity for finding beauty within their surroundings and which they could adequately convey through pictorial means. Consequently, the concept of a visual construct that is a manifestation of movement requiring the viewer's eye as well as imagination in order to perceive it as beautiful can be considered in the context of artworks deemed to be the opposite of one's predetermined idea of "beauty". Whether these artworks are paintings that emerged from the trenches, or a pictorial poster related to the recruitment campaign, it is reasonable to conjecture that if the *line* is encountered it is this construct that

instigates the viewer's attraction to the work, despite the composition as a whole arguably being deemed as contrary to a generally-accepted "ideal". Shearman's description of a "special kind of beauty", as well as Viney's assessment of Nash's conflict artwork as redolent of a somewhat "macabre beauty", both succinctly summarise the concept.

The requirement for a propagandist to gain a propagandee's empathetic involvement with the situation pictorially portrayed supports the need not only for a visual trope to which he or she is attracted, but also for its inclusion to insinuate something in which each individual can believe. When this is aligned with the promotion of an alternate "real" through a propaganda poster campaign such as a recruitment drive, it provokes the hypothesis that 'The very definition of the real becomes: *that of which it is possible to give an equivalent reproduction*' (Baudrillard, 1983 p146, italics in the original). In this context, the repetitive saturation bill-posting of the "exactly repeatable pictorial statement" in the form of the poster arguably confirms the propagandist's affirmation of an attainable, alternate reality *because* of the poster's ability as a medium to be mechanically reproduced. Supplemental to this is the idea that the ubiquity of the poster creates a circular cause and effect: the propagandee *consciously* perceives the message conveyed through each poster he or she observes, and in addition is *subconsciously* aware of the message because of the physicality of repetitive posting of the functional object through which that message is conveyed.

The ways in which these early twentieth century artworks can be representative of an era include an analysis informed by hindsight on the part of the viewer, and in contextualising the role of the poster within the temporal parameters pertinent to this research such analysis can be assisted by understanding the competing and contrasting media available at the time, especially in respect of the pictorial. In the broader propaganda campaign the poster both complemented and competed against other methods of distribution, including newspapers, periodicals and newsreels; in the wider visual ecology in particular the propaganda poster vied for a viewer's attention from its position upon billboards that also carried posters related to the advertising of commercial products. As has been acknowledged, the merging of political doctrine with the promotional ideas of commerce led to the incorporation of the same thematic concepts and constructs within each – including the *line of beauty*. In this latter regard, whether expressed through contrasting *or* competing methods of pictorial information-distribution, the *line of beauty* as a visual trope

remains the same, continuing to reflect both literal and metaphorical manifestations of movement from within the medium for which it forms a contributory layer and thereby functioning as an attraction to which the viewer is directed.

Political Aesthetics

The role of Hogarth and the significance of the serpentine curve which drew his focus are each links in a long genealogical chain and, as highlighted throughout this research, the presence of the *line* within artworks prior to Hogarth's analyses – alongside a viewer's recognition of the same – is important in endorsing its aesthetic legacy. It is this heritage that contributes to the ways in which a viewer perceives the construct and consequently, when it is positioned within an artwork that is communicating a message such as the conflict propaganda poster, it can potentially assist in the propagandist's objective of drawing that viewer towards the message, thereby motivating the individual as propagandee into some form of action in response. The role of that individual as a participant within a crowd is pertinent, as it is this participation that indicates an individual who is most likely to be receptive to a propaganda message. In employing a medium of distribution where the method of construction of the object in and of itself is designed to be accessible to as many people as possible at any one time, the propagandist's utilisation of the poster as an instrument for manipulation is not only understandable but can also be considered as essential, particularly within a certain cultural context such as during periods of conflict. This remains a relevant process despite the increase in the methods by which such messaging can be distributed, and the poster's position within not only a propaganda campaign in particular, but also within the wider visual ecology in general, continues to be a productive one.

Aesthetics are often separated from politics, but where art in the form of visual conflict propaganda is concerned this is no longer possible, and by allying the particular visible continuum of the *line of beauty* with pictorial conflict *propaganda*, an interesting conjecture arises concerning both explicit and implicit usage of this visual trope. As an addendum to the comment made in the chapter titled *The Genealogy of the* Line *and the Role of Resemblances* regarding a consideration of the *line of beauty* as an *actual* propagandist tool, if artists employ a pictorial construct as a unifying link within their compositions, especially one recognised for its ability to attract, are they subsequently to be regarded as deliberately manipulative – an adjective by which propaganda artists can clearly be described. Conversely is the hypothesis that any manifestation of the *line* within an artist's work

is due to the artist having him- or herself been manipulated. This circular cause and consequence is reflected in the specific context of the theories surrounding the *line of beauty* as they pertain to this text, and therefore what is of most relevance to this supposition is the question as to whether, in hindsight at least, Hogarth can be considered as a manipulator or someone who has himself been manipulated – that is to say, a propagandist, or a propagandee. In considering the concept that there is at least an element of collusion between the propagandist and the propagandee, this theory can be allied with a more general assertion, in that there is no '"zero" point from which to begin' (Ellul, 1973 p260). It is not possible to make "something out of nothing" and in this context the *line of beauty* cannot work in isolation – as has been explored throughout this text. This consideration serves as further endorsement of the role of Hogarth within this research, as through *The Analysis of Beauty* his ardent avowal of the aesthetic theories to which he was committed can arguably be considered as a propagandist promotion of what Hogarth believed to be an ideal. Regardless, the *line of beauty* as a pictorial trope capable of attraction remains an undeniably useful mechanism in and of itself for propagandist employment in the construction of artworks specific to the promotion of a message.

Potential Future Research

With the focus upon attraction, one of the threads of thinking in relation to this research and which remains primarily unexplored because of the specific confines of this text albeit alluded to, is the connection between Hogarth's *line of beauty* and eroticism. When this aspect of the significance of the *line* is considered within a technological context it opens up a new area of investigation that parallels key themes already considered yet specifically places them within a 'nightmare marriage between sex and technology' (Ballard, 2011 introduction) and which is therefore worthy of further development. J. G. Ballard's observation of a 'marriage of reason and nightmare' (2011 introduction) reflects contextual and temporal factors surrounding World War I, bringing the concept firmly within the realms of this text yet offering a new path to follow as an intriguing research thread. As commented upon previously, in relation to how one perceives an artwork Turner connects the movement of a viewer's eye with desire, through the 'aesthetic motion' required (2001 p40), and this can only be enhanced when that viewer's imagination contributes to the process. From this perspective, therefore, if one's attraction to the *line of beauty* is linked to a "desire" within us, the possibility exists for this to be expanded in order to consider whether this desire is connected to aesthetics in the form of sensuality and eroticism. Ogée writes how 'Hogarth defines a dynamic

aesthetics of “pleasing discovery” illustrated by the line’s most erotic way of gradually teasing knowledge out of form until the “sublime” climax:’ (2001 p63), and when this is considered from the point of view of a so-called “marriage of sex and technology”, it is the *line*’s function as a mechanism for extraction in addition to its ability to attract, that confers a supplemental value upon its manifestation.

As commented upon in this research, there is a hypothesis that connects an erotic articulation of the *line of beauty* with the presentation of a woman’s fan, in that it is this movement ‘thus registered and betrayed in its dynamic deployment’ that conveys ‘the thoughts and emotions of its owner’ (Rosenthal, 2001 p122). This latter point can be extended and in so doing highlights a correlation with the poster as a pictorial medium: Garelick notes how a Jules Cheret poster of Loie Fuller, advertising a performance at the Folies-Bergère, bears no resemblance to her at all, nor accurately depicts Fuller’s immersion in the voluminous fabrics that were key to her performances (2007 p166). Cheret was not alone in this visual misrepresentation: Fuller’s performances elicited the *perception* of erotic imagery, and it was this the artists and sculptors who immortalised her desired to capture (p170). More importantly in the context of the points made above is that these artists were projecting their and the audience’s own desires and fantasies onto these two- and three-dimensional representations of this particular Modernist dancer (p170). In citing Fuller as an example it emphasises the suggested eroticism that can be allied to the *line of beauty*, and certainly Ogée remarks that the “pleasure of the pursuit” as described by Hogarth is centred ‘at the heart of true eroticism’ (2001 p64). In employing these examples to endorse a foundation from which to begin a prospective, additional research theme, the connective thread to technology and the mechanistic lies in Fuller’s mechanomorphic serpentine dance. Not only does this represent the articulation of literal “Lines of Beauty”, it also reflects the concept of a subsumption into the prosthesis that is arguably required for the machinery of war. If there are already documented investigations into the *line of beauty* and its connection to eroticism, as well as equally-archived accounts of a relationship between sex and technology, it is the combination of both threads – that is to say the utilisation of the former as a mechanism by which to explore the latter – that makes for an innovative discourse that can be further developed. These considerations embrace a line of reasoning leading directly from the central premise of this text and therefore serve in support of the aims and objectives of this research.

Contributory Considerations

In positioning this study within existing theories and assumptions surrounding artworks that lie within the genre of visual conflict propaganda and therefore considering any potential contribution to the conversation, it is imperative to concentrate upon the importance of the *line of beauty* as a construct in the ways that have been examined throughout this text. The *line* serves as a productive mechanism by which to analyse the imagery in this regard because of the multi-faceted connotations its presence indicates, particularly when considered as part of the construction of a medium for information-distribution such as the functional object of the poster. These connotations include the construct's aesthetic legacy, its genealogy endorsed by artists including Lomazzo and Michelangelo, both of whom selected the serpentine curve as a signifier of movement at its most beautiful, a theory with which Hogarth concurred and subsequently documented in his published manuscript. These historical analyses affirm the *line*'s role as a pictorial representative for movement, and when the construct is consequently embedded within an artwork of propagandist intent its literal depiction of movement acquires a further implication because the pictorial trope now epitomises movement from a metaphoric viewpoint. The construct therefore demonstrates dual meaning that can be perceived as such by the onlooker, with the consequence that it is advantageously exploitable as a propagandist tool.

In clarification of the above, these multiple manifestations of what the *line of beauty* can signify underscore its potential value and serve to explain the ways in which the *line* can be employed in the unpacking and subsequent assessment of the artwork within which it is encountered. Within the pictorial propaganda poster, therefore, the *line of beauty* can represent a dividing "line", demonstrating the demarcation between differing versions of a real in the form of a poster constructed as a diptych. The *line* can also be illustrative of a moving mass of soldiers, or a waving surface of a road, thereby suggestive of not only literal movement as the *line* serpentines through the image, but also expressive of movement figuratively from the point of view of mobility from one version of reality to another, often "better" real. As shorthand for the pictorial denotation of "beauty", the *line* can additionally be utilised for the attraction of the viewer to something which could be considered as iniquitous; the *line of beauty* can be appropriated to detract from what is arguably a "facade" present in a conflict propaganda poster related to recruitment, for example, yet also be present in the conflict artwork created as a response to that particular campaign. In this latter respect, the *line* that is symbolic of a "something beautiful" embedded

within a somewhat abhorrent subject matter may be as much about the artist's requisite to latch onto "beauty" for his or her own need, as it is about ultimately attracting others to the artwork under construction. All these examples serve in support of the *line of beauty* as a productive visual construct worthy of an analytical focus in and of itself, and moreover sanction the importance of the *line* as a pictorial trope in an attempt to ascertain alternative insights into early twentieth century pictorial conflict propaganda in ways which can affect the perspective of previously considered appraisals of this particular genre of artwork.

In conclusion, therefore, it is of supplemental interest to learn that even at the end of his life Hogarth did not simply defend his theories documented within *The Analysis of Beauty*, but was, in fact, still 'excited by them' (Uglow, 2002 p691). This enthusiasm contributes to how his observations and subsequent analyses of the same are indicative of the strength of the aesthetic legacy pertaining to the genealogical chain of which the *line of beauty* is an integral link. Consequently, in pursuing a reasonable articulation of his concept, Hogarth reveals that the pursuit he had undertaken in an attempt to understand the 'mystery of beauty had defied time and language' (Uglow, 2002 p691). This research has endeavoured to explore these concepts in the context of a very specific genre of artwork – namely early twentieth century visual conflict propaganda with an emphasis upon the pictorial poster. In so doing it exposes a constructive way of examining the role of the pictorial trope within an image, and thereby aptly serves to underline not only the ubiquity of the *line of beauty* as a specific visible continuum to which a viewer can relate, but also the prospective relevance of this particular pictorial trope as a productive analytical tool.

List of Images

Fig. 11 *Mousehole Penzance* 1932
A. Stuart-Hill
http://gerryco23.wordpress.com/2011/07/19/british-masters-in-search-of-england - accessed 9 February 2013

Fig. 12 *Keep it Coming – Waste Nothing* 1917
George Illian
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g10000/3g10000/3g10100/3g10126v.jpg - accessed 28 February 2013

Fig. 13 *Discobolos* date unknown
Roman copy of Greek bronze, original by Myron c450BC
Mannerism p82

Fig. 14 *The Ypres Salient at Night* 1918
Paul Nash
http://www.iwm.org.uk/collections/item/object/20069 - accessed 26 June 2012

Fig. 15 *Café* 1910-1911
Percy Wyndham Lewis
Vorticism and Abstract Art in the First Machine Age Volume 1: Origins and Development p16

Fig. 16 *The Painter and his Pug* 1745 [Detail]
William Hogarth
http://www.tate.org.uk/art/artworks/hogarth-the-painter-and-his-pug-n00112 - accessed 1 February 2013

Fig. 17 *Gulielmus Hogarth* 1749 [Detail]
William Hogarth
The Analysis of Beauty endplate 9

Fig. 18 *The Isle of Man* date unknown
Charles Pears
http://www.trueartworks.com/poster.php/0000-2620 – accessed 7 November 2012

Fig. 19 *To Triumph, Subscribe to the National Loan* 1917
Georges Goursat [Sem]
Revolutionary Tides: The Art of the Political Poster 1914-1989 p34

Fig. 20 *Bavarians! Your Land is Burning!* 1919
Wera von Bartels
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g10000/3g11000/3g11500/3g11503v.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Fig. 21 *Women Work for the Brothers at the Front* c1936-1939
Carles Fontseré
http://www.elmundo.es/albumes/2007/01/04/carteles/index_7.html - accessed 6 February 2013

Fig. 22 *Feed the Guns with War Bonds and Help to End the War* 1918 © IWM
Bert Thomas
http://www.vads.ac.uk/x-large.php?uid=28645&sos=0 – accessed 8 May 2013

Fig. 23 *Feed the Guns with War Bonds* 1918 © IWM
Sidney Stanley
http://www.vads.ac.uk/x-large.php?uid=28559&sos=0 – accessed 8 May 2013

Fig. 24 *Bring Him Home with War Bonds* 1918 © IWM
Sidney Stanley
http://www.vads.ac.uk/x-large.php?uid=28560&sos=0 – accessed 8 May 2013

Fig. 25 *Un-Titling Sidney Stanley*, 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p65

Fig. 26 *Enlist* 1915
Fred Spear
Propaganda Prints: A History of Art in the Service of Social and Political Change p103

Fig. 27 *Worth Fighting For?* 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p68

Fig. 28 *Malvern* 1924
Graham Petrie
http://collectionsonline.nmsi.ac.uk/detail.php?type=related&kv=228595&t=objects – accessed 20 May 2013

Fig. 29 *Enlist* 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p69

Fig. 30 *2nd City of London Battalion, Royal Fusiliers. Recruits Required at Once to Complete this Fine Battalion* 1915 [Detail]
Savile Lumley
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g10000/3g10000/3g10900/3g10971v.jpg - accessed 21 February 2013

Fig. 31 *What Is Our One Demand?* 2011
Adbusters
http://thetyee.ca/News/2011/10/07/Kalle-Lasn-Occupy-Wall-Street/ - accessed 15 February 2012

Fig. 32 *The Call to Duty – Join the Army for Home and Country* c1917
Artist Unknown
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g00000/3g07000/3g07500/3g07565v.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Fig. 33 *Shut Down the Corporations* 2011-2012
Katherine Ball
http://occuprint.org/Info/OWSJ - accessed 15 February 2012

Fig. 34 *For Every Fighter a Woman Worker* 1918
Ernest Hamlin Baker
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3b50000/3b52000/3b52900/3b52923r.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Fig. 35 *Spain Fights for its Independence* 1936-1939
Gori Muñoz
http://weblioteca.uv.es/bdigital/carteles/Cart_01_0082/00000001.jpg - accessed 9 September 2013

Fig. 36 *Forward* 1943-1944
Artist Unknown
Revolutionary Tides: The Art of the Political Poster 1914-1989 p48

Fig. 37 *Long Kesh Concentration Camp* 1971
Artist Unknown
Propaganda Prints: A History of Art in the Service of Social and Political Change p195

Fig. 38 *Prevent the Venomous Influence of Cultural Depravity* 1996
Truong Trang Tri Mỹ Thuật Dông Nai
Tranh Cô Dông [Posters]
Vu Mỹ Thuật [Fine Arts Department] *Tranh Cô Dông* [*Posters*] (1996), N Hanoi: Ministry of Culture and Information p76

Fig. 39 *Nothing to Lose* c2012
Bizhan Khodabandeh
http://occuprint.org/Info/OWSJ - accessed 22 May 2012

Fig. 40 *Fighting for a Better Future* 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p85

Fig. 41 *Florence A., Running* [plate 39] 1878-1879
Eadweard Muybridge
Eadweard Muybridge: The Human and Animal Locomotion Photographs p39

Fig. 42 *Lancer's Charge* 1914-15
Umberto Boccioni
Futurism p68

Fig. 43 *Flexioned March* 1895
Re-photographed tracings made from projected and overlapped filmed images
Etienne-Jules Marey
Collège de France
Picturing Time p172

Fig. 44 *Step Into Your Place* 1915
Artist Unknown
Revolutionary Tides: The Art of the Political Poster 1914-1989 p30

Fig. 45 *Marching Men* 1916
C. R. W. Nevinson
ANTLIFF, M; GREENE, V (Eds.) (2010) *The Vorticists: Manifesto for a Modern World* London: Tate Publishing p43

Fig. 46 *Searching and Slap* 1911
Anton Giulio Bragaglia
http://i12bent.tumblr.com/page/1341 - accessed 12 January 2014

Fig. 47 *Velocità Astratta (è Passata L'Automobile)* [Velocity of an Automobile] 1913
Giacomo Balla
http://www.italica.rai.it/scheda.php?scheda=futurastrattismo_1&cat=arte – accessed 29 April 2012

Fig. 48 *Arab Horse, Gallop* 1887
Album G, plate 67, Hôtel de Ville, Paris
Etienne-Jules Marey
Picturing Time p125

Fig. 49 *Sweepstake Prix de L'Arc de Triomphe* 1935
A. M. Cassandre
http://www.trueartworks.com/poster.php/0000-1666 - accessed 7 November 2012

Fig. 50 *Are You Trained To Do Your Share? Plattsburg* [sic] 1917
Artist Unknown
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g00000/3g09000/3g09000/3g09021v.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Fig. 51 *More Men! More Arms! More Ammunition!* 1936
Jaume Solá
PRESTON, P. et al (Eds.) (2001) *The Spanish Civil War: Dreams + Nightmares* London: Imperial War Museum p22

Fig. 52 *Portrait of Loie Fuller* 1902 [Detail]
Frederick Glasier
http://www.shorpy.com/node/1641?size=_original – accessed 20 October 2012

Fig. 53 *Red Stone Dancer* c1913
Henri Gaudier-Brzeska
ANTLIFF, M; GREENE, V (Eds.) (2010) *The Vorticists: Manifesto for a Modern World* London: Tate Publishing p106

Fig. 54 *Famous Leap by Peggy St Lo* c1930s
Artist Unknown
Modernism, Technology, and the Body p112

Fig. 55 *Reichs Sports Day for the League of German Maidens* 1934
Ludwig Hohlwein
AULICH, J. (2011) *War Posters: Weapons of Mass Communication*
London: Thames and Hudson © Imperial War Museum 2007 p117

Fig. 56 *Deco Ballerina* 2011-2012
Camila Schindler de Souza
http://occuprint.org/Info/OWSJ - accessed 17 February 2012

Fig. 57 *La Loie Fuller* c1895
Jean de Paleologue [PAL]
http://www.allposters.com/-sp/La-Loie-Fuller-Posters_i2553473_.htm
- accessed 27 May 2013

Fig. 58 *Bichonnade Leaping* c1905
Jacques-Henri Lartigue © Jacques-Henri Lartigue Foundation
http://www.bbc.co.uk/photography/genius/gallery/lartigue.shtml -
accessed 6 November 2012

Fig. 59 *Direct tracings of the movement of an insect's wing in flight* 1868
Etienne-Jules Marey
Notice sur les titres et travaux scientifiques du Dr Marey
Picturing Time p31

Fig. 60 *Change of Position* 1911
Anton Giulio Bragaglia
http://tracesofthereal.com/2011/01/24/they-called-it-photodynamism/ -
accessed 13 October 2012

Fig. 61 *Slow Run* 1885
Stereoscopic photographs of a point on the coccyx of a moving subject
Etienne-Jules Marey
Cinémathèque Française
Picturing Time p101

Fig. 62 William Hogarth's "Lines of Beauty" c1753
The Analysis of Beauty p141; endplate 9 [detail]; endplate 8 [detail]

Fig. 63 *Lines of Beauty* 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope
p112

Fig. 64 *Nude Descending a Staircase (No. 2)* 1912
Marcel Duchamp
The Philadelphia Museum of Art, Philadelphia, USA:
http://www.marcelduchamp.net/Nude_Descending_a_Staircase.php -
accessed 3 April 2012

Fig. 65 *Jody Sperling in "Ether" from 'Dance of the Elements'* date unknown
© Julie Lemberger
Electric Salome: Loie Fuller's Performance of Modernism p226

Fig. 66 *Horse and Rider* c1912
Carlo Carrà
http://www.artelista.com/en/great-masters/artwork/4242725244752171-horse-and-rider-1912.html - accessed 8 September 2012

Fig. 67 *Returning to the Trenches* 1914
C. R. W. Nevinson
http://www.gallery.ca/en/see/collections/artwork_viewer.php?mkey=2272 – accessed 9 January 2012

Fig. 68 *Troops Resting* c1916
C. R. W. Nevinson
Images of Wartime: British Art and Artists of World War 1 © 1991 The Imperial War Museum p40

Fig. 69 *A Single Command in Transport at the Service of the War* 1936-1939
From a Political Party without title
Artist Unknown
The Palette and The Flame: Posters of the Spanish Civil War p84

Fig. 70 *A Single Command in Transport at the Service of the War* 1936-1939 – *manipulated* 2011-2012
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p120

Fig. 71 *The Wye Valley* 1946
GWR
Frank Newbould
http://www.urban75.org/photos/wales/posters.html - accessed 5 November 2012

Fig. 72 *The Wye Valley 1946 – manipulated* 2011-2012
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p120

Fig. 73 *Fight For It Now* 1943
Abram Games
http://savefinsburyhealthcentre.wordpress.com/history - accessed 23 May 2012

Fig. 74 *Fighting for a Better Future* [with text] 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p121

Fig. 75 *The London Underground as Visualisation* 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p122

Fig. 76 *After the Battle* 1918
Paul Nash
A Terrible Beauty: British Artists in the First World War p138

Fig. 77 *Scotland For Ever* 1881
Elizabeth Thompson (Lady Butler)
http://www.leedsartgallery.co.uk/gallery/listings/l0081.php - accessed 29 April 2012

Fig. 78 *Step Into Your Place* 2013-14
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p134

Fig. 79 *The Vorticist* 1912
Percy Wyndham Lewis
© 2003 Estate of Mrs G A Wyndham Lewis
http://www.southampton.gov.uk/s-leisure/artsheritage/sotonartgallery/search/view-artwork.asp?acc_num=1429&show_page=interpretation – accessed 19 February 2013

Fig. 80 *Study for Returning to the Trenches* c1914 © Tate
C. R. W. Nevinson
http://www.tate.org.uk/art/artworks/nevinson-study-for-returning-to-the-trenches-t00249 - accessed 22 June 2012

Fig. 81 Film still from *The Battle of the Somme* 1916
Time code 00:03:28
Geoffrey H Malins & J. B. McDowell
The Battle of the Somme

Fig. 82 Sketch of the German Army Marching Through Belgium c1914-1918
Artist Unknown
http://thefirstworldwar.blogspot.co.uk/ - accessed 27 October 2012

Fig. 83 *An Appeal To You* 1915
Artist Unknown
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g10000/3g11000/3g11300/3g11317v.jpg - accessed 21 February 2013

Fig. 84 *Existence* 1917-1918
Paul Nash
Images of Wartime: British Art and Artists of World War 1 © 1991 The Imperial War Museum p50

Fig. 85 Film still from *The Battle of the Somme* 1916
Time code 00:56:00
Geoffrey H Malins & J. B. McDowell
The Battle of the Somme

Fig. 86 *The Menin Road* 1918-1919
Paul Nash
A Crisis of Brilliance: Five Young British Artists and The Great War p290-291

Fig. 87 *A Reading of Ovid (Tyros)* 1921
Percy Wyndham Lewis
Wyndham Lewis p44

Fig. 88 *Ellis Gamble's Trade Card* c1723-1733
William Hogarth
http://www.britishmuseum.org/research/collection_online/collection_object_details.aspx?objectId=1622852&partId=1&searchText=hogarth+trade+card&images=true&page=1 – accessed 30 May 2013

Fig. 89 Untitled, 1869
Albert Robida
http://www.paulpert.com/prophesies.htm - accessed 30 May 2013

Fig. 90 E. E. Briscoe
June 9 1915 issue
PUNCH (1915) *Punch, Or The London Charivari: Vol. CXLVIII January-June 1915* London: The Whitefriars Press p441

Fig. 91 F. H. Townsend
March 3 1915 issue
PUNCH (1915) *Punch, Or The London Charivari: Vol. CXLVIII January-June 1915* London: The Whitefriars Press [Supplement] p180-181

Fig. 92 *Chocolat Klaus* 1903
Leonetto Cappiello
The Poster: A Worldwide Survey and History p125

Fig. 93 *The Birth of a Nation* 1915
Artist Unknown
http://www.vinmag.com/online/prodshow/AP915___Birth_Of_A_Nation__D_W_Griffith_Silent_Movie_Poster_1915__30x40cm_Art_Print_/AP915-birth-of-a-nation-d-w-griffith-movie-poster-1915.html - accessed 27 May 2013

Fig. 94 *You Are Wanted By The U.S. Army 660 Market St. San Francisco or Any Army Recruiting Station* 1915-1918
K. M. Bara
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g00000/3g07000/3g07500/3g07557v.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Fig. 95 *Recruiting Posters Outside Brick House, North Street, Dunmow* 1915
Artist Unknown
http://1914-1918.invisionzone.com/forums/index.php?showtopic=42092&st=25 – accessed 27 May 2013

Fig. 96 *Britain Needs You At Once* 1915
Artist Unknown
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g10000/3g11000/3g11200/3g11248v.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Fig. 97 *On The Way To The Trenches* 1915
C. R. W. Nevinson
http://www.modjourn.org/render.php?view=mjp_object&id=mjp.image.NevinsonChristopher.4 – accessed 14 November 2012

Fig. 98 *Elliptic Hyperboloids as a 'Line of Beauty'* 2013
Georgina Williams
Lines of Beauty: Propaganda, the Poster, and the Pictorial Trope p171

Fig. 99 *Your Country's Call. Isn't This Worth Fighting For? Enlist now* 1915
Artist Unknown
http://www.loc.gov/pictures/resource/cph.3g10829/ - accessed 13 April 2013

Fig. 100 *Cabiria* 1914
Artist Unknown
http://www.imwatchingmovies.com/cabiria-1914/ - accessed 29 May 2013

Fig. 101 Poster for Safety Matches c1900
Adolfo Hohenstein
The Poster: A Worldwide Survey and History p85

Fig. 102 *Topiel* [The Abyss] 1917
Mikhail Kalmanson
http://movieposteroftheday.tumblr.com/post/31134845886/theabyss – accessed 27 May 2013

Fig. 103 *Destroy This Mad Brute – Enlist. U.S. Army* c1917
Harry R. Hopps
http://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:'Destroy_this_mad_brute'_WWI_propaganda_poster_(US_version).jpg – accessed 20 November 2013

Fig. 104 Film still from *The Battle of the Somme* 1916
Time code 00:10:31
Geoffrey H Malins & J. B. McDowell
The Battle of the Somme

Fig. 105 Film still from *The Battle of the Somme* 1916
Time code 00:32:45
Geoffrey H Malins & J. B. McDowell
The Battle of the Somme

Fig. 106 *Thanks to the Army and Navy from the Kaiser and the People* 1917
Artist Unknown
http://www.firstworldwar.com/posters/uk.htm - accessed 15 February 2012

Fig. 107 *British Infantry Awaiting Orders to Move Forward from a Reserve Trench near Tilloy-Les-Mofflaines* 1917
© IWM (Q1995)
Ernest Brooks
http://www.iwm.org.uk/collections/item/object/205191421 - accessed 3 June 2013

Fig. 108 *Shelling the Duckboards* c1917
Paul Nash
UNKNOWN, (Eds.) (1918) *British Artists at the Front: Part III: Paul Nash* London: "Country Life" Ltd & George Newnes p31

Fig. 109 *The German Tango: "From East to West and West to East, I Dance With Thee"* c1917
Louis Raemaekers
http://chethamslibrary.blogspot.sg/2013/07/the-german-tango.html - accessed 14 January 2014

Fig. 110 *Flooded Trench on the Yser* 1915
C. R. W. Nevinson
A Terrible Beauty: British Artists in the First World War p114

Fig. 111 *The Rye Marshes* 1932
Paul Nash for Shell Mex & BP
http://blog.eyemagazine.com/?p=557 - accessed 5 May 2012

Fig. 112 *Pears' Soap* 1900
Artist Unknown
http://c590298.r98.cf2.rackcdn.com/TOM3_333.JPG - accessed 31 May 2013

Fig. 113 *For Horsenden Hill* 1914 © TfL from the London Transport Museum Collection
Dora McLaren
https://ltmuseum.app.box.com/s/7f16pedi066arna13o4z - accessed 14 August 2014

Fig. 114 *Follow The Pied Piper – Join the United States School Garden Army* c1917
Maginel Wright Enright
http://lcweb2.loc.gov/service/pnp/cph/3g00000/3g03000/3g03600/3g03691v.jpg - accessed 11 February 2013

Works Cited

ADAM, H. C. (Ed.) (2010) *Eadweard Muybridge: The Human and Animal Locomotion Photographs* Trans: HELTAY, H. Köln: Taschen GmbH

ADORNO, T. (2001) *The Culture Industry* New York: Routledge Classics

APOLLINAIRE, G. (2001) *Apollinaire on Art: Essays and Reviews 1902-1918* Trans: SULEIMAN, S. edited by BREUNIG, L. C. Boston: MFA Publications

ARISTOTLE (2010) *Aristotle: Poetics* Trans: BUTCHER, S. H. CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform

ARMSTRONG, T. (1998) *Modernism, Technology, and the Body* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

ARNHEIM, R. (1956) *Art and Visual Perception: A Psychology of the Creative Eye*, London: Faber and Faber Limited

AUGUSTINE (1955) Confessions, translated and edited by OUTLER, A. C. [online] Available from http://www9.georgetown.edu/faculty/jod/augustine/conf.pdf [accessed 2 October 2012]

BACON, F. (2008) Of Beauty IN: BACON, F. *24 Essays by Francis Bacon* Maryland: Wildside Press 177-178

BADSEY, S. D. (1983) Battle of the Somme: British War-Propaganda *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 3:2, 99-115

BADSEY, S. (2011) Mass Politics and the Western Front *BBC – History – History in Depth* [online] Available from http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/british/britain_wwone/war_media_01.shtm [accessed 14 March 2013]

BALLA, A. (1987) My Uncle Giacomo Balla, Trans: KUNZLE, M. IN: BORTOLOTTI, N. (Ed.) *Balla: The Futurist* Trans: KUNZLE, M. Milano: Nuove edizioni Gabriele Mazzotta 7-8

BALLARD, J. G. (2011) *Crash* London: Fourth Estate

BARBUSSE, H. (1926) *Under Fire* Trans: FITZWATER WRAY, W. London: Everyman's Library: J M Dent & Sons Ltd

BARTHES, R. (1977) *Image Music Text* Trans: HEATH, S. London: Fontana Press

BARTHES, R. (1993) *Camera Lucida* Trans: HOWARD, R. London: Vintage Classics

The Battle of the Somme (1916, 2008) Film. Produced by William F. Jury; Cinematography by Geoffrey H. Malins & J. B. McDowell. UK: British Topical Committee for War Films. © 2008 Trustees of The Imperial War Museum/Strike Force Entertainment Ltd.

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1983) *Simulations* Trans: FOSS, P. et al Los Angeles: Semiotext[e]

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1993) *The Transparency of Evil* Trans: BENEDICT, J. London: Verso

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1994) *Simulacra and Simulation* Trans: FARIA GLASER, S. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press

BAUDRILLARD, J. (2001) The Murder of the Real IN: BAUDRILLARD, J. *The Vital Illusion* edited by WITWER, J. New York: Columbia University Press 59-83

BENJAMIN, A. (2005) Introduction IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 1-2

BENJAMIN, W. (1999) *Illuminations* Trans: ZORN, H. London: Pimlico

BENJAMIN, W. (2008) *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction* Trans: UNDERWOOD, J. A. London: Penguin Books Limited

BERGER, J. et al (1972) *Ways of Seeing* London: Penguin Books Ltd

BERGSON, H. L. (1910) *Time and Free Will: An Essay on the Immediate Data of Consciousness* Trans: POGSON, F. L. London: Swan Sonnenschein & Co.

BERNAYS, E. L (1947) The Engineering of Consent IN: The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, March 1947 vol. 250 113-120

BERNAYS, E. L. (2004) *Propaganda* New York: Ig Publishing

BISHOP, R; PHILLIPS, J; (2011) *Modernist Avant-Garde Aesthetics and Contemporary Military Technology: Technicities of Perception* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press Ltd

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Technical Manifesto of Futurist Sculpture 1912 (published as a leaflet by *Poesia* (Milan), 11 April 1912) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 51-65

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) The Plastic Foundations of Futurist Sculpture and Painting 1913 (Published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 15 March 1913) Trans: BRAIN, R. In: IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 88-90

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Plastic Dynamism 1913 (12 December 1913: Lecture published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 15 December 1913) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 92-94

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Absolute Motion + Relative Motion = Dynamism 1914 (Advance extract from Pittura scultura futuriste, 15 March 1914) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 150-154

BOCCIONI, U. et al (2009) Manifesto of the Futurist Painters 1910 (published as a leaflet by *Poesia* (Milan), 11 February 1910) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 24-27

BOCCIONI, U. et al (2009) Futurist Paintings Technical Manifesto 1910 (published as a leaflet by Poesia (Milan), 11 April 1910. This English version from the catalogue of the 'Exhibition of Works by the Italian Futurist Painters', Sackville Gallery, London, March 1912) IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 27-31

BOCCIONI, U. et al (2009) The Exhibitors to the Public 1912 (Exhibition catalogue, Galerie Bernheim-Jeune, Paris. This English version from the catalogue of the 'Exhibition of Works by the Italian Futurist Painters', Sackville Gallery, London, March 1912) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 45-50

BRAGAGLIA, A. G. (2009) Futurist Photodynamism 1911 (first mentioned in an advertisement in *Lacerba* (Florence) 1 July 1913, Trans: TISDALL, C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 38-45

BRAUN, M. (1994) *Picturing Time* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

BROWNING, R. (1993) *The Pied Piper of Hamelin; A Child's Story* New York: Alfred A. Knopf

BRYAN, J. (2011) 'Shells, Shots and Shrapnel': *Picturegoer* Goes to War IN: HAMMOND, M; WILLIAMS, M; (Eds.) *British Silent Cinema and the Great War* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 64-76

BRYDER, T. (2008) Conceptual Elements for a Theory of Visual Political Propaganda *Psicología Política* No 37, November 2008, 101-117

BURKE, E. (1958) *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* edited by BOULTON, J. T. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul

BURKE, J. (1955) Introduction IN: HOGARTH, W. *The Analysis of Beauty* edited by BURKE, J. Oxford: Clarendon Press xiii-lxii

CARRUTHERS, S. L. (2005) Missing in Authenticity? Media War in the Digital Age IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 236-250

CIALDINI, R. B. (2007) *Influence: The Psychology of Persuasion* New York: First Collins Business Essentials

CLARK, T. (1997) *Art and Propaganda in the Twentieth Century: The Political Image in the Age of Mass Culture* London: George Weidenfeld and Nicolson Ltd

CLIFFORD, J. (1988) *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art* Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Concise Oxford English Dictionary, Luxury Edition (2009) 11th Ed. Edited by SOANES, C; STEVENSON, A. Oxford: Oxford University Press

CORK, R. (1976) *Vorticism and Abstract Art in the First Machine Age Volume 1: Origins and Development* London: Gordon Fraser

CORK, R. (1976) *Vorticism and Abstract Art in the First Machine Age Volume 2: Synthesis and Decline* London: Gordon Fraser

CORK, R. (1994) Suffering into Art: Howson and Bosnia IN: *Peter Howson: Bosnia* London: Imperial War Museum 35-42

CREEL, G. (1920) George Creel's Rememberance of the American WWI Poster Campaign: The "Battle of the Fences" from How We Advertised America [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/George_Creel_WW1_posters_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

CUBITT, S. (2005) Distribution and Media Flows *Cultural Politics* Vol. 1 Issue 2, 193-214

DAGOGNET, F. (1992) *Etienne-Jules Marey: A Passion for the Trace* Trans: GALETA, R; HERMAN, J. New York: Zone Books

DELEUZE, G. (1993) What Is Desire? IN: BOUNDAS, C. V. (Ed.) *The Deleuze Reader* New York: Columbia University Press 136-142

DELEUZE, G; GUATTARI, F. (1988) *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* Trans: MASSUMI, B. London: The Athlone Press

DEWEY, J. (2005) *Art as Experience* New York: Perigree

DODGSON, C. (1918) The Artist IN: *British Artists at the Front: Part I: C. R. W. Nevinson* London: "Country Life" Ltd & George Newnes Ltd 1-4

DURHAM PETERS, J. (1997) What Did Walter Benjamin See? Image Cultures 1890-1933: Beauty's Veils: The Ambivalent Iconoclasm of Kierkegaard and Benjamin IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 9-32

EIFLING, S. (2011) Adbusters' Kalle Lasn Talks About OccupyWallStreet *The Tyee* [online] Available from: http://thetyee.ca/News/2011/10/07/Kalle-Lasn-Occupy-Wall-Street - accessed 15 February 2012

EISENSTEIN, S. (2010) *Sergei Eisenstein: Selected Works Volume 1: Writings, 1922-1934* edited by TAYLOR, R. London: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd

EKSTEINS, M. (1995) *The Cultural Impact of the Great War* IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 201-212

EKSTEINS, M. (2000) *Rites of Spring: The Great War and the Birth of the Modern Age* London: Papermac

ELLUL, J. (1964) *The Technological Society* Trans: WILKINSON, J. New York: Vintage Books

ELLUL, J. (1973) *Propaganda: The Formation of Men's Attitudes* Trans: KELLEN, K. and LERNER, J. New York: Vintage Books

ELSAESSER, T. (2004) The New Film History as Media Archaeology, Trans: unknown *CiNéMAS: revue d'études cinématographiques / Cinémas: Journal of Film Studies* Vol. 14, No. 2-3, 2004 75-117

FAGIOLO, M; (1987) Balla in his Time – An Album of his Life and Works, Trans: KUNZLE, M. IN: BORTOLOTTI, N. (Ed.) *Balla: The Futurist* Trans: KUNZLE, M. Milano: Nuove edizioni Gabriele Mazzotta 9-147

FOSTER, H. (1997) Prosthetic Gods *Modernism/modernity* Vol. 4, No 2, April 1997, 5-38. John Hopkins University Press

FREUD, S. (1930) Civilization and its Discontents [online] Trans: STRACHEY, J. p37-74 W.W. Norton and Company, Available from http://eres.lndproxy.org/edoc/AH402Freud-09.pdf [accessed 19 February 2013]

FREUD, S. (1955) Beyond the Pleasure Principle IN: *Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Group Psychology and Other Works* Trans: STRACHEY, J. et al, London: Hogarth Press 7-64

FREUD, S. (2012) *Group Psychology and the Analysis of the Ego* Trans: STRACHEY, J., Empire Books

FRY, R. (1981) *Vision and Design* Oxford: Oxford University Press

FUSSELL, P. (2009) A Satire of Circumstance IN: *The Great War and Modern Memory* New York: Sterling Publishing Co., Inc. 1-42

GARELICK, R. K. (2007) *Electric Salome: Loie Fuller's Performance of Modernism* Princeton: Princeton University Press

GAUDIER-BRZESKA, H. (1981) Vortex Gaudier-Brzeska IN: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast: War Number* London: John Lane In: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast 2* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press 33-34

GIBSON, O. (2003) Straw Warns Against Snap Judgements, *The Guardian* [online] 1 April. Available from http://www.guardian.co.uk/media/2003/apr/01/pressandpublishing.Iraqandthemedia2 - accessed 7 March 2013

GOMBRICH, E. H. (1977) *Art and Illusion: A Study in the Psychology of Pictorial Representation*, 5th Ed., London: Phaidon Press

GOUGH, P. (2010) *A Terrible Beauty: British Artists in the First World War* Bristol: Sansom & Company

GRAY, C. (1986) *The Russian Experiment in Art 1863-1922* edited by BURLEIGH-MOTLEY, M. London: Thames & Hudson

GRAY, T. (1955) *Elegy Written in a Country Church-Yard* London: The Rodale Press

GREGG, F. J. (1918) American Artists and the War: The Effort That Is Being Made To Create And Stimulate Propaganda Through Art *Vanity Fair, April 1918* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_poster_art_review_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013] 47 & 94

GUNNING, T. (1995) An Aesthetic of Astonishment: Early Film and the (In)Credulous Spectator IN: WILLIAMS, L. (Ed.) *Viewing Positions: Ways of Seeing Film* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 114-133

HAMMOND, M. (2011) *The Battle of the Somme* (1916): An Industrial Process Film that 'Wounds the Heart' IN: HAMMOND, M; WILLIAMS, M; (Eds.) *British Silent Cinema and the Great War* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 19-38

HARDIE, M; SABIN, A. K. (Eds.) (1920) *War Posters Issued by Belligerent and Neutral Nations 1914-1919* London: A&C Black Ltd.

HAYCOCK, D. B. (2010) *A Crisis of Brilliance: Five Young British Artists and The Great War* London: Old Street Publishing Ltd

HILEY, N. (1995) The British Cinema Auditorium IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 160-170

HERDAN, I; HERDAN, G. (Eds.) (1966) *Lichtenberg's Commentaries on Hogarth's Engravings* London: The Cresset Press

HOGARTH, W. (1997) *The Analysis of Beauty* edited by PAULSON, R. London: Yale University Press

HORKHEIMER, M; ADORNO, T. W. (2002) The Culture Industry: Enlightenment as Mass Deception IN: *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments* Trans: JEPHCOTT, E., edited by SCHMID NOERR, G. Stanford: Stanford University Press 94-136

HULME, T. E. (1994) *The Collected Writings of T. E. Hulme* edited by CSENGERI, K. Oxford: Clarendon Press

HUMPHREYS, R. (1999) *Futurism* London: Tate Publishing

HUMPHREYS, R. (2004) *Wyndham Lewis* London: Tate Publishing

HUMPHREYS, R. (2009) *Futurism: May The Force Be With You* IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 221-227

HUXLEY, A. (1943) *The Art of Seeing*, 3rd Ed. London: Chatto & Windus

HYNES, S. (1990) *A War Imagined: The First World War and English Culture* London: The Bodley Head Ltd

IVINS, W. M. (1969) *Prints and Visual Communication* Cambridge: The MIT Press

JAMES, D; THOMSON, R. (2011) *Posters and Propaganda in Wartime: Weapons of Mass Persuasion* London: Franklin Watts

JOHN (1952) The First Letter of John IN: *The New Testament* IN: *The Holy Bible* New York: Collins

JOHNSTON, J. (1997) Introduction: Friedrich Kittler: Media Theory After Poststructuralism IN: KITTLER, F. A. *Literature, Media, Information Systems* edited by JOHNSTON, J., Amsterdam: OPA 1-26

JONES, N. (2014) *Peace and War: Britain in 1914* London: Head of Zeus Ltd.

KANT, I. (2007) *Critique of Judgement* edited by WALKER, N. Trans: MEREDITH, J. C. Oxford: Oxford University Press

KELLEN, K. (1973) *Introduction* IN: ELLUL, J. *Propaganda: The Formation of Men's Attitudes* Trans: KELLEN, K. and LERNER, J. New York: Vintage Books v-viii

KINDER, J. M. (2009) Iconography of Injury: Encountering the Wounded Soldier's Body in American Poster Art and Photography of World War I IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 340-368

KITTLER, F. A. (1997) *Literature, Media, Information Systems* edited by JOHNSTON, J., Amsterdam: OPA

KLEIN, S. (unpublished manuscript) Spread Spectra: Hedy Lamarr, George Antheill, and Modernist Perception *Talk given at Winchester School of Art (University of Southampton) 4 December 2012*

LATOUR, B. (2004) Why Has Critique Run Out of Steam? From Matters of Fact to Matters of Concern *Critical Inquiry 30* Winter 2004 225-248

LAWRENCE, J. (2006) The Transformation of British Public Politics After the First World War *Past & Present* No. 190, February 2006, 185-216

LE BON, G. (2001) The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind, Batoche Books [online] Available from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/soton/docDetail.action?docID=2004652 [accessed from 20 January 2013]

LEED, E. J. (1979) *No Man's Land: Combat & Identity in World War I* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) (1981) *Blast 1* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press

LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) (1981) Blast: War Number London: John Lane IN: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast 2* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press

LEWIS, P. W. (1963) Part V: 1945-1956 The Writer and the Absolute: Letter to Charles Handley-Read September 2nd 1949 IN: ROSE, W. K. (Ed.) *The Letters of Wyndham Lewis* London: Methuen & Co Ltd 504-505

LYOTARD, J-F. (1984) *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge* Manchester: Manchester University Press

MALVERN, S. (2004) *Modern Art, Britain and the Great War* New Haven: Yale University Press

MANGHANI, S. et al (Eds.) (2006) *General Introduction* MANGHANI, S. et al *Images: A Reader* London: SAGE Publications Ltd. 1-18

MANGHANI, S. (2013) *Image Studies: Theory and Practice* Abingdon: Routledge

MANN, T. (1999) *Doctor Faustus: The Life of the German Composer Adrian Leverkühn as Told by a Friend* Trans: WOODS, J. E. New York: Vintage International

MARINETTI, F. T. (1972) *Marinetti: Selected Writings* edited by FLINT, R. W. London: Secker & Warburg

MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) The Founding and Manifesto of Futurism 1909 (published in *Le Figaro*, (Paris), 20 February 1909) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 19-24

MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) Manifesto of Futurist Dance, Trans: RAINEY, L. IN: RAINEY, L. et al (Eds.) *Futurism: An Anthology* New Haven & London: Yale University Press 234-239
MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) The New Religion-Morality of Speed, Trans: RAINEY, L. IN: RAINEY, L. et al (Eds.) *Futurism: An Anthology* New Haven & London: Yale University Press 224-229

MCKERNAN, L. (2012) Topical Budget: War and Propaganda *BFI Screenonline* [online] Available from http://www.screenonline.org.uk/film/id/583331/index.html [accessed 15 March 2013]

MCLUHAN, M. (1962) *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul

MCLUHAN, M. (1964) *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd

MCLUHAN, M; FIORE, Q. (2008) *The Medium is the Massage* co-ordinated by AGEL, J. London: Penguin Books

MESSINGER, G. S. (1993) An Inheritance Worth Remembering: The British Approach to Official Propaganda During The First World War *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 13:2, 117-127

MITCHELL, W. J. T. (2005) *What Do Pictures Want? The Lives and Loves of Images* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

MITCHELL, W. J. T. (2013) There Are No Visual Media IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 7-14

MOORE, C. (2010) *Propaganda Prints: A History of Art in the Service of Social and Political Change* London: A&C Black Publishers Limited

NEVINSON, C. R. W. (1937) *Paint and Prejudice* London: Methuen Publishers

NIETZSCHE, F. (1969) *Thus Spoke Zarathustra* Trans: HOLLINGDALE, R. J. London: Penguin Books

NIETZSCHE, F. (2003) *The Genealogy of Morals* Trans: SAMUEL, H. B. New York: Dover Publications Inc.

O'DONNELL, V; JOWETT, G. S. (2012) *Propaganda and Persuasion*, 5th Ed., London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

OGÉE, F. (2001) I: Crafting the Erotic Body: The Flesh of Theory: The Erotics of Hogarth's Lines IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 62-75

ONG, W. J. (1982) *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word* London: Methuen

ORCHARD, K (2000) 'A Laugh Like a Bomb': The History and the Ideas of the Vorticists IN: EDWARDS, P. (Ed.) *Blast: Vorticism 1914-1918* Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited 14-23

OSTROW, S. (2005) Rehearsing Revolution and Life: The Embodiment of Benjamin's Artwork Essay at the End of the Age of Mechanical Reproduction IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 226-247

PAULSON, R. (1997) *Introduction* IN: HOGARTH, W. *The Analysis of Beauty* edited by PAULSON, R. London: Yale University Press xvii-lxii
PEPPIS, P. (1997) "Surrounded By A Multitude Of Other Blasts": Vorticism and the Great War *Modernism/Modernity* 4.2 (1997) 39-66

PHAIDON PRESS LTD. (Ed.) (2007) *30,000 Years of Art: The Story of Human Creativity across Time and Space* London: Phaidon Press Limited

PINCHOT, G. (1915) England in War *Harper's Weekly for April 17th, 1915* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_Britain_During_World_War_One_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

PLATO (1991) *The Republic of Plato*, 2nd Ed., Trans: BLOOM, A. New York: Basic Books

PLATO (2001) Philebus, Trans: JOWETT, B. [online] Available from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/soton/docDetail.action [accessed from 1 June 2014]

POUND, E. (1970) *A Memoir of Gaudier-Brzeska* New York: Penguin Books New Directions Books

REEVES, N. (1997) Cinema, Spectatorship and Propaganda: 'Battle of the Somme' (1916) and its Contemporary Audience *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 17:1, 5-28

REEVES, N. (1999) *Official British Film Propaganda* IN: PARIS, M. (Ed.) *The First World War and Popular Cinema: 1914 to the Present* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 27-50

RIBOT, T. (1906) *Essay on the Creative Imagination* Chicago: The Open Court Publishing Company

ROGOFF, I. (2002) Studying Visual Culture IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 2nd Ed. London: Routledge 24-36

ROSENTHAL, A. (2001) II: The Anatomy of Difference: Unfolding Gender: Women and the "Secret" Sign Language of Fans in Hogarth's Work IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 120-141

RUGGIERO, G. (2012) Editor's Note IN: CHOMSKY, N. *Occupy* London: Penguin Books Limited 9-19

SASSOON, S. (1930) *Memoirs of an Infantry Officer* London: Faber & Faber Limited

SASSOON, S. (1936) *Sherston's Progress* London: Faber & Faber Limited

SCHOPENHAUER, A. (2006) *The Essays of Arthur Schopenhauer; The Art of Controversy* Trans: BAILEY SAUNDERS, T. Teddington: The Echo Library

SCHNAPP, J. T. (2005) *Revolutionary Tides: The Art of the Political Poster 1914-1989* Milan: Skira editore S.p.A.

SEVERINI, G. (2009) The Plastic Analogies of Dynamism – Futurist Manifesto 1913 (Ms. September-October 1913) Trans: HIGGITT, J. C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 118-125

SHEARMAN, J. (1967) *Mannerism* London: Penguin Books

SHEN, K. (2009) *Propaganda Posters in China* IN: LANDSBERGER, S. R. et al (Eds.) *Chinese Posters: The IISH-Landsberger Collections* London: Prestel Publishing Limited 8-20
SHESGREEN, S. (Ed.) (1973) *Engravings by Hogarth: 101 Prints* New York: Dover Publications

SLOTERDIJK, P. (1988) *Critique of Cynical Reason* Trans: ELDRED, M. (1987) London: Verso

SMITHER, R. (1993) "A Wonderful Idea of the Fighting": The Question of Fakes in 'The Battle of the Somme' *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 13:2, 149-168

SONTAG, S. (1999) 1970 – Posters: Advertisement, Art, Political Artifact, Commodity IN: BEIRUT, M. et al (Eds.) *Looking Closer 3: Classic Writings on Graphic Design* New York: Allworth Press 196-218

STIEGLER, B. (2011) *Technics and Time, 3: Cinematic Time and the Question of Malaise* Trans: BARKER, S. Stanford: Stanford University Press

TAYLOR, R. (2010) Introduction IN: EISENSTEIN, S. *Sergei Eisenstein: Selected Works Volume 1: Writings, 1922-1934* edited by TAYLOR, R. London: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 1-24

TCHERNYSHOVA, M. (date unknown) Kuzma Petrov-Vodkin *Olga's Gallery* [online] Available from http://www.abcgallery.com/P/petrov-vodkin/petrov-vodkinbio.html [accessed 30 October 2012]

THOMPSON, J. (2007) 'Pictorial Lies'? – Posters and Politics in Britain c1880-1914 *Past & Present* No. 197, November 2007, 177-210

TONEY, A. (1980) An Appreciation IN: TISA, J. (Ed.) *The Palette and The Flame: Posters of the Spanish Civil War* Wellingborough: Collet's (Publishers) Ltd & Sofia: Sofia Press Publishers xv-xxii

TURNER, J. G. (2001) I: Crafting the Erotic Body: “A Wanton Kind of Chace”: Display as Procurement in *A Harlot’s Progress* and its Reception IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 38-61

UGLOW, J. (2002) *Hogarth: A Life and a World* London: Faber and Faber Limited

UNKNOWN (c1918) The Influence of the War on Art *The Great War: The Standard History of the World-Wide Conflict volume CCLXIII* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/pdf/WW1-Artist-Nevinson.pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

VAN DOOREN, I; KRÄMER, P. (1995) The Politics of Direct Address IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 97-107

VINEY, N. (1991) *Images of Wartime: British Art and Artists of World War 1* Newton Abbot: David & Charles plc [images © 1991 The Imperial War Museum]

VIRILIO, P. (1986) *Speed & Politics* Trans: POLIZZOTTI, M. New York: Semiotext(e)

VIRILIO, P. (1989) *War and Cinema: The Logistics of Perception* Trans: CAMILLER, P. London: Verso

WALLAS, G. (1920) Human Nature in Politics, 3rd Ed [online] 1-142 Available from http://socserv2.socsci.mcmaster.ca/~econ/ugcm/3ll3/wallas/humannature.pdf [accessed 14 November 2012]

WALSH, M. J. K. (2002) *C.R.W. Nevinson: This Cult of Violence* New Haven: Yale University Press

Webster’s Revised Unabridged Dictionary (1913) edited by WEBSTER, N. [online] Available from http://1913.mshaffer.com [accessed 28 January 2013]

WEILL, A. (1984) *The Poster: A Worldwide Survey and History* Trans: MYATT, M. London: Sotheby’s Publications

WELCH, D. (2005) ‘Winning Hearts and Minds’: The Changing Context of Reportage and Propaganda, 1900-2003 IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd ix-xxi

WOLLAEGER, M. (2008) *Modernism, Media, and Propaganda: British Narrative from 1900-1945* Princeton: Princeton University Press

XENOPHON (2009) *The Socratic Writings (Memorabilia, Economist, Symposium, Apology, and Hiero)* Trans: DAKYNS, H. G. New York: Digireads Publishing

ZAJONC, R. (1980) Feeling and Thinking: Preferences Need No Inferences, *American Psychologist: February 1980* Vol. 35 No. 2 151-175

Full Bibliography

ABBAS, A. (2013) Faking Globalization IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 282-295

ADAM, H. C. (Ed.) (2010) *Eadweard Muybridge: The Human and Animal Locomotion Photographs* Trans: HELTAY, H. Köln: Taschen GmbH

ADORNO, T. (2007) Commitment, Trans: McDONAGH, F. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 177-195

ADORNO, T. (2007) Letters to Walter Benjamin, Trans: ZOHN, H. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 110-133

ADORNO, T. (2007) Reconciliation Under Duress, Trans: LIVINGSTONE, R. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 151-176

ADORNO, T. (2001) *The Culture Industry* New York: Routledge Classics

ADRIAN, E. D. (1947) *The Physical Background of Perception: Being the Waynflete Lectures Delivered in the College of St Mary Magdalen, Oxford in Hilary Term 1946* Oxford: Oxford University Press

AIZPÚRUA, J. P. F. (1999) The Culture of Antifascism In: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc. 17-24

ALBRINCK, M. (2009) Humanitarians and He-Men: Recruitment Posters and the Masculine Ideal IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 312-339

ALTHUSSER, L. (1984) *Essays on Ideology* London: Verso

ANDREW, D. (1997) A Preface to Disputation IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press vii-xiv

ANDREW, D. (1997) Traditional Arts and the Shock of This Century's Image: Introduction IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 151-154

ANDREW, D. (1997) Vision and Interpretation after Photography: Introduction IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 227-230

ANDREW, D. (1997) What Did Walter Benjamin See? Image Cultures 1890-1933: Introduction IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 3-7

ANTLIFF, M. (2010) Henri Gaudier-Brzeska's *Guerre sociale*: Art, Anarchism and Anti-Militarism in Paris and London, 1910–1915 *Modernism/modernity* Vol. 17, No 1, January 2010 135-169

ANTLIFF, M; GREENE, V (Eds.) (2010) *The Vorticists: Manifesto for a Modern World* London: Tate Publishing

APOLLINAIRE, G. (2001) *Apollinaire on Art: Essays and Reviews 1902-1918* Trans: SULEIMAN, S. edited by BREUNIG, L. C. Boston: MFA Publications

APOLLONIO, U. (2009) Introduction, Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 7-16

ARAC, J. (1988) *Introduction* IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press vii-x

ARENDT, H (1999) Introduction IN: BENJAMIN, W. *Illuminations* Trans: ZORN, H. London: Pimlico 7-55

ARISTOTLE (2010) *Aristotle: Poetics* Trans: BUTCHER, S. H. CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform

ARMITAGE, J. (2003) Art and Fear: an introduction IN: VIRILIO, P. *Art and Fear* London: Continuum 1-24

ARMITAGE, J. (2009) Pursuit in Paris IN: BISHOP, R. (Ed.) *Baudrillard Now: Current Perspectives in Baudrillard Studies* Cambridge: Polity Press 116-135

ARMITAGE, J; BISHOP, R. (2013) *Aesthetics, Vision and Speed: An Introduction to Virilio and Visual Culture* IN: ARMITAGE, J; BISHOP, R. (Eds.) *Virilio and Visual Culture* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1-27

ARMSTRONG, T. (1998) *Modernism, Technology, and the Body* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

ARNHEIM, R. (1956) *Art and Visual Perception: A Psychology of the Creative Eye*, London: Faber and Faber Limited

ASHMEAD-BARTLETT, E. (1917) New Methods in War Described by Bartlett *Hearst's Sunday American Sunday March 4 1917* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/draw_pdf.php?filename=Bartlett.pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

AUGUSTINE (1955) Confessions, translated and edited by OUTLER, A. C. [online] Available from http://www9.georgetown.edu/faculty/jod/augustine/conf.pdf [accessed 2 October 2012]

AULICH, J. (2011) *War Posters: Weapons of Mass Communication* London: Thames and Hudson © Imperial War Museum 2007

AUMONT, J. (1997) Vision and Interpretation after Photography: The Variable Eye, or the Mobilization of the Gaze, Trans: O'BRIEN, C; SHAFTO, S. IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 231-258

BACON, F. (2008) Of Beauty IN: BACON, F. *24 Essays by Francis Bacon* Maryland: Wildside Press 177-178

BADSEY, S. D. (1983) Battle of the Somme: British War-Propaganda *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 3:2, 99-115

BADSEY, S. (2005) 'The Missing Western Front': British Politics, Strategy, and Propaganda in 1918 IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 47-64

BADSEY, S. (2011) Mass Politics and the Western Front *BBC – History – History in Depth* [online] Available from http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/british/britain_wwone/war_media_01.shtm [accessed 14 March 2013]

BAHRANI, Z. (2013) The Archaeology of Violence: The King's Head IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 153-162

BALBUS, I. D. (1988) Disciplining Women: Michel Foucault and the Power of Feminist Discourse IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 138-160

BALLA, A. (1987) My Uncle Giacomo Balla, Trans: KUNZLE, M. IN: BORTOLOTTI, N. (Ed.) *Balla: The Futurist* Trans: KUNZLE, M. Milano: Nuove edizioni Gabriele Mazzotta 7-8

BALLA, G. (2009) *The* Futurist Universe 1918 (Rome, 1918. Published in exhibition catalogue 'Futurballa', Galleria d'Arte Contemporanea, Florence, November 1952) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 219

BALLA, G; DEPERO, F; (2009) Futurist Reconstruction of the Universe 1915, Milan, 11 March 1915. Published as a leaflet by Direzione del Movimento Futurista, Trans: TISDALL, C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 197-200

BALLARD, J. G. (2011) *Crash* London: Fourth Estate

BARBUSSE, H. (1926) *Under Fire* Trans: FITZWATER WRAY, W. London: Everyman's Library: J M Dent & Sons Ltd

BARKER, S. (2009) Transformation as an Ontological Imperative: The [Human] Future According to Bernard Stiegler *Transformations* [online] Issue no. 17 2009 – Bernard Stiegler and the Question of Technics, Available from http://www.transformationsjournal.org/journal/issue_17/article_01.shtml [accessed 27 October 2011]

BARNOUW, E. (1995) A Wartime Remembered IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 7-9

BARTHES, R. (1977) *Image Music Text* Trans: HEATH, S. London: Fontana Press

BARTHES, R. (1993) *Camera Lucida* Trans: HOWARD, R. London: Vintage Classics

The Battle of the Somme (1916, 2008) Film. Produced by William F. Jury; Cinematography by Geoffrey H. Malins & J. B. McDowell. UK: British Topical Committee for War Films. © 2008 Trustees of The Imperial War Museum/Strike Force Entertainment Ltd.

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1983) *Simulations* Trans: FOSS, P. et al Los Angeles: Semiotext[e]

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1993) *The Transparency of Evil* Trans: BENEDICT, J. London: Verso

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1994) *Simulacra and Simulation* Trans: FARIA GLASER, S. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1997) Aesthetic Illusion and Virtual Reality IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 19-27

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1997) The Art of Disappearance IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 28-31

BAUDRILLARD, J. (1997) Objects, Images, and the Possibilities of Aesthetic Illusion IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 7-18

BAUDRILLARD, J. (2001) The Murder of the Real IN: BAUDRILLARD, J. *The Vital Illusion* edited by WITWER, J. New York: Columbia University Press 59-83

BAXELL, R. (2007) *British Volunteers in the Spanish Civil War: The British Battalion in the International Brigades, 1936-1939* Pontypool: Warren & Pell Publishing

BECKS-MALORNY, U. (2007) *Wassily Kandinsky: The Journey to Abstraction* Köln: TASCHEN GmbH

BENJAMIN, A. (2005) Introduction IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 1-2

BENJAMIN, W. (1999) *Illuminations* Trans: ZORN, H. London: Pimlico

BENJAMIN, W. (2007) Conversations with Brecht, Trans: BOSTOCK, A. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 86-99

BENJAMIN, W. (2007) Reply, Trans: ZOHN, H. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 134-141

BENJAMIN, W. (2008) *The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction* Trans: UNDERWOOD, J. A. London: Penguin Books Limited

BERGER, J. et al (1972) *Ways of Seeing* London: Penguin Books Ltd

BERGSON, H. L. (1910) *Time and Free Will: An Essay on the Immediate Data of Consciousness* Trans: POGSON, F. L. London: Swan Sonnenschein & Co.

BERNAYS, E. L (1947) The Engineering of Consent IN: The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, March 1947 vol. 250 113-120

BERNAYS, E. L. (2004) *Propaganda* New York: Ig Publishing

BERNSTEIN, J. M. (2001) Introduction IN: ADORNO, T. *The Culture Industry* New York: Routledge Classics 1-28

BISHOP, R. (2009) Introduction: The End of Baudrillard and Beyond IN: BISHOP, R. (Ed.) *Baudrillard Now: Current Perspectives in Baudrillard Studies* Cambridge: Polity Press 1-16

BISHOP, R; PHILLIPS, J; (2009) Baudrillard and the Evil Genius IN: BISHOP, R. (Ed.) *Baudrillard Now: Current Perspectives in Baudrillard Studies* Cambridge: Polity Press 28-46

BISHOP, R; PHILLIPS, J; (2009) What is a Tank? IN: BISHOP, R. (Ed.) *Baudrillard Now: Current Perspectives in Baudrillard Studies* Cambridge: Polity Press 136-153

BISHOP, R; PHILLIPS, J; (2011) *Modernist Avant-Garde Aesthetics and Contemporary Military Technology: Technicities of Perception* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press Ltd

BLOCH, E. (2007) Discussing Expressionism, Trans: LIVINGSTONE, R. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 16-27

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Absolute Motion + Relative Motion = Dynamism 1914 (Advance extract from Pittura scultura futuriste, 15 March 1914) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 150-154

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Futurist Dynamism and French Painting 1913 (Published in Lacerba (Florence), 1 August 1913) Trans: HIGGITT, J. C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 107-1

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Futurist Painting and Sculpture (extracts) 1914 (From Pittura scultura futuriste, Milan, 1914) Trans: HIGGITT, J. C; BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 172-181

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Plastic Dynamism 1913 (12 December 1913: Lecture published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 15 December 1913) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 92-94

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) The Plastic Foundations of Futurist Sculpture and Painting 1913 (Published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 15 March 1913) Trans: BRAIN, R. In: IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 88-90

BOCCIONI, U. (2009) Technical Manifesto of Futurist Sculpture 1912 (published as a leaflet by *Poesia* (Milan), 11 April 1912) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 51-65

BOCCIONI, U. et al (2009) The Exhibitors to the Public 1912 (Exhibition catalogue, Galerie Bernheim-Jeune, Paris. This English version from the catalogue of the 'Exhibition of Works by the Italian Futurist Painters', Sackville Gallery, London, March 1912) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 45-50

BOCCIONI, U. et al (2009) Futurist Paintings Technical Manifesto 1910 (published as a leaflet by Poesia (Milan), 11 April 1910. This English version from the catalogue of the 'Exhibition of Works by the Italian Futurist Painters', Sackville Gallery, London, March 1912) IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 27-31

BOCCIONI, U. et al (2009) Manifesto of the Futurist Painters 1910 (published as a leaflet by *Poesia* (Milan), 11 February 1910) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 24-27

BOURDIEU, P. (1986) The Forms of Capital, Trans: NICE, R. [online] 1-21 Available from http://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/fr/bourdieu-forms-capital.htm [accessed from 6 October 2012]

BOVÉ, P. A. (1988) The Rationality of Disciplines: The Abstract Understanding of Stephen Toulmin IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 42-70

BRAGAGLIA, A. G. (2009) Futurist Photodynamism 1911 (first mentioned in an advertisement in *Lacerba* (Florence) 1 July 1913, Trans: TISDALL, C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 38-45

BRAUN, M. (1994) *Picturing Time* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

BRAUN, M (2006) Muybridge, Eadweard (1830–1904) IN: LENMAN, R; NICHOLSON, A. (Eds.) *The Oxford Companion to the Photograph* [online] Oxford University Press. Available from http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780198662716.001.0001/acref-9780198662716-e-1070?rskey=pqE0iC&result=2&q=marta braun [accessed 6 November 2012]

BRECHT, B. (2007) Against Georg Lukács, Trans: HOOD, S. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 68-85

BROWNING, R. (1993) *The Pied Piper of Hamelin; A Child's Story* New York: Alfred A. Knopf

BRYDER, T. (2008) Conceptual Elements for a Theory of Visual Political Propaganda *Psicología Política* No 37, November 2008, 101-117

BRYAN, J. (2011) 'Shells, Shots and Shrapnel': *Picturegoer* Goes to War IN: HAMMOND, M; WILLIAMS, M; (Eds.) *British Silent Cinema and the Great War* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 64-76

BURKE, E. (1958) *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* edited by BOULTON, J. T. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul

BURKE, J. (1955) Introduction IN: HOGARTH, W. *The Analysis of Beauty* edited by BURKE, J. Oxford: Clarendon Press xiii-lxii

BURMAN, E. (2004) Boundary Objects and Group Analysis: Between Psychoanalysis and Social Theory *The Group-Analytic Society (London)* [online] Vol. 37(3):379–385. DOI: 10.1177/533316404045534 www.sagepublications.com. 361-379 Available from http://www.discourseunit.com/papers/burman_papers/2004%20GA%20Boundary%20objects.pdf [accessed 4 May 2012]

BURNETT, R. (2004) *How Images Think* Cambridge: Massachusetts Institute of Technology

BUTLER, R. (1997) Jean Baudrillard's Defence of the Real: Reading In the Shadow of the Silent Majorities as an Allegory of Representation IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 51-63

CABRERA, J. G. (1999) Dedication IN: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc. 9

CAPA, C. (1999) Dedication IN: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc. 11

CARRÀ, C. (2009) Plastic Planes as Spherical Expansions in Space 1913 (Published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 15 March 1913) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 91-92

CARRÀ, C. (2009) Warpainting (extracts) 1915 (From Carlo Carrà, *Guerrapittura*, Milan, 1915) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 202-205

CARRUTHERS, S. L. (2005) Missing in Authenticity? Media War in the Digital Age IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 236-250

CHOMSKY, N. (2002) *Media Control: The Spectacular Achievements of Propaganda*, 2nd Ed., New York: Seven Stories Press

CHOMSKY, N. (2012) *Occupy* London: Penguin Books Limited

CHRISTIE'S (2000) *19th and 20th Century Posters: Wednesday 11 October 2000* London: Christie's International plc

CHRISTIE'S (1997) *An Important Collection of 19th and 20th Century German Posters: Wednesday 11 June 1997* London: Christie's International plc

CIALDINI, R. B. (2007) *Influence: The Psychology of Persuasion* New York: First Collins Business Essentials

CLARK, T. (1997) *Art and Propaganda in the Twentieth Century: The Political Image in the Age of Mass Culture* London: George Weidenfeld and Nicolson Ltd

CLIFFORD, J. (1988) *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art* Cambridge: Harvard University Press

COLEMAN, C. (1999) Women in the Spanish Civil War IN: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc. 43-51

COLLIER, S. J. (2009) Topologies of Power: Foucault's Analysis of Political Government beyond 'Governmentality' IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 78-108

COLLINS WEITZ, M. (2000) Art in the Service of Propaganda: The Poster War in France During World War II *Religion and the Arts* 4:1 43-75

COMAY, R. (2005) Materialist Mutations of the Bilderverbot IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 32-59

Concise Oxford English Dictionary, Luxury Edition (2009) 11th Ed. Edited by SOANES, C; STEVENSON, A. Oxford: Oxford University Press

CORK, R. (1976) *Vorticism and Abstract Art in the First Machine Age Volume 1: Origins and Development* London: Gordon Fraser

CORK, R. (1976) *Vorticism and Abstract Art in the First Machine Age Volume 2: Synthesis and Decline* London: Gordon Fraser

CORK, R. (1994) Suffering into Art: Howson and Bosnia IN: *Peter Howson: Bosnia* London: Imperial War Museum 35-42

COSTELLO, D. (2005) Aura, Face, Photography: Re-reading Benjamin Today IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 164-184

COULTER-SMITH, G. (1997) Between Marx and Derrida: Baudrillard, Art and Technology IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 91-103

CRAMPTON, R. (1994) *Facing Fear: Peter Howson in Bosnia* IN: *Peter Howson: Bosnia* London: Imperial War Museum 9-14

CRARY, J. (1988) Techniques of the Observer *October* Vol. 45 (Summer 1988) 3-35

CRARY, J. (1999) *Suspensions of Perception: Attention, Spectacle, and Modern Culture* Cambridge: Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press

CREEL, G. (1920) George Creel's Rememberance of the American WWI Poster Campaign: The "Battle of the Fences" from *How We Advertised America* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/George_Creel_WW1_posters_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

CUBITT, S. (2005) Distribution and Media Flows *Cultural Politics* Vol. 1 Issue 2, 193-214

DAGOGNET, F. (1992) *Etienne-Jules Marey: A Passion for the Trace* Trans: GALETA, R; HERMAN, J. New York: Zone Books

DAS, S. (2005) *Touch and Intimacy in First World War Literature* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

DEARDEN, W. H. (1915) Surgeons and the Trenches *Hearst's Harper's Weekly March 20 1915* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/pdf/WW1_Doctors.pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

DEBORD, G. (1983) *Society of the Spectacle* Detroit: Black & Red

DELEUZE, G. (1993) What Is Desire? IN: BOUNDAS, C. V. (Ed.) *The Deleuze Reader* New York: Columbia University Press 136-142

DELEUZE, G; GUATTARI, F. (1988) *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* Trans: MASSUMI, B. London: The Athlone Press

DESCARTES, R. (2013) Optics IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 333-337

DESIDERI, F. (2005) The Mimetic Bond: Benjamin and the Question of Technology IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 108-120

DEWEY, J. (2005) *Art as Experience* New York: Perigree

DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B. (1995) Introduction IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 10-14

DISMORR, J. (1981) Monologue IN: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast: War Number* London: John Lane In: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast 2* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press 65

DODGSON, C. (1918) The Artist IN: *British Artists at the Front: Part I: C. R. W. Nevinson* London: "Country Life" Ltd & George Newnes Ltd 1-4

DURHAM PETERS, J. (1997) What Did Walter Benjamin See? Image Cultures 1890-1933: Beauty's Veils: The Ambivalent Iconoclasm of Kierkegaard and Benjamin IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 9-32

EDWARDS, P. (Ed.) (2000) *Blast: Vorticism 1914-1918* Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited

EIFLING, S. (2011) Adbusters' Kalle Lasn Talks About OccupyWallStreet *The Tyee* [online] Available from: http://thetyee.ca/News/2011/10/07/Kalle-Lasn-Occupy-Wall-Street - accessed 15 February 2012

EILAND, H. (2005) Reception in Distraction IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 3-13

EISENSTEIN, S. (1991) *S. M. Eisenstein Selected Works: Volume II: Towards a Theory of Montage* edited by GLENNY, M; TAYLOR, R; London: BFI Publishing

EISENSTEIN, S. (2010) *Sergei Eisenstein: Selected Works Volume 1: Writings, 1922-1934* edited by TAYLOR, R. London: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd

EKSTEINS, M. (1995) *The Cultural Impact of the Great War* IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 201-212

EKSTEINS, M. (2000) *Rites of Spring: The Great War and the Birth of the Modern Age* London: Papermac

ELLUL, J. (1964) *The Technological Society* Trans: WILKINSON, J. New York: Vintage Books

ELLUL, J. (1973) *Propaganda: The Formation of Men's Attitudes* Trans: KELLEN, K. and LERNER, J. New York: Vintage Books

ELSAESSER, T. (2004) The New Film History as Media Archaeology, Trans: unknown *CiNéMAS: revue d'études cinématographiques / Cinémas: Journal of Film Studies* Vol. 14, No. 2-3, 2004 75-117

ELSAESSER, T. (2011) Part I: Engines of/in the Imaginary: Freud and the Technical Media – The Enduring Magic of the Wunderblock IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 95-115

ERNST, W. (2011) Part III: Between Analogue and Digital: Media Archaeography – Method and machine versus History and Narrative of Media IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 239-255

FAGIOLO, M; (1987) Balla in his Time – An Album of his Life and Works, Trans: KUNZLE, M. IN: BORTOLOTTI, N. (Ed.) *Balla: The Futurist* Trans: KUNZLE, M. Milano: Nuove edizioni Gabriele Mazzotta 9-147

FENVES, P. (2005) Is There an Answer to the Aestheticizing of the Political? IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 60-72

FLINT, R. W. (1972) Introduction IN: FLINT, R. W. (Ed.) *Marinetti: Selected Writings* London: Secker & Warburg 3-36

FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (2001) The Analysis of Difference IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 3-13

FOSTER, H. (1997) Prosthetic Gods *Modernism/modernity* Vol. 4, No 2, April 1997, 5-38. John Hopkins University Press

FOUCAULT, M. (1977) Nietzsche, Genealogy, History IN: BOUCHARD, D. F. (Ed.) *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essay and Interviews* Ithaca: Cornell University Press 139-164

FOUCAULT, M. (2002) *The Order of Things*, Abingdon: Routledge

FOUCAULT, M. (2009) Alternatives to the Prison: Dissemination or Decline of Social Control? IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 12-24

FREUD, S. (1930) Civilization and its Discontents [online] Trans: STRACHEY, J. p37-74 W.W. Norton and Company, Available from http://eres.lndproxy.org/edoc/AH402Freud-09.pdf [accessed 19 February 2013]

FREUD, S. (1955) Beyond the Pleasure Principle IN: *Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Group Psychology and Other Works* Trans: STRACHEY, J. et al, London: Hogarth Press 7-64

FREUD, S. (2012) *Group Psychology and the Analysis of the Ego* Trans: STRACHEY, J., Empire Books

FRY, R. (1981) *Vision and Design* Oxford: Oxford University Press

FUSSELL, P. (2009) A Satire of Circumstance IN: *The Great War and Modern Memory* New York: Sterling Publishing Co., Inc. 1-42

GARELICK, R. K. (2007) *Electric Salome: Loie Fuller's Performance of Modernism* Princeton: Princeton University Press

GAUDIER-BRZESKA, H. (1981) Vortex Gaudier-Brzeska IN: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast: War Number* London: John Lane In: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast 2* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press 33-34

GENOSKO, G. (1997) Who Is The 'French McLuhan'? IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 104-120

GIBSON, O. (2003) Straw Warns Against Snap Judgements, *The Guardian* [online] 1 April. Available from http://www.guardian.co.uk/media/2003/apr/01/pressandpublishing.Iragandthemedia2 - accessed 7 March 2013

GIL DE BIEDMA, E. A. (1999) Dedication IN: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc. 7

GOEBEL, S. (2009) Chivalrous Knights versus Iron Warriors: Representations of the Battle of *Matériel* and Slaughter in Britain and Germany, 1914-1940 IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 79-110

GOMBRICH, E. H. (1977) *Art and Illusion: A Study in the Psychology of Pictorial Representation*, 5th Ed., London: Phaidon Press

GOUGH, P. (2010) *A Terrible Beauty: British Artists in the First World War* Bristol: Sansom & Company

GOWRIE, G. (2009) Preface IN: SPENDER, S. *Selected Poems* edited by GOWRIE, G. London: Faber and Faber Ltd ix-xv

GRAVES, R. (2000) *Goodbye to All That* London: Penguin Books

GREGG, F. J. (1918) American Artists and the War: The Effort That Is Being Made To Create And Stimulate Propaganda Through Art *Vanity Fair, April 1918* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_poster_art_review_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013] 47 & 94

GRAY, C. (1986) *The Russian Experiment in Art 1863-1922* edited by BURLEIGH-MOTLEY, M. London: Thames & Hudson

GRAY, T. (1955) *Elegy Written in a Country Church-Yard* London: The Rodale Press

GREGG, F. J. (1918) American Artists and the War: The Effort That Is Being Made To Create And Stimulate Propaganda Through Art *Vanity Fair, April 1918* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_poster_art_review_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013] 47 & 94

GULLACE, N. F. (2009) Barbaric Anti-Modernism: Representations of the “Hun” in Britain, North America, Australia and Beyond IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 61-78

GUNNING, T. (1986) The Cinema of Attraction: Early Film, Its Spectator and the Avant-Garde *Wide Angle* Vol. 8, 3-4, 63-70
GUNNING, T. (1995) An Aesthetic of Astonishment: Early Film and the (In)Credulous Spectator IN: WILLIAMS, L. (Ed.) *Viewing Positions: Ways of Seeing Film* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 114-133

HALL, S. (2006) Encoding/Decoding IN: DURHAM, M. G; KELLNER, D. M. (Eds.) *Media and Cultural Studies: KeyWorks* Malden: Blackwell Publishing 163-173

HALLETT, M. (2001) II: The Anatomy of Difference: Manly Satire: William Hogarth’s *A Rake’s Progress* IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 142-161

HAMMOND, M. (2011) *The Battle of the Somme* (1916): An Industrial Process Film that ‘Wounds the Heart’ IN: HAMMOND, M; WILLIAMS, M; (Eds.) *British Silent Cinema and the Great War* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 19-38

HANSSEN, B. (2005) Benjamin or Heidegger: Aesthetics and Politics in an Age of Technology IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 73-92

HARAWAY, D. (2000) The Ironic Dream of a Common Language for Women in the Integrated Circuit: Science, Technology, and Social Feminism in the 1980s or A Socialist Feminist Manifesto for Cyborgs http://www.cc.rochester.edu/College/FS/Publications/HarawayCyborg.html. [online] Available from http://molodiez.org/net/harraway.pdf [accessed 26 June 2012]

HARAWAY, D. (2013) The Persistence of Vision IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 356-362

HARDIE, M; SABIN, A. K. (Eds.) (1920) *War Posters Issued by Belligerent and Neutral Nations 1914-1919* London: A&C Black Ltd.

HAROOTUNIAN, H. D. (1988) Foucault, Genealogy, History: The Pursuit of Otherness IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 110-137

HAYCOCK, D. B. (2002) *Paul Nash* London: Tate Publishing

HAYCOCK, D. B. (2010) *A Crisis of Brilliance: Five Young British Artists and The Great War* London: Old Street Publishing Ltd

HEIDEGGER, M. (1977) *The Question Concerning Technology and Other Essays* New York: Harper & Row

HEIDEGGER, M. (1982) *On The Way To Language* New York: HarperCollins Publishers

HEIDEGGER, M. (1993) *Basic Writings* edited by KRELL, D. F. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco

HEMINGWAY, E. (1935) *A Farewell to Arms* Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd

HERBERT, S. (2000) *A History of Pre-Cinema Volume I* London: Routledge

HERDAN, I; HERDAN, G. (1966) Introduction IN: HERDAN, I; HERDAN, G. (Eds.) *Lichtenberg's Commentaries on Hogarth's Engravings* London: The Cresset Press ix-xxiii

HERDAN, I; HERDAN, G. (Eds.) (1966) *Lichtenberg's Commentaries on Hogarth's Engravings* London: The Cresset Press

HILEY, N. (1995) The British Cinema Auditorium IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 160-170

HIMID, L. (2001) IV: Race and Representation: A Fashionable Marriage IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 270-277

HODGE, J. (2005) The Timing of Elective Affinity: Walter Benjamin's Strong Aesthetics IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 14-31

HOGARTH, W. (1997) *The Analysis of Beauty* edited by PAULSON, R. London: Yale University Press

HORKHEIMER, M; ADORNO, T. W. (2002) The Culture Industry: Enlightenment as Mass Deception IN: *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments* Trans: JEPHCOTT, E., edited by SCHMID NOERR, G. Stanford: Stanford University Press 94-136

HOY, D. C. (1988) Foucault: Modern or Postmodern? IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 12-41

HUHTAMO, E. (2011) Part I: Engines of/in the Imaginary: Dismantling the Fairy Engine – Media Archaeology as Topos Study IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 27-47

HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (2011) Introduction: An Archaeology of Media Archaeology IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 1-21

HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (2011) Part I: Engines of/in the Imaginary [Introduction] IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 25-26

HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (2011) Part II: (Inter)facing Media [Introduction] IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 119-121

HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (2011) Part III: Between Analogue and Digital [Introduction] IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 207-209

HUI KYONG CHUN, W. (2008) Part II: (Inter)facing Media: The Enduring Ephemeral, or The Future Is a Memory IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 184-203

HULME, T. E. (1994) *The Collected Writings of T. E. Hulme* edited by CSENGERI, K. Oxford: Clarendon Press

HUMPHREYS, R. (1999) *Futurism* London: Tate Publishing

HUMPHREYS, R. (2004) *Wyndham Lewis* London: Tate Publishing

HUMPHREYS, R. (2009) *Futurism: May The Force Be With You* IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 221-227

HUXLEY, A. (1943) *The Art of Seeing*, 3rd Ed. London: Chatto & Windus

HUYSSEN, A. (1988) Foreword SLOTERDIJK, P. *Critique of Cynical Reason* Trans: ELDRED, M. (1987) London: Verso
ix-xxv

HYNES, S. (1990) *A War Imagined: The First World War and English Culture* London: The Bodley Head Ltd

IVINS, W. M. (1969) *Prints and Visual Communication* Cambridge: The MIT Press

JAMES, D; THOMSON, R. (2011) *Posters and Propaganda in Wartime: Weapons of Mass Persuasion* London: Franklin Watts

JAMES, P. (2009) Images of Femininity in American World War I Posters IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 273-311

JAMES, P. (2009) Introduction: Reading World War I Posters IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 2-36

JAMESON, F. (2007) Reflections in Conclusion IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 196-213

JAMESON, F. (1984) *Foreword* IN: LYOTARD, J-F. *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge* Manchester: Manchester University Press vii-xxi

JOHN (1952) The First Letter of John IN: *The New Testament* IN: *The Holy Bible* New York: Collins

JOHNSTON, J. (1997) Introduction: Friedrich Kittler: Media Theory After Poststructuralism IN: KITTLER, F. A. *Literature, Media, Information Systems* edited by JOHNSTON, J., Amsterdam: OPA 1-26

JOHNSTON LAING, E. (2004) Selling Happiness: Introduction [online] 1-42 © University of Hawai'i Press Available from http://www.uhpress.hawaii.edu/books/laing-intro.pdf [accessed 13 November 2012]

JONES, N. (2014) *Peace and War: Britain in 1914* London: Head of Zeus Ltd.

JONES, R.: *Passive Political: Ross Jones in the Presence of William Hogarth*, 19 January – 17 February 2012, Sumarria Lunn Gallery, 36 South Molton Lane, Mayfair, London, W1K 5AB

KANT, I. (2007) *Critique of Judgement* edited by WALKER, N. Trans: MEREDITH, J. C. Oxford: Oxford University Press

KAUFMAN, R. (2005) Aura, Still IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 121-147

KAZECKI, J; LIEBLANG, J. (2009) Regression versus Progression: Fundamental Differences in German and American Posters of the First World War IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 111-141

KEATS, J. (1994) Ode on a Grecian Urn, IN: KEATS, J. *The Complete Poems of John Keats* New York: Modern Library 185-186

KELLEN, K. (1973) *Introduction* IN: ELLUL, J. *Propaganda: The Formation of Men's Attitudes* Trans: KELLEN, K. and LERNER, J. New York: Vintage Books v-viii

KELLNER, D. (2009) Some Reflections on Baudrillard's "On Disappearance" IN: BISHOP, R. (Ed.) *Baudrillard Now: Current Perspectives in Baudrillard Studies* Cambridge: Polity Press 154-158

KINDER, J. M. (2009) Iconography of Injury: Encountering the Wounded Soldier's Body in American Poster Art and Photography of World War I IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 340-368

KITTLER, F. A. (1997) *Literature, Media, Information Systems* edited by JOHNSTON, J., Amsterdam: OPA

KLEIMAN, N. (1991) On the Story of 'Montage 1937' IN: EISENSTEIN, S. *S. M. Eisenstein Selected Works: Volume II: Towards a Theory of Montage* edited by GLENNY, M; TAYLOR, R; London: BFI Publishing viii

KLEIN, S. (unpublished manuscript) Spread Spectra: Hedy Lamarr, George Antheill, and Modernist Perception *Talk given at Winchester School of Art (University of Southampton) 4 December 2012*

KLUITENBERG, E. (2011) Part I: Engines of/in the Imaginary: On the Archaeology of Imaginary Media IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 48-69

KRELL, D. F. (1993) Being and Time: Introduction IN: HEIDEGGER, M. *Basic Writings* edited by KRELL, D. F. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco 37-40

KRELL, D. F. (1993) On the Essence of Truth [Introduction] IN: HEIDEGGER, M. *Basic Writings* edited by KRELL, D. F. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco 111-114

KRELL, D. F. (1993) The Origin of the Work of Art [Introduction] IN: HEIDEGGER, M. *Basic Writings* edited by KRELL, D. F. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco 139-142

KUSAHARA, M. (2011) Part II: (Inter)facing Media: The "Baby Talkie," Domestic Media, and the Japanese Modern IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 123-147

LAFONT, M. (2010) *Soviet Posters: The Sergo Grigorian Collection, 4th Ed.,* London: Prestel Publishing Ltd

LAITY, M. (2005) Afterword IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 292-296

LAITY, M. (2005) *Straddling the Divide – Spinning for Both Sides* IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 275-291

LANDSBERGER, S. R. et al (Eds.) (2009) *Chinese Posters: The IISH-Landsberger Collections* London: Prestel Publishing Limited

LATOUR, B. (2004) Why Has Critique Run Out of Steam? From Matters of Fact to Matters of Concern *Critical Inquiry 30* Winter 2004 225-248

LAZZARATO, M. (2009) Neoliberalism in Action: Inequality, Insecurity and the Reconstitution of the Social IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 109-133

LAWRENCE, J. (2006) The Transformation of British Public Politics After the First World War *Past & Present* No. 190, February 2006, 185-216

LE BON, G. (2001) The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind, Batoche Books [online] Available from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/soton/docDetail.action?docID=2004652 [accessed from 20 January 2013]

LEED, E. J. (1979) *No Man's Land: Combat & Identity in World War I* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) (1981) *Blast 1* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press

LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) (1981) Blast: War Number London: John Lane IN: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast 2* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press

LEWIS, P. W. (1963) Part V: 1945-1956 The Writer and the Absolute: Letter to Charles Handley-Read September 2nd 1949 IN: ROSE, W. K. (Ed.) *The Letters of Wyndham Lewis* London: Methuen & Co Ltd 504-505

LIVINGSTONE, R. et al (2007) Presentation I IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 9-15

LIVINGSTONE, R. et al (2007) *Presentation II* IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 60-67
LIVINGSTONE, R. et al (2007) *Presentation III* IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 100-109

LIVINGSTONE, R. et al (2007) *Presentation IV* IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 142-150

LOGAN, M-R. (1988) The Renaissance: Foucault's Lost Chance? IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 97-109

LONGO, L. (1980) *Foreword* IN: TISA, J. (Ed.) *The Palette and The Flame: Posters of the Spanish Civil War* Wellingborough: Collet's (Publishers) Ltd & Sofia: Sofia Press Publishers ix-xii

LOTRINGER, S. (Ed.) (1988) *Jean Baudrillard: The Ecstasy of Communication* Trans: SCHUTZE, B; SCHUTZE, C; New York: Autonomedia

LOTRINGER, S; VIRILIO, P. (2005) *The Accident of Art* New York: Semiotext(e)

LOVITT, W. (1977) *Introduction* HEIDEGGER, M. *The Question Concerning Technology and Other Essays* New York: Harper & Row
xiii-xxxix

LUBOK, S. (2009) Art, War and National Identity IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 241-269

LUKÁCS, G. (2007) Realism in the Balance, Trans: LIVINGSTONE, R. IN: ADORNO, T. et al *Aesthetics and Politics* London: Verso 28-59

LYOTARD, J-F. (1984) *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge* Manchester: Manchester University Press

MACEY, D. (2009) Rethinking Biopolitics, Race and Power in the Wake of Foucault IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 186-205

MALVERN, S. (2004) *Modern Art, Britain and the Great War* New Haven: Yale University Press

MANGHANI, S. (2013) *Image Studies: Theory and Practice* Abingdon: Routledge

MANGHANI, S. et al (Eds.) (2006) *General Introduction* MANGHANI, S. et al *Images: A Reader* London: SAGE Publications Ltd. 1-18

MANGHANI, S. et al (2006) *Images: A Reader* London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

MANN, T. (1999) *Doctor Faustus: The Life of the German Composer Adrian Leverkühn as Told by a Friend* Trans: WOODS, J. E. New York: Vintage International

MARCUS, J. (1989) Afterword – Corpus/Corps/Corpse: Writing the Body in/at War IN: SMITH, H. Z. *Not So Quiet... Stepdaughters of War* New York: The Feminist Press 241-293
MARINETTI, F. T. (1972) *Marinetti: Selected Writings* edited by FLINT, R. W. London: Secker & Warburg

MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) The Founding and Manifesto of Futurism 1909 (published in *Le Figaro*, (Paris), 20 February 1909) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 19-24

MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) Geometric and Mechanical Splendour and the Numerical Sensibility 1914 (Published in two parts in *Lacerba* (Florence), 15 March 1914 and 1 April 1914, with two different titles, and as a leaflet by Direzione del Movimento Futurista, 18 March 1914) Trans: FLINT, R. W. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 154-160

MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) Manifesto of Futurist Dance, Trans: RAINEY, L. IN: RAINEY, L. et al (Eds.) *Futurism: An Anthology* New Haven & London: Yale University Press 234-239

MARINETTI, F. T. (2009) The New Religion-Morality of Speed, Trans: RAINEY, L. IN: RAINEY, L. et al (Eds.) *Futurism: An Anthology* New Haven & London: Yale University Press 224-229

MASSUMI, B. (2009) National Enterprise Emergency: Steps Toward an Ecology of Powers IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 153-185

MASSUMI, B (1988) Translator's Foreword: Pleasures of Philosophy DELEUZE, G; GUATTARI, F. *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* Trans: MASSUMI, B. London: The Athlone Press ix-xv

MCKERNAN, L. (2012) Topical Budget: War and Propaganda *BFI Screenonline* [online] Available from http://www.screenonline.org.uk/film/id/583331/index.html [accessed 15 March 2013]

MCLUHAN, M. (1962) *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul

MCLUHAN, M. (1964) *Understanding Media: The Extensions of Man* London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd

MCLUHAN, M; FIORE, Q. (2008) *The Medium is the Massage* co-ordinated by AGEL, J. London: Penguin Books

MCNAY, L. (2009) Self as Enterprise: Dilemmas of Control and Resistance in Foucault's *The Birth of Biopolitics* IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 55-77

MELBERG, A. (2005) The Work of Art in the Age of Ontological Speculation: Walter Benjamin Revisited IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 93-107

MERTINS, D. (2005) Walter Benjamin and the Tectonic Unconscious IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 148-163
MERTON, R. K. (1964) Foreword IN: ELLUL, J. *The Technological Society* Trans: WILKINSON, J. New York: Vintage Books v-viii

MESSINGER, G. S. (1993) An Inheritance Worth Remembering: The British Approach to Official Propaganda During The First World War *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 13:2, 117-127

MITCHELL, W. J. T. (2005) *What Do Pictures Want? The Lives and Loves of Images* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

MITCHELL, W. J. T. (2013) There Are No Visual Media IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 7-14

MONAGHAN, J; JUST, P; (2000) *Social and Cultural Anthropology: A Very Short Introduction* Oxford: Oxford University Press

MONTAGUE, C. E. (1918) Strange, But True IN: *British Artists at the Front: Part III: Paul Nash* London: "Country Life" Ltd & George Newnes Ltd 5-7

MONTAGUE, C. E. (1918) War Aeroplanes IN: *British Artists at the Front: Part I: C. R. W. Nevinson* London: "Country Life" Ltd & George Newnes Ltd 5-7

MOORE, C. (2010) *Propaganda Prints: A History of Art in the Service of Social and Political Change* London: A&C Black Publishers Limited

MORGAN, G. (1915) Modern Trench Fighting *The New Republic: Saturday January 9th 1915 p16* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW-trench-fighting_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

MORROW, B. (1981) Blueprint to the Vortex IN: LEWIS, P. W. (Ed.) *Blast 1* Santa Barbara: Black Sparrow Press v-viii

NEVINSON, C. R. W. (1937) *Paint and Prejudice* London: Methuen Publishers

NIETZSCHE, F. (1969) *Thus Spoke Zarathustra* Trans: HOLLINGDALE, R. J. London: Penguin Books

NIETZSCHE, F. (2003) *The Genealogy of Morals* Trans: SAMUEL, H. B. New York: Dover Publications Inc.

NOWELL-SMITH, G. (1991) Eisenstein on Montage IN: EISENSTEIN, S. *S. M. Eisenstein Selected Works: Volume II: Towards a Theory of Montage* edited by GLENNY, M; TAYLOR, R; London: BFI Publishing xiii-xvi

NUTTALL, R. (2012) Blacks See Benefit of Military Service, The New Pittsburgh Courier April 18 2012 *PublicSource* [online] Available from: http://publicsource.org/investigations/blacks-see-benefit-of-military-service - accessed 11 July 2012

O'DONNELL, V; JOWETT, G. S. (2012) *Propaganda and Persuasion*, 5th Ed., London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

OGÉE, F. (2001) I: Crafting the Erotic Body: The Flesh of Theory: The Erotics of Hogarth's Lines IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 62-75

O'HARA, D. T. (1988) What Was Foucault? IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 71-96

ONG, W. J. (1982) *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word* London: Methuen

ORCHARD, K (2000) 'A Laugh Like a Bomb': The History and the Ideas of the Vorticists IN: EDWARDS, P. (Ed.) *Blast: Vorticism 1914-1918* Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited 14-23

ORWELL, G. (2000) *Homage to Catalonia* London: Penguin Classics

ORWELL, G. (1981) *A Collection of Essays*, San Diego: Harcourt Brace and Company

ORWELL, G. (2008) *All Art is Propaganda* edited by PACKER, G. Florida: Harcourt Books

OSTROW, S. (1997) Preface IN: JOHNSTON, J. (Ed.) *Friedrich A. Kittler Essays: Literature, Media, Information Systems* Amsterdam: OPA 1-26 ix-xii

OSTROW, S. (2005) Rehearsing Revolution and Life: The Embodiment of Benjamin's Artwork Essay at the End of the Age of Mechanical Reproduction IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 226-247

OWEN, W. (1994) *The War Poems* edited by STALLWORTHY, J. London: Chatto & Windus Limited

PAP, J. (1997) Traditional Arts and the Shock of This Century's Image: The Cubist Image and the Image of Cubism IN: ANDREW, D. (Ed.) *The Image in Dispute: Art and Cinema in the Age of Photography* Austin: University of Texas Press 155-180

PARIS, M. (Ed.) (1999) *The First World War and Popular Cinema: 1914 to the Present* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press

PAULSON, R. (1997) *Introduction* IN: HOGARTH, W. *The Analysis of Beauty* edited by PAULSON, R. London: Yale University Press xvii-lxii

PEPPIS, P. (1997) "Surrounded By A Multitude Of Other Blasts": Vorticism and the Great War *Modernism/modernity* 4.2 (1997) 39-66

PHAIDON PRESS LTD. (Ed.) (2007) *30,000 Years of Art: The Story of Human Creativity across Time and Space* London: Phaidon Press Limited

PHILLIPS, J; (2009) Humanity's End IN: BISHOP, R. (Ed.) *Baudrillard Now: Current Perspectives in Baudrillard Studies* Cambridge: Polity Press 159-171

PINCHOT, G. (1915) England in War *Harper's Weekly for April 17th, 1915* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_Britain_During_World_War_One_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

PLATO (1991) *The Republic of Plato*, 2nd Ed., Trans: BLOOM, A. New York: Basic Books

PLATO (2001) Philebus, Trans: JOWETT, B. [online] Available from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/soton/docDetail.action [accessed from 1 June 2014]

POUND, E. (1970) *A Memoir of Gaudier-Brzeska* New York: Penguin Books New Directions Books

PRESTON, P. et al (Eds.) (2001) *The Spanish Civil War: Dreams + Nightmares* London: Imperial War Museum

PUNCH (1915) *Punch, Or The London Charivari: Vol. CXLVIII January-June 1915* London: The Whitefriars Press

RABINBACH, A. (1990) *The Human Motor: Energy, Fatigue, and the Origins of Modernity* Berkeley: University of California Press

RABINOW, P. (2009) Foucault's Untimely Struggle: Toward a Form of Spirituality IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 25-44

RALL, T. (2011) Censorship of War Casualties in the US, *Aljazeera* [online] Available from http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2011/07/20117258316765540.html [accessed from 3 May 2012]

RANCIÈRE, J. (2013) Notes On The Photographic Image, Trans: MEACHAM, D. IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 3rd Ed. Abingdon: Routledge 86-95

REEVES, N. (1997) Cinema, Spectatorship and Propaganda: 'Battle of the Somme' (1916) and its Contemporary Audience *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 17:1, 5-28

REEVES, N. (1999) *Official British Film Propaganda* IN: PARIS, M. (Ed.) *The First World War and Popular Cinema: 1914 to the Present* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 27-50

REVEL, J. (2009) Identity, Nature, Life: Three Biopolitical Deconstructions IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 45-54

RHYS, B. (1955) *Introduction* IN: BARBUSSE, H. (1926) *Under Fire* Trans: FITZWATER WRAY, W. London: Everyman's Library: J M Dent & Sons Ltd v-xiv

RIBOT, T. (1906) *Essay on the Creative Imagination* Chicago: The Open Court Publishing Company

RIDDELL, J; STEARN, W. T. (1994) *By Underground to Kew: London Transport Posters 1908 to the Present* London: Studio Vista

ROGOFF, I. (2002) Studying Visual Culture IN: MIRZOEFF, N. (Ed.) *The Visual Culture Reader*, 2nd Ed. London: Routledge 24-36

ROSENTHAL, A. (2001) II: The Anatomy of Difference: Unfolding Gender: Women and the "Secret" Sign Language of Fans in Hogarth's Work IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 120-141

RUGGIERO, G. (2012) Editor's Note IN: CHOMSKY, N. *Occupy* London: Penguin Books Limited 9-19

SAID, E. W. (1988) Michel Foucault, 1926-1984 IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 1-11

SALIS, J. (1918) The Artist IN: *British Artists at the Front: Part III: Paul Nash* London: "Country Life" Ltd & George Newnes Ltd 1-4

SANT'ELIA, A. (2009) Manifesto of Futurist Architecture 1914 (Milan, 11 July 1914. Amplified from catalogue introduction 'Nuove Tendenze', Milan 1914. Published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 1 August 1914) Trans: TISDALL, C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 160-172

SASSOON, S. (1918) *Counter-Attack* [online] Available from http://www.readbookonline.net/readOnLine/4282 [accessed 27 April 2012]

SASSOON, S. (1930) *Memoirs of an Infantry Officer* London: Faber & Faber Limited

SASSOON, S. (1936) *Sherston's Progress* London: Faber & Faber Limited

SASSOON, S. (1975) *Memoirs of a Fox-Hunting Man* London: Faber and Faber Limited

SAWICKI, J. (1988) Feminism and the Power of Foucauldian Discourse IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 161-178

SCHIVELBUSCH, W. (1986) *The Railway Journey: The Industrialization of Time and Space in the 19th Century* Berkeley: The University of California Press

SCHJELDAHL, P. (2007) Performance: Chris Burden and the Limits of Art *The New Yorker* [online] May 14 2007 Available from http://www.newyorker.com/arts/critics/artworld/2007/05/14/070514craw_artworld_schjeldahl [accessed 16 March 2013]

SCHNAPP, J. T. (2005) *Revolutionary Tides: The Art of the Political Poster 1914-1989* Milan: Skira editore S.p.A.

SCHNAPP, J. T. (2009) Epilogue IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 369-375

SCHOPENHAUER, A. (2006) *The Essays of Arthur Schopenhauer; The Art of Controversy* Trans: BAILEY SAUNDERS, T. Teddington: The Echo Library

SCONCE, J. (2011) Part I: Engines of/in the Imaginary: On the Origins of the Origins of the Influencing Machine IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 70-94

SEVERINI, G. (2009) The Plastic Analogies of Dynamism – Futurist Manifesto 1913 (Ms. September-October 1913) Trans: HIGGITT, J. C. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 118-125

SHEARMAN, J. (1967) *Mannerism* London: Penguin Books

SHEN, K. (2009) *Propaganda Posters in China* IN: LANDSBERGER, S. R. et al (Eds.) *Chinese Posters: The IISH-Landsberger Collections* London: Prestel Publishing Limited 8-20

SHESGREEN, S. (Ed.) (1973) *Engravings by Hogarth: 101 Prints* New York: Dover Publications

SLOTERDIJK, P. (1988) *Critique of Cynical Reason* Trans: ELDRED, M. (1987) London: Verso

SMITHER, R. (1993) "A Wonderful Idea of the Fighting": The Question of Fakes in 'The Battle of the Somme' *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television* 13:2, 149-168

SMITHER, R. (2005) *Der Magische Gürtel (The Enchanted Circle, 1917)* – A Case Study in First World War German Film Propaganda IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 82-91

SOBCHACK, V. (2011) Part III: Between Analogue and Digital: Afterword – Media Archaeology and Re-presencing the Past IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 323-333

SOFFICI, A. (2009) The Subject in Futurist Painting (Published in *Lacerba* (Florence), 1 January 1914) Trans: BRAIN, R. IN: APOLLONIO, U. (Ed.) *Futurist Manifestos* London: Thames and Hudson Ltd 134-135

SONTAG, S. (1999) 1970 – Posters: Advertisement, Art, Political Artifact, Commodity IN: BEIRUT, M. et al (Eds.) *Looking Closer 3: Classic Writings on Graphic Design* New York: Allworth Press 196-218

SPENDER, S. (2009) *Selected Poems* edited by GOWRIE, G. London: Faber and Faber Ltd

STIEGLER, B. (2011) *Technics and Time, 3: Cinematic Time and the Question of Malaise* Trans: BARKER, S. Stanford: Stanford University Press

STRAUVEN, W. (2011) Part II: (Inter)facing Media: The Observer's Dilemma – To Touch or Not to Touch IN: HUHTAMO, E; PARIKKA, J. (Eds.) *Media Archaeology: Approaches, Applications and Implications* Berkeley: University of California Press 148-163

STRICKLAND, R. (2003) Spontaneous Cinema as Design Practice: How to Walk Without Watching Your Step IN: LAUREL, B. (Ed.) *Design Research: Methods and Perspectives* Boston: Massachusetts Institute of Technology

SUN TZU (1910) Sun Tzu on the Art of War Trans: GILES, L. [online] 1-34 Available from http://www.artofwarsuntzu.com/Art%20of%20War%20PDF.pdf [accessed 11 May 2012]

TAYLOR, R. (1991) General Editor's Preface IN: EISENSTEIN, S. *S. M. Eisenstein Selected Works: Volume II: Towards a Theory of Montage* edited by GLENNY, M; TAYLOR, R; London: BFI Publishing viii

TAYLOR, R. (2010) Introduction IN: EISENSTEIN, S. *Sergei Eisenstein: Selected Works Volume 1: Writings, 1922-1934* edited by TAYLOR, R. London: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 1-24

TCHERNYSHOVA, M. (date unknown) Kuzma Petrov-Vodkin, *Olga's Gallery* [online] Available from http://www.abcgallery.com/P/petrov-vodkin/petrov-vodkinbio.html [accessed 30 October 2012]

TERRANOVA, T. (2009) Another Life: The Nature of Political Economy in Foucault's Genealogy of Biopolitics IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 234-262

THACKER, E. (2009) The Shadows of Atheology: Epidemics, Power and Life after Foucault IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 134-152

THOMPSON, J. (2007) 'Pictorial Lies'? – Posters and Politics in Britain c1880-1914 *Past & Present* No. 197, November 2007, 177-210

TISA, J. (1980) Preface IN: TISA, J. (Ed.) *The Palette and The Flame: Posters of the Spanish Civil War* Wellingborough: Collet's (Publishers) Ltd & Sofia: Sofia Press Publishers xiii

TISA, J. (Ed.) (1980) *The Palette and The Flame: Posters of the Spanish Civil War* Wellingborough: Collet's (Publishers) Ltd & Sofia: Sofia Press Publishers

TONEY, A. (1980) An Appreciation IN: TISA, J. (Ed.) *The Palette and The Flame: Posters of the Spanish Civil War* Wellingborough: Collet's (Publishers) Ltd & Sofia: Sofia Press Publishers xv-xxii

TURNER, J. G. (2001) I: Crafting the Erotic Body: "A Wanton Kind of Chace": Display as Procurement in *A Harlot's Progress* and its Reception IN: FORT, B; ROSENTHAL, A. (Eds.) *The Other Hogarth: Aesthetics of Difference* Princeton: Princeton University Press 38-61

UGLOW, J. (2002) *Hogarth: A Life and a World* London: Faber and Faber Limited

UNKNOWN (1915) Bernard Shaw's Terms of Peace *Current History: A Monthly Magazine of the New York Times June, 1915* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/anti-War_George_Bernard_Shaw_against_WW1_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

UNKNOWN (1916) Germany Seen by a British Visitor *The Literary Digest for July 22nd, 1916* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_german_home-front_life_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

UNKNOWN (c1918) The Influence of the War on Art *The Great War: The Standard History of the World-Wide Conflict volume CCLXIII* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/pdf/WW1-Artist-Nevinson.pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

UNKNOWN (1920) Seven Artists – The Poster *The Poster Advertising Association* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/pdf/seven%20artists.pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

UNKNOWN (1916) The Soldiers' Lot *Supplement to THE CAMBRIDGE MAGAZINE July 8, 1916 pi* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_letter_condemning_politicians_of_World_War_One_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

UNKNOWN (1916) Untitled *Supplement to THE CAMBRIDGE MAGAZINE July 8, 1916 pi* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/WW1_letter_about_how_disgusting_war_is_pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

UNKNOWN (1917) Wake Up, Artists! *The Literary Digest, May 1917* [online] Available from http://www.oldmagazinearticles.com/pdf/mass%20media.pdf [accessed 14 March 2013]

VAN DOOREN, I; KRÄMER, P. (1995) The Politics of Direct Address IN: DIBBETS, K; HOGENKAMP, B; (Eds.) *Film and the First World War* Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press 97-107

VENN, C. (2009) Neoliberal Political Economy, Biopolitics and Colonialism IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 206-233

VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (2009) Introduction: Thinking after Michel Foucault IN: VENN, C; TERRANOVA, T; (Eds.) *Theory Culture & Society: Explorations in Critical Social Science, Volume 26, Number 6, November 2009: Special Issue on Michel Foucault* London: SAGE Publications Ltd 1-11

VINEY, N. (1991) *Images of Wartime: British Art and Artists of World War 1* Newton Abbot: David & Charles plc [images © 1991 The Imperial War Museum]

VIRILIO, P. (1986) *Speed & Politics* Trans: POLIZZOTTI, M. New York: Semiotext(e)

VIRILIO, P. (1989) *War and Cinema: The Logistics of Perception* Trans: CAMILLER, P. London: Verso

VIRILIO, P. (2003) *Art and Fear* London: Continuum

VIRILIO, P. (2005) *The Information Bomb* Trans: TURNER, C. (2000) London: Verso

VIRILIO, P. (2013) The Illusions of Zero Time, Trans: TURNER, C. IN: ARMITAGE, J; BISHOP, R. (Eds.) *Virilio and Visual Culture* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 28-36

Vu Mỹ Thuât [Fine Arts Department] *Tranh Cô Dông [Posters]* (1996), N Hanoi: Ministry of Culture and Information

WALLAS, G. (1920) Human Nature in Politics, 3rd Ed [online] 1-142 Available from http://socserv2.socsci.mcmaster.ca/~econ/ugcm/3ll3/wallas/humannature.pdf [accessed 14 November 2012]

WALSH, M. J. K. (2002) *C.R.W. Nevinson: This Cult of Violence* New Haven: Yale University Press

Webster's Revised Unabridged Dictionary (1913) edited by WEBSTER, N. [online] Available from http://1913.mshaffer.com [accessed 28 January 2013]

WEILL, A. (1984) *The Poster: A Worldwide Survey and History* Trans: MYATT, M. London: Sotheby's Publications

WELCH, D. (2005) Mobilizing the Masses: The Organization of German Propaganda During World War One IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd 19-46

WELCH, D. (2005) 'Winning Hearts and Minds': The Changing Context of Reportage and Propaganda, 1900-2003 IN: CONNELLY, M; WELCH, D; (Eds.) *War and the Media: Reportage and Propaganda* New York: I. B. Tauris & Co Ltd ix-xxi

WHELAN, R. (1999) Robert Capa In Spain IN: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc.. 27-41

WHELAN, R; CAPA, C. (Eds.) (1999) Catalogue Raisonné IN: MARTIN, L. et al (Eds.) *Heart of Spain: Robert Capa's Photographs of the Spanish Civil War from the Collection of the Museo Nacional Centro De Arte Reina Sofía* New York: Aperture Foundation Inc. 175-198

WHITE, H. V. (1973) Introduction IN: *Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth Century Europe* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press 1-42

WILKINSON, J. (1964) Translator's Introduction IN: ELLUL, J. (1964) *The Technological Society* Trans: WILKINSON, J. New York: Vintage Books viv-xx

WINTER, J. (2009) Imaginings of War: Posters and the Shadow of the Lost Generation IN: JAMES, P. (Ed.) *Picture This: World War I Posters and Visual Culture* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press 37-58

WOLIN, S. S. (1988) On the Theory and Practice of Power IN: ARAC, J. (Ed.) *After Foucault: Humanistic Knowledge, Postmodern Challenges* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press 179-201

WOLLAEGER, M. (2008) *Modernism, Media, and Propaganda: British Narrative from 1900-1945* Princeton: Princeton University Press

WORTH, S. (2012) Editorial Cartoonists: Louis Raemaekers – The Cartoonist Who Helped Win The First World War, *Animation Resources* [online] Available from http://animationresources.org/?p=1126 [accessed 30 May 2013]
XENOPHON (2009) *The Socratic Writings (Memorabilia, Economist, Symposium, Apology, and Hiero)* Trans: DAKYNS, H. G. New York: Digireads Publishing

ZAJONC, R. (1980) Feeling and Thinking: Preferences Need No Inferences, *American Psychologist: February 1980* Vol. 35 No. 2 151-175

ZIAREK, K. (2005) The Work of Art in the Age of its Electronic Mutability IN: BENJAMIN, A. (Ed.) *Walter Benjamin and Art* London: Continuum 209-225

ZURBRUGG, N. (1997) Introduction: 'Just What Is It That Makes Baudrillard's Ideas So Different, So Appealing?' IN: ZURBRUGG, N. (Ed.) *Jean Baudrillard, Art and Artefact* London: SAGE Publications 1-6