Laurie Stras

The performance of polyphony in early 16th-century Italian convents*

Thirty years ago, in a chapter that lifted the veil on the musical world of medieval convents in Europe, the musicologist Anne Bagnall Yardley called for 'an increased sensitivity ... to the musical activities of nuns'.¹ Since then, interest in convent music has flourished, yet lacunae still exist—particularly in respect of the 16th century, both in terms of performance and scholarly literature.

Performing groups appear to have more freedom to explore on either side of the High Renaissance: while numerous ensembles (Sequentia, Anonymous 4, Ensemble Peregrina, Ensemble Korymbos, Trio Medieval, Reverdie, to name but a few) investigate nuns' music up to the 15th century, and perhaps fewer (for example, Cappella Artemisia, Newberry Consort, Cappella Clausura, Schola Pietatis Antonio Vivaldi) concentrate on the 15th and 18th centuries, the sonic world of 16th-century convent music has remained largely closed to our ears.

Musicology, too, has found the 16th-century convent difficult to fathom. This could be down to what Natalie Zemon Davis called 'the fiction of the archives'; that is, the idea that the stories we can tell are inevitably shaped by the completeness of the available evidence and how it is recorded.² Evidence relating to musical practice at Italian convents in the first half of the 16th century is mostly fragmentary, rarely concentrated in an extended run of documents or a coherent musical source.³ Yet we may nevertheless consider how nuns might have dealt with the legacy of Franco-Flemish polyphony, performing both *voci piene* ('full voices' or full range) and *voci pari* ('equal voices' or restricted range)

works, both by using techniques that are attested in contemporary treatises, and by closer reading of what documents do exist. This essay brings together a variety of sources, some of which have already been discussed in scholarship, and places them in dialogue with each other—offering new perspectives, and at times challenging existing ones, on how they might be interpreted.

The musical institutions of 16th-century convents were nourished and admired, despite the efforts of some reformers to silence them, and whereas elite male chapel choirs were heard only by the few, nuns' music was available to every citizen, on a daily basis. Nuns regularly performed polyphony both during liturgical worship and outside chapel, whether it was written expressly for them, or adapted for their use. They sang at the command of popes and nobility, and were even used as examples to inspire (or shame) lesser musicians.⁴ Restoring female voices to 16th-century polyphony has the potential to transform our modern concept of the sound of the High Renaissance into one in which both male and female voices have authority.

Documentary evidence of convent polyphony in the 16th century

Practical evidence, in the form of music manuscripts or prints directly linking the composition and singing of polyphony in Italian convents, is not plentiful prior to the end of the 16th century. The first musical publication attributed to a nun, the *Sacrae cantiones quinque, septem, octo, & decem vocibus decantande* by the Ferrarese Suor Raffaella Aleotti, did not emerge until 1593. In the second half of the century, however, there is a relatively small number of dedications to nuns in printed books of both sacred and secular music (Table 1). From these we learn that nuns in many Italian cities were familiar with the performance of polyphony

in their daily lives, both in chapel as part of their devotion and recreation. For instance, the dedication of Tiburtio Massaino's *Sacri cantus quinque paribus vocibus...liber secundus* (Venice: Gardano, 1580) states that the motets were a commission, and that they were intended to be used both in church and in private music-making:⁷

Et perche fossero cantati in Chiesa, et perche servissero nelle hore del riposo per un honesto intrattenimento à quelle honorate giovani, che sotto la santa disciplina della R. vostra ... fui honorato da suoi comandamenti à comporre come ho fatto diversi Motetti à voce pari...

And because they might be sung in Church, and because they might serve during the hours of repose as a decent entertainment for those honourable maidens that are under the discipline of your Reverence... I was honoured by your command to compose as I have done several motets in equal voices...

--Insert Table 1 near here [file on S1]--

The earliest of these books is, in fact, secular: the Ferrarese Francesco dalla Viola dedicated his *Primo libro de madrigali a quattro voci* (Venice: Gardano, 1550) to Suor Leonora d'Este (1515–1575), only surviving daughter of Duke Alfonso I d'Este and Lucrezia Borgia.⁸ But this publication is an outlier: liturgical settings only begin to appear in the last two decades of the century, and by 1600 they are still barely in double figures. The real explosion of conventual music in print begins in earnest at the turn of the 17th century, with more books emerging in the first decade than had been issued in the previous century.⁹ This burgeoning of convent culture is perhaps indicative of the socioeconomic reality of an expanding convent population, for there was a steep increase in the

number of noblewomen monachized during the second half of the century. ¹⁰ More well-educated nuns, increased competition between convents to attract both dowries and memorial bequests, and a subtle (or not so subtle) pressure from post-Tridentine reformers could all have increased the demand for new bespoke compositions that satisfied both the need for prestige and more self-evident adherence to musical decorum. And, of course, the more accomplished the music at any particular convent, the better for its own economic health: it is by no means a coincidence that the convents with the finest musical establishments often attracted women from the upper echelons of patrician society, with appropriately-sized dowries. ¹¹

Yet despite the relative paucity of directly verifiable musical materials relating to convent polyphony prior to this late-century flowering, we can be certain that it was manifested much earlier in urban centres across Italy through evidence gleaned from the documentary record. Frequently, accounts of visits by dignitaries, royalty or nobles reveal the importance of the musical, as much as spiritual, experience to the event. These visits were visible evidence of institutional support for convents, as no doubt they culminated in donations and patronage, but the convents were also offering a *quid pro quo*: nuns' continual prayer was considered vital to the spiritual health of the city. 12

Especially popular for public attendance were Vespers services, when congregations could gather in the outer church to hear the nuns' singing through the grilles that separated the outer church from the inner choir. ¹³ In 1475 Sixtus IV went to the Clarissan convent of San Cosimato in Trastevere to hear Vespers, and it was reported that the nuns' singing moved him to tears. ¹⁴ At times, visitors were invited to stay afterwards to receive refreshment, and may also then have

been entertained further: for instance, on 2 January 1492 the Ferrarese Duke Ercole I d'Este attended two Vespers services ('quello de la Madon[n]a prima et poi quello del Signore') at Corpus Domini in Bologna, and afterwards witnessed six nuns singing laude. In Venice, nuns' music had also been attracting attention since the mid-15th century: Emperor Frederick III visited the Benedictine convent of San Zaccaria in 1469, and was delighted by the nuns singing psalms and laude; in 1502 Isabella d'Este and Elisabetta Gonzaga were similarly impressed by the Augustinian canonesses of Le Vergini. In the 1520s the diarist Marin Sanudo recommended these two convents as tourist attractions, equivalent to the Doge's palace and the Piazza San Marco. Musical curiosity and piety could be satisfied in a single visit: the most important Clarissan house in Venice during the late 15th and early 16th centuries was attached to the popular pilgrimage church of Santa Maria dei Miracoli, where the choir was placed above the entrance to the church, heard but not seen.

The presence of organs in convents' inner choirs, even as the 16th century dawned, suggests that the practice of polyphony was widespread. Organs were not necessary for chant, yet they played a vital role in facilitating women-only performance as they could provide support to the whole ensemble, principally by covering or doubling any of the voices—in particular the lowest part. As early as 1480, the Ferrarese ambassador to Florence noted in his dispatches that the quality of both singing and organ playing at the Benedictine convent of Le Murate was equal to that heard in a [ducal] chapel. We might then conclude that the Estes' subsequent support in the form of organ building and maintenance at nearly all of the city's convents—which continued throughout

the 16th century—was perhaps prompted, or at least sustained, by dynastic rivalry.²⁰

During the last decade of the 15th century, Florentine nuns' familiarity with polyphony came in for special criticism from Girolamo Savonarola, who deemed their use of organs particularly frivolous, even heinous. ²¹ Yet Savonarola's own detractor, Angelo da Vallombrosa, disagreed that the sisters were neglecting the Office by choosing polyphony over chant. In what seems a deliberate challenge to those who used St. Paul's words 'Mulieres in ecclesiis taceant' (1 Corinthians 14, verse 34; 'Women should be silent in church') to argue against convent polyphony, Fra Angelo selects an alternative Pauline dictum, suggesting that the nuns' singing was an appropriate way to praise God, edifying their congregation through sheer pleasure at the sound. He is clear that the nuns of Florence were skilled practitioners, musically advanced enough to sing polyphony 'in imitation of the Pope's chapel':²²

in alcuni monasterii le sancte moniali erano consuete laudare Dio con canto figurato ad imitatione della cappella del papa vicario di Dio. Essi propheti hanno tanto gridato a quelle che loro per ignorantia feminile sono mancate da così laudabile oficio, per quale cessando ne seguitara grandi delicti, *cum sit* che molti allecti dalla dulcedine di tale musicha lasciavano li giuochi, bestemmie, lascivie et furti, et andavano a udire quella: il che mancato si danno a vitii. Persuadeno a quelle semplici monache che erano andati perché in tal modo cantavano per piacere gl'huomini. Che procede da grande presumptione a guidicare le mente degl'huomini, cognita al suo Dio: et io non existimo che si truovi uno tanto ignorante che giudichi che esse monache fondassino la sua mente principale in tale errore ma in laudare Dio si e in piacere de gl'huomini seguitando la doctrina dello apostolo Roma xv: *unusquisque placeat proximo in bonum ad aedificationem*.

In some convents the holy sisters were used to praising God with polyphony in imitation of the chapel of the Pope, the vicar of God. Those prophets have shouted much at the nuns, that they—through their feminine ignorance—are neglecting that most praiseworthy Office, and ceasing it would lead to great offences, since many, attracted by the sweetness of this music leave their games, their blaspheming, whoring and thieving, and come to hear it: but if it were lacking they would give themselves to vice. They [i.e. the prophets] tried to persuade the simple nuns that the public came because they were singing in that way to please men. This is what comes of the great presumption of guessing the minds of men, known only to their God. And I don't reckon that one could find anyone so stupid as to believe that these nuns grounded their primary thinking in such error, but in praising God and in pleasing men, following the doctrine of Romans 15, 'let each please his neighbour for his good, to edification'.

Practical considerations for female-voice polyphony

Singing polyphony required some knowledge of music theory, in particular the hexachordal system and the rules regarding *musica ficta*. Tuition was often provided by outsiders; in 1512, Isabella d'Este requested that the sisters of San Giovanni in Mantua receive instruction from 'learned and discreet' teachers, as their inexpert singing 'offended' her ears.²³ The Benedictine sisters at Le Murate in Florence, who had cultivated the learning of polyphony from at least the middle of the 15th century, also benefitted from the tuition of priests.²⁴ A small group of nuns would gather at the grate to receive singing instruction, chaperoned by senior members of the convent; these sisters were expected then to teach the others. This system of cascaded learning became the norm for

maintaining and extending musical expertise in convents. By the later 16th century many communities were expected to be self-sufficient, either through teaching in-house or by recruiting young women who had already received a thorough musical education.²⁵

15th-century musicians attempting to school young novices in the fundaments of musical theory might have found appropriate teaching materials hard to come by. ²⁶ Yet in 1508 the Milanese theorist and composer Franchinus Gaffurius brought out a vernacular translation and condensation of his *Practica musicae* and *Musica theorica*, the *Angelicum ac divinum opus musicae ... materna lingua scriptum*. The *Angelicum ac divinum* explains hexachords, the modes, mensural notation and metre. Its opening paragraph even states that the translation would specifically benefit nuns, among others who were not able to read Latin:

Perche molti illiterati fano professione de musica: et con grande difficultade pervengano a la vera cognitione de li praecepti harmonici per non intendere le opere nostre et de altri degni auctori latini quale son scripte con qualche ornato et alquanto obscuro stillo: havemo consyderato subvenire non solamente a lor voti et desiderii: ma anchora a la devotione de molte donne religiose intente ad laudare lo eterno Dio con tutta la corte celeste: imitando le angelice Ierarchie: et ad ornamento del culto divino ... descrivaremo in lingua materna con brevitade molte degne consyderatione necessarie a che e studioso de pervenire ad perfecta cognitione de questa angelica doctrina.

Because many illiterate persons make a profession of music, and with great difficulty arrive at the true understanding of the harmonic precepts because they do not understand our works and those by other worthy Latin authors that are written in a somewhat ornate and obscure style: we have thought to submit

not only to their wishes and desires, but also to the devotion of many women religious intent on praising the eternal God with all the celestial court, imitating the angelic hierarchies, and to the ornament of the divine worship ... we will describe in the mother tongue with brevity many worthy considerations necessary to one who is studious to arrive at a perfect understanding of this angelic doctrine.²⁷

After Gaffurius, direct allusions to nuns making music do not appear in didactic literature again until Orazio Vecchi makes a fleeting reference in an undated manuscript, written towards the end of the century.²⁸ Nonetheless, nuns could find the information they needed in treatises published for general use, in particular those that expound at length on performance, such as those by Nicola Vicentino and Gioseffo Zarlino. These treatises make clear some of the challenges that faced convent choirs, and the practical solutions that were available. Regardless of the era in which they flourished, Italy's nun musicians faced the same fundamental issue when it came to performing much of the existing polyphonic repertoire. The most prestigious convents were able to scout for singers with low voices, but these women were always exceptional.²⁹ So choirs would have to adapt existing music, unless composed specifically in a tessitura appropriate to high voices, in order to render it successfully. In practice, this meant a choice of either instrumental accompaniment to supply or supplement the lower voices or transposition in order to bring the music into the right range; in many instances both techniques might be used.

The chapters on transposition at the keyboard in Zarlino's *Le istitutioni* harmoniche reveal a practical understanding of music-making in religious houses where the ranges of choirs might be restricted:

Trasportationi sono vtili, et sommamente necessarie anco ad ogni perito Organista, che serue alle Musiche choriste; et ad altri Sonatori similmente, che sonano altre sorti di istrumenti, per accommodare il suono di quelli alle Voci, le quali alle volte non possono ascendere, o discendere tanto, quanto ricercano i luoghi propij delli Modi...³⁰

Transpositions are useful and above all also necessary for every skilled organist who serves with choirs; and similarly to other players that play other sorts of instruments, to accommodate the pitch to that of the voices, which sometimes cannot ascend or descend far enough to reach the proper place of the modes...

Zarlino suggests that transposition was so basic to music learning that only those organists who had not received a complete musical education (such as those who learnt their craft in a convent, perhaps) would find his instructions helpful, particularly in the singing of daily offices:

Lasso hora giudicare ad ogn' vno perito nella Musica, quanto potrà essere vtile tale cognitione ad ogni Organista non cosi bene istrutto nella Musica: conciosia che dalli mostrati essempi potrà vedere, et conoscere quello, che hauerà a fare, quando gli accascarà di trasportare alcuna cantilena, quando seruirà alle Capelle, oue si cantano varie cantilene appartinenti alli chori, non solo nelle Messe, et nelli Vesperi; ma anche nell' altre Hore, tanto diurne, quanto notturne.³¹

I leave it now to the judgment of anyone learned in music how much this knowledge is useful to any organist who has not been well instructed in music ... when it falls to them to transpose whatever piece, when they are serving in chapels where various works pertaining to the choir are sung, not

just in Masses and in Vespers, but also in other Hours, both diurnal and nocturnal.

Zarlino discusses three kinds of transposition: at the octave; up or down a fourth; or by a tone.³² Stepwise transposition (for all but modes 3 and 4) could be accommodated relatively easily within the meantone tuning system, and might be done to improve the singers' comfort or tone; it required practice rather than a change of notation.³³ Hexachordal transposition—that is, transposition at the fourth from the natural to soft hexachord or vice versa—was generally expressed as a transposition of the work's mode, which governed its melodic and harmonic organization, and required alteration of the clefs in which the voices were written. Hexachordal transposition was particularly important to nuns as it was the most efficient, theoretically grounded method for bringing *voci piene* pieces into a workable female range, although the bass would still need to be supported or provided by an organ or viol. Orazio Vecchi explains this transposition in terms of adapting polyphony for strings, 'col favor della corda' (Examples 1a and 1b).³⁴

--Example 1a near here, full page-width--

--Example 1b near here, full page-width --

Although *chiavi naturali* (low clefs: C1-C3-C4-F4) were established as the norm for *voci piene* polyphony early on in the 16th century, *chiavi alti* (high clef: G2-C2-C3-F3) works, using the disposition of Vecchi's transposed example, also appear regularly in their own right.³⁵ High-clef works have posed a practical problem within the traditional narrative of polyphony given that many, if attempted at notated pitch, are not optimal—or indeed are even unsingable—for

male-voice ensembles. A great deal of evidence has been compiled relating to stipulations in 17th-century theory (and then extrapolated backward to the 16th) regarding mandatory downward transposition of high-clef works by a fourth or a fifth, supported by practical examples from instrumental manuals, downward-transposed intabulations, and scores. He is none of the 17th-century advice specifically focusing on the problem of high clefs, or indeed the scholarship it has inspired, considers performance by female-voice choirs. This is despite the fact that high-clef *voci piene* polyphony is readily performable—without transposition—by women, if the bass is supplied by or reinforced with instruments. Some high-clef works may even have originated as works for convent performance, and not just those that appear in volumes dedicated to nuns. While it would be disingenuous to suggest that all such works were written for female voices, it would be equally ill-advised to exclude that possibility for individual works solely on the assumption that high clefs must always be transposed, and therefore have no significance in terms of performance pitch.

An early 17th-century work dedicated to a nun reveals that downward transposition of high-clef pieces, far from being mandatory, is just one of a set of options; and in this case, at least, it specifically brings music written for women into a lower range, suitable for men. Pompeo Signorucci's 1603 *Salmi, falsibordoni et motetti a tre voci*, which was dedicated to his ex-pupil, Suor Uritia Serguiliani of the convent of Santa Margherita in Borgo San Sepolcro, contains psalm settings in three voices—two high, one low—which can be sung as solos, duets or trios. The printed rubrics on the continuo part give the option of downward transposition for all pieces, not just those in high clefs. For instance, the opening work, 'En dilectus meus'—notated in low clefs—has the rubric 'In

tuono et alla quarta bassa' ('at pitch, and at a fourth below'). 38 At written pitch the upper voices sit comfortably for female voices (Example 2a), but downward transposition by a fourth (Example 2b) brings them into a male tenor range (while making the lowest voice unsingable). Advice regarding downward transposition, then, can be seen as primarily relevant to male-voice ensembles and as part of a flexible performance practice, rather than something that should, or even can, be rigidly applied.

--Example 2a near here, full page-width--

--Example 2b near here, full page-width --

A further feature of high-clef *voci piene* polyphony renders it even more suitable for convent performance. A significant number of high-clef works compress the range between the highest and lowest voices by raising the tessitura of the lowest voice by a third (typically, G2-C2-C3-C4 instead of G2-C2-C3-F3), so that notationally this voice sits a ninth below the cantus and a third below the tenor.³⁹ Compressed cleffing optimizes *voci piene* polyphony for mature male ensembles that lack falsettists or boys, but in high clefs it also often brings all the voices comfortably into the range of a mature female ensemble—particularly if the choir includes specialist female tenors or basses.

Octave transposition and the voci pari disposition

Nun musicians negotiated issues of performance pitch and range on a daily basis, using transposition and accompaniment as their primary tools for adaptation of existing repertoire; but not all polyphony was readily adaptable. If the bass and tenor voices cross frequently, for example, the additional weight on instruments on the bass line can make it seem as if the harmony inverts when the bass is

higher than the tenor. For some works, solving problems of range in one voice creates the opposite problem at the other extreme, and for these selective transposition—that is, transposing only some of the voices by an octave—might be an acceptable solution.⁴⁰ Determining the best solution for individual works was a matter of trial and error: late 16th-century sources confirm that preparation and rehearsal were key to the success of convent music.⁴¹

Transposition techniques could also be combined, as Orazio Vecchi recommends in relation to convent practice:

Ora vediamo una maniera di trasportatione che si fa un'ottava più alto per B molle, la quale è molto atta per canzonette, napolitane, arie, e per composizioni da monache, o per concertar fanciulli, perché l'armonia ristretta et unita nell'acuto è molto allegra; oltre che alle volte per carestia de bassi, tai componimenti sono comodissimi.⁴²

Now we turn to a manner of transposition that is made an octave higher with B flat, which is very apt for canzonette, napolitane, songs, and for compositions for [or by] nuns, or for children's ensembles. Because the harmony [is] restricted and united in the high register, it is very convivial; moreover, on occasions when there is a lack of basses, such compositions are very handy.

To demonstrate, Vecchi treats his previous transposition up a fourth to further selective octave transposition. He leaves the uppermost part alone and brings the lower three up an octave, creating polyphony for three equal high voices and a 'bass' voice in a range a fifth lower, notating the example in a G2-G2-G2-C2 clef arrangement (Example 3).

--Example 3 near here, full page-width--

Vecchi's transposition creates a disposition for the voices that is seen sporadically in the 15th- and 16th-century polyphonic repertoire, called variously *voci pari, voci mutate,* or *voces aequales* in treatises, on title pages, and in rubrics to individual compositions. This disposition is discussed by Pietro Aron, Zarlino, and Vicentino—invariably, however, as a combination of lower voices notated in lower clefs. It is most frequently seen with a slightly wider compass and with the ranges of the inner voices duplicated, typically employing G2-C1-C1-C3 or C3-C4-C4-F4 clefs. Like Vecchi, Vicentino shows how the disposition may arise from octave transposition: either by composing a cantus part specifically for downward transposition (*soprano mutabile*), or a tenor part that may be transposed up (*tenor mutabile*).

Voci pari polyphony—mostly frequently found in three or four voices, but sometimes in five or even six—appears in many early 16th-century publications, sometimes with a rubric but most often undifferentiated from the voci piene works. However, around 1540, Venetian publishers began to issue specialized collections of voci pari works, possibly to cater for the market provided by religious establishments. Voci pari polyphony is ideal for nuns' ensembles; indeed, the earliest sacred publications dedicated to nuns indicate on their title pages that the works are in equal voices (see Table 1 above). While some voci pari works are notated in high clefs, most, even in repertoire unequivocally associated with convent use, are published with the highest voice in C3 or C4 clef, obliging female choirs to transpose in order to bring the work to performance. Curiously, it is not uncommon to find a small number of compressed-clef works in otherwise voci pari publications. This suggests that publishers (and

purchasers) understood the title-page label *voci pari* differently to theorists: more as a practical indication that the works are suitable for single-sex ensembles than as a precise description of their clef disposition.

Refining an understanding of 16th-century nuns' repertoire: two manuscripts explored

While even a small number of prints can tell us a great deal about nuns' polyphonic practice, the texts they preserve are inevitably mediated by the publisher, and changes introduced at the publication stage might well obscure details that would otherwise be informative. For instance, Gardano's apparent desire to rationalise clef combinations in order to make his partbooks more uniform led him to transpose *voci pari* works originally published in high clefs down an octave when reissuing them some years later. Manuscripts commissioned and used by convents may reveal more, but such volumes are scarce. Nevertheless, two manuscripts linked with Italian convents—Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare Ms 761 (*c*.1495) [Verona Ms 761] and Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique Ms 27766 (*c*.1560) [Brussels Ms 27766]—corroborate the idea that nuns in the first half of the 16th century found suitable repertoire in compressed-clef and *voci pari* works. At the same time, they also show that though untransposed low clefs were not a barrier to performance, high clef notation was more practical.

Verona Ms 761

Verona Ms 761 joins the music of the Sistine Chapel to iconographical evidence of nuns singing polyphony.⁴⁹ The manuscript preserves masses, credos, and a Te

Deum, and includes works by Josquin, Brumel, Martini, Busnoys and Obrecht, several of which also appear in Vatican choirbooks.⁵⁰ Based on its opening heraldic illuminations, Judith Benfield argued that the manuscript commemorated the wedding of Isabetta Brenzoni and Giorgio Maffei in 1495.51 Using this date as a point of departure for his own investigation, Joshua Rifkin then identified the scribe as one Girolamo Beltrandi, a singer who was employed at both San Pietro and the Sistine Chapel in Rome in the 1490s.⁵² While there might be another explanation for the heraldic illuminations (see the discussion of Brussels Ms 27766 below), 1495 also saw the establishment of the League of Venice on 31 March, an event that was marked in Verona with three days and nights of celebration.⁵³ A connection with this event would account well for the manuscript's contents, including three *L'homme armé* masses (by Busnois, Faugues and Brumel), an anonymous Missa Da pacem, and the Te Deum setting, as well as the exhortation from Psalm 88 featured on the first opening, 'Beatus populus qui scit jubilationem' ('blessed is the people that knows the joyful sound').

--Illus.1 near here (Fig 1 on ScholarOne), full page-width, colour--

A certain dissonance between this manuscript's contents and its iconography has caused controversy in musicological circles. Its prominent illuminations include a portrait of a nun on the opening page, and below on the same page is a miniature of a group of nuns and novices singing around a lectern supporting a choirbook, in which a polyphonic work is clearly indicated (illus.1). Benfield noted that earlier scholarship had assumed that the manuscript was owned by a convent, though she discounted the theory.⁵⁴ However, using the symbolism embedded in the illumination, Howard Mayer Brown showed that the

nun is Febbronia Brenzoni, abbess of the Benedictine convent Santa Lucia sopra il Chievo between 1492 and 1511; he thus suggested that the manuscript was compiled for conventual use. Following Benfield in disputing that the image had any significance for the manuscript's provenance, Joshua Rifkin speculated instead that the collection was intended for the new choir school at the *duomo*, based on its contemporaneity with the establishment of the school's statutes, the connections of its scribe to one of the cathedral's canons (a member of the Maffei family), and its long presence—since the 17th century—in the cathedral library.

There are, however, good reasons why a valuable music manuscript belonging to Santa Lucia could have changed ownership even as early as the first half of the 16th century. The musical traditions fostered at Santa Lucia during Brenzoni's rule would undoubtedly have been disrupted by the Imperial wars, in which the convent's 'molto grandi, e magnifici' church and buildings were so comprehensively damaged that they had to be demolished in 1518.⁵⁶ The nuns were forced to move to a much less salubrious complex in the city, and it is at this moment that the manuscript might have moved to be housed at the cathedral. Moreover, in 1539, the Bishop of Verona banned convent polyphony outright throughout the diocese, at which point the manuscript might have been surrendered.⁵⁷

It is entirely possible that the Brenzoni-Maffei wedding took place at Santa Lucia, and indeed that Isabetta Brenzoni had some youthful experience of the convent.⁵⁸ Yet the decidedly risqué content of some of the chanson models for the masses perhaps makes the manuscript appear inapposite for convent use. The chanson *Orsus, orsus*, the model for one of the masses by Martini, mocks bridegrooms who become cuckolds, while the model for Josquin's *Missa L'ami*

Baudichon relates a lewd proposition (delicately skirted by the scribe, who omits a single word of anatomical detail). The incipit of *Orsus, orsus* and the (nearly) complete text of *L'ami Baudichon* are each inserted under the tenor cantus firmus of their respective first Kyrie sections and, in the case of Josquin's *Missa L'ami Baudichon*, at the beginning of the Gloria as well.⁵⁹ Nevertheless, it is far from certain that these texts are intended to be sung—they are incomplete, and it is simple to supply the correct Ordinary text at each point, even extempore. Moreover, other manuscripts produced by 16th-century nuns also include suggestive, even obscene material, showing that nuns were not impervious to secular humour.⁶⁰

Brown observed that the works in Verona Ms 761 are not suitably scored for female voices, and assumed that the repertoire was assembled without regard to women's ranges. He noted, for instance, that the overall range in Martini's *Missa Ma bouche rit* is *A-e''.*⁶¹ However, his data were taken from modern editions. In the manuscript itself, the bassus only descends to A at cadences, and the note is given with an optional *a* notated above. The lowest note otherwise is *c*, and given that the *e''* is also exceptional, the whole could easily be transposed up a minor third or even a fourth, bringing it within comfortable female ranges. Brown also reasonably suggested that instruments might be used to support the lower voices. This would be in keeping with what we know of Florentine practice, and further examination of the manuscript suggests the masses may have been chosen with exactly this practice in mind.

--Table 2 near here [full page, through 90 degrees; use version in Google Docs]--

Fifteen out of seventeen masses are in either *voci pari* or compressed cleffing: Table 2 shows the principal disposition used for each mass cycle, and

notes others that occur. The *voci pari* masses might have needed transposition, depending on the pitch standard in the convent; but conspicuous in all the masses that are not *voci pari* is the near-universal use of paired inner voices that sit a 5th below the superius, and either a 5th (in one case a 7th) above the bassus—in effect, doubling the altus range rather than the tenor. Only the final mass and the Credos that conclude the manuscript do not conform to this pattern. While this is not a rare disposition for 15th-century polyphony, the consistency is striking, and the separation between the upper voices and the bass makes instrumental substitution of that part more practical. Don Angelo da Vallombrosa's description of the nuns singing in imitation of the papal choir, quoted above, makes the conventual use of Verona MS 761 historically plausible. My contention is that the musical qualities of the manuscript's masses, taken together with its exceptional iconography, support Brown's theory that the manuscript was indeed compiled for nuns.

Brussels Ms 27766

A unique Florentine manuscript, dated 1560 and compiled for two Florentine Clarissan nuns, Suor Agnoleta Biffoli and Suor Clementia Sostegni, Brussels Ms 27666 (*c*.1560) is perhaps the most comprehensive document that has yet emerged to shed light on the musical practices of 16th-century nuns.⁶² As with Verona Ms 761, the heraldic emblems of two families are prominent in the illuminations; however, the nuns' names are also embossed in the binding, making it clear for whom the manuscript was compiled. Brussels Ms 27666 was described, catalogued, and its Clarissan associations identified, by Lucia Boscolo in 1996, but it has received little further attention or analysis.⁶³ The repertoire in

the volume implies that Suor Agnoleta and Suor Clementia belonged to a house with a strong musical tradition that had evolved over a period of time. Most of the works are anonymous, though the manuscript opens with a mass based on the motet 'Recordare Virgo Mater', which is followed immediately by the motet itself (a work elsewhere attributed to Josquin).⁶⁴ A few more attributable pieces by Compère, Festa, Mouton, de Billon, Willaert, Bocchino and Antonio Moro show that the collection contains other Franco-Flemish and Italian repertoire both contemporary to its compilation and from several decades before.

The texts correspond to the same feasts, celebrations, and activities that were important to convents in better documented eras: Christmas, Holy Week, Marian worship, vestition/profession rites, the night hours of Vespers and Compline, and private devotion. The works that point most clearly to a Clarissan context are the clusters of antiphons and hymns for the Feast of St Clare, including both Vespers I and II, and Lauds. These propers are not derived from the *Breviarum romanum*, but from the thirteenth-century rhymed office of St Clare, written by Julian of Speyer. The office is transmitted in a small number of Franciscan breviaries and antiphoners, with only the Magnificat antiphon for Vespers II, 'Salve sponsa Dei', entering the published polyphonic repertoire—and even then only twice in the 16th century.

The music of Brussels Ms 27766 shows that the nuns had a rich musical life: the variety of performative approaches to chant is striking, including *alternatim* hymns, psalms and antiphons; *falsobordone* psalm settings; *cantus firmus* polyphony (including one motet, 'Veni sponsa Christi'—perhaps the most important chant in nuns' liturgy—in which the *cantus firmus* is given in square notation); and the remarkable polyphonic chant setting of 'Salve sponsa Dei', for

which all four voices are given in square notation and in low clefs (C4-C4-F3-F4).⁶⁷ The book includes not only liturgical polyphony, but also a number of spiritual songs and prayers that could have been used in private or paraliturgical devotion. Some, like a setting of Petrarch's canzone *Vergine bella* and the Savonarolan hymn 'Ecce quam bonum', mirror musical expressions of piety that were popular outside the cloister. Others are more closely related to regular devotion, and appear in multiple versions: for instance, a Christmas carol based on the antiphon 'Verbum caro factum est' has three settings, one in four voices and two in three.

While most of the 78 works it contains are written for equal voices, roughly a fifth are in *voci piene* and compressed cleffing: there are two *voci piene*, thirteen compressed-cleffing, and sixty-three *voci pari* works, of which 22 have a disposition that places two or three equal voices against a 'bass' voice at least a fifth lower. Around two-thirds of the works are copied at a pitch suitable for female voices, using G2 C1 and C2 for the upper parts, but the remaining third—including some *voci pari* works—use the lower C clefs and even F clefs (F3 and F4), clearly requiring octave transposition and/or instrumental accompaniment. The many psalms include chant incipits in various transpositions (up a fourth, fifth, seventh, octave, and eleventh) and a full range of clefs. Often the transposition occurs without a 'key change'—that is, without the addition of a flat at the beginning of each system (see illus.2).

--Illus. 2 (Fig.2 on ScholarOne) near here, full page--

Brussels Ms 27766 is intimately bound with the music-making at a single convent, but while its contents are generous, they are not comprehensive. The convent must have had a fuller repertoire, perhaps in other manuscripts but

likely also found in prints: after all, the collection shows that the nuns could draw on works in the full range of clef dispositions, so theoretically they could choose their music from whatever prints were in circulation. Nevertheless, the majority of its works are in *voci pari*, including the earliest of the attributable works; it follows, then, that the printed equal-voice repertoire is no less legitimate a place to find traces of convent polyphony in the first half of the century.

We may also seek out settings of texts that were significant for nuns, particularly if those settings themselves are *voci pari*: the vestition antiphon 'Veni sponsa Christi', for instance, or liturgical texts like 'Salve sponsa Dei', with strong institutional significance for particular orders. And then there are texts, such as those drawn from the Song of Songs, that have a clear relevance for religious women celebrating their union with Christ.⁶⁸ Brussels Ms 27766 points the way here, too, by showing how settings of a well known text might, in certain circumstances, reveal specific resonances with conventual practice. The manuscript contains two four-voice settings, by Francesco Bocchini (G2-G2-C1-C1) and Antonio Moro (C1-C1-C1-C3), of the prayer 'Sancta Maria succurre miseris', which is included in a variety of Marian offices:⁶⁹

Sancta Maria, succurre miseris,
juva pusillanimes, refove flebiles
ora pro populo, interveni pro clero,
intercede pro devoto femineo sexu;
sentiant omnes tuum juvamen
quicumque celebrant tuam commemorationem. Alleluia.

Holy Mary, succour the poor,

aid the faint-hearted, revive those who mourn.

Pray for the people, intervene for the clergy,

intercede for women consecrated to God.

May all experience your aid

who celebrate your holy commemoration. Alleluia.

Central to this text is the passage which refers to the nuns themselves ('intercede pro devoto femineo sexu'). Both composers respond to the nuns' oration, highlighting it through specific devices. Bocchini uses duration and melisma: the people get three breves, the clerics four, and the nuns fourteen (Example 4). Moro, meanwhile, uses a change in declamation and chromatic alteration (Example 5, especially at bb. 31 and 34); while it is not unusual to see Efflat's in transposed Dorian mode works, in this setting they only appear on the word 'femineo'.70 These characteristics may have existed in the settings prior to their inclusion in the manuscript, but their appropriateness to conventual use is clear.

--Example 4 (see S1) near here--

--Example 5 (on S1) near here--

*

Seeking out suitable polyphony for all-female performance may be no more complicated now than it was for a 16th-century convent *maestra*: while some works need no modification (high compressed, or equal clefs), others require intervention (accompaniment) or adaptation (transposition), approaches that have sound bases in contemporary theory and practice.

Understanding how convents made music is vital to the understanding of Italian 16th-century musical culture as a whole. Acknowledging the role of female

voices in the history of polyphony will inevitably change our perception of how the music sounds and how it works. But it will also restore a balance to our own musical culture, and give us the opportunity to hear once again how the nuns might have followed Fra Angelico's Pauline exhortation in using their voices to please their cities for their good, and to their edification.

Laurie Stras is Professor of Music at the University of Southampton, and codirector, with Deborah Roberts, of Musica Secreta and the female-voice choir, Celestial Sirens, with whom she was awarded the American Musicological Society's 2016 Noah Greenberg Award. She is the author of numerous essays and articles on sixteenth-century polyphony, and she is co-editor, with Bonnie Blackburn, of Eroticism in Early Modern Music (Farnham, 2015). Her monograph, Women and Music in Sixteenth-Century Ferrara, is forthcoming with Cambridge University Press.

L.A.Stras@southampton.ac.uk

^{*} A great many scholars and musicians have contributed to my better understanding of music in early sixteenth-century convents. I am indebted to Craig Monson, Candace Smith, Robert Kendrick, Paula Higgins, and Bonnie Blackburn for their insights and support; and it almost goes without saying that the musicians of Musica Secreta and Celestial Sirens have been indispensable in this endeavour: particular thanks to Deborah Roberts and Sally Dunkley for their continuous enthusiasm and wisdom. All translations are my own unless otherwise indicated; many thanks to the anonymous readers for their invaluable suggestions on these and other matters.

- ¹ A. Bagnall Yardley, "Full weel she soong the service dyvyne": the cloistered musicians in the middle ages', in *Women making music: the western art tradition*, ed. Jane Bowers and Judith Tick (Urbana, 1986), pp.15–38, at p.30. Another chapter in the book also contained the first published modern scholarship on early modern nuns: Jane Bowers, 'The emergence of women composers in Italy, 1566-1700', in *Women making music*, ed. Bowers and Tick, pp.116–67.
- ² N. Zemon Davis, *Fiction in the archives: pardon tales and their tellers in sixteenth-century France* (Stanford, 1987), pp.2–3.
- ³ Note the specific exception of studies by Craig Monson, Robert Kendrick and Lucia Boscolo; C. Monson, 'Elena Malvezzi's keyboard manuscript: a new sixteenth-century source', *Early Music History*, 9 (1990), pp.73–128; R. L. Kendrick, *celestial sirens : nuns and their music in early modern Milan* (Oxford, 1996), pp.48–75; L. Boscolo, 'L'antologia polifonica fiorentina del 1560 nel Codice Bruxelles 27766', *Rassegna veneta di studi musicali*, 11/12 (1996), pp.177–267.
- ⁴ Giovanni Maria Artusi claimed that the nuns of San Vito in Ferrara were the finest ensemble in all of Italy; Giovanni Maria Artusi, *L'Artusi, ovvero delle imperfettioni della moderna musica ragionamenti dui* (Venice, 1600), fol.1v.
- ⁵ Yardley compiled a list of medieval manuscripts of polyphonic music for convents; Yardley, 'Cloistered Musicians', pp.15–38.
- ⁶ Raffaella Aleotti, *Sacrae cantiones: quinque, septem, octo & decem vocibus decantandae (1593)*, ed. C. A. Carruthers (New York, 2006). They have been recorded by Cappella Artemisia, *Le Monache di San Vito* (Tactus TC570101, 2012).

⁷ Tiburtio Massaino's *Sacri cantus quinque paribus vocibus...liber secundus* (Venice: Gardano, 1580).

⁸ Suor Leonora d'Este was abbess of the Clarissan convent of Corpus Domini in Ferrara. She was a longstanding correspondent with Gioseffo Zarlino, and their relationship provided inspiration for his 1588 treatise *Sopplimenti musicali*; see K. Schiltz, 'Gioseffo Zarlino and the Miserere tradition: A Ferrarese connection?', *Early Music History*, 27 (2008), pp.181–216, at pp.212–14. Nicola Vicentino praised her musical ability, including her understanding of the three *genera* of ancient music, shortly after dalla Viola's book was published; Nicola Vicentino, *L'antica musica ridotta alla moderna practica* (Rome, 1555), fol. 10r.

- ⁹ A partial picture of the scale of this printing initiative can be gained from searching the principal online databases for early modern sacred music: RISM, 'Printed Sacred Music in Europe 1500-1800' http://www.printed-sacred-music.org/ [accessed 29 July 2016]; J.G. Kurtzman and A. Schoebelen, 'A Catalogue of Mass, Office, and Holy Week Music Printed in Italy, 1516-1770', *JSCS Instrumenta, Volume 2* http://sscm-jscm.org/instrumenta/instrumenta-volume-2/ [accessed 29 July 2016].
- ¹⁰ G. Zarri, 'Monasteri femminili e città (secoli XV-XVIII)', in *Storia d'Italia. Annali.*La chiesa e il potere politico dal Medioevo all'età Contemporanea, ed. Giorgio
 Chittolini and Giovanni Miccoli (Turin, 1986), pp.357–429, at pp.361–5.
- ¹¹ The existing literature on early modern convent music contains rich detail on its economics; see, for instance, C. Monson, *Disembodied voices : music and culture in an early modern Italian convent* (Berkeley and London, 1995); Kendrick, *Celestial sirens*; C. Reardon, *Holy concord within sacred walls : nuns and*

music in Siena, 1575–1700 (Oxford, 2001); K. J. P. Lowe, Nuns' chronicles and convent culture in renaissance and counter-reformation Italy (Cambridge, 2003); K. Harness, Echoes of women's voices: music, art, and female patronage in early modern Florence (Chicago, 2006); J. K. Page, Convent music and politics in eighteenth-century Vienna (Cambridge, 2014).

¹² For comments on the civic purpose of convents see Lowe, *Nuns' chronicles*, pp.213–18.

¹³ Lowe, *Nuns' chronicles*, pp.214–15.

¹⁴ The visit 'was one of the most solemn and important occasions in [the convent's] history'; K. J. P. Lowe, 'Franciscan and Papal patronage at the Clarissan convent of San Cosimato in Trastevere, 1440–1560', *Papers of the British School at Rome*, 68 (2000), pp.217–239, at p.228.

¹⁵ Letter dated 3 January 1492 from Siviero Sivieri to Eleonora d'Aragona, transcribed in T. Tuohy, *Herculean Ferrara: Ercole D'Este (1471–1505) and the invention of a ducal capital* (Cambridge, 2002), p.482.

¹⁶ K. J. P. Lowe, 'Power and institutional identity in renaissance Venice: the female convents of S. M. Delle Vergini and S. Zaccaria', ed. K. J. P. Lowe and A. Korhonen, *the trouble with ribs: women, men and gender in early modern Europe,* Collegium: Studies across Disciplines in the Humanities and Social Sciences, 2 (2007), pp.128–152, at pp.138–41.

¹⁷ He underlined this entry in his list of 'sights shown to important visitors' three times, in red; Marino Sanudo, *Venice, Cità Excelentissima: selections from the renaissance diaries of Marin Sanudo*, ed. P. H. Labalme and L. Sanguineti White (Baltimore, 2008), p.392, n.85.

- ¹⁸ D. Chambers and B. Pullan, with J. Fletcher (eds), *Venice: A documentary history,* 1450–1630 (Toronto, 2001), p.10.
- ¹⁹ Lowe, Nuns' chronicles, pp.273, 278.
- ²⁰ E. Peverada, 'Documenti per la storia organaria dei monasteri femminili ferrarese (sec. XVI-XVII)', *L'Organo: Rivista di cultura organaria e organistica*, 30 (1996), pp.119–93.
- ²¹ Lowe, *Nuns' chronicles*, p.273; Patrick Macey, *Bonfire songs : Savonarola's musical legacy* (Oxford, 1998), pp.95–6.
- ²² Angelo da Vallombrosa, *Epistola dello heremita de Valle Ombrosa dello stato della Chiesa* (Florence, 1496), fol. 6v; partially quoted in Peverada, 'Documenti', p.119.
- ²³ W. F. Prizer, 'Una "virtù molto conveniente a madonne": Isabella d'Este as a musician', *The Journal of Musicology*, 17/1 (1999), pp.10–49, at p.24.
- ²⁴ Lowe, *Nuns' chronicles*, p.272.
- ²⁵ See Bowers, 'The emergence of women composers', p.130; Monson, *Disembodied voices*, p.48.
- ²⁶ Paula Higgins points to a late 15th-century 'instruction manual about polyphonic music' written in the vernacular, that may have been used by nuns; P. Higgins, 'The other Minervas: creative women at the court of Scotland', in *Rediscovering the muses: women's musical traditions*, ed. K. Marshall (Boston, 1993), pp.169–185, at p.181. The treatise is available in a modern edition: *Anonimi, Notitia del valore delle note del canto misurato*, ed. A. Carapetyan, Corpus Scriptorum de Musica 5 (s.l.: American Institute of Musicology, 1957). The editor concludes that the manuscript was compiled for convent use based on

an inscription, 'a uso per Sr. Landomina'. Bonnie Blackburn has noted that this name might be 'Laudomia', a name associated with the Medici in the 15th century; my thanks to her for this intriguing suggestion.

- ²⁷ Franchinus Gaffurius, Angelicum ac divinum opus musice. Franchini Gafurii laudensis Regii musici: ecclesieque Mediolanensis phonasci: materna lingua scriptum (Milan, 1508), sig.Bir.
- ²⁸ Bologna, Biblioteca della musica, C.30; modern edition, Orazio Vecchi, *Mostra delli tuoni della musica trattato inedito*, ed. M. Pollastri (Modena, 1987). Vecchi is known to have taught at a convent in Modena; it is conceivable that he used this treatise there.
- ²⁹ For instance, in 1525 Le Murate admitted a girl from a poor family, Suor Marta, 'because she possessed the "rare talent" of a bass voice'; Lowe, *Nuns' chronicles*, p.275.
- ³⁰ Gioseffo Zarlino, *Le istitutioni harmoniche (1588)*, facsimile reprint (New York, 1965), p.319.
- ³¹ Zarlino, *Le istitutioni*, p.320.
- ³² Zarlino, *Le istitutioni*, pp.319–20.
- ³³ See the discussion in Kendrick, *Celestial sirens*, pp.201–2.
- ³⁴ Vecchi, *Mostra delli tuoni*, pp.3–6.
- ³⁵ A. Johnstone, "High" clefs in composition and performance', *Early Music*, xxxiv/1 (2006), pp.29–53, at pp.31–5. A small number of works in the 16th-century repertoire were disseminated in both high- and low-clef systems; see Johnstone, "High" clefs', pp.35–40.

³⁶ This literature includes, but is not limited to: A. Parrott, 'Transposition in Monteverdi's Vespers of 1610: an "aberration" defended', Early Music, xii/4 (1984), pp.490–516; J. G. Kurtzman, 'An aberration amplified', *Early Music*, xiii/1 (1985), pp.73–76; P. Barbieri, 'Chiavette and modal transposition in Italian practice (c.1500–1837)', Recercare, 3 (1991), pp.5–79; R. Rasch, 'Modes, clefs, and transpositions in the early seventeenth century', in *Théorie et Analyse* Musicales (1450–1650), ed. B. J. Blackburn and A. -E. Ceulemans (Leuven, 2001), pp.403–32; J.G. Kurtzman, 'Tones, modes, clefs and pitch in Roman cyclic magnificats of the 16th century', *Early Music*, xxii/4 (1994), pp.641–65; R. Bowers, 'An "aberration" reviewed: the reconciliation of inconsistent clefsystems in Monteverdi's Mass and Vespers of 1610', Early Music, xxxi/4 (2003), pp.527–38; A. Parrott, 'Monteverdi: onwards and downwards', Early Music, xxxii/2 (2004), 303-17; Johnstone, "High" clefs'; R. Bowers, "The High and Lowe Keyes Come Both to One Pitch": reconciling inconsistent clef-systems in Monteverdi's vocal music for Mantua', Early Music, xxxix/4 (2011), pp.531-45; A. Parrott, 'High clefs and down-to-earth transposition: a brief defence of Monteverdi', Early Music, xxxx/1 (2012), pp.81-6; A. Parrott, 'A brief anatomy of choirs', in *The Cambridge Companion to Choral Music*, ed. André de Quadros (Cambridge, 2012), pp.7–26. Andrew Parrott cites the downward transposition in the keyboard *partitura* of two high-clef motets in Aquilino Coppini's 1607 Musica tolta contrafacta (madrigals with Latin texts substituted for the original vernacular) in support of mandatory transposition, without mentioning the other nine high-clef motets in the book that are not transposed in the keyboard score; see Parrott, 'Monteverdi: onwards and downwards', p.314. Downward

transposition in keyboard intabulation may equally reflect a more convenient disposition for solo performance.

- ³⁷ Parrott limits his coverage of convent ensembles in his 'brief anatomy of choirs' to two pages out of twenty, and begins his discussion in the 15th century; Parrott, 'A brief anatomy of choirs', pp.22–4.
- ³⁸ Pompeo Signorucci, *Salmi, falsibordoni et motetti a tre voci, commodissimi per cantare, et concertare nel Organo, con ogni sorte di strumento* (Venice, 1603), fol.2r.
- ³⁹ Johnstone calls this compressed disposition 'ubiquitous' in high-clef works; Johnstone, "High" clefs', p.44.
- ⁴⁰ Selective octave-transposition has the longest and best-documented association with monastic female ensembles; see Kendrick, *Celestial Sirens*, pp.188–203. For 18th-century practice, see M. Talbot, 'Tenors and Basses at the Venetian "Ospedali", *Acta musicologica*, 66/2 (1994), pp.123–38.
- ⁴¹ Ercole Bottrigari, *Il Desiderio, overo, De concerti di varii strumenti musicali. Dialogo di Alemanno Benelli, etc.* (Venice, 1594), p.58; Artusi, *L'Artusi*, fol.3r.

 ⁴² Vecchi, *Mostra delli tuoni*, p.6.
- ⁴³ See O. Kinkeldey, 'Equal voices in the a cappella period', in *Essays on Music in Honor of Archibald Thompson Davidson* (Cambridge, MA, 1957), pp.101–9; F. Carey, 'Composition for equal voices in the sixteenth century', *The Journal of Musicology*, 9/3 (1991), pp.300–42. Neither consider the performance of sacred music by female voices in detail (Carey not at all). A forthcoming chapter considers Cipriano de Rore's *voci pari* motets (again, without reference to female voices); K. Schiltz, 'Cipriano de Rore's *a voci pari* motets: sources, context, style',

in *Cipriano de Rore at the crossroads*, ed. J. A. Owens and K. Schiltz (Turnhout, 2017), pp.191–227.

- ⁴⁴ See Carey, 'Composition for equal voices', pp.301–12.
- ⁴⁵ Vicentino, *L'antica musica*, fols.92*v*–93*r*.
- decantandae (Venice: Scotto, 1542; RISM 1542³); Musica quinque vocum: motteta materna lingua vocata (Venice: Gardano, 1543; RISM 1543²); Moralis hispani, et multorum eximiae artis virorum musica cum vocibus quatuor, vulgo motecta cognominata, cuius magna pars paribus vocibus cantanda est, relique verò plena voce apta est decantari (Venice: Scotto, 1543; RISM 1543⁵); Liber quartus missarum quinque cum quatuor vocibus paribus canendarum (Venice: Gardano, 1544; RISM 1544³); Musica quinque vocum que materna lingua moteta vocantur (Venice: Gardano, 1549; RISM 1549°); Musica quatuor vocum que materna lingua moteta vocantur (Venice: Gardano, 1549; RISM 1549°).
- ⁴⁷ This holds true for all of the books listed above except 1544³, which I have not been able to examine.
- ⁴⁸ See Johnstone, "High" clefs', p.35; RISM 1549⁶ and 1549⁹ contain low-clef works originally published in RISM 1543² and 1543⁵ in high clefs.
- ⁴⁹ The literature on Verona MS 761 that specifically addresses its use—or not—by nuns is J. Benfield, 'Music in Verona, C. 1480–1530' (PhD thesis, University of Cambridge, 1984), p.179; H. M. Brown, 'Music for the nuns of Verona: a story about MS DCCLXI of the Biblioteca capitolare in Verona', in *Gestalt und Entestehung musikalischer Quellen im 15. und 16. Jahrhundert*, ed. M. Staehelin, Quellenstudien zur Musik der Renaissance, 83 (Wiesbaden, 1998), pp.111–24; J.

Rifkin, 'A scriptor, a singer, and a mother superior', in 'Uno gentile et subtile ingenio': Studies in Renaissance Music in Honour of Bonnie Blackburn, ed. M. J. Bloxam, G. Filocamo, and L. Holford-Strevens (Turnhout, 2009), pp.309–17.

50 A complete list of contents and concordances with Vatican sources is given in Appendix B of J. Rodin, Josquin's Rome: hearing and composing in the Sistine Chapel, AMS Studies in Music (New York, 2012), pp.324–5.

- ⁵¹ Benfield, 'Music in Verona', p.196.
- ⁵² Rifkin, 'A Scriptor', 315.
- ⁵³ Girolamo dalla Corte, *L'istoria di Verona divisa in ... XX. libri* (1596), p.448. Brown assumed that these masses are, instead, either Marian or connected to Saint Michael; Brown, 'Music for the nuns of Verona', pp.115–6.
- ⁵⁴ Benfield, 'Music in Verona', p.179.
- ⁵⁵ Brown, 'Music for the nuns of Verona', p.113. Brown then pursued an alternative convent, San Michele in Campagna, as the manuscript's source, but this does not fit with the illuminations in any way.
- ⁵⁶ Alternatively, the manuscript may have been confiscated in the general enforcement of enclosure imposed on all Verona's convents by the bishop in April 1531; Corte, *L'istoria di Verona*, pp.633; 682–4.
- ⁵⁷ Giovanni Matteo Giberti, *Constitutioni de le monache per la città et Diocesi di Verona* (Verona, 1539), cap.II.
- ⁵⁸ Pre-Tridentine conventual customs included the celebration of nuns' relatives' weddings; see Lowe, *Nuns' chronicles*, p.227, n.1.
- ⁵⁹ The incipit to *L'ami Baudichon* is also given in the 'Crucifixus' section of the Credo, but the rubric 'sicut mutus non aperiens os suum' above the tenor

indicates that the part is not to be sung; see the discussion in A. Kirkman, *The* cultural life of the early polyphonic mass: medieval context to modern revival (Cambridge, 2010), pp.137-40.

- ⁶⁰ See Monson, 'Elena Malvezzi's keyboard manuscript', pp.73–128, at pp.104–8; L. Stras, 'The *Ricreationi per monache* of Suor Annalena Aldobrandini', *Renaissance Studies*, 26/1 (2012), pp.34–59, at p.41.
- 61 Brown, 'Music for the nuns of Verona', pp.119–22.
- 62 In 1553, an Agnoletta Biffoli is recorded as the widow of first Piero Gondi and then Jacopo Benozzi; Giovanni Corbinelli, *Histoire généalogique de la maison de* Gondi (Paris, 1705), I, p.182. There is no indication in the manuscript as to which Clarissan convent Suor Agnoleta and Suor Clementia belonged. However, in 1572, another Biffoli, Suor Benigna, was madre at Sant'Orsola (the burial place of Lisa Gherardini, Leonardo da Vinci's Mona Lisa); Giovambatista Ubaldini, Istoria della casa degli Ubaldini e de'fatti d'alcuni di quella famiglia (Florence, 1588), p.122. Alternatively, given the prominence given to the Vespers psalms and hymn from the Common of the Apostles and Evangelists, placed near the beginning, the book could have originated in San Iacopo in via Ghibellina, or in San Matteo in Arcetri, which was eventually home to Suor Maria Celeste, daughter of Galileo Galilei.
- 63 Boscolo, 'L'antologia polifonica fiorentina'.
- ⁶⁴ Willem Elders notes that the motet's high tessitura (cleffed C1-C1-C2) suggests that it was composed for nuns; W. Elders, Josquin Des Prez and his *musical legacy: an introductory guide* (Leuven, 2013), p.175. The attribution to Josquin is derived solely from its only other source, RISM 15201.

- ⁶⁵ G. Baroffio and E. J. Kim, *Iam sanctae Clarae claritas: l'ufficio ritmico di santa Chiara nella tradizione arborense* (Milan, 2004).
- ⁶⁶ In RISM 1543₂, and Benedetto Binaghi, *Sacrarum cantionum quinque vocum liber primus* (Milan: Agostino Tradate, 1598).
- ⁶⁷ For further discussion of this setting see L. Boscolo, 'Una composizione a 4 voci in notazione quadrata nel codice fiorentino di Bruxelles 27766', in *Un millennio di polifonia liturgica tra oralità e scrittura*, ed. G. Cattin and F. A. Gallo (Venice, 2002), pp.11–18. For the importance of the antiphon 'Veni sponsa Christi' to nuns' liturgy, see C. Reardon, "'Veni sponsa Christi": investiture, profession and consecration ceremonies in Sienese convents', *Musica disciplina*, 50 (1996), pp.271–97.
- ⁶⁸ See, for instance, L. Macy, 'Geronimo Cavaglieri, the Song of Songs and female spirituality in Federigo Borromeo's Milan', *Early Music*, xxxix/3 (2011), pp.349–58.
- ⁶⁹ Francesco Bocchini was *maestro di cappella* at Pisa Cathedral from 1555 to 1570; F. Baggiani, 'Musicisti in Pisa. I maestri di Cappella della Primaziale', *Bollettino storico pisano*, 52 (1982), pp.271–94. Antonio Moro was the copyist of the manuscript.
- ⁷⁰ For the gendered significance of flats see B. J. Blackburn, 'The Lascivious Career of B-Flat', in *Eroticism in Early Modern Music*, ed. B. J. Blackburn and L. Stras (Farnham, 2015), pp.19–42.

TABLE CAPTIONS

Table 1: Sixteenth-century polyphony associated with Italian nuns and convents

Table 2: Contents and clef dispositions in Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare MS 761

FIGURE CAPTIONS

Figure 1: Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare MS 761, 1v. By permission.

Figure 2: Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique MS 27766, 16v,

Psalm Tone 1 transposed up a fifth. By permission.

MUSIC EXAMPLE CAPTIONS

Example 1a: Orazio Vecchi, *Mostra delli tuoni*, Bologna C30, 1v-2r (note, *cantus firmus* voice is placed at the top of the score in the ms.).

Example 1b: Orazio Vecchi, Mostra delli tuoni, Bologna C30, 2v-3r.

Example 2a: Pompeo Signorucci, Salmi...a tre voci, 1603, 'En dilectus meus', bb. 14-20

Example 2b: Pompeo Signorucci, *Salmi...a tre voci*, 1603, 'En dilectus meus', bb. 14-20, transposed down fourth.

Example 3: Orazio Vecchi, Mostra delli tuoni, Bologna C30, 3r-3v.

Example 4: Francesco Bocchini, 'Sancta Maria succurre miseris', Brussels MS 27766, 44v-46r, bb. 19-39.

Example 5: Antonio Moro, 'Sancta Maria succurre miseris', Brussels MS 27766, 41v-43r, bb. 15-35.

Table 1: Sixteenth-century polyphony associated with Italian nuns and convents

Date	Composer	Title	Publisher	Dedicatee	Convent	Order
1550	Francesco dalla Viola	Primo libro de madrigali a quattro voci	Venice: Gardano	Suor Leonora d'Este	Corpus Domini, Ferrara	Clarissan
1580	Tiburtio Massaino	Sacri cantus quinque paribus vocibusliber secundus	Venice: Gardano	Suor Eugenia de Navi	Santa Trinità, Como	Augustinian
1580	Antonio Valente	Versi spirituali sopra tutte le Note, con diversi Canoni spartiti per sonar ne gli Organi, Messe, Vespere, et altri Officii divini	Naples: Heirs of Matteo Cancer	Donna Elionora Palmiera	?? a	??
1581	Costanzo Antegnati	Sacrae cantiones, vulgo motecta, paribus vocibusquatuor vocum	Brescia: Sabbio	Madre Serena de' Boni	Santa Giulia, Brescia	Benedictine
1583	Giammatteo Asola	Duplex completorium romanum unum communibus, alterum vero paribus vocibus decantandum	Venice: Vincenzi and Amadino	Suor Ginevera Baialoti (and Suor Cherubina)	San Daniele, Verona	Benedictine
1583	Camillo Cortellini	Primo libro de madrigali a cinque voci	Ferrara: Baldini	Laura Bovio ^b	San Lorenzo, Bologna	Augustinian, Lateran Canonesses
1584	Alessandro Milleville	Le Vergine, con dieci altre stanze spirituali a quattro voci	Ferrara: Baldini	Suor Brigida Grana ^c	San Rocco, Ferrara	Dominican
1585	M. Giovanni Becci (editor) [Palestrina; Bartolomeo Roy]	Di M. Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestina (sic) vna Messa a otto voci sopra il suo Confitebor a due Cori. Et di M. Bartolomeo Lo Roii	Venice: Scotto	Eleonora Cybo (and Donna Caterina Cybo)	Le Murate, Florence	Benedictine

		vna Messa a quattro sopra Panis quem ego dabo tibi, de Lupo				
1587	Andrea Rota	Motectorum liber primus quae quinque, sex, septem et octo vocibus concinuntur	Milan: Heirs of Francesco and Simon Tini	Donna Leonora Moneta, Donna Prospera Pusterla, and all the other madri	[San Vittore], Meda	Benedictine
1592	Costanzo Antegnati	Salmi a otto Voci	Venice: Gardano	Donna Hortensia Marchi, Donna Hieronima Birraga, and their compagne	San Vittore, Meda	Benedictine
1593	Suor Raffaella Aleotti	Sacrae cantiones: quinque, septem, octo & decem vocibus decantandae	Venice: Amadino	Bishop Giovanni Fontana	San Vito, Ferrara	Augustinian
1595	Camillo Cortellini	Salmi a sei voci	Venice: Vincenzi	Donna Paola Ortensia Serbellona	San Vicenzo, Milan	Benedictine
1597	Alessandro Savioli	Salmi intieri a cinque voci	Venice: Amadino	Donna Flavia Gromella Benaglia Abbatessa, and their care figliole	Santa Grata, Bergamo	Benedictine

1598	Agostino Soderini	Sacrarum Cantionum octo et novem vocibus liber primus	Milan: Trabate	Overall dedication to Duke Ercole Sfondrato	individual dedications to Donna Angelica Agatha Sfondrata San Paolo; Donna Francisca Maria Stampa, and Donna Angela Catarina Brivia, Santa Radegonda; Donna Martha, Collegio della Guastalla	various
1598	Gioseffo Gallo	Sacri operis musici	Milan: Heirs of Francisco and Simon Tini	various	individual dedications to Angelica and Archilea Archinta, and Maximilla Biuma; Santa Radegonda, Milan; Anna Camilla and Bianca Margarita, Sant'Orsola, Milan; Arcangela and Maria Mantegazza, Sant'Agnese, Milan	various
1599	Adriano Banchieri	Messe solenne a otto voci	Venice: Amadino	Donna Emilia Grassi	Santa Cristina, Bologna	Camadolese
1599	Giovenale Ancina (editor)	Tempio armonico della Beatissima Vergineprima parte a tre voci	Rome: Nicolò Mutio	Madre Suor Orsola Benincasa	Monastero della Concettione nel Monte di San Martino, Napoli	Theatine?

^a Valente does not say outright that Donna Eleonora Palmiera is a nun, but it would be extraordinary for him to dedicate a volume of functional Office music to a secular woman. The dedicatory material indicates that she is both a liturgical musician of merit and Valente's teacher; the gender reversal is astonishing, but as he was blind, perhaps he was raised in a convent.

b The Bolognese singer Laura Bovio received her musical education in the convent of San Lorenzo, but was not professed. She eventually left the convent and was employed as a singer at the Medici court between 1584 and 1589; C. Monson, 'Ancora uno sguardo sulle suore musiciste di Bologna', in *I monasteri femminili come centri di cultura fra rinascimento e barocco*, ed. Gianna Pomata and Gabriella Zarri (Rome, 2005), pp. 3–26.

^c Milleville says in his dedication that Suor Brigida is a poet, so she may be the author of the 'altre stanze spirituali' set in the second half of the book.

Table 2: Contents and clef dispositions in Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare MS 761a

	Title	Composer	Disposition	Main clefs	[other combinations used]		
1	Missa de BVM	anon	СС	c2c4c4F4	$c_3c_4F_4F_5$		
2	Missa Salve diva parens	Obrecht	high-clef	$g_2c_3c_3F_3$	$g_2c_3c_3c_4$	$g_2c_3c_3F_4$	
3	Missa Bon temps	Brumel	low-clef	$c_1c_3c_3F_4$	$c_1c_3c_4F_4$		
4	Missa Da pacem	anon	сс	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$			
5	Missa Ma bouche rit	Martini	vp	C1C3C4C4			
6	Missa L'ami baudichon	Josquin	СС	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	$c_1c_2c_3F_3$	$c_1c_3c_3c_5^b$	
7	Missa Dominicalis	de Orto	vp	$c_1c_3c_3c_4$	$c_1c_3c_3c_5$		
8	Missa Orsus orsus	Martini	сс	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	C1C3C3C5	c1c3c4F4	$c_2c_4c_5F_4$
9	Missa l'homme armé	Busnois	vp	C1C3C3C4			
10	Missa l'homme armé	Faugues	vp	$c_1c_3c_3c_4$	$c_1c_3c_3c_3$	$c_1c_1c_1c_3$	$C_1C_1C_1C_4$
11	Missa Regina celi	Basiron	сс	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	$c_1c_3c_4F_3$		
12	Missa Alma redemptoris mater	anon	сс	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	C1C3C3C5		
13	Missa de Angelis	Prioris	vp/cc	C1C3C3C4	C1C3C3C5	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	
14	Missa l'homme armé	Brumel	сс	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	$c_1c_3c_3c_5$	C ₁ C ₃ C ₃ C ₄	
15	Missa Victime pascali	Brumel	сс	$c_1c_3c_3F_3$	$c_1c_3c_4F_4$	$c_1c_3c_4F_3$	C1C3C3C5
16	Missa Ma bouche rit a3	anon	vp	C1C3C4			
17	Missa Ferialis	Martini	сс	$c_1c_3c_4F_3$	$c_1c_3c_4F_4$		
18	Credo I	Vaqueras	low-clef	$c_1c_3c_4F_4$			
19	Credo I (a5)	Vaqueras	low-clef	c1c3c4c4F4			
20	Credo I	Weerbeeke	low-clef	$c_1c_3c_4F_4$			
21	Credo IV	Nicasius de Clibano	low-clef	$c_1c_3c_4F_4$			
22	Te Deum 'contra a fauxbourdon'	Binchois	vp	C ₁ C ₄			

^a In the 'Disposition' column, 'vp' = 'voci pari', and 'cc' = 'compressed cleffing'.

^b Note, c₅ is equivalent to F₃, but both clefs are used in the manuscript.

















