Societal Stability and Environmental Change: Examining the Archaeology - Soil Erosion Paradox

Tony Brown

Paleoenvironmental Laboratory University of Southampton (PLUS), University of Southampton, Southampton SO43 7FT UK

Abstract
This paper critically examines the soil-exhaustion and societal collapse hypothesis both theoretically and empirically. The persistence of civilisations, especially in the Mediterranean, despite intensive and presumably erosive arable farming creates what is described here as the archaeology-soil erosion paradox. This paper examines the data used to estimate past erosion and weathering rates, before presenting case studies which engage with the theoretical arguments. Study 1 shows 5000 years of high slope erosion rates with both soil use and agriculture continuously maintained in the catchment. Study 2 shows how ancient agricultural terraces were constructed as part of an integrated agricultural system which fed the ancient city of Stymphalos - now abandoned. Study 3 presents a recent example of how after the removal of terraces high soil erosion rates result during intense rainstorms but that arable agriculture can still be maintained whilst external costs are borne by other parties. What these case studies have in common is the creation of soil, and increased weathering rates whist productivity is maintained due to a combination of soft bedrocks and/or agricultural terraces. In societal terms this may not be sustainable but it does not necessarily lead to land abandonment or societal collapse.

Introduction

Soil lies at the base of all human subsistence systems and so it is unsurprising that it has been implicated in both archaeological and recent socio-economic problems, particularly in regions with relatively low or unreliable rainfall and incomplete vegetation cover. A narrative has emerged from environmental disciplines that soil erosion was implicated in the collapse or decline of past complex societies (Montgomery, 2007a). This paper questions this view through examining this degradation narrative and presenting three case studies which in different ways also question this narrative. The soil-erosion driven societal collapse narrative can be interrogated through three propositions. The first proposition is that a soil exhaustion model may not adequately describe the soil mass balance over the medium timescale (10^2-10^3 years). The second is that past societies were aware of the danger and from earliest times employed techniques that manipulated the soil formation/erosion balance and in particular through agricultural terracing. The last proposition is that the abandonment of such soil conservation and creation measures is the most likely cause of short-term increases in soil erosion, loss of fertility and soil profile truncation but that this can be compensated for by additions and external support. The three case studies exemplify these propositions with Case Study 1 being an example of continued arable agriculture despite extremely high erosion rates, whilst case Study 2 describes a City State where agricultural terracing was an integral part of the economy and case Study 3 illustrates the erosion rates and forms of erosion that can occur after the ploughing-out of terraces on soft rocks. All three examples can be regarded as typically NW European or Mediterranean. The debate as to human impact on both erosion and soil production rates and the effects of agricultural terracing is a key element in the currently vibrant Anthropocene debate (Monastersky, 2015)

The rise and decline of agricultural societies, soil exhaustion and soil conservation

Because soil has traditionally been viewed as a finite, or non-renewable resource, several soil scientists, geomorphologists and biologists have considered soil, as not only a limiting factor for the growth of civilisations but also a possible cause of societal collapse through its over-exploitation (Dale and Carter, 1955; Mann et al., 2003; Diamond, 2005; Montgomery, 2007a). As Montgomery (2007b) has remarked "The life expectancy of a civilization depends on the ratio of the initial soil thickness to the net rate at which it loses soil". So Montgomery (2007b) and others such as Chew (2001) have argued several civilisations collapsed for the primary reason that they destroyed their soil resources by arable cultivation above a sustainable rate, and so presumably suffered population collapse or out-migration due to increasing famine and food poverty. This narrative, also referred to as 'overshoot' (*c.f.* Tainter, 2006), has been utilised in turn by soil scientists understandably critical of modern agronomy (Scholes and Scholes, 2013). However, archaeologists have failed to show convincingly a single example of this scenario, indeed further research has almost invariably led to a questioning of soil-based and other monocausal hypotheses (Tainter, 2006; Hunt, 2007: McAnany and Yoffee, 2010). Hence the title of this paper - the archaeology-soil erosion paradox, or how can societies continue despite what *would appear to be* unsustainable demands upon their soil base.

Montgomery's statement and the soil-collapse paradigm is based upon estimates of soil erosion under arable agriculture that appear to be several times greater, or even an order of magnitude greater, than soil production rates (Fig. 1a; Montgomery, 2007b). For this to be the case we have to be confident that both the estimates of soil erosion under the appropriate agricultural conditions and the soil production rates are realistic. In this regard soil production is not easy to measure directly and so proxy measures are used. The most common is to assume soils are in equilibrium under natural conditions and use a natural or non-agricultural erosion rate to approximate the soil production rate. This gives low rates between 10^{-4} to 10^{-1} mm yr^{-1} which overlap with modern agricultural rates of 10^{-1}- to 10^{2} mm yr^{-1} (Montgomery, 2007). An alternative that has only recently become available is to use an estimate of long-term soil erosion from cosmogenic radionuclides and particularly ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al on quartz (Small et al., 1999). An example is Heimsath et al. (1997; 2000) who used ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al on greywacke in northern California, and on granites in south eastern Australia, making in both cases, the assumption that local soil thickness was constant with time. Also in Australia Wilkinson et al. (2005) estimated rates using ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al on Triassic sandstones in the Blue Mountains. Interestingly the results in this case suggested to the authors that the soils were not in equilibrium probably because of a late Pleistocene glacial inheritance. These studies have produced estimates in the range 0.009-0.1 mm yr^{-1} (mean 0.1 mm yr^{-1}). In a much a much cooler climate estimates derived from the microweathering of roches Moutonnées in Norway, are an order of magnitude Lower (Andre, 2002). It is well known that cratons may have low weathering rates, but that in these areas deep soils have accumulated over hundreds of thousands of years.

A deeply embedded assumption in soil production theory is that there is an exponential or humped relationship between soil depth and the weathering rate (Carson and Kirkby, 1972; Cox, 1980; Heimsath et al., 2001). In both the humped or exponential curves the weathering rate falls to practically zero when soil thicknesses exceed 2-3m and it is argued that this produces divergent evolution of soils with thin soils having a distinct contrast between bedrock and soil (clear and sharp weathering front) or thick soils with indistinct soil bedrock boundaries. However, there is evidence that soil-production functions (SPFs) are sensitive to root density and other ecological factors, many of which can extend many metres into the soil (e.g. due to termites) and cosmogenic data (^{10}Be) suggest soil chemical denudation rates increase proportionately with erosion rates (Fig. 1b; Larsen et al., 2014). Given that increased porosity under bioturbation or tillage increases biological activity (respiration) and water movement, it should therefore increase the weathering rate particularly from increased hydrolysis of soil skeletal minerals. Most recently Johnson et al. (2014) have estimated the depth dependency of soil bioturbation rates and shown that they are strongly related to rooting depth and also sensitive to the erosion rate. This process of soil formation can now be seen due to X-ray CT scanning of tilled versus zero-tilled soils (Mangalassery et al., 2014). Therefore soil production on soft rocks (e.g. loess or marls) is a function of the chemical weathering rate and bioturbation (including tillage) and this can allow the maintenance of a regolith, with fertility maintained by grazing and/or manuring (or chemical fertilizers today). On hard rocks, such as hard limestones this cannot occur and soils thins and can be lost completely, although most will accumulate downstream in structural traps and floodplains. This causes the dichotomy often seen in Mediterranean regions with fertile soils in some areas and almost bare rock in others. A good example of this dichotomy is the estimated soil erosion map of Crete as predicted by the G2 Erosion model (Fig. 2; European Soil Portal). This model estimates soil loss from sheet and rill erosion using a modified Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) on a monthly time-step (Panagos et al., 2014). Data input is from a number of European and Global databases for soils and DEM datasets from satellites.

The slope-weathering-erosion system is further complicated by agricultural terracing. Agricultural terraces systems vary according to their morphology and means of construction but can be broadly grouped into slow and fast terraces. Slow terraces are created behind walls, constructed along the contours and are associated with irrigation/drainage channels. Soil depth increases behind the walls through erosion upslope. In theory these terraces can arise from walled co-axial field-system or from stone clearance. Fast terraces or 'bedrock'-cut terraces have risers cut into slope creating new saprolite behind terrace wall. Both slow and fast terraces increase the total saprolite and so could increase effective weathering rate especially under tillage, as discussed later in this paper. In parts of Europe such as the UK and northern France terraces were constructed on this soils, especially on soft limestone, often without walls and these are referred to as lynchets (Lewis, 2012; Chartin et al., 2011).

Case Study 1: The Frome Catchment UK.

The erosion and societal collapse literature tends to focus on Mediterranean or semi-arid environments, however, very high erosion rates are observed in the cool temperate zone of North West Europe. This is particularly true with catchments with relatively moderate rainfall and on soft sedimentary lithologies such as the river Frome in the Midland region of the UK. The Frome is a small (144 km^2) low relief catchment entirely on soft and friable mudstones in the West Midlands of the UK (Fig. 3). These lithologies produce argillic brown earths soils which are moderately to highly erodible but inherently fertile (Fig. 3b). The catchment receives moderate annual precipitation (706 mm yr^{-1}) which can exceed annual potential evapotranspiration although there can be a small moisture deficit (400-200 mm) during the summer and this has led to field irrigation in modern times. Pollen analyses from the alluvial valley indicates that the catchment was almost entirely deforested by the late Bronze Age (*c*. 3000 cal. BP) and under arable cultivation with much of the resulting eroded soil being deposited as overbank alluvium along the valley floor (Brown et al., 2011; Brown et al., 2013). Using 7 cross-sections of the valley and both radiocarbon and optically stimulated luminescence (OSL) dating, estimates were made of the deposition rate of sediments in five of these reaches (Fig. 4a). Since it is reasonable to assume a constant delivery ratio over such a small change in catchment area (77 to 144 km^2) these rates can be converted into minimum erosion estimates (Fig. 4b). These rates vary from 40-100 t km^2 and show a distinct increase over the last 5000 years. These rates are also comparable to another small catchment 28 km to the southwest which was the first location in which this type of budget analysis was attempted in the UK (Brown and Barber, 1985). The resultant over-thickened and homogenous superficial floodplain sediment unit is found over wide areas of the English Midlands and was first recognised in the 1970s by Shotton who termed it the buff-red-silty clay (Shotton, 1976; Brown, 1997). Due in part to its known high erosion rates, the catchment sediment discharge of the Frome has been measured within the last decade (Walling et al., 2008) and from these studies we know that the recent (2000-2004) estimated erosion rate is 19.4 t km^{-2} year^{-1}. Due to the incised nature of the channel today the contemporary sediment loads are derived from bank erosion (48%), cultivation (38%) and pasture (16%; Walling et al., 2008). Given these rates and the volumes of sediment stored in the floodplain it would take c. 60,000 years to remove all the stored sediment at the present erosion rate.

Despite this high erosion rate the catchment is still covered in relatively deep soils (argillic brown-earths) and has a dense multi-period archaeological record (White and Ray, 2011). There are still remnants of lynchets on some slopes but it is not known precisely what age they are. Other archaeology includes abundant evidence of arable agriculture and settlement in the late Prehistoric and Roman periods and a rich record of Medieval settlement (White and Ray, 2011). A good example of this is the area around Venn Farm, Bishops Frome, which is located in the middle of the valley just to the south of Bromyard (Fig. 3) which revealed Medieval kilns (probably for corn drying), ridge and furrow (arable strip cultivation), a mill, mill race and an associated agricultural earthwork terrace (Hovered and Roseff, 2000). In the 19th century it developed an intensive hop (for brewing) and soft fruit agriculture. Data has been extracted at a parish level from the Post Office Directory of Hertfordshire (1851-1931) and other trade directories in order to document rural population change from 1853 to 1931 as part of the Frome Valley Project (Table 1). This shows that maximum population densities occurred in the mid to late 19th and very early 20th centuries supported by the intensive cultivation of hops, wheat, barley, apples and fruit. At the peak these rural population densities reached remarkably high values (0.9 persons ha) which would today be regarded as unsustainable (Roose, 1996), however, this wasacieved through the intensive arable cultivation of fields and lynched that had been agricultural soils for over 3000 thousand years. The catchment remains predominantly under intensive arable cultivation today (largely cereals) and as has happened over much of the UK field size has increased (White and Ray, 2011). Fertility is maintained by both the addition of farmyard manure and also chemical (NPK) fertilizers. However, one negative aspect of this high erosion rate has been the almost total removal of archaeological features including terracing, from the catchment slopes and also the burial of significant archaeology within the floodplain (Brown et al., 2011). However, the eroded soil also significantly increased the alluvial area in the catchment and this has been exploited by both arable cultivation (including potatoes) even in areas 'liable to flooding' and also by highly productive pastoral agriculture. This included at Paunton Mill the construction of an integrated corn mill and water meadows constructed on an area of post Bronze Age alluviation (Howerd and Roseff, 1999).

Case Study 2: Terraces in the Stymfalia Valley NW Peloponese, Greece
The Stymfalia Valley is a polje (structural valley in limestone) in the NW Peloponese in Greece. It was the location of the classical city of Stymphalos from 700-375 BC and again from 375 BC - 6th C AD (the Late Classical City), after which it fell into decline. Stymphalos is famous in classical mythology as the location of Hercules 6th labour – the killing of the Stymphalian birds. The site of the classical city is surrounded by a reed-fringed lake which is under 2m deep and has been known to have dried out in historical times. Being a polje the hydrogeology of the valley is complicated, but in essence valley-side springs on the north face of the valley under Mt. Kylini supplies water to the valley floor and lake. The lake has a natural outlet on its southern side which is a sink-hole. Sink-holes are prone to get plugged by sediment and can therefore 'behave' erratically and this is clearly the source of stories told in antiquity of the sudden drainage of the lake as recorded by the Classical writer and geographer Pausanias (Clendenon, 2010). The Hercules myth is also probably related to the erratic behaviour of the lake in an indirect fashion as well as the Greek myths of the hunter-gatherer origins of the Arcadians in their brutish environment (Schama, 1995). However, the valley-side springs were essential for water supply to agricultural terraces up to an altitude

of 900 m asl. These springs also supplied water to the valley-base alluvial fans which formed local aquifers closer to the ancient city and under the modern village of Stymfalia. Although the agricultural terraces have yet to be independently dates erosion at Bouzi revealed a buried landsurface covered by 0.4 m of soil that contained an assemblage of Roman pottery. This terrace system is developed below the springs at upper village of Stymfalia and it includes a series of water channels designed to feed water from the spring onto the terraces (Fig. 5).

Coring in the valley floor and through the lake by Heymann et al. (2013) and Walsh et al. (in press) has allowed the creation of a sediment deposition model. Sedimentation has also been investigated by coring close to the edge of the city where over 2 m of marginal lake sediment has been shown to contain pottery and brick from the city (Walsh et al., in press.). Both the central and marginal cores reveal that the maximum accumulation rates post-date the Classical period: at c. 2000-1200 BP and there is no evidence that the preceding 700 years of city occupation was associated with atypically high deposition rates in the lake. Since the valley has no significant sediment contributing areas other than the immediate slopes around Stymphalos and the valley has no outlet other than the sinkhole the rates of deposition can be taken as a proxy for the erosion rate. The fountain House cores suggest an average accumulation rate of 1.7 mm yr^{-1} and the core published by Hermann et al. (2013) shows an increase in the accumulation rate further out into the lake from 0.56 mm yr^{-1} to 1.3 mm yr^{-1} in the early Classical Period to around 0.36 mm yr^{-1} subsequently. Using both estimates from the Fountain House cores and the core by Heymann et al. (2013) the estimated accumulation rates if averaged over the lake basin area (from Papastergiadou et al., 2007) would produce a long term average clastic erosion rate in the catchment of approximately 0.1 to 0.04 t ha yr^{-1}. It is not surprising that these rates are low, although higher than the Holocene average which is approximately 0.01 t ha yr^{-1} as all the bedrock in the catchment is relatively pure limestone and so would be expected to dominate the total denudation loss but at a rate linearly related to precipitation (Simms, 2004). Although the dating needs to be improved, it is likely that the higher erosion rates post-date the abandonment of the city which was caused fundamentally by a political shift of power to the Corinth area facilitated, at least in part, by the water supply taken from the Stymphalos valley-lake. The importance of Stymphalos as a source of water was transformed during the Roman period when the Hadrianic aqueduct to supply water for Corinth was built. The manipulation of this plentiful water supply, more specifically the spring at Driza, just to the north of Lake Stymphalos (Lolos, 1997) by Roman technology altered the very nature and meaning of water at Stymphalos. This does not mean to say that local people's engagement with the lake and surrounding springs, and the springs' associations with sanctuaries and deities necessarily changed. However, the capture of this source must have affected inputs into the lake and at least part of the hydrological system around Stymphalos. Such a structure not only creates a physical link between the source and consumer of the water (in this instance Corinth), but it also may have changed the nature of cultural and ideological links between the source area and the consuming city symbolic of the loss of autonomy of the city under Roman rule. This change in a community's or society's relationship with water would have course been true in any landscape where such a feat of hydraulic engineering had been undertaken. In Greece alone there were c. 25 aqueducts plus a dozen across the Greek islands (Lolos, 1997).

Case Study 3: Recent Terrace Loss and Erosion in SW Spain.
Observations over a number of years in the Ardales area, Malaga Province, SW Spain have revealed the consequences of land use change on the nature and pattern of soil erosion (Fig. 6a). Geologically the area is part of the Betic Cordillera which forms a spine of limestone mountains flanked by Oligocene marls and Miocene conglomerates (Fontbote, 1970). The marls form areas of undulating relief within structural basins and they vary in colours from red through pink, white grey/green to light brown. The area also exhibits incipient badland formation on the steeper slopes. The area has a typical Mediterranean climate with a pronounced summer moisture deficit of 600-800 mm yr-1 (Mairota et al., 1998). The study area is centred on a large field 10.5 ha in size comprising a large north facing slope of approximately 100 m relative relief and steeper south facing slope on which the badlands have formed (Fig. 7). The field has been ploughed out of an area of smaller fields and matorral-type vegetation and on the steep north facing slope several abandoned agricultural terraces were also ploughed out in the 1980s. This was despite a slope of over 30^{o} and was only possible due to the adoption of small caterpillar-tracked tractors. The field was monitored from 1987 to 1994 using a variety of techniques designed to indicate soil thickness and condition. These included soil bulk density, penetration resistance, electrical resistivity, field radiometry and the use of the airborne thematic mapper which is a hyper-spectral scanner mounted in a light aircraft (Brown et al., 1990). The principal laboratory analyses of the soils were the determination of organic matter using both loss on ignition and wet oxidation, and $CaCO_3$ content using a Collins Calcimeter which has a standard maximum error of 2%. The soils in the field all had low levels of organic matter ranging from 0.5% to 0.9%.

In order to get a complete view of the entire study area airborne remote sensing was used. So on 16th May 1989 the a Piper Chieften flew over the area deploying a Daedalus multi-spectral scanner. The field was partially covered by an emerging seedling crop of chick-peas and the soil was dry. The data was transferred to the Erdas image processing system, cleaned and geometrically corrected using ground control points from stereo aerial photography. Although only approximate this method did remove along-flight stretching. The removal of atmospheric effects was achieved using dark object subtraction and off-nadir view angle/path length effects were assessed by plotting the mean digital number for every 5 pixels across the flight-line and although there was some evidence of a trend it was much reduced for the longer wavelength bands. The hyperspectral scanner reflectance data was used in an attempt to estimate soil quality and depth through soil surface properties and specifically topsoil $CaCO_3$ content. On non-cultivated soils a soil truncation model developed by Brown (Brown, 1990) can be used to estimate soil depth, and on the carbonate-rich marls this can be estimated from surface carbonate content. Field studies using a Milton Multiband radiometer on two successive years had shown that the principal determinant of bare-soil variation in the field was total carbonate content. The correlation was strong and statistically significant in all bands (blue, green, red, NIR) but highest in red. A regression equation between $CaCO_3$ content (25%-70%) and red reflectance was also produced using a spectro-radiometer (SIRIS) and this was then used to generate a pattern of soil carbonate content variation across the field from the ATM data. Although the carbonate content had a clear relationship to topography estimates of soil depth using soil resistivity showed it to be only partially related to topography (Fig. 8). The confounding factor appeared to be lithological variation with a band of a band of calcareous sandstone separating clastic limestones in the west from fossiliferous limestones and further sandstone in the east. The resistivity data was inversely modelled and the model tested using coring. Where there was a sharp boundary to soil depth there was agreement with the model and where it was gradational the boundary was defined as the inflection of the resistivity curve (Payne et al., 1994). Soil depth varied from 3.3m in spurs to 0.1 m on the highest spur. Erosion modelling using a simple cost surface (D. sin θ), the Pert Amboy model, Western Colorado model and Meyer and Wischmeier models had weak statistical relationships to the resistivity model but did exhibit lowest values on the lowest slopes of the interfluves (Payne et al., 1994). The topography was also found to be closely related to seedling emergence of both chick peas in 1990 (Brown et al., 1990) and density of barley in the summer of 1992 (Payne et al., 1994).

As can be seen in Fig. 7b the hill had been converted into a single very large field sometime before the 1980s and this had removed two and maybe three small agricultural terraces on the steep south facing side of the interfluve and morphologically typical badlands had started to form at the western end of this slope. In November 1989 a major storm hit the area with rainfall intensities reaching 25 mm h^{-1} for an hour long storm (Tout, 1991) and this event caused extensive rilling and gullying over the entire area. A survey of these rills and gullies allowed estimates to be made of the event-related soil erosion rate. On the steepest south facing slope this rate was as high at 40 t ha (equivalent to 0.40 t km^{-2}). Eroded soil and even large stones from the field (some probably old terrace walling) covered the local road (Fig. 7c). However, within a few weeks this was cleared and all the slopes re-ploughed using a caterpillar tracked plough and, just as in Case Study 1, these slopes remain in arable production today despite what would appear to be an unsustainable long-term erosion rate due fundamentally to the geotechnical properties of the marl bedrock.

It is not easy to relate these modern quantitative estimates to ancient soil erosion history in southern Spain due to a lack of quantification in the archaeological studies. However, studies by Wise et al. (1982) and Gilman and Thorne (1985) showed that badlands can be of geological origin and more recent studies have shown that erosion rate can be higher on agricultural land in surrounding badlands areas (Mairota et al., 1998; Wainwright and Thornes, 2004). Longer records are possible from fluvial sediments and studies on several basins in south eastern Spain summarised by Schulte (2002) show a correlated increase in fluvial activity Early Medieval Ice advance (6th-10th centuries AD) and the Little Ice Age (15th-19th) centuries AD) and lower activity in Medieval Climatic Optimum (Medieval Warm Period). Archaeological studies on seven sites in southern Spain have shown a degree of continuity between Roman and the Islamic period irrigated agriculture including terrace systems such as those at Benialí, in the municipality of Ahín (Butzer et al., 1985).

Discussion

Evidence from chemical denudation and theoretical considerations suggest that the soil production rate is not independent of the erosion rate and there is therefore a negative feedback on soil loss, especially on soft lithologies. Soil production rates are difficult to measure directly, however, new techniques being applied to this critical zone such as grain history using OSL or burial dating using cosmogenic nuclides do offer the potential in this repect. In each of these case studies soil erosion is either socially accepted and adapted to, and/or managed by agricultural terracing and there is evidence from a few locations that this was part of a deliberate attempt to reduce erosion, maintain fertility and thicken soils. Although now largely ploughed-out, terraces in the form of lynchets were probably common in the Frome catchment in the past as they were across much of the UK (Curwen, 1939). In a study of terraces in the Cheviot Hills in Northern Britain Frodsham and Waddington (2004) have shown that some of these lynched-type terraces could be of late Neolithic or early Bronze age date.

Nearly all complex societies, and indeed many less politically complex societies such as in the American Southwest (Doolittle, 2000), used extensively, or even relied upon agricultural terracing. Within Western Europe and the Mediterranean agricultural terraces date back several thousand years and are one of the hallmarks of complex societies (Bevan, et al., 1987; Bevan and Conolly, 2011; Davidovich, et al., 2012; Walsh, 2013: Broodbank, 2013). Archaeological or historical terraces are generally of the bench (or fast) type with stone walls (Fig. 9) which require maintenance – typically 600-1200 days' work per hectare (FAO, 2013). Agricultural terraces have generally been under-researched by geomorphologists due to their scale – too small to be represented on topographic maps. However, the advent of laser altimetry (LiDAR) is now allowing rapid mapping and process modelling (Tarolli, 2014; Tarolli et al., 2014).

There has, however, been considerable experimental research on the effect of terraces on soil erosion by soil conservation services and related institutions (e.g. USDA, 1980; AAFC, 1999; FAO, 2000; FFTC, 2004; GPA, 2004) who all agree that terracing reduces runoff and soil erosion generally to very low levels if not zero (Dorren and Ray, 2012 Table 2). In many instances it is the combination of terracing and maintaining vegetation cover that reduced soil erosion and increased soil erosion after terraces abandonment in the Mediterranean area in Spain results from a reduction in vegetation cover (Inbar and Llerena, 2000). Inbar and Llerena (2000) conclude that one of the key erosion reducing activities is the maintenance of the terrace walls. Terrace abandonment has been shown to cause massive soil loss (Vogel, 1988; Cerda-Bolinches; 1994; Harden, 1996). In a study of soil erosion before and after terrace abandonment Koulouri and Giourga (2007) showed that on typical slopes (25%) soil erosion increased post abandonment due to the replacement of herbaceous ground cover by shrubs and this lead to the partial collapse of dry-stone walling. So poorly designed or maintained terraces can cause significant soil erosion whilst well designed and maintained systems reduce soil erosion rates even with high population densities (Wilkinson 1999) but are unsustainable under conditions of rural depopulation (Douglas et al. 1996). Terrace abandonment is a particular feature of islands in the Mediterranean in the 19th-20th centuries (Petanidou et al., 2008).

In a rare archaeological study of a terraced landscape at Aáin Southern Spain Butzer (1990, 2011) found no discernible soil erosion over a period of 400 years. These studies suggest terraces are both efficient and resilient during the Medieval and into the post-Medieval periods but can fail due to abandonment when under environmental or severe social stress. Other studies of small catchments that have estimated both long-term soil erosion and sediment retention have shown that colluviation (soil storage on slopes) can be beneficial rather than detrimental as it is more suited to intensive cultivation (Houben, 2012; Houben et al., 2012). This means that once constructed the life-history of terraces (*sensu* Dennell, 1982) both documents social history, in particular rural population densities, and drives soil erosion and land degradation (Blaikie and Brookfield, 1987). This is probably one of the principal causes of non-linearity in the relationship between population density and soil erosion. So the history of terraces is important in the archaeological soil erosion debate since they clearly indicate a concern at multiple levels in society to conserve soil and water in the face of a fluctuating environment, although it is not clear whether they were constructed due to high population pressure, climate change or facilitated population growth. In the other two case studies agricultural terracing had formed an important element in the management of the environment. This debate also has contemporary significance as at present they are being destroyed at a remarkable rate (FAO, 2013), form a significant element in soil security (McBratney et al., 2014) and are a vanishing part of our cultural heritage, particularly in European landscapes.

Conclusions

The Mediterranean in particular has been the scene of a polarised debate between those believing it is in essence a degraded environment, which illustrates how inappropriate and over-intensive agriculture in a climatically marginal environment is not sustainable and has led to societal collapse (Montgomery, 2007) as opposed to a view that sound ecological behaviour and transgenerational continuity has been typical of most Mediterranean complex societies (Butzer, 2005; 2011). This paper has presented both theoretical arguments and some empirical data which supports four propositions in relation to the nature and severity of human-induced erosion in the past. Firstly the simple application of soil exhaustion models is likely to be misleading on soft lithologies where soil production is a function of tillage and can be modified by agricultural terracing. Terracing, which was probably designed to maximise water retention and ease of cultivation, is an almost universal adaptation in complex agricultural systems due to its widespread utility and sustainability. However, terrace abandonment which implies a reduction of population to below the local carrying capacity (ie due to other causes) will result in terrace-wall collapse and terrace failures which are known to increase the soil erosion rate. Finally it is suggested that agricultural terraces added resilience to classical agricultural systems and could remain sustainable in agricultural systems today, given the right economic or other incentives.

Acknowledgements

The author must acknowledge the co-authors of the case studies used in this paper; Kevin Walsh, Phillip Toms, Chris Carey, Helen Schneider, Donald Payne, Ben Brock, D. M. Maju and Ted Milton. The airborn thematic mapper survey was funded by the Natural Environmental Research Council.The author would also like to thank the two referees who's comments greatly improved the paper.

References

AAFC, 1999. Terracing potato fields saves soil. Ministry of Agriculture and Agrifood Canada. [online]. URL: http://res2.agr.gc.ca/research-recherche/ann-dir/1999-2001/1x4x1_e.html

Andre, M-F. (2002) Rates of rock weathering on glacially scoured outcrops. Geogafiska Annaler 84A, 139-150.

Blaikie, P, & Brookfield, H. (1987) Land Degradation and Society. Methuen, London.

Bevan, A. & Conolly, J. (2011) Terraced fields and Mediterranean landscape structure.An analytical case study from Antikythera, Greece. Ecological Modelling 222, 1303-1314..

Bevan, A. & Conolly. J. (2011) Terraced Fields and Mediterranean Landscape Structure: An Analytical Case Study from Antikythera, Greece. Ecological Modelling 222, 1303–1314.

Broodbank, C. (2013) The Making of the Middle Sea. Thames & Hudson, London.

Brown, A. G. (1990) Soil erosion and fire in areas of Mediterranean type vegetation: results from chaparral in southern California, USA and matorral in Andalucia, southern Spain. In J. B. Thornes (Ed.) Vegetation and Erosion. Wiley, Chichester, 269 287.

Brown, A. G. (1997) Alluvial Environments: Geoarchaeology and Environmental Change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Brown, A. G. & Barber, K. E. (1985) Late Holocene palaeoecology and sedimentary history of a small lowland catchment in Central England. Quaternary Research, 24, 87-102.

Brown, A. G., Dinnin, M. & Carey, C. (2011) The geoarchaeology of the Frome valley: a preliminary study. In The Frome valley, Herefordshire: Archaeology, Landscape Change and Conservation. P. White and Ray(Ed.) Herefordshire Studies in Archaeology, Series 3, Hereford Archaeology, 62-78.

Brown, A. G., Dinnin, M. & Carey, C. 2011. The geoarchaeology of the Frome valley: a preliminary study. In The Frome valley, Herefordshire: Archaeology, Landscape Change and Conservation. P. White (Ed.) Herefordshire Studies in Archaeology, Series 3, Hereford Archaeology, 62-78.

Brown, A G, Schneider, H, Rice & Milton, E J. (1990) Remote sensing soil erosion: airborne thematic mapper data on soil variation in Mediterranean arable land in Southern Spain. In Procs. of the NERC Symposium on Airborne Remote Sensing 1990, British Geological Survey, Keyworth, Nottingham, 7-18.

Brown, A. G., Toms, P, Carey, C. & Rhodes, E. (2013) Geomorphology of the Anthropocene: time-trangressive discontinuities of human-induced alluviation. The Anthropocene, 1, 3-13.

Butzer, K. W. (1990) The realm of cultural-human ecology. Adaptation and change in historical perspective. In Turner et al. (EDS.) The Earth As Transformed by Human Actions. Cambridge University Ress, New York, 658-701.

Butzer, K. W. (2005) Environmental history in the Mediterranean world: cross - disciplinary investigation of cause - and - effect for degradation and soil erosion. Journal of Archaeological Science 32, 1773-1800.

Butzer, K. W. (2011). Geoarchaeology, Climate Change, Sustainability. In Brown, A. G., Basell L. S. and Butzer, K. W. (Eds.) 2011. Geoarchaeology, Climate Change and Sustainability. Geological Society of America Special Publication 476, 1-14.

Butzer, K.W., Juan F. Mateu, J.F, Butzer, E. k and Kraus, P. (1985) Irrigation Agrosystems in Eastern Spain: Roman or Islamic Origins. Annals of the Association of American Geographers 75, 479- 509.

Carson. M. A, & Kirkby, M. J. (1972) Hillslope Form and Process. Cambridge University Press, London.

Cerda-Bolinches, A. (1994) The response of abandoned terraces to simulated rain. In: Conserving soil resources – European perspectives. R.J. Rickson (ed.). CAB International, Cambridge, UK, 44-55.

Chartin, C. Bourennane, H., Salvador-Blanes, S., Hinschberger, F. & Macabre, J. J.A (2011) Classification and mapping of anthropogenic landforms on cultivated hillslopes using DEMs and soil thickness data - Example from the SW Parisian Basin, France. *Geomorphology* 135, 8-20.

Chew, W. R. (2001) World Ecological Degradation: Accumulation, Urbanization and Deforestation. 3000 B.C. – A.D. 2000. Alta Mira, Walnut Creek, California.

Chow, T.L., Rees, H.W. & Daigle, J.L., (1999) Effectiveness of terraces grassed waterway systems for soil and water conservation: a field evaluation. Journal of Soil and Water Conservation 54, 577-583.

Clendenon, C. (2010) Ancient Greek geographer Pausanias as a qualitative karst hydrogeologist. Ground Water 48, 465-470.

Cox, N. J. (1980) On the relationship between bedrock lowering and regolith thickness. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms, 5, 271-274.

Curwen, E. C. (1939) The Plough and the Origin of Strip-Lynchets. Antiquity 13, 45-52.

Dale, T. & Carter, V. G. 1955. Topsoil and Civilization. University of Oklahoma Press, Norman Oklahoma.

Davidovich, U., Porat, N., Gadot, Y., Avni, Y. & Lipschits, O. (2012) Archaeological investigations and OSL dating of terraces at Ramat Rahel, Israel. Journal of Field Archaeology 37, 192-208.

Dennell, RW. (1982) In Spooner, B. and Man, H.S. (Eds.) Desertification and Development: Dryland Ecology in Social Perspective. Academic Press, London, 171-200.

Diamond, J. (2005) Collapse: How Societies Choose to Fail or Succeed. Viking Press.

Doolittle, W. (2000) Cultivated Landscapes of Native North America. Oxford university Press, Oxford.

Dorren L. and Rey, F. (2012 A review of the effect of terracing on erosion. Soil Conservation and Protection for Europe (SCAPE), 97-108.

Douglas, T., Critchley, D. & Park., G. (1996) The deintensification of terraced agricultural land near Trevelez, Sierra Nevada, Spain. Global Ecology and Biogeography Letters 5, 258-270

FAO (2000) Manual on integrated soil management and conservation practices. FAO Land and Water Bulletin 8, Rome, Italy: 230 pp.

FAO (2013) FAO 2013//www.fao.org/docrep/t1765e/t1765e06. Htm

FFTC (2004) Soil conservation practices for slopelands. Food and Fertilizer Technology Center. [online]. URL: http://www.agnet.org/library/abstract/ pt2001024.html

Fontbote, J. M. et al. (1970) Mapa Geológico de España 1:200,000 82-Morón de la Fronterer – Síntesis de la Cartografia existente. IGME, Madrid.

Frodsham P, Waddington C 2004 In Archaeology in Northumberland National Park. Council for British Archaeology, York.

Gilman, A. and Thornes, J.B. 1985: Land use and prehistory in south east Spain. London: George Allen and Unwin.

GPA (2004) Sediment mobilization, upstream erosion and agriculture. Global Programme of Action for the Protection of the Marine Environment from Land-based Activities [online] URL: http://www.fao.org/gpa/sediments/coastero.htm

Harden, C.P. (1996) Interrelationships between land abandonment and land degradation: A case from the Ecuadorian Andes. Mountain Research and Development 16, 274-280.

Hatch, T. (1981) Preliminary results of soil erosion and conservation trials under pepper (*Piper nigrum*) in Sarawak, Malaysia. In: Soil Conservation: Problems and Prospects. R.P.C. Morgan (ed.). John Wiley, Chichester, UK: 255-262.

Heimsath, A.M., Dietrich, W. E., Nishiizumi, K. & Finkel, R. C. (1997) The soil production function and landscape equilibrium. Nature, 388, 358-361.

Heimsath, A.M., Chappell, J., Dietrich, W. E., Nishiizumi, K. & Finkel, R. C. (2000) Soil production on a retreating escarpment in southeastern Australia. Geology 28, 787–790.

Heymann, C., Nelle, O., Dörfler, W., Zagana, H., Nowaczyk, N., Xue, J., et al. (2013). Late Glacial to mid-Holocene palaeoclimate development of Southern Greece inferred from the sediment sequence of Lake Stymphalia (NE-Peloponnese). Quaternary International, 302, 42-60.

Houben P (2012) Sediment budget for five millennia of tillage in the Rockenberg catchment (Wetterau loess basin, Germany). Quaternary Science Reviews 52: 12–23.

Houben, P., Schmidt, M., Mauz, B., Stobbe, A. & Lang, A. (2012) Asynchronous Holocene colluvial and alluvial aggradation: A matter of hydrosedimentary connectivity. The Holocene 23, 544–555.

Hoverd, T. & Roseff, R. (1999) The Vann, Avenbury: an earthwork survey. Herefordshire Archaeological Reports No. 6, Herefordshire Archaeology, Hereford.

Hunt, T. L. (2007) Rethinking Easter Island's ecological catastrophe. Journal of Archaeological Science 34, 485-502.

IAPAR, 1984. IAPAR (Fundação Instituto Agronômico do Paraná) 10 anos de pesquisa: relatório técnico 1972-1982. Londrina, PR, Relatório Técnico: 233 pp.

Inbar, M. & Llerena, C.A. (2000) Erosion processes in high mountain agricultural terraces in Peru. Mountain Research and Development 20, 72-79.

Johnson, M.O., Gloor, M., Kirkby, M. J. & Lloyd, J. (2014) Insights into biogeochemical cycling from a soil evolution model and long-term chronosequences. *Biogeosciences* 11, 6873-6894.

Koulouri, M. & Giourga, Chr. (2007) Land abandonment and slope gradient as key factors in soil erosion in Mediterranean terraced lands. Catena 69, 274-281.

Larsen, I. J., Almond, P. C., Eger, A., Stone, J. O., Montgomery, D. R. & Malcolm, B. (2014) Rapid Soil Production and Weathering in the Southern Alps, New Zealand. Science 343, 637-640.

Lewis, H. (2012). *Investigating Ancient Tillage. An Experimental and Soil Micromorphological Study.* British Archaeological Reports International Series 2388, Oxbow Books, Oxford.

Lolos, Y. (1997) The Hadrianic aquaduct of Corinth (with an Appendix on the Roman aquaducts in Greece). Hessperia 1997, 271-314.

Mairota, P., Thornes, J. B. and Geeson, N. (1998). Atlas of Mediterranean Environments in Europe. Wiley, Chichester.

Mangalassery, S., Sjögersten, S., Sparkes, D. L., Sturrock, C. J., Craigon, J. & Mooney, S. J. (2013) To what extent can zero tillage lead to a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions from temperate soils? Scientific Reports, 4, 4586, 1-8.

Mann, D., Chase, J., Edwards, J., Beck, R., Reanier, R. & Mass, M. (2003) Prehistoric destruction of the primeval soils and vegetation of Rapa Nui (Isla de Pascua, Easter Island). In: Loret, J., Tanacredi, J.T. (Eds.), Easter Island: Scientific Exploration in the World's Environmental Problems in Microcosm. Kluwer Academic/Plenum, New York, pp. 133e153.

McAnany, P. A. and Yoffee, N. (2010) Questioning Collapse. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

McBratney, A., Fielda, D. F. & Koch, A. (2014) The dimensions of soil security. Geoderma 213, 203-213.

Mizuyama, T., Uchida, T. & Kimoto, A. (1999) Effect of hillside works on granite slopes; terracing and planting. In: Ground and water bioengineering for erosion control and slope stabilization. IECA, manila, The Philippines: 190-196.

Monastersky, R. 2015. Anthropocene: The human age. *Nature* 519, 144-147.

Montgomery, D. R. (2007a) Dirt: The Erosion of Civilisations. University of California Press.

Montgomery, D. R. (2007b) Soil erosion and agricultural sustainability. Proceedings of the national Academy of Science, 104, 13268–13272.

Papastergiadou, E. S., Retalus, A., Kalliris, P. & Georgiadis, Th (2007) Land use changes and associated environmental impacts on the Mediterranean shallow Lake Stymfalia, Greece. Hydrobiologia 584, 361-370.

Payne, D., Brown, A. G. & Brock, B. (1994) Factors effecting remotely sensed soil variation and near-harvest crop variation near Antequera, Southern Spain. In Proceedings of the NERC Symposium on Airborne Remote Sensing 1993. University of Dundee 20-21st December, NERC.

Rose, E. (1996) *Land Husbandry – Components and Strategy*. Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations, Rome.

Theodora Petanidou, T., Kizos, T. & Soulakellis, N. (2008) Socioeconomic Dimensions of Changes in the Agricultural Landscape of the Mediterranean Basin: A Case Study of the Abandonment of Cultivation Terraces on Nisyros Island, Greece. Environmental Management 41, 250–266.

Schama, S. (1995) Landscape and Memory. Fontana Press, London.

Scholes, M. C. & Scholes, R. J. (2013) Dust unto dust. Science 342, 565-566.

Schuman, G.E., Spurner, R.G. & Piest, R.F. (1973) Phosphorus losses from four agricultural watersheds on Missouri Valley loess. Soil Science Society of America Proceedings 37, 424-427.

Shotton, F.W. (1978) Archaeological inferences from the study of alluvium in the lower Severn-Avon valleys. In: Limbrey, S., Evans, J.G. (Eds.), The Effect of Man on the Landscape: The Lowland Zone, 27–32. CBA Research Report 21. Council for British Archaeology, London.

SIMMs, M. (2004) Tortoises and hares: Dissolution, erosion and isostasy in landscape evolution. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms. 29, 477-494.

Small, E. E., Anderson, R. S., Hancock, G. S. & Finkel, R. C. (1999) Estimates of regolith production from 10Be and 26Al: Evidence for steady state alpine hillslopes. Geomorphology, 27, 131–150.

Tainter, J. (2006) Archaeology of overshoot and collapse. Annual Review of Anthropology 35, 59-74.

Tarolli, P. (2014) High-resolution topography for understanding Earth surface processes: opportunities and challenges. Geomorphology 216, 295–312.

Tarolli, P., Preti, F. & Romano, N. (2014) Terraced landscapes: From an old best practice to a potential hazard for soil degradation due to land abandonment. Anthropocene 6, 40-25.

Tout, D. G. (1991) A very wet autumn-early winter in southern Spain in 1989. Weather 46, 11-15.

Irena Tsermegas, I., Dłużewski, M. & Biejat, K. (2011) Function of agricultural terraces in Mediterranean conditions – selected examples from the island of Ikaria (the southern Sporades, Greece). Geographica Miscellanea 15, 65-78.

USDA Soil Conservation Service (1980) Save Soil with Terraces. Des Moines.

Vogel H. (1988) Deterioration of a mountainous agro-ecosystem in the Third World due to emigration of rural labour. Mountain Research and Development 8, 321–329.

Walsh, K., Brown, A. G., Gourley, B. & Scaife, R. In Press. Archaeology, Hydrogeology and Geomythology in the Stymphalos Valley. Journal of Archaeological Science Reports,

Walling, D. E., Collins, A. L. & Stroud, R. W. (2008) Tracing suspended sediment and particulate phosphorus sources in catchments. Journal of Hydrology, 350, 274-289.

Walsh, K. (2013) Mediterranean Landscape Archaeology. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Wilkinson, M. T., Chappell, J., Humphreys, G. S., Fifield, K., Smith, B. & Hesse, P. (2005) Soil production in heath and forest, Blue Mountains, Australia: influence of lithology and palaeoclimate. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms, 30, 923–934.

Wise, S., Thornes, J.B. and Gilman, A. 1982: How old are the badlands? A case study from south-east Spain. In Yair, A. and Bryan, R., editors, Badland geomorphology and piping, Norwich: Geo Books, 29-56.

White, P. And Ray, K (2011). The Frome valley, Herefordshire: Archaeology, Landscape Change and Conservation. Herefordshire Studies in Archaeology, Series 3. Herefordshire County Council, Hereford. 204p.

Figure and Table Captions

Fig. 1 (a). Plot of erosion rates from Montgomery (2007b). (b) Physical vs chemical denudation rate from Larsen et al (2014).

Fig. 2. G2 Erosion model for Crete from the European Soil Portal. ©European Union, 1995-2015.

Fig. 3. Map of the Frome catchment UK (a) topography, (b) soils.

Fig. 4. Sedimentary data from the Frome catchment. (a) stratigraphic long section of the valley with radiocarbon and OSL dates and inset of GPR cross-section at Stratton Grandison, (b) estimated minimum erosion rates from the River Frome, West Midlands, UK derived from ^{14}C and OSL dates cross-sections and the catchment area of each cross-section.

Fig. 5. The Stymphalos polje with the alluvial fans, springs, core locations (a), and the location of the Bouzi terrace system (b)

Fig. 6. Location maps and soil erosion data from the Ardales soil erosion study area after the November 1989 event.

Fig. 7 Photos of the Ardales soil erosion study Area after the major event in November 1989, (a) north facing slope having been ploughed, (b) the south facing slope adjacent to the incipent badland formation with old terraces indicated by broken white lines, (c) rilling and soil slipping on the north facing slope, (d) the public road at the base of the north facing slope after the 1989 event. See text for discussion of this map.

Fig. 8. A false colour map of estimated soil calcium carbonate values over the Ardales soil erosion study area derived from a transformation of multispectral scanner data flown on 15th of May 1989.

Fig. 9. Agricultural terraces (A) terrace terminology, (B) Inca terraces adapted from The Cusichaca Trust, (c) Levant terracing types from Davidovich et al. (2012), (d) terrace with soil formation and bedrock weathering zones.

Table Captions

Table 1. Population and land values for parishes in the Frome Valley in the mid 19th century. Data from The Frome Valley Project. Data extracted by B.E.Haner.

Table 2. Estimates of soil erosion reduction resultant upon agricultural terracing.

.

Parish	**Pop. In 1861**	**Peak pop. (date)**	**Parish acreage**	**Rateable value in 1861 £**	**Pop. Density in 1861 persons km^2**
Ashperton	534	(1861)	1715	2839	76.9
Avenbury	371	391 (4871)	3048	3982 (4871)	30.0
Bishops Frome	50	(1891)	3950	905	3.1
Bredenbury	52	119 (1901)	555	1023(1881)	23.2
Canons Frome	115	254 (1911)	1005	1504	28.3
Edwin Ralph	165	163 (1881)	1590	1695	25.6
Linton	547	616 (1881)	2430	3759	18.1
Much Cowerne	563	(1861)	3535	5214	39.3
Norton	623	(1861)	1708	4407	90.1
Stanford Bishop	234	235 (1851)	1471	1829	39.3
Thornbury	224	241 (1871)	2130	2426	26.0
Wacton	123	129 (1851)	1002	976 (1881)	30.3
Winslow	440	491 (1851)	3106	4337	34.9

Table 2

Location	**Practices, slope & other measures**	**Erosion reduction**	**Reference**
Paraná		Approx.. 50%	IAPAR, 1984
	Also grassed waterways & contour ploughing	Over 95% (20 tons ha to under 1 tons ha)	Chow et al. (1999)
Malaysia	35^o, peppers	96% (63 t ha yr^{-1} to 1.4 t ha yr^{-1})	Hatch (1981)
Missouri river valley, USA	Contour ploughing	800% reduction	Schuman et al. (1973)
W Japan	Tree planting	Continuous fall for 35 years	Mizuyama et al. (1999)

Table 1. Estimates of soil erosion reduction resultant upon agricultural terracing.