**Title:** Exploring the art of ciliary beating: the benefits of high-speed video analysis

**Jane S Lucas** jlucas1@soton.ac.uk [1] Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia Centre, NIHR Biomedical Research Centre, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK [2]University of Southampton Faculty of Medicine, Academic Unit of Clinical and Experimental Medicine, Southampton, UK

**Hazel J Evans** Hazel.Evans@uhs.nhs.uk Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia Centre, NIHR Biomedical Research Centre, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK

**Eric G Haarman** EG.Haarman@vumc.nl Dept of Pediatric Pulmonology, VU University Medical Center, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

**Robert A Hirst** rah9@leicester.ac.uk Centre for PCD Diagnosis and Research, Department of Infection, Immunity and Inflammation, University of Leicester, Robert Kilpatrick Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, Leicester, UK

**Claire Hogg** C.Hogg@rbht.nhs.uk Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia Centre, Departments of Paediatrics and Paediatric Respiratory Medicine, Imperial College and Royal Brompton Hospital, London UK

**Claire L Jackson** clj@soton.ac.uk [1] Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia Centre, NIHR Biomedical Research Centre, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK [2]University of Southampton Faculty of Medicine, Academic Unit of Clinical and Experimental Medicine, Southampton, UK

**Kim G Nielsen** kgn@dadlnet.dk Danish PCD & chILD Centre, CF Centre Copenhagen Paediatric Pulmonary Service, ERN Accredited for PCD and CF Health Care, Department of Paediatrics and Adolescent Medicine, Copenhagen University Hospital, Rigshospitalet, Denmark

**Heymut Omran** Heymut.Omran@ukmuenster.de Department of Pediatrics, University Hospital Muenster, Muenster Germany

**Jean Francois Papon** jean-francois.papon@aphp.fr APHP, Bicetre University Hospital, ENT department, Universite Paris-Sud, Faculté de Médecine, Paris, France

**Phil Robinson:** Phil.Robinson@rch.org.au PCD service, Department of Respiratory and Sleep Medicine, Royal Children’s Hospital, Melbourne, Australia.

**Amelia Shoemark** a.shoemark@dundee.ac.uk **[1]** Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia Centre, Departments of Paediatrics and Paediatric Respiratory Medicine, Imperial College and Royal Brompton Hospital, London UK [2] School of Medicine, University of Dundee, Dundee, UK

**Woolf T Walker,** Woolf.Walker@uhs.nhs.uk [1] Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia Centre, NIHR Biomedical Research Centre, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK [2]University of Southampton Faculty of Medicine, Academic Unit of Clinical and Experimental Medicine, Southampton, UK

**Correspondence:** Jane Lucas, Southampton University Hospital, Mailpoint 803 F level, Tremona Road, Southampton, SO16 6YD, UK. E-mail: jlucas1@soton.ac.uk

**Acknowledgements:** The following were members of the ERS Task Force for a Diagnostic Guideline for PCD: JSL, RAH, CH, KGN, HO, J-FP, AS, WW; all authors are members of BEAT-PCD (COST Action BM1407)

**Conflict of interest:** No author declared a conflict of interest

We enjoyed reading Kempeneers *et al’s* study whichinvestigated the variability of ciliary beat pattern (CBP) in nasal epithelium from healthy volunteers [1]. We routinely use high speed video (HSV) analysis to assess ciliary motility, and fully agree that areas of abnormal CBP occur in healthy individuals. This is a well-known observation in the primary ciliary dyskinesia (PCD) diagnostic field with secondary dyskinesia caused by infections, inflammation or by the trauma of sampling. We note that the authors found the majority of epithelial edges exhibited uniform normal CBP and only 1% exhibited uniform stiff cilia or 1% asynchronous cilia [1]. In our collective experience of patients with respiratory symptoms referred for diagnostic testing for PCD, secondary dyskinesia is considerably more common. The evidence-based European Respiratory Society (ERS) Guidelines therefore recommend reanalysis of CBP following cell culture in an attempt to mitigate secondary defects, and reduce the need for repeat brushings [2,3]. Kempeneers *et al* have confirmed our experience that ‘normal HSV’ does not require every strip of epithelium to exhibit normal CBP; the vast majority of cilia should beat normally and we would expect to see effective particle clearance.

The ERS Guidelines [2], North American PCD Research Consortium [4] and ERN-LUNG [5] recommend that HSV analyses should be conducted in centres with a high referral rate, by experts with extensive experience of normal and abnormal beating; there is an art to interpreting the science. Ideally centres should combine complementary tests: nasal nitric oxide (nNO), HSV, transmission electron microscopy (TEM), genotyping and possibly immunofluorescence labelling [2]. “Hallmark” CBP abnormalities of PCD (e.g. immotile, hyperkinetic or circular) correspond to genotype and are uniform in most patients with PCD; HSV is therefore extremely helpful for supporting the diagnosis [2]. HSV is the most sensitive test in the diagnostic algorithm and is invaluable in driving the pursuit of a diagnosis in difficult cases, such as normal TEM and genotype (16% and 35% of cases) [2]. If HSV and nNO are normal, the diagnosis is considered very unlikely. However some patients have subtle abnormalities of CBP and, even in the hands of experts, HSV interpretation can be difficult. Discussion of ‘difficult’ cases between centres is now a feature of the UK Diagnostic Centres and of the BEAT-PCD network ([www.beatpcd.org](http://www.beatpcd.org)), and will become an option with the ERN-LUNG (<http://ec.europa.eu/health/ern/policy_en>).

As highlighted by the ERS Guidelines and by the editorial [4] accompanying Kempeneers’ manuscript there is the need for standardization of methodology and reporting of HSV, alongside a need to evaluate the accuracy of HSV to differentiate individuals with and without PCD.

1. Kempeneers C, Seaton C, Chilvers MA. Variation of Ciliary Beat Pattern in Three Different Beating Planes in Healthy Subjects. Chest. 2017 May;151(5):993-1001.
2. Lucas JS, Barbato A, Collins SA, et al European Respiratory Society guidelines for the diagnosis of primary ciliary dyskinesia. Eur Respir J. 2017 Jan 4;49(1).
3. Hirst RA, Jackson CL, Coles JL, et al. Culture of primary ciliary dyskinesia epithelial cells at air-liquid interface can alter ciliary phenotype but remains a robust and informative diagnostic aid. PLoS One. 2014 Feb 25;9(2):e89675.
4. Leigh MW, Knowles MR. Assessment of Ciliary Beat Pattern: Variability in Healthy Control Subjects Has Implications for Use as Test for Primary Ciliary Dyskinesia. Chest. 2017 May;151(5):958-959.
5. Humbert M, Wagner TO. Rare respiratory diseases are ready for primetime: from Rare Disease Day to the European Reference Networks. Eur Respir J. 2017 Feb23;49(2)