**Defining causality in COVID-19 and neurological disorders**

Ellul M1,2, Varatharaj A3,4, Nicholson T5, Pollack T5, Zandi MS6, Manji H6, Solomon T1,2,7,

Carson A8, Turner MR9, Kneen R1,10 Galea I3,4, Pett S11, Thomas RH12,13, \*Michael BD1,2,7

1. The Institute for Infection and Global Health, University of Liverpool, UK

2. The Walton Centre NHS Foundation Trust, Liverpool, UK

3. Clinical Neurosciences, Clinical and Experimental Sciences, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

4. Wessex Neurosciences Centre, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, Southampton, UK

5. Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology, and Neuroscience, Kings College London, UK

6. National Hospital for Neurology and Neurosurgery and UCL Queen Square Institute of Neurology, London, UK.

7. The NIHR Health Protection Research Unit for Emerging and Zoonotic Infection, Liverpool, UK

8. Centre for Clinical Brain Sciences, University of Edinburgh, UK

9. Nuffield Department of Clinical Neurosciences, University of Oxford, UK

10. Alder Hey Children’s NHS Foundation Trust, Liverpool, UK11. Institute for Global Health and Institute for Clinical Trials Methodology, University College London, UK

12. Translational and Clinical Research Institute, University of Newcastle, UK

13. Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle, UK

\*Corresponding Author: Benedict.Michael@liv.ac.uk

**When faced with acute neurological presentations in a patient with COVID-19, how**

**confident can one be that SARS-CoV2 is causal?**

**Introduction**

Clinicians are increasingly recognising neurological presentations occur in some patients (1). A case series from Wuhan described associated neurological syndromes (e.g. ‘dizziness’ and ‘impaired consciousness’), but with little detail regarding symptomatology, and CSF and neuroimaging findings (2). The extent to which these disorders were caused by the virus per se, rather than being complications of critical illness, unmasking of degenerative disease, or iatrogenic effects of repurposed medications is not clear.

Numerous case reports have since emerged and, at the time of writing, published cases include encephalopathy (3), encephalitis (4), Guillain-Barré syndrome (GBS) (5) and stroke (6). In all of these cases the virus has been identified in respiratory samples, and in a small number in CSF. So far, the reporting of clinical features has been extremely variable, for example several cases have claimed to report encephalitis without clear evidence of CNS inflammation, which would not meet established definitions of the disease (7).

Whether SARS-CoV2 is associated with neurological manifestations is of critical importance as they may result in substantial morbidity and mortality.

**Defining causality**

It is crucial that neurologists and neuropsychiatrists apply a systematic strategy to determine whether there is evidence that SARS-CoV2 is causing these manifestations, whether they are a consequence of severe systemic disease alone, or simply coincidence. In 1965 Hill proposed criteria on which to build an argument for disease causation, which can be applied to COVID-19 (8).

What is the **strength** of the association? So far it appears fairly weak. >2.5 million people have been infected with SARS-CoV2 and to date (to the authors’ knowledge) there have been only 93 published cases of neurological manifestations (about 5/100,000). However, reported cases are an underestimate of the real incidence, and this underscores the need for proper epidemiological study.

What is the **consistency** of the association? So far there have been published reports of neurological manifestations across the globe, including from China, Japan, Italy, France, the USA, and the UK. Although the numbers are low, these are not isolated incidences and have occurred throughout the evolution of the pandemic.

To what extent is the relationship **specific**? The range of neurological manifestations reported in association with SARS-CoV2 is wide, from the CNS through to peripheral nerves.

However, in previous pandemics similar central and peripheral associations have been well recognised (9).

What can **temporality** tell us about the association? The delay between infection and the neurological presentation may give a clue to mechanisms. Direct CNS infection might be expected to be contemporaneous with, or shortly after, fever and respiratory symptoms. Para- infectious disease, owing to innate immune responses, such as acute necrotising encephalopathy, usually occurs in the days following infection. Post-infectious syndromes, due to adaptive immune responses, such as GBS, are typically in the few weeks following infection. In most reported cases, respiratory disease has occurred a few days prior to the

onset of the neurological syndrome. Although significant delays between a neurological presentation and COVID-19 diagnosis in some raise the possibility of nosocomial infection.

Hill asks us to look for a **biological gradient**. In general those with neurological

manifestations have had severe COVID-19 respiratory disease suggesting the possibility that higher viral loads and/or more fulminant inflammatory responses may be accountable for both.

Is there **biological plausibility**? Many human viruses can enter the CNS and some

coronaviruses exhibit neurotropism in animal models (10). The syndromes described so far could plausibly be related to primary infection with SARS-CoV2, although improved understanding of host responses is needed.

Hill asks us to consider the **coherence** of the evidence. Perhaps our best sources of coherent data are the SARS and MERS epidemics: coronaviruses with about 80% and 50% homology to SARS-CoV2 respectively. Neurological syndromes were reported in association with both, including acute disseminated encephalomyelitis-like presentations with MERS and encephalopathy/encephalitis with SARS (11).

Is there any possibility of **experimental evidence**? The ideal investigational vehicle would be a case control study, but this presents design challenges as exposure is high and we do not yet have validated antibody testing to ascertain seroprevalence.

Can we learn by **analogy** with other similar scenarios? Other respiratory viruses, most notably influenza, are well established triggers of CNS damage. During the H1N1 pandemic, neurological syndromes were well described, including acute necrotising encephalopathy bearing striking resemblance to the case recently described with COVID-19 (9). So, the emergence of neurological disorders associated with pandemic viral infections is less the exception, more the norm.

**Conclusions**

As always, our evidence must be founded on clear and systematic assessment of the clinical syndromes, supported by well-designed laboratory studies. Cases must be reported in line with clear clinical case definitions, both systematically and transparently, and with honesty about negative or missing results.

These aims are best served by standardisation and centralisation of case reporting, which calls for a truly collaborative approach between neurologists, neuropsychiatrists and allied colleagues.

To address this we have established the CoroNerve Studies Group as a collaboration between professional bodies in the UK ([www.CoroNerve.com](http://www.CoroNerve.com)), and similar studies are underway in other countries. However, a joined-up international approach is necessary. To begin this process, a complimentary initiative, the COVID-Neuro Network, through Brain Infections Global, is supporting collaboration among several lower and middle-income countries.

We all must learn the lessons from previous pandemics, and the principles of Bradford Hill if we are to translate these rapidly growing datasets into meaningful advances in our understanding of the neurological complications of COVID-19.

**Acknowledgements**

CoroNerve Study Management Group: Mark Ellul, Ian Galea, Rachel Kneen, Benedict Michael, Sarah Pett, Naomi Thomas, Rhys Thomas, Ara Varantharaj.

CoroNerve Steering Committee: Laura Benjamin, Jonathan Coles, Nicholas WS Davies, Ava Easton, Hadi Manji, Craig Smith, Tom Solomon, Michael Zandi.

Collaborating Organisations:

RCPsych- A Carson, A David, M Dilley, E Joyce, T Nicholson, T Pollak, V Voon

ABN- M Turner

BPNA- R Chin

BASP- R Al-Shahi Salman, C Smith

NACCS- J Coles, D Menon

ISARIC- C Semple

**References**

1. Liu K, Pan M, Xiao Z, Xu X. Neurological manifestations of the coronavirus (SARS-CoV- 2) pandemic 2019–2020. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 2020; ahead of print: doi:10.1136/jnnp-2020-323177

2. Mao L, Jin H, Wang M, Hu Y, Chen S, He Q, et al. Neurologic Manifestations of Hospitalized Patients With Coronavirus Disease 2019 in Wuhan, China. JAMA neurology 2020; doi:10.1001/jamaneurol.2020.1127

3. Poyiadji N, Shahin G, Noujaim D, Stone M, Patel S, Griffith B. COVID-19-associated Acute Hemorrhagic Necrotizing Encephalopathy: CT and MRI Features. Radiology 2020; 201187.

4. Ye M, Ren Y, Lv T. Encephalitis as a clinical manifestation of COVID-19. Brain Behav Immun 2020; doi: 10.1016/j.bbi.2020.04.017

5. Zhao H, Shen D, Zhou H, Liu J, Chen S. Guillain-Barre syndrome associated with SARS- CoV-2 infection: causality or coincidence? The Lancet Neurology 2020; 19: 383-4

6. Beyrouti R, Adams ME, Benjamin L, Cohen H, Farmer SF, et al. Characteristics of ischaemic stroke associated with COVID-19. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 2020; doi:10.1136/jnnp-2020-323586

7. Solomon T, Michael BD, Smith PE, Sanderson F, Davies NW, Hart IJ, et al. Management of suspected viral encephalitis in adults--Association of British Neurologists and British Infection Association National Guidelines. The Journal of infection 2011; 64:347-73.

8. Hill AB. The Environment and Disease: Association or Causation? Proc R Soc Med 1965; 58:295-300.

9. Goenka A, Michael BD, Ledger E, Hart IJ, Absoud M, Chow G, et al. Neurological manifestations of influenza infection in children and adults: results of a National British Surveillance Study. Clin Infect Dis 2014;58:775-84.

10. Netland J, Meyerholz DK, Moore S, Cassell M, Perlman S. Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus Infection Causes Neuronal Death in the Absence of Encephalitis in Mice Transgenic for Human ACE2. J Virol 2008; 82:7264-75.

11. Arabi YM, Harthi A, Hussein J, Bouchama A, Johani S, Hajeer AH, et al. Severe neurologic syndrome associated with Middle East respiratory syndrome corona virus (MERS-CoV). Infection 2015; 43:495-501.