‘Immigrant Gifts’: Alphonso Trumpbour Clearwater, Colonial Silver and the Limits of ‘Americanization’, 1906-1933

Jonathan Conlin

Abstract

The Clearwater Bequest of 1933 is a landmark in the development of the Metropolitan Museum of Art's holdings of American silver, and in the American Colonial Revival more broadly. Alphonso Trumpbour Clearwater (1848-1933) was a judge, antiquary and pillar of society in Kingston, New York. Drawing on the Clearwater papers at the Winterthur Museum as well as his correspondence with curators at the Metropolitan Museum of Art and other museums, this essay considers the origin of Clearwater's collecting of late-17th- and 18th-century silver in late nineteenth-century fairs; his evolving taste and relations with dealers, curators and rival collectors in the decades either side of the opening of the Metropolitan's American Wing (1924); as well as how his views on what kind of silver ‘belonged’ in his collection interacted with his views on what kind of people did and did not ‘belong’ in the United States.

Article

The silver collector Alphonso Trumpbour Clearwater died almost a century ago, but mention of his name in Kingston, New York, still has older residents counting their spoons. Shortly after Clearwater’s death in 1933, a former partner in his legal practice, Gilbert Hasbrouck, noted that he had ‘long witnessed [Clearwater's] over-lordship and his extreme acquisitiveness where there was a piece of old silver with which he might connect his name.’[1] Clearwater himself recognized ‘that irresistible and ruinous impulse which like the road to Sheol, leads a collector to perdition by imperceptible but steady gradation.’[2]

Clearwater was a generous lender of silver spoons, porringers (a type of shallow bowl), teapots, nutmeg graters and tankards to the Museum of Fine Arts (MFA) in Boston, the Albany Institute of History and Art (AIHA), and above all the Metropolitan Museum of Art. His bequest to the Met of 653 pieces made him ‘the Museum's preeminent American

silver benefactor'.[3] For Elizabeth Stillinger, the only scholar to have given Clearwater much attention, he was a 'transitional figure in the history of collecting American antiques': 'a bridge between two centuries and two orientations', between an eye for 'associations and symbolism' and an eye for beauty.[4]

Known universally as 'Judge Clearwater,' after serving eight years as Ulster County Court judge, Clearwater was urged repeatedly, albeit unsuccessfully, to stand for Congress.[5] Alongside his service on the bench and the New York State Bar Association, Clearwater also served as Ulster county's unofficial historian; though the title of 'remembrancer' would be more in keeping with his fondness for archaic language that had fallen into desuetude. While they tell us little of his life and career beyond the collecting of silver, the Clearwater Papers at Winterthur Museum, Garden and Library in Delaware, as well as letters from the Met and AIHA archives, indicate a sharply-defined, somewhat stylized persona: formal, yet rarely pompous, with occasional flashes of self-deprecating humour. Alongside quotes from Virgil and obscure Biblical references ('Sheol' is the Hebrew underworld, a term even fellow Christians might not have known), he was preternaturally fond of the word 'peradventure'. August Franzen's portrait [Fig. 1] therefore comes as something of a surprise. Although the Vandyke beard points to his ancestry, this appears to be a gentleman in something of a hurry, on the verge of donning his battered hat and rushing off.

'I am Dutch and Huguenot,' Clearwater declared to one Met curator, firmly identifying himself as a Knickerbocker, as in a descendant of the Dutch settlers who had built New Amsterdam, the city later known as New York. He claimed to be descended from Theunis Jacobsen Klaarwater (c. 1636-1715), born in Rotterdam, who settled in Kingston (New York) in the late seventeenth century, not long after the settlement was founded in 1652. Clearwater was very active in fraternal societies that celebrated the Knickerbocker contribution to United States history and national life.[6] Religious toleration formed part of that contribution.[7] Clearwater served as President of the St Nicholas Society of the City of New York, founded in 1835 with the aim of 'preserving New York's Dutch heritage, honoring distinguished individuals, and enjoying good fellowship.' He was equally active in Huguenot societies, and fascinated by genealogy.

When it came to silver, too, provenance was important: although he decided early on to specialize in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century American silver, Clearwater was ready to make an exception if a piece had been owned by a notable Dutch or English settler.

Though it was important for pieces to be in good condition and regularly polished, Clearwater cherished pieces which bore traces, even scars, of their history: above all, that of the American Revolution. Like R. T. Haines Halsey, 'the principal guiding spirit in the formation of the American Wing,' a teapot or porringer could be a 'crystal ball', one which summoned visions, not of the future, but of 'the memories which form part of our national inheritance.'[8]

Clearwater's interest in American silver had been piqued by the temporary loan exhibitions of art and historical relics which began during the Civil War, under the aegis of the Union's Sanitary Commission, and gained traction around various centennials of turning points in the American Revolution. The 1864 New York City Sanitary Fair included a 'Knickerbocker Kitchen,' where visitors enjoyed Dutch-style krullers among heirloom furniture borrowed from the Beekman, Schermerhorn and other Knickerbocker families. The krullers were served by real Knickerbocker ladies in 'the costume of [their] great-grandmothers.' Two 'respectable people of color' played the part of enslaved servants, playing music.[9] Many of today's leading East Coast institutions inherited their founding trustees, buildings and collections from Sanitary Fairs or later celebrations of the American Revolution's centennial.

The Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York City was founded in 1870, inspired by the 1864 Sanitary Fair. But its decision to collect 'American art', which its trustees understood to be that of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Anglo-Dutch settlers, was inspired by the 1909 Hudson-Fulton Celebration. This was a two-week, two-state (New York and New Jersey) double commemoration of the three hundredth anniversary of Henry Hudson's arrival in the Hudson River, and the centenary of Robert Fulton's paddle steamer. As the Met's official history notes, 'well into the first decade of the twentieth century, the Museum's collection of Americana was sparse'. The Hudson-Fulton Exhibition was 'a trial run for the development, fifteen years later, of the American Wing', not least in its displays of paintings and decorative arts presented in chronologically-arranged groupings, some of which included 'architectural elements that simulated rooms'.[10] Providing a window on the past in a similar way to the elaborate *tableaux vivants* of the Hall of the Age of Man (1923) installed across Central Park in the American Museum of Natural History, the opening of the Met's American Wing in 1924 led to something of a fad for period rooms in American museums. [11] Clearwater lived long enough to see the beginnings of open-air museums such

as those of Greenfield, Michigan, and Williamsburg, Virginia. These were delayed responses to Artur Hazelius's Skansen (1891), a collection of around 150 houses from across Norway, assembled on a 75-acre campus in Stockholm, where they provided a setting for displays of folk dancing and pre-industrial crafts by staff in period costume.

These displays of natural history specimens, works of art, and historical curiosities were encouraged as a means of challenging European perceptions of the United States as lacking in civilisation. They also allowed rival American cities to compete with one another and, prestige aside, were felt to have social benefits as well. They helped Americans to 'place' themselves in the gradual unfolding, or evolution, of God's Providence. Lest that be considered too abstract, it was also believed that art museums had economic benefits. For example, the first generation of American art museums drew heavily, at least rhetorically, from the 'Arts and Industry' model championed by London's South Kensington Museum (now the V&A), founded two decades before. Tiffany sought permission to sell reproductions of pieces Clearwater had lent to the Met, a request which delighted the collector. Eager to demonstrate its potential to improve manufacturing design, the Met was even more pleased.

Of course, Clearwater also thought his silver was beautiful. Aesthetic appeal was not a discrete element, however, but inextricably linked to all the others: a respect for pedigree, community building, and economic utility. Writing in 1913 to Henry Kent, Secretary of the Met, the Judge put it this way:

One of my ideas in making the collection has been to demonstrate to the people of America that the silversmiths of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries not only were skillful craftsmen but had an artistic instinct and the ability of execution rarely surpassed in any period of the world's history. It is not necessary to say to you that for beauty of line, sense of proportion, artistic balance and adaptability to the uses to which they were devoted, the various pieces made by the early American silversmiths are remarkable examples of the silversmith's art.[12]

Clearwater's phrasing here ('not only...but') nods to the commonplace that 'art' is superior to 'craft.' The closing reference to 'the silversmith's art', however, excuses the Judge from dwelling on the nature of that superiority, thanks to the slippage between 'art' as 'an

activity that can be achieved or mastered by the application of specialist skills' and 'art' as 'the expression of application of creative skill and imagination'.[13]

In this letter to Kent Clearwater presents his collecting as a scientific demonstration or performance aimed at 'the people of America'. A few years later, however, the Judge penned the letter quoted in the opening paragraph, in which he presented his collecting in more intimate, almost pathological terms: as a private matter between Alphonso and his soul. Though we should be cautious about attempting an exercise in cognitive archaeology, or putting Clearwater 'on the couch', there are indications that collecting helped Clearwater to fashion a more satisfactory version of his own place in the community.

Yet Clearwater was, for all his vaunted ancestry and importance as a collector, unacceptable to the Walpole Society, established by Henry Kent in 1910 'to bring the collectors of Americana together in closer association'.[14] As Jeffrey Trask notes, the Society was 'an exclusive gentlemen's club for his [i.e. Kent's] collecting friends' that could also 'be used as formal resource for institutional collecting.'[15] Membership was by invitation, and it appears that Clearwater was never invited. His exclusion relates to this essay's broader investigation into whom Clearwater meant by 'the people of America'. For a man who used words advisedly, it is surely not accidental that Clearwater did not write 'Americans'. Not all 'the people of America' were 'Americans', at least, not in the way 'the early American silversmiths' had been.

Dominies and Tankards

Clearwater was talented at leveraging his collection, or rather the reversion of it, to secure the assistance of museums. His generous loans not only raised the profile and value of his pieces. They allowed him to learn more about their makers and provenance, thanks to the expertise of curators, who also advised him on purchases. His long-standing relationship with the Met even allowed him to use the museum's *Bulletin* to polish his own provenance.. The July 1931 issue included a piece entitled 'Recollections', in which the Judge shared childhood memories of his grandfather Thomas Theunis Clearwater, veteran of the War of 1812 and elder of the First Dutch Church of Kingston, as well as the distinguished 'dominies' or churchmen Thomas welcomed to his home, where they conversed in Dutch and 'munched krullers'. Clearwater claimed that one of the silver tankards on loan to the Met

had been presented to his grandfather by 'his companions in arms'.[16] The story seems unlikely. The Judge's grandfather is listed in the 1850 census as a carpenter, whose real estate was valued at $500 ($370,000 in today's value). He had served as a private, not an officer, in the War of 1812.[17] Had Thomas Clearwater been the well-connected local notable his grandson described, he would certainly not have entered the regiment as a private.

Alphonso's father Isaac, also a carpenter, was living in New York City when he wed Emily Ann Baoudoin Trumpbour in 1847. The first of five children, Alphonso was born at West Point the following year. In 1849 the family moved to Wilbur, a hamlet just outside Kingston, where waggons loaded with bluestone came to load their cargo onto canal barges. Their neighbours were boatmen and boat-builders. In 1860, when Alphonso was twelve, his household's real estate was valued at $500 and their other property at $100. The equivalent of $370,000 today, this was a lower middle-class home. They were a cut above the 'rowdies' drawn to nearby Rondout after the arrival of the Delaware & Hudson Canal and the discovery of deposits of natural cement at nearby Rosendale, developments which boosted Kingston's population from around 6,000 in 1870 to around 18,000 just a decade later. The Clearwaters clearly did not belong to Kingston's closely-knit Dutch-Huguenot elite, which included the Hasbrouck and DuBois families who had ruled Kingston for two centuries.

Just because Alphonso wasn't born with a silver spoon in his mouth did not mean that he could not collect them once he made a name for himself as a lawyer. Kingston's other, more famous art collector, Charles Lang Freer (1854-1919), came from an even humbler family. Freer's mother died when he was a teenager, and the boy had to take a job in one of the Rosendale cement mines mentioned above. He was working as a clerk when he was hired by a railroad executive. Shortly thereafter, he moved to Detroit, where he made his fortune building rolling stock. Freer began collecting contemporary and Asian art in the 1880s and 1890s. In 1905 he offered to bequeath his collections to the nation. Construction of the Freer Gallery of Art began on the National Mall in Washington in 1916. After leaving Kingston aged twenty, however, Freer broke ties with the community, and does not appear to have corresponded with Clearwater, who rarely left Kingston.

Ten years on, the 1870 census lists twenty-two-year-old Alphonso as living at home, describing him as a 'law student'. Law degrees had yet to be offered by universities, so there was nothing remarkable about his informal training under county judge Augustus Schoonmaker Jn. and state senator Jacob Hardenbergh. The latter had a pedigree

Clearwater could only envy: descended from six of the twelve founders (or patentees) of New Paltz, a town established in 1678 by French Huguenot refugees, and the great-great-nephew of Jacob Rutsen Hardenbergh (1735-1790), who founded that bastion of Dutch Reformed higher education, Queens College (now Rutgers, State University of New Jersey). Hardenbergh's own father had been a field officer under General Washington.

In 1871 Clearwater was admitted to the bar. Four years later he wed Anna Houghtaling, of Gardiner, New York, another town in Ulster county founded by French Huguenots. Anna's father Robert is listed in census records as a 'laborer'. Although Schoonmaker had been a Democrat, Clearwater became active in local politics as a Republican, serving as secretary of a 'Hayes and Wheeler Club,' which supported the 1876 Republican presidential candidate Rutherford B Hayes and his vice president William Wheeler. As the *New York Times* noted at the time, Ulster County

though generally Democratic by a majority of about two thousand three hundred, contains a large number of independent voters, composed of gentlemen engaged in the blue-stone trade, the cement business, the wooden-ware manufacturing interest, the officials of the Delaware and Hudson Canal Company, and members of the old Dutch and Huguenot families, who hold the balance of power. Usually they keep aloof from the political arena, but with their aid in 1860 we carried the country for Lincoln [a Republican] by a majority of 523.[18]

By the time Clearwater was elected District Attorney, in November 1880, he and his wife were living in central Kingston, on Cedar Street. Re-elected in 1883, he and Anna moved to Albany Street, where they remained for the rest of Alphonso's life.

In 1884 Clearwater was proposed as Republican congressional candidate, one of several such propositions he refused. He was more comfortable as one of the twenty-odd Vice Presidents of the Holland Society of New York, a club for those claiming Knickerbocker ancestry. Clearwater helped the Society develop plans to erect a monument to the Pilgrim Fathers at Delft harbour in the Netherlands for the four hundredth anniversary of the 'discovery' of America. He delivered a talk on 'The Dutchmen of Kingston' to the Society's annual beanfeast at the Hotel Kaaterskill, which was fitted in between loud choruses of the Society's 'herring drinking song.'[19] He was also active in the Huguenot Society of America,

addressing their 1898 convention banquet, held in Delmonico's in New York City, on the topic of the 'Huguenots' Influence in the Colonial Capital of New York'.[20] These activities brought him regular mentions in the press, from the *New York Times* to Kingston's *Old Ulster: an Historical and Genealogical Magazine* (1905-1914).

By the late 1880s Clearwater had evidently attracted a number of wealthy clients. In 1888 he felt financially secure enough to travel to Europe with his wife, their first and only trip across the Atlantic. Shortly after their return Clearwater was elected to the Ulster county bench. His second term was cut short in January 1898, when New York State governor Frank S. Black appointed him to fill future Democratic Presidential candidate Alton B. Parker's seat on the New York State Supreme Court for the Third Judicial District. Justice Clearwater was thrown off the bench at the next election, just a few months later. This was humiliating: Clearwater, a sitting justice, lost to a former teacher and much less qualified candidate, James Betts.

This may have been the result of Republican in-fighting at their county convention. In 'the bitterest political campaign ever known in Ulster County', the family of self-made millionaire Thomas Cornell and his son-in-law Samuel D. Coykendall battled one of the 'oldest families in Ulster County' (the Hasbroucks), 'inch over inch for the control of the party machinery.'[21] Clearwater and Gilbert Hasbrouck were in opposing camps: the latter had hoped to succeed Parker. A relation, Josiah Hasbrouck, was charged with bribing voters.[22]

This explains why Hasbrouck spoke so critically of the late Judge's 'overlordship' in the letter quoted in the opening of this essay. Clearwater's decision to take Cornell-Coykendall's side cannot have endeared him to the old families he otherwise sought to identify himself with. This is one of a number of indications that suggest Clearwater was torn between a desire to ingratiate himself with Kingston's traditional elite and a more independent-minded streak, perhaps even a sense that he did not want to join a club which would not have him.

Sources and Inspirations

Clearwater's first opportunities to view exhibitions of American silver probably came in the 1880s. In 1886, for example, the two hundredth anniversary of Albany's municipal

charter saw the Albany Academy put on a loan show of more than four thousand 'historical relics and art objects from the city's leading families: the Van Rensselaers, Schuylers, Gansevoorts, Lansings and Cornings, among others.' The exhibition drew twenty-five thousand visitors. The Albany Historical and Art Society was established to allow highlights from this show to remain on view in a rented house on State Street. Then, in the 1890s, Society president G. D. Miller launched a fundraising drive for a museum 'with rooms occupied by the Sons of the Revolution fitted up in colonial style.' This enabled the Society to buy another house on State Street, build an art gallery annexe and merge with an older institution dedicated to the arts and sciences, the Albany Institute (est. 1824), to form the Albany Institute of History and Art Society in 1900.[23]

Similar 'relics' featured in an 1889 loan exhibition organized in New York City, to mark the centenary of George Washington's first inauguration as President of the United States. This time, a large display (352 items) of American silver was specifically included. It had been curated by John Henry Buck, a British-born expert working at The Gorham Manufacturing Company, the leading American silversmiths. *Harper's Weekly* noted that it was 'by far the finest [display of silver] ever brought together in the United States.' The magazine nonetheless echoed the then widespread view that 'early American plate has bullion value, is curious, but has little artistic merit.'[24] For Clearwater the Hudson-Fulton exhibition was a 'revelation'. As he noted it had 'done much to stimulate the collecting of the work of early American silversmiths.'[25] There are no surviving records for Clearwater's collecting prior to the Hudson-Fulton show, to which he lent fifteen pieces, but he had evidently begun collecting before this exhibition.

Clearwater obtained his pieces from various sources. While several of the most important pieces came through the Boston-based silver scholar Francis Hill Bigelow, the Judge also corresponded with other Bostonians: interior decorators such as Miss T. V. Carey, antique dealers, as well as scouts like Eli Jacobs and Joseph Epstein. Epstein's laboriously scrawled missives reek of a hand-to-mouth existence on 'the road', going house to house looking for likely items, such as a John Coney tankard and a Jacob Hurd pepper box.[26] An interest in local history and genealogy afforded the Judge many opportunities to sound out owners of heirloom silver interested in a discreet sale. Clearwater sometimes lent works to institutions with the stipulation that their provenance not be revealed.[27] For a Boston brahmin selling a flagon by Burt (whether Joseph or Benjamin is unclear), the Judge offered

reassurance that he planned eventually to give the piece to the Met 'or to the National Museum in Washington'. Although Clearwater noted that this would 'take it out of Boston', saving the seller's blushes, it seems that the sale did not proceed.[28]

Clearwater also wrote to the *Christian Intelligencer*, drawing attention to a shift (driven by hygienic concerns) to taking communion by 'individual cup', rather than a shared chalice. It was prudent to sell unused church vessels to a collector with plans to bequeath his treasures to a museum, Clearwater intimated. Such pieces, he argued, might end up passing out of church ownership anyway, albeit through negligence or malfeasance. His approaches proved successful so that by 1917, the Judge had snapped up the silver services of twenty-seven churches.[29] Such purchases sometimes proved controversial, but had been advocated by the English scholar E. Alfred Jones in his book *The Old Silver of American Churches* (1913).[30] Clearwater admired Jones, who had catalogued the silver of Leopold de Rothschild as well as J. P. Morgan, and helped secure Jones an honorary degree from Rutgers.[31]

Collecting placed a significant burden on the Judge's finances. Letters in which he berated himself for succumbing to the temptation afforded by this or that piece, for 'spoil[ing] the market' by 'paying larger prices for American silver than anybody else has been willing to pay,' thus carry an edge. 'I realize perfectly that I am largely responsible for the extravagant notions existing in some quarters relative to the value of American silver.'[32] One wonders what his wife Anna, running 316 Albany Avenue without any servants, thought. Though her husband took his collecting seriously, at times he could describe it in terms which seem curiously dismissive. As he put it to Bigelow, 'my duties are multifarious. The collection of silver after all is but an infinitesimal diversion.'[33] Here again, perhaps, we can see the Judge torn between a desire to ingratiate himself with a select coterie - of noted collectors of 'Americana' - and an urge to hold back, refusing to let 'the collection of silver' define him.

The three other collectors who lent to the Met's Hudson-Fulton show were certainly more established and better-connected collectors, about who much more is known: the collections of Richard Townley Haines Halsey (1865-1942), Hollis French (1868-1940) and George Shepard Palmer (1855-1934) ended up in public collections including those of Yale University Art Gallery, Cleveland Museum of Art and the Met.[34] Around 1909 Clearwater had yet to specialize, collecting European as well as American silver. Halsey was among

those who encouraged him to focus his efforts on seventeenth- and eighteenth-century American silver. A Princeton graduate who worked on the New York Stock Exchange, Halsey became a trustee of the Met in 1914, and chaired the board's committee on American Decorative Art. He published his *Historic Silver of the Colonies and Its Makers* in 1917. Even as he consulted fellow collectors, Clearwater could in turn express frustration that these 'New England collectors' were making difficulties for him, by paying 'extravagant prices for even quite late American silver'.[35]

Alongside Halsey, the Hudson-Fulton exhibits at the Met had been masterminded by the museum's Secretary, Henry Watson Kent, and by Met trustee (and future President) Robert de Forest. While the Hudson-Fulton display was still up, Kent negotiated the purchase of Boston lawyer Eugene Bolles' large collection of early American furniture, firmly committing the Met to this new area of collecting. De Forest and his wife Emily donated the museum's first American period room. In 1916 they encouraged Kent to draw up plans for a 'Wing of Colonial Art'. The following year Kent informed Clearwater of these plans to include 'what museums call "period rooms".'[36] Thanks to the First World War, these plans were only presented to the Met board in 1922, whereupon the de Forests announced their intention to pay for the Wing's construction.[37]

The first scholar to deem American plate worthy of consideration alongside European, John Henry Buck did the most to educate the Judge about silver. Buck's *Old Plate, Its Makers and Marks* (1888), included a chapter on American silversmiths and in 1906 the author became curator of metalwork at the Met, helping to organize exhibitions of American silver at the MFA in Boston in 1906 and 1911, and the Met in 1909 and 1911. As Kent put it, these shows 'broke the ice of official aloofness' surrounding 'what our early silversmiths could do.'[38]

Clearwater's first letter to Buck dates from May 1909, mentioning a small German beaker and a Dutch ladle without a handle. These had been offered to the Judge, and he wished to know if Buck considered them 'worth the money and of sufficient interest and value to be accepted by the Museum, peradventure I finally carry out my hope to present such collection of silver, as I make, to the Museum.'[39] His first long-term loans in late 1909 were early nineteenth-century pieces by Anthony Rasch (c. 1778-1858), Garret Eoff (1770-1845), and the Lewis and Smith partnership (active c. 1805-11).[40] Concerned that these were not enough to merit an entire display case by themselves, the Judge made a series of

additions over the following two years, including two tablespoons by Paul Revere, so that by 1912 Buck could report in the *Bulletin* that a case of Clearwater loans was on show in Gallery 22.[41] A year later all the Met's silver was displayed together in galleries A-22 and A-23, with Clearwater's loans filling two free-standing cases and two wall cases.

Clearwater claimed that the MFA had asked to borrow some of the pieces he had lent to Buck, but added that he preferred to show them in New York City.[42] Eleven pieces went on loan to the MFA in 1911, and another thirty-seven in 1913. The Judge tried to stoke competition for his collection between New York and Boston: 'I am not a little amused to see that there is an interesting rivalry between the Metropolitan of New York, and the Museum of Fine Arts of Boston,' the Judge wrote to the MFA's Florence V. Paull, 'and between the Colonial Dames of the two states.'[43] Paull's notices of Clearwater loans in the MFA's annual reports and *Bulletin* were short and infrequent.[44] This probably frustrated the Judge, who placed great importance on having his loans publicized. He wanted his pieces displayed separately, accompanied by a large label identifying them as his, and he wanted reports of successive additions to their number to appear in *Bulletins* and in the mainstream press.[45] Clearwater drafted most of these notices himself.

The third institution to which Clearwater lent was the Albany Institute of History and Art. In 1917 Clearwater lent the AIHA 210 pieces, some drawn from those previously at the Met. Unfortunately, the AIHA publicly thanked 'W. T. Clearwater', eliciting a humorous yet ominous letter from A. T.[46] A further 123 pieces then in storage at the Met followed in April 1918. Another 48 came in 1919, transferred from the MFA, with further loans in 1921 and 1932. In the meantime, the AIHA elected Clearwater as a trustee and Honorary Life Member, renamed a gallery containing his loans the 'Clearwater Room,' and got Albany's mayor to write to the Judge expressing the City's appreciation. By 1920, the AIHA assumed that 'we had acquired a permanent possession.'[47] A chance remark by Clearwater to a member of staff that year, intimating that he had other plans, though, left the AIHA's leading trustees trying to find a polite way to flush out the Judge's intentions. They feared that 'any direct approach, however delicately made, might...be interpreted as pressure by him and result in an action quite opposite from what we intended and desire.'[48]

Despite the large number of loans to the AIHA, it seems that the Judge never seriously considered Albany as a permanent home. Where, then, did he consider donating his collection? Although he does mention Washington in one letter (quoted above), that

appears to have been a fleeting thought. The only other museum to solicit loans from Clearwater was the Philadelphia Museum of Art. In 1913 the museum's director, Edward Atlee Barber, requested loans of any duplicates among the Clearwater pieces on show at the Met. Barber was a leading expert on early American ceramics, but was also trying to build up his museum's silver displays. Pleading overwork, Clearwater said he would consider it, but no loans were forthcoming, not even for Philadelphia's 1917 Exhibition of Old American and English Silver.[49]

Setting Boundaries

Buck and Clearwater corresponded regularly until the former's death in 1914, exchanging letters every few days during 1911. Buck deciphered marks, advised on prospective additions to Clearwater's collection and served as intermediary between the Judge and sellers. Clearwater deferred to Buck's considerable expertise, yet one can sense his resistance to Buck's rule that the Met could not display items lacking a hallmark, or Buck's belief that post-1776 silver was less significant. 'We make too much of a fetich [sic] of maker's marks', Clearwater observed, adding that he had several pieces whose 'design and workmanship' were just as good as that of marked pieces.[50]

As for post-1776 American silver, Clearwater explained that he had been encouraged to collect pieces as late as 1840 by visiting the MFA's 1911 American Church Silver Show. He claimed that 'the authorities of that Museum' had told him 'that the uniformity of design of the Colonial silversmiths was not only monotonous but that in a large collection it seemed almost depressing and disheartening in that when you had seen thirty or forty pieces you had practically seen all there was to see except that the pieces bore the mark of different markers, a mark not visible to the ordinary visitor, and of practically no interest to anyone except the antiquarian and the collector. In making my collection I have endeavored to secure as great a variety of style in each decade down to about 1840. Do you think that my method is altogether destitute of wisdom?' Buck's reply was somewhat gnomic, noting simply that Clearwater's remarks had been 'very much to the purpose.' [51] The same day, however, the Judge wrote to Bigelow that he felt his collection of nineteenth-century silver had grown too large, and that he was thinking of auctioning the majority off.[52] The presence

of several 1840s teapots and other pieces in the 1933 Clearwater Bequest indicate that he did not sell them all.

Buck and Clearwater also disagreed on the value of 'personal associations'.[53] Buck, for example, returned three spoons the Judge had lent, on the basis that they were English rather than American. Clearwater acquiesced, but expressed regret that 'we are bereft of the power of transmutation',[54] for the spoons had belonged to a Revolutionary-era Loyalist, Edward Winslow, descendant of a Mayflower pilgrim. Yet that same year the Judge could claim in another letter that 'I do not collect silver for its historic association, but only for its artistic beauty or because of the silversmith who made it.'[55] The Judge seemed to swing back and forth on the question.

Whereas Buck thought 'all works by Revere are very much overrated,' and confided that he planned to use the next edition of *Old Plate* to 'make his works drop' in esteem (Buck died before he could do this), Clearwater shared the contemporary fascination for Paul Revere Jr. (1734-1818) in particular: a stalwart craftsman summoned by destiny from his bench. [56] Revere is famous for his midnight ride of 1775, in which he alerted British settlers in Massachusetts to the imminent arrival of British troops. In 1919, Clearwater lent a coin and banknote designed by Paul Revere Jr. to the Met, and later urged the investment banker-turned-scholar Hermann F. Clarke to write a biography of the 'picturesque' silversmith.[57]

None of these polite disagreements stopped the Judge from holding Buck in 'the highest and most affectionate regard,' as he put it to Met director Edward Robinson. Indeed, when the Judge heard that Buck was thinking of leaving the Met he accelerated plans to present his collection to the museum, 'as a token of my recognition of the service rendered by you in preserving the record of the art of the early American silversmiths.'[58] Within a few years, however, it seems that the Judge forgot about this plan.

The Judge was a clubbable man, yet was never invited joined the Walpole Society of Americana collectors, whose members largely hailed from New York, Connecticut and Massachusetts. The Society had been conceived over a magnum of champagne at the Union Club in New York City, by Kent, Bolles and the pioneering scholar of American furniture, Luke Vincent Lockwood, who played a similar role to Kent in building the Brooklyn Museum's holdings of American period rooms.[59] Twice a year this male-only Society organized weekend expeditions to inspect private collections in New England.[60] Clearwater

knew several of the founding members and was safely Protestant, unlike fellow silver collector Francis Patrick Garvan. Born in 1875 in Hartford (Connecticut), Garvan was a self-made man who endowed his alma mater, Yale University, with an encyclopedic collection of American silver (as well as furniture, paintings and decorative arts), intended to serve as 'a great panorama of American arts and crafts'. Although Garvan certainly shared members' fears of the 'foreign ideas' of recent immigrants, as the son of Roman Catholic Irish immigrants, he was excluded from the Walpole Society.[61]

The Walpoleans published a number of 'glossaries' listing American craftsmen, including Hollis French's *Silver Glossary* (1917). This was a form of antiquarian scholarship Clearwater prized and warmly encouraged, alongside more topographical histories such as his own *History of Ulster County* (1907). In addition to belonging to 'acceptable families of old native stock,' however, Hollis French insisted that members must have that 'broad general culture which stamps a gentleman and a scholar.' Perhaps it is here that Clearwater fell short.[62]

To qualify as 'a gentleman and a scholar' was not, it seems, a question of education or pedigree alone. Kent and Clearwater were both university educated and both born to downwardly-mobile families of the 'old stock'. Yet, it seems, the latter was not considered 'a gentleman' by the Walpole Society. Kent struck his Met colleagues as a throwback and fussbudget, as a sketch in the museum's Ladies Lunch Club Guestbook [Fig. 2] demonstrates. Published by the Grolier Club, where he served as librarian prior to his appointment to the Met in 1905, the title of Kent's 1949 memoir, *What I am Pleased to Call My Education* even displays that tone of formal mock-diffidence at which Clearwater was a past master. 'I am of Yankee stock, all of my forebears having come to Massachusetts in its beginning,' Kent notes in his opening paragraph, 'and I was brought up on stories of these ancestors, their ways and manners.' His grandfather had been an officer in the War of 1812, and, like Clearwater, he fondly recalled a childhood passed among a coven of maiden aunts: Yankee Miss Havershams guarding parlours stuffed with 'fans, slippers, and caps worn by the ladies when they danced with Lafayette', preserved in a 'splendid block-front mahogany desk which Washington himself had used.'[63] Kent barely mentioned his parents once, presumably because, like Clearwater's, they were not very wealthy or distinguished.

Concerned, perhaps, at the uncoordinated manner in which his museum was acquiring silver, Met director Robinson wrote to the Judge in 1915, explaining that it would

be unwise for the museum to accept any more loans until it had settled 'the future policy of the Museum with regard to its exhibition of American silver.' Robinson made it clear that Halsey, recently appointed to the Met board, would set this policy, though he politely suggested that Clearwater share his thoughts on 'the limitations to be placed upon our collection of American silver, and the character which should be given to it.'[64] Like Bigelow, Halsey sought to drum into Clearwater the need to adopt a less scattergun approach to collecting, particularly given the Judge's repeated declarations of his intent to leave his collection to the Met. With this in mind, Halsey contributed a heavily-illustrated, glowing survey of 'The Clearwater Collection of Colonial Silver' to the Met *Bulletin* in January 1916.[65] He subsequently offered to produce a catalogue of Clearwater's collection. This had the effect of leading Clearwater to move pieces from the MFA to the Met. Citing the many calls on his time, though, Halsey ended up passing the work on to 'a very capable young woman', Clara Louise Avery, then working as a stenographer in Kent's office.[66] A graduate of Mount Holyoke, Avery created the catalogue in her first step as a curator, a role she would fill until retiring from the Met in 1957.

Avery was more open to 'the added element of human interest' in a piece's history than some of her colleagues. The Judge persuaded the Met to mark Lafayette Day (May 20, the date of Lafayette's death) each year by displaying a map case by Louis Boudo of Charleston (1786-1827), which the Judge had acquired in 1912, and which had been presented to Lafayette by the State of South Carolina. This was exhibited on its own in a display case, with French and American flags either side.[67] But fellow Met Decorative Arts curator Russell Plimpton, who later served as director of the Minneapolis Institute of Arts, would not exhibit a pair of Portuguese salts that had allegedly belonged to the author Edgar Allan Poe, known for his tales of the macabre. Such pieces were not 'up to the high standard maintained by other pieces in your collection.'[68] For Clara Avery, such associations

> connect the silver with Colonial life in such a fascinating manner, especially when their history is as romantic as that of the Pygan Adams coffee-pot, the Goelet tumbler, or the Onclebagh tankard. I can appreciate how much thought and untiring effort and enthusiasm lie back of all these discoveries.[69]

The Pygan Adam's pot [Fig. 3] derived its 'romantic' interest from having been seized by a British officer in 1781, when New London (Connecticut) was burned by British forces. Having been passed down generations of the officer's family, it was sold at Christie's, and made its way into Clearwater's collection.[70] The Goelet tumbler had been thrown down its owner's well immediately prior to the 1777 looting of Kingston. Once British forces had moved on, an enslaved servant was lowered on a rope with a shovel to dig it out, inadvertently damaging the tumbler. Clearwater was careful not to have this damage repaired.[71] [Fig. 4] Records relating to the Met's American Wing indicate that the gouges were repaired in 1965.[72]

Published in 1920, *American Silver of the XVII and XVIII Centuries: A Study Based on The Clearwater Collection* featured the elegant headpieces typical of Met publications under Henry Kent. As Halsey noted in his preface, Avery's 'real contribution' to the field lay in her consideration of the 'artistic standpoint', 'tracing and ascribing the origin of motives of decoration used,' as well as the evolution of specific forms like the porringer.[73] Illustrated with over 140 photographic reproductions, the work was hailed as 'the best starting point for the study of the subject'.[74]

For Met President Robert de Forest and others, the European tragedy of the Great War represented an opportunity for American designers to step up their game. By drawing inspiration from the Met's collections, they could ensure that, by the time peace broke out, imports from Europe would have been replaced by domestic wares. In 1917 the Met held the first of what became an annual temporary exhibition of consumer goods inspired by items in the collection [Fig. 5]. Located in classroom B on the ground floor, these exhibits included reproductions by Tiffany of nineteen pieces from the Clearwater Collection, such as his Zachariah Brigden porringer. These were analogous to the reproductions of early American furniture then being produced by Wallace Nutting (1861-1941), an expert in American furniture and antiquarian famous, among other things, for his publication *Furniture of the Pilgrim Century* (1921).[75]

Considering the firm to be 'men of the first rank', the Judge had responded enthusiastically to Tiffany's reproduction proposals, feeling 'that possibly I might be doing a little towards the cultivation of true taste' thereby.[76] He refused to allow Gorham, Meriden, Cutler or Oneida to produce their own copies of works in his collection, and objected strongly when a member of the Vanderbilt family presumed to have a silversmith he

disapproved of produce a service copied from his pieces, without any mark acknowledging the 'Clearwater Collection'.[77]

Tiffany marketed their copies with an elegantly printed brochure whose introduction hailed the Judge's 'discriminating taste' and the 'sturdy characters' of the silversmiths represented in his collection, who combined 'purity of line and simplicity of design...with excellence of workmanship.' The reproductions were exact, but lacked 'markings indicating the ownership.'[78] By this Tiffany presumably meant inscriptions and initials of the original owners: Clearwater's ownership was made clear, with every piece clearly marked on the base: 'Original in the Clearwater Collection Metropolitan Museum of Art', accompanied by tombstone information on the original piece. Although neither Clearwater nor the museum derived any financial benefit, for the Met's Richard F. Bach, appointed in 1918 to the new position of Associate in Industrial Relations, they provided much-needed evidence of the Met's service to industry.

'The Undervaluation of American Citizenship'

Whether open air or more conventional, between 1900 and 1914 American museums of early Anglo-Dutch interiors and decorative arts were partly motivated by a desire to educate immigrants and inoculate them against 'socialism, militant laborism, and other worse -isms', to quote George Frances Dow. Dow's Essex Institute in Salem, Massachusetts (1905) featured the first examples of period rooms, shown by costumed guides.[79] A few years later, staff at the Children's Museum in Kingston Park, Brooklyn were shocked to discover that 'foreign-born children' knew nothing of Plymouth Rock, where the *Mayflower* pilgrims disembarked in 1620, yet 'could talk quite learnedly of [the German socialist August] Bebel or Marx.' A series of puppet tableaux set in meticulously-researched miniature historic interiors 'caught the children from the start', in a way public school history lessons had not.[80] Similar concerns about '"Anglo-Saxon" purity' were cited by Wallace Nutting.[81]

The guide written by Halsey and his wife Elizabeth Tower to celebrate the opening of the American Wing in 1924 picked up where Nutting had left off.[82] Taken as a whole, however, the Met's curators were in two minds about whether period rooms were preferable to the South Kensington approach, which organized galleries around material.

Curator Durr Friedley, for instance, originally proposed that the second floor of the American Wing be devoted to galleries organized according to material, rather than period or geography. The Clearwater Gallery housing the Judge's loans, which connected the American and Morgan Wings, was very much a South Kensington-style display.

For Clearwater and Halsey, 'Americanizing' began at home, with 'our people, to whom much of our history is little known.'[83] This 'Yankee stock' descended from seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Anglo-Dutch immigrants had been led to worship false gods, chiefly Mammon.[84] It was a classic Knickerbocker complaint. A certain disdain for new money lies behind Halsey and Tower's sneer at 'those exotic interiors in which your modern Maecenas is lodged.'[85] Mammon also threatened America's totemic landscapes: alongside silver, Clearwater also collected views of Niagara Falls, whose setting he sought to preserve as President of the New York State Reservation Commission for Niagara Falls, created in 1883.[86]

Recent immigrants also needed 'Americanizing', even as many identified those same migrants as vessels by which vigorous 'peasant art' might inoculate American design against the deadening effects of industrialisation. In Buffalo and in New York City, 'Homelands Exhibitions' celebrating immigrant communities broke attendance records in 1919. In 1912 the MFA's 'Native Arts of Our Foreign Population' saw working-class immigrants lend examples of 'native costume', with the museum laying on lectures in the appropriate languages.[87] As MFA Instructor Laura Scales noted, 'The immigrant, ignorant and unlettered man that he is, has not yet learned the American way of spelling Art with a capital letter,' as the preserve of 'women's clubs and moneyed connoisseurs.' Here was 'a diversity of gifts' to which America might become heir. 'Will she accept her good fortune?'[88]

The Met barely acknowledged the America's Making Exposition and Festival of October 1921 held at the 71st Regiment Armory in New York City [Fig. 6]. Every public school in New York City took part in pageants, with alongside the central exhibition in the Armory.[89] The 'Colored Section' included sculpture by Meta Warrick Fuller invoking Egypt's 'most brilliant period': 'the period of the Negro kings.'[90] As far as the *Bulletin* was concerned, the Met already displayed 'what is best, most characteristic in the art of many of the countries represented in the racial descent of [Americans].'[91] 'Immigrant gifts' were not welcome at Fifth Avenue, unless they were Anglo-Dutch.

As Wendy Kaplan has noted, between 1918 and 1924 Halsey's understanding of the American Wing's purpose shifted. 'A well-meaning desire to help the immigrants understand their new country was now laced with fear that if these aliens did not conform to the values of Anglo-Saxon America, the country would be irrevocably lost.'[92] There were signs of this in Halsey's 1916 *Bulletin* article, in which he proposed that Americans 'jealously apprehensive of our country's future' might find solace in Clearwater's collection.[93] In Clearwater's case, this shift happened several years earlier. It was a remarkable shift, considering the pride the Judge had previously expressed for the toleration displayed by Dutch New York, and, of course, his celebration of his own Huguenot ancestors.

In September 1913 the Judge delivered a speech on 'The Undervaluation of American Citizenship' to the New York State Historical Association, at its annual gathering in Oswego. Clearwater cited the eugenicist Charles Davenport's analysis of patients in New York State psychiatric institutions, which allegedly indicated a high incidence of 'lunacy' among recent immigrants, as well as 'my personal experience of forty-two years at the bar', to argue for tighter restrictions on immigration, presumably modelled on the 1882 Chinese Exclusion Act.

According to Clearwater, pre-1880 migrants had been 'men and women of excellent character, of more than average intelligence and possessed more than the average spirit of enterprise'. 'The later immigrant' sought citizenship in order to sell his vote to political 'bosses', while labour markets 'overstocked' with such people deterred the earlier arrivals, 'this precious stock of pioneer ancestry,' from having children.[95] A year later, as one of 168 delegates to New York State's seventh Constitutional Convention, the Judge repeated his call for policies to prevent the emergence of an American 'proletariat'.[96]

Whereas the Oswego lecture had been little noticed in 1914, it got much more attention when Clearwater repeated it to the New York Bar Association in 1923. This was a year before the landmark Johnson-Reed Act, which set immigration quotas for Eastern and Southern Europe.[97] Such rhetoric echoed the eugenicist Madison Grant's best-selling *Passing of the Great Race* (1916).[98] It also reflected the 1919-20 'Red Scare,' which equated labor unions with both a 'not-quite-white "Other" and the vague specter of communism.'[99]

The Duty of Collectors

Clearwater suffered a ‘nervous collapse’ in 1926, after which his visits to New York City became infrequent. Clearwater's eightieth birthday found him taking stock of his health: one broken leg, two broken arms, ‘but one eye, and no natural teeth.’[100] Sensing that the end was near, Met President de Forest and Robinson's successor as director, the Egyptologist Herbert Winlock, made sure that Clearwater got his way when Met curators tried to prevent him lending pieces that had ‘historical associations,’ but which they considered otherwise unfit.[101] This continued right up to July 1933, two months before the Judge's death in Kingston on 23 September.

Clearwater never made a home in New York City, and his collection was far less important to the Met than those of contemporary robber barons. For twenty years the Judge had nonetheless been a fixture at the Met. Guards recognized him, and asked for his support in securing promotion. Clearwater could advise those meeting him for the first time at the Met simply to ask any member of staff, confident that they would be able to point him out.[102] Writing a posthumous tribute for the *Bulletin,* Avery was perfectly sincere in paying tribute to Clearwater's ‘most friendly relations’ with all staff. But the Judge was prepared to go over curators' heads to President and Director on occasion, while hinting that other institutions stood ready to welcome his collection, if he did not get his way.[103]

From John H. Buck through Louise Avery to Joseph Breck, therefore, Met curators had to work hard for Clearwater, answering his queries, researching his acquisitions and producing a catalogue. Space had to be made for Clearwater's silver in displays, lest he complain about works tarnishing in the Met's vaults.[104] Sometimes curators had to display items which did not fit their own plans for their galleries. Clearwater defended the value of ‘personal associations’, and challenged curators' snooty view of nineteenth-century design. Only in 1957, with the appointment of James Biddle, did American Wing staff embrace American decorative art of the mid nineteenth century.[105]

The galleries of the new American Wing celebrated immigration and demonized it at the same time. Even when admiring ‘my Colonial silver’ in aesthetic terms, Clearwater could not, it seems, help but fall into racialist tropes: contrasting the ‘refined’ forms of the eighteenth century with latter-day design, characterized by ‘the over-ornate vagary of super-oriental workmanship.’[106] In art as in demography, it was the ‘oriental’ which provided the ‘other’ to ‘our ancestors.’

Clearwater was a complex character. Rather than standing on one side or the other, the fault lines of class and race ran through him: a 'joiner' but also, it seems, a bit of a loner. Eager to write himself into the historical Knickerbocker elite of Kingston, even as he kicked against it. A collector who joked to Kent about the 'polyglot, polychrome population' of New York City, yet one who decided against endowing either Kingston's Senate House museum [Fig. 7] or Albany Institute of History and Art, precisely because he felt his collection would not be appreciated enough there.[107] Unpleasant as his high-profile interventions in immigration policy are, we need to set them beside a 1921 letter to an Albany curator:

More and more I am convinced that it is almost a duty of collectors to permit the public to share with them the pleasure of a collection. Always the number of collectors will be limited, but the number of people who can enjoy them only is limited by the number of people of judgment and taste who are afforded an opportunity to see them.[108]

Address for correspondence: School of Humanities (History), University of Southampton, Avenue Campus 65/2073, Southampton SO17 1BF, United Kingdom. j.conlin@soton.ac.uk

Acknowledgments: The author would like to thank Ulster County Commissioner of Jurors Paul T. O'Neill and Ulster County Archivist Taylor Bruck for generously sharing their knowledge of Clearwater and especially the history of Kingston, New York. Assistant Librarian Carley Altenburger facilitated visits to Clearwater's papers at Winterthur. Diane Shewchuk and Maureen Melton provided remote access to records at Albany and Boston. Medill Higgins Harvey and Beth Wees both commented on drafts, lending expertise gained from their years of service to the American Wing at the Metropolitan Museum of Art. Finally I thank Suzanne Higgott and Felix Zorzo of the Wallace Collection, for the invitation to contribute to the Wallace's Seminars in the History of Collecting.

---

[1] Taylor Bruck, personal comment, 2020. G. D. B. Hasbrouck to H. Kent, 3 March 1934 (quote). Metropolitan Museum of Art Archives, New York (hereafter MMAA), WCOR I.1.12.
[2] Clearwater to Kent, 23 September 1919. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1919'.
[3] Beth Carver Wees, *Early American Silver in the Metropolitan Museum of Art* (New York, 2013), p. 12.
[4] Elizabeth Stillinger, *The Antiquers: the lives and careers, the deals, the finds, the collections of the men and women who were responsible for the changing taste in American antiques, 1850-1930* (New York, 1980), p. 133.

[5] Paul T. O'Neill, John J. Wadlin and John Tobin, *History of Ulster County Bench and Bar* (White Plains, NY, 2021); Robert A. Caro, *Power Broker: Robert Moses and the Fall of New York* (New York, 2020), p. 246.
[6] Clearwater to Cornelius, 24 Jan. 1931. Winterthur Museum, Garden and Library, Winterthur (hereafter WMGL), Alphonso Trumbour Clearwater Papers, Collection 65 (hereafter ATC), Winterthur Museum, Garden and Library, Box 7.
[7] 'Sons of Dutch Fathers', *New York Times* 28 January 1887.
[8] Marshall Davidson, 'Those American Things', *Metropolitan Museum Journal* 3 (1970), pp. 219-33 (228). Clara Louise Avery, *American Silver of the XVII & XVIII Centuries. A study based on the Clearwater Collection* (New York, 1920), xii ('crystal-ball').
[9] Elizabeth L. Bradley, *Knickerbocker: The Myth Behind New York* (New Brunswick, NJ, 2009), p. 87. See also Rodris Roth, 'The New England, or 'Olde Tyme,' Kitchen Exhibit at Nineteenth Century Fairs', in Alan Axelrod, ed., *The Colonial Revival In America* (New York, 1985), pp. 159-83.
[10] Amelia Peck and Thayer Tolles, 'Creating a National Narrative', in Andrea Bayer, ed., *Making the Met, 1870-2020* (New York, 2020), pp. 110-129 (121-2).
[11] Victoria E. M. Cain, ''The Direct Medium of the Vision': Visual Education, Virtual Witnessing and the Prehistoric Past at the American Museum of Natural History, 1890-1923', *Journal of Visual Culture* 9.3 (2010), pp. 284-303. See also Cain, 'Nature Under Glass: Popular Science, Professional Illusion and the Transformation of American Natural History Museums' (DPhil. diss., Columbia Univ. 2007), p. 244 (quote); Alison Griffith, *Wondrous Difference: Cinema, Anthropology, and Turn-of-the-century Visual Culture* (New York, 2002), p. 24.
[12] Clearwater to Kent, 17 July 1913. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1913'.
[13] 'art, n.1.' *OED Online.* Oxford University Press, March 2023. Web. 16 May 2023. definitions 3.b and 8.a.
[14] Henry W. Kent, 'The Walpole Society, 1910-1935' in *The Twenty-fifth Anniversary Meeting of the Walpole Society* (1935), p. 21.
[15] Jeffrey Trask, *Things American. Art Museums and Civic Culture in the Progressive Era* (Philadelphia, 2012), 119.
[16] Clearwater, 'Recollections', *Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin* (hereafter *MMA Bulletin*) 26.7 (July 1931), pp. 174-5 (174).
[17] Declaration, 20 June 1857. New York State Archives, Albany. Generals Office, Box 3, Folder 20, Claim 686. Conversion based on relative share of GDP per capita, using the engine at www.measuringworth.com
[18] 'Ulster County', *New York Times*, 26 July 1876.
[19] 'Republican Conventions', *New York TImes* 11 September 1887; 'The Pilgrim Fathers', 27 July 1890; 'The Holland Society Dine', *New York Times,* 15 Sep. 1886.
[20] 'Huguenot Society's Session', 15 April 1898.
[21] 'Ulster at Fever Heat', *New York TImes* 23 October 1889.
[22] 'The Albany Legislature', *New York TImes,* 2 January 1898; 'Election Case Postponed', *New York Times,* 14 May 1890.
[23] Tammis K. Groft and Mary Alice Mackay, eds., *Albany Institute of History & Art: 200 Years of Collecting* (New York, 1998), 17, 24.
[24] 'The Centennial Loan Exhibition', *Harper's Weekly* 33 (27 April 1889), 331.
[25] Clearwater to Robinson, 11 February 1910. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1910'.
[26] Eli Jacobs and Joseph Epstein to Clearwater, 19 July 1912. WMGL ATC 2.
[27] Clearwater to Charles O. Cornelius, 20 November 1922. WMGL ATC 7.
[28] Clearwater to T. V. Carey, 18 November 1912. WMGL ATC 2.
[29] Clearwater to *Christian Intelligencer,* 20 March 1911, Clearwater to Robert E. Dean, 24 February 1917. WMGL ATC 2. Clearwater to Board of Publication of Reformed Church in America, 16 March 1911, WMGL ATC 5. The practice originated in the United States in the late 1890s among Scotch Presbyterians, but even among that church it was controversial. A. K. Robertson, 'The Individual Cup: Its Use At Holy Communion', *Liturgical Review* 8 (1978), pp. 2-12.
[30] Clearwater nominated E. Alfred Jones to receive an honorary MA from Rutgers. Clearwater to F. H. Bigelow, 19 March 1915. WMGL ATC 1.
[31] Clearwater to Bigelow, 19 March 1915. ATC 1. Clearwater to Dunn, 21 March 1929. Albany Institute of History and Art, Albany (hereafter AIHA).
[32] Clearwater to Eli Jacobs and Joseph Epstein, 19 July 1912 ('spoiling'); Clearwater to W. Farr, 8 April 1913 ('notions'). WMGL ATC 2 and 3.
[33] Clearwater to F. H. BIgelow, 15 January 1912. WMGL ATC 1.
[34] 'F. N. L.', 'The Hudson-Fulton Exhibition', *MMA Bulletin* 4.8 (August 1909), pp. 137-138 (138); 'Famous Paintings for Fulton Exhibit', *New York Times,* 24 August 1909.

[35] Clearwater to Buck, 6 July 1911. WMGL ATC 6.
[36] Kent to Clearwater, 12 Sep. 1917. WMGL ATC 8.
[37] Morrison H. Heckscher, 'The American Wing Rooms in the Metropolitan Museum of Art', *Winterthur Portfolio* 46.2 (2012), pp. 161-177 (Table A1).
[38] Kent, 'The Bolles Collection', *MMA Bulletin* 5.1 (January 1910), pp. 1-16 (15). Michael Kammen, *Mystic Chords of Memory: The Transformation of Tradition in American Culture* (New York, 1991), p. 148; Stillinger, *Antiquers*, p. 128.
[39] Clearwater to Buck, 3 May 1909. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1909.'
[40] 'Notes', *MMA Bulletin* 5.1 (January 1910), pp. 25-27 (26)
[41] Whether this was Paul Revere Sr. (1702-1753) or his son Paul Revere Jr. (1735-1818) is unclear.
[42] 'J. H. B.' [John H. Buck] 'Notes', *MMA Bulletin* 7.1 (January 1912), pp. 10-13 (10); 'Rearrangement of Silver Collection', 8.6 (June 1913), p. 138; Buck to CLearwater, 6 Sep. 1910. WMGL ATC 6; Clearwater to Buck, 12 September 1910. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T. Loans 1910'.
[43] Clearwater to Paull, 5 July 1911. WMGL ATC 8.
[44] 'F.V.P. [Florence V. Paull], 'Gifts of American Silver', *Museum of Fine Arts Bulletin* 11.62 (April 1913), pp. 22-25 (25).
[45] 'Copley Portrait in Art Museum', *New York Times,* 12 January 1916; 'A Rare Old Coffee Pot', *New York Times,* 10 July 1921; 'Art Treasures of Middle Ages In a New Display at Museum', *New York TImes,* 16 September 1933.
[46] Clearwater to AIHAS, 15 Dec. 1917. AIHA.
[47] Dr John M. Clarke to H. H. Kohn, 11 May 1920. AIHA.
[48] H. H. Kohn to Dr John M. Clarke, 12 May 1920. AIHA.
[49] E. A. Barber to Clearwater, 4 November 1914. WMGL ATC 4.
[50] Clearwater to Robinson, 13 October 1914. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1914'.
[51] Clearwater to Buck, 3 October 1911. WMGL ATC 6.
[52] Clearwater to Bigelow, 3 October 1911. WMGL ATC 1
[53] Clearwater to Robinson, 10 November 1911. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1911'.
[54] Buck to Clearwater, 7 September 1911 (marks), Clearwater to Buck, 3 October 1911 (post-1776 silver), Clearwater to Buck, 28 October (Winslow) and 8 November 1910 (transmutation). WMGL ATC 6.
[55] Clearwater to T. V. Carey, 6 December 1911. WMGL ATC 2.
[56] Buck to Clearwater, 5 July 1911. WMGL ATC 6. Clearwater lent a coin and banknote designed by Revere to the Met in October 1919. He later urged the investment banker-turned-scholar Hermann F. Clarke to write a biography of Revere. Clearwater to Clarke, 9 November 1932. WMGL ATC 2. Clearwater to Breck, 2 Oct. 1919. WMGL ATC 6.
[57] Clearwater to Clarke, 9 November 1932. WMGL ATC 2. Clearwater to Breck, 2 October 1919. WMGL ATC 6.
[58] Clearwater to Robinson, 10 November 1911 ('regard'), Clearwater to Buck, 23 May 1911 ('idea'). WMGL ATC 6
[59] Hillary Murtha, 'The Reuben Bliss Bedchamber at the Brooklyn Museum of Art: A Case Study in the History of Museum Period Room Installations', *Winterthur Portfolio* 40.4 (2005): 205-218.
[60] For an account of a 1946 expedition, see Jeanne Schinto, 'The Walpole Society Goes to Dinner', *Gastronomica* 8.4 2008): 34-45.
[61] Catherine L. Whalen, 'American Decorative Arts Studies at Yale and Winterthur: The Politics of Gender, Gentility, and Academia', *Studies in the Decorative Arts* [Bard Graduate Center], 9.1 (2001), pp. 108-144 (110, 111).
[62] Stillinger, *Antiquers*, p. 167.
[63] Henry Kent, *What I Am Pleased to Call My Education* (New York, 1949), p. 7.
[64] Robinson to Clearwater, 14 January 1915. WMGL ATC 9.
[65] R. T. H. Halsey, 'The Clearwater Collection of Colonial Silver', *MMA Bulletin* 11.1 (January 1916), pp. 3-9.
[66] Halsey to Clearwater, 16 September 1918. WMGL ATC 8.
[67] 'Notes', *MMA Bulletin* 7.6 (June 1912), pp. 118-21 (119).
[68] Plimpton to Clearwater, 2 April 1920. WMGL ATC 9. See Kevin D. Murphy, 'A Presentation Case for the Marquis de Lafayette: Memory and Geography in the Early Republic,' *West 86th: A Journal of Decorative Arts, Design History, and Material Culture* 20.1 (2013).
[69] Clearwater to Avery, 4 September 1919; Avery to Clearwater, 26 June 1919. WMGL ATC 6.
[70] Avery, *Silver,* p. 64.
[71] Clearwater to Kent, 12 June 1919. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1919'. See also Avery, *Silver*, p. 84.

[72] My thanks to Medill Higgins Harvey, Ruth Bigelow Wriston Associate Curator of American Decorative Arts at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, for making this information available.
[73] Avery, *Silver*, xi.
[74] Review cited in 'American Silver of the XVII and XVIII Centuries', *MMA Bulletin* 16.3 (March 1921), pp. 64-5 (65).
[75] 'The Designers and the Museum', *MMA Bulletin* 12.4 (April 1917), pp. 93-94 (94).
[76] Clearwater to Henry F. Davidson, 28 May 1918, Clearwater to Kent, 28 June 1916, Kent to Clearwater, 26 November 1919 and 18 June 1920, Arthur Munn to Clearwater, 1 September 1926. WMGL ATC 8 and 5. See Antoniette M. Guglielmo, 'Workbench of American Taste: Richard F. Bach, Industrial Art, and Consumerism at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1917-40' (DPhil thesis, University of California Santa Barbara 2008).
[77] Clearwater to Kent, 15 March 1928. WMGL ATC 8.
[78] Tiffany & Co., *The Clearwater Collection at the Metropolitan Museum of Art* (undated brochure). AIHA.
[79] Kammen, *Mystic Chords*, p. 248.
[80] 'Puppet Tableaux to Teach History', *New York Times,* 2 January 1910.
[81] Curran, *Invention,* p. 152; Denenberg, *Wallace Nutting*, pp. 90, 91 (quote).
[82] Halsey and Tower, *Homes of Our Ancestors* (New York, 1925), Figs 94, 178
[83] See Halsey and Tower, op. cit. (note 73), xxii.
[84] Clearwater to Howe, 19 June 1931. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1931'. For similar, earlier accounts see Bradley, *Knickerbocker*, pp. 101-2.
[85] Halsey and Tower, *Homes*, x. Bradley, *Knickerbocker*, p. 109.
[86] Robert De Forest also sat on the same Commission. Gail E. H. Evans, 'Storm Over Niagara: A Catalyst in Reshaping Government in the United States and Canada During the Progressive Era', *Natural Resources Journal* 32.1 (1992), pp. 27-54. His friend and fellow silver collection Francis Hill Bigelow was Treasurer of the National Highways Association, which supported the creation of federal highways that would, among other ends, encourage Americans to 'See America First', that is, before travelling to Europe. Marguerite S. Shaffer, *See America First: Tourism and National Identity, 1880-1940* (Washington, DC, 2001), pp. 155-9.
[87] Mary Lord Fairbanks, 'The Native Arts of Our Foreign Population', *Art and Progress* 3.6 (1912), pp. 550-3 (551).
[88] Laura W. L. Scales, 'The Museum's Part in the Making of Americans', *MMA Bulletin* 12.9 (September 1917), pp. 191-3 (191).
[89] Ilana Abramovitch, 'America's Making Exposition and Festival (New York, 1921): Immigrants Gifts on the Altar of America' (DPhil diss., NYU 1996), p. 32. See also Clif Stratton, *Education for Empire: American, Schools, Race, and th Paths of Good Citizenship* (Berkeley, 2016), pp. 168f.
[90] Renée Ater, 'Making History: Meta Warrick Fuller's 'Ethiopia'', *American Art* 17.3 (2003), pp. 12-31 (17).
[91] 'America's Making', *MMA Bulletin* 16.10 (October 1921), pp. 205-206 (206).
[92] Wendy Kaplan, 'R. T. H. Halsey: An Ideology of Collecting American Decorative Arts', *Winterthur Portfolio* 17.1 (1982), pp. 43-53 (50). See also Davidson, 'American Things', 231.
[93] Halsey, 'Clearwater', p. 8.
[95] Clearwater, 'The Undervaluation of American Citizenship', *Proceedings of the New York State Historical Association* 13 (1914), pp. 71-84 (73, 77, 78, 79).
[96] 'Wage Hot Fight for Social Laws', *New York Times* 14 August 1915.
[97] Clearwater, 'The Undervaluation of American Citizenship', *Proceedings of the Forty-Sixth Annual Meeting of the New York State Bar Association* (Albany, 1923), pp. 314-42 (316, 317). 'Jurist Sees Peril in Alien Hordes', *New York Times,* 21 January 1923.
[98] Matthew Frye Jacobson, *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race* (Cambridge, MA, 1999), pp. 81-90. Grant cited in Art M. Blake, *How New York Became American, 1890-1924* (Baltimore, 2020), p. 124. As Blake notes, however, tourist literature continued to present immigrant neighbourhoods as picturesque, rather than dangerous.
[99] Julie M. Powell, 'Making 'The Case Against the Reds': Racializing Communism, 1919-20', in Travis D. Boyce and Winsome M. Chunnu, eds., *Historicizing Fear: Ignorance, Vilification, and Othering* (Louisville, CO, 2020), pp. 102-121 (104). See also E. Digby Baltzell, *The Protestant Establishment: Aristocracy and Caste in America* (New York, 1964), ch. 9.
[100] Clearwater to F. H. Bigelow, 19 July 1928. WMGL ATC 1.
[101] Ralston to Clearwater, 7 January 1931, de Forest to Breck, 15 January 1931; Breck to de Forest, 16 January 1931, de Forest to Clearwater, 17 January 1931, Clearwater to de Forest, 20 January 1931. MMAA OSR 'Clearwater, Alphonso T., Loans 1931'. See also Winlock to Clearwater 25 July 1933 and Clearwater to Winlock, 27 July 1933. WMGL ATC 9.

[102] John S. Higgins to Clearwater, 22 January 1925, Clearwater to Elizabeth Stoney, 11 September 1922. WMGL ATC 3 and 5.
[103] Avery, 'The Clearwater Collection', *MMA Bulletin* 29.6 (June 1934), pp. 89-98 (92).
[104] Clearwater to Breck, 2 Oct. 1919. WMGL ATC 6.
[105] Heckscher, 'American Wing Rooms', p. 172.
[106] Clearwater to Coffin, 10 February 1933. WMGL ATC 7.
[107] Clearwater to Kent, 27 April 1921, cited in Wees, *Early American Silver,* p. 15.
[108] Clearwater to Kohn, 12 Nov. 1921. AIHA.