PALEOCEANOGRAPHY, VOL. ???, XXXX, DOI:10.1029/,

# Organic Carbon Burial following the Middle Eocene Climatic Optimum (MECO) in the central - western Tethys

D.J.A. Spofforth<sup>1</sup>, C. Agnini<sup>2</sup>, H. Pälike<sup>1</sup>, D. Rio<sup>2</sup>, E. Fornaciari<sup>2</sup>, L.

Giusberti<sup>2</sup>, V. Luciani<sup>3</sup>, L. Lanci<sup>4</sup>, G. Muttoni<sup>5</sup>

(1) School of Ocean and Earth Science, University of Southampton, UK

(2) Department of Geosciences, University of Padua, Italy

(3) Department of Earth Sciences, University of Ferrara, Italy

(4) Instituto di Dinamica Ambientale, University of Urbino, Italy

(5) Department of Earth Sciences, University of Milano, Italy

David JA Spofforth & Heiko Pälike, University of Southampton, School of Ocean and Earth Science, European Way, Southampton, SO14 3ZH, U.K. (djas@noc.soton.ac.uk, heiko.palike@noc.soton.ac.uk).

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

#### 1 Abstract

We present trace metal geochemistry and stable isotope records for the mid-2 dle Eocene Alano di Piave section, NE Italy, deposited during magnetochron 3 C18n in the marginal Tethys Ocean. We identify a  $\sim 500$  kyr long carbon 4 isotope perturbation event we infer to be the middle Eocene Climatic Op-5 timum (MECO) confirming the northern hemisphere expression and global 6 occurrence of MECO. Interpreted peak climatic conditions are followed by 7 the rapid deposition of two organic rich intervals ( $\leq 3\%$  TOC) and contem-8 poraneous positive  $\delta^{13}$ C excursions. These two intervals are associated with 9 increases in the concentration of sulphur and redox-sensitive trace metals, 10 and low concentrations of Mn, as well as coupled with the occurrence of pyrite. 11 Together these changes imply low, possibly dysoxic, bottom water  $O_2$  con-12 ditions promoting increased organic carbon burial. We hypothesize that this 13 rapid burial of organic carbon lowered global  $pCO_2$  following the peak warm-14 ing and returned the climate system to the general Eocene cooling trend. 15

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

DRAFT

X - 2

#### 1. Introduction

Peak Cenozoic warmth during the Early Eocene Climatic Optimum ( $\sim 50 - 52$  Ma) 16 [Zachos et al., 2001] was followed by gradually cooling temperatures through the Eocene 17 with the development of permanent ice-sheets on Antarctica around the Eocene-Oligocene 18 boundary ( $\sim 33.8$  Ma) [Zachos et al., 1996; Coxall et al., 2005; Lear et al., 2008]. This 19 long term cooling has been mostly attributed to decreased atmospheric  $pCO_2$  and its 20 feedbacks within the climate system [Raymo, 1991; Berner and Kothavala, 2001; DeConto 21 and Pollard, 2003; Pagani et al., 2005; Liu et al., 2009]. Reconstructions of past Cenozoic 22  $pCO_2$  suggest concentrations decreased stepwise from 1000 - 1500 ppmV in the middle -23 late Eocene to near modern day values by the late Oligocene [Paqani et al., 2005]. 24

Superimposed on the Eocene long term cooling trend are a series of transient positive 25 and negative oxygen isotope excursions interpreted as warming [Bohaty and Zachos, 2003; 26 Sexton et al., 2006; Edgar et al., 2007b; Ivany et al., 2008; Bohaty et al., 2009] and cooling 27 and/or glaciation events [Tripati et al., 2005; Edgar et al., 2007b]. Climate model results 28 for the Eocene Antarctic run under several possible  $pCO_2$  conditions indicate that small 20 ephemeral ice sheets may have been possible under weak greenhouse conditions *DeConto* 30 and Pollard, 2003; DeConto et al., 2008] and even small ice caps at elevated regions were 31 possible under higher  $pCO_2$  with favorable orbital configurations. Similarly, prominent 32 changes in the calcium compensation depth in the equatorial Pacific [Rea and Lyle, 2005] 33 further suggest that the middle Eocene experienced large changes within the global carbon 34 cycle. 35

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

Short lived negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursions punctuate the Eocene [Cramer et al., 2003; Lourens 36 et al., 2005; Sexton et al., 2006; Nicolo et al., 2007; Edgar et al., 2007b]. Some of these 37 have previously been inferred to represent short-lived warming events e.g. [Sluijs et al., 38 2008a, b]. However, at least one longer transient warming event is recorded during the 39 Eocene [Bohaty and Zachos, 2003; Bohaty et al., 2009]. During the middle Eocene climatic 40 optimum (MECO) [Bohaty and Zachos, 2003; Bohaty et al., 2009] Southern Ocean deep 41 water temperatures warmed by up to  $4^{\circ}$ C and lasted for ~ 500 kyrs before rapidly cooling. 42 Recent identification of a positive  $\delta^{13}$ C anomaly in the Tethys [Jovane et al., 2007] has 43 been tentatively correlated to the MECO event, and confirmed by new dating of the 44 original sites [Bohaty et al., 2009], suggesting a global occurrence of this event. 45

On timescales of several hundred thousand years chemical weathering of silicate rocks 46 and the rate of volcanic gas emissions control  $pCO_2$  concentrations, but shorter timescale 47 variations require different mechanisms. The Paleocene – Eocene thermal maximum 48 (PETM), for example, is frequently explained by rapid ( $< 10^4$  yr [Zachos et al., 2005]) 49 release and oxidation of CH<sub>4</sub> clathrates to pCO<sub>2</sub> [Dickens et al., 1995; Thomas et al., 50 2002] leading to 4 - 5°C deep sea [Kennett and Stott, 1991; Zachos et al., 2001] and 5 -51 8°C of global surface warming [Zachos et al., 2003; Sluijs et al., 2006, 2008a]. Similarly 52 rapid decreases in  $pCO_2$  can also occur through increased productivity and/or increased 53 rates of organic carbon burial [John et al., 2008] on similar time scales, as well as changes 54 in chemical weathering rates of terrestrial carbonates [Archer et al., 1998; Ridgwell and 55 Hargreaves, 2007; Stap et al., 2009]. 56

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

Here we identify the northern hemisphere occurrence and confirm the timing of MECO from a site in the central-western Tethys. High resolution bulk sediment stable isotope 58 and percentage  $CaCO_3$  studies are coupled with bulk sediment geochemistry and kerogen 59 analysis to investigate paleoenvironmental responses to this climatic perturbation. We 60 report previously unrecorded locally low bottom water oxygen saturation following the main excursion of the event. We suggest that high organic carbon burial immediately following MECO is the most likely mechanism for reduction in  $pCO_2$  and the return to

the general cooling trend. 64

## 2. Methods

57

61

62

63

#### 2.1. Materials

The middle/late Eocene Alano di Piave section outcrops in the Belluno Basin in the 65 Southern Alps of NE Italy (Figure 1). Comprising part of the middle Eocene - upper 66 Eocene Marna Scagliosa di Alano formation [Agnini et al., (in press) 2009], this section 67 outcrops along the Calcino Creek close to Alano di Piave village (Latitude 45°54'50"N, 68 Longitude 11°54'55"E). The lithology consists mainly of bathyal grey marks, with oc-69 casional inducated limestones beds. This formation outcrops for  $\sim 110$  m stratigraphic 70 thickness and was deposited in middle-upper bathyal water depths (L.Giusberti. unpubl. 71 data). Paleoenvironmental reconstructions (Figure 1A,C) of the Tethys region [Dercourt 72 et al., 1993; Smith et al., 1994; Scotese, 2002; Bosellini and Papazzoni, 2003] suggest that 73 the climate was predominately sub-tropical and that the Alano section was deposited to 74 the east of a carbonate platform and within  $\sim 100 - 150$  km of land. 75

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

Х-6

Sediment samples were collected at each lithological change or every 20 cm if individual beds were thicker than this. The average sample spacing for all samples was  $\sim$  20cm. During sample collection all weathered material was removed. In this study we particularly focus on a darker organic rich interval  $\sim$  17-25 m down the river valley from where rocks first outcrop.

Stratigraphically the interval from 17 - 25 m is characterized by dark colored marks with rare sub-cm scale clay horizons, increases in the amount of pyrite and occasional laminated sediments. The top of the interval is marked by a coarse calcareous arenite, the Palladio Bed, overlain by a  $\sim$  20 cm thick low CaCO<sub>3</sub> clay layer before a return to more marly deposition. The dark colored interval is split into 2 units by a lighter colored interval from  $\sim$  19 - 21 m.

Geochemical, magnetic and biostratigraphic data were obtained using standard methods
for the entire Alano section (see supplementary information).

## 3. Results

## 3.1. Magnetobiostratigraphic framework

The Alano di Piave section extends from calcareous nannofossil zone NP16 to zone NP19-20 [Martini, 1971], and from planktonic foraminiferal zone E10-E11 to zone E15 [Berggren and Pearson, 2005]. Magnetostratigraphic data indicates that this section was deposited between the upper part of magnetochron C18r and the very base of chron C16r [Cande and Kent, 1995]. The present biochronology available for the middle to late Eocene interval is based on a limited dataset in Berggren et al. [1995]. The age estimates obtained for first, last and peak occurrences of biostratigraphic markers from

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

the Alano section based on linear sedimentation rates applied to the magnetostratigra-96 phy Pälike et al. [2006a], differ from those presented in Berggren et al. [1995]. They are, 97 however, consistent with calibrations obtained for calcareous nannofossil and planktonic 98 foraminifera from Blake Nose (ODP Site 1052) [Wade, 2004]. The age model (Figure 99 S1) developed by us (supplementary information) and applied here, relies on the magne-100 tostratigraphic framework and dates this section from the top of chron C18r to the base 101 of chron C16r (40.96 - 36.50 Ma using the *Pälike et al.* [2006a] timescale). Additionally, 102 as recorded in Contessa [Jovane et al., 2007] and at ODP Site 1051 [Edgar et al., 2007a] 103 the first occurence of the key biostratigraphic datum Orbulinoides beckmanni coincides, 104 here at Alano, with the onset of MECO confirming the magnetostratigraphic placement 105 of the event. 106

# 3.2. Bulk $\delta^{13}$ C and $\delta^{18}$ O Isotope Data

Isotope results from the Alano section are shown in Figure 2. These show a gradual 107 decrease of ~ 0.5% in both  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O up section. The CaCO<sub>3</sub> content also decreases 108 from  $\sim 50\%$  to  $\sim 45\%$  over the same interval. Superimposed on this overall trend is a 109 prominent transient isotope excursion beginning at ~13 m (Figure 3). Bulk  $\delta^{18}$ O records 110 a negative shift of up to -1.8 % with the minimum  $\delta^{18}$ O values (labeled A in Figure 3) 111 at  $\sim 17$  m, coincident with the beginning of the first darker unit and representing the 112 peak of the event. Similarly  $\delta^{13}$ C and CaCO<sub>3</sub> record minimum values of 0.2 % (from ~ 113 1‰) and 20% (from 50%) respectively. Although the  $\delta^{18}$ O record gradually recovers to 114 near-pre-event values by 25 m, the  $\delta^{13}$ C and CaCO<sub>3</sub> records are more complex (Figure 3) 115 and are strongly correlated to the observed lithological changes. Two rapid positive  $\delta^{13}$ C 116

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

excursions (labeled B and D) are interrupted by a negative excursion to near peak event values at ~ 19 - 21 m (labeled C). The two positive carbon isotope excursions are similar in magnitude (1.25 ‰) and are coincident with elevated organic carbon content (up to 3%)(Figure 3). At the beginning of the first darker interval the CaCO<sub>3</sub> recovers to maximum values occurring in the 19 - 21 m interval. A small decrease (~ 5%) is recorded during the positive  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion during the second organic rich layer.

#### 3.3. Organic Carbon

X - 8

Two organic rich units are recognised (from here on referred to as ORG1 and ORG2) 123 and are recorded in TOC data (Figure 3). Pre-event and post-event values are low around 124 0.1 - 0.15 % rising to a peak of 3.1 % between 16.8 and 19 m and 21 - 25.5 m, respectively. 125 Within each organic rich unit the amount of TOC present is not constant but appears to 126 vary cyclically (Figure 3). In particular, ORG2 between 20.9 - 25.5 m has 4 prominent 127 peaks in organic carbon content,  $\sim 1.4$  m apart. The major component of organic carbon 128 in these intervals is marine amorphous organic matter, although minor amounts of wood, 129 pollen, fungal spores, dinocysts and rare benthic foraminifer linings are also present. 130

 $\delta^{13}C_{org}$  analysis of organic material (Figure 3) follows the same trend and pattern as the TOC data. Negative isotope excursions of ~ 1‰ occur within both organic rich intervals. The initial excursion leads the TOC increase by ~ 40 cm in ORG1 while the shift associated with ORG2 has occurred by ~ 21.5 m, coincident with the second TOC spike. The ORG2 data is ambiguous as to whether  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$  leads or lags the TOC data.

#### 3.4. Bulk Sediment Geochemistry

# <sup>136</sup> 3.4.1. CaCO<sub>3</sub>, TOC and Detrital inputs

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

Immediately following the maximum negative carbon isotope excursion there are strong 137 lithological indicators in the form of organic rich dark shales and clay layers that there were 138 variations in the paleoceanographic conditions at this time. Assuming the Si content of the 139 sediment to be of detrital origin, the slope of the Al-Si plot (Figure S2) shows an average 140 shale value of  $\sim 3$ , we assume that sediment input consists of the mutual dilution between 141 detrital and calcareous biogenic material. The peak detrital contribution (represented by 142 the concentration of Al in Figure 3) occurs immediately before ORG1 coincident with 143 the most negative  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ . At the same time minimum CaCO<sub>3</sub> values of around 20% are 144 recorded. As CaCO<sub>3</sub> recovers, [Al] and the CaCO<sub>3</sub> records appear to anti-correlate. 145

The behavior of organic carbon with respect to both lithogenic and biogenic components is more complex. The initial increase in organic carbon content occurs after the peak in detrital content of the sediment during the initial recovery of  $CaCO_3$  (B, Figure 3). Following ORG1, but prior to ORG2,  $CaCO_3$ , TOC and [Al] all resemble conditions prior to the negative oxygen isotope excursion (C, Figure 3). During ORG2 the TOC and  $CaCO_3$  records are out of phase by 180°, and detrital material is in phase representing the mutual dilution occurring (D, Figure 3).

## <sup>153</sup> 3.4.2. Paleo-oxygenation

Paleo-oxygenation proxies, such as U, U/Th, V/Cr, and Ni/Co, have been used to determine water column oxygenation conditions through large periods of geological time from Quaternary sapropels [*Thomson et al.*, 1995], Jurassic mudstones [*Jones and Manning*, 1994] to the Cambrian [*Powell et al.*, 2003]. U measurements within both ORG1 and ORG2 are on average around 3 ppm, with occasional increases to 5 ppm, with back-

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

<sup>159</sup> ground values of near zero. Ni/Co ratios are greater than 5, while V/Cr and U/Th are <sup>160</sup> less than 2 and 0.75 respectively. V/Cr does, however, increase during ORG1 and ORG2 <sup>161</sup> (Figure 3) from around 1 to a maximum of 1.4. Mn/Al profiles generated through the <sup>162</sup> section show significant decreases during both ORG1 and ORG2 with spikes immediately <sup>163</sup> following the decrease in TOC concentration (Figure 3).

A qualitative increase in the amount of pyrite is observed from the analysis of the organic 164 residues and from the  $\geq 63 \ \mu m$  residue for a miniferal analyses within both ORG intervals. 165 S values are on average 0.05% of the bulk sediment but rise to greater than 1% at times in 166 the organic rich intervals (Figure 3). These increases in concentration are coincident with 167 peaks in TOC and the maximum negative excursions recorded in  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ . Similarly Fe/Al 168 shows a small relative increase during these intervals. Principal component analysis of the 169 geochemical data set (Figure S3) indicates that both Fe and S are important constituents 170 of the sediment within ORG 1 and 2 and correlate with the observed increase in pyrite 171 and measured TOC. 172

The non-biological elements, (e.g. Cr, U, V) all show relatively small increases in elemental ratios during the high organic intervals, associated with the peaks in S content (Figure S4). However, they do not show the large enrichments as seen in present day anoxic environments such as the Black Sea, or in previous ocean anoxic events. The biogenic metals Zn, Ni and Cu show small (2 fold) enrichment on background values ( $\sim$  4 fold on average shale values) coincident with high TOC values and elevated S concentrations in the sediment (Figures 3, S4).

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

## 4. Discussion

#### 4.1. Comparison to other MECO records

Our records from Alano document a perturbation to the Earth's climate system that 180 interrupted the long term cooling of the Eocene. Previous  $\delta^{13}$ C isotopic studies, both bulk 181 and benthic foraminifera, are presented alongside the bulk  $\delta^{13}$ C signal from the Alano sec-182 tion (Figure 4). The Alano data are plotted using the age model constructed in section 183 3.1 and appear to indicate an  $\sim 100$  kyr older offset for the maximum negative isotope 184 excursion. Using carbon isotope stratigraphy the salient features of the carbon isotope 185 record at Alano can be correlated to other global sections (tie points A-E (Figure 4). 186 Additionally by comparing the occurrence of key biostratigraphic datums, in particular 187 the calcareous planktonic foraminifer P13 marker species O. beckmanni, as well as the 188 calcareous nannofossils Discoaster bisectus and Sphenolithus furcatolithoides a clear case 180 can be made to correlate the isotope perturbations recorded at Alano with the previously 190 documented MECO event [Bohaty and Zachos, 2003; Bohaty et al., 2009]. We suggest 191 that the uncertainity in the placement of the base of the magnetochron 18n.2n. bound-192 ary means that, within error of the age model, that the maximum  $\delta^{13}$ C negative isotope 193 excursion (labelled B, Figure 4, S5) is correlatable across the global suite of sites plotted 194 in Figure 4 (a full discussion of this is given in the supplementary information). Further-195 more, both bulk and for a miniferal records show a positive  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion of up to 1.2% 196 immediately after the maximum negative excursion and occurring within 50 - 150 kyrs. 197 Within the central-western Tethys our record from Alano shows a strong isotopic cor-198 relation with other deep ocean records, which cannot be seen in the Contessa section 199 (Figure 4). The previous identification of MECO for the Contessa section was associ-200

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

ated with the positive  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion by *Jovane et al.* [2007]. This excursion can be re-interpreted with respect to the new Alano correlation to represent the positive  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion immediately after the event (B as marked in Figure 3).

Interestingly, the gradual excursion to minimum  $\delta^{13}$ C values seen at Alano is mirrored by similar patterns at ODP Site 1051 and 1263 and DSDP Site 523 (Figure 4). However, it is not recorded in the fine fraction at S. Ocean sites or in the benthic foraminiferal values from there. There a number of reasons that may account for these observed differences, including diagenetic histories, and at Alano oxidation of organic matter in the near shore environment and continental input of organic rich material to surface waters.

<sup>210</sup> The other prominent features of the Alano record, the positive  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion associated <sup>211</sup> with ORG 2, and the intervening large negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion, are not as well defined in <sup>212</sup> the other records. We suggest that small negative excursions at ODP Sites 702, 738 and <sup>213</sup> 748 at ~ 39.7 Ma (labeled D+E Figure 4), and at ODP Sites 1051 and 1263 at 39.8 Ma <sup>214</sup> may also be recording these two other features.

## 4.2. Organic Carbon Burial and Low Oxygenation of Bottom Waters

Post-MECO conditions have different lithological expressions between the central Tethyan record and the MECO event documented in the Southern Ocean, Blake Nose and other deep ocean sites. Mn is frequently used as an indicator of the sediment water interface oxygenation conditions since it precipitates as oxy-hydroxides within the range of Eh and pH values of well oxidised seawater. If the dissolved  $O_2$  concentration decreases then the solubility of oxy-hydroxides increases and  $Mn^{2+}$  is reductively leached from the sediment under sub-oxic to anoxic conditions [*Dickens and Owen*, 1994]. Previous work

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

on depth profiles showed that Mn<sup>2+</sup> displayed this behavior in modern day oxygen mini-222 mum zones [Klinkhammer, 1980; Saager et al., 1989] when  $[O_2]$  dropped below ~ 2ml/L. 223 In general the increased  $Mn^{2+}$  concentration comes from dissolution of  $Mn^{2+}$  phases in 224 situ within the sediment. Minima in Mn/Al correlate with increased preservation of or-225 ganic material and also pyrite occurrence, high sulphur contents, together with locally 226 clay rich and laminated layers. Together these suggest the bottom water and pore water 227 environment became  $O_2$  depleted. Proxies for paleo-oxygenation conditions, such as [U], 228 V/Cr, and Ni/Co give a mixed interpretation of the bottom water environment. Two 229 values for the concentration of U at the oxic – dysoxic boundary in seawater have previ-230 ously been suggested; 5 ppm [Jones and Manning, 1994] and 2 ppm [Wignall and Ruffel, 231 1990]. The Alano ORG intervals record values between these two (Figure 3) and suggests 232 that the low  $O_2$  conditions existed. Further evidence comes from the paleoecology of 233 benthic foraminifera within ORG1 and ORG2. Increases in the abundance of Uvigerina, 234 a taxon common in  $O_2$  depleted, organically enriched settings [Gooday, 2003] together 235 with increases in other biserial and triserial taxon (e.g. bolivinids) and the species Hanza-236 waia ammophila are recorded. This latter taxa has been reported in high abundances in 237 Ypresian sapropels of the Peri-Tethys and has been interpreted as an indicator of dysoxic 238 conditions [Oberhänsli, 2000]. Different values from less than 2 to 0.3 ml/l have been 239 placed on the bottom  $O_2$  conditions indicated by these taxa [Tyson and Pearson, 1991; 240 Kaiho, 1994] and this agrees well with the  $O_2$  constraint from the observed Mn front. 241 Furthermore, the spikes in Mn/Al immediately preceeding both ORG1 and ORG2, in-242 dicate good correlation between re-oxygenation of pore waters and a decrease in organic 243

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

carbon preservation. The offset between the TOC record marking the end of ORG1 and the inorganic bulk carbonate  $\delta^{13}$ C record indicates that preservation of organic carbon in ORG1 was probably affected by burn down of the organic material after deposition. ORG2 is not similarly affected but the rapid change in lithology described at the top of this bed is indicative of a hiatus removing an unknown amount of material and time.

At the present day, terrestrial organic matter has a more negative  $\delta^{13}$ C signal than 249 marine organic matter and the negative  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$  excursions during the burial of ORG1 and 250 ORG2 therefore suggest an increased delivery of terrestrial organic matter to the sediment. 251 This would suggest that increased terrestrial material would provide increased nutrients to 252 the sea surface and increase productivity. This interpretation is consistent with calcareous 253 nannofossil assemblage changes from oligotrophic to euthrophic taxa [Aquini et al., 2007b] 254 which suggest a high food high productivity ocean. At the same time minima in the  $\leq$ 255  $63\mu$ m size fraction (not shown) suggests a shift to more chemical weathering indicative of 256 wetter more humid environments, or a shift in palaeocoastal position to deeper waters. 257

Increases in the relative proportion of detrital material are synchronous with the max-258 imum negative isotope conditions and the  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$  excursion suggesting that terrestrially 259 derived nutrients, rather than upwelling, was a source to feed this productivity increase. 260 Further evidence for terrestrial input comes from the preservation of spores, pollen and 261 wood identified in the organic residues. The increase in nutrients prior to the MECO 262 peak suggests that an increase in rain rate of organic material would lead to increased O<sub>2</sub> 263 utilization in bottom waters and in the sediment leading to a dysoxic bottom water en-264 vironment and more reducing conditions in the sediment allowing the formation of pyrite 265

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

and the increased solubility of  $Mn^{2+}$ . Small increases in the sulphide fixed trace elements (Figure S4) suggest that anoxia was reached neither in the sediment nor the water column for any extended period of time.

Several potential mechanisms could have caused the low oxygenation conditions. An 269 increase in nutrients would lead to an increase in productivity in surface waters and 270 sediment rain to bottom waters where increased  $O_2$  utilization in the decomposition of 271 organic matter would lead to the generation of dysoxic water conditions. Secondly changes 272 in bottom water temperatures, if present, may act to decrease the solubility of  $O_2$  in the 273 waters and promote dysoxia. A third alternative mechanisms could involve the upwelling 274 of a low  $O_2$  water upwelled from depth bathing the site as suggested for black shale 275 formation during the PETM in the eastern Tethys [Speijer and Morsi, 2002]. Fourthly, 276 more sluggish ocean circulation driven by possible increases in ocean temperature (e.g. 277 Bohaty et al. [2009] would have decreased the rate at which  $O_2$  poor waters were replaced. 278 The productivity driven mechanism for ORG burial, similar to OAE2 of the Cretaceous 279 [Schlanger and Jenkyns, 1976], would likely be coupled with an increase in sedimentation 280 rate during this interval, both from increased terrestrial input and in increases in produc-281 tivity of calcareous organisms, which are seen to shift towards euthrophic taxa [Aquini 282 et al., 2007a; Luciani et al., 2009]. Similar increases in sedimentation rate are seen in 283 expanded PETM sections in the Belluno Basin [Giusberti et al., 2007] and other marginal 284 marine sections [Sluijs et al., 2008b]. However, the age model presented in section 3.1 285 maintains a constant linear sedimentation rate across these intervals. The placement of 286 magnetochron C18n.2r (supplementary information) is poorly constrained, however, it 28

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

X - 15

## X - 16 SPOFFORTH ET AL.: ORGANIC CARBON BURIAL FOLLOWING MECO

tentatively suggests sedimentation rates up to 6 times faster during the ORG2 interval, 288 consistent with the productivity hypothesis. Together with an increased sedimentation 289 rate the combination of increased burial rate of organic carbon, and the decreased  $[O_2]$ 290 resulted in increased preservation of organic carbon within the sediment. Variations in the 291 amount of TOC preserved in ORG2 appear cyclic and suggest a strong orbital control on 292 the preservation of organic carbon. This increase in LSR results in cycle spacing of  $\sim 17$ 293 kyrs during ORG 2. Reduced preservation could therefore be related to either increased 294  $O_2$  in bottom waters or reduction in productivity in the surface waters driven by orbital 295 variations in run off. 296

During the PETM warming soil and atmospheric moisture increased in the northern 29 mid-latitudes [Bowen et al., 2004], and there was enhanced continental weathering around 298 the Tethyan regions [Bolle and Adatte, 2001]. Increased humidity, fluvial run-off and a 299 strengthening of the hydrological cycle was also seen in the Arctic Ocean [Sluijs et al., 2006; 300 Paqani et al., 2006]. If these responses to global warming at the PETM are considered 301 to be analogous to expected responses to warming during MECO then the fluctuations in 302 TOC may relate to orbital (precessional) driven changes in weathering and fluvial input. 303 Similarly, warmer temperatures may have slowed the rate of ocean circulation. The 304 combination of a slower circulation, high nutrient input and possible fresh water lid to 305 the Tethys could have led to ocean stratification and driven the low  $O_2$  conditions at this 306 site promoting organic carbon burial and preservation. 307

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

#### 5. Mechanisms of global change

The organic carbon burial following the maximum negative carbon isotope excursion is the first documented for MECO at any of the globally distributed sites. This may in part be related to the very different geographic location occupied by Alano compared to the deep ocean sites reported by *Bohaty et al.* [2009] or the oxidation of organic carbon in the deep ocean. The organic carbon burial recorded here allows us to briefly speculate on the recovery of this transient warming event.

#### 5.1. Recovery to the general cooling trend

The two main mechanisms for drawing down  $pCO_2$  are, (1) increased burial of organic 314 burial and (2) increased weathering of silicate rocks. Both operate on significantly different 315 timescales (kyrs and Myrs respectively). Deep sea benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O records from the Southern 316 Ocean (Figure 4) [Bohaty and Zachos, 2003; Bohaty et al., 2009] show a rapid recovery to 317 pre-warming values on timescales of less than 100 kyrs. Globally the increased  $\delta^{13}$ C values 318 both at Alano and from other records distributed globally (Figure 1) suggest an increase 319 in the the rate of organic burial relative to total carbon burial, although a number of 320 assumptions have to be made for this interpretation of the  $\delta^{13}$ C record [Kump and Arthur, 321 1999]. The record at Alano, bears close similarities to Cretaceous records of ocean anoxic 322 events [Schlanger and Jenkyns, 1976] where  $\delta^{13}$ C records a geologically instantaneous very 323 rapid shift to higher values, associated with large burial of organic carbon and for OAE 2 324 a productivity driven cause of anoxia. 325

The initial increases in detrital material and  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$  recorded at Alano prior to the acme of the negative  $\delta^{13}C$  excursion suggest that the nutrient driven increase in productivity

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

and subsequent increased utilization and storage began prior to this point, but only had 328 an effect when either the source of  $pCO_2$  was switched off, or the preservation of organic 329 material became greater than the  $pCO_2$  input. The high TOC values at the Alano section 330 suggest that burial of organic carbon could provide a major sink for  $pCO_2$  after warming 331 and rapidly lower atmospheric  $pCO_2$ . Further evidence for organic carbon burial being a 332 probable  $pCO_2$  sink comes from deepening of the CCD over  $10^4$  yrs immediately following 333 peak warming [Bohaty et al., 2009] and increased mass accumulation rates of organic 334 carbon at ODP Site 1218 [Lyle and Lyle, 2006]. Alternatively, weathering of terrestrial 335 CaCO<sub>3</sub> [*Ridqwell and Hargreaves*, 2007] has been suggested for the recovery of the CCD 336 at the ETM2 [Stap et al., 2009] and could potentially negate the need for organic carbon 337 burial. 338

The enhanced preservation and burial of organic carbon was driven by both a decrease 339 in bottom water oxygenation conditions and an increase in nutrient supply to surface 340 waters at Alano. Previous records of MECO come from deep-sea sites with little evidence 341 of increased carbon burial, although Site 1218 in the equatorial Pacific records an increase 342 in organic carbon accumulation rates [Lyle and Lyle, 2006; Lyle et al., 2008]. However, 343 if burial was mainly restricted to marginal and continental shelf sites, as 90% of present 344 day organic burial is [Hedges and Keil, 1995], then as yet these records will not have been 345 discovered and further sections remain to be studied to confirm or reject this hypothesis. 346

# 5.2. Removal of organic carbon from the atmosphere

Average TOC values are give in table 1 and show an order of magnitude increase in ORG1 and ORG2 compared to the pre-CIE and post event. Could this burial of organic

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

<sup>349</sup> carbon be sufficient to cause the positive carbon isotope excursions seen following the <sup>350</sup> maximum negative  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta^{13}$ C excursions? How much carbon could be removed from <sup>351</sup> the ocean-atmosphere system through accelerated organic carbon burial?

If we assume that TOC values both before the maximum negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion (A), 352 Figure 3, and post recovery (E) represent the average TOC burial during the Eocene, 353 it becomes clear that there was excess carbon burial during the MECO recovery period. 354 However, trying to extrapolate these numbers to determine total carbon burial is not 355 simple, even allowing the assumption that Alano represents global conditions on shelves 356 post peak MECO. Furthermore, present day attempts to estimate carbon fluxes to / from 357 the global ocean and coastal areas has proved difficult [Borges, 2005] and organic flux to 358 the sea floor is very dependent on local and regional conditions creating a heterogeneous 359 coastal ocean. It is possible though, to make some first order calculations to test the 360 possible organic carbon burial mechanism for the recovery from the MECO event. Today, 361 the coastal shelf area is some 26 x10<sup>6</sup> km2 [Walsh, 1991], which is estimated to be  $\sim$ 362 50 - 75 % of the Eocene coastal shelf area [John et al., 2008], when sea-levels were up 363 to and above 100m higher than the present day [Miller et al., 2005]. We consider that 364 our estimate of TOC averaged for intervals A+E (Figure 3) represent background organic 365 carbon sedimentation at this time and therefore the total extra organic carbon burial 366 during ORG1 can be calculated. We assume for this calculation that LSR remained 367 constant and we consider two possible end member dry bulk densities (0.5 and 1 g/cm<sup>3</sup>) 368 to calculate mass accumulation rates. Extrapolated to the whole of the present coastal 369 area this would bury an additional 542 to 872 GT of carbon during ORG1 and 1160 to 370

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

<sup>371</sup> 1656 GT during ORG2. These values are similar to estimates of organic carbon burial <sup>372</sup> on continental settings during the PETM [*John et al.*, 2008] and only slightly less than <sup>373</sup> estimates of carbon released at the PETM: 1500 – 2200 GT C [*Dickens et al.*, 1997] and <sup>374</sup> 4500 GT C [*Zachos et al.*, 2005].

<sup>375</sup> Using our estimate from the first order calculation we apply the increased organic carbon <sup>376</sup> burial over the period of ORG1 to the simple steady state carbon cycle system described <sup>377</sup> by *Kump and Arthur* [1999]. After applying the increased burial to the system we estimate <sup>378</sup> that for the volumes of organic carbon buried above a 0.57% positive isotope excursion <sup>379</sup> should be recorded in the global ocean. Compared to benthic records from the Southern <sup>380</sup> Ocean [*Bohaty et al.*, 2009], this shift accounts for only about two-thirds of the measured <sup>381</sup>  $\delta^{13}$ C positive shift occurring in the first 50 – 100,000 years after the peak of the event.

Two possibilities arise from this observation. 1) That Alano is not a typical section, 382 it is slightly deeper than true coastal sections and the amount of organic carbon buried 383 may well have been higher. Burndown of TOC in ORG 1 is likely to have occurred. 384 Similarly, if Eocene shelf areas estimates are used this will again increase the estimate by 385 a factor of 1.5 - 2.2) That increases in CaCO<sub>3</sub> mass accumulation rates as seen following 386 the event [Bohaty et al., 2009] and also hypothesised by Ridgwell and Zeebe [2005] at 387 the PETM and shown by Stap et al. [2009] for the Eocene thermal maximum 2 (ETM2) 388 and H2 event may explain the rest of the recovery. Previously, silicate weathering was 389 the foremost mechanism for the deepening of the lysocline during the recovery of the 390 PETM [Dickens et al., 1997; Ravizza et al., 2001; Kelly et al., 2005; Zachos et al., 2005]. 391 However, on timescales less than 100 kyrs this mechanism is suggested to be relatively 392

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

<sup>393</sup> ineffective [*Ridgwell and Zeebe*, 2005]. On shorter timescales ( $\leq 20$  kyrs) neutralization of <sup>394</sup> the increased  $pCO_2$  in the atmosphere is predicted to occur via weathering of carbonates <sup>395</sup> in soils and exposed surfaces thereby increasing the ocean [HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>] and deepening the <sup>396</sup> lysocline [*Archer et al.*, 1998; *Ridgwell and Zeebe*, 2005]. The weathered [HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>] would <sup>397</sup> have a more positive  $\delta^{13}C$  signal that the exogenic carbon reservoir at the time and would <sup>398</sup> therefore help drive a recovery in the depth of the lysocline and a positive shift in the <sup>399</sup>  $\delta^{13}C$  value.

We suggest that together, increased organic carbon burial during the recovery phase 400 and increases in the accumulation of  $CaCO_3$  in sections above the lysocline, as seen in 401 the records of John et al. [2008] for shallow New Jersey margin sections at the PETM 402 and increases in the mass accumulation rates seen at DSDP Site 523 in the S. Atlantic 403 [Bohaty et al., 2009], explain the rapid positive increase in the  $\delta^{13}$ C at MECO immediately 404 after the maximum negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion. Until further shallow coastal sections for the 405 MECO event are identified the organic carbon scenario remains one hypothesis, which 406 requires further study. 407

## 6. Conclusions

In this study middle Eocene warming is recorded in the northern hemisphere synchronously with previous records from the Southern Ocean [Bohaty and Zachos, 2003]. High organic carbon burial and local depleted  $O_2$  bottom water conditions may be a local response to this warming or could potentially represent a well preserved global signal. Organic carbon burial coincident with a positive  $\delta^{13}C$  excursion at Alano has been stratigraphically correlated to the Southern Ocean. We suggest high burial rates of organic

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

X - 22 SPOFFORTH ET AL.: ORGANIC CARBON BURIAL FOLLOWING MECO

carbon in marine shelf settings over kyr timescales that are consistent with global cooling recorded at Southern Ocean sites and offer the most likely mechanism for driving a  $pCO_2$  decrease following the event. Future modeling studies may help to increase our understanding of this event.

Acknowledgments. We are grateful for the staff at Padova University, Italy who 418 originally sampled and logged this section. DJAS thanks Professor John Marshall for 419 help with the organic material, Professor Ian Croudace for help and advice with sediment 420 geochemistry, and Kirsty Edgar and Steve Bohaty for numerous discussions on MECO 421 both at Alano and elsewhere. Appy Slujis and an anonymous reviewer greatly improved 422 this manuscript. Financial support was provided to DJAS by NERC studentship (Ref. 423 NER/S/A/2005/13474) and to HP by grants PP/D002176/1 and PPARC/STFC and 424 NERC grant NE/D000393/1 425

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

#### References

- 426 Agnini, C., E. Fornaciari, D. Rio, F. Tateo, J. Backman, and L. Giusberti (2007a), Responses of calcareous nannofossil assemblages,
- 427 mineralogy and geochemistry to the environmental perturbations across the Paleocene/Eocene boundary in the Venetian Pre-Alps,
- 428 Marine Micropaleontology, 63, 19–38.
- 429 Agnini, C., D. J. A. Spofforth, E. Fornaciari, L. Giusberti, L. Lanci, V. Luciani, G. Muttoni, P. Grandesso, and D. Rio (2007b), Is the Middle
- 430 Eocene Climatic Optimum (MECO) recorded in the central-western Tethys?, Eos Trans. AGU, 88(52) Fall Meet.
- 431 Suppl(52. Fall Meet. Suppl), Abstract OS11A-0188.
- 432 Agnini, C., et al. ((in press) 2009), Integrated Bio-magnetostratigaphy of the Alano di Piave section (NE Italy): A proposal and definition
- 433 of the middle-late Eocene boundary, GSA Bulletin.
- 434 Archer, D., H. Kheshgi, and E. Maier-Reimer (1998), Dynamics of fossil fuel co<sub>2</sub> neutralization by marine caco<sub>3</sub>, Global Biogeo-
- 435 chemical Cycles, 12(2), 259-276.
- Berggren, W. A., and P. N. Pearson (2005), A revised tropical to subtropical paleogene planktonic foraminiferal zonation, Journal of
   Foraminiferal Research, 35 (4), 279–298.
- 438 Berggren, W. A., D. V. Kent, C. C. Swisher, and M.-P. Aubry (1995), A revised Cenozoic geochronology and chronostratigraphy, in
- 439 Geochronology, time scales and global stratigraphic correlation (SEPM Special Publi-
- *cation*), vol. 54, edited by B. W. A., D. V. Kent, M.-P. Aubry, and J. Hardenbol, pp. 129–212, Society for Sedimentary Geology
  (SEPM).
- 442 Berner, R., and Z. Kothavala (2001), GEOCARB III: A revised model of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> over phanerozoic time, American Jour-
- 443 nal of Science, 301 (2), 182-204.
- Bohaty, S. M., and J. C. Zachos (2003), Significant Southern Ocean warming event in the late middle Eocene, Geology, 31 (11),
- 445 1017-1020.

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

#### X - 24 SPOFFORTH ET AL.: ORGANIC CARBON BURIAL FOLLOWING MECO

- 446 Bohaty, S. M., J. C. Zachos, F. Florindo, and M. L. Delaney (2009), Coupled greenhouse warming and deep-sea acidification in the middle
- 447 Eocene, Paleoceanography, 24, doi:ARTNPA2207.
- Bolle, M. P., and T. Adatte (2001), Palaeocene early Eocene climatic evolution in the Tethyan realm: clay mineral evidence, Clay
   Minerals, 36 (2), 249–261.
- 450 Borges, A. V. (2005), Do we have enough pieces of the jigsaw to integrate CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes in the coastal ocean?, Estuaries, 28(1), 3–27.
- 451 Bosellini, F. R., and C. A. Papazzoni (2003), Palaeoecological significance of coral-encrusting foraminiferan associations: A case-study from
- 452 the Upper Eocene of northern Italy, Acta Palaeontologica Polonica, 48(2), 279–292.
- 453 Bowen, G. J., D. J. Beerling, P. L. Koch, J. C. Zachos, and T. Quattlebaum (2004), A humid climate state during the Palaeocene/Eocene
- 454 thermal maximum, Nature, 432(7016), 495–499.
- 455 Cande, S. C., and D. V. Kent (1995), Revised Calibration of the Geomagnetic Polarity Timescale for the Late Cretaceous and Cenozoic,
- 456 Journal of Geophysical Research-Solid Earth, 100 (B4), 6093–6095.
- 457 Coxall, H. K., P. A. Wilson, H. Palike, C. H. Lear, and J. Backman (2005), Rapid stepwise onset of Antarctic glaciation and deeper calcite
   458 compensation in the Pacific Ocean, Nature, 433 (7021), 53–57.
- 459 Cramer, B. S., J. D. Wright, D. V. Kent, and M. P. Aubry (2003), Orbital climate forcing of delta c-13 excursions in the late paleocene-early

460 eocene (chrons c24n-c25n), Paleoceanography, 18(4).

- 461 DeConto, R. M., and D. Pollard (2003), Rapid Cenozoic glaciation of Antarctica induced by declining atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Nature,
   462 421 (6920), 245–249.
- <sup>463</sup> DeConto, R. M., D. Pollard, P. A. Wilson, H. Palike, Lear, and M. Pagani (2008), Thresholds for Cenozoic bipolar glaciation, *Nature*,
  <sup>464</sup> 455, 652–656.
- 465 Dercourt, J., L. E. Ricou, and B. Vrielynck (1993), Atlas of Tethys Palaeoenvironmental Maps, Gauthier-Villars.
- 466 Dickens, G. R., and R. Owen (1994), Late Miocene-early Pliocene manganese redirection in the central Indian-Ocean expansion of the
- intermediate water oxygen minimum zone, Paleoceanography, 9(1), 169-181.

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

- 468 Dickens, G. R., J. R. Oneil, D. K. Rea, and R. M. Owen (1995), Dissociation of oceanic methane hydrate as a cause of the carbon-isotope
- 469 excursion at the end of the Paleocene, Paleoceanography, 10(6), 965–971.
- 470 Dickens, G. R., M. M. Castillo, and J. C. G. Walker (1997), A blast of gas in the latest peleocene: Simulating first-order effects of mas-
- sive dissociation of oceanic methane hydrate, Geology, 25 (3), 259–262, doi:10.1130/0091-7613(1997)025(0259:
- $_{472}$  ABOGIT  $\rangle 2.3.CO; 2.$
- 473 Edgar, K. M., P. Sexton, R. Norris, P. Wilson, and S. Gibbs (2007a), Evolutionary Response of Planktic Foraminifera to a Pronounced
- Global Warming Event 40 Myr ago, Eos Trans. AGU, 88(52), Fall Meet. Suppl(52, Fall Meet. Suppl), Abstract
  OS14A-03.
- Edgar, K. M., P. A. Wilson, P. F. Sexton, and Y. Suganuma (2007b), No extreme bipolar glaciation during the main Eocene calcite
  compensation shift, *Nature*, 448, 908–911, doi:10.1038/nature06053.
- 478 Giusberti, L., D. Rio, C. Agnini, J. Backman, E. Fornaciari, F. Tateo, and M. Oddone (2007), Mode and tempo of the Paleocene-Eocene
- thermal maximum in an expanded section from the Venetian pre-Alps, Geological Society of America Bulletin,
  119, 391-412.
- 481 Gooday, A. J. (2003), Beyond methane: Towards a theory for the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum Benthic foraminifera (protista) as
- tools in deep-water palaeoceanography: Environmental influences on faunal characteristics, Advances In Marine Biology,
- 483  $Vol \ 46, \ 46, \ 1-90.$
- Hay, W. W., et al. (1999), Alternative Global Cretaceous Paleogeography, in *The Evolution of Cretaceous Ocean/Climate Systems*, vol. 332, edited by E. Barrera and C. Johnson, pp. 1–47, Geological Society of America Special Paper.
- 487 Hedges, J. I., and R. G. Keil (1995), Sedimentary organic-matter preservation an assessment and speculative synthesis, Marine
- 488 Chemistry, 49 (2-3), 81–115.

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

#### X - 26 SPOFFORTH ET AL.: ORGANIC CARBON BURIAL FOLLOWING MECO

- 489 Ivany, L. C., K. C. Lohmann, F. Hasiuk, D. B. Blake, A. Glass, R. B. Aronson, and R. M. Moody (2008), Eocene climate record of a high
- southern latitude continental shelf: Seymour Island, Antarctica, Geological Society of America Bulletin, 120 (5-6),
- 491 659-678.
- 492 John, C. M., S. M. Bohaty, J. C. Zachos, A. Sluijs, S. Gibbs, H. Brinkhuis, and T. J. Bralower (2008), North American continental margin
- <sup>493</sup> records of the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum: Implications for global carbon and hydrological cycling, *Paleoceanography*,

494 23(2), doi:ARTNPA2217.

- Jones, B., and D. Manning (1994), Comparison of geochemical indexes used for the interpretation of palaeoredox conditions in ancient mudstones, *Chemical Geology*, 111 (1-4), 111–129.
- 497 Jovane, L., F. Florindo, R. Coccioni, J. Dinarès-Turell, A. Marsili, S. Monechi, A. P. Roberts, and M. Sprovieri (2007), The middle Eocene
- climatic optimum event in the Contessa Highway section, Umbrian Apennines, Italy, Geological Society of America
- 499 Bulletin, 119(3), 413-427.
- Kaiho, K. (1994), Benthic foraminiferal dissolved-oxygen index and dissolved-oxygen levels in the modern ocean, *Geology*, 22 (8),
   719–722.
- 502 Kelly, D. C., J. C. Zachos, T. J. Bralower, and S. A. Schellenberg (2005), Enhanced terrestrial weathering/runoff and surface ocean carbonate
- production during the recovery stages of the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum, Paleoceanography, 20(4), pA4023.
- 504 Kennett, J. P., and L. D. Stott (1991), Abrupt deep-sea warming, palaeoceanographic changes and benthic extinctions at the end of the
- 505 Paleocene, Nature, 353(6341), 225–229.
- 506 Klinkhammer, G. P. (1980), Early diagenesis in sediments from the eastern equatorial Pacific 2. Pore water metal results, Earth and
- <sup>507</sup> Planetary Science Letters, 49(1), 81–101.
- 508 Kump, L. R., and M. A. Arthur (1999), Interpreting carbon-isotope excursions: carbonates and organic matter, Chemical Geology,
- 509 *161* (1-3), 181–198.

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

- Lear, C. H., T. R. Bailey, P. N. Pearson, H. K. Coxall, and Y. Rosenthal (2008), Cooling and ice growth across the Eocene-Oligocene
- 511 transition, Geology, 36(3), 251–254.
- Liu, Z., M. Pagani, D. Zinniker, R. DeConto, M. Huber, H. Brinkhuis, S. R. Shah, R. M. Leckie, and A. Pearson (2009), Global Cooling During
- the Eocene-Oligocene Climate Transition, *Science*, 323 (5918), 1187–1190, doi:DOI10.1126/science.1166368.
- 514 Lourens, L. J., A. Sluijs, D. Kroon, J. C. Zachos, E. Thomas, U. Rohl, J. Bowles, and I. Raffi (2005), Astronomical pacing of late Palaeocene
- to early Eocene global warming events, Nature, 435 (7045), 1083–1087.
- 516 Luciani, V., C. Agnini, E. Fornaciari, L. Giusberti, D. Rio, D. Spofforth, and H. Palike (2009), Ecological and evolutionary response
- of Tethyan planktonic foraminifera to the Middle Eocene Climatic Optimum (Alano di Piave section, NE Italy), Geophysical
- <sup>518</sup> *Research Abstracts*, *11* (EGU2009-10464-2).
- 519 Lyle, A. O., and M. W. Lyle (2006), Missing organic carbon in Eocene marine sediments: Is metabolism the biological feedback that
- 520 maintains end-member climates?, Paleoceanography, 21 (2), pA2007.
- Lyle, M., J. Barron, T. J. Bralower, M. Huber, A. O. Lyle, A. C. Ravelo, D. K. Rea, and P. A. Wilson (2008), Pacific ocean and Cenozoic
   evolution of climate, *Reviews of Geophysics*, 46 (2).
- 523 Martini, E. (1971), Standard Tertiary and Quaternary calcareous nannoplankton zonation, in 2nd Planktonic Conference,
- vol. 2, edited by A. Farinacci, pp. 739–785, Tecnoscienza, Roma.
- 525 Miller, K. G., et al. (2005), The phanerozoic record of global sea-level change, Science, 310 (5752), 1293–1298, doi:DOI10.1126/
- <sup>526</sup> science.1116412.
- 527 Nicolo, M. J., G. R. Dickens, C. J. Hollis, and J. C. Zachos (2007), Multiple early Eocene hyperthermals: Their sedimentary expression on
- the New Zealand continental margin and in the deep sea, Geology, 35(8), 699–702.
- 529 Oberhänsli, V. N., Hand Beniamovskii (2000), Dysoxic bottom water events in the peri-Tethys during the late Ypresian: A result of changes
- in the evaporation/precipitation balance in adjacent continental regions,  $G\!f\!f$ , 122, 121–123.

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

- X 28 SPOFFORTH ET AL.: ORGANIC CARBON BURIAL FOLLOWING MECO
- Pagani, M., J. C. Zachos, K. H. Freeman, B. Tipple, and S. Bohaty (2005), Marked decline in atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations
- 532 during the Paleogene, Science, 309 (5734), 600–603.
- 533 Pagani, M., K. Caldeira, D. Archer, and J. C. Zachos (2006), An ancient carbon mystery, Science, 314 (5805), 1556–1557.
- 534 Pälike, H., R. D. Norris, J. O. Herrle, P. A. Wilson, H. K. Coxall, C. H. Lear, N. J. Shackleton, A. K. Tripati, and B. S. Wade (2006a), The
- <sup>535</sup> Heartbeat of the Oligocene Climate System, *Science*, *314* (5807), 1894–1898, doi:10.1126/science.1133822.
- 536 Powell, W. G., P. A. Johnston, and C. J. Collom (2003), Geochemical evidence for oxygenated bottom waters during deposition of fossiliferous
- 537 strata of the Burgess Shale Formation, Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology, 201 (3-4), 249–268,

#### doi:DOI10.1016/S0031-0182(03)00612-6.

- 539 Ravizza, G., R. D. Norris, J. Blusztajn, and M.-P. Aubry (2001), An osmium isotope excursion associated with the late Paleocene thermal
- maximum: Evidence of intensified chemical weathering, Paleoceanography, 16 (2), 155–163.
- Raymo, M. E. (1991), Geochemical evidence supporting Chamberlin, T., C. theory of glaciation, Geology, 19(4), 344–347.
- 542 Rea, D. K., and M. W. Lyle (2005), Paleogene calcite compensation depth in the eastern subtropical Pacific: Answers and questions,
- <sup>543</sup> Paleoceanography, 20(1), doi: ARTNPA1012.
- 544 Ridgwell, A., and J. C. Hargreaves (2007), Regulation of atmospheric CO2 by deep-sea sediments in an Earth system model, Global

## 545 Biogeochemical Cycles, 21 (2), doi:ARTNGB2008.

- Ridgwell, A., and R. E. Zeebe (2005), The role of the global carbonate cycle in the regulation and evolution of the earth system, Earth
- <sup>547</sup> and Planetary Science Letters, 234 (3-4), 299–315.
- 548 Saager, P. M., H. J. W. Debaar, and P. H. Burkill (1989), Manganese and iron in Indian-Ocean waters, Geochimica Et Cos-
- 549 mochimica Acta, 53(9), 2259-2267.
- 550 Schlanger, S. O., and H. C. Jenkyns (1976), Cretaceous anoxic events: causes and consequences, Geologie en Mijnbouw, 55,
- 551 179–184.
- 552 Scotese, C. R. (2002), http://www.scotese.com (paleomap website)

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

- Sexton, P. F., P. A. Wilson, and R. D. Norris (2006), Testing the Cenozoic multisite composite delta O-18 and delta C-13 curves: New
  monospecific Eocene records from a single locality, Demerara Rise (Ocean Drilling Program Leg 207), *Paleoceanography*, 21 (2),
  pA2019.
  Sluijs, A., U. Rohl, S. Schouten, H. J. Brumsack, F. Sangiorgi, J. S. S. Damste, and H. Brinkhuis (2008a), Arctic late Paleocene-early
  Eocene paleoenvironments with special emphasis on the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum (Lomonosov Ridge, Integrated Ocean
  Drilling Program Expedition 302), *Paleoceanography*, 23 (1), pA1S11.
- Sluijs, A., et al. (2006), Subtropical arctic ocean temperatures during the Palaeocene/Eocene thermal maximum, Nature, 441 (7093),
  610–613.
- Sluijs, A., et al. (2008b), Eustatic variations during the Paleocene-Eocene greenhouse world, Paleoceanography, 23(4), doi:

## 562 ARTNPA4216.

- 563 Smith, A., D. G. Smith, and B. M. Funnell (1994), Atlas of Mesozoic and Cenozoic Coastlines, CUP.
- 564 Speijer, R. P., and A. M. M. Morsi (2002), Sea-level changes and black shales associated with the late paleocene thermal maximum: 565 organic-gochemical and micropaleontologic evidence from the southern tethyan margin (egypt-israel), in *Geological Society of*
- 566 America Special Paper, vol. 356, pp. 533–549.
- 567 Stap, L., A. Sluijs, E. Thomas, and L. Lourens (2009), Patterns and magnitude of deep sea carbonate dissolution during Eocene Thermal
- Maximum 2 and H2, Walvis Ridge, southeastern Atlantic Ocean, *Paleoceanography*, 24, doi:ARTNPA1211.
- Thomas, D. J., J. C. Zachos, T. J. Bralower, E. Thomas, and S. Bohaty (2002), Warming the fuel for the fire: Evidence for the thermal
- dissociation of methane hydrate during the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum, Geology, 30(12), 1067-1070.
- 571 Thomson, J., N. C. Higgs, T. R. S. Wilson, I. W. Croudace, G. J. Delange, and P. J. M. Vansantvoort (1995), Redistribution and
- 572 geochemical behavior of redox-sensitive elements around s1, the most recent eastern Mediterranean sapropel, Geochimica Et
- <sup>573</sup> Cosmochimica Acta, 59(17), 3487–3501.

# DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

#### X - 30 SPOFFORTH ET AL.: ORGANIC CARBON BURIAL FOLLOWING MECO

- 574 Tripati, A., J. Backman, H. Elderfield, and P. Ferretti (2005), Eocene bipolar glaciation associated with global carbon cycle changes,
- 575 Nature, 436 (7049), 341–346.
- 576 Tyson, R., and T. Pearson (1991), Modern and ancient continental shelf anoxia: an overview, in Modern and Ancient Con-
- 577 tinental Shelf Anoxia, vol. 58, edited by R. Tyson and T. Pearson, pp. 1–24, Geological Society Speical Publication.
- 578 Wade, B. S. (2004), Planktonic foraminiferal biostratigraphy and mechanisms in the extinction of Morozovella in the late middle Eocene,

579 Marine Micropaleontology, 51 (1-2), 23–38.

- Walsh, J. J. (1991), Importance of continental margins in the marine biogeochemical cycling of carbon and nitrogen, Nature, 350 (6313),
   53-55.
- Wignall, P. B., and A. H. Ruffel (1990), The influence of a sudden climatic-change on marine deposition in the Kimmeridgian of northwest
- Europe, Journal of the Geological Society, 147, 365–371.
- Zachos, J. C., T. M. Quinn, and K. A. Salamy (1996), High-resolution (10<sup>4</sup> years) deep-sea for a for a stable isotope records of the

- Zachos, J. C., M. Pagani, L. Sloan, E. Thomas, and K. Billups (2001), Trends, rhythms, and aberrations in global climate 65 Ma to present,
   *Science*, 292 (5517 1), 686–693.
- 588 Zachos, J. C., M. W. Wara, S. Bohaty, M. L. Delaney, M. R. Petrizzo, A. Brill, T. J. Bralower, and I. Premoli-Silva (2003), A transient rise
- in tropical sea surface temperature during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, Science, 302 (5650), 1551–1554.
- Zachos, J. C., et al. (2005), Rapid acidification of the ocean during the Paleocene-Eocene thermal maximum, Science, 308 (5728),
  1611–1615.

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm

Eocene-Oligocene climate transition, *Paleoceanography*, 11 (3), 251–266.

X - 31

Figure 1. A) Palaeogeographic reconstruction of the Lessini Shelf: 1) deep water mudstones of the surrounding Jurassic basins; 2) Palaeogene lagoon and shelf edge reefs; 3) Palaeogene pelagic claystones and marlstones (modified from *Bosellini and Papazzoni* [2003]) The approximate location of the Alano site is marked by a star. B) Paleogeographic reconstruction at 40Ma [*Hay et al.*, 1999] showing location of sites where MECO has been identified and location of Alano (A) and Contessa (C). C) Same reconstruction centered over the Tethys area. Paleoenvironmental reconstruction from *Scotese* [2002] and interpretation *Dercourt et al.* [1993]. Alano di Piave location marked by the star.

Figure 2. Bulk carbonate stable isotopes  $\delta^{13}C$ ,  $\delta^{18}O$  and percentage CaCO<sub>3</sub> over the entire Alano di Piave section. Linear sedimentation rates are calculated using magnetochron boundaries with ages from [*Cande and Kent*, 1995; *Pälike et al.*, 2006a]

X - 32

X - 33

Figure 3. Sediment Geochemistry across the MECO interval. From top  $\delta^{13}C_{cc}$  and  $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ , % CaCO<sub>3</sub>, Total Organic Carbon (TOC), % sulfur, Mn/Al, [Al], [U] and V/Cr. Dashed lines on U (ppm) graph represent oxic - dysoxic boundary of [*Wignall and Ruffel*, 1990] and [*Jones and Manning*, 1994] respectively. Elemental data measured on discrete XRF samples. Overlaid bands indicate organic rich intervals. Labels A – E deconstruct the  $\delta^{13}$ C record into phases and are described in the results

Figure 4. Stratigraphic correlation of  $\delta^{13}C_{Alano}$  to global records from *Bohaty et al.* [2009] and for Contessa from *Jovane et al.* [2007]. The FO and LO of the marker species *O.beckmanni* and S. furcatolithoides are shown for the Alano section. Records from sites as marked in the Figure and locations as seen in Figure 1. Letters A-E refer to correlation tie points between records.

Table 1. Average TOC content for sections, A, B, C, D, E as referred to in main text and Figure 3. Calculated mass accumulation rates assuming constant linear sedimentation rate and dry bulk density. As no measure of dry bulk density is available we use a value of 1g/cc. We note that the  $\geq 63 \ \mu$ m residue is lowest during the organic rich units and therefore the expected dry bulk density here would be expected to be higher.

0	-		0		
Section	A(Pre-CIE)	B(ORG1)	С	D(ORG2)	E(Recovery)
% TOC	0.17	1.83	0.23	1.5	0.15
$MAR^*$	0.003	0.033	0.004	0.027	0.002

DRAFT

December 3, 2009, 5:33pm









```
\begin{table*}
\caption{\label{tableTOC} Average TOC content for sections, A, B, C, D, E
as referred to in main text and Figure 3. Calculated mass accumulation
rates assuming constant linear sedimentation rate and dry bulk density.
As no measure of dry bulk density is available we use a value of 1g/cc.
rich units and therefore the expected dry bulk density here would be
expected to be higher. }
\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{lccccc}
\hline
Section&A (Pre-CIE) &B (ORG1) &C&D (ORG2) &E (Recovery) \\
\hline
\% TOC&0.17&1.83&0.23&1.5&0.15\\
MAR*&0.003&0.033&0.004&0.027&0.002\\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}
\end{table*}
```